

DESCRIBING
ENGLISH
LANGUAGE

Series editors

John Sinclair

Ronald Carter

Patterns of Lexis in Text

Michael Hoey

Oxford University Press

DESCRIBING ENGLISH LANGUAGE

SERIES EDITORS

John Sinclair · Ronald Carter

Patterns of Lexis in Text

Michael Hoey

Oxford University Press 1991

Oxford University Press
Walton Street, Oxford OX2 6DP

Oxford New York Toronto
Delhi Bombay Calcutta Madras Karachi
Petaling Jaya Singapore Hong Kong Tokyo
Nairobi Dar es Salaam Cape Town
Melbourne Auckland

and associated companies in
Berlin Ibadan

Oxford English and the *Oxford English* logo are trade marks of Oxford University Press

ISBN 0 19 437142 5

© Michael Hoey 1991

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior permission of Oxford University Press.

This book is sold subject to the condition that it shall not, by way of trade or otherwise, be lent, re-sold, hired out or otherwise circulated without the publisher's prior consent in any form of binding or cover other than that in which it is published and without a similar condition including this condition being imposed on the subsequent purchaser.

Typeset in 11/13pt Sabon by Pentacor PLC, High Wycombe, Bucks
Printed in Hong Kong

To my children,
Alice and Richard (in alphabetical order)
Richard and Alice (by age)
(since I could never put one before the other)

Acknowledgements

The work reported in this book has been almost twenty years in the making and has in that time been helped by many people. It began life as research towards a thesis under the supervision of Sir Randolph Quirk. Though pressure of employment and other research interests resulted in that thesis never being written, the initial encouragement, advice, and guidance of Sir Randolph made an impact on the work that is still with it today, to its great benefit. All the positions adopted in Chapters 5 and 6 were in place by the late seventies but my inexperience and the climate of linguistics at that time meant that I was not in a position to write it up in a way that would have reached an audience. During that period I was greatly supported and advised by Eugene Winter who has been tireless in his encouragement and helpful criticism ever since. The most recent fruits of his support have been the detailed and wide-ranging comments he has offered on the complete manuscript of this book. Although, like every author, I have clung to some of my errors, there is no question that my book is markedly better for his advice.

The book has also been read in part or in full by other colleagues and friends. John Sinclair and Ron Carter, editors of this series, have introduced all kinds of improvement as a result of their careful and sympathetic readings of the work; John's support over the past few years has been crucial in bringing it to fruition. Malcolm Coulthard, Sara Fine, Mike McCarthy, Antoinette Renouf, and David Shepherd have each commented valuably on chapters of the work. David Wilson, at Oxford University Press, has been a sympathetic and interested editor at the publisher's end. To all of these great thanks are due.

No lecturer fails to learn from his students, and I have been particularly fortunate in mine. Several intakes of the University of Birmingham's Sandwich MA in Applied English Linguistics have tested out in a generous manner the claims I make in this book; although too many to name here, these students have helped enormously in the development and improvement of the descriptive system this book outlines, as have members of our former BPhilEd course. Amongst my postgraduate thesis and project students (former and current), I have learnt particularly from Evelyn Cheung, Ann Darnton, Cathy Emmott, Susan Hunston, Christina Rammell, Tania Shepherd, and Sarah Thomas, all of whom have either introduced me to ideas that have materially affected the work presented in this book, or have tried aspects of my ideas in their work and in so doing made them their own. But these represent the tip of an iceberg as a glance at the bibliography

Acknowledgements

will reveal, and it is only space and the desire not to appear to be diluting my gratitude that prevents me from listing many more.

I have also benefited greatly from the opportunity to present aspects of the current work in a number of different places, and I am grateful to The British Council, the host organizations, and the University of Birmingham for making this possible. What I have to say and the way I say it has been sharpened markedly by presentations I was able to give at a Seminar for Returned Study Fellows held in Pune, India; during a workshop in Poland organized by the University of Warsaw; on courses at the Universities of Paraná, Santa Caterina, and Minas Gerais in Brazil; as part of two PILC seminars and a Summer School in Finland; at the Jubilee Seminar of the Institute for Anvendt Sprakvitenskap in conjunction with NORDWRITE at the University of Trondheim, Norway; at the UTELI conference in Israel, and at the 16th International Systemics Congress held in Helsinki. Closer to home, I was able to present papers at my own University, and the Universities of Nottingham, Warwick, and Exeter. In all of these places I have received the most valuable feedback.

Writing a book is, despite all the help that I have been gratefully acknowledging, a solitary and potentially unsociable business. My final and most heartfelt thanks must therefore be to my family for allowing this book to happen. Sue, my wife, is a creative and dynamic force in curriculum development in South Birmingham but she has never allowed her own arduous work schedule to interfere in any way with my research or writing and has at all times been a source of unqualified encouragement and support. My children, too, have always offered their support and never questioned the necessity of my sitting in my study most evenings; they seem never to have loved me the less for the loss of my time. It is most appropriate, therefore, that this book should be dedicated to them.

The author and publishers would like to thank the following for permission to reproduce material that falls within their copyright:

BBC Enterprises Limited for an extract from *BBC Wildlife* magazine March 1984 (Vol. 2/3).

Forum Linguisticum for an extract from 'Replacement as a fundamental function of the sentence in context', by E. O. Winter, in Vol. 4/2 (1979).

International Reading Association, Delaware, for an extract, by R. Hasan, from *Understanding Reading Comprehension* (1984) ed. J. Flood.

Istoé for the extract 'Ostracismo Rompido', from the 1 July 1987 edition.

Longman Group UK Limited for extracts from *Cohesion in English* (1976) by M. A. K. Halliday and R. Hasan.

Acknowledgements

Thomas Nelson & Sons Ltd for extracts from *Masters of Political Thought* Vol. 1 (by Michael Foster, 1942) and Vol. 3 (by Lane W. Lancaster, 1959).

North-Holland Linguistic Services, Elsevier Science Publications, and the author, for extracts from *Aspects of Text Structure: an investigation of the lexical organization of text* (1985) by M. Phillips.

Sunday Mail, Zimbabwe, for the extract 'Only one prisoner's release holds key to SA escape from sanctions' in the 7 December 1986 edition.

Word for extracts from 'Categories of the theory of grammar' in Vol. 17/3 (1961) by M. A. K. Halliday.

Every effort has been made to trace the owners of copyright material in this book, but we should be pleased to hear from any copyright holder whom we have been unable to contact.

The author and series editors

Michael Hoey is a senior lecturer in the School of English at the University of Birmingham where he has worked since 1979. Previously, from 1970 to 1979, he lectured in linguistics at the Hatfield Polytechnic. At Birmingham he teaches on the MA course in Applied English Linguistics, and has played a crucial role in the setting up and running of the Cobuild project: for three years he acted as its research administrator. His research has been in discourse analysis, lexis, and stylistics. Dr Hoey has presented his work in lectures and seminars in places as far apart as Brazil and Poland, and has published widely in his areas of research since 1979.

John Sinclair has been Professor of Modern English Language at the University of Birmingham since 1965. His main areas of research are discourse (both spoken and written) and computational linguistics—with particular emphasis on the study of very long texts. He has been consultant/adviser to a number of groups including, among others, the Bullock Committee, The British Council, and the National Congress for Languages in Education. He holds the title of Adjunct Professor in Jiao Tong University, Shanghai. Professor Sinclair has published extensively, and is currently Editor-in-Chief of the Cobuild project at Birmingham University.

Ronald Carter is Professor of Modern English Language in the Department of English Studies at the University of Nottingham where he has taught since 1979. He is Chairman of the Poetics and Linguistics Association of Great Britain, a member of CNAAs panels for Humanities, and a member of the Literature Advisory Committee of The British Council. Dr Carter has published widely in the areas of language and education, applied linguistics, and literary linguistics. He is Director of the Centre for English Language Education at the University of Nottingham and is currently seconded part-time as National Co-ordinator for Language in the National Curriculum.

Foreword

Describing English Language

The Describing English Language series provides much-needed descriptions of modern English. Analysis of extended naturally-occurring texts, spoken and written, and, in particular, computer processing of texts have revealed quite unsuspected patterns of language. Traditional descriptive frameworks are normally not able to account for or accommodate such phenomena, and new approaches are required. This series aims to meet the challenge of describing linguistic features as they are encountered in real contexts of use in extended stretches of discourse. Accordingly, and taking the revelations of recent research into account, each book in the series will make appropriate reference to corpora of naturally-occurring data.

The series will cover most areas of the continuum between theoretical and applied linguistics, converging around the mid-point suggested by the term 'descriptive'. In this way, we believe the series can be of maximum potential usefulness.

One principal aim of the series is to exploit the relevance to teaching of an increased emphasis on the description of naturally-occurring stretches of language. To this end, the books are illustrated with frequent references to examples of language use. Contributors to the series will consider both the substantial changes taking place in our understanding of the English language and the inevitable effect of such changes upon syllabus specifications, design of materials and choice of method.

John Sinclair, *University of Birmingham*
Ronald Carter, *University of Nottingham*

Patterns of Lexis in Text

Dr Hoey already has an international reputation for original work in the structure of written discourse. He has for many years insisted on the importance of lexical patterning, and has gradually worked out the original position which he sets out in this new book. This position has the advantage that, while giving valuable insights into text organization from a theoretical point of view, it is also of direct practical relevance; an application of it to automatic abstracting has attracted research support recently.

The idea that vocabulary words might be best described in dictionaries is challenged strongly by this book. It shows that much of the coherence, as well as the cohesion, of text is created by the lexical ties of individual words with each other.

Dr Hoey writes fluently, and explains complicated matters in straightforward prose. His enthusiasm for his subject is evident on every page.

John Sinclair

Contents

The author and series editors	xv
Foreword	xvi

PART ONE

Introduction: questions that need answering

Chapter 1 Questions about cohesion

1.1 The aim of this book	3
1.2 The nature of cohesion	3
1.3 Questions concerning the place of cohesion	10
Question 1: cohesion and coherence	11
Question 2: cohesion and sentence relationships	12
Question 3: cohesion and text organization	13
1.4 Work relevant to the questions	14
Hasan (1984)	14
Winter (1974, 1979)	16
Phillips (1985)	21
1.5 A way forward	25

Chapter 2 A metaphor for text organization

2.1 The aim of this chapter	26
2.2 Sentence as a metaphor for text	26
2.3 An alternative metaphor	30
2.4 A simple example	35
The repetition links: sentence 1	36
The repetition links: sentence 2	38
The repetition links: sentence 3	39
The repetition links: sentence 4	40
2.5 A representation of the repetition patterning	41
2.6 Unwanted cohesion	42
2.7 Interpretation of the patterning: central and marginal sentences	43
2.8 Interpretation of the patterning: common ground between sentences	45
2.9 Conclusions	48

PART TWO

Answers from text analysis

Chapter 3 Types of repetition

3.1	The aim of this chapter	51
3.2	Repetition as links	51
3.3	Simple lexical repetition	52
3.4	Complex lexical repetition	55
3.5	Text-forming versus 'chance' lexical repetition	56
3.6	Simple paraphrase	62
3.7	Complex paraphrase and the link triangle	64
3.8	Superordinate, hyponymic, and co-reference repetition	69
3.9	Other ways of repeating	70
	Personal pronouns	71
	Demonstrative pronouns and modifiers	72
	Other substitution links	73
3.10	A last look at the 'collection of texts' metaphor	75

Chapter 4 Patterns of repetition in non-narrative text

4.1	The aim of this chapter	76
4.2	The data	78
4.3	Identification of repetition links	81
4.4	Construction of a repetition matrix	84
4.5	Creation of a net of bonds	91
4.6	An extension to the data	94
4.7	Conclusions	99

Chapter 5 The significance of repetition nets

5.1	The aim of this chapter	100
5.2	The removal of certain features of cohesion	100
5.3	The net as record of bonding	104
5.4	Marginal sentences	105
	Sentences 5, 9, and 10	106
	Sentence 18	107
	Sentence 27	108
	Sentences 30 and 31	108
	Sentence 13	109
	Abridgement: procedure 1 (marginal sentences)	113

Contents

5.5	Central sentences	113
	Abridgement: procedure 2 (central sentences)	114
5.6	Topic opening and topic closing	118
	Clear topic-opening sentences	119
	Clear topic-closing sentences	120
	Other topic openings and closings	121
5.7	Conclusions	124

Chapter 6 Properties of the bonds of the nets

6.1	The aim of this chapter	125
6.2	Claims for the bonds	125
6.3	Testing the strong claim	127
	Sentences 1 and 4	127
	Sentences 1 and 7	128
	Sentences 1 and 17	129
	Sentences 17 and 24	130
	Sentences 19 and 26	130
	Sentences 20 and 38	130
	Sentences 21 and 23	131
	Sentences 23 and 36	132
	Sentences 23 and 38	132
	Sentences 25 and 28	133
6.4	Testing the weak claim	133
	Excessive repetition	134
	The effect of voice choice	136
	The effect of modal choice	136
	The effect of given–new relationships	138
	The role of context	141
6.5	Abridgement: procedure 3 (topic-controlling sentences)	142
	Sentence 17: summary	143
	Sentence 38: first summary	144
	Sentence 38: second summary	146
	Sentence 1: summary	147
6.6	Distance bonding	149
6.7	Bonding and reader creativity	152
6.8	Bonding and writer creativity	155
6.9	Conclusions	159

Chapter 7 How the links work

7.1	The aim of this chapter	162
7.2	How the pairs are related	162
7.3	Processes in the creation of parallelism	167
	Lexical expansion	170
	Lexical reduction	170
	Lexical transference	171
	Lexical substitution	171
	Syntactic equivalence	171
	Discoursal expansion	172
7.4	Exemplification of the processes of parallelism	174
	Sentences 17 and 24	174
	Sentences 19 and 26	176
	Sentences 21 and 23	179
7.5	Conclusions	183

PART THREE

Implications for theory and practice

Chapter 8 Implications for a theory of language

8.1	The aim of this chapter	187
8.2	Claims about the nature of text	188
8.3	Text as structure versus text as organization	193
8.4	Halliday's map of language (1961)	194
8.5	The meaning of context in Halliday (1961)	196
8.6	A revision of Halliday's map of language	198
8.7	The place of monologue in a map of language study	202
8.8	The place of lexis in a map of language study	206
8.9	Implications of our map of language	209
8.10	Further symmetries in our map of language	210
	Reference to adjacent areas	210
	The relationship of speech and writing	211
	Grammar and discourse	211
	Sentence and morpheme	214
	Relationships across the map of language	217
8.11	Conclusions	220

Contents

Chapter 9 Implications for reading and writing

9.1	The aim of this chapter	221
9.2	The reader's active role	221
9.3	Typical reading purposes	223
9.4	Typical reading strategies	224
9.5	Reading quickly and reading carefully	225
9.6	Identifying relevant sentences	226
9.7	Getting sense out of a text	231
9.8	Rough and ready analyses	235
9.9	Reading for reference	236
9.10	The teaching of lexis	240
9.11	Repetition and writing	242
9.12	Conclusions	245
Appendix I		246
Appendix II		249
Appendix III		253
Appendix IV		254
Appendix V		255
Bibliography		258
Glossary		265
Notes		270
Index		273

P A R T O N E

**Introduction: questions
that need answering**

