Regional Trade Agreements and the WTO Legal System

Edited by

LORAND BARTELS

and

FEDERICO ORTINO



Regional Trade Agreements and the WTO Legal System

Edited by
LORAND BARTELS
and
FEDERICO ORTINO



General Editor's Preface

JOHN H. JACKSON*

One of the most perplexing and complex problems relating to the world trading system today, is the proliferation of a wide variety of so-called 'regional trade agreements (RTAs)'. These agreements vary greatly in composition and structure, from numerous bilateral 'Free Trade Agreements (FTAs)' to certain small regional or mini-lateral agreements such as NAFTA (North American Free Trade Agreement) or CAFTA (Central American Free Trade Agreement), and in some cases involving nations which are not even in the same region. These agreements have a wide variety of provisions, and often vary greatly even when involving one same partner. This volume, which is part of the Oxford University Press series of books on subjects of the extraordinarily broad landscape of international economic law, contains an excellent analysis of the various characteristics and problems of regional trade agreements.

This volume, edited by Lorand Bartels and Federico Ortino, is a very welcome contribution to the legal knowledge about international economic policy and the structure and configuration of the world trading system. The great proliferation of a wide variety of agreements poses considerable concern to the multilateral trade system, as most often represented by the WTO. On the other hand, many of these agreements can perform useful functions in a world that is often hobbled by difficult 'constitutional' problems of making timely decisions so as to keep abreast of rapid paced economic developments frequently described as 'globalization'.

Among other recent examples of commentary about the proliferation or 'spaghetti bowl' of RTAs is the annual WTO report for the year 2003, which includes an analytical section describing the multiplying development of regional trade agreements, in expressing some serious reservations about the policy implications of them, while recognizing some of the advantages. More recently, these issues were explored by the 'Sutherland' Consultative Board, which in its January 2005 report devoted an important chapter to the dangers to the multilateral system that can occur from the 'erosion of non-discrimination', attributed to the great growth in the number of FTAs and RTAs.

^{*} University Professor of Law, Georgetown University Law Center (GULC), Washington, DC; Director, Institute of International Economic Law, GULC; General Editor, International Economic Law Series, Oxford University Press; Editor in Chief, Journal of International Economic Law, Oxford University Press.

Clearly there are some advantages for the RTAs, partly because, with a limited number of members, decisions often can be made more easily, more efficiently, and in a more timely way. Furthermore, these agreements often explore and experiment with subjects that have proven virtually impossible to develop in the broader multilateral framework of about 150 member countries or more.

On the other hand, many concerns are important. To some degree, RTAs can develop protectionist measures which discriminate against certain parts of the world trade and in any event create additional transaction costs because of the need of customs officials to analyse the 'origin' of goods (in a world where national origin becomes less and less meaningful for goods or services.) The rules of origin often themselves are manipulated in such a way to provide protectionist effects. In addition there are some subjects which do not well lend themselves to smaller grouping of states. For example, subsidies, particularly those on agriculture, cannot be effectively contained by agreements between small groups of countries, since the world market is what will drive many of the problems regarding subsidies and the market will restrict ways to diminish the distorting allocation effects of subsidies.

This book takes these various issues up in considerable detail and with very able perspective, in five parts which span very effectively these policy conundrums. Part I, entitled 'Framework Issues', sets the stage with an economic and political analysis of regional trade agreements and a discussion of 'constitutional functions' of the WTO and its relationship to regional trade agreements. Part II is entitled 'WTO Regulation of Regional Trade Agreements', and in this Part a series of some of the legal issues of regional trade agreements is explored. For example, the text explores whether these agreements and their rules of origin truly comply with the mandatory disciplines embodied in the norms expressed in Article XXIV of the GATT text incorporated in the WTO. Part III, which is entitled 'WTO-Plus Issues in Regional Trade Agreements', is a series of seven chapters and presents an awesomely extensive analysis of a number of different characteristics found in regional trade agreements, which in some cases push the frontiers of trade policy and ably provide answers in situations where the multilateral trade system has not been proven very effective. Subjects taken up include: services liberalization, foreign investment, intellectual property, competition law, harmonization ideas, constitutional reforms including possible interaction with human rights norms, and environmental issues of various sorts.

Part IV discusses 'Dispute Settlement in Regional Trade Agreements' and includes the perplexing problems of how these dispute settlement systems interact with each other. Finally, Part V, 'Interfaces Between the WTO and Regional Trade Agreements', begins to look more systemically at questions of overlap and jurisdiction between the WTO and RTAs and the question of applicability of WTO law in RTAs.

This book will certainly become a standard source of analyses which will influence future scholarship, and will be a necessary component of the thinking of policy makers, academics, and all professionals who have to grapple in-depth with the problems of world trade and globalization.

Acknowledgements

The contributions in this book are for the most part the proceedings of a conference of the same title held in Edinburgh in May 2005. We would like to express our deep gratitude to the International Law Association (British Branch), the British Academy, the University of Edinburgh, and Oxford University Press, for their generous support of the conference and of this publication. We would also like to thank the participants in the conference for their contributions, both formal and informal, which have enriched this publication. And we are grateful to Humberto Zúñiga Schroder for first class editorial assistance, and to John Louth and Gwen Booth at OUP for their helpfulness and efficiency with the production process of this book.

List of Abbreviations

ACP African, Caribbean and Pacific

AJIL American Journal of International Law

Alb L J Sci & Tech Albany Law Journal of Science & Technology

ALCA Área de Libre Comercio de las Américas (Free Trade

Area of the Americas)

Am Rev Int Arb American Review of International Arbitration
Am U Int L Rev American University International Law Review

APEC Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation

Appl Econ Lett Applied Economics Letters

Ariz J Int & Comp L Arizona Journal of International and Comparative

Law

ASEAN Association of Southeast Asian Nations

ASEAN Econ Bull ASEAN Economic Bulletin Asian Econ J Asian Economic Journal

ASIL Proc American Society of International Law Proceedings

& Trade L Trade Law

Aust YIL Australian Yearbook of International Law

BISD Basic Instruments and Selected Documents (GATT

Series)

BIT Bilateral Investment Treaty

Brook J Int L

BYIL

BYIL

BYIL British Yearbook of International Law

BYU L Rev

CACM

CAFTA-DR

Cal W Int L J

Brooklyn Journal of International Law

British Yearbook of International Law

British Yearbook of International Law

Central American Common Market

Central American Free Trade Agreement

California Western International Law Journal

Caricom Caribbean Community

CCAEC Canada-Chile Agreement on Environmental

Cooperation

CCLCA Canada-Chile Labour Cooperation Agreement
CCRLCA Canada-Costa Rica Labour Cooperation Agreement

CEC Commission for Environmental Cooperation
CEPA Mainland and Hong Kong Closer Economic

Partnership Agreement

CMLR Common Market Law Review

Colo J Int Envtl L Colorado Journal of International Environmental

& Policy Law and Policy

Colum J Eur L Columbia Journal of European Law

xxviii List of Abbreviations

Comesa Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa

Cornell Int L J Cornell International Law Journal

CRTA WTO Committee on Regional Trade Agreements

CU Customs Union

CUP Cambridge University Press

CUSFTA Canada-US Free Trade Agreement

DSB Dispute Settlement Body

DSM Dispute Settlement Mechanism

DSU WTO Dispute Settlement Understanding

EBL Rev European Business Law Review

EC European Community or EC Treaty (after Article

number)

ECHR European Convention on Human Rights

ECI European Court of Justice

ECOWAS Economic Community of West African States

ECR European Court Reports
ECT Energy Charter Treaty

ECtHR European Court of Human Rights

EEA European Economic Area

EFA Rev European Foreign Affairs Review
EFTA European Free Trade Association
EIIL European Journal of International Law

EL Rev European Law Review ELI European Law Journal

EPA Economic Partnership Agreement

EPL European Public Law

ERPL European Review of Private Law

EU European Union or Treaty on European Union (after

Article number)

Euratom European Atomic Energy Community

Euro-Mediterranean

Far East Econ Rev Far Eastern Economic Review
Ford Int LJ Fordham International Law Journal
FTA Free Trade Agreement or Free Trade Area

FTAA Free Trade Area of the Americas

GATS General Agreement on Trade in Services
GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade

GCC Gulf Cooperation Council

Geo Int Env L Rev Georgetown International Environmental Law

Review

Geo Wash Int L Rev George Washington International Law Review

GSP Generalized System of Preferences
GTAP Global Trade Analysis Project

GYIL German Yearbook of International Law

Harv Int L J Harvard International	Law	Journal
------------------------------------	-----	---------

Harv J L & Pub Harvard Journal of Law and Public Policy

Policy

HTS Harmonized Tariff System
ICI International Court of Justice

ICJ Rep International Court of Justice Reports

ICLQ International and Comparative Law Quarterly
ICSID International Centre for Settlement of Investment

Disputes

ILCInternational Law CommissionILMInternational Legal MaterialsILOInternational Labour OrganizationInd J Glob Leg StudIndiana Journal of Global Legal Studies

Int Org International Organisation

IOLR International Organizations Law Review

IPE International Political Economy
IPR Intellectual Property Rights
ITL Rev International Trade Law Review
ITO International Trade Organization
I Asian Econ Journal of Asian Economics

J Copyright Soc USA Journal of the Copyright Society of the USA

J Econ Integration
J Econ Lit
J Econ Perspect

I Int Trade Econ Journal of International Trade and Economic

Devel Development

J Pol Econ Journal of Political Economy
JEPP Journal of European Public Policy
JIEL Journal of International Economic Law
JWIP Journal of World Intellectual Property

JWT Journal of World Trade

Law & Bus Rev Am Law and Business Review of the Americas

LCP Law and Contemporary Problems

LDC Least Developed Country

Leiden J Int L Leiden Journal of International Law LIEI Legal Issues of Economic Integration

LMO Living Modified Organism

Loy LAL Rev Loyola of Los Angeles Law Review

Marq Intell Prop Marquette Intellectual Property Law Review

L Rev

MEA Multilateral Environmental Agreement

Mercado Común del Sur (Southern Common Market)

MFN Most Favoured Nation

Mich J Int L Michigan Journal of International Law

Minn J Global Trade Minnesota Journal of Global Trade

MIIEL Manchester Journal of International Economic Law

MLR Modern Law Review

N Amer J Econ North American Journal of Economics and Finance

Finance

NC I Int L North Carolina Journal of International Law and

& Com Reg Commercial Regulation

NAAEC North American Agreement on Environmental

Cooperation

NAALC North American Agreement on Labor Cooperation

NAFTA North American Free Trade Agreement

NAO National Administrative Office

Neth Int L Rev Netherlands International Law Review

New Eng L Rev New England Law Review

Nord J Int L Nordic Journal of International Law

NTB Non-Tariff Barrier

Nw J Int L & Bus Northwestern Journal of International Law &

Business

NYIL Netherlands Yearbook of International Law

NYU J Int L & Pol New York University Journal of International Law

& Politics

OECD Organisation for Economic Cooperation and

Development

OJ Official Journal of the European Union (formerly

European Communities)

ONLR Ohio Northern University Law Review

OPEC Organization of the Petroleum Exporting Countries

ORC Other Regulations of Commerce

ORRC Other Restrictive Regulations of Commerce

OUP Oxford University Press
Pac Rev The Pacific Review

PCA Partnership and Cooperation Agreement
Polish YIL Polish Yearbook of International Law

RTA Regional Trade Agreement

SAA Stabilization and Association Agreement
SADC Southern African Development Community
SPS Sanitary and Phytosanitary (measures)
SYIL Singapore Yearbook of International Law

TBT Technical Barriers to Trade

TCE Treaty Establishing a Constitution for Europe

TDCA EC-South Africa Trade and Development Cooperation

Agreement

TMB WTO Textiles Monitoring Body

Tul L Rev Tulane Law Review

TWQ Third World Quarterly

U Chi L Rev University of Chicago Law Review

U Ott Law & Tech J University of Ottawa Law and Technology Journal U Pa J Int Econ L University of Pennsylvania Journal of International

Economic Law

UN United Nations

UNCED United Nations Conference on Environment and

Development

UNCITRAL United Nations Commission for International Trade

Law

UNCLOS United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea

UNCTAD United Nations Conference on Trade and

Development

UNDP United Nations Development Programme
UNEP United Nations Environment Programme

UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural

Organization

UNTS United Nations Treaty Series

US United States of America or United States Supreme

Court Reports

Vanderbilt J Vanderbilt Journal of Transnational Law

Transnatl L

VCLT Vienna Convention on the Law of the Treaties

VER Voluntary Export Restraint

Whittier L Rev Whittier Law Review
WHO World Health Organization

WHO World Health Organization
WTO World Trade Organization
WTR World Trade Review

Yale J Int L Yale Journal of International Law

Contents

1a0	le of Cases	ΑV
Tab	les of Treaties and International Instruments	xix
List	of Abbreviations	xxvii
List	of Contributors	xxxiii
	Introduction LORAND BARTELS AND FEDERICO ORTINO	1
I.	Framework Issues	5
1.	Economic Analysis of Regional Trade Agreements VIET D. DO AND WILLIAM WATSON	7
2.	The Political Economy of Regional Trade Agreements CHAD DAMRO	23
	Constitutional Functions of the WTO and Regional Trade Agreements THOMAS COTTIER AND MARINA FOLTEA	43
П.	WTO Regulation of Regional Trade Agreements	77
4.	Regional Trade Agreements and Domestic Regulation: What Reach for 'Other Restrictive Regulations of Commerce'? JAMES H. MATHIS	79
5.	Mandatory Abolition of Anti-dumping, Countervailing Duties and Safeguards in Customs Unions and Free Trade Areas Constituted between WTO Members: Revisiting a Long-standing Discussion in Light of the Appellate Body's <i>Turkey—Textiles</i> Ruling ANGELA T. GOBBI ESTRELLA AND GARY N. HORLICK	109
6.	Do Rules of Origin in Free Trade Agreements Comply with Article XXIV GATT? JOSÉ ANTONIO RIVAS	149
ш.	WTO-plus Issues in Regional Trade Agreements	173
7.	Services Liberalization in Regional Trade Agreements: Lessons for GATS 'Unfinished Business'? MARKUS KRAJEWSKI	175

**	Contents
X11	Contents

8.	International Agreements Covering Foreign Investment in Services: Patterns and Linkages FEDERICO ORTINO AND AUDLEY SHEPPARD	201
9.	TRIPS-Plus Provisions in FTAs: Recent Trends BRYAN MERCURIO	215
10.	Competition Law and Regional Trade Agreements: An Overview MELAKU GEBOYE DESTA AND NAOMI JULIA BARNES	239
11.	Is Mutual Recognition an Alternative to Harmonization? Lessons on Trade and Tolerance of Diversity from the EU GARETH DAVIES	265
12.	The WTO and Regional Trade Agreements as Competing Fora for Constitutional Reforms: Trade and Human Rights ERNST-ULRICH PETERSMANN	281
13.	Sustainable Development in Regional Trade Agreements MARIE-CLAIRE CORDONIER SEGGER	313
IV.	Dispute Settlement in Regional Trade Agreements	341
	Dispute Settlement in the WTO and RTAs: A Comment WILLIAM J. DAVEY	343
15.	NAFTA Dispute Settlement: Creative Experiment or Confusion? ARMAND DE MESTRAL	359
16	Dispute Settlement in European Union Free Trade Agreements: Lessons Learned? IGNACIO GARCIA BERCERO	383
17	. Dispute Settlement in Bilateral Trade Agreements: The EFTA Experience ANDREAS R. ZIEGLER	407
18	. Dispute Settlement in the Proposed East Asia Free Trade Agreement: Lessons Learned From the ASEAN, the NAFTA, and the EU YAN LUO	419
V	. Interfaces Between the WTO and Regional Trade Agreements	447
19	The EU and its Member States in the WTO—Issues of Responsibility PIET EECKHOUT	449

	Contents	xiii
20.	Overlaps and Conflicts of Jurisdiction between the World Trade Organization and Regional Trade Agreements KYUNG KWAK AND GABRIELLE MARCEAU	465
21.	Applicability of WTO Law in Regional Trade Agreements: Identifying the Links LOCKNIE HSU	525
22.	What Role is there for Regional International Law in the Interpretation of the WTO Agreements? ISABELLE VAN DAMME	553
Ap _Į	pendix	577
Sele	ect Bibliography	<i>5</i> 8 <i>5</i>
Ind	ex	599

Table of Cases

A. GATT AND WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT REPORTS

(1) WTO Appellate Body Reports
Appellate Body Report, Argentina—Footwear (EC), WT/DS121/AB/R, adopted
12 January 2000
Appellate Body Report, Australia—Salmon, WT/DS18/AB/R, adopted 6 November 1998
Appellate Body Report, Chile—Alcoholic Beverages, WT/DS87/AB/R,
WT/DS110/AB/R, adopted 12 January 2000
Appellate Body Report, EC—Asbestos, WT/ DS135/AB/R, adopted 5 April
2001
Appellate Body Report, EC—Bananas III, WT/DS27/AB/R, adopted 25 September
1997203, 207, 209, 359, 467, 534, 571
Appellate Body Report, EC—Export Subsidies on Sugar, WT/DS265/AB/R,
WT/DS266/AB/R, WT/DS283/AB/R, adopted 19 May 2005
Appellate Body Report, EC—Hormones, WT/DS26/AB/R, WT/DS48/AB/R,
adopted 13 February 1998
1998
Appellate Body Report, EC-Tariff Preferences, WT/DS246/AB/R, adopted
20 April 2004
Appellate Body Report, India—Patents (US), WT/DS50/AB/R, adopted 16 January 1998
Appellate Body Report, Japan—Alcoholic Beverages II, WT/DS8/AB/R,
WT/DS10/AB/R, WT/DS11/AB/R, adopted 1 November 1996 105, 114, 118,
145, 146, 156, 526, 531, 536, 546, 575
Appellate Body Report, Korea—Dairy, WT/DS98/AB/R, adopted
12 January 2000
Appellate Body Report, Korea—Beef, WT/DS161/AB/R, WT/DS169/AB/R,
adopted 10 January 2001
Appellate Body Report, Mexico—Soft Drinks, WT/DS308/AB/R adopted
6 March 2006
Appellate Body Report, Turkey—Textiles, WT/DS34/AB/R, adopted
19 November 19993, 48, 53, 59–61, 83, 88, 90, 95, 109, 112–114, 116,
119, 121–123, 135, 136, 138–140, 142, 146, 148, 150,
154–160, 163–165, 359, 466, 483, 567 Appellate Body Report, <i>US—FSC</i> , WT/DS108/AB/R, adopted
20 March 2000
20 April 2005
Appellate Body Report, US—Gasoline, WT/DS2/AB/R, adopted
20 May 1996 156 530 556

Appellate Body Report, US—Line Pipe, WT/DS202/AB/R, adopted
8 March 2002
Appellate Body Report, US-Shrimp, WT/DS58/AB/R, adopted
6 November 1998
559, 570, 571, 572, 573
Appellate Body Report, US-Upland Cotton, WT/DS267/AB/R, adopted
21 March 2005
21 1/410/1 20001111111111111111111111111111111
(2) WTO Panel Reports
Panel Report, Argentina—Footwear (EC), WT/DS121/R, adopted
12 January 2000, as modified by the Appellate Body Report60, 88-89,
111–112, 126, 128, 129, 156, 158, 359
Panel Report, Argentina—Poultry Anti-Dumping Duties, WT/DS241/R, adopted
19 May 2003
Panel Report, Australia—Salmon, WT/DS18/R and Corr.1, adopted
6 November 1998, as modified by the Appellate Body Report
Panel Report, Canada—Autos, WT/DS139/R, WT/DS142/R, adopted
19 June 2000, as modified by the Appellate Body Report60, 177, 208, 213, 359
Panel Report, Canada—Periodicals, WT/DS31/R and Corr.1,
adopted 30 July 1997, as modified by the Appellate Body Report365, 469, 478
Panel Report, Canada—Pharmaceutical Patents, WT/DS114/R, adopted
7 April 2000
Panel Report, Chile—Price Band System, WT/DS207/R, 3 May 2002 adopted
23 October 2002, as modified by the Appellate Body Report529, 570
Panel Report, EC-Bananas III (Article 21.5-EC), WT/DS27/RW/EEC and
Corr.1, circulated 12 April 1999
Panel Report, EC-Bananas III (Ecuador), WT/DS27/R/ECU, adopted
25 September 1997, as modified by the Appellate Body Report237
Panel Report, EC—Computer Equipment, WT/DS62/R, WT/DS67/R, WT/DS68/R,
adopted 22 June 1998, as modified by the Appellate Body Report
Panel Report, EC-Tariff Preferences, WT/DS246/R, adopted 20 April 2004,
as modified by the Appellate Body Report
Panel Report, EC-Trademarks and Geographical Indications (Australia),
WT/DS290/R, adopted 20 April 2005
Panel Report, Korea—Beef, WT/DS161/R, WT/DS169/R,
adopted 10 January 2001, as modified by the Appellate Body Report569
Panel Report, Mexico—Telecoms, WT/DS204/R, adopted 1 June 2004240,
243, 301, 306
Panel Report, Mexico—Corn Syrup, WT/DS132/R and Corr.1, adopted
24 February 2000
Panel Report, US—Gambling, WT/DS285/R, adopted 20 April 2005, as modified
by the Appellate Body Report
Panel Report, US—Line Pipe, WT/DS202/R, adopted 8 March 2002, as modified
by the Appellate Body Report
Panel Report, US—Shrimp (Article 21.5—Malaysia), WT/DS58/RW, adopted
21 November 2001, as upheld by the Appellate Body Report318–319

(3) GATT Panel Reports
Panel Report, EEC—Oilseeds I, adopted 25 January 1990, BISD 37S/86
B. INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE
Case Concerning Oil Platforms (Iran v United States of America), Judgment [2003] ICJ Rep 161
Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua Case (Nicaragua v United States of America), Merits, Judgment [1986] ICJ Rep 94
C. INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNAL FOR THE LAW OF THE SEA
Southern Bluefin Tuna (Australia and New Zealand v Japan), Award on Jurisdiction and Admissibility, 4 August 2000 (2000) 39 ILM 1359466, 475
D. EUROPEAN COURT OF JUSTICE
Cassis de Dijon (Case 120/78) [1979] ECR 649
E. MERCOSUR (PROTOCOL OF BRASILIA)
Laudo III—Productos Textiles—de Brasil a Argentina, Decision of 3 March 2000, text available in Spanish at www.mercosur.int/msweb/SM/es/Controversias/ Laudos.asp