

英文版

林恩·夏普·佩因



领导、伦理与组织信誉案例

正版

哈佛商学院案例教程

Cases in Leadership, Ethics,
and Organizational Integrity

Lynn Sharp Paine



东北财经大学出版社



McGraw-Hill 出版公司

正版哈佛商学院案例教程·英文版

领导、伦理与组织信誉案例

Cases in Leadership, Ethics, and Organizational Integrity

林恩·夏普·佩因

Lynn Sharp Paine

东北财经大学出版社
McGraw-Hill 出版公司

图书在版编目 (CIP) 数据

领导、伦理与组织信誉案例: 英文 / (美) 佩因 (Paine, L. S.) 著. —大连: 东北财经大学出版社, 1998.8

(正版哈佛商学院案例教程)

ISBN 7 - 81044 - 457 - 3

I. 领… II. 佩… III. 企业管理 - 案例 - 英文 IV. F270

中国版本图书馆 CIP 数据核字 (98) 第 19551 号

辽宁省版权局著作权合同登记号: 图字 06 - 1998 - 126 号

Lynn Sharp Paine: Cases in Leadership, Ethics, and Organizational Integrity: A strategic Perspective

Copyright © 1997 by Lynn Sharp Paine

This edition is published jointly by McGraw-Hill Book Co. and Dongbei University of Finance & Economics Press, for sale in P. R. China only.

All Rights Reserved.

本书英文影印版由 McGraw-Hill 出版公司和东北财经大学出版社合作出版, 仅限中国境内销售, 未经出版者书面许可, 不得以任何方式抄袭、复制或节录本书的任何部分。

版权所有, 侵权必究。

东北财经大学出版社
McGraw-Hill 出版公司 合作出版

东北财经大学出版社发行

(大连市黑石礁尖山街 217 号 邮政编码 116025)

北京万国电脑图文有限公司制版 朝阳新华印刷厂印刷

开本: 787×1092 毫米 1/16 字数: 610 千字 印张: 25.75 插页: 2

1998 年 8 月第 1 版

1998 年 8 月第 1 次印刷

策划编辑: 方红星

封面设计: 曲 子

定价: 40.00 元

ISBN 7 - 81044 - 457 - 3/F·1140

出版者的话

当今的世界是一个变革的世界，政治体制在变革，经济结构在变革，管理方式在变革，思想观念在变革……从东方到西方，从中国到世界，一切无不处在变革之中。毫不例外，管理教育也正面临着一场深刻的变革。在以 MBA (Master of Business Administration, 通常译为“工商管理硕士”) 教育为主干的应用型管理教育大行其道的同时，一种以经典案例为主要素材、强调培养实务操作能力、反对一味灌输抽象理论的所谓“案例教学法”(Cases Methods) 逐渐取代了传统的管理教学模式，并以惊人的速度风靡全球。

作为世界 MBA 教育发祥地的美国哈佛大学工商管理研究生院 (Graduate School of Business Administration, Harvard University, 通常简称 Harvard Business School, 即“哈佛商学院”), 同时也是管理专业案例教学的首创者和积极倡导者。哈佛商学院经过近一个世纪的发展, 已经无可争辩地登上了全世界 MBA 教育的制高点, 哈佛商学院 MBA 已经成为全球企业管理界一块光芒四射的“金字招牌”。个中原因除了素来坚持严格的学员遴选制度之外, 主要应归功于独具一格的案例教学方法。

毋庸讳言, 我国的管理教育尚处于“初级阶段”, 亟待借鉴发达国家的成功经验, 包括先进的教学方法、权威的教学素材和科学的教学体系。为此, 我们通过多方努力, 终于开通了一条通过合法途径引进哈佛商学院案例教程的渠道, 并及时推出了首批十余种图书。按照预定计划, 我们将在今后两到三年内, 陆续推出哈佛商学院 MBA 其他主干课程案例教程的英文 (影印) 版和相应的中译版, 以满足国内管理教育尤其是 MBA、经理培训项目 (ETP) 师生和其他有关人士的迫切需要, 为推动我国管理教育改革和向国际接轨的步伐贡献一份绵薄之力。

对于本套系列教材在选题策划、翻译、编辑、出版以及发行工作中存在的缺点和不足, 恳请广大读者不吝指正, 我们在此先致谢忱!

东北财经大学出版社

1998 年 8 月

This book is intended for those who lead or aspire to lead business organizations. It is about the challenges of building and maintaining organizational integrity in the business environment of the 1990s—an environment that is dynamic, competitive, culturally diverse, and information-intensive.

I hope that anyone who studies the materials in this book will be rewarded with a rich understanding of organizational integrity in both concept and practice. But it is important to note at the beginning that the term *integrity* is not being used in its narrow sense as a synonym for honesty, but in its broad sense to refer to the qualities of self-governance, responsibility, moral soundness, adherence to principle, and constancy of purpose. The general concern of the book is how leaders build and maintain organizations with such qualities—in short, how they build self-governing organizations guided by a sense of purpose, responsibility, and ideals.

More specifically, the cases, introductory essays, and readings in the book aim to shed light on three main topics:

- Why organizational integrity is important.
- What strategies managers can use to build organizational integrity.
- What knowledge, skills, and concepts managers need to lead high-integrity companies.

Two facets of the leader's role are emphasized: the leader as decision maker and the leader as organization builder.

Although integrity is typically regarded as an attribute of individuals, the materials in the book show why it is important to think about integrity in organizational as well as personal terms. As the cases illustrate,

there are essential links between organizational integrity and the personal integrity of an organization's members. High-integrity organizations cannot exist without high-integrity individuals, but at the same time individual integrity is rarely self-sustaining. Without organizational support systems and ethical boundaries, good people can lose their bearings when faced with pressures, temptations, and heightened performance expectations. Organizational integrity, moreover, goes beyond personal integrity. It rests on a concept of purpose, responsibility, and ideals for an organization as a whole. Part of the leader's role in building organizational integrity is to develop this ethical framework and the organizational capabilities needed to make it operational.

In an important sense, this is a book about ethics. But in another sense, the ethics label is misleading. The book, more fundamentally, is about management and organizational leadership. The basic thesis of these materials is that ethical thinking is an important leadership skill and a source of organizational strength. It is a building block for organizational integrity, which is a valuable corporate asset. But building and maintaining organizational integrity require more than ethical thinking alone. As the cases show, technical competence, appropriate organizational structures, and excellent communications skills are among the other capabilities required.

This strategic perspective on ethics sets this book apart from many texts on business ethics. Indeed, some may reject the approach taken here on the grounds that it is dangerous or inappropriate to think strategically about ethics. Ethics, we are told, must be valued for its own sake. While there is an important kernel of truth behind this warning, it is equally important for organizational leaders to understand that ethics is intensely practical. Ethical norms and ideals serve an important purpose in facilitating cooperation, providing direction, and setting limits—all of which can enhance organizational effectiveness. In my view, the real danger lies in losing sight of this purpose and relegating ethics to the domain of superstition or irrationality.

Of course, every organizational leader must consider what ethical norms and ideals should be embraced. What framework of responsibilities should be adopted? The cases and readings collected here allow students to consider these issues in concrete circumstances where the stakes are substantial. Although the text includes conceptual and background essays, as well as excerpted readings, central emphasis is placed on the cases to bring this material alive.

One of the primary benefits of learning through cases is the opportunity to explore ideas in action. Readers unfamiliar with the case method will want to make a special effort to put themselves in the shoes of the case protagonists. They should try to approach the issues as decision makers and actors rather than passive observers. Although much can be learned from simply reading the cases, even more value can be derived

from imaginative participation in the situations presented. The cases, moreover, provide a laboratory for examining the concepts and frameworks outlined in the text, while giving readers the chance to hone their analytical and decision making skills.

The cases in the book have been selected to allow discussion of a wide range of ethical issues. Among these are the perennials of honesty, fair-dealing, product safety, and adherence to law, as well as newer and emerging issues such as information privacy, human rights, environmental protection, and conflicting standards of responsible behavior around the world. These issues are explored through situations set in a variety of industries and companies, large and small. Financial services, health care, global retailing, aerospace, hospitality, and electrical power production are among the industries covered. Several cases are set in an international context, allowing readers to compare and contrast differing national environments for corporate ethics.

While offering important opportunities to learn about topical issues of ethics, the cases have also been selected to promote learning at a deeper level. The most fundamental learning concerns the processes and criteria managers use to make decisions and lead their organizations. In-depth study of the Lotus MarketPlace:Households case, for example, should give readers not only a better understanding of data privacy issues but also a better understanding of sound approaches to making business decisions. By comparing the E. F. Hutton case with the Salomon Brothers series, readers will see dramatically different approaches to leading an organization through a crisis triggered by misconduct. One approach led to the demise of a once-successful corporation, while the other led to an organizational rejuvenation. The cases offer many opportunities for such comparisons.

This collection of materials throws a spotlight on ethics, but it makes no attempt to separate questions of ethics and corporate responsibility from the other issues organizational leaders must deal with. In fact, the opposite is true. In each case, the ethical issues are closely intertwined with strategic, organizational, financial, and legal issues.

Readers accustomed to a neat separation between ethical issues and management issues may be puzzled by the wide-angle approach reflected in this book. They may question whether some of the cases are *really* about ethics at all. However, the cases have been selected to reveal the ethical underpinnings of what might otherwise be seen as straightforward management issues having nothing to do with ethics. As managers grapple with choices about organizational structure, compensation practices, new product development, or worldwide sourcing, they are also dealing with issues of organizational values and responsibilities. Both ethical and economic understanding must be brought to bear on these choices. Moreover, as the

introductory case suggests, getting the management enterprise off the ground at all can be a formidable challenge in the absence of a basic ethical framework to guide the organization's development.

The cases reflect the inconvenient reality that ethical issues typically arise in situations that are complex and highly charged. The true ethical challenge is to chart a responsible course of action in the face of multiple, and often competing, considerations. Framing the issue and identifying the relevant considerations are often the most important steps in working toward a responsible solution. For this reason, the cases are rich with information. Although ethics, like many subjects, may and indeed should be studied as a discrete field of inquiry, this book assumes that in the final analysis, ethics cannot be treated as something separate from management decision making and organizational leadership. Business leaders must be sensitive to ethics and skilled in ethical thinking, but they must also have a practical approach to integrating ethics into their decision processes and into the fabric of their organizations.

The structure of the book is straightforward. It has three main parts, each consisting of an introduction followed by a series of cases, and a brief concluding section. The introductory segment of each main part provides the conceptual background needed to understand the cases and a framework for analyzing them. The concluding section includes explanatory background and a series of readings on corporate purpose and responsibility.

Part I introduces the concept of organizational integrity and explores the reasons executives have turned their attention to ethics in recent years. Four problem-centered cases give students an opportunity to examine the different ways sound ethics contributes to organizational effectiveness. In each case, senior managers must diagnose the problem presented and decide on a plan of action for going forward.

Part II concerns strategies for building organizational integrity. Two of the four cases illustrate strategies focused on preventing misconduct. The other two present strategies based on positive concepts of ethical excellence. Through this series of cases students examine the leader's role in building integrity, consider the various levers executives can use in this endeavor, and assess the merits of alternative approaches.

Part III focuses on responsible decision making, the ultimate expression of organizational integrity. The module presents several high-stakes decisions involving difficult ethical issues for senior management. Each involves at least one of the classic challenges of responsible decision making: (1) interpreting ethical principles in light of social and technological change; (2) applying ethical principles in the face of factual uncertainty; (3) making trade-offs when stakeholder interests compete; and (4) dealing with conflicts among ethical standards in different regions of the world.

The cases give students an opportunity to apply the decision framework outlined in the introduction to Part III and to explore the corporation's responsibilities to its different stakeholders. The emphasis is not on right versus wrong, but on developing a decision process that will help managers make responsible, ethically informed choices.

The conclusion focuses on corporate purpose and responsibility, the central element of a company's ethical framework. This section contains a series of short readings illustrating different conceptions of corporate purpose and responsibility. Readers are encouraged to examine these conceptions critically and to reflect on their own views as they prepare to build, lead, or maintain high-integrity organizations.

My hope is that readers find this book compelling as an argument and useful as a guide. The materials presented here underscore the central importance of ethics and organizational integrity in today's dynamic marketplace. Perhaps more important, the materials provide concepts and frameworks that can be put to practical use. I hope these ideas will prove valuable to executives and managers who every day strive to make sound decisions and build more effective organizations.

Lynn Sharp Paine
Boston, Massachusetts

This book is based on a five-year research and course development project sponsored by the Harvard Business School's Division of Research. This project, which resulted in a second-year MBA elective course called "Managing for Organizational Integrity," involved extensive field work and the development of 30 new cases set in 20 corporations. The materials included in this collection reflect the central concepts and cases taught in the course and in an elective seminar offered in the school's Advanced Management Program: International Senior Managers Program since 1993.

This project involved contributions and support from many individuals and institutions in the business and academic communities. I am deeply grateful to the Harvard Business School's Division of Research and in particular to Dean John H. McArthur and senior associate deans Thomas R. Piper and F. Warren McFarlan, without whose generous support the project would not have been possible. Besides providing the essential resources and time needed for the project, they also extended their personal support for the intellectual themes I was exploring. I am particularly indebted to Tom Piper, who proved an indefatigable sounding board and critical reader of cases, articles, and teaching materials. I have benefited enormously from his perspectives as a teacher and management educator, as a professor of finance, and as a concerned citizen.

A special debt of thanks is due to my colleagues Joseph L. Badaracco and J. Gregory Dees, co-venturers in developing courses on management ethics, with whom I talked almost daily about some aspect of the project. I want to thank them and the many other colleagues who read and commented on materials produced at various stages of the project: Kenneth R. Andrews, James E. Austin, Raymond E. Corey, Dwight B. Crane, William E. Fruhan, Mary C. Gentile, Joseph Hinsey, George C. Lodge,

Scotty McLennan, Sharon Daloz Parks, Henry B. Reiling, Richard S. Tedlow, and Richard E. Walton. In addition, Richard Tedlow provided valuable support throughout the project in his capacity as my research director. I am doubly grateful to Joe Badaracco and Dwight Crane for, in addition, allowing me to include their cases in this collection: to Joe for "AT&T Consumer Products," and to Dwight for "Salomon and the Treasury Securities Auction." A special thanks is due also to N. Craig Smith, professor at Georgetown University Business School, for giving me permission to include his case "Dow Corning: Product Stewardship."

My understanding of the issues covered in this book has been immeasurably enhanced by what I have learned from my colleagues in teaching. I am particularly indebted to those with whom I have taught the first-year MBA module "Decision Making and Ethical Values." In addition to those mentioned earlier, I also want to acknowledge other members of this group who contributed, often unknowingly, to my project: Michael Beer, Robert H. Hayes, Cynthia A. Montgomery, Walter J. Salmon, Malcolm S. Salter, W. Earl Sasser, Debora Spar, Howard H. Stevenson, and Shoshana Zuboff. Among other Harvard Business School faculty who offered challenges, insights, and advice, I also want to thank Lynda M. Applegate, Samuel L. Hayes, and John A. Quelch. Among those with whom I formerly taught at Georgetown University Business School, I am especially indebted to Norman E. Bowie (now at the University of Minnesota), Mary J. Culnan, Thomas Donaldson, Karen L. Newman, Dennis P. Quinn, and Pietra Rivoli.

I must also express my gratitude to members of the business community, especially to the executives and managers who cooperated in the development of case studies for the project. Without exception, these individuals gave generously of their time and shared valuable insights. At talks, seminars, and workshops related to the project, countless executives and managers raised questions and offered perspectives that helped shape my thinking. Thanks are also due the alumni and other contributors whose donations help fund the Harvard Business School's Division of Research.

In developing the ideas reflected in this book, I have benefited from the work of many business ethicists and philosophers in the fields of professional and practical ethics. Many of their names can be found in the footnotes to the text, but I would like to acknowledge a special debt to two individuals. The first is philosopher Richard M. Hare, under whose supervision I wrote my doctoral thesis on utilitarian ethics at Oxford. Dick's vision of a rigorous but practical moral philosophy has served as a continuing source of inspiration for much of my work. The second is Dennis Thompson, director of Harvard University's Program in Ethics and the Professions. To Dennis, I owe thanks for his superb leadership of this program which has stimulated work on professional ethics across the

university. My involvement in the Program—as a Fellow in 1990–1992 and as a Faculty Associate since that time—has been an important stimulus for my thinking about ethics in business.

The final manuscript was much improved as a result of suggestions offered by reviewers selected by Irwin. I deeply appreciate the time and attention devoted by reviewers Larry Alan Bear, New York University's Stern School; Norman E. Bowie, University of Minnesota's Carlson School; Prompilai Khunaphante, Chulalongkorn University; Patrick E. Murphy, University of Notre Dame; and Patricia H. Werhane, University of Virginia's Darden School.

In working on this project, I was assisted by a number of outstanding research associates and doctoral candidates. Charles A. Nichols, III, has been an invaluable associate, contributing to all phases of the project. Jane Palley Katz and Michael A. Santoro also deserve special mention for the scope and duration of their involvement. Others who made valuable contributions to particular cases or aspects of the project include Lexanne J. Abbott, Marc W. Boatwright, Sarah B. Gant, Bronwyn Halliday, Joshua Margolis, Sarah C. Mavrinac, and Andrea L. Strimling.

Superb administrative support was provided by Eugenie T. Moriconi, my assistant for nearly five years, and by Yvonne A. Green, who joined me in the concluding phases of the project. Both managed the seemingly endless drafts and redrafts of materials conscientiously and cheerfully. Credit also goes to the staff of the Harvard Business School Word Processing Center for turning the drafts around under tight deadlines without sacrificing attention to quality and detail.

Finally, I am indebted to my husband, Tom Paine, and to members of my family for the many ways in which they have supported and contributed to my work.

L.S.P.

Preface vii
Acknowledgments xiii

PART I

UNDERSTANDING ORGANIZATIONAL INTEGRITY: *THE ROLE OF ETHICS*

1. Problems at InSpeech 21
2. Sears Auto Centers (A) 39
3. Hutton Branch Manager (A) 58
4. Salomon and the Treasury Securities Auction 73

PART II

BUILDING ORGANIZATIONAL INTEGRITY: *CREATING CONTEXT*

1. Forging the New Salomon 110
2. Martin Marietta: Managing Corporate Ethics (A) 146
3. Wetherill Associates, Inc. 171
4. AES Honeycomb (A) 194

PART III

MAINTAINING ORGANIZATIONAL INTEGRITY: *CRITICAL DECISIONS*

1. Lotus MarketPlace:Households 240
2. Marriott Corporation (A) 260
3. Manville Corporation Fiber Glass Group (A) 280

4. Dow Corning Corporation: Product Stewardship 298
5. AT&T Consumer Products 320
6. Levi Strauss & Co.: Global Sourcing (A) 346

CONCLUSION

LEADING FOR INTEGRITY: *CORPORATE PURPOSE AND RESPONSIBILITY*

I UNDERSTANDING ORGANIZATIONAL INTEGRITY

The Role of Ethics

Once considered a frill or even a costly diversion, attention to ethics is increasingly seen as a fundamental aspect of organizational leadership. In recent years, many executives have launched corporate ethics or values initiatives. Some have created corporate ethics offices, board-level ethics and corporate responsibility committees, or task forces to deal with difficult ethical issues. Others have introduced training programs to heighten awareness of ethical issues or to help managers integrate ethical considerations into their decision processes.¹

An observer of these developments might well ask, "Why all the attention to ethics?" The cases in Part I of this book suggest a range of answers to this question. As the cases illustrate, there are several quite distinctive reasons that business leaders have added ethics to their agendas. However, the simple overarching explanation is that many have come to regard a value system based on sound ethical principles as a foundation of organizational excellence. They seek to develop their company's capacity for ethical self-governance because they see organizational integrity as a corporate asset. Although organizational integrity depends on far more than ethics alone, it starts with an ethical framework grounded in a company's purpose and responsibilities.

According to the *Economist*, these executives are on the right track. A 1995 editorial declared, "[T]omorrow's successful company can no longer afford to be a faceless institution that does nothing more than sell the right product at the right price. It will have to present itself more as if

¹ For information on the numbers of companies undertaking such initiatives, see Ronald E. Berenbeim, *Corporate Ethics Practices* (New York: The Conference Board, Report No. 986, 1992); Ethics Resource Center, Inc., *Ethics Policies and Programs in American Business* (Washington, D.C., 1990); Ethics Resource Center, Inc., *Ethics in American Business: Policies, Programs and Perceptions* (Washington D.C., 1994).

it were . . . an intelligent actor, of upright character, that brings explicit moral judgments to bear on its dealings with its own employees and with the wider world."²

Before turning to the cases in Part I, it is worth reviewing the reasons behind today's increased attention to ethics as well as some common arguments for skepticism.

Ethics and Organizational Effectiveness

Although many executives regard sound ethics as a cornerstone of organizational effectiveness, some people find this idea counterintuitive. Caught in a belief system that equates ethics with self-sacrifice, they cannot reconcile attention to ethics with organizational strength. But if we understand what ethics is all about, the linkage between ethics and organizational effectiveness will hardly seem surprising.

Although ethics has historically been defined in many different ways, a central focus of ethical thought has been the principles and standards that should govern human interaction. Ethical ideals such as honesty, trustworthiness, or fairness are not just personal ideals. They are standards for how people should behave toward one another. Ethical concepts such as rights, duties, and responsibilities map the infrastructure of social relationships. They define the scope of individual authority and specify what individuals, whether persons or organizations, owe to one another and to their communities. While ethics is also concerned with the nature and sources of value in life—often referred to as “the good”—issues of right and responsibility are at the center of what most people today think of as ethics.

Broadly speaking, the aim of ethics is to enhance human development.³ A framework of rights, responsibilities, and ideals helps people achieve their fullest potential as human beings—both individually and collectively. For individuals, such a framework serves the vital purposes of guiding action and establishing expectations. For groups and communities, it facilitates cooperation and mutual trust. In general, life tends to go better when people can count on one another at least for justice and mutual respect, if not for mutual assistance. Although ethics does not require self-sacrifice, it does require an ability to understand the needs and interests of others and to conduct oneself in a manner that, at a minimum, acknowledges their legitimate claims. Ethics may be thought of as an invisible infrastructure of norms and precepts that ideally supports positive human interaction.

² “Saints and Sinners,” *The Economist*, June 24, 1995, p. 16.

³ An excellent discussion of the purpose of morality is found in G. J. Warnock, *The Object of Morality* (London: Methuen & Co. Ltd., 1971).

Given the functions of the executive, the path to ethics is straightforward. An ethical outlook is essential to engaging the support and positive involvement of all the constituencies essential to a company's success: its employees, customers, shareholders, creditors, and suppliers, as well as the public by whose license it operates. Unless these constituencies enjoy a high level of confidence in the company, feel they are treated fairly by it, and benefit by their involvement, they are unlikely to contribute with any great enthusiasm. They may withdraw their support altogether, especially if more attractive options are available.

Effective managers realize that outstanding organizational performance requires the ongoing confidence and cooperation of all the organization's constituencies, but especially of the employees and others who do its day-to-day work. In today's knowledge-based economy, attracting creative and energetic employees and nurturing their talents has become a high priority. Without imaginative and industrious employees, companies cannot hope to maintain the levels of innovation needed to remain competitive in a rapidly changing environment. Managers are becoming increasingly aware that many people do their best, most creative work in an environment of trust, responsibility, and high aspirations. Such an environment can only be built on values such as honesty, reliability, fairness, and respect.

An organizational value system grounded in sound ethical principles is an asset that pays multiple dividends. The benefits can be seen most clearly in three areas: organizational functioning, market relationships, and social standing. A closer look at each of these areas will show why more executives are coming to regard ethics as a help rather than a hindrance in building and maintaining effective organizations.

Organizational Functioning

Studies of organizational excellence consistently show the importance of a well-defined value system for achieving and maintaining outstanding performance.⁴ A compelling purpose and a set of deeply held values provide a focus for organizational effort. They are a source of organizational identity that can generate pride and commitment while helping companies weather the adaptations necessary to survive and thrive over time. In periods of adversity, a sound value system is a buffer against temptations to generate short-term results in ways that will impair long-term

⁴ See, e.g., Donald K. Clifford, Jr., and Richard E. Cavanagh, *The Winning Performance* (New York: Bantam Books, 1985); James C. Collins and Jerry I. Porras, *Built to Last* (New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 1994); John P. Kotter and James L. Heskett, *Corporate Culture and Performance* (New York: The Free Press, 1992).