Stochastic Programming

M.A.H. DEMPSTER

3162082

0221.5

Stochastic Programming

Based on Proceedings of an International Conference Sponsored by the Institute of Mathematics and Its Applications, Mathematical Institute, Oxford, 15–17 July, 1974





1980



ACADEMIC PRESS

A Subsidiary of Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, Publishers

London New York Toronto Sydney San Francisco

ACADEMIC PRESS INC. (LONDON) LTD. 24/28 Oval Road, London NW1 nited States Edition published by ACADEMIC PRESS INC. 111 Fifth Avenue New York, New York 10003

Copyright © 1980 by The Institute of Mathematics and its Applications

11:15-118

All Rights Reserved

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by photostat, microfilm, or any other means, without written permission from the publishers

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data International Conference on Stochastic Programming, *1st, Oxford, 1974*Stochastic programming. Stochastic programming.—Congresses Title II. Dempster, M. A. H. 519.2 T57.79

ISBN 0-12-208250-8 77-92826

Printed in Great Britain

Stochastic Programming



The Institute of Mathematics and its Applications Conference Series

Optimization, edited by R. Fletcher

Combinatorial Mathematics and its Applications, *edited by* D. J. A. Welsh

Large Sparse Sets of Linear Equations, edited by J. K. Reid

Numerical Methods for Unconstrained Optimization, edited by W. Murray

The Mathematics of Finite Elements and Applications, *edited by* J. R. Whiteman

Software for Numerical Mathematics, edited by D. J. Evans

The Mathematical Theory of the Dynamics of Biological Populations, edited by M. S. Bartlett and R. W. Hiorns

Recent Mathematical Developments in Control, edited by D. J. Bell

Numerical Methods for Constrained Optimization, *edited by* P. E. Gill and W. Murray

Computational Methods and Problems in Aeronautical Fluid Dynamics, edited by B. L. Hewitt, C. R. Illingworth, R. C. Lock, K. W. Mangler, J. H. McDonnell, Catherine Richards and F. Walkden

Optimization in Action, *edited by* L. C. W. Dixon

The Mathematics of Finite Elements and Applications II, edited by J. R.

Whiteman

The State of the Art in Numerical Analysis, *edited by* D. A. H. Jacobs Fisheries Mathematics, *edited by* J. H. Steele

Numerical Software—Needs and Availability, edited by D. A. H. Jacobs Recent Theoretical Developments in Control, edited by M. J. Gregson The Mathematica of Hydrology and Water Participation of the Software Participat

The Mathematics of Hydrology and Water Resources, *edited by* E. H. Lloyd, T. O'Donnell and J. C. Wilkinson

Mathematical Aspects of Marine Traffic, edited by S. H. Hollingdale

Mathematical Modelling of Turbulent Diffusion in the Environment, edited by C. J. Harris

Mathematical Methods in Computer Graphics and Design, edited by K. W. Brodlie

Stochastic Programming, edited by M. A. H. Dempster

In Preparation

Numerical Methods in Applied Fluid Dynamics, edited by B. Hunt

Recent Developments in Markov Decision Processes, *edited by* D. J. White, R. Hartley and L. C. Thomas

Analysis and Optimization of Stochastic Systems, *edited by* O. L. R. Jacobs, M. H. A. Davis, M. A. H. Dempster, C. J. Harris and P. C. Parks

Computational Techniques for Ordinary Differential Equations, edited by I. Gladwell and D. K. Sayers

Power from Sea Waves, edited by B. Count

8162082



Contributors

R. D. ARMSTRONG University of Texas, Austin, Texas 78712, U.S.A.

- J. L. BALINTFY School of Business Administration, Department of General Business and Finance, University of Massachusetts, Amherst, Massachusetts 01002, U.S.A.
- E. M. L. BEALE Scientific Control Systems Limited, 4 Burners Lane, Brick Close Kiln Farm, Milton Keynes MK11 3EJ, England.
- B. BEREANU Centre for Mathematical Statistics, Academy of the Socialist Republic of Romania, 21 Grivitei Street, Bucharest 12, Romania.
- S. P. BRADLEY Graduate School of Business Administration, Harvard University, Soldiers Field, Boston, Massachusetts 02163, U.S.A.
- D. B. CRANE Graduate School of Business Administration, Harvard University, Soldiers Field, Boston, Massachusetts 02163, U.S.A.
- I. DEAK Computer and Automation Institute, Hungarian Academy of Sciences, H 1502 Budapest XI, Kende utca 13–17, Hungary.
- M. A. H. DEMPSTER System and Decision Sciences, International Institute for Applied Systems Analysis, A-2361 Laxenburg, Austria.
- A. S. DEXTER Faculty of Commerce and Business Administration, University of British Columbia, 2075 Wesbrook Place, Vancouver, B.C., Canada V6T 1W5.
- M. J. EISNER Exxon Corporation, Mathematics, Computer and Systems Dept., Box 153, Florham Park, New Jersey 07932, U.S.A.
- YU. M. ERMOLJEV System and Decision Sciences, International Institute for Applied Systems Analysis, A-2361 Laxenburg, Austria.
- B. L. FOOTE College of Engineering, School of Industrial Engineering, The University of Oklahoma, 202 West Boyd, Suite 124, Norman, Oklahoma 73069, U.S.A.
- J. J. H. FORREST Scientific Control Systems Limited, 4 Burners Lane, Brick Close Kiln Farm, Milton Keynes MK11 3EJ, England.
- S. GANCZER Computer and Automation Institute, Hungarian Academy of Sciences, H 1502 Budapest XI, Kende utca 13–17, Hungary.
- S. J. GARTSKA Department of Administrative Sciences, Yale University, Box 1A, New Haven, Conn. 06520, U.S.A.
- R. GRINOLD Graduate School of Business Administration, University of California, Berkeley, California 94720, U.S.A.

Contributors

- J. GUNDELACH Department of Geography and Environmental Engineering, The Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, Maryland 21218, U.S.A.
- R. HARTLEY Department of Decision Theory, University of Manchester, Manchester, England M13 9PL.
- P. HUTCHINSON London Graduate School of Business Studies, Sussex Place, Regents Park NW1 4SA, England.
- O. L. R. JACOBS Department of Engineering Science, University of Oxford, Parks Road, Oxford OX1 3BJ, England.
- P. KALL Institutsdirektor, Institut für Operations Research, CH-8006 Zurich, Weinbergstrasse 59, Switzerland.
- M. LANE, J. F. Eckstein & Co., Chicago, Illinois, U.S.A.
- S. C. LITTLECHILD The University of Aston Management Centre, Residential Centre, 36 Wake Green Road, Birmingham B13 9PD, England.
- A. G. LOCKETT Manchester Business School, University of Manchester, Booth Street West, Manchester M15 6PB, England.
- D. P. LOUCKS School of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Hollister Hall Cornell University, Ithaca, New York 14850, U.S.A.
- K. MARTI Hochschule der Bundeswehr München, FB LRT, Werner-Heisenberg-Weg 39, 8014 Neubiberg/München, W. Germany.
- L. J. MIRMAN Department of Economics, University of Illinois, Box 111, Commerce Building (West), Urbana, Illinois 61801, U.S.A.
- J. MOCKUS The Institute of Physics and Mathematics, Academy of Sciences of the Lithuanian S.S.R., Vilnius, K. Pozelos, 54, U.S.S.R.
- A. P. MUHLEMANN Department of Management Sciences, University of Manchester, Institute of Science and Technology, P.O. Box 88, Manchester M60 1QD, England.
- E. A. NURMINSKIY System and Decision Sciences, International Institute for Applied Systems Analysis, A-2361 Laxenburg, Austria.
- W. OETTLI Fakultat fur Mathematik und Informatik, Universitat Mannheim D-6800 Mannheim, Germany.
- P. OLSEN Institute for Defense Analyses, 400 Army-Navy Drive, Arlington, Virginia 22202, U.S.A.
- M. ORAL Marmara Scientific and Industrial Research Institute, P.O. Box 21, Gebze, Istanbul, Turkey.
- A. PAPAGAKI-PAPOULIAS Agricultural Bank of Greece, Research and Planning Division, 9, Vissarionos St, Athens, Greece.
- K. PATYI Computer and Automation Institute, Hungarian Academy of Sciences, H 1502 Budapest XI, Kende utca 13–17, Hungary.
- Á. PRÉKOPA Computer and Automation Institute, Hungarian Academy of Sciences, H 1502 Budapest XI, Kende utca 13–17, Hungary.
- C. REVELLE Department of Geography and Environmental Engineering, The Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, Maryland 21218, U.S.A.
- J. K. SENGUPTA Department of Economics, University of California, Santa Barbara, California, U.S.A. 93106.
- S. SUBBA RAO Department of Operations Research, Case Western Reserve University, Cleveland, Ohio 44106, U.S.A.

vi

Contributors

- B. STRAZICKY Computer and Automation Institute, Hungarian Academy of Sciences, H 1502 Budapest XI, Kende utca 13–17, Hungary.
- C. J. TAYLOR SIA Limited, Ebury Gate, 23 Lower Belgrave Street, London SW1W 0NR, England.
- P. VAN MOESEKE Department of Economics, University of Otago, Otago, New Zealand.
- R. J.-B. WETS College of Arts and Sciences, Department of Mathematics, University of Kentucky, Lexington, Kentucky 40506, U.S.A.
- L. A. WOLSEY Center for Operations Research and Econometrics, 34 Voie du Roman Pays, 1348 Louvain-la-Neuve, Belgium.
- J. N. W. YU Faculty of Commerce and Business Administration, University of British Columbia, 2075 Wesbrook Place, Vancouver, B.C., Canada V6T 1W5
- W. T. ZIEMBA Faculty of Commerce and Business Administration, University of British Columbia, 2075 Wesbrook Place, Vancouver, B.C., Canada V6T 1W5.

Preface

The idea of holding the conference upon whose proceedings this book is based arose at the Eighth International Symposium on Mathematical Programming, held in August 1973 at Stanford University. In the autumn of 1973 the Institute of Mathematics and Its Applications kindly agreed to sponsor the first International Conference on Stochastic Programming and a Programme Committee consisting of Oliver Jacobs, Morton Lane, Steven Littlechild, Steven Vajda and myself was formed to organize the programme and invite the speakers. To the other members of the Committee is owed the credit for the large number of presented papers concerned with applications and computational techniques. The Institute organized a most successful residential conference at Balliol College, Oxford with programme sessions in the Mathematical Institute, Oxford, 15-17 July, 1974. At the Conference it was suggested that the editor attempt to write a comprehensive introduction tying the contributions together. It was also the general feeling that several researchers, unable for various reasons to attend the Conference, should be solicited for articles to be included in the Proceedings. The great majority of the contributors also generously volunteered to act, at the editor's discretion, as referees. In the end, updated versions of all but four of the papers presented at the Conference are represented in this volume, together with three of those solicited. All of the papers appearing here in their final form have been extensively refereed and edited.

It is axiomatic that the more interdisciplinary a subject in the mathematical sciences, the more difficult is the provision of a clear, consistent and unambiguous notation for it. I have attempted to overcome the basic notational difficulties and ambiguities in stochastic system theory by enforcing on the authors represented here the use of boldface type to distinguish random variables, vectors and matrices from their realizations. A common symbol I is also used to denote the end of proofs. An original plan to collect together at the end of the book and classify all references was abandoned upon the appearance of the excellent bibliography of Stancu-Minasian and Wets. However, an index was judged to be appropriate to a book meant to serve as a supplementary reader to recent texts.

Preface

Like these texts, the research reported here presupposes the mastery of beginning graduate level courses in optimization and probability. Although some knowledge of the subject matter is desirable, the introduction has been written with a view to sketching its outlines to a reader with this level of mathematical sophistication.

Much of the editorial work was done in 1974–75 while I was a Fellow at the Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences, Stanford, California. It has been completed at Balliol College in the University of Oxford, England over a rather longer period of time than had originally been hoped due to unforseen circumstances, both personal and general. I should like to express my gratitude to both the above institutions for their generous support.

Thanks are due on behalf of all the participants in the Conference, to Barbara Mayne of the Institute of Mathematics and Its Applications and to Ann Lazier for helping to make the Conference such a pleasant social occasion and to Steven Vajda for "the perfect conference after dinner speech". For their diligence, thanks are also due to the referees: Martin Beale, Steven Bradley, Dwight Crane, Mark Eisner, Bob Foote, Stanley Gartska, Richard Grinold, Roger Hartley, Peter Hutchinson, Morton Lane, Peter Lewy, Steven Littlechild, Geoffrey Lockett, Daniel Loucks, Kurt Marti, Leonard Mirman, Paul Olsen, András Prékopa, William Raike, Benjamin Schwartz, Richard Sutherland, John Tomlin, Paul Van Moeseke, Balder von Hohenbalken, Roger Wets, Douglass Wilde, Laurence Wolsey and William Ziemba. I am grateful to Masoud Derakshan-Now, András Prékopa and William Ziemba for detailed comments on a draft of the introduction. Kirsty Healey of Academic Press, Peter Lewy and Judith Wagstrom of Oxford Systems Associates Ltd supplied valuable editorial assistance. Secretarial services were cheerfully and painstakingly provided by Helena Smith, of the Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences, and Judith Wagstrom.

May 1979

M. A. H. Dempster

Contents

	Contributors Preface									v ix
1.	Introduction M. A. H. E			ROD						3
			П	THE	ORY					
2.	Logarithmic (András Pré		Meas	ures a	und R	elated	d Toj	oics	•	63

	Andras Prekopa	
3.	The Economic Equivalence of Several Stochastic Programming	
	Models	83
	Stanley J. Gartska	
4.	Measurability Theorems for Stochastic Extremals	93
	P. Kall and W. Oettli	
5.	A Class of Constrained Linear Control Problems with	
	Stochastic Coefficients	97
	Richard C. Grinold	
6.	Inequalities for a Class of Sequential Stochastic Decision	
	Processes.	109
	Roger Hartley	
7.	The Structure of Stochastic Control Laws	125
	O. L. R. Jacobs	
8.	Stochastic Multipliers, Induced Feasibility and Non-	
	anticipativity in Stochastic Programming	137
	Roger JB. Wets	
9.	Duality in Probabilistic Programming	147
	Mark J. Eisner and Paul Olsen	
10.		159
	Kurt Marti	

ŧ

Artist - Ar

4

.....

ŕ

Contents

III COMPUTATION

11.	Some Numerical Methods in Stochastic Linear Programming	
	Under Risk and Uncertainty	169
	Bernard Bereanu	
12.	A Discussion of the Properties of a Basic Simplex Algorithm	
	for Generating the Decision Regions of Bereanu	207
	B. L. Foote	
13.	Computational Experience with an Approximate Method for	
	the Distribution Problem	223
	M. A. H. Dempster and A. Papagaki-Papoulias	
14.	The Distribution Problem and its Relation to Other Problems	
	in Stochastic Programming	245
	Roger JB. Wets	
15.	Some Results Concerning an Algorithm for the Discrete	
	Recourse Problem	263
	Beáta Strazicky	
16.	Stochastic Quasigradient Algorithms for Minimax Problems	
	in Stochastic Programming	275
	Yu. M. Ermoljev and E. A. Nurminskiy	
17.	On Bayesian Methods for Seeking the Extremal Point	287
	J. Mockus	
18.	A Chance Constrained Multiple Choice Programming	
	Algorithm With Applications	301
	Ronald D. Armstrong and Joseph L. Balintfy	

IV APPLICATIONS

19.	Discrete Chance C	Constrained	Models	for	River	Basi	n	
	Planning							329
	Daniel P. Loucks							
20.	A Variance Minimiz	ing Linear	Decision	Rule	for Re	servo	ir	
	Management and De	sign .						341
	Charles ReVelle an	d José Gun	delach					
21.	A Stochastic Program	mming App	roach to	Weat	her-dep	ender	nt	
	Pricing for Water Re	sources .		÷				357
	M. N. Lane and S.	C. Littlech	ild					
22.	The STABIL Stoc	hastic Pro	gramming	g Mo	odel an	nd it	ts	
	Experimental Applic	ation to the	e Electrica	al Ene	ergy See	ctor c	of	
	the Hungarian Econo	omy						369
András Prékopa, Sándor Ganczer, Istvan De						Károl	ly	
	Patyi							

	Contents	xiii
23.	Multi-time-period Stochastic Programming	387
24.	An Objective Function for Inventory Control Models Muhittin Oral and S. Subba Rao	403
25.	A Stochastic Programming Model for Project Selection A. G. Lockett, A. P. Muhlemann and L. A. Wolsey	427
26.	Managing a Bank Bond Portfolio Over Time	449
27.	A Model for Managing a Certificate of Deposit Portfolio Under Uncertainty	473
28.		497
29.	Portfolio Selection in a Lognormal Market when the Investor has a Power Utility Function: Computational Results A. S. Dexter, J. N. W. Yu and W. T. Ziemba	507
30.	Stochastic Programming: A Selective Survey of Recent Economic Applications	525
31.		537
	Index	569

l Introduction



1 Introduction to Stochastic Programming

M. A. H. DEMPSTER

Balliol College, University of Oxford

The papers in this volume, taken together, represent a survey of the current state of the art of stochastic programming. The term stochastic programming bears the same relation to the modern approach to deterministic optimization problems—mathematical programming—as the term stochastic processes bears to the classical theory of deterministic dynamical processes. Both terms refer to the non-negligible introduction of random variables into mathematical models in their respective fields; in the case of interest here, optimization theory, in its classical analogue, dynamical system theory. As with early progress in stochastic process theory, where discrete time Markov process results concerned with biological, medical and economic applications were developed relatively independently of continuous time results arising from problems in theoretical physics and engineering, theory for the optimization of stochastic systems has until recently been motivated by four separate fields of application-operations research, statistics, control engineering and economics. The term stochastic programming is usually taken to refer to models arising from the first of these fields, operations research.

Even within the operations research literature however there is a welter of terminology stemming from the various independent formulations of stochastic programming problems over two decades ago by Beale (1955), Dantzig (1955), Tintner (1955) and Charnes and Cooper (1959). Since then, several textbooks have appeared, Kolbin (1971), Sengupta (1972), Vajda (1972), Kall (1975), Kolbin (1977), see also Parikh (1968). Although extremely useful—indeed, this volume is intended as a supplementary reader for them—these texts display an unfortunate tendency to preserve terminological differences. While the first decade of research into stochastic programming problems largely concerned *theory*, Part IV of this volume demonstrates that *applications* of these models, in step with advances in

computational techniques for linear and nonlinear programming (see Part III) have become a practical reality. Research bibliographies attempting to classify both theory and applications have been produced by Fricks (1969a, 1969b) and Stancu-Minasian and Wets (1976). Various survey papers will be referred to in the appropriate context later in this Introduction.

The 30 papers comprising this volume represent the bulk of those presented at the first international conference to be devoted solely to stochastic programming-held in Oxford, England, under the sponsorship of the Institute of Mathematics and Its Applications-together with two papers solicited from authors in the Soviet Union. As well as providing an exchange of ideas at a critical point in the development of stochastic programming, it was a purpose of this conference to foster the correlation of related research results in the fields of management science, control engineering and economics using concepts central to the literature of statistical decision theory. Since then, at least two international conferences. see Wets (1976) and Davis et al. (1979), have been organized with this latter purpose specifically in mind under the *aegis* of the general term optimization of stochastic systems. It is to be hoped that this trend will continue and accelerate in the future. As is the case in the optimization of deterministic systems, where recently mathematical programming in abstract spaces has been introduced by a number of authors as a unifying theoretical structure for both classical and modern optimization theory, it is likely that the characterization and analysis of optimization problems for stochastic systems will benefit from a similar abstract mathematical programming approach. It is also possible that the computational and applications experience of stochastic (mathematical) programming may be relevant to general problems of stochastic system theory. As we shall see, computational and applications experience in stochastic programming has on the whole been with larger and more complex systems than has so far been (generally) the case in stochastic optimization problems in control engineering, economics or statistics.

The purpose of this Introduction is to tie the papers composing this volume both to each other and to related results, along the general lines indicated above. The structure of the sections of this Introduction mirrors the structure of the parts of the book. After a short section introducing the basic stochastic programming problems, brief comments on the individual papers are given under the headings—Theory, Computation and Applications—and the subheadings of the parts (and sub-parts) of the volume. Of course, a number of the theoretical papers are relevant to computation, while some of those on computation contain both practical applications and new theory, and the applied papers frequently present both new theoretical results and, more importantly, novel computational techniques.