



21世纪法学系列教材

Learning Anglo-American Law: A Thematic Introduction

By Kuo-Lee Li

基础课系列



北京大学出版社
PEKING UNIVERSITY PRESS



21世纪法学系列教材

基础课系列

Learning Anglo-American Law: A Thematic Introduction

By Kuo-Lee Li

烟台大学英美法研究中心



北京大学出版社
PEKING UNIVERSITY PRESS

图书在版编目(CIP)数据

英美法导读/李国利著. —北京:北京大学出版社, 2005. 8

(21 世纪法学系列教材)

ISBN 7-301-09456-6

I. 英… II. 李… III. 英美法系-英文 IV. D904.3

中国版本图书馆 CIP 数据核字(2005)第 086327 号

书 名: Learning Anglo-American Law: A Thematic Introduction (英美法导读)

著作责任者: 李国利 著

责任编辑: 李燕芬

标准书号: ISBN 7-301-09456-6/D·1256

出版发行: 北京大学出版社

地 址: 北京市海淀区成府路 205 号 100871

网 址: <http://cbs.pku.edu.cn>

电 话: 邮购部 62752015 发行部 62750672 编辑部 62752027

电 子 信 箱: pl@pup.pku.edu.cn

排 版 者: 北京高新特打字服务社 82350640

印 刷 者: 北京中科印刷有限公司

经 销 者: 新华书店

730 毫米×980 毫米 16 开本 19.375 印张 369 千字

2005 年 8 月第 1 版 2005 年 8 月第 1 次印刷

定 价: 29.00 元

未经许可,不得以任何方式复制或抄袭本书之部分或全部内容。

版权所有,翻版必究

Resume

Professor Li was born in Yantai City, Shandong province in 1935. He graduated from the Law School of Taiwan University in 1959.

In 1963, he left Taiwan for Canada to study at the Institute of Air and Space Law and the Library Information Science School of McGill University. In 1968, he obtained the two master degrees in the same year. Since then, he taught at both the Institute and the Law School of McGill University. He retired in 2000.

Professor Li has a very strong interest in space law, international law, and philosophy of law. In these areas, he published a number of essays, and wrote the most comprehensive multi-volume World-wide Space Law Bibliography.

After China and Canada established diplomatic relations, Professor Li took an active and leading role in advocating the importance of establishing an institutional base for Chinese law. In 1987, with the support of the leaders of overseas Chinese in Canada, the China Law Foundation was founded and he was elected as the chairman of the Foundation. Subsequently in the name of the Foundation, he donated more ten thousands of law books in English on the law of United States, Canada, and Great Britain to the Peking University, Yantai University, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Trade and Commerce Promotion Commission, and so on.

After retirement, Professor Li has always come back to his hometown Yantai to live for a few months. Because of his deep interest in the promotion of legal education in China, he conferred with the Law School of Yantai University in early 1999 for the purpose of devoting his service in this respect. In 2000, he accepted the position of teaching Anglo-American Law in English at the university. To serve as a teaching and research platform, they established the Center for Study of Anglo-American Law of Yantai University in 2002. And he has been appointed as its founding Director.

Professor Li take his position and responsibility very seriously. He purport to promote the comparative value of Anglo-American Law in China and help with her legal modernization undertaking.

Preface

This publication is the revised text of the content of lectures given at the Faculty of Law, Yantai University. Some of the lectures are based on a number of books on the subjects included. Other lectures included are the results of my own findings and views. As such, these are not normally found in books of this nature. But in my opinion, they are very much an integral part of the subject matter, Anglo-American Law. The main focus of the lectures is on the law and legal system of the United States. This is primarily due to the fact that not only the United States has adopted the Common law tradition, it has the most rich and vibrant law and legal system in the work and has an unprecedented and unsurpassed influence internationally.

The lectures purport to emphasize the systemic components, features, and characteristics of Anglo-American Law. This is evident from the content of the lectures. No subject components of any substantive law, especially private law are included. What are generally missed or overlooked by other introductory works on Anglo-American Law have been particularly chosen to strengthen the systematic nature of Anglo-American Law properly understood. Thus, one finds in this work a chapter on Anglo-American Law and you, the building of a good legal system, United States law in action, legal reason, legal research and legal materials.

The systematic emphasis of the lectures is purported to stress the process and operation of the making, unmaking and remaking of the law rather than inanimate nature of substantive rules. The emphasis is on how decisions are made, how decision-makers interact and how a rule of law finally emerges. The central theme of the emphasis is interactivity between sources and decision-makers. How and why decision-makers interact and how and why the law finally emerges is believed to be an important element in studying Anglo-American Law.

For ease of learning and locating any specific text and information, a detailed table of content is deliberately structured. In addition, catching headings and distinct paragraphs are specifically created. The unique way of the structure of the table of content also serves to reveal at a quick glance the thematic presentation of lectures and the content thereof. Instead of a subject index normally featured in

2 Learning Anglo-American Law: A Thematic Introduction

books of this nature, it is believed that a detailed table of content is a better means of access. In a few instances, text of a more or less similar nature is found in more than one place. This is deliberately done to maintain the holistic structure of the topic concerned.

In addition to the many books that inform these lectures, an amply number of footnote references have been provided. However, should there be any mistakes, gaps, omissions, inaccuracies, they are the sole responsibility of the author and should not attributed to any institution or individual that is associated with the author.

Kuo-Lee Li

Center for Study of Anglo-American Law

December 28, 2004

Yantai University, China

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter One: Anglo-American Law and You	1
Section One: Political and Moral Perspective	1
Section Two: Anglo-American Law Defined	2
A. Common Law Countries	3
B. Subjects of the Common Law	4
Section Three: Study of Anglo-American Law — Why, What and How	4
A. What Is or Counts as Foreign Law — Definition and Clarification	5
B. Why for Study of Anglo-American Law	5
C. Reasons for Study — Summary	7
D. Implications of Globalization of Law: International Trade, Commerce and Private Law — Unification and Uniform Application	8
E. Similarity of Private Law Worldwide	9
Section Four: Factors and Considerations Affecting Choice of Foreign Law	11
A. Foreign Law Chosen on the Basis of Shared History and Tradition	11
B. Foreign Law Chosen on the Basis of Superior Human Value Conditions	11
C. Foreign Law Chosen on the Basis of Special Relationship	11
D. Foreign Law Chosen on the Basis of Superior Legal Structure and Framework	11
E. Foreign Law Chosen on the Basis of the Rationality of Substantive Content of Its Laws	12
Section Five: Methodology and Approach of Foreign Law Study	13
A. How Should Anglo-American Law Be Studied	13
Section Six: Importance of Knowledge of Legal Research and Legal Materials	16
Section Seven: Need for Study of Foreign Law in Vernacular	17
Section Eight: What or the Subject Matter of Study	17
A. Hot Topics and In-Demand Subject or Issue; Reactive Research	17
B. Topics or Issues for Scholarly and Theoretical Research	18
C. Study the Common Law as a Unique Legal System	18

2 Learning Anglo-American Law: A Thematic Introduction

D. Study the Philosophical Ideas Informing Anglo-American Law	19
Section Nine: Sources, Texts and Materials of Study of Anglo-American Law	20
Section Ten: Conditions and Factors Determinative of the Need and Viability of Legal Transplant	20
Chapter Two: Sources of Law in General	22
Section One: Codes and Statutes	22
Section Two: Regulations, Decrees and Administrative Directives	22
Section Three: Binding Nature or Significance of Administrative Directives	23
Section Four: Judicial Decisions	23
Section Five: Non-state or Unofficial Sources of Law	24
Section Six: Legal Pluralism and Legal Centralism — Written Law v. Unwritten Law, Express v. Implicit Law, Law in Book v. Law in Action	26
A. Pre-(state) Law	26
B. Relative Insignificance of Judicial Law (Settlement of Disputes)	27
C. Implicit Law, Unwritten or Autonomous Ordering	28
Section Seven: Custom	33
Section Eight: Sources of American Law Worthy of Special Mention	35
A. Statute Law	36
B. Constitution as Source	37
C. Treaties and International Agreements	38
D. Administrative Law	38
E. Compilations and Consolidations of Laws	38
F. Court Rules	39
G. Uniform State Law	39
H. Secondary Authority	40
I. Restatement of Law: Nature and Status	40
J. View of Formalism vs. Realism as to What Counts as Law	41
K. Authoritative and Effective Decision as Source	42
L. Integration of All Sources of Law-Generating Actions and Decisions	43
Chapter Three: The Common Law	44
Section One: Historical Development of the Common Law	44

A. First: The Anglo-Saxon Period (Preceding the Norman Conquest, 1066)	44
B. Second: Formation of the Common Law (1066—1485): From Writs to Actions on the Case	44
C. Third Period: Growth of Equity (1485—1832)	46
D. Fourth: The Modern Period	49
Section Two: Special Character of English Law	50
A. Distinct Characteristics of English Common Law	51
B. Courts Decide Fate of Statutes Through Interpretation	54
C. US Courts Incorporate Legislative Innovations and Policies into Common Law Principles	54
D. Courts Apply Principles Derived From Statutes	55
Section Three: Certain Characteristics of the Common Law Authority	55
Section Four: Sources of the British Common Law	56
Section Five: Importance of Legal Structure, Defining Categories and Concepts	57
Section Six: English Judicial Organization	57
Section Seven: Judicial Authority in England	60
Section Eight: Form and Content of English Judgments	60
Chapter Four: Legal System and Foundation of Law of the United States	62
Section One: General Remark	62
Section Two: Reasons for Choice of Focus	62
Section Three: Spirit and Fundamental Characteristics of American Law and Society	63
A. Liberty, Rights and Government by Consent	63
B. Individualism, Competing Values and Personal Choice	63
C. Distrust of Government: Separation and Limitation of Powers, Checks and Balances, Political Accountability and the Bill of Rights	63
D. Pragmatism in Law	65
E. Government under the Rule of Law	66
F. Tolerance	67
G. Optimism	67
H. Unity Out of Diversity	68
I. Diversity as Divisiveness: Disquieting Factors and Troubling Voices	68
Section Four: Basic Constitutional and Political Structure	69
Section Five: Division and Limits of Legal Authority of the United States	71

4 Learning Anglo-American Law: A Thematic Introduction

A. Originality of American Law	71
B. Place of Statute in American Law: The Abnormal or Excessive Attitude toward Statute	71
Section Six: Allocation of Legal Authority between Federal and State Governments	72
A. Inherent Legal Authority of the States	72
B. Jurisdiction of Federal Law vs. Jurisdiction of State Law	72
C. Supremacy Clause	74
D. Preemption Controversies	74
E. Derivative Principle of Preemption Clause	75
F. Continued Importance of State and Local Law	75
Section Seven: Judicial Organization	75
A. Organization of Courts	75
B. Administrative Agencies and Tribunals	76
C. State Courts	77
D. Jury	77
Section Eight: Allocation of Judicial Authority	78
A. General Allocation	78
B. Two Primary Bases of Federal Jurisdiction	78
C. Structure Parallel Systems of Adjudication: Judicial Dualism	79
D. Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act, 28 U. S. C para. 1330	79
E. Jurisdiction of the Supreme Court	80
Section Nine: Reception of the Common Law in the United States	81
A. Ignorance and Slight of the Common Law	82
B. Influence of the Codification Movement	82
C. Triumph of the Common Law	82
Section Ten: Is There a United States Common Law or a Distinct Common Law for Each State Individually	84
A. Different Social and Economic Conditions Produced Diverse Common Law	84
B. Common Law Develop s along the Same Line and Way as Legislation: Federal and State	84
C. Complicating Factors	85
Section Eleven: The Cohesion and Unity of American Law	87
Section Twelve: Unifying State Common Laws — Role of State and not Federal Courts	87

Section Thirteen: Codification of American Common Law	88
Section Fourteen: A Systematic Statement of the Common Law	89
Section Fifteen: Protection from the Burdens of Multi-State Legal Authority	89
A. Tradition of Uniform Laws	90
B. Constitutional Limit on the Reach of State Court Jurisdiction and Choice of Law	91
C. Negative Commerce Clause	92
Chapter Five: Case Law: Form, Nature and Function of Judicial Decisions	94
Section one: Form and Content of Judicial Decisions	94
Section two: The Judicial Function	94
Section Three: Meaning and Scope of the Rule of Precedent in British Law	95
Section Four: Doctrine of Stare Decisis and Its Justification	96
Section Five: The Doctrine of Stare Decisis and Ratio Decidendi or Holding of a Case	96
Section Six: Transforming Facts into Binding Legal Rules	97
Section Seven: In Search of an Ideal Holding or Ratio Decidendi of a Case	97
Section Eight: Rule of Precedent and Statute Law	99
Section Nine: Obiter Dictum: Definition and Clarification	100
Section Ten: Ratio, Obiter and Principle	100
Section Eleven: Doctrine of Stare Decisis in U. S. Law	101
Section Twelve: The Overriding Importance of the Opinions of the Appellate Courts	103
Section Thirteen: Factors Likely to Figure in Distinguishing Decisions	103
Section Fourteen: Opposing Treatments of Precedents	104
Section Fifteen: To Distinguish or To Overrule	105
Section Sixteen: Multi-legged Holding	105
Section Seventeen: The Retroactive Effect of Application of Judicial Decisions	106
Section Eighteen: Contradiction and Tension between Predictability and Hard Cases	107
Section Nineteen: More Characterizations of the Common Law	108

6 Learning Anglo-American Law: A Thematic Introduction

Section Twenty: Is the Common Law a Living Law	110
Section Twenty-one: The Common Law — Vitality, Staying Power and Continuing Relevance	111
Section Twenty-two: Common Law in the Welfare State of the Twentieth Century — the Age of Statutes	112
Chapter Six: United States Law in Action: the Operative and Interactive Dynamics	114
Section one: The Defining Character and Spirit of Anglo-American Law	114
Section two: The Contrast between Law in Action and Law in Book	114
Section three: Sites, Sources and Manifestations of Law and Legal System in Action: State and Non-state	118
Section four: The Life of Law in Common Law America: Selective Accounts of the Interactive Dynamics of Elite Power Decisions	122
A. Check and Balance: The Overriding Principle of Interactivity	122
B. Exemplary Interactive Relationships between the President, the Congress, the Court and the States	123
C. Life and Fate of Legislation	127
D. Judicial Attitude toward Legislation: The Legal Standing or Status of Legislation in the Legal System	128
E. Place of Statute in American Law	128
F. Transforming Statutes into Common Law: The Life of Statute Takes on the Form of the Common Law	129
G. Nature and Content of the United States Code	129
H. Constitutional Activism of the Judiciary	130
I. Measures Taken to Counter Anti-Democratic or Unpopular Judicial Review	133
J. Life and Fate of a Common Law Rule or Common Law Case	135
K. Role of Lawyers in Shaping Judicial Law	137
L. Checking Judicial Law by Legislative Decision or Executive Action	138
M. Judges and Judge-made Law vs. Legislatures and Legislation	139
N. Scholarly Rendering and Exposition of Legislation	140
O. Formation of Leading Cases: The Role and Contribution of Jurists	141
P. Scholars and Scholar's Law Versus Judges and Judicial Law	141
Q. Some Anecdotal Observations of the U. S. Legal System in Action.	144

R. Conclusion	145
S. In Search of Emerging Law	146
Section five: Some Critical Observations on the Law of the United States in Action: Phenomenon of Idealization of Law, Juridification Saturation of Society and Hypertrophying of Law and Legal Reason	148
Section six: Modes and Levels of Dispute Resolution	150
Section seven: Critique of the Efficiently Processed Dispute Theory and Its Notorious Conclusions	151
Chapter Seven: Good Legal System, Good Laws and Good Decision-makers Lawyers	156
Section One: Legal System and System of Law Distinguished	156
Section Two: Good Legal System Produces Good Laws	158
A. The Formal and Procedural Requirements for a Good Legal System	158
B. Legal Proceduralism	159
Section Three: Good Law Informs Good Legal System	161
A. Substantive Moral Requirements for a Good Legal System	161
B. Democratic Foundation and Spirit of Law and Legal System	162
C. Democratizing Law-Making (Authoritative and Effective Decision) Process	165
D. Open and Transparent Decision-making	167
E. Elite Powers and Democracy	169
F. Equality before the Law: Equal Protection of the Laws	170
G. Timely Access to the Court	171
Section Four: The Virtue of Legal Simplicity	172
A. General	172
B. Some Defining Elements of Legal Simplicity	173
Section Five: The Falsity of Legal Complexity	174
Section Six: Private Ordering Versus State Law	175
Section Seven: Transnational Component of the National Legal System	178
Section Eight: Human Elements of a Good Legal System and Good Law	179
A. Rule of Law vs. Rule of Man	179
B. Good Lawyer, Good Legal System and Good Laws	182
C. American Law Schools and Legal Education	188
D. The Conditions and Requirements of a Good Judge	195

8 Learning Anglo-American Law: A Thematic Introduction

E. Condition and Requirements of a Good Politician	201
F. Condition and Requirements of a Good Legal Scholar or Jurist	205
G. Conditions and Requirements of a Good Citizen	209
Chapter Eight: Legal Reason and Executing Decision	211
Section one: Law and Legal Reason	213
A. Nature of Legal Reason	214
B. Content or Material Bases of Legal Reason	216
C. Distinctive Nature and Superior Status of Reason	218
D. Reason and Discretionary Decision	221
E. Allure and Risk of Legal Reason	222
F. Evaluation and Balancing of Reason	224
G. Authoritative and Effective Decisions and Justifying Reason	226
H. Truth and Myth of Judicial Reason	227
I. Moral, Epistemological Pluralism and Incommensurability	231
J. Limits of Legal Reason and Limits of Knowledge	234
K. Reason Runs Out	235
L. Subjective versus Objective Reason	237
M. Reason, Faith and Other Belief Systems	238
N. Belief in Disguise of Reason	240
O. Legal Reason is a Noble Scam: The Self-referential Nature of Law and Legal Reason	242
P. Beyond Reason, Beyond Law; Without Reason, Without Law	245
Q. Law, Reason and Deep, Divisive Social Issues	248
R. Critique of Cynicism, Defeatism and Self-denial of Law and Reason — "As If Jurisprudence"	250
S. Doubters' Law and Legal Reason	251
T. Truth in Law and Reason	252
U. Emotion in Political and Moral Debate	255
V. Defending and Redeeming Reason	256
W. Re-imagine and Re-conceptualize Law and Reason	258
Chapter Nine: Civil Litigation	260
A. General Remarks	260
B. Start a Lawsuit with a Complaint and a Summons	260
C. Responses to the Complaint	261

D. Truth and Adversarial Advocacy	263
E. Multi-Party Actions	263
F. Class Action	264
G. Discovery	265
H. Pre-trial conference	267
I. Summary Judgment	267
J. Trial	268
K. Jury Trial and Selection	269
L. Nature of Jury Decision	269
M. Trial or Legal Proceedings	269
N. Jury Instructions	271
O. Rogue Juror	272
P. Appeals	274
Q. Reason for Appeal	275
R. Finality Principle	275
S. The "De Novo" Nature of the Appellant Proceedings	275
T. Brief Amicus Curiae	276
U. Options of Appellant Ruling	276
V. Judge's Discretionary Rulings	277
Chapter Ten: Legal Research and Legal Materials	278
Section One: Legal Research in General	278
Section Two: Practical Legal Research	279
A. Identify, Analyze and Characterize Significant Facts	280
B. Identify and Formulate Legal Issues	280
C. Research the Issues and Update Findings	281
D. Identify and Analyze Social Change and Trends	282
Section Three: Legal Materials and Publications	282
A. Publications of Judicial Decisions	283
B. Finding Case Law	285
C. Finding Legislation	287
D. Finding Legislative Documents	289
E. Finding Administrative Law	289
F. Shepard's Citations	290
G. Lexis and Westlaw Online Services	290
General References	293

Chapter One: Anglo-American Law and You

Section One: Political and Moral Perspective

You are the center of the legal normative universe. Anglo-American Law is part of that universe, same as your domestic law. This is true whether you take the nationalist perspective of law and the internationalist perspective of law. How do you live through your experience with Anglo-American Law will inform, define, and shape that normative universe — a universe that aspires to and cherishes liberty, democracy, equality, justice and other highly regarded values of political morality. This legal normative universe is a shared and collaborated one; you share it with all citizens who take an internal view of it. What form, content, character, objectives and functions of this shared and collaborated normative universe will take depends very much on your intelligence, efforts, devotion, and commitment. You are the protagonist of this inclusive, shared, and evolving normative universe. You are its master.

Your response to the idea above may be fast and sharp. You would retort by saying that this is incredible, unrealistic, and even fantasy; I am not the master of my house, the legal universe of my own country, let alone the master of the Anglo-American Law world. From where I am to where you imagine I will be, it is a long and difficult way. The prospect looks like an ever-fading horizon.

Aim high and hit low. There is a will, there is a way. You create your world. First you must have a right perspective. You have to mobilize the power of intention, efforts, devotion, and commitment. The power of intention and a heart-felt and life-long commitment would bring you to your destiny. Your perspective may be that of a nationalist, or internationalist. You may take a stance from an external or an internal point of view. These perspectives and stances will converge at the right time and form a unity, if not in reality, at least in your mind.

Remember that you are not alone. You as a collective political moral force just may be able to change the legal normative world.

Section Two: Anglo-American Law Defined

Broadly speaking, Anglo-American Law may be understood to signify the entire body of the law of the English-speaking world. Such a view would include the Common Law, all the established sources of law and much more. Narrowly defined, it mainly refers to the Common Law tradition, especially the Common Law system as it was conceived by and evolved first in England and as received in all other countries belonging to that tradition.

The sources of the Anglo-American Law world include much more than the Common Law — a body of law that is understood to be originally derived from the decisions of the royal courts of England as well as the principles developed from these decisions. In its broad conception, Anglo-American Law signifies the decisions of the court as well as other established sources of a primary nature. In addition, it encompasses secondary sources of law. Moreover, any broad and realistic conception of the sources of law would extend much further to include all law generative events and phenomena. Thus, any comprehensive study of Anglo-American Law has to cover the Common Law which in modern terminology refers to the law of judicial decisions or judicial law, legislation, and other sources of authoritative and effective decisions, state and non-state.

The main feature of Anglo-American Law is that it is a body of law based on judicial decisions — judge made law. More specifically, it adheres to the basic concepts, principles, and values originated from that version of the law as it arose and developed in England. But this should be understood as true as far as private law and a few other subjects are concerned. ^①

Some believe that the Common Law before anything else is reason. Today in England, law remains primarily a work of reason and distinct from legislation or statute. For example one does not think of the Common Law as a system of “National Law”; it is much more “the common heritage of the English-speaking peoples.”

In modern welfare states, judicial decisions are not what people mostly concerned with. What affects their life are increasingly more legislative, administrative, regulatory, and even rules, regulations, and decisions made in the

^① Atiyah and Summers, *Form and Substance in Anglo-American Law: A Comparative Study of Legal Reasoning, Legal theory and Legal Institutions*, Oxford, N. Y., Clarendon Press, 1987.