



国家哲学社会科学成果文库

NATIONAL ACHIEVEMENTS LIBRARY
OF PHILOSOPHY AND SOCIAL SCIENCES

清代唐宋诗之争流变史

王英志 主编



人民文学出版社

图书在版编目(CIP)数据

清代唐宋诗之争流变史/王英志主编. —北京:人民文学出版社,2012

(国家哲学社会科学成果文库)

ISBN 978-7-02-008950-5

I. ①清… II. ①王… III. ①诗歌史—研究—中国—清代 IV. ①I207.209

中国版本图书馆 CIP 数据核字(2012)第 012669 号

责任编辑 周绚隆

装帧设计 赵迪

责任校对 周绚隆

责任印制 王景林

出版发行 人民文学出版社

社址 北京市朝内大街 166 号

邮政编码 100705

网 址 <http://www.rw-cn.com>

印 刷 北京盛通印刷股份有限公司

经 销 全国新华书店等

字 数 661 千字

开 本 710×1000 毫米 1/16

印 张 47.75 插页 3

印 数 1—2000

版 次 2012 年 3 月北京第 1 版

印 次 2012 年 3 月第 1 次印刷

书 号 978-7-02-008950-5

定 价 108.00 元

如有印装质量问题,请与本社图书销售中心调换。电话:01065233595



作者简介

王英志 男，1944年11月生。1968年于北京大学中文系毕业；1982年于苏州大学获文学硕士学位，为钱仲联教授首届研究生。苏州大学学报编审（曾任副主编），苏州大学文学院研究员、博士生导师。长期从事明清诗学研究，出版著作二十余部，其中《袁枚全集》《袁枚评传》《清人诗论研究》《中国古典诗歌艺术新探》《性灵派研究》等广有影响；另编校有《陈子龙全集》《清代闺秀诗话丛刊》，主持有国家社科基金项目“清代唐宋诗之争流变史”。曾于《文学评论》等发表论文二百余篇。曾获全国、江苏省、苏州市、苏州大学等社科优秀成果奖多项。有海内外二十余家报刊对其学术成果作过报道评介。

《国家哲学社会科学成果文库》 出版说明

为充分发挥哲学社会科学研究优秀成果和优秀人才的示范带动作用,促进我国哲学社会科学繁荣发展,全国哲学社会科学规划领导小组决定自 2010 年始,设立《国家哲学社会科学成果文库》,每年评审一次。入选成果经过了同行专家严格评审,代表当前相关领域学术研究的前沿水平,体现我国哲学社会科学界的学术创造力,按照“统一标识、统一封面、统一版式、统一标准”的总体要求组织出版。

全国哲学社会科学规划办公室
2012 年 3 月

目 录

总 论	1
-----------	---

[执笔:王英志]

上编:顺康雍时期唐宋诗之争流变史

绪 论:清代“唐宋诗之争”研究述评	8
第一章 明清之际宗唐之风的流布	26
第一节 云间派的复古宗唐诗论及其广泛影响	29
第二节 王夫之、顾炎武的宗唐抑宋倾向	42
第二章 顺治至康熙前期宋诗风的兴起	53
第一节 钱谦益唐宋兼宗开清代宗宋先河	53
第二节 浙派初祖黄宗羲大力提倡宋诗	66
第三节 《宋诗钞》与宋诗风的兴起	80
第三章 顺康年间宗唐之风的发展	92
第一节 吴伟业与唐宋诗之争	92
第二节 中晚唐诗风的流传历程	104
第三节 明七子宗唐诗学在各地的沿袭和发展	116
第四章 康熙年间宋诗风的广泛传播	131
第一节 汪琬等人对宋诗的接受及对唐宋诗之争的审视	133
第二节 叶燮《原诗》对唐宋诗之争的理论解析	145
第三节 查慎行诗的宋调特征	154
第四节 康熙年间的宋诗选本与宋诗风的传播	165

第五章 康熙中后期唐音的兴盛	181
第一节 庙堂之上的宗唐抑宋	181
第二节 王士禛的宗尚衍变与“神韵说”的形成	195
第六章 清初人选清初诗与唐宋诗之争	211
结 语	227

[执笔:赵 娜]

中编:乾嘉时期唐宋诗之争流变史

第一章 雍乾之际宗唐之风的再度盛行	230
第一节 反拨宋诗热潮,重奏盛世雅音	231
第二节 宗唐诗人对宋诗风潮的批判	246
第三节 沈德潜的宗唐学说	251
第四节 宗唐诗人的理论建树	261
第五节 取法唐诗者的创作风貌与成绩	275
第二章 雍乾之际浙地法宋风气的蓬勃发展	285
第一节 雍乾之际宋风的流播	285
第二节 主宋与宗唐的对立	294
第三节 厉鹗等人对宋诗创作精神、风格与方法的继承	298
第四节 浙地杭世骏、全祖望等对构建学人诗理论的贡献	312
第五节 秀水诗群对黄庭坚诗风的接受	328
第三章 乾隆前期融通唐宋思想的逐步升温	334
第一节 薛雪对拟古与优唐劣宋诗学观的批评	335
第二节 吴雷发对拟古格调的批判与无分唐宋论	342
第三节 李重华的折衷唐宋论与诗学批评	346
第四章 乾隆后期至嘉庆朝唐宋融通思潮的空前高涨	357
第一节 融通思想普及时代的到来	358
第二节 讨伐异说,先破后立	363

——性灵派无分唐宋主张的确立

第三节 袁枚“无分唐宋”说辨析	372
第四节 赵翼对唐诗美学风格与宋诗创作精神及方法的融合	384
第五节 张问陶的“无师”论及其对肌理派的批评	393
第五章 乾嘉年间宗宋思潮的不断上扬	398
第一节 乾隆三十年至嘉庆末的宗宋热潮	398
第二节 精深细密之风与以学为诗	407
——论翁方纲对宋诗的接受	
第三节 宗黄之风的广为流播	423
第四节 乾嘉后期的学人诗潮	432
第六章 乾隆后期至嘉庆朝宗唐之风的渐趋衰退	440
第一节 “吴中七子”等人对宗唐思想的因革	441
第二节 高密诗人宗法中晚唐之风及对唐宋诗之争的参与	456
第三节 其他地区寥落的宗唐之音	461
结 语	468

[执笔:张丽华]

下编:道咸同光宣时期唐宋诗之争流变史

第一章 道咸同年间宗宋诗风的初兴	476
第一节 道咸同年间宗宋诗风的兴起	478
第二节 宋诗派对乾嘉宗唐末流的批判及对学人诗的倡导	485
第三节 桐城诗派的诗歌崇尚:诗学唐宋、以宋为主	498
第二章 道咸同年间宗唐态势的衰微及宗唐诗人群体	516
第一节 道咸同年间宗唐诗风的低迷	517
第二节 江左宗唐诗人群体概说	525
第三节 闽粤等地宗唐诗人群体概说	538
第四节 湖湘派:对宋诗及宋诗派的反动	551
第三章 道咸同年间融通唐宋思潮的持续发展	562
第一节 潘德舆折衷的唐宋诗学观	564

4 清代唐宋诗之争流变史

第二节 林昌彝的诗论:性情和学问并举,唐诗与宋诗齐平	570
第三节 何曰愈性情、理趣、才学三者并重及平和看待唐宋诗优劣	578
第四节 龚自珍兼取唐宋的创作实践	584
第四章 光宣民初宗宋诗风的空前高涨	592
第一节 陈衍与同光体的兴盛	593
第二节 陈衍对学唐宗唐者的批判	603
第三节 同光体以宋为主、唐宋兼融的理论主张	610
第四节 同光体诗人多元宗宋诗趣	623
第五节 同光体之外众多的宗宋群体	635
第五章 光宣民初调和唐宋潮流的不断上扬	642
第一节 张之洞的唐宋诗调和论:“宋意唐格”	645
第二节 李慈铭及其门生的唐宋兼融理论及主张:“八面受敌”	654
第三节 “诗界革命”派:超越唐宋诗之争,主张觅求新诗界	662
第六章 光宣民初宗唐风气的日趋活跃	673
第一节 湖湘派后期诗人的宗唐取向及斥宋诗学观	674
第二节 宗法晚唐、反对宋诗的西昆派	682
第三节 湖湘派之外尊奉魏晋、六朝、盛唐诗人的诗学宗尚	687
第四节 南社之宗唐主流及其唐宋诗之争	702
第五节 光宣民初其他宗唐诗人群体	708
结 语	717
[执笔:郭前孔]	
参考文献	722
后 记	743

Change and Historical Development in Qing Dynasty of the Preferences between Tang Dynasty Poems and Song Dynasty Poems Contents

Introduction	1
--------------------	---

[Authored by Wang Ying zhi]

Part One: Change and historical development of the preferences between
Tang dynasty poems and Song dynasty poems in the reign periods of em-
perors Shunzhi, Kangxi and Yongzheng

Preface: A review of the study of the preferences between Tang poems and Song poems in Qing dynasty	8
--	---

Chapter One The spread and distribution of the promotion of Tang poems at the turn of Ming and Qing dynasties	26
--	----

Section One Yunjian school's poetics of reverting to old ways and promoting Tang poems and its widespread influence	29
--	----

Section Two Wang Fuzhi and Gu Yanwu's tendency to promoting Tang poems and depreciating Song poems	42
---	----

Chapter Two The upsurge of promoting Song poems from the reign period of emper- or Shunzhi to the early reign period of emperor Kangxi	53
---	----

Section One Qian Qianyi's promotion of both Tang and Song poems set a precedent case of promoting Song poems in Qing dynasty	53
---	----

Section Two Huang Zongxi, the creator of Zhejiang school, greatly advocated Song poems	66
Section Three The upsurge of Collection of Song Poems as well as Song poetic style	80
Chapter Three The development of the promotion of Tang poems during the reign periods of emperors Shunzhi and Kangxi	92
Section One Wu Weiye and the preferences between Tang and Song poems	92
Section Two The passing on of middle and late Tang dynasty poetic style ...	104
Section Three The inheritance and development in various places of the poetics established by seven scholars who promoted Tang poems in Ming dynasty	116
Chapter Four The wide spread of the promotion of Song poems in the reign periods of emperors Kangxi and Yongzheng	131
Section One People like Wang Wan's reception of Song poems and inspection of the preferences between Tang poems and Song poems	133
Section Two The theoretical analysis of the preferences between Tang poems and Song poems in Original Poems by Ye Xie	145
Section Three The characteristics of Song poems embodied in Zha Shenxing's poems	154
Section Four The spread of selected works of Song poems and Song poetic style in the reign periods of emperors Kang Xi and Yong Zheng	165
Chapter Five The boom of Tang poems in the middle and late reign period of emperor Kang Xi	181
Section One The promotion of Tang poems and depreciation of Song poems at the royal court	181
Section Two The evolution of Wang Shizhen's preference and the establishment of the School of Spirit and Charm	195
Chapter Six People in the early Qing period preferred poems at that time and their preferences between Tang poems and Song poems	211

Conclusion	227
------------------	-----

[Authored by Zhao Na]

PART TWO: CHANGE AND HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT OF THE PREFERENCES BETWEEN TANG DYNASTY POEMS AND SONG DYNASTY POEMS IN THE REIGN PERIODS OF EMPERORS QIANLONG AND JIAQIN

Chapter One The promotion of Tang poems boomed again at the turn of the reign periods of emperors Yongzheng and Qianlong	230
Section One The resistance to Song poems' boom and the re-emphasis on the elegant poems in the prosperous Tang dynasty	231
Section Two Poets who promoted Tang poems criticized the fashion for Song poems	246
Section Three Shen Deqian's theory of promoting Tang poems	251
Section Four The theoretical achievement of poets who promoted Tang poems	261
Section Five The poem creation outlook and achievement of those who drew on Tang poems	275
Chapter Two The flourishing of the imitation of Song poems in Zhejiang area at the turn of the reign periods of emperors Yongzheng and Qianlong	285
Section One The spread of Song poems at the turn of the reign periods of emperors Yongzheng and Qianlong	285
Section Two The confrontation between the promotions of Song poems and Tang poems	294
Section Three People like Lie's inheritance of the creation idea, style and method of Song poems	298
Section Four Hang Shijun and Quan Zuwang's contribution to the construction of the poetics that advocated scholar poems	312

Section Five Xiushui school's reception of Huang Tingjian's poem style	328
Chapter Three The gradual rise of the idea that Tang and Song poems should be integrated in the early reign period of emperor Qianlong	334
Section One Xue Xue's criticism of the poetic views which advocated imitating ancient poems and the views which advocated Tang poems while depreciated Song poems	335
Section Two Wu Leifa's criticism of imitating ancient poetic styles and his opinions which advocated there should be no prejudice about Tang and Song poems	342
Section Three Li Chonghua's opinions which advocated a compromise between Tang and Song poems and his poetic criticism	346
Chapter Four The unprecedented rise of the ethos of a comprehensive study that integrated Tang and Song poems from the late reign period of emperor Qianlong to the reign period of emperor Jiaqin	357
Section One The arrival of the age in which the ideas are popularized about a comprehensive and integrated study	358
Section Two The intolerance of heterodoxy and the destruction before construction; the establishment of the views of the School of True Nature which advocated there should be no prejudice about Tang and Song poems	363
Section Three Analysis of Yuan Mei's opinions which advocated there should be no prejudice about Tang and Song poems	372
Section Four Zhao Yi's integration of Tang poems' aesthetic style and Song poems' creation ideas and methods	384
Section Five Zhang Wentao's No Teacher opinions and his criticism of the School of Texture	393
Chapter Five The continual rise of the promotion of Song poems in the reign periods of emperors Qianlong and Jiaqin	398
Section One The upsurge of promoting Song poems from the thirtieth year of emperor Qianlong's reign period to the end of emperor Jiaqin's reign period	398

Section Two The common practice of profoundness and compactness and composing poems through talent and learning: on Weng Fanggang's reception of Song poems	407
Section Three The widespread of the promotion of Huang Tingjian's poems	423
Section Four The ethos of scholar poems in the late reign periods of emperors Qianlong and Jiaqin	432
Chapter Six The gradual decline of the promotion of Tang poems from the late reign period of emperor Qianlong to the reign period of Jiaqin	440
Section One The inheritance and innovation by the Seven Scholars in the Wu Area of the ideas which promoted Tang poems	441
Section Two Gaomi area's poets' promotion of middle and late Tang dynasty poems and their preferences about Tang and Song poems	456
Section Three The scanty views of promoting Tang poems in other areas	461
Conclusion	468

[Authored by Zhang Li hua]

Part Three: Change and historical development of the preferences between Tang dynasty poems and Song dynasty poems in the reign periods of emperors Daoguang, Xianfeng, Guangxu and Xuantong

Chapter One The initial rise of the promotion of Song poems in the reign periods of emperors Daoguang and Xianfeng	476
Section One The rise of the promotion of Song poems in the reign periods of emperors Daoguang, Xianfeng and Tongzhi	478
Section Two The criticism of the decadent promotion of Tang poems in the reign periods of emperors Qianlong and Jiaqin by the school of poets who promoted Song poems as well as their advocacy of scholar poems	485
Section Three The advocacy of the Tongcheng school poets: learning from both	

Tang and Song poems with the emphasis on Song poems	498
Chapter Two The decline of the promotion of Tang poems in the reign periods of emperors Daoguang, Xianfeng and Tongzhi and the group of poets who promoted Tang poems	516
Section One The depression of the promotion of Tang poems in the reign periods of emperors Daoguang, Xianfeng and Tongzhi	517
Section Two General introduction of the group of poets in the area south of the Yangtze river who promoted Tang poems	525
Section Three General introduction of the group of poets in the areas of Fujian and Guangdong who promoted Tang poems	538
Section Four The Huxiang school poets' resistance to Song poems and to poets who promoted Song poems	551
Chapter Three The continual development in the reign periods of emperors Daoguang, Xianfeng and Tongzhi of the ethos of a comprehensive study that integrated Tang and Song poems	562
Section One Pan Deyu's compromising opinions about Tang and Song poems	564
Section Two Lin Changyi's poetic views: simultaneous development of nature and knowledge; equal emphasis on Tang and Song poems	570
Section Three He Riyu's opinions that equal emphasis should be laid on nature, interest and talent and that Tang and Song poems' advantages and disadvantages should be treated mildly	578
Section Four Gong Zizhen's creation practice that drew on both Tang and Song poems	584
Chapter Four The unprecedented rise of the promotion of Song poems in the reign periods of emperors Guangxu and Xuantong as well as in the early period of the Republic of China	592
Section One Chen Yan and the boom of the Tonggong school of poems	593
Section Two Chen Yan's criticism of those who learned from and promoted Tang po-	

ems	603
Section Three The Tongguang school's theoretical opinions of integrating Tang and Song poems with the emphasis on the latter	610
Section Four The poets of the Tongguang school promoted Song poems' advantages in various aspects	623
Section Five The various groups that promoted Song poems besides the Tongguang school	635
Chapter Five The continual rise of the trend that reconciled Tang and Song poems in the reign periods of emperors Guangxu and Xuantong and in the early period of the Republic of China	642
Section One Zhang Zhidong's opinions of reconciling Tang and Song poems: "Song poems' flavor and Tang poems' style"	645
Section Two Li Ciming and his students' theory and opinions of integrating Tang and Song poems: "attack from various people"	654
Section Three The school that advocated "revolution in the poetic circle": going beyond the preferences between Tang and Song poems; seeking for a new poetic horizon	662
Chapter Six The gradual animation of the promotion of Tang poems in the reign periods of emperors Guangxu and Xuantong and in the early period of the Republic of China	673
Section One The Huxiang school's late-period poets' preference to promoting Tang poems and their opinions against Song poems	674
Section Two The Xikun school that promoted late Tang poems and resisted Song poems	682
Section Three The poetic preferences of other groups besides the Huxiang school that advocated poets in the dynasties of Wei, Jin, Liuchao and Tang	687
Section Four The Nanshe group's mainstream of promoting Tang poems and the preferences between Tang and Song poems among its members	702
Section Five Other groups of poets who promoted Tang poems in the reign periods	

12 清代唐宋诗之争流变史

of emperors Guangxu, Xuantong and in the early period of the Republic of China
..... 708

Conclusion 717

[Authored by Guo Qian kong]

Bibliography 722

Postscript 743

[英译:张 玲]

总 论

中国古典诗歌历经唐、宋两大发展高峰阶段,及元、明低谷时期,而进入清代(含近代,下同)之复兴与集大成的总结时期。清诗具有巨大的潜在的研究价值,但是长期以来,与唐宋诗歌研究的现状相比,清诗研究显得相当滞后,其价值尚未得到应有的重视。可喜的是新时期以来清诗研究有了长足的进展,有关论文大批出现,还陆续出版了几部“清代诗歌史”著作。不过这还不够,比如论文的视角尚欠多元化,著作多属综合性的清诗史,是对清诗发展的粗线条描述。随着清诗研究的不断深入,需要变换研究角度,更细化、更具体、更深入的研究。本《清代唐宋诗之争流变史》就是从新的角度对清诗系统、细化、深入研究的尝试。

诗歌的唐宋之争于南宋江西派初见端倪之后,就成为中国古典诗学史上的一个重要现象。后来元、明两代唐宋诗之争现象进一步扩展,但还比较单纯。惟至清代诗坛,唐宋之争才得以普遍、深入地展开,充分显示了唐、宋诗各自在清代的广泛影响。清人对唐宋诗的全面继承与发展,使人不断深入认识到唐宋诗的长期论争,实际是清诗能够独具面目的重要原因之一。因此了解唐宋之争无疑是认识清诗的一把钥匙,是值得探讨的重要课题。只是学术界对这一课题并未高度重视,专题论文尚不多见,史类著作或有涉及,但未作为专门问题进行集中与深入的研究。目前仅有20余年前即1984年出版的齐治平先生的《唐宋诗之争概述》一书(岳麓书社),是专门研究唐宋诗之争的著作。不过其清代唐宋诗之争内容只作为一章五六万字而已,由于各种原因具有明显不足:一是限于清代宗唐宗宋之诗学理论的排比,未涉及唐宋诗之争于诗歌创作方面的反映,失去重要的一翼;二是就诗说诗,没有把唐宋之争与政治、经济、思想及学术挂钩;三是论及的诗人、流派太少,格局嫌小,线条