

HONG KONG CASES

1973-1976

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Butterworths Asia
Hong Kong • Singapore • Kuala Lumpur

The Butterworth Group of Companies

Hong Kong	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA (HONG KONG) 19/F Eight Commercial Tower 8 Sun Yip Street, Chai Wan, Hong Kong Tel: 29651400 Fax: 29760840
Singapore	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA 10 Anson Road #32-01, International Plaza, Singapore 0207
Malaysia	MALAYAN LAW JOURNAL SDN BHD Suite 1001/02 10th Floor Wisma Hamzah Kwong Hing No 1 Leboh Ampang 50100 Kuala Lumpur
Australia	BUTTERWORTHS Sydney, Melbourne, Brisbane, Adelaide, Perth, Canberra
Canada	BUTTERWORTHS CANADA LTD Toronto and Vancouver
Ireland	BUTTERWORTH (IRELAND) LTD Dublin
New Zealand	BUTTERWORTHS OF NEW ZEALAND LTD Wellington and Auckland
Puerto Rico	BUTTERWORTH OF PUERTO RICO, INC San Juan
UK	BUTTERWORTH & Co (PUBLISHERS) LTD London and Edinburgh
USA	BUTTERWORTH LEGAL PUBLISHERS Salem, New Hampshire and Carlsbad, California
Butterworths Asia is a division of Reed Elsevier (Singapore) Pte Ltd.	

© Butterworths Asia, 1995

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any material form or by any means, including photocopying and recording, or storing in any medium by electronic means and whether or not transiently or incidentally to some other use of this publication, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher. Such written permission must also be obtained before any part of this publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

ISSN 0218-7809

Typeset by Butterworths Asia and Corporate Press (HK) Ltd
Produced by Mandarin Offset Ltd
Printed and bound in Hong Kong

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Associate Editors

Grenville Cross QC

Peter Garland QC

Ruy Barretto, Barrister

Michael Ozorio, Barrister

Mohan Bharwaney, Barrister

Susan Kwan, Barrister

Malcolm Merry, Barrister

Aarif Barma, Barrister

Andrew Cheung, Barrister

Peter Ng, Barrister

Joseph Fok, Barrister

Anderson Chow, Barrister

Teresa Cheng, Barrister

David Fitzpatrick, Barrister

Patrick WS Cheung, Barrister

Andrew Byrnes, Hong Kong University

Johannes Chan, Hong Kong University

Reporters in this volume

Daniel WS Chan

Earnest WH Cheung, Barrister

Charles P Chiu, Barrister

Lindy Course, Barrister

Stephen Fong, Barrister

Victor T Gidwani, Barrister

Annie Marie Gordon, Barrister

Richard Khaw, Barrister

Jasper Kwan, Barrister

Julia Lau, Barrister

Lawrence Law, Barrister

Cindy Lee, Barrister

Rebecca MK Lee, Barrister

Richard Leung, Barrister

Cynthia Li, Barrister

PY Lo, Barrister

Herman LH Poon, Barrister

Phillip Ross, Barrister

Timon Shum, Barrister

KW Tang, Barrister

David Tsang, Barrister

Jennifer Tsui, Barrister

Daniel Wan, Barrister

Lydia Wingrad

Christopher Wong, Barrister

Dominic Yeung, Barrister

Angela Ho

Anthony P Kinnear

Butterworths Asia

Publisher: Anthony P Kinnear

Deputy Managing Editor (Hong Kong): Angela Ho

Deputy Managing Editor (Singapore): Zarinah Marican

Legal Editor: Jeanne Tan

Editors: Neerav Srivastava, Vera Yu, Azeem Ali

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The publishers are grateful to and acknowledge the significant contribution and support of the Hong Kong Superior Court Judgments Database project, directed by the four members of the Faculty of Law, whose names are mentioned below. The judgments database project (1989–1994) was funded primarily by the University of Hong Kong's Conference and Research Grants Committee with assistance from the Department of Professional Legal Education, at the Faculty of Law. The Faculty members responsible for the project are (in alphabetical order) Andrew Byrnes, Lecturer, Department of Law; Rick Glofcheski, Lecturer, Department of Law; Gary N Heilbronn, Senior Lecturer, Department of Professional Legal Education; and Sarah Nield, Senior Lecturer, Department of Professional Legal Education (until 1992). The project administrator is James Garritty, Research Officer, Faculty of Law.

TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS

List of abbreviations used in this volume (excluding reports):

A	High Court Action
ACJ	Acting Chief Justice
A-G	Attorney General
AR	Application for Review
Adm	Admiralty Action
App	Appendix
art	article
Aust	Australia
CA	Court of Appeal
CA	Civil Appeal Number in references to unreported cases (eg CA 2/92)
CC	High Court Criminal Case
CJ	Chief Justice
Cap	Chapter (as in Chapter Number of an Ordinance)
Crim App	Criminal Appeal
Comm L	Commercial List
Con L	Construction List
ch	chapter (as in chapter number of a book)
cl(l)	clause(s)
DC	District Court
DCA	District Court Action
DJ	District Court Divorce Jurisdiction
DJ	District Judge
DPP	Director of Public Prosecutions
EC	European Communities
ECC	Economic Compensation Case
ECHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECJ	Court of Justice of the European Communities
EEC	European Economic Communities
Ed	Edition
Ex Ch	Court of Exchequer Chamber
exh	exhibit
fn	footnote
HC	High Court
HL	House of Lords
J(J)	Justice(s)
J(J)A	Justice(s) of Appeal
LT(A)	Labour Tribunal (Appeal)
LC	Lord Chancellor
Ld T(A)	Lands Tribunal (Appeal)
MA	Magistracy Appeal
MP	Miscellaneous Proceedings
MR	Master of the Rolls
n	note
NSW	New South Wales
O	Order (of the Rules of the Supreme Court)
PC	Privy Council

Abbreviations

PRC	People's Republic of China
PCA	Privy Council Appeal
Pt	Part
para(s)	paragraph(s)
RSC	Rules of the Supreme Court
r(r)	rule(s)
reg(s)	regulation(s)
s(s)	section(s)
sub-s(s)	subsection(s)
Sch	Schedule
UN	United Nations
Uncitral	United Nations Commission on International Trade Law
VP(P)	Vice-President(s)
WCC	Workers' Compensation Case

List of abbreviations of law reports:

AC	Law Reports, Appeal Cases (HL and PC); since 1890
All ER	All England Law Reports; since 1936
All ER Rep	All England Law Reports Reprint
App Cas	Law Reports, Appeal Cases, House of Lords, 15 volumes; 1875–1890
CB(NS)	Common Bench Reports, New Series, 20 volumes; 1856–1865
CCC	Canadian Criminal Cases, Annotated, since 1892
CLR	Commonwealth Law Reports; since 1903
Ch	Law Reports, Chancery Division; since 1890
Ch D	Law Reports, Chancery Division, 45 volumes; 1875–1890
Cr App R	Criminal Appeal Reports (HL and CA(UK)); since 1908
Crim LR	Criminal Law Review; since 1954
DLR	Dominion Law Reports (Canada), 1912–1955
East	East's Reports, King's Bench, 16 volumes; 1800–1812
Ex	Exchequer Reports (Welshby, Hurlstone & Gordon); 1847–1856
F & F	Foster and Finlason's Reports, Nisi Prius, 4 volumes; 1856–1867
FLR	Federal Law Reports (Australia), 12 volumes; since 1957
H & C	Hurlstone and Coltman's Reports, Exchequer, 4 volumes; 1862–1866
H & N	Hurlstone and Norman's Reports, Exchequer, 7 volumes; 1856–1862
HKC	Hong Kong Cases
HKDCLR	Hong Kong District Court Law Reports
HKLR	Hong Kong Law Reports
Hare	Hare's Reports, Chancery, 11 volumes; 1841–1853

IR	Irish Reports; since 1838
KB	King's Bench
LGR	Local Government Reports; since 1902
LJ Ch	Law Journal Reports, New Series, Chancery; 1831-1949
LR CP	Law Reports, Common Pleas, 10 volumes; 1865-1875
LR QB	Queen's Bench; 10 volumes; 1865-1875
LT	Law Times Reports; 1859-1947
LI LR	Lloyd's List Law Reports; 1919-1950
Lloyd's Rep	Lloyd's List Law Reports; since 1951
Mol	Molloy's Reports, Chancery (Ireland), 3 volumes, 1808-1831
NLJ	New Law Journal; since 1965
NZLR	New Zealand Law Reports; since 1883
P	Law Reports, Probate, Divorce and Admiralty Division; 1890-1971
QB	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1891-1900, and since 1952
QBD	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1875-1890
QWN	Queensland Law Reporter & Weekly Notes; since 1908
R & N	Rhodesia & Nyasaland Law Reports, 6 volumes; 1956-1964
RLR	Reports of the High Court of Rhodesia; since 1964
RPC	Reports of Patent Cases; since 1884
SASR	South Australian State Reports; since 1921
SJ	Solicitors' Journal; since 1856
TLR	The Times Law Reports, 71 volumes; 1884-1950
	The Times Law Reports; since 1951
WIR	West Indian Reports ; since 1959
WLR	Weekly Law Reports; since 1953
WR	Weekly Reporter; 1853-1906
Wms Saund	Saunders' Reports, annotated by Williams; 1666-1673
Y & C Ex	Younge & Collyer's Reports, Exchequer in Equity, 4 volumes; 1833-1841

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

The mode of citation of cases reported in this volume of *Hong Kong Cases* is [1973-1976] HKC (page).

	Page		Page
A		A	
Alabama Building Construct- ion Ltd; Faber Union (Hong Kong) Ltd v [HC]	113	Chau Ping San, Re [HC]	87
Angela Maria Dias (t/a Crowden Trading Corp) v National Insurance Co Ltd [HC]	21	Cheng Bong Nang v Cheng Ho Fai [HC]	137
Attorney General v Far East Paint Co (a firm) [HC]	30	Cheng Ho Fai; Cheng Bong Nang v [HC]	137
Attorney General v Ng Kwok Yuen [HC]	326	Cheung For Kuen v Tang Wai Kwong [HC]	485
Attorney General v Yip Wing Sun & Anor [CA]	425	Cheung Kwong Sui; R v [HC]	493
Attorney General; Chan Yat Sun & Ors v [HC]	278	Cheung Li Bo; R v [CA]	437
Attorney General; Crozet Ltd & Ors v [HC]	97	Cheung Yeung Kan v Liu Kwan [HC]	237
Attorney General; Wong Kwong Shing (t/a Ka Wah Motors Co) v [HC]	359	Chinese Estates Ltd; Woodhall Co Ltd v [HC]	350
Au Lai Yung; R v [HC]	417	Chiu Chun Chuen; R v [CA]	456
Au Yeung Siu Tung & Ors v Tung Shing Ho (a firm) [CA]	144	Choo Kim San & Ors; Lee Ing Chee v [HC]	511
Australian & Eastern Insurance Co Ltd v Luen Fat Hong (a firm) [HC]	47	Chu Chun Sing; R v [CA]	474
C		Chu Kim Leung & Anor v Wong Suk Yee [HC]	11
Canton Trust & Commercial Bank Ltd, The v Fui Men Tak & Ors [HC]	121	Chui King; R v [HC]	261
Canton Trust & Commercial Bank Ltd, The v Yuen Chen Koo & Ors [HC]	33	Chui Ying Fong & Anor v Leung Kon Shau [HC]	216
Capital Land Investment Co Ltd, The v Se Mong Kai [HC]	15	Cromwell Investment Co Ltd & Ors; Fook Sun Enterprises Co Ltd v [HC]	335
Chan Ching Chong v Chan Kwan Lai & Anor [HC]	329	Crozet Ltd & Ors v Attorney General [HC]	97
Chan King Pan, Dr v The Medical Council of Hong Kong [CA]	211	D	
Chan Kwan Lai & Anor; Chan Ching Chong v [HC]	329	Dao Heng Bank Ltd & Anor; Yat Tung Investment Co Ltd v [PC]	194
Chan Yat Sun & Ors v Attorney General [HC]	278	Ding Kwei Tsoh & Ors; Yue Wan Estates Ltd v [CA]	508
		Ding Lik Kiu, Dr v Medical Council of Hong Kong [CA]	90
		Duty Free Shoppers Ltd v Hong Kong Tax Free Co Ltd [HC]	203
		F	
		Faber Union (Hong Kong) Ltd v Alabama Building Construction Ltd [HC]	113
		Far East Paint Co (a firm); Attorney General v [HC]	30

Hong Kong Cases

	Page		Page
First Asian Security Co v Ng Michael [HC]	368	Johnson Electric Industrial Manufactory Ltd v Lo Ping Sun & Ors [HC]	251
Fong Shu Hoi; Hon Hong v [HC]	207		
Fook Sun Enterprises Co Ltd v Cromwell Investment Co Ltd & Ors [HC]	335	K	
Fui Men Tak & Ors; The Canton Trust & Commercial Bank Ltd v [HC]	121	Kam Wing Yiu; R v [HC]	273
Fung Siu Kwan; R v [HC]	496	Kays Impex Corp (HK) Ltd v Arbuthnot Export Services Ltd [CA]	109
Fung Wing King (executor of last will and testament of Tang Siu, dec'd); Hongkong & Shanghai Banking Corp v [HC]	164	Ken Kee Securities Co v Wong Ying Cheong (No 1) .. [HC]	55
H		Ken Kee Securities Co v Wong Ying Cheong (No 2) .. [HC]	445
Hardwick & Ors v Spence Robinson (a firm) [HC]	241	Khan v Morrin & Ors [HC]	223
Ho Kwok Shing; R v [HC]	233	King & Anor; Warble Enterprises Ltd v [HC]	103
Hocomban Enterprises Ltd v Standfast International Insurance Co Ltd [HC]	373	Kowloon Stock Exchange Ltd & Ors; So Kwan Nane & Ors v [HC]	315
Holiday Products (HK) Ltd v Polyproducts Industrial Co (a firm) [CA]	177	Kung Hoi Lau; R v [HC]	499
Holiday Products (HK) Ltd; Polyproducts Industrial Co v [HC]	342	Kwan Wai Hung; R v [CA]	449
Hon Hong v Fong Shu Hoi [HC]	207	L	
Hong Kong Tax Free Co Ltd; Duty Free Shoppers Ltd v [HC]	203	Lai Fat; R v [HC]	503
Hongkong & Shanghai Banking Corp v Fung Wing King (executor of last will and testament of Tang Siu, dec'd) [HC]	164	Lai Ming; R v [HC]	288
Hsin Chong Construction Co Ltd; Lam Kwong Yick v [CA]	434	Lai Tin Hei; R v [CA]	406
I		Lam Kwok Hing & Anor; R v [HC]	408
IBM World Trade Corp v Jean [CA]	63	Lam Kwong Yick v Hsin Chong Construction Co Ltd [CA]	434
J		Lam Mui Yau; R v [CA]	323
JC Penny Co Inc & Anor v Penneys Ltd & Anor [HC]	290	Lam Tin Yau; R v [CA]	302
Jean; IBM World Trade Corp v [CA]	63	Lam Wu Nam & Ors; R v [CA]	467
		Lau Yiu Long & Ors; Pao On & Ors v [HC]	377
		Lee Charles; Pepsi-Cola Inter- national Ltd v [HC]	82
		Lee Ing Chee v Choo Kim San & Ors [HC]	511
		Lee Kam Sheung; R v [CA]	461
		Lee Pui Kee v Ng Chak Tong [HC]	75
		Lee Woon Sun & Ors; Wong Kin Keung v [HC]	45
		Leung Bing Yiu; R v [HC]	260

Table of Cases Reported

	Page		Page
Leung Kon Shau; Chui Ying Fong & Anor v [HC]	216	O	
Leung Wing Kei; R v [HC]	313	Owners of the 'Adri XV' (Indo- nesian Flag); Wong Chun Ho (t/a Hong Kong World Wide Enterprises Co v [CA]	1
Li Chun Sai & Ors; R v [HC]	442	P	
Li Fung Wo; R v [HC]	412	Pak Wing Biu; R v [HC]	439
Li Wai Kuen; R v [HC]	346	Pao On & Ors v Lau Yiu Long & Ors [HC]	377
Lin Sai Kan; R v [HC]	483	Penneys Ltd & Anor; JC Penny Co Inc & Anor v [HC]	290
Liu Kwan; Cheung Yeung Kan v [HC]	237	Pepsi-Cola International Ltd v Lee Charles [HC]	82
Lo Ping Sun & Ors; Johnson Electric Industrial Manu- factory Ltd v [HC]	251	Polyproducts Industrial Co (a firm); Holiday Products (HK) Ltd v [CA]	177
Luen Cheong & Co & Anor v Mak Yeuk Chi & Ors [HC]	263	Polyproducts Industrial Co (a firm) v Holiday Products (HK) Ltd [HC]	342
Luen Fat Hong (a firm); Australian & Eastern Insurance Co Ltd v [HC]	47	R	
Luong Bat Kien, Re [HC]	71	R v Au Lai Yung [HC]	417
M		R v Cheung Kwong Sui [HC]	493
Mak Yeuk Chi & Ors; Luen Cheong & Co & Anor v [HC]	263	R v Cheung Li Bo [CA]	437
Malteser Hilfsdienst Hospital An Hai v Shun Cheong Steam Navigation Co Ltd [HC]	40	R v Chiu Chun Chuen [CA]	456
Man Kwok Hung; R v [HC]	465	R v Chu Chun Sing [CA]	474
Medical Council of Hong Kong, The; Dr Chan King Pan v [CA]	211	R v Chui King [HC]	261
Medical Council of Hong Kong, The; Dr Ding Lik Ki v [CA]	90	R v Fung Siu Kwan [HC]	496
Morrin & Ors; Khan v [HC]	223	R v Ho Kwok Shing [HC]	233
N		R v Kam Wing Yiu [HC]	273
National Insurance Co Ltd; Angela Maria Dias (t/a Crowden Trading Corp) v [HC]	21	R v Kung Hoi Lau [HC]	499
Ng Chak Tong; Lee Pui Kee v [HC]	75	R v Kwan Wai Hung [CA]	449
Ng Kwok Yuen; Attorney General v [HC]	326	R v Lai Fat [HC]	503
Ng Lai Sim; R v [HC]	286	R v Lai Ming [HC]	288
Ng Michael; First Asian Security Co v [HC]	368	R v Lai Tin Hei [CA]	406
Ng Wan Fei; R v [HC]	420	R v Lam Kwok Hing & Anor [HC]	408
		R v Lam Mui Yau [CA]	323
		R v Lam Tin Yau [CA]	302
		R v Lam Wu Nam & Ors [CA]	467
		R v Lee Kam Sheung [CA]	461
		R v Leung Bing Yiu [HC]	260
		R v Leung Wing Kei [HC]	313
		R v Li Chun Sai & Ors [HC]	442

	Page		Page
R v Li Fung Wo	[HC] 412	Tung Shing Ho (a firm); Au Yeung Siu Tung & Ors v	[CA] 144
R v Li Wai Kuen	[HC] 346		
R v Lin Sai Kan	[HC] 483	W	
R v Man Kwok Hung	[HC] 465	Wang Yu; Shaw Brothers Ltd v	[CA] 125
R v Ng Lai Sim	[HC] 286	Warble Enterprises Ltd v King & Anor	[HC] 103
R v Ng Wan Fei	[HC] 420	Wong Chun Ho (t/a Hong Kong World Wide Enterprises Co v Owners of the 'Adri XV' (Indonesian Flag)	[CA] 1
R v Pak Wing Biu	[HC] 439	Wong Kin Keung v Lee Woon Sun & Ors	[HC] 45
R v Sit Kwok Chiu & Ors	[CA] 422	Wong Kwan Cheung; R v	[CA] 463
R v Taylor	[HC] 452	Wong Kwong Shing (t/a Ka Wah Motors Co) v Attorney General	[HC] 359
R v Tse Hung	[HC] 300	Wong Suk Yee; Chu Kim Leung & Anor v	[HC] 11
R v Wong Kwan Cheung	[CA] 463	Wong Ying Cheong (No 1); Ken Kee Securities Co v	[HC] 55
R v Yu Kiu Kwan	[CA] 478	Wong Ying Cheong (No 2); Ken Kee Securities Co v	[HC] 445
R v Yuen Choi Sau	[HC] 333	Woodhall Co Ltd v Chinese Estates Ltd	[HC] 350
		Y	
S		Yam Wong Tak, dec'd, Re	[HC] 355
Sadick v Song Wai Ling	[HC] 305	Yat Tung Investment Co Ltd v Dao Heng Bank Ltd & Anor	[PC] 194
Se Mong Kai; Capital Land Investment Co Ltd, The v	[HC] 15	Yip Wing Sun & Anor; Attorney General v	[CA] 425
Shaw Brothers Ltd v Wang Yu	[CA] 125	Yu Kiu Kwan; R v	[CA] 478
Shing Shun Hang Land Investment Co Ltd v Siu Kwong Hong Ltd	[HC] 169	Yue Wan Estates Ltd v Ding Kwei Tsoh & Ors	[CA] 508
Shun Cheong Steam Naviga- tion Co Ltd; Malteser Hilfs- dienst Hospital An Hai v	[HC] 40	Yuen Chen Koo & Ors; The Canton Trust & Commercial Bank Ltd v	[HC] 33
Sit Kwok Chiu & Ors; R v	[CA] 422	Yuen Choi Sau; R v	[HC] 333
Siu Kwong Hong Ltd; Shing Shun Hang Land Investment Co Ltd v	[HC] 169		
So Kwan Nane & Ors v Kowloon Stock Exchange Ltd & Ors	[HC] 315	Z	
Song Wai Ling; Sadick v	[HC] 305	Zee Cheung Yok Lin v Zee Tak Foong	[HC] 6
Spence Robinson (a firm); Hardwick & Ors v	[HC] 241	Zee Tak Foong; Zee Cheung Yok Lin v	[HC] 6
Standfast International Insur- ance Co Ltd; Hocomban Enterprises Ltd v	[HC] 373		
T			
Tang Wai Kwong; Cheung For Kuen v	[HC] 485		
Taylor; R v	[HC] 452		
Tse Hung; R v	[HC] 300		

SUBJECT INDEX

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

Commissioner of Transport

Refusal to register and license vehicles – Whether the Commissioner had discretion to refuse registration – Ultra vires – Whether Commissioner should make clear basis for refusal – Burden of adducing evidence – Road Traffic (Registration and Licensing of Vehicles) Regulations (Cap 220) reg 4, 17, 17A, 18B

Wong Kwong Shing (t/a Ka Wah Motors Co) v Attorney General [HC] 359

Habeas corpus

Illegal entrant – Removal order – Whether applicant given sufficient opportunity to be heard – Whether decision of Director of Immigration quasi-judicial – Court may not interfere with administrative decision unless there was an abuse of statutory power

Re Luong Bat Kien [HC] 71

Medical Council

Review of disciplinary proceedings – Whether proceedings conducted in proper manner – Defendant allowed to put forward defence in improper manner – Medical Practitioners (Registration and Disciplinary Procedure) Regulations reg 28

Dr Chan King Pan v The Medical Council Of Hong Kong [CA] 211

Natural justice

Application to the Commissioner of Police for gaming licence – No reasons given for refusal – Whether breach of statutory duty – Whether irrelevant considerations taken into account – Gambling Ordinance (Cap 148) s 13

Chan Yat Sun & Ors v Attorney General [HC] 278

ANIMALS

Cruelty to animals

Confiscation order – Whether order permissible – Animals may only be removed and detained for limited period of time – Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Ordinance (Cap 169) s 5(1), (2)

R v Lin Sai Kan [HC] 483

ARBITRATION

Arbitrator

Removal – Whether arbitrators ought to be removed on the basis of misconduct – Whether all relevant information before arbitrators – Whether quantum of award properly considered

Wong Chun Ho (t/a Hong Kong World Wide Enterprises Co v Owners of the 'Adri XV' (Indonesian Flag) [CA] 1

Stay of proceedings

Arbitration clause in contract for supply of computer goods – Contract

repudiated and repudiation accepted – Whether arbitration clause still operative – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) s 6

IBM World Trade Corp v Jean [CA] 63

BANKING AND FINANCE

Margin trading

Whether the plaintiff had agreed and was under a duty to sell the shares upon the fall in value of the shares – Whether the plaintiff had a duty to advise on dangers of margin trading – Whether security was broker's only remedy – Action for debt

Sadick v Song Wai Ling [HC] 305

Stockbroker

Loan advanced for purchasing shares on margin basis – Whether stock broker an unlicensed moneylender and loan unlawful – Money Lenders Ordinance (Cap 163) s 6

Sadick v Song Wai Ling [HC] 305

Money lending – Money advanced by stockbrokers by way of loan to purchase shares – Whether unlicensed money lenders – Money Lenders Ordinance (Cap 163) s 6

First Asian Security Co v Ng Michael [HC] 368

BETTING, GAMBLING AND LOTTERIES

Gaming licence

Refusal – Whether proper exercise of discretion – Whether Commissioner bound to give reasons for refusal of licence – Gambling Ordinance (Cap 148) ss 2, 6, 13

Chan Yat Sun & Ors v Attorney General [HC] 278

BILLS OF EXCHANGE AND OTHER NEGOTIABLE INSTRUMENTS

Dishonoured cheques

Whether cheque delivered conditionally – Cheques handed over as escrow – Incomplete bills of exchange – Whether an undated cheque is invalid – Bills of Exchange Ordinance (Cap 19) s 21

Ken Kee Securities Co v Wong Ying Cheong (No 1) [HC] 55

BRIBERY, CORRUPTION AND ORGANISED CRIME

Bribery

Charge based on admission contained in agreed statement of facts relating to another charge – Whether record admissible – Prevention of Bribery Ordinance (Cap 201) s 9(2)(a)

Attorney General v Yip Wing Sun & Anor [CA] 425

BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION

Assessment of damages

Building contract – Whether loss of rental income could be recovered –
Failure to plead loss and damages with sufficient particularity
Hocomban Enterprises Ltd v Standfast International
Insurance Co Ltd [HC] 373

Interlocutory injunction

Failure to complete on time – Whether prima facie evidence of breach of
contract relevant in interlocutory application – Whether refusal would aid a
continuing breach of contract – Balance of convenience
Faber Union (Hong Kong) Ltd v Alabama Building
Construction Ltd [HC] 113

Negligence

Architect – Drainage system failed – Whether failure of system evidence of
architect's negligence – Damages for cost of installing second system – Damages
for mental distress – Family home
Hardwick & Ors v Spence Robinson (a firm) [HC] 241

CARRIERS

Claim under bill of lading

Limitation of action – Limitation period extended by consent – Whether
doctrine of promissory estoppel applied – Whether the cause of action discharged
– Bills of Lading Rules art III R 6(3)
Malteser Hilfsdienst Hospital An Hai v Shun Cheong Steam
Navigation Co Ltd [HC] 40

CITIZENSHIP

Declaration of nationality

Whether court had jurisdiction to make declaration of nationality – Whether
petitioner had initiated serious research or enquiry to support his story – Matrimonial
Causes Ordinance (Cap 179) s 49(4) – British Nationality Act 1948 s 23 – Rules
of the Supreme Court O 15 r 16
Re Chau Ping San [HC] 87

CIVIL PROCEDURE

Action on breach of contract

Employment contract – Subsequent action based on same contract – Whether
res judicata
Shaw Brothers Ltd v Wang Yu [CA] 125

Addition of defendants

Directors of company which had prima facie committed a dishonest act –

Whether directors shielded by corporate personality
Duty Free Shoppers Ltd v Hong Kong Tax Free Co Ltd [HC] 203

Appointment of Official Receiver

Administration of deceased' estate – Action for personal injury against estate – No proceedings in existence – Appropriate procedure – Probate and Administration Ordinance (Cap 10) s 36 – Rules of the Supreme Court O 15 r 15
Re Yam Wong Tak, dec'd [HC] 355

Costs

Defendants not parties to foreign judgment subsequently registered in Hong Kong – Whether still liable for costs of registration – Whether strangers to substantive action
Lee Ing Chee v Choo Kim San & Ors [HC] 511

Declaratory order

Declaration of nationality – Whether court had jurisdiction to make declaration of nationality – Whether specific statutory authority required for the court to make declaration of nationality – Matrimonial Causes Ordinance (Cap 179) s 49(4) – Rules of the Supreme Court O 15 r 16
Re Chau Ping San [HC] 87

Defence

Striking out – Defence full of negatives pregnant – More appropriate to ask for particulars – Leave to amend more appropriate
Luen Cheong & Co & Anor v Mak Yeuk Chi & Ors [HC] 263

Estoppel

Per rem judicatum – Action dismissed for want of prosecution – Whether a foundation for res judicata – Whether distinction between dismissal before and after setting down for hearing – Whether distinction between cause of action estoppel and issue estoppel
Au Yeung Siu Tung & Ors v Tung Shing Ho (a firm) [CA] 144

Res judicata – Defamation – Whether abuse of process – Whether issues or facts so clearly part of the subject-matter of the litigation and so clearly could have been raised in earlier proceedings
Khan v Morrin & Ors [HC] 223

Res judicata – Whether previous opportunity for decision – Contract – Validity of auction sale by bank of property mortgaged to it – Whether sales collusive – Matters which could and should have been litigated in prior proceedings – Whether abuse of process
Yat Tung Investment Co Ltd v Dao Heng Bank Ltd & Anor [PC] 194

Examination of witness abroad

Whether the applicant could show either witness could not come or he would not come for good reason – Whether it was in the interest of justice to have

witness examined abroad – Rules of the Supreme Court O 39 r 2
Hongkong & Shanghai Banking Corp v Fung Wing King
(executor of last will and testament of Tang Siu, dec'd) [HC] 164

Joinder

Motor accident – Whether insurers of defendant should be allowed to be joined as a defendant – Whether necessary party to action – Rules of the Supreme Court O 15 r 6(2)(b)
Cheung For Kuen v Tang Wai Kwong [HC] 485

Pleadings

Amendment – Withdrawal of admissions in pleadings pursuant to leave to amend by consent without limitation – Whether leave of court required to withdraw admissions in original defence and counterclaim – Whether introduction of new defence proper
Luen Cheong & Co & Anor v Mak Yeuk Chi & Ors [HC] 263

Claim for loss of profit not specifically pleaded – Whether court can consider claim – Principle of rule that loss of profit should be specifically pleaded – Whether other party taken by surprise
Holiday Products (HK) Ltd v Polyproducts Industrial Co
(a firm) [CA] 177

Interest – Failure to claim interest in pleadings – Time at which interest could otherwise be asked for – Requirement of finality in all proceedings – Judgment debt already paid – Prejudice to respondent – Supreme Court Ordinance (Cap 4) s 30A
Polyproducts Industrial Co v Holiday Products (HK) Ltd [HC] 342

Sale of land by order

Whether order for sale under O 31 could be made to enforce charging order on land – Order for sale could only be made where necessary for purposes of action Rules of the Supreme Court O 31 rr 1, 2, O 50
Ken Kee Securities Co v Wong Ying Cheong (No 2) [HC] 445

Stay of proceedings

Arbitration clause – Discretion of a judge – Under what circumstances Court of Appeal will interfere with exercise of discretion – Rules of the Supreme Court (Cap 4) O 73 r 7
IBM World Trade Corp v Jean [CA] 63

Striking out

Allegation of improper loans against company – Proper plaintiff in action for wrong to company – Exceptions to rule in *Foss v Harbottle* – Whether loan made ultra vires – Whether triable issue
So Kwan Nane & Ors v Kowloon Stock Exchange Ltd & Ors [HC] 315

Fatal accident action – Consent order entered into with damages to be assessed – Inordinate and inexcusable delay by plaintiff – Whether defendant

prejudiced by delay – Burden of proof on defendant – Striking out unlikely where liability admitted

Chan Ching Chong v Chan Kwan Lai & Anor [HC] 329

Summary judgment

Application to be made within a reasonable time – Whether delay justifiable – Plaintiff should not have consented to defendant filing late defence – Whether application to sign judgment after delivery of defence ought to be allowed – Whether defence bona fide

Ken Kee Securities Co v Wong Ying Cheong (No 1) [HC] 55

Statement of claim contained allegation of fraud – Whether court had jurisdiction to give summary judgment – Rules of the Supreme Court O 14 r 2

Kays Impex Corp (HK) Ltd v Arbuthnot Export Services Ltd [CA] 109

COMPANIES AND CORPORATIONS

Liquidation

Whether receivers' repayment of debt secured by debenture wrongful – Whether principal moneys payable 'exclusively out of the profits of the company' – Construction of debenture deed

Warble Enterprises Ltd v King & Anor [HC] 103

Rule in *Foss v Harbottle*

Proper plaintiff in action for wrong to company – Exceptions to rule in *Foss v Harbottle* – Whether loan made ultra vires – Whether triable issue

So Kwan Nane & Ors v Kowloon Stock Exchange Ltd & Ors [HC] 315

CONTRACT

Damages

Advertising expenses – Whether reasonably in the contemplation of parties

Holiday Products (HK) Ltd v Polyproducts Industrial Co

(a firm) [CA] 177

Misrepresentation

Lease of land – Whether the defendant misrepresented – Whether the plaintiff was induced by the representation – Calculation of damages – Whether damages in respect of the physical discomfort too remote – Misrepresentation Ordinance (Cap 284) s 3(1)

Pepsi-Cola International Ltd v Lee Charles [HC] 82

CRIMINAL LAW AND PROCEDURE

Alibi evidence

Trial should have been adjourned to allow defendant to produce alibi witness

R v Lai Fat [HC] 503

Appeal against magistrate's decision

Refusal to reverse guilty plea – Whether any procedure in Magistrates