CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL AND COMPARATIVE LAW

# Legal Principles in WTO Disputes

Andrew D. Mitchell



## Legal Principles in WTO Disputes

Andrew D. Mitchell



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521873260

© Andrew D. Mitchell 2008

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2008

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Mitchell, Andrew D.

Legal principles in WTO disputes / Andrew D. Mitchell.

p. cm. - (Cambridge studies in international and comparative law ; [61]) Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-87326-0 (hardback)

- 1. World Trade Organization. 2. Foreign trade regulation.
- 3. Tariff-Law and legislation. 4. Dispute resolution (Law) I. Title.
- II. Series.

K4610.M58 2008

382'.92-dc22 2008028689

ISBN 978-0-521-87326-0 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

#### **Legal Principles in WTO Disputes**

Principles play a crucial role in any dispute settlement system, and the World Trade Organization (WTO) is no exception. However, WTO Panels and the Appellate Body have been too timid in using principles, sometimes avoiding their use when appropriate and at other times using them without fully acknowledging that they are doing so. Perhaps more worryingly, these bodies often fail to delve deeply enough into principles. They tend to overlook key questions such as the legal basis for using a given principle, whether the principle is being used in an interpretative manner or as applicable law, and the meaning of the principle in public international law. This book establishes a framework for addressing these questions. The use of such a framework should allay fears and misconceptions about the use of principles and ensure that they are used in a justifiable manner, improving the quality of dispute settlement in the WTO.

ANDREW D. MITCHELL is a Senior Lecturer at Melbourne Law School. Previously he was a solicitor with Allens Arthur Robinson in Australia. He has also worked in the Trade Directorate of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), the intellectual Property Division of the World Trade Organization (WTO), and the Legal Department of the International Monetary Fund (IMF).

#### CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL AND COMPARATIVE LAW

Established in 1946, this series produces high-quality scholarship in the fields of public and private international law and comparative law. Although these are distinct legal sub-disciplines, developments since 1946 confirm their interrelation.

Comparative law is increasingly used as a tool in the making of law at national, regional and international levels. Private international law is now often affected by international conventions, and the issues faced by classical conflicts rules are frequently dealt with by substantive harmonisation of law under international auspices. Mixed international arbitrations, especially those involving state economic activity, raise mixed questions of public and private international law, while in many fields (such as the protection of human rights and democratic standards, investment guarantees and international criminal law) international and national systems interact. National constitutional arrangements relating to 'foreign affairs', and to the implementation of international norms, are a focus of attention.

The Board welcomes works of a theoretical or interdisciplinary character, and those focusing on the new approaches to international or comparative law or conflicts of law. Studies of particular institutions or problems are equally welcome, as are translations of the best work published in other languages.

Iames Crawford SC FBA General Editors

> Whewell Professor of International Law, Faculty of Law, and Director, Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law,

University of Cambridge John S. Bell FBA

Professor of Law, Faculty of Law, University of Cambridge

Editorial Board Professor Hilary Charlesworth Australian National University

Professor Lori Damrosch Columbia University Law School

Professor John Dugard Universiteit Leiden

Professor Mary-Ann Glendon Harvard Law School

Professor Christopher Greenwood London School of Economics

Professor David Johnston University of Edinburgh Professor Hein Kötz Max-Planck-Institut, Hamburg Professor Donald McRae University of Ottawa Professor Onuma Yasuaki University of Tokyo

Professor Reinhard Zimmermann Universität Regensburg

Advisory Committee Professor D. W. Bowett QC

Judge Rosalyn Higgins QC Professor J. A. Jolowicz QC

Professor Sir Elihu Lauterpacht CBE QC

Judge Stephen Schwebel

A list of books in the series can be found at the end of this volume.

To my wife and best friend, Tania and to my son, Max

#### Table of WTO Agreements

Agreement on Agriculture

Agreement on Safeguards 40, 54, 55, 159, 179, 211, 216, 217, 232, 233, 234,

235, 262, 263

Anti-Dumping Agreement xix, 15, 18, 40, 73, 128, 134, 135, 136, 159, 179,

181, 211, 215, 216, 223, 228, 229, 230, 231, 233,

236, 237, 258, 262, 263

ATC xix, 180, 231, 232, 233, 235, 255

DSU xix, xxi, xxii, xxiii, xxiv, xxv, xxvi, xxvii, xxviii,

> xxix, xxxi, xxxii, xxxiv, xxxv, xxvi, xxxvii, xxxviii, ixl, xl, xli, xlii, xlii, xliv, xlv, 2, 3, 4, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 20, 22, 25, 34, 54, 67, 72, 73, 74, 75, 79, 80, 86, 89, 90, 91, 92, 93, 95, 96, 97, 98, 100, 101, 102, 103, 104, 122, 123, 124, 125, 126, 127, 131, 132, 133, 138, 142, 143, 144, 153, 155, 156, 157, 160, 161, 162, 163, 164, 166, 167, 168, 169, 175, 181, 210, 211, 213, 214, 218, 219, 220, 221, 224, 232,

253, 254, 257, 258, 259

GATS xix, 38, 39, 90, 138, 140, 142, 143, 158, 159,

178, 248

**GATT** xix, 3, 14, 37, 38, 39, 40, 42, 54, 55, 67, 82, 85,

> 127, 138, 140, 141, 143, 158, 159, 169, 171, 172, 173, 175, 176, 178, 213, 223, 235, 238, 239, 240,

241, 242, 243, 246, 249, 252, 254, 258, 260,

261, 265

Marrakesh Agreement

xix, xx, 34, 35, 36, 37, 38, 42, 86

SCM Agreement xix, xxiii, xxiv, xxxix, 128, 134, 135, 136, 159,

> 163, 179, 181, 211, 214, 215, 216, 223, 224, 225, 226, 227, 233, 234, 236, 237, 244, 247, 248, 251,

262, 265

SPS Agreement xix, 18, 38, 52, 55, 56, 91, 179, 183

TBT Agreement xix, 179, 183 TRIMS Agreement xx, 39, 180

TRIPS Agreement xix, xx, 18, 25, 39, 80, 101, 123, 158, 159, 180, 248

#### Table of WTO cases

Argentina – Footwear (EC)	xxii, 54, 55, 216
Argentina – Hides and Leather	xxii, 171
Argentina – Poultry Anti-Dumping	xxii, 15, 129
Duties	AAII, 10, 129
Argentina – Textiles and Apparel	xxiii, 166
Australia – Salmon	xxiii, 165, 169
Brazil – Aircraft	xxiii, xxiv, 92, 218, 225, 226, 227
Brazil - Desiccated Coconut	xxiv, 81, 85, 156
Brazil - Retreaded Tyres	
Canada – Aircraft	xxiv, xxv, 24, 78, 91, 101, 124, 226,
-	227, 228
Canada - Aircraft Credits and	xxv, 24
Guarantees	
Canada – Periodicals	xxvii, 17, 169
Canada - Wheat Exports and	xxvii, 165
Grain Imports	
Chile - Alcoholic Beverages	xxvii, 75, 133
Chile – Price Band System	xxvii, xxviii, 81, 161, 254, 264
Dominican Republic - Import and	xxviii, 172, 254
Sale of Cigarettes	
EC – Asbestos	xxviii, 2, 124, 167, 223
EC – Bananas III	xxviii, xxix, 24, 81, 93, 126, 156, 166, 168,
no national	170, 218, 220, 222, 223, 258
EC - Bed Linen	xxix, xxx, 92, 129, 229, 230, 263, 264
EC - Chicken Cuts	xxx, 3, 15, 39, 69, 73, 80, 165
EC - Computer Equipment	xxx, 42, 43, 87
EC - Export Subsidies on Sugar	xxxi, 3, 24, 53, 85, 130, 132, 163, 169
EC – Hormones	xxxi, xxxii, 36, 52, 55, 56, 81, 91, 131, 164,
EC Doulton	165, 166, 218
EC – Poultry EC – Sardines	xxxii, 2, 85, 91, 165, 170
EC - Sarames EC - Tariff Preferences	xxxii, 124, 133
Lo - Tury Prejerences	xxxiii, 2, 24, 38, 40, 81, 168, 242, 251, 252,
EC - Tube or Pipe Fittings	253, 254, 260, 261, 262
20 Table of Type Tunings	xxxiii, 263, 264

Guatemala - Cement I xxxiii, 167 Guatemala - Cement II xxxiv, 65, 128, 129 India - Autos xxxiv, 65 India - Patents xxxiv, 75, 87, 101, 156, 166 India - Quantitative Restrictions xxxiv, 24, 240, 253, 258 Japan - Agricultural Products II xxxv, 55 Japan - Alcoholic Beverages II xxxv, 17, 20, 34, 73, 74, 85 Japan - Apples xxxv, 55 Japan - Film xxxv, 223 Korea - Alcoholic Beverages xxxvi, 156, 165 Korea - Dairy xxxvi, 53, 156 Korea - Procurement xxxvi, 17, 73, 94, 138, 139 Mexico - Corn Syrup xxxvi, xxxvii, 100, 124, 126, 131, 156, 162, 163 Mexico - Telecoms xxxvii, 78 Turkey - Textiles xxxvii, 67, 82 US - 1916 Act xxxvii, xxxviii, 100, 218, 221 US - Certain EC Products xxxviii, 127, 212 US - Corrosion-Resistant Steel xxxix, 1 Sunset Review US - Cotton Yarn xxxix, 24, 122, 161, 218, 231, 232, 234, 235, 236 US - Countervailing Duty xxxix, 166 Investigation on DRAMS US - Countervailing Measures on xxxix, 91, 156 Certain EC Products US - FSC xl, 24, 124, 125, 128, 136, 153, 225, 226, 227 US - Gambling xli, 3, 25, 78, 85, 92, 124, 142, 143, 162 US - Gasoline xli, 16, 73, 76 US - Hot-Rolled Steel xli, 32, 124, 136, 172 US - Lamb xli, 124 US - Lead and Bismuth II xlii, 167 US - Line Pipe xlii, 24, 218, 231, 233, 235, 236 US - Offset Act (Byrd Amendment) 134, 135, 136, 137, 218, 221, 222, 257, 258 US - Oil Country Tubular Goods xliv, 133, 166 Sunset Reviews US - Section 301 Trade Act xliv, 12, 88, 127 US - Shrimp xliv, xlv, 31, 36, 71, 73, 79, 81, 133, 136, 140, 141, 142, 175 US - Softwood Lumber V xlv, xlvi, 2, 230

 US - Stainless Steel
 xlvi, 171, 173

 US - Steel Plate
 xlvi, 263, 264

 US - Steel Safeguards
 xlvi, 124

 US - Upland Cotton
 xlvii, 2, 3, 85, 156, 247, 264, 265

 US - Wheat Gluten
 xlvii, 155, 165, 166

 US - Wool Shirts and Blouses
 xlvii, 100, 101, 163

#### Table of general abbreviations

Short title Full citation

Anti-Dumping Agreement	Agreement on Implementation of Article VI of the GATT 1994
ATC	Agreement on Textiles and Clothing
BISD	Basic Instruments and Selected Documents
CDSOA	Continued Dumping and Subsidy Offset Act of 2000, Pub L
	No 106-387, 114 Stat 1549, 1001-1003 (2001) (US)
covered	The Agreements listed in Annex 1 of the
agreements	Understanding on Rules and Procedures
	Governing the Settlement of Disputes
Doha Declaration	WTO Ministerial Conference, Ministerial
	Declaration, WT/MIN(01)/DEC/1 (20 November
	2001)
Doha Declaration	WTO Ministerial Conference, Declaration on the
on TRIPS and	TRIPS Agreement and Public Health, WT/MIN(01)/
Public Health	DEC/2 (20 November 2001)
Doha Implemen-	WTO Ministerial Conference, Implementation-
tation Decision	Related Issues and Concerns - Decision of 14 November
	2001, WT/MIN(01)/17 (20 November 2001)
DSB	Dispute Settlement Body
DSU	Understanding on Rules and Procedures
	Governing the Settlement of Disputes (Dispute
7.0	Settlement Understanding)
EC	European Communities
ECJ	European Court of Justice
Enabling Clause	Decision on Differential and More Favourable
	Treatment, Reciprocity, and Fuller Participation

S&D

of Developing Countries, GATT Document L/4903, 28 November 1979, BISD 26S/203 GATS General Agreement on Trade in Services GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade

GSP Generalised System of Preferences

HS Harmonized Commodity Description and Coding

System (Harmonized System)

ICJ International Court of Justice

ILC Articles International Law Commission's Articles on Responsibility of States for Internationally

Wrongful Acts: General Assembly, UN, Report of the International Law Commission, A/56/10 (SUPP)

(1 October 2001)

IMF International Monetary Fund

July Package WTO General Council, Decision Adopted by the

General Council on 1 August 2004, WT/L/579

(2 August 2004)

LDC Least-developed country

Marrakesh Marrakesh Agreement Establishing the World

Agreement Trade Organization
MFN Most Favoured Nation

Multilateral Trade Agreements and associated legal instruments included in Annexes 1, 2 and 3 to the Marrakesh

Agreement Establishing the World Trade

Organization

NAFTA North American Free Trade Agreement

OECD Organisation for Economic Co-operation and

Development

PCIJ Permanent Court of International Justice

Plurilateral Trade Agreements and associated legal instruments included in Annex 4 to the Marrakesh Agreement

Establishing the World Trade Organization

Rules of Conduct DSB, Rules of Conduct for the Understanding on Rules

and Procedures Governing the Settlement of Disputes,

WT/DSB/RC/1 (11 December 1996) Special and differential treatment

SCM Agreement Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing

Measures

SPS Agreement Agreement on the Application of Sanitary and

Phytosanitary Measures

SPS measure Sanitary or phytosanitary measure

TBT Agreement Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade
TRIMS Agreement Agreement on Trade-Related Investment

Measures

Intellectual Property Rights

UN United Nations

UN Charter Charter of the United Nations

UNCTAD United Nations Conference on Trade and

Development

VCLT Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties,

opened for signature on 23 May 1969, 1155 UNTS 331 (entered into force 27 January 1980)

Review, WT/AB/WP/5 (4 January 2005)

Working Appellate Body, Working Procedures for Appellate

Procedures for

Appellate Review

WTO World Trade Organization

contained in its four annexes

WTO Tribunals WTO Arbitral Bodies, Panels, and the Appellate

Body

### Table of WTO award and report abbreviations

Short Title	Full citation
Argentina – Ceramic Tiles	Panel Report, Argentina – Definitive Anti-Dumping Measures on Imports of Ceramic Floor Tiles from Italy WT/DS189/R, adopted 5 November 2001, DSR 2001:XII, 6241
Argentina – Footwear (EC)	Appellate Body Report, Argentina – Safeguard Measures on Imports of Footwear, WT/DS121/AB/R, adopted 12 January 2000, DSR 2000:I, 515
Argentina – Footwear (EC)	Panel Report, Argentina – Safeguard Measures on Imports of Footwear, WT/DS121/R, adopted 12 January 2000, as modified by Appellate Body Report, WT/DS121/AB/R, DSR 2000:II, 575
Argentina – Hides and Leather	Panel Report, Argentina – Measures Affecting the Export of Bovine Hides and Import of Finished Leather, WT/DS155/R and Corr.1, adopted 16 February 2001, DSR 2001:V, 1779
Argentina – Hides and Leather	Award of the Arbitrator, Argentina – Measures Affecting the Export of Bovine Hides and Import of Finished Leather – Arbitration under Article 21.3(c) of the DSU, WT/DS155/10, 31 August 2001, DSR 2001:XII, 6013
Argentina – Poultry Anti-Dumping Duties Argentina – Preserved Peaches	Panel Report, Argentina – Definitive Anti-Dumping Duties on Poultry from Brazil, WT/DS241/R, adopted 19 May 2003 Panel Report, Argentina – Definitive Safeguard Measure on Imports of Preserved Peaches, WT/DS238/R, adopted 15 April 2003
	,,-, adopted to hpin 2005

Argentina – Textiles and Apparel	Appellate Body Report, Argentina - Measures Affecting Imports of Footwear, Textiles, Apparel and Other Items, WT/DS56/AB/R and Corr.1, adopted 22 April 1998, DSR 1998:III, 1003
Argentina – Textiles and Apparel	Panel Report, Argentina – Measures Affecting Imports of Footwear, Textiles, Apparel and Other Items, WT/DS56/R, adopted 22 April 1998, as modified by Appellate Body Report, WT/DS56/AB/R, DSR 1998:III, 1033
Australia – Automo- tive Leather II	Panel Report, Australia – Subsidies Provided to Producers and Exporters of Automotive Leather, WT/ DS126/R, adopted 16 June 1999, DSR 1999:III, 951
Australia – Automo-	Panel Report, Australia – Subsidies Provided to
tive Leather II	Producers and Exporters of Automotive Leather –
(Article 21.5 – US)	Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU by the United States, WT/DS126/RW and Corr.1, adopted 11 February 2000, DSR 2000:III, 1189
Australia – Salmon	Appellate Body Report, Australia – Measures Affecting Importation of Salmon, WT/DS18/AB/R, adopted 6 November 1998, DSR 1998:VIII, 3327
Australia – Salmon	Panel Report, Australia – Measures Affecting Importation of Salmon, WT/DS18/R and Corr.1, adopted 6 November 1998, as modified by Appellate Body Report, WT/DS18/AB/R, DSR 1998:VIII, 3407
Australia – Salmon	Award of the Arbitrator, Australia - Measures Affecting Importation of Salmon - Arbitration under Article 21.3(c) of the DSU, WT/DS18/9, 23 February 1999, DSR 1999:I, 267
Australia – Salmon (Article 21.5 – Canada)	Panel Report, Australia – Measures Affecting Importation of Salmon – Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU by Canada, WT/DS18/RW, adopted 20 March 2000, DSR 2000:IV, 2031
Brazil – Aircraft	Appellate Body Report, Brazil – Export Financing Programme for Aircraft, WT/DS46/AB/R, adopted 20 August 1999, DSR 1999:III, 1161
Brazil – Aircraft	Panel Report, Brazil – Export Financing Programme for Aircraft, WT/DS46/R, adopted 20 August 1999,

as modified by Appellate Body Report, WT/DS46/AB/R, DSR 1999:III, 1221 Appellate Body Report, Brazil - Export Financing Brazil - Aircraft (Article 21.5 -Programme for Aircraft - Recourse by Canada to Article 21.5 of the DSU, WT/DS46/AB/RW, adopted Canada) 4 August 2000, DSR 2000:VIII, 4067 Brazil - Aircraft Panel Report, Brazil - Export Financing Programme (Article 21.5 for Aircraft - Recourse by Canada to Article 21.5 of the Canada) DSU, WT/DS46/RW, adopted 4 August 2000, as modified by Appellate Body Report, WT/DS46/ AB/RW, DSR 2000:IX, 4093 Panel Report, Brazil - Export Financing Programme Brazil - Aircraft for Aircraft - Second Recourse by Canada to Article (Article 21.5 -Canada II) 21.5 of the DSU, WT/DS46/RW/2, adopted 23 August 2001, DSR 2001:X, 5481 Decision by the Arbitrators, Brazil - Export Brazil - Aircraft (Article 22.6 -Financing Programme for Aircraft - Recourse to Arbitration by Brazil under Article 22.6 of the DSU Brazil) and Article 4.11 of the SCM Agreement, WT/DS46/ ARB, 28 August 2000, DSR 2002:I, 19 Appellate Body Report, Brazil - Measures Affecting Brazil - Desiccated Desiccated Coconut, WT/DS22/AB/R, adopted Coconut 20 March 1997, DSR 1997:I, 167 Panel Report, Brazil - Measures Affecting Desiccated Brazil - Desiccated Coconut Coconut, WT/DS22/R, adopted 20 March 1997, as upheld by Appellate Body Report, WT/DS22/AB/R, DSR 1997:I, 189 Panel Report, Brazil - Measures Affecting Imports of Brazil - Retreaded **Tyres** Retreaded Tyres, WT/DS332/R, 12 June 2007 Appellate Body Report, Brazil - Measures Affecting Brazil - Retreaded Imports of Retreaded Tyres, WT/DS332/AB/R, **Tyres** adopted 17 December 2007 Canada - Aircraft Appellate Body Report, Canada - Measures Affecting the Export of Civilian Aircraft, WT/DS70/AB/R, adopted 20 August 1999, DSR 1999:III, 1377 Panel Report, Canada - Measures Affecting the Export Canada - Aircraft of Civilian Aircraft, WT/DS70/R, adopted 20 August 1999, as upheld by Appellate Body Report, WT/DS70/AB/R, DSR 1999:IV, 1443

Appellate Body Report, Canada - Measures Affecting Canada - Aircraft the Export of Civilian Aircraft – Recourse by Brazil (Article 21.5 to Article 21.5 of the DSU, WT/DS70/AB/RW, Brazil) adopted 4 August 2000, DSR 2000:IX, 4299 Panel Report, Canada - Measures Affecting the Canada - Aircraft (Article 21.5 -Export of Civilian Aircraft - Recourse by Brazil to Article 21.5 of the DSU, WT/DS70/RW, adopted Brazil) 4 August 2000, as modified by Appellate Body Report, WT/DS70/AB/RW, DSR 2000:IX, 4315 Canada - Aircraft Panel Report, Canada - Export Credits and Loan Guarantees for Regional Aircraft, WT/DS222/R and Credits and Corr.1, adopted 19 February 2002, DSR 2002:III. Guarantees 849 Canada - Aircraft Decision by the Arbitrator, Canada - Export Credits and Loan Guarantees for Regional Aircraft - Recourse Credits and Guarantees to Arbitration by Canada under Article 22.6 of the (Article 22.6 -DSU and Article 4.11 of the SCM Agreement, WT/ DS222/ARB, 17 February 2003 Canada) Appellate Body Report, Canada - Certain Measures Canada - Autos Affecting the Automotive Industry, WT/DS139/AB/R, WT/DS142/AB/R, adopted 19 June 2000, DSR 2000:VI, 2985 Canada - Autos Panel Report, Canada - Certain Measures Affecting the Automotive Industry, WT/DS139/R, WT/DS142/R, adopted 19 June 2000, as modified by Appellate Body Report, WT/DS139/AB/R, WT/DS142/AB/R, DSR 2000:VII, 3043 Award of the Arbitrator, Canada - Certain Measures Canada - Autos Affecting the Automotive Industry - Arbitration under Article 21.3(c) of the DSU, WT/DS139/12, WT/ DS142/12, 4 October 2000, DSR 2000:X, 5079 Canada - Dairy Appellate Body Report, Canada - Measures Affecting the Importation of Milk and the Exportation of Dairy Products, WT/DS103/AB/R, WT/DS113/AB/R and Corr.1, adopted 27 October 1999, DSR 1999:V.

Canada – Dairy

2057

Panel Report, Canada – Measures Affecting the Importation of Milk and the Exportation of Dairy Products, WT/DS103/R, WT/DS113/R, adopted 27 October 1999, as modified by Appellate Body

Term

Report, WT/DS103/AB/R, WT/DS113/AB/R, DSR 1999:VI, 2097 Canada - Dairy Appellate Body Report, Canada - Measures Affecting the Importation of Milk and the Exportation of Dairy (Article 21.5 -Products - Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU by New New Zealand Zealand and the United States, WT/DS103/AB/RW, and US) WT/DS113/AB/RW, adopted 18 December 2001, DSR 2001:XIII, 6829 Panel Report, Canada - Measures Affecting the Canada - Dairy (Article 21.5 -Importation of Milk and the Exportation of Dairy Products - Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU by New New Zealand Zealand and the United States, WT/DS103/RW, WT/ and US) DS113/RW, adopted 18 December 2001, as reversed by Appellate Body Report, WT/DS103/ AB/RW, WT/DS113/AB/RW, DSR 2001:XIII, 6865 Canada - Dairy Appellate Body Report, Canada - Measures Affecting (Article 21.5 the Importation of Milk and the Exportation of Dairy New Zealand Products - Second Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU by New Zealand and the United States, WT/DS103/ and US II) AB/RW2, WT/DS113/AB/RW2, adopted 17 January 2003 Canada - Dairy Panel Report, Canada - Measures Affecting the (Article 21.5 -Importation of Milk and the Exportation of Dairy New Zealand Products - Second Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU by New Zealand and the United States, WT/DS103/ and US II) RW2, WT/DS113/RW2, adopted 17 January 2003, as modified by Appellate Body Report, WT/DS103/AB/RW2, WT/DS113/AB/RW2 Appellate Body Report, Canada - Term of Patent Canada - Patent Protection, WT/DS170/AB/R, adopted 12 October Term 2000, DSR 2000:X, 5093 Panel Report, Canada - Term of Patent Protection, Canada - Patent Term WT/DS170/R, adopted 12 October 2000, as upheld by Appellate Body Report, WT/DS170/ AB/R, DSR 2000:XI, 5121 Canada - Patent Award of the Arbitrator, Canada - Term of Patent

V, 2031

Protection - Arbitration under Article 21.3(c) of the

DSU, WT/DS170/10, 28 February 2001, DSR 2001: