#### INTERNATIONAL SYMPOSIUM

# Welding and Allied Developments for the Process Industries

London, England, 12-14 April 1988

**EDITED BY A.F. GIFFORD** 







764-53 W4853 小能力,引情

## International Symposium on WELDING AND ALLIED DEVELOPMENTS FOR THE PROCESS INDUSTRIES

London, England, 12-14 April 1988

Organised by
The Welding Institute
and co-sponsored by
the Process Industries Division of
The Institution of Mechanical Engineers
and the Process Plant Association

Edited by A.F. Gifford Symposium Technical Director



E9061310





### First published 1988 Copyright © 1988 The Welding Institute

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher.

To make this volume available as economically and rapidly as possible, the authors' typescripts have been reproduced in their original form. This method has its typographical limitations, but it is hoped that they do not unduly distract the reader.

#### **CONTENTS**

For	eword	5
SE	SSION I: Developments in materials	
1	Developments in metals — an evolving plant fabrication technology T.E.M. JONES	9
2	Developments in plastics M.N. WATSON	21
3	Developments in ceramics M.H. LEWIS	29
4	Metallurgical and market developments in stainless steels S. HENDERSON, K.J. KING and P.G. STONE	43
SES	SSION II: Surfacing	
16	An overview of tribological surface treatments K.T. STEVENS and A. DAVIES	59
19	Thermochemical surface modification techniques T. BELL	73
17	Developments in weld surfacing for the process industries S. GRAINGER	89
18	Solid phase cladding by friction surfacing W.M. THOMAS	101
22	Laser surface treatment techniques — practical experience I.C. HAWKES	121
20	Thermal spraying processes and applications P.E. CHANDLER	133
21	Advantages and limitations of coatings in the food processing industries P.E. WHITE	143
SES	SION III: Advances in cutting and conditioning technology	
13	Developments in plasma cutting equipment M. HASEGAWA and H. YAMAMOTO	155
28	Advances in $\rm CO_2$ laser cutting of aluminium and stainless steel using RF-excited lasers D.H.D. DECHAMPS	165
15	Abrasive water jet cutting I.D. HARRIS	173
29	Surface pre-stressing to reduce the incidence of stress corrosion cracking and corrosion fatigue of welded joints P. O'HARA	185

SESS	SION IV: Advances in arc welding processes	
5	Overview of arc welding developments for the process industries D.N. SHACKLETON	195
8	Developments in welding of process pipework L. CARRICK, A.J. WAREING and D.J. POWELL	203
6	Hot wire TIG narrow-gap welding D.B. PASS and A.N.R. HUNTER	215
7	Development of equipment and procedures for AGR standpipe liner replacement C.H. PEARCE, P. FERGUSON, D.N. WALTON and B. WATSON	227
SESS	SION V: Advances in non-arc welding	
10	The potential use of non-arc welding processes in the process plant industries  J.D. RUSSELL	245
11	Flexible manufacturing with friction welding for the hydraulics industry D.B. PEARSON	263
12	Applications of diffusion bonding S.B. DUNKERTON	273
30	Flash butt welding of boiler tubing G. MATHERS	283
SESS	SION VI: Computerised and automated systems	
24	The role of expert systems: An overview of the present trend and possible evolution of Intelligent Knowledge Based Systems in the context of power and process industries fabrication technology L. HENDERSON	295
27	Systems for optimizing plant life K.G. BØVING	307
23	The application of Computer Aided Engineering (CAE) systems to the design and construction of a major nuclear reprocessing plant K.W. DELOOZE	315
25	Adaptive control of the welding process J. DOHERTY and S. HOLDER	327
	Index to authors	339

#### **FOREWORD**

Successful process plant operation owes much to the work of the materials and joining engineers and the initial conceptual and detail designer. Between them, they provide a team which is committed to providing plant which will produce its intended product reliably, safely and economically, and be easily made and installed on time. There have been few previous seminars where such a spectrum of materials and processes associated with the design and manufacture of process plant equipment has been discussed in such detail.

Process plant equipment covers a number of industries and products, each demanding specialist attention to the selection of materials, fabricating and joining processes. The need was therefore recognised to bring together the experts, who each make their own industries possible and thus help to provide the creature comforts and foods we find so essential in this modern world.

The many skills involved in building process plant resulted in the symposium addressing a very broad range of technology. This collection of papers provides current information on the following:

- A variety of welding and cutting processes, with a major contribution on the increasing role of expert systems and computers in providing control mechanisms, both for manufacture and for design operations.
- b) The importance of ceramics, recognising continuing problems of brittleness.
- c) High quality stainless steel and nickel alloys, meeting many industrial needs.
- d) Surface treatments used to resolve tribological and corrosion problems.
- e) The benefits to be gained by surface conditioning, i.e. 'peening' as a means to combat fatigue, stress corrosion cracking (SCC) and corrosion fatigue.
- f) The increasing use of plastics, arising from improved joining techniques, but limited at present to relatively low temperatures.

Finally, the advent of expert systems will enable the skills of specialists in welding and allied technologies to be encapsulated and will ensure that knowledge becomes even more readily accessible in the future.

A.F. Gifford
Executive Quality Manager
NEI International Combustion Limited
Derby, England

SESSION I: Developments in materials •

.

#### PAPER 1

#### Developments in metals - an evolving plant fabrication technology

T.E.M. Jones (Titanium Fabricators Limited)

#### SUMMARY

While no sweeping technological changes could be said to have taken place during the major economic recession in the process plant industry of the past decade, improved fabricating methods have been implemented to meet the enhanced quality assurance requirements of the users. Demands by the process industry are increasingly for more complicated plant designs with more dimensional precision and for plant for service conditions requiring improved alloys in severely corrosive service conditions. This paper reflects the way in which the demands have been met in applying metals to severe service environments.

#### INTRODUCTION

With some notable exceptions, the initial requirement when selecting a metal of use in the process plant industry is that it should have adequate corrosion resistance at the service temperature with minimum price.

When the choice of metal or alloy has been made a second requirement is to select the design, fabrication and quality assuring methodology that gives an adequate safety factor in service at lowest cost.

By reference to specific recent examples of fabricated process plant, this paper addresses the second of these requirements where the corrosive media are such that carbon steel and the more conventional stainless steels have inadequate corrosion resistance.

The ultimate user is subjected somewhat to the competing claims for superiority of these metals by their suppliers. More often than not the choice is clear cut but beware the user whose economic choice is made by the unit weight cost of the metal alone. Consideration of density, required metal form, quantity involved and of fabrication cost factors are essential. Cost comparisons have been made elsewhere (1-4).

A summary of the metals and alloys under review is given in  $\underline{\text{Table 1}}$ , and their main application areas in  $\underline{\text{Table 2}}$ .

#### APPLICATION AND SELECTION

Aggressive media which cause problems to the process industries that are of most concern are:—

Inorganic acids notably sulphuric, nitric, phosphoric, hydrofluoric acid. Organic acids notably acetic, benzoic and terephthalic. Concentrated alkalis notably potassium hydroxide. Sea water

Corrosive gases notably chlorine and sulphur dioxide.

Metals or alloys which are appropriate at a particular level of medium concentration, temperature, purity or aeration, may of course not be suitable

at higher levels of these variables. Furthermore, certain media/metal combinations require an awareness of the dangers of stress corrosion cracking, crevice corrosion, corrosion fatigue, pitting corrosion and grain boundary corrosion.

While there are good rule-of-thumb broad selection procedures, the complexity of variables tends to make material selection for severely corrosive environments largely empirical supported by plant trials where a new process application is envisaged. One such recent example is the material requirement for flue gas desulphurisation (FGD) plant with its potential for large scale use of one or more of the several contending alloys for resistance to corrosion by wet sulphur dioxide and high chloride, low pH solutions (5-8).

Significant improvements have been made in alloy development over recent years. Notable introductions are included in Table 1 viz.

#### Nickel alloys

- Alloy G.3 With improved ductility over alloys C276 and alloy B2 it is more easily fabricated and corrosion resistant in hot sulphuric, phosphoric and nitric acids.
- Alloy G.30 An alloy with applications in strongly oxidising acids and commercial phosphoric acids, it is superior to alloy G and alloy 625 for this purpose.
- Alloy H Particularly cost effective and having suitable stress cracking resistance in FGD plants, it is resistant to stress corrosion, cracking, pitting and crevice corrosion.
- Alloy C22 Claimed to have better overall corrosion resistance than alloy C276, alloy C4 and alloy 625 it resists localised corrosion particularly in chloride containing solutions and strongly oxidising media.

#### Titanium alloys

Ti Grade 12 A 0.8% Ni 0.3% Mo alloy which has widely substituted for the price unstable Ti 0.2% palladium alloy favoured for corrosion resistance in more reducing conditions than can be withstood by unalloyed titanium 'Fig. 1'. The significantly higher strength of this alloy at all service temperatures is as yet insufficiently appreciated. It is very cost effective where this can be taken advantage of in reducing wall thickness. The comparisons of 'Figs. 2 and 3' shows its allowable stress values and yield/density ration compared with commercial purity titanium.

A pressure vessel application in a recent major US chemical plant with an economic comparison has recently been reported (9). Its application as a lid lining is shown in 'Fig. 4'.

Ti Grade 9 A promising newcomer derived from the widely applied aircraft industry alloy with 6% - Aluminium 4% vanadium but having 3% Aluminium and 2½% vanadium - with a major strength benefit over unalloyed titanium 'Fig. 2'. It is currently being considered by the ASME code authority.

In the fabrication of pressure plant in these metals, the prevalent welding process used is gas tungsten arc welding which, while experiencing no substantial change in use over the past two decades has seen a trend to mechanisation particularly with hot wire feed 'Fig. 5,' and to specialised

welding equipment for specific joint types particularly tube end to tube plate welds of heat exchangers. Synergic MIG welding is receiving much attention as is the use of orbital pipe welding with inserts. More significant perhaps is the implementation of quality planning and monitoring to a rigidly controlled quality assurance system – the latter nowhere more strict than in the environmentally sensitive area of plant for nuclear waste reprocessing. The implementation of total quality management will receive further impetus by the product liability legislation of the Consumer Protection Act of 1987.

While having no direct influence on material selection, the fabrication industry has the ensuing problems of:

- \* designing out potential areas for corrosion
- \* ensuring that economic forming and welding procedures are in place as new alloys are introduced
- \* creating confidence in the client that quality assurance systems for the new alloys are of an adequate standard

With this background, representative examples are given next of process plant in various alloys to illustrate design solutions, and fabrication procedures necessary to produce high integrity containment of aggressive fluids at elevated temperatures and pressures.

#### SOME FABRICATION AND WELDING APPLICATIONS

#### Nickel alloys

A straightforward design and fabrication application in the recently introduced alloy G3 is the vapouriser drum to ASME VIII Div 1 of 'Fig. 6'. This alloy is increasing in usage, its higher molybdenum and nickel content conferring more resistance to corrosive attack in mixed acid solutions than the more generally used alloy 825. Requirements were that the heads after forming should be solution annealed at 1149°C with rapid cool and that seams be fully X-rayed and dye penetrant checked. A typical weld joint preparation is shown in 'Fig. 6'. An increasingly common requirement, as in this case, is that positive metal identification (PMI) be part of the quality plan for vessel construction. PMI is often a requirement of third party inspection both at material suppliers, and at the fabricator during and after manufacture.

The catalyst regenerator vessel in alloy 600 of 'Fig. 7,' is a good example of the increasing complexity of vessels that is now being demanded; as in this case for a chlorination process at 540°C. Provision is made in the design for catalyst to be continuously top fed into an annular space between two cylindrical slotted screens and for reaction gas, regenerate gas and purge air to be passed radially through the screen at different process intervals. As well as needing a finely detailed assembly procedure and welding sequence, tight tolerances on the finished dimensions were required. Statistical analysis involving over 200 screen and annular space measurements were taken in horizontal and vertical vessel orientation to ensure compliance and low service downtime due to catalyst abrasion, screen blocking and hot spot screen burnout.

In general, welding procedures were that weld root runs were by GTAW followed by MMA filler runs. Alloy 600 weld overlay on ASTM A182 FI by the automatic hot wire GTAW process was used on blind flanges. Extensive dye penetrant testing, ultrasonic testing and spot radiography was a requirement.

An example of a complicated form of high temperature tubular heat exchanger is the gas heater of 'Fig. 8,' in which shielding of the tubeplate of a shell and tube heat exchanger from hot shell inlet gas is by use of Alloy 600 in the vulnerable positions coupled with ceramic shields cast into position during

construction around the type 347 stainless tube plate. The ceramic cement insulates from the hot entry 925°C gas and equalises the temperature both across the tubeplate thickness and around its periphery. The cooler tube-side inlet gas enters in the peripheral tubes and then reverses direction radially towards the centre line of the bundle passing out at around 520°C into the inner channel end. Differential expansion of the inner channel outlet as it penetrates the outer channel wall is accommodated by an alloy 600 bellows. The tubes were hydraulically expanded into the tube sheet after welding.

Hydraulic expansion of tubes into tubeplate which was a feature of this heat exchanger is now increasingly used in high integrity shell and tube heat exchangers in preference to the more conventional roller expansion method (10, 11). In this method the tube deforms plastically by applied hydraulic pressure against the inside of the hole; a method which makes it particularly suitable for thin walled tubes. A comparison shows that little or no work hardening occurs in the hydraulic expansion method compared to the significant hardening of the tube by roller expansion. There is also little or no wall thinning by this method. Care must be taken in setting the expansion length to avoid bursting or ballooning of tubes behind the tubesheet. The operation is shown in 'Fig. 9'.

Complexity and close dimensional tolerances occasionally necessitate the fabrication of vessel sections in separate jigs to restrain any movement out of shape and size during welding. In the vertical wet scrubber column of 'Fig. 10,' each of seven sections each with an integrally welded bubble cap tray was fabricated in a jig so as to maintain +/- 0.5mm verticality on each section. This was followed by trial fitting to the bottom section which was closely packed with coilwork. Then the sections were welded together in the vertical position on site such as to maintain a +/- 2mm verticality tolerance. Non destructive testing included extensive radiography, fibre optic inspection and helium leak testing.

In 'Fig. 11,' an example is shown of an added complication where it was required that a column be fully dressed with trays cabling, insulation, and deck platforms before leaving the works for site.

When the design conditions permit, it is still economical to loose-line steel vessels with the more costly nickel alloys such as alloy C276 as in 'Fig. 12'. Because nickel alloys are fusion compatible to steel it permits a technique of panelling the vessel interior by edge fusion to the vessel walls with a suitable disimilar metal GTAW process filler metal and then obviating the weld metal dilution effect on corrosion resistance by applying alloy C276 sealing strips with edge fillet welds to cover these joints as illustrated. This wall paper concept is expected to have widespread application in FGD systems.

#### Titanium

Some sizeable vessels have now been fabricated in titanium although economy dictates that section thickness be low. As a recent example of the large titanium vessels now being applied, the titanium vessel of 'Fig. 13,' has unusual design requirements for an internal bed frame to carry non-metallic material. Design was for 130°C in ASME B265 Grade 2 commercial purity titanium and a 1 hour working cycle between 27 and 110°C. Designed to be as economically thin as possible, PREVPAK micro computer design software was invaluable for calculations of local loads and the stresses at the saddle support. The design solution gave shell thickness of 7.5mm in the saddle area 6.35mm elsewhere, and external stiffening rings for general support, the vessel being allowed to expand freely on the saddles via a PTFE sandwich interlayer. Local loads on the end pipework due to vessel expansion were subject to

theoretical stress analysis. As in this instance, local load calculation demands on fabricators are now commonplace. With thirty upright titanium pipe supports welded via pads to the shell, extensive internal and external argon shielded backing was required.

It is becoming the practice that the tubes of titanium heat exchanger bundles be expanded into the tube sheet by the hydraulic expansion method. In a typical instance each 14 swg grade U-tube is expanded into two grooves over a 200mm length into a 222mm thick titanium tubeplate. Expansion procedure test blocks were required as were daily test weld samples before start of production welding. A helium leak test from the shell side is a further requirement and the usual ferroxyl test for freedom from iron contamination before welding is necessary. To prevent tube scoring and service vibration, PTFE ferrules are used in the baffle holes.

#### Zirconium and tantalum

A heat exchanger is now under construction with 9 inch thick zirconium tubeplates, but explosively clad zirconium to mild steel tubeplates are more usual 'Fig. 14'.

With these few exceptions, because of its higher cost, zirconium tends to be used in thin sections, for example as vessel internals, linings and coils. Much skill is required in satisfactory lining not only to get a close fit in intricate designs but because it is, like titanium and tantalum, not ferrous fusion compatible. The zirconium clad agitator of 'Fig. 15,' involves painstaking piecemeal fitting and argon shielding to protect the sheet metal joints. Stability of the cladding is conferred by a number of zirconium plugs through blade holes which are seal welded to the sheet on each surface.

Sheet thickness used in the more expensive tantalum is lower still although it is sometimes used in explosion clad form. A welding chamber installation for tantalum shielding is shown in 'Fig. 16'.

#### SPECIALISED WELDING PROCESSES

Two of the less common welding methods now being applied are mechanised and enhanced versions of GTA Welding, which is still the dominant process for high integrity work. These are:-

#### Hot wire TIG welding

Used principally for productivity gains by high deposition without sacrifice of high weld soundness. It is also useful for the weld surfacing of steel with, for example, nickel alloys. Hot wire TIG by virtue of its speed needs longer trailing and backing shields than normal welding and careful weld parameter setting to achieve weld pool deposition equilibrium with traverse speed 'Fig. 4'. It is of course more economical as weld thickness increases. The less common metals are not used often in thick section so that welding machine capital cost is not easy to justify unless batch production or lengthy runs are a feature of the work. Nevertheless one can expect increasing application of the process in the future.

#### Back face or down-the-bore welding

Used for welding heat exchanger tubes to the rear face of tube plates in order to avoid the natural crevice present with front face welding, there is some productivity gain in this process by automation of the weld cycle and by saving of the length of tube otherwise needed to pass through the tubeplate thickness.

The major gain is that of ensuring the highest integrity by the ability to radiograph what is effectively a butt weld.

Back face welding requires much perseverance in setting the weld parameters, procedures and positional requirements. This is in order to achieve adequate penetration at the rear of the weld on each tube exterior so that a concave underside fillet is obtained for a smooth external joint and no crevice is caused by inadequate penetration. An example of welds obtained by this technique using commercially available equipment is shown in 'Fig. 17'. It is currently being applied in heat exchangers for the nuclear waste reprocessing industry and the fertiliser industry.

The fabrication sector with which this paper is concerned operates in a high material and high weld cost regime with weld soundness requirements well above those achieved by the flux shielded processes that have the advantage of higher linear speeds and higher deposition rates. In compensation for the relatively high weld costs, repair costs are remarkably low in GTA welding these metals. The challenge for welding engineers in this sector remains to maintain the present high standards of weld soundness and integrity while increasing the weld production rate towards that achieved in the ferrous process plant sector.

#### Acknowledgements

The author thanks the employees of Titanium Fabricators Limited who made this paper possible.

#### References

- 1. Jones T E M: 'The behavioural characteristics of Titanium, Zirconium, Tantalum, Nickel and their alloys'. In Proc. Symp. 'Fluid Handling' I. Chem. E. Series No. 60, 1980, 205-258.
- 2. Hansen B H: 'Present and future uses of Titanium in Engineering'. Materials and Design 1986 7(6) Nov/Dec.
- 3. Balliett R W, Coscia M, Hunkeler F J: 'Niobium and Tantalum in materials selection' Journal of Metals 1986 38(a) 25-27.
- 4. Hunkeler F J: 'Properties of Tantalum for applications in the chemical process industry' ASTM STP 849 'Refractory Metals and their industrial applications'. 1984, 28-49.
- 5. Schutz A W and Gravman J S: 'Corrosion behaviour of titanium and other alloys in laboratory FGD similar environment', NACE Symp. 1985, paper 52.
- 6. Cerny M K: Titanium Resista-Clad plate in FGD units Proc. 'International Titanium Conf. San Francisco'. 1986. 1 532-537.
- 7. Kirchenheimer R and Romer W: "Corrosion resistant VDM materials for FGD plants" Publ. of VDM Nickel Technology AG.
- 8. Silence W L, Manning P E and Asphahani A I: "Alloy selection for FGD systems" Haynes Int. Corp. 1981 Denver Seminar.
- 9. Philippon P A and Willey B A: 'Grade 12 and 9 for cost effective Titanium fabrication', Proc. International Titanium Conf. San Francisco 1986 1 497-505.
- 10. Hydraulische Rohrbefestigung in Warmetauschern, Dampferzeugern und Kondensatoren, Druckschrift der Fa. TU-EX-CO, Wuppertal (1982).

11. Yokell S: 'Heat exchanger tube to tube sheet connections' 'Chemical Engineering' 1982, Feb 8.

Table 1 Alloy designations and compositions

NT	CKEL	AT.T.	OVS

Zr702

GENERIC NAME	ASTM NO.	WERKS	TOF FE	APPROX	CIMATE (	COMPOSIT	ION %			
				Fe	Ni	Cr	Мо	Cu	Mino Elem	
Alloy 28 Alloy 20 Alloy 825 Alloy G Alloy G3 Alloy H Alloy G30 Alloy 690 Alloy 600 Alloy C276 Alloy C22 Alloy C4 Alloy 625 Alloy 400 Alloy B2 90:10 CuNi 70:30 CuNi Nickel 200 Nickel 201 TITANIUM GRA	B709 B463 B163 B582 B582 - B168 B163 B575 B575 B574 B443 B127 B333 B706 B715 B160 B160	1.456 2.466 2.485 2.461 2.460 2.464 2.481 2.460 2.461 2.485 2.461 2.087 2.088 2.461 2.087	0889 3269206072280	35 34 28 19 19 19 15 9 6 4 3 2 2 1.5 0.6	31 38 41 45 48 48 45 61 73 57 66 63 64 69 10 30 100	27 20 21 22 23 22 29.5 29 16 21 16 22	3.5 2.4 6.1 6.4 7 9 5.5 16 16 13 16 9	1.3 3.4 2.2 2.0 2.0 - 2.0	0.25 0.25 3.5W 3.2W 0.3T 3.4NI	i b b b c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c
GENERIC NAME	ASTM NO.	APPRO	KIMATE	COMPOSI	TION %					
		N max	C max	Fe max	O max	A1	V	Pd	Ni	Мо
Grade 1 Grade 2 Grade 3 Grade 7 Grade 9 Grade 12	B265 B265 B265 B265 B265 B265	0.03 0.03 0.05 0.03 0.03	0.10 0.10 0.10 0.10 0.08 0.08	0.20 0.30 0.30 0.30 0.30	0.18 0.25 0.35 0.25 0.25		2.5	0.2	0.7	0.3
ZIRCONIUM				,						
GENERIC NAME	ASTM NO.	APPROX	IMATE	COMPOSIT	CION %					
		Hf max	C max	Fe max	O max					

0.16

B551 4.5 0.05 0.2

Table 2 Principal applications

NICKEL ALLOYS	3				/	;- [S		/			
		\$11.7.			1/20					St. St. St.	
GENERIC NAME											SOME TRADE NAMES*
Alloy 28 Alloy 20	X X X	х		X	Х	х	X				Nicrofer 3127LC Nicrofer 3620NE, Carpenter 20
Alloy 825 Alloy G	X	^		X			^			<del> </del>	Incoloy 825, Nicrofer 4221 Hastelloy G, Nicrofer A520hMo
Alloy G3 Alloy H	X			Х		v					Hastelloy G3
Alloy G30	-			Х		X	-	├	_	+-	Nicrofer 4823hMo Hastelloy G30
Alloy 690			Х				X				Nicrofer 6030
Alloy 600							Х	X			Inconel 600
Alloy C276	X			X		X		X	Х		Hastelloy C276, Nicrofer 5716
Alloy C22	X	Х					_		X		Hastelloy C22, Nicrofer 5621
Alloy C4	X	_		X		X					Hastelloy C4, Nicrofer 6616, Coronel C4
Alloy 625	Х			Х	Х	Х	v		X	~	Inconel 625, Cabot 625, Nicrofer 6020hMo
Alloy 400 Alloy B2	-	Х			^	-	Х	-		Х	Monel 400
90:10 CuNi	-	^			Х					-	Coronel B2, Hastelloy B2, Nicrofer 6928 Kunifer 10, Cunifer 10
70:30 CuNi	_				X						Kunifer 30, Cunifer 30
Nickel 200							Х			Х	naminar oo, daminar oo
Nickel 201							Х	Х			
TITANIUM GRAD	ES A	ND	AL L	oys							
Grade 1			Х		Х	Х		Х	Х		IMI 115, Ti 35A
Grade 2			X		X	X		X	X		IMI 125, Ti 50A
Grade 3	<u> </u>		X		Х	Х		X	X		IMI 130, Ti 75A
Grade 7			X								IMI 260, Ti Pd
Grade 9 Grade 12	_		X	-	х						- Ti Code 12, IMI 325
ZIRCONIUM	<u> </u>										11 GOGE 12, 1M1 323
Zr702	х	х	Х				х		Х		

<sup>\*</sup> Trade name attributions - Hastelloy (Cabot Corporation)
Nicrofer, Cunifer (VDM Metal Technology AG)
Inconel, Incoloy, Monel, Coronel (Wiggin Alloys)
IMI 115, Kunifer etc (IMI plc)
Ti 35, Ti Code 12 (Timet Corporation)