中国男男性交易状态调查

AN INQUIRY TO COMMERCIAL SEX IN MSM COMMUNITY IN CHINA

童文 著 Tong Ge

项目执行机构:北京纪安德咨询中心 项目资助机构:福特基金会 中国 北京 2007年3月

Beijing Gender Health Education Institute With the Support Of Ford Foundation March, 2007



中国男男性交易状态调查

AN INQUIRY TO COMMERCIAL SEX IN MSM COMMUNITY IN CHINA

童文 著 Tong Ge

项目执行机构:北京纪安德咨询电心项目资助机构:福特基金会中国北京 2007年3月

Beijing Gender Health Education Institute
With the Support Of Ford Foundation
March, 2007

学术顾问 (以姓氏笔画为序):

丛 中、刘伯红、孙中欣、李银河、李文晶、李 橘、张孔来、张北川、陆言灵、邱仁宗、金德初、荣维毅、高燕宁、夏国美、崔子思、翁乃群、 甄 理、潘绥铭、程晓梅、魏宏岭

项目负责人: 郭雅琦

项目工作组成员: 毛燕凌、郭晓飞、齐云鹏 调查工作组织者 (自2004年—2006年):

铁 成 (沈阳) 付 玉 (沈阳)

牧 羊 (大连) 黄 巍 (大连)

王晓东 (成都) 杨 斗 (成都)

国 明(兰州)

丁先生 (北京) 袁 新 (北京) 小鱼儿 (北京)

大 何 (天津) 小 付 (天津) 司 马 (天津) 柳 风 (天津)

噶 噶 (天津) 卢先生 (天津) 张先生 (天津) 谢先生 (天津)

安 然 (西安) 唐先生 (西安)

贵 贵 (南京) 曹宁校 (南京)

龙 龙 (苏州)

雨 奇 (郑州) 吴 涛 (郑州) 潘先生 (郑州)

阿 豪 (深圳) 阿 东 (深圳)

小 奇 (广州) 林 子 (广州)

编辑: 李国荣

翻 译: 文小宁

校 译:徐志祥、毛燕凌

设计:黄伟

内容摘要

《中国男男性交易状态调查》的作者,在对中国社会存在的男男性交易活动进行了比较详尽、深入、具体的调查实践基础上,经过认真、独到、系统的分析和研究,形成了目前国内"性"学研究领域对这个课题具有填补空白意义的社会调查报告。

这个调查报告有55万字(中文),筛选收录了调查对象的访谈调查个例将近500个(段落)。并根据现场调查,对一些鲜为人知的现象进行了具体、详细的专题描述。

这些生动的调查记录,是参与男男性交易活动的主体(性工作者、经营者、消费者,其他参与者、知情者),他们在对调查人员产生了信任以后,对他们自己的经历、经验、体会、感受的深度介绍、倾述和表达。这些来自男男性交易活动行为主体自我阐释和表达的第一手原生态资料,非常少见。而且,这些材料在调查对象很少加以伪饰的生动表述中,蕴涵着非常丰富、多元、独特的人性、人际关系、"性"际关系、社会、文化、经济的个人经验和体会,具有从不同的理论和视角进行审视和研究的宝贵"材料库"价值。

这个调查报告,通过深入的调查,揭示了许多人们对男男性交易活动形成的 习惯认识中难以想象的特定问题和现象的存在。

比如,MB(要钱的男孩)和性顾客群体对性交易活动各自存在的多元需求问题,贫困和胁迫是不是MB选择了性交易活动的主要原因问题,MB群体对于身体价值观和身体处置权的自我认同问题,当代男男性交易活动存在的深层次社会支持系统问题,MB群体的人文关怀需求问题,等等。

另外,调查报告揭示的许多现象,都出乎着人们的一般想象而在男男性交易 活动中现实存在。比如:高学历 MB,中老年 MB,易装 MB,"伪装 MB"等男男 性工作者类型的存在及其活动状态。MB 群体中有人会以性顾客身份去找"小姐"或者 MB 再发生性交易。性交易经营者和 MB 的内部性关系。对 MB 的性经验和性 技巧的训练,以及他们的接受差异。男男性交易活动参与者之间的社会人际关系。农民工中被动发生的男男性交易现象。等等。

这些现象和问题,目前,在国内基本都还缺乏实际研究。这些现象和问题,无 论是从社会学角度,还是从文化学、人类学、伦理学、法学的角度,都具有进一 步进行先进"性"学理论研究的重要现实意义。而且,对社会性别,性伦理;性 政治的研究,如果从这些"性"的少数人和表现去观照"性"的多数人和表现,更 具有不可多得的启示。

例如,一些男男性交易活动中的表现,和异性(男/女,女/男)性交易活动中的相关表现,是否相同或者存在着差异?如果研究这个问题,显然同性/异性性交易活动只能是个"标本",内在的问题可能涵盖着更广泛更深入的"性"的社会、历史、伦理文化等问题。本调查报告以这个角度提出了许多假设,有待后来的研究者进行深入、具体的研究。

因此,这个调查报告,也内涵着开掘"性"学研究专题的"课题库"意义。

这个调查报告坚持后现代主体建构"性"学研究的视角,以社会学的研究方向作为框架结构,从理论分析的角度,对中国社会的男男性交易问题,提出了一些立场鲜明,角度独到的深刻认识和观点——

- (1) 通过对传统男男性交易活动的社会支持因素和当代男男性交易活动的社会背景的研究和比照指出,当代的男男性工作者(MB),基本和性交易经营者(妈妈桑)、性顾客之间不存在人身的买卖、依附、占有的关系,他们从事男男性服务的提供,基本是出于自主、自愿、知情同意的。因此,他们同时也是性交易活动的利益受体,他们和妈妈桑的关系,是利益受体的两个主体资源合作的关系。这个观点,对于性交易活动,触及了传统伦理学的立场和性伦理的价值观,具有理论建构的冲击力。
- (2)通过理论联系实际的分析后指出,虽然当代男男性交易活动在一定程度 上还沿袭着传统的"游戏规则",但参与者又根据时代和社会的发展,在悄然发生 着更为尊重参与者基本人权的自我变革,对于一些传统的"游戏规则",正在发生 着对性工作者自主意愿和人身权益有所尊重的的变革。
- (3) 通过调查研究指出,MSM 社群虽然在一定程度上存在着"GAY/MB"性与人格价值评价的同一性,但是这个同一性更广泛的指向对男男性行为存在的人格/行为价值的歧视。而根据调查实践,男男性交易活动和 MSM 的社群活动,在

人际关系、性关系、群体关系等方面,并不具有更多的同一性,两者在社会人际 关系的发生和互构,在社会性活动的组织机制、结构、性质方面,虽然存在交叉, 但是基本各成系统。

- (4)通过调查指出,男男性交易活动中发生的种种伤害行为,是因为社会坚持维护传统性道德的"纯道德法理",以及社会对性交易参与者存在着市俗暴虐性质的歧视,才使得性交易活动中的伤害他人的行为反而因为被伤害者需要躲避法律/社会歧视的更大伤害,而维护双方隐秘自行处置的状态。同时,更深层次的指出一些伤害他人的行为,具备着行为人通过报复他人取得自我报复的心理活动背景。
- (5) 调查报告站在当代人文思想立场上,倡导社会对 MB 群体的人文关怀。认为社会只有对他们投注有益、公正、和谐的人文关怀,而不是实行道德/法律的强制,才是制约、规避性交易活动中可能发生的人身伤害,促进 MB 群体尽快发生行为选择改变,帮助他们尽快自立于社会而应该体现的社会责任。

ABSTRACT

Based on adequate analysis of lots of empirical data in relation to MSM commercial sex practice in Chinese society, the author wrote this research report containing valuable findings that have filled a blank area of the subject in the inquiry to sexuality in China.

There are totally 550,000 Chinese characters in the whole book. It has selected and included nearly 500 cases of respondent interviews. After field study, some unknown phenomena were elaborated in details and discussed concretely.

The data collected in this study comes from the people who are involved in MSM commercial sex (sex workers, establishment owners, sex workers' clients, informants and other participants). They openly shared their lived experience with the researchers. The primary raw data that reflects the self expression and interpretation of the subjects in MSM commercial sex practice was rarely seen in the previous studies. The original narratives the respondents who gave openly were meaningful texts that illuminate multiplicity, diversity and particularity in humanity, social relationships and sexual relationships. From their individual and subjective experience, we can learn and understand its social, cultural and economic contexts. They are a valuable resource of valid raw data for further examination from different theoretical perspectives.

After an in-depth investigation, this study has revealed many underlying issues in MSM commercial sex that is far beyond people's stereotypical understanding about it. For example, both sex workers and their clients have diverse needs in commercial sex relationships; Poverty and intimation are not the major reasons why MSM sex workers end up in the sex industry; MSM sex workers may have different views about the values of the body and autonomy of their bodies; There exists a lack of a system that provides deeper social support in MSM commercial sex practice; MSM sex workers have needs that require a humanistic response.

In addition, this study has shed light on many extraordinary issues in the homosexual world, but beyond people's imagination. For example, there are some sex workers who

are highly educated, or elderly, or cross-dressed etc. MSM sex workers may buy sex from female sex workers or other MSM sex workers. The pimps may have sex with the sex workers. Provision of sexual competency training to sex workers and the variation in the acceptance of it; social relationships of the subjects involved in MSM commercial sex; rural migrant workers' passive involvement in MSM commercial sex.

To date, the abovementioned phenomena and issues are still blank and unknown areas of sexuality study and good for a closer examination from multi-disciplinary perspectives. What suggests from the sexual minority and their experience in contrast with their counterparts – sexual majority, can provide valuable insights that informs our understanding of gender, sexual morality and sexual politics.

For example, are there any similarities or differences between homosexual and heterosexual commercial sex practices? An inquiry to this research question, we need to peel off the superficial layer of the homo/heterosexual commercial sex and reveal the wider and deeper social, cultural, historical and ethical contexts of sexuality issue. This study has highlighted some assumptions that needs to be addressed by the social research in the future. From this sense, the significance of this book also lies in showing the directions sexuality studies should go in the future.

This study adheres to the postmodernist view to conceptualize sexuality and examined MSM commercial sex by putting them into a sociological framework. From the above theoretical premises, the author comes out with his own arguments:

- (1) The MSM sex workers in contemporary Chinese society get involved in sex work on the basis of autonomy, voluntary decision and informed consent. Basically their relationships with pimps, clients are not the kind that is inferior, dependent and subordinated. They all benefit from commercial sex. Their relationships with the pimps are the kind that is cooperative and resource sharing. Such an argument surely challenges traditional morality and values and opens up the space for the construction of a new theory.
- (2) MSM commercial sex practice in contemporary Chinese society, although following traditional 'game rules', has been undergone a social transformation that values the basic human rights of the participants. The traditional protocols now give more space to the autonomy and rights of MSM sex workers.
- (3) Within the MSM community, there exist some degree of commonality in the self evaluation of sexuality and self worth. The commonality is more widely seen in the stigmatization and discrimination against homosexual behavior. The research findings, however, reveal more discrepancies between MSM community activities and MSM

commercial sex in terms of interpersonal relationships, sexual relationships and community relations. They have their own structures and systems that operate independently, although there exist some overlapped parts.

- (4) All kinds of harmful behavior that occur in MSM commercial sex activities are a consequence of a law system that endorses traditional sexual morality, and social discrimination against the participants in commercial sex. The harmful behavior can cause more harms when the victims remain silent and feel reluctant to seek for help due to fear of legal punishment and social discrimination. Some individual behavior that causes harm to others is legitimated by the tit-for-tat mentality.
- (5) From a humanistic standpoint, the author tries to advocate on the provision of social support and care to MSM sex workers. He argues that, what can limit or avoid incidence of harmful behavior in commercial sex and sustain behavioral change among sex workers is to give them care and support rather than regulate them with the repressive law and morality. The society should help them to secure autonomy in their social lives.

前言

在美国福特基金会的支持和资助下,北京纪安德咨询中心继 2005 年承担和聘请著名的学者、作家童戈先生主持和写作,完成了卓有影响的《中国人的男男性行为:性与自我认同状态调查》项目以及调查报告以后,又于 2006 年开始,继续聘请童戈独立主持,完成了这个《中国男男性交易状态调查》项目以及这部调查报告。

这两部调查报告的内容可以表明,这是两项在中国国内的性学研究领域具有独 到角度和深入调查的性社会学调查研究成果。这样的两部调查报告,也是两部在研 究思想和方法上具有鲜明特色的性社会学研究的学术著作。

目前,《中国人的男男性行为:性与自我认同状态调查》报告,已经在福特基金会的支持下,进行着英文介绍版本的翻译。相信这个英文介绍版本会为和国外学术界的交流起到信息通道的作用。

北京纪安德咨询中心作为中国国内一家微小的民间咨询、研究机构,为自己能够连续承担、组织两个重要研究项目,以及顺利完成其它各具特色的调查研究项目,为能够给中国,乃至世界的性学研究领域奉献出体现着中国本土特色的有影响力研究成果,感到极大的欣慰和骄傲。

这部《中国男男性交易状态调查》报告,总计55万字,收录了访谈调查个例500例,单元群体的定量调查资料9例。调查报告对中国社会的男男性交易活动状态,进行了比较全面、深入、真实、具体的揭示和分析。我们根据对同类研究成果进行了认真检索以后,现在,我们可以骄傲的说,这个调查研究项目和童戈撰写的这部调查报告,为中国的性学研究领域,填补了男男性交易活动研究这个课题的空白。

这部调查报告以丰富的调查反馈信息,以及人文关怀的审视,揭示了当代中国 社会在现行法律底线以下隐秘发生着的男男性交易活动,和 MSM 社群以性为媒介 发生的人际关系活动比较,既有融合,又在性行为方式的表现、性关系的表现、人际关系的互动、群体活动的组织和发生机制等等方面,多有自成社会活动系统的发生和存在状态。并且,男男性交易活动和异性性交易活动比较,两者在社会人际关系的组织、结构、尤其是性关系的伦理文化认同方面,也存在着极大的差异。

只是,因为现实的社会条件给研究者形成了进入这个领域进行研究实践的障碍,使得大家对这些情况所知甚少。这部调查报告,对许多根据调查实践发现具有性学研究理论价值的问题,在讨论和分析时,只是提出了问题。因为,这些问题新颖而又丰富,不是这样的一部调查报告可以承担的。我们相信,这部调查报告不仅能够为大家了解中国社会的男男性交易活动提供了一个阶梯,而且,还为有志于性学研究的研究者,提供了一个可以深入开掘的性学研究课题的富矿资源。

并且,这部调查报告在性学研究实践中,在调查方法和理论方向上,比较坚定的坚持了当代人文思想的立场。这部调查报告的作者童戈,作为一个"学界的圈外人,GAY社群圈里的学者",对于国内男男性行为研究实践中研究者对于研究对象的话语采纳,始终有着自己独到的看法和立场。

这样的话语采纳,相信会使这部调查报告更为突出的表现着中国社会的社会、 文化、历史、经济状态的本土特色,突出表现着这些人文因素互动关系的本土特 色,也突出表现着中国人男男性活动的社会人际关系互构的本土特色。

因此,我们期待着,这部调查报告能够给国内,乃至国际"性"的人文社会 科学研究领域的风景线上,增添一个风格独到的新颖景观。

这部调查报告的完成,凝聚着多方面的热情支持---

在此,我们诚挚的感谢美国福特基金会对我们的持续信任和支持,尤其要感谢福特基金会北京办事处的李文晶博士。她带着对推进中国性学研究深入发展的殷切期望,给予了我们无私的支持和鼓励!

在此,我们要感谢童戈先生,他自2002年以来,始终以对我们的信任热情接受着我们的聘请,为我们完成相关的项目倾注着他的负责态度和积极工作。我们近年来产出了一批有影响力的理论研究成果,是和他的努力分不开的。我们愿意为他今后的研究工作打造更有效率的工作平台,也为更多的研究者可以拿出出色的成果,提供我们的服务。

在此,我们诚挚的感谢中国人民大学性社会学研究所潘绥铭教授在研究方向和方法上一如既往的给予我们的无私鼓励和指导!

在此,我们诚挚的感谢愿意为这个项目接受我们聘请的各位学术顾问。应该 说,各位学术顾问的指教,更具有突破着学术体制、学术样式、学术观点的束缚, 推进性学研究多元化深入发展的积极意义。

在此,我们诚挚的感谢十几个大中城市帮助我们进行调查工作的"同志"志愿者,包括那些MSM 社群活动经营场所的老板们,没有他们充分的理解和无私的奉献着自己建立的人际关系网络,没有他们通过艾滋病预防的志愿服务所传递的人文关怀得到了有关人士的信任,没有他们反复、深入的解释和动员,我们不可能顺利的进行如此深入、坦诚的访谈调查。

在此,我们还要诚挚的感谢中国艾协志愿者工作委员会、国家CDC性艾中心、国家CDC性病防治中心(南京)、广东省CDC、深圳市CDC、深圳市慢性病防治院等单位,他们为童戈到各地在开会、讲课以后进行这个课题的调查,也提供了一定的方便。

最后,我们带着无比的感动,更要特意感谢那些接受了我们访谈调查的调查 对象。应该是他们在调查中对我们表现出的高度理解和以诚相待,才给这部调查 报告注入了活生生搏动着的充分生命力。

"路漫漫其修远兮,吾将上下以求索。"

人世间的任何事情,总是需要有人来关注,有人来求索,有人来理解,有人 为了促使社会对待这些事物发生进步而付诸行动的!

我们带着大家的理解、鼓励和支持,一定继续付出我们力所能及的不懈努力。

北京纪安德咨询中心 2007年3月

PREFACE

Following the sensational works Titled Sexuality and Expression of Self Identities in Chinese MSM Community in 2005, Beijing Gender Health Education Institute continuously obtained support from Ford Foundation in 2006 to carry out another sexuality study led by Mr. Tong Ge, a famous scholar and writer in China to investigate the issue of Commercial Sex In the Chinese MSM Community. Now the book about this study has been completed successfully.

These two books make significant contribution to the inquiry of sexuality in China in the sense of unique perspectives and in-depth exploration. Their academic values also lie explicitly in conceptualization and research methodology.

At present, the translation of the Book Titled 'Sexuality and Expression of Self Identities in Chinese MSM Community' has been in progress with the support of Ford Foundation. We believe the English Version will surely promote exchange of information and communication with the international academic community.

As a small institution specialized in counseling and research in China, Beijing Gender Health Education Institute feels privileged and delighted carrying out and coming out with these two important works as well as some other research projects. We are pleased to contribute our bits to present research outputs that can better represent China and have greater impact in the arena of the inquiry of sexuality in China and internationally.

This book - 'ommercial Sex In the Chinese MSM Community' is a long research report of approximately 550,000 Chinese characters, that includes 500 cases of indepth interviews as well as analysis of 9 cases of quantitative data. In this research report, the issue of MSM commercial sex in Chinese society is examined and discussed comprehensively with adequate support of details and concrete empirical data. After we

have conducted a careful research on the similar studies, we can proudly say that this research project, together with this book by Mr. Tong Ge as an output of it, has filled the blank in the understanding of the issue of MSM Commercial Sex in the arena of sexuality study in China.

Rich empirical data and a humanistic view in this book sheds light to the phenomena of MSM commercial sex forced underground by the present Chinese law System. Compared and contrasted with the building of social relationships by the means of having sex in the MSM community, MSM commercial sex, apart from some similarities, has its own world in terms of expression of sexual behavior and partnerships, the ways of interaction and communication, mechanism of organizing and developing commercial sex relationships. When we contrast it with heterosexual commercial sex, we can see great discrepancy in the organization and structure of social relationships, especially in sexual morality and ethics.

The actual constraining social circumstances create lots of difficulties that prevent researchers from entering this particular field of study. That's why we know little about this topic. In the parts of discussion and analysis, this research report simply give questions for further consideration in relation to many valuable issues highlighted during the investigation, but hard to be addressed sufficiently in this study. We believe that this investigation report can be instrumental as a window for people to clearly see the phenomenon of MSM Commercial Sex, and as a step stone that allows more sexuality researchers to go further to explore and hunt what glitters underneath this valuable piece of land.

The author adheres to a modern humanistic standpoint during the course of the study, and throughout the process of conceptualization and research methodology. Mr. Tong Ge, as a writer from the Chinese gay community and a scholar outside of the academic sphere, has his particular position and view of points in terms of the importance of use of research respondents? narratives in the inquiry to homosexuality in China.

We believe that their narratives will be powerful enough to illuminate the Chinese social, cultural, historical and economic contexts in this field of study and creates particularity and specificity in the understanding of such a dynamic social world. It also highlights the Chinese context in which social relationships are shaped and reshaped in the Chinese MSM community.

Here we wish this book would be of help to the domestic and international social

scientists. We hope it may strike some sparkles and bring something new and extraordinary in the understanding of human sexuality.

This book would hardly be done without the warmly support of various stakeholders. First and foremost, we would like to extend our sincere gratitude to Ford Foundation for its continuous trust and support, and to Dr. Eve Lee in particular for her unselfish support and encouragement as well as her commitment to the development of sexuality studies in China.

Here we would like to acknowledge Mr. Tong Ge's hard work in this research project. He trusts us always. As early as in 2002, Mr. Tong Ge accepted our invitation and worked hard on the given research projects. The achievements we've made during the recent years would be impossible without his efforts. We would continuously create better working conditions for him and more researchers to make greater success in the field of sexuality study.

Thanks also go to Professor Pan Suiming of Institute of Sexuality and Gender, Renmin University of China for his unfailing encouragement and technical guidance as always.

We would like to thank all the consultants who were invited to give support to this research project. With their participation, we will be able to free our mind from the restrictive academic knowledge, structure and standpoint and add depth to diversity and multiplicity in the field of sexuality study.

Besides, we would like to genuinely acknowledge the support of MSM volunteers in more than ten cities where we conducted investigations. Without their understanding and unselfish sharing of their social connections, without adequate rapport they have developed through delivery of care in their voluntary HIV/AIDS work, and without their patient explanation and mobilization, we would not have had such open and sincere interview conversations that went deep enough.

What's more, we will never forget the contribution of China HIV/AIDS Prevention and Control Society Volunteer Development Unit, National Center for HIV/AIDS Prevention and Control, National Center for STD Prevention and Control (Nanjing), Guangdong CDC, Shenzhen CDC, Shenzhen Chronic Disease Hospital, whose support made it easy for Mr. Tong Ge to attend meetings, give lectures and carry out the investigation in their cities.

Last but not the least, we are greatly indebted to all the respondents who shared their

experience with us. It is their understanding and sincere attitude that keep feeding the book the impulse of lives.

'we have a long, long way to travel, and I

I will explore the truth all the way.'

For anything in the world, there should be always someone who cares about it, someone who studies it, someone who is to understand, and someone who takes action in order to promote a positive progress towards it!

With all the understanding, encouragement and support, we ought to keep up great efforts.

Beijing Gender Health Education Institute