

Advanced Textbooks in Economics

Editors C.J. BLISS and M.D. INTRILIGATOR

# Public Enterprise Economics

Dieter Bös

North-Holland

# PUBLIC ENTERPRISE ECONOMICS

## Theory and Application

---

DIETER BÖS

*Institut für Gesellschafts- und  
Wirtschaftswissenschaften  
der Universität Bonn*



1986

NORTH-HOLLAND  
AMSTERDAM · NEW YORK · OXFORD

© ELSEVIER SCIENCE PUBLISHERS B.V., 1986

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the copyright owner.

ISBN: 0 444 87899 8

*Publishers:*

ELSEVIER SCIENCE PUBLISHERS B.V.  
P.O. BOX 1991  
1000 BZ AMSTERDAM  
THE NETHERLANDS

*Sole distributors for the U.S.A. and Canada:*

ELSEVIER SCIENCE PUBLISHING COMPANY, INC.  
52 VANDERBILT AVENUE  
NEW YORK, N.Y. 10017  
U.S.A.

**Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**

Bös, Dieter.

Public enterprise economics.

(Advanced textbooks in economics ; v. 23)

Bibliography: p.

Includes index.

1. Government business enterprises. 2. Industry  
and state. 3. Price regulation. I. Title.  
II. Series.

HD3845.6.B67 1986

338.5'26

85-24602

ISBN 0-444-87899-8

PRINTED IN THE NETHERLANDS

## PREFACE

When I started to write this book, I thought it would be a comparatively easy task, given my previous work on public enterprise economics \*, coupled with the permission of both Springer and North-Holland to reproduce parts of my previous publications. Today, after finishing the last chapter, I know how wrong I was. Writing the chapters on nationalization and privatization, on piecemeal policy, and on optimal quality, turned out to be as difficult as compiling all the empirical material for the applied chapters, and computing normative and positive fares for the London bus and underground services. Moreover, not only did I revise all the chapters, I had published before, but rewrote parts of them completely.

I am indebted to many colleagues and students for comments on earlier drafts of this book. It is impossible to list here all those who have helped me. But I should like to thank particularly: Patricia Apps, Heinz-Jürgen Büchner, Wolfgang Peters, Ray Rees, Hans-Dieter Stolper, Georg Tillmann and Ruth Watzke for having read carefully and criticized incisively successive drafts of this book; Alexander Löser and Hans-Georg Zimmermann for doing all the computations of the empirical chapters and for commenting meticulously on earlier drafts of them; Kurt Klappholz for cross-examining me on the exact meaning of so many of my statements and for carefully correcting my English; Maurice Garner for improving my knowledge of nationalization and privatization; Malcolm Fairhurst, Stephen Glaister and Hugh Gravelle for many discussions of London (Regional) Transport; Mrs. Lydia Danner and Barbara Zimmermann for their faultless typing of the manuscript which had to be camera-ready.

---

\* Economic theory of public enterprise, Lecture notes in economics and mathematical systems, vol. 188, Springer, Berlin, Heidelberg, New York 1981; Public sector pricing, in: A. Auerbach and M. Feldstein, eds., Handbook of public economics, vol. I, North-Holland, Amsterdam, New York 1985, pp. 129 - 211.

I also must thank the London School of Economics for inviting me to lecture on public enterprise economics every year for over ten years, and the Special Research Units 21 and 303 at the University of Bonn for financial and moral support which they have given to this book.

Bonn, August 1985

Dieter Bös

## **TECHNICAL NOTE**

Formulas are indicated by a number which refers to the order in which they occur within one chapter. When reference is made, say to equation (25), it is always the equation of the same chapter. References to formulas of other chapters are made by using two numbers, the first referring to the chapter and the second to the order within the chapter. Thus, equation (8-2) is the second equation of chapter 8.

# CONTENTS

<b>Preface</b>	1
<b>Technical Note</b>	2
<b>Chapter 1 Introduction</b>	13
1.1 Normative and positive theory	13
1.2 The public enterprise	18
1.2.1 Range of activity	18
1.2.2 More precise definitions	20
1.2.3 Institutional diversity versus theoretical abstraction	23
1.3 Nationalization of enterprises	25
1.3.1 Ideology	25
1.3.2 Economic reasoning	27
1.3.3 Other reasons	30
1.4 Privatization: a swelling tide?	31
1.4.1 On the ideological, economic and financial background	31
1.4.2 Transition to public regulation?	34
1.5 Socialization of commodities	35
1.6 Optimal qualities	37
1.6.1 On the explicit introduction of quality indicators	37
1.6.2 Quality standardization for publicly supplied private goods	38
1.6.3 Ex ante and ex post quality	39
1.6.4 Quality indicators for "public good" properties	40
1.7 Optimal price schedules	40

<b>PART ONE</b>	<b>The basic model</b>	<b>43</b>
<b>Chapter 2</b>	<b>Essential parts of public sector pricing models</b>	<b>43</b>
2.1	Objectives I: normative theory	45
2.1.1	Commodity versus budget space	45
2.1.2	Allocation versus distribution	47
2.1.3	The case against consumer surplus	50
2.1.3.1	Defining consumer surplus	51
2.1.3.2	The case against Marshallian consumer surplus	53
2.1.3.3	The case against the Hicksian welfare measures	55
2.2	Objectives II: positive theory	61
2.3	Constraints I: markets	63
2.3.1	Equilibrium of supply and demand	64
2.3.2	Disequilibria of supply and demand	65
2.4	Constraints II: production	67
2.4.1	The production side of our model	67
2.4.2	X-inefficiency	69
2.4.3	Q-efficiency	75
2.4.4	A-efficiency	76
2.4.5	Efficiency and cost minimization	81
2.4.6	Long-run versus short-run investigations	84
2.5	Constraints III: finance	85
2.5.1	The general concept	85
2.5.2	An alternative concept	87
2.5.3	On the opportunity costs of financing deficits	89
<b>Chapter 3</b>	<b>Normative optimum theory</b>	<b>91</b>
3.1	The actors and their instruments	91
3.2	Solving the model	94
3.3	The conditions for optimal prices and quantities	96

3.3.1	Distributional objectives	98
3.3.2	Allocation in the public sector	100
3.3.3	The public enterprise and the private sector	101
3.4	Compensating for income effects	103
3.5	The conditions for optimal quality	105
3.5.1	On consumers' and producers' quality choice	105
3.5.2	Optimal qualities, prices and quantities	111
3.5.2.1	Social valuation of quality changes	112
3.5.2.2	Quality allocation in the public sector	113
3.5.2.3	The public enterprise and the private sector	114
3.5.3	Compensating for income effects	115
<b>Chapter 4</b>	<b>Positive optimum theory</b>	<b>117</b>
<b>Chapter 5</b>	<b>Normative piecemeal theory</b>	<b>125</b>
5.1	On the difference between optimum and piecemeal policies	125
5.2	Welfare improvements with non-tight constraints	127
5.3	Welfare improvements with tight technology constraint	135
5.4	On welfare-improving increases of public inefficiency	138
5.5	Piecemeal policy recommendations: general rules for some special cases	143
<b>Chapter 6</b>	<b>Positive piecemeal theory</b>	<b>148</b>
6.1	Improvements with tight and non-tight constraints	148
6.2	The trade-off between efficiency and market equilibrium	150
6.2.1	Trends towards production inefficiency with markets in equilibrium	150
6.2.2	Production efficiency with markets in disequilibrium	156



<b>PART TWO</b>	<b>Normative theory: public pricing policies for welfare maximization</b>	<b>161</b>
<b>A</b>	<b>Basic rules</b>	<b>161</b>
<b>Chapter 7</b>	<b>Marginal-cost pricing</b>	<b>161</b>
7.1	Optimum policy	161
7.1.1	The theoretical basis and practical examples	161
7.1.2	Deficits under marginal-cost pricing	163
7.1.3	Marginal-cost pricing and general equilibria	165
7.1.4	Long-run versus short-run marginal-cost pricing; joint inputs; social costs	167
7.1.5	The problem of cross-subsidization	168
7.2	Regulating marginal-cost prices	169
7.2.1	Competitive public enterprises	169
7.2.2	Regulating natural monopolies	171
7.3	Consequences for allocation, distribution, and stabilization	180
7.4	Piecemeal policy	183
<b>Chapter 8</b>	<b>Ramsey pricing</b>	<b>187</b>
8.1	Optimum Ramsey policy	187
8.1.1	Theoretical basis	187
8.1.2	Cross-subsidization	192
8.2	Regulating Ramsey prices	194
8.2.1	Regulation by changing the environment	195
8.2.2	Regulation in a given environment	196
8.3	Influence of Ramsey prices on allocation, distribution, and stabilization	200
8.4	A piecemeal policy interpretation of the Ramsey optimum	201

<b>Chapter 9</b>	<b>Rate of return regulation</b>	<b>204</b>
9.1	An intuitive introduction	204
9.2	A more rigorous treatment	206
9.3	Welfare versus profit maximization: the Averch- Johnson effect	208
<b>Chapter 10</b>	<b>Pricing with distributional aims</b>	<b>212</b>
10.1	Prices versus taxes	212
10.2	Feldstein pricing	214
10.3	Comparing distributional and allocative pricing	218
<b>B</b>	<b>Interdependencies with the private economy</b>	<b>225</b>
<b>Chapter 11</b>	<b>Adjustment to monopolistic pricing in the private sector</b>	<b>225</b>
11.1	The second-best issue: adjustment to, versus interference in, the private economy	225
11.2	A model for public prices in an imperfect market economy	227
11.3	A duopoly model for public prices	231
<b>Chapter 12</b>	<b>Adjustment to rationed markets</b>	<b>241</b>
12.1	Rationed labor market	241
12.1.1	Individual employment constraints	241
12.1.2	An overall employment constraint	248
12.2	Capacity limits of public transportation	250

<b>C</b>	<b>Time-dependent pricing</b>	<b>258</b>
<b>Chapter 13</b>	<b>Pricing through time and adjustment clauses</b>	<b>258</b>
<b>Chapter 14</b>	<b>Peak-load pricing</b>	<b>261</b>
14.1	Setting the problem	261
14.2	A model with excess demand and rationing	264
<b>D</b>	<b>Public pricing when quality matters</b>	<b>275</b>
<b>Chapter 15</b>	<b>Different approaches towards optimal quality</b>	<b>275</b>
15.1	Quality I: distinguishing different goods	275
15.2	Quality II: using continuous quality indicators	277
15.2.1	On the significance of such an analysis	277
15.2.2	The case that corresponds to marginal-cost pricing	279
15.2.3	The case that corresponds to Ramsey prices	280
15.2.4	Pricing with distributional aims	282
15.2.5	Adjustment to monopolistic structures in the private economy	283
<b>PART THREE</b>	<b>Positive theory: public pricing policies to achieve politicians' and managers' aims</b>	<b>284</b>
<b>A</b>	<b>Politicians and bureaucrats</b>	<b>284</b>
<b>Chapter 16</b>	<b>Winning votes</b>	<b>284</b>
<b>Chapter 17</b>	<b>Maximizing budgets</b>	<b>293</b>

<b>B</b>	<b>Managers of public enterprises and unions</b>	<b>297</b>
<b>Chapter 18</b>	<b>Maximizing output or revenue, minimizing energy inputs</b>	<b>297</b>
<b>Chapter 19</b>	<b>Minimizing price indices</b>	<b>301</b>
<b>Chapter 20</b>	<b>The influence of unions</b>	<b>304</b>
<b>Chapter 21</b>	<b>Quality in positive theory models</b>	<b>308</b>
<b>Chapter 22</b>	<b>A set of axioms for prices to achieve a fair allocation of costs</b>	<b>311</b>
<b>PART FOUR</b>	<b>Application of the theoretical results: the example of London Transport</b>	<b>317</b>
<b>Chapter 23</b>	<b>Economic theory and empirical analysis (I): specifying demand</b>	<b>317</b>
<b>23.1</b>	<b>Microeconomics of the representative consumer</b>	<b>317</b>
<b>23.2</b>	<b>Some basic principles for estimating systems of demand functions</b>	<b>321</b>
<b>23.3</b>	<b>Desirable properties of a demand system</b>	<b>324</b>
	<b>23.3.1 Compatibility of theory and empirical tests</b>	<b>325</b>
	<b>23.3.2 Empirical implementation</b>	<b>327</b>
<b>23.4</b>	<b>The almost ideal demand system</b>	<b>328</b>

<b>Chapter 24</b>	<b>Economic theory and empirical analysis (II) : specifying technology</b>	<b>335</b>
24.1	Duality	335
24.2	Some basic principles of estimating technology	337
24.3	Desirable properties of the firm's technology representation	338
24.3.1	Compatibility of theory and empirical tests	339
24.3.2	Empirical implementation	340
24.4	Long-run versus short-run marginal costs	340
<b>Chapter 25</b>	<b>Bus and underground services in London</b>	<b>345</b>
25.1	Recent organizational and political history	345
25.2	Recent economic history	349
25.2.1	Demand	349
25.2.2	Costs	356
25.3	Empirical studies on bus and underground demand	365
25.3.1	London Transport's economic research reports	365
25.3.2	Further empirical evidence	369
25.4	Empirical studies on bus and underground costs	374
<b>Chapter 26</b>	<b>Estimating normative and positive prices for bus and underground in London</b>	<b>378</b>
26.1	The AIDS specification of demand	378
26.1.1	Analytical outline of the specification	378
26.1.2	The empirical implementation	382
26.1.3	Data	385
26.1.4	The resulting elasticities of demand	385
26.2	The translog specification of factor demand functions	394
26.2.1	Analytical outline of the specification	394
26.2.2	On computing marginal costs	396

<i>Contents</i>	11
26.2.3 The empirical implementation	398
26.2.4 Data	400
26.2.5 The resulting marginal costs	401
26.3 Optimal prices for London bus and underground services	406
26.3.1 Introduction	406
26.3.2 Marginal cost prices	410
26.3.3 Ramsey prices	411
26.3.4 Pricing with distributional objectives	412
26.3.5 Adjustment to monopolistic pricing	415
26.3.6 Revenue maximization	421
26.3.7 Price index minimization	422
<b>Appendices</b>	424
<b>Appendix 1 The size of the public enterprise sector in Europe</b>	424
<b>Appendix 2 The size of the government and regulated enterprise sector in the United States</b>	431
<b>List of symbols</b>	435
<b>References</b>	441
<b>Index</b>	464



## CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION

### 1.1 NORMATIVE AND POSITIVE THEORY

This is a book about prices. The reader may be astonished that pricing can be seen as the central problem of public enterprises. But why should prices of railways, of postal services, of local public utilities, or of nationalized enterprises be of less importance than prices of private enterprises? Pricing of publicly supplied goods is the primary vehicle for embedding public enterprises adequately into a market economy.

We concentrate on publicly supplied private goods, i.e. goods which individuals consume in different quantities and where people who do not pay are excluded from consumption. The reader may be aware that most public enterprises, in fact, supply such private goods. Rail, mail, communal electricity or gas supply, nationalized steel or car producers provide good examples. Therefore, in our context, free riding causes no greater problems than in the case of private enterprises.

If there is such a far-reaching similarity between public and private enterprises, why is a separate theory of public enterprises necessary? The simple fact that the owner of an enterprise is either a public authority or a private authority does not justify the development of such a special theory from the point of view of ordinary microeconomic theory. Theorists who adhere to the "property rights"-school will, of course, dissent.

Thus, from our point of view, the main difference is not ownership. The main difference is the multitude of political and economic determinants of public enterprises' activities as compared to the mainly commercial determinants of the activities of private enterprises. The consequences, and not



the genesis, of government objectives and constraints for an enterprise that tries to "make the best of it" are the center of an economic theory of public enterprises. Prices are the best indicator of the consequences of combining such political and economic determinants of public enterprises.

We do not deny that some public enterprises are allowed to behave in much the same way as private enterprises do <sup>1)</sup>. However, a theory of public enterprises must not concentrate primarily on those few enterprises which behave like private ones, but on the many which behave differently. The major aspects of such a theory of public enterprises in Western-type economies are as follows:

*First, public enterprises usually do not aim to maximize profits.* This negative proposition allows for different positive statements regarding public enterprises' objectives:

- a) Public enterprises ought to maximize welfare. This statement is the basis of a *normative economic theory of public enterprises*. "Normative" means that the application of the respective pricing rules can be justified by some higher-order value judgements as formally expressed by social welfare functions. As "ought" implies "can", normative pricing rules are empirically applicable. There are many examples where marginal-cost pricing or Ramsey pricing have actually been applied. (See, for example, Quoilin (1976) on *Electricité de France*.) On the other hand, it must be admitted that there are many examples where prescriptions of the welfare kind failed in practice. (See, for instance, the NEDO-report (1976) on British nationalized enterprises.) After presenting the basic features of a fairly general model of an economy with public enterprises in part I of the book, we will turn to a detailed treatment of pricing policies for welfare maximization, deriving the most important normative pricing rules in part II. The empirical applicability of normative theory will be illustrated in part IV using London Transport data as an example.

---

<sup>1)</sup> Volkswagen in Germany, or Elf Aquitaine in France provide good examples.