STRATEGIC FINANCIAL PLANNING OVER THE LIFECYCLE

A Conceptual Approach to Personal Risk Management



Narat Charupat • Huaxiong Huang Moshe A. Milevsky

Strategic Financial Planning over the Lifecycle

A Conceptual Approach to Personal Risk Management

NARAT CHARUPAT

McMaster University, Canada

HUAXIONG HUANG

York University, Canada





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521148030

© Narat Charupat, Huaxiong Huang, and Moshe A. Milevsky 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Charupat, Narat.

Strategic financial planning over the lifecycle : a conceptual approach to personal risk management / Narat Charupat, Huaxiong Huang, Moshe A. Milevsky

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references (p.) and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-76456-8 (hardback)

 Finance, Personal.
 Risk management.
 Wealth–Management.
 Huang, Huaxiong.
 Milevsky, Moshe Arye, 1967–
 Title.

HG179.C5354 2012

332.024-dc23 2011050681

ISBN 978-0-521-76456-8 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-14803-0 Paperback

Additional resources for this publication at http://www.yorku.ca/milevsky/?page_id=185

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

STRATEGIC FINANCIAL PLANNING OVER THE LIFECYCLE

This book on personal financial planning and wealth management employs the lifecycle model of financial economics. The central idea of "consumption smoothing" is used to connect chapters and topics such as saving and investment, debt management, risk management, and retirement planning. The first part of the book is nontechnical and aimed at a wide audience with no special technical background. The second part of the book provides a rigorous presentation of the lifecycle model from first principles using the calculus of variations. The accompanying website is found at http://www.yorku.ca/milevsky/?page_id=185.

Narat Charupat is an associate professor at the DeGroote School of Business, McMaster University, Ontario, Canada. His research has been published in journals such as the *Journal of Economic Theory, Journal of Banking and Finance, Journal of Risk and Insurance*, and the *Journal of Financial and Quantitative Analysis*. Professor Charupat's areas of professional interest include annuity and insurance products, financial innovation, arbitrage, and behavioral finance. He has taught courses in financial derivatives and personal and international finance.

Huaxiong Huang is a professor of applied mathematics at York University, Toronto, Canada, where he has taught since 1999. He has published more than 60 articles in peer-reviewed journals including the Journal of Banking and Finance, Insurance: Mathematics and Economics, Journal of Risk and Insurance, and the Financial Analysts Journal. He is an associate editor of the Journal of Engineering Mathematics and Advances in Applied Mathematics and Mechanics and managing editor of the Mathematics-in-Industry Case Studies. A Fellow of the Fields Institute, he has held visiting positions in China, Japan, the United Kingdom, and the United States.

Moshe A. Milevsky is a finance professor at York University, Toronto, Canada; executive director of The IFID Centre in Toronto; and president and CEO of the QWeMA Group. He has written eight books, more than 60 peer-reviewed journal articles, and more than 200 articles in the popular press on insurance, investments, pensions, retirement, and annuities, including *The Calculus of Retirement Income: Financial Models for Pension Annuities* and *Life Insurance* (Cambridge University Press, 2006). A Fellow of the Fields Institute, Professor Milevsky has received two National Magazine (Canada) awards and the Graham and Dodd scroll award and has been honored by the Retirement Income Insurance Association for lifetime achievement in applied research. In 2009, *Investment Advisor* magazine named him one of the 25 most influential people in the financial advisory business.

To our wives...

 \dots As far as I am aware, no one has challenged the view that if people were capable of it, they ought to plan their consumption, saving, and retirement according to the principles enunciated by Modigliani and Brumberg in the 1950s \dots

Angus S. Deaton, Princeton University, 2005

Acknowledgments

The authors would like to thank Zvi Bodie, Simon Dabrowski, Faisal Habib, Mark Kamstra, Larry Kotlikoff, David Promislow, Thomas Salisbury, Lingwu Shao, and Pauline Shum for helpful comments, conversations, and discussions as this book was being written.

In addition, the authors would like to acknowledge our editor Scott Parris at Cambridge University Press for encouraging us to reach a wider audience; Tanya Bass for editorial and typesetting assistance; Mirela Cara for help with the lecture slides; Warren Huska for setting up the book's website; Shana Meyer at Aptara, Inc., for supplying editorial and composition services; the CFA Institute for allowing us to use material in Chapter 12; and Alexa Brand, the office manager at the IFID Centre, for ensuring that we were never bogged down by minutia.

Finally, we would like to recognize thousands of our students who have motivated us to "explain things better" during the last twenty years of our teaching careers. We look forward to meeting thousands more over the next twenty.

Contents

Acknowledgments			page xiii	
1	Intro	Introduction and Motivation		
2	Mathematical Preliminaries – Working with Interest Rates		4	
	2.1	Interest Rates	4	
		2.1.1 Effective Annual Rate (EAR) and Annual		
		Percentage Rate (APR)	5	
	2.2	Time Value of Money – Definitions	7	
	2.3	Present Value and Future Value of a Single Cash Flow	8	
	2.4	Present Value of an Annuity with Constant Payments	9	
		2.4.1 Ordinary Annuity	9	
		2.4.2 Annuity Due	11	
	2.5	Future Value of an Annuity with Constant Payments	12	
		2.5.1 Ordinary Annuity	12	
		2.5.2 Annuity Due	13	
	2.6	Present Value of an Annuity Whose Payments Change		
		at a Constant Rate	14	
		2.6.1 Constant-Growth Ordinary Annuity	14	
		2.6.2 Constant-Growth Annuity Due	18	
	2.7	Future Value of an Annuity Whose Payments Change		
		at a Constant Rate	19	
		2.7.1 Constant-Growth Ordinary Annuity	19	
		2.7.2 Constant-Growth Annuity Due	20	
	2.8	A Preliminary Discussion of the Effects of Inflation	21	
	2.9	Appendix: Geometric Progressions and Annuity		
		Relations	23	
	2.10	Questions and Assignments	26	

viii Contents

3	Personal Balance Sheet and Human Capital	28	
	3.1 Personal Balance Sheets	28	
	3.1.1 Financial Assets	30	
	3.1.2 Gross Human Capital	31	
	3.1.3 Explicit Liabilities	32	
	3.1.4 Implicit Liabilities	32	
	3.1.5 Economic Net Worth	32	
	3.2 Estimation of Gross Human Capital	33	
	3.2.1 What Is Proper Discount Rate for Gross Human		
	Capital?	36	
	3.3 Estimation of Implicit Liabilities	37	
	3.4 An Example of Human Capital Decisions: Investing in		
	Education	40	
	3.4.1 Some Caveats	42	
	3.5 Questions and Assignments	42	
4	Consumption Smoothing and Optimal Savings		
	4.1 Consumption Smoothing	46	
	4.2 Assumptions for Consumption Smoothing	49	
	4.3 Solving for Smoothness	51	
	4.3.1 Effects of Changes in Other Parameter Values	65	
	4.4 Consumption Smoothing vs. Other Approaches	70	
	4.4.1 The Fixed-Percentage Savings Rules	70	
	4.4.2 The 70% Income Replacement Rule	73	
	4.5 Practical Considerations	75	
	4.6 Questions and Assignments	76	
5	Debts, Loans, and Mortgages [Canadian Content]	79	
	5.1 Mortgage Financing	79	
	5.1.1 Mortgage Amortization	81	
	5.1.2 Mortgage Insurance	84	
	5.1.3 Mortgage Refinancing	88	
	5.1.4 Fixed-Rate vs. Floating-Rate Loans	92	
	5.2 Borrowing to Invest	95	
	5.3 Debt Consolidation	98	
	5.4 Is Debt Good or Bad?	99	
	5.5 Questions and Assignments	100	
6	Personal Income Taxes [Canadian Content]	103	
	6.1 The Logic of Income Tax Calculations	103	

Contents ix

	6.1.1 Federal Income Taxes	105
	6.1.2 Provincial Income Taxes	109
	6.1.3 Combining Federal and Provincial Income Taxes	111
	6.2 Investment Income	114
	6.2.1 Interest Income	115
	6.2.2 Dividend Income	115
	6.2.3 Capital Gains/Losses	119
	6.3 Income Tax Planning	120
	6.3.1 Income Splitting	121
	6.3.2 Tax-Deferred Investment Vehicles	124
	6.3.3 Tax-Free Savings Accounts (TFSAs)	131
	6.3.4 RRSPs vs. TFSAs	132
	6.4 Questions and Assignments	134
7	Risk, Utility, and Insurance	136
	7.1 The Concepts of Risk and Risk Preferences	136
	7.1.1 Definition of Risk	136
	7.1.2 Risk Preferences	137
	7.2 The Concept of Insurance	138
	7.3 The Demand for Insurance	141
	7.3.1 When Should People Buy Insurance?	141
	7.3.2 How Much Should You Pay for Insurance?	142
	7.3.3 The Effect of Current Wealth on Insurance	
	Decisions	147
	7.3.4 The Effect of Risk-Aversion Parameter on	
	Insurance Decisions	149
	7.3.5 Generalizations	151
	7.4 Insurance and Consumption Smoothing	152
	7.5 Questions and Assignments	155
8	Mortality Risk and Life Insurance	157
	8.1 Who Needs Life Insurance?	157
	8.2 How Much Coverage Do You Need?	158
	8.2.1 Human-Capital Approach	158
	8.2.2 The Expense (Needs) Approach	160
	8.3 Types of Life Insurance	161
	8.3.1 Term Life Insurance	162
	8.3.2 Cash-Value Life Insurance	179
	8.4 Questions and Assignments	182

x Contents

9	Investment and Diversification		183
	9.1	Investment Decisions and Consumption	183
	9.2	Major Asset Classes	186
		9.2.1 Cash Equivalents	186
		9.2.2 Fixed Income (Bonds)	187
		9.2.3 Equities	188
		9.2.4 Commodities	189
		9.2.5 Real Estate	190
	9.3	Historical Returns	191
		9.3.1 Arithmetic Average vs. Geometric Average	193
		9.3.2 Correlations of Returns	194
	9.4	Asset Allocation and Diversification	194
	9.5	Mutual Funds and Exchange-Traded Funds	197
		9.5.1 Mutual Funds	197
		9.5.2 Exchange-Traded Funds (ETFs)	201
	9.6	Summary	201
	9.7	Questions and Assignments	202
10	The Mathematics of Portfolio Diversification		204
	10.1 Impressive Investment Performance: Real or Fake		204
	10.2	2 Portfolio Diversification	206
		10.2.1 Preliminaries	206
		10.2.2 From Bernoulli to Binomial	209
		10.2.3 The Central Limit Theorem	211
	10.3	3 Portfolio Construction	214
		10.3.1 Efficient Frontier for Two Assets	217
		10.3.2 Efficient Frontier for More Than Two Assets	219
	10.4	4 Summary	221
	10.5	5 Questions and Assignments	222
11	Housing Decisions		224
	11.1 Buying or Renting?		224
		11.1.1 From a Purely Financial Perspective	224
		11.1.2 Other Aspects of the Decision	232
		11.1.3 Our Recommendation	234
	11.2	2 Questions and Assignments	236
12	Pensions and Retirement [Canadian Content]		238
	12.1	Longevity Risk	238
		Retirement Plans that Provide Lifelong Income	243

Contents xi

		12.2.1 Canada Pension Plan (CPP) and Old-Age	
		Security Pension (OAS)	243
		12.2.2 Defined-Benefit Pension Plan	244
		12.2.3 Life Annuity	248
	12.3	Optimal Retirement Spending Rate in the Presence of	
		Longevity Risk	254
		12.3.1 Retirement Spending Rates	255
		12.3.2 Numerical Example	256
		12.3.3 Including Pension Annuities	258
	12.4	Summary	262
	12.5	Questions and Assignments	264
13		nced Material: Part I. Continuous Time and the	
	Calcu	lus of Variations	266
	13.1	Wages and Salary in Continuous Time	266
	13.2	Human Capital Values in Continuous Time	267
	13.3	A Different Route: Same Destination	270
	13.4	Does Human Capital Grow or Shrink over Time?	272
	13.5	Implicit Liabilities in Continuous Time	273
		Consumption Smoothing: A Second Look	273
	13.7	Calculus of Variations	279
	13.8	Smooth Consumption: A Final Look	281
		Life and Death in Continuous Time	283
	13.10	The Problem of Retirement Income	291
		13.10.1 The Euler-Lagrange Equation	293
		13.10.2 Wealth Depletion	293
		13.10.3 Classifying the Different Retirement	
		Trajectories	295
		13.10.4 Explicit Solution: Exponential Remaining	
		Lifetime	297
		13.10.5 Explicit Solution: Gompertz Mortality	299
	13.11	Back to the Working Years	302
		13.11.1 Patient Individual $k \le \hat{k} < g$	303
		13.11.2 Relatively Impatient Individual $k \le g \le \hat{k}$	305
		13.11.3 Impatient Individual $g < k \le \hat{k}$	308
		Conclusion	309
		Questions and Assignments	310
	13.14	Appendix	313

xii Contents

Adva	nced Material: Part II. Stochastic Optimal Control and	
		315
14.1	Dynamic Asset Allocation and Optimal Consumption	315
14.2	Asset Price Model	316
14.3	A Self-Financed Portfolio	317
14.4	The Asset-Allocation Problem	318
14.5	The Asset-Allocation-Consumption Problem	321
14.6	The Asset-Allocation-Consumption Problem with	
	Deterministic Wage Income	323
14.7	An Advanced Stochastic Lifecycle Model	324
	14.7.1 Model Specifications	325
	14.7.2 HJB Equation for the Lifecycle Model	328
	14.7.3 Closed-Form Solution	329
14.8	Questions and Assignments	337
14.9	Technical Appendix	338
	14.9.1 Elementary Stochastic Calculus in Finance	338
	14.9.2 Stochastic Dynamic Optimization	341
	14.9.3 Finite Difference Method for Solving the HJB	
	Equation	342
Concluding Thoughts and Next Steps		345
15.1	Portfolio Selection with Human Capital	346
15.2	Asset Location vs. Asset Allocation	347
15.3	Home Mortgage Financing	348
15.4		348
15.5	Employee Compensation and Proper Incentives	349
15.6	Choice of Defined Benefit vs. Defined Contribution	
	Pensions	349
15.7	Starting a Retirement Pension Annuity	350
15.8	Estate Planning and Tax Arbitrage	350
15.9		350
oliograt	ohy	353
ler		357
	the H 14.1 14.2 14.3 14.4 14.5 14.6 14.7 14.8 14.9 Cone 15.1 15.2 15.3 15.4 15.5 15.6 15.7 15.8 15.9 collograp	14.2 Asset Price Model 14.3 A Self-Financed Portfolio 14.4 The Asset-Allocation Problem 14.5 The Asset-Allocation-Consumption Problem 14.6 The Asset-Allocation-Consumption Problem with Deterministic Wage Income 14.7 An Advanced Stochastic Lifecycle Model 14.7.1 Model Specifications 14.7.2 HJB Equation for the Lifecycle Model 14.7.3 Closed-Form Solution 14.8 Questions and Assignments 14.9 Technical Appendix 14.9.1 Elementary Stochastic Calculus in Finance 14.9.2 Stochastic Dynamic Optimization 14.9.3 Finite Difference Method for Solving the HJB Equation Concluding Thoughts and Next Steps 15.1 Portfolio Selection with Human Capital 15.2 Asset Location vs. Asset Allocation 15.3 Home Mortgage Financing 15.4 Life and Health Insurance 15.5 Employee Compensation and Proper Incentives 15.6 Choice of Defined Benefit vs. Defined Contribution Pensions 15.7 Starting a Retirement Pension Annuity 15.8 Estate Planning and Tax Arbitrage 15.9 The Real Options in Your Life

ONE

Introduction and Motivation

This book grew out of the deep frustration two of the three authors have experienced for many years, trying to teach a practical yet rigorous course on personal – in contrast to corporate or investment – finance, to undergraduate and graduate students at Canadian business schools. Although there are many college-level textbooks that discuss the *tactical* aspects of personal finance – nuggets such as: credit card debt is bad; reduce fees on mutual funds; regular saving is important; have a budget; and so on – we have not come across a textbook that integrated all these disparate concepts into a conceptual or *strategic* framework for financial decision making, *based on sound economic principles*.

For the most part, personal finance is being taught as a collection of standalone facts about "smart" money management. Most existing textbooks are written assuming a (very) basic background in mathematics on the part of the student, which limits the financial and economic level at which such a course can be delivered and the material discussed. Moreover, in today's Google and YouTube world, curious students could obtain more relevant, accurate, and up-to-date information about most (if not all) of the products that are part of the personal financial toolkit. In our opinion, a textbook that allocates most of its pages to the tactical aspects of financial planning, such as explaining how to read a credit card statement or how to get a copy of your credit report from your local credit bureau, or how to open up a brokerage account, is not advanced enough for a third or fourth year course in a business school. Many personal finance textbooks – whose first editions were written before Internet browsers existed - are a relic from a bygone era in which good information could not be located on the Web within seconds.

On a related note – to make things more difficult for us as instructors – the recent "discoveries" by behavioral economists that individuals do not

adhere to the most basic axioms of rational choice, and the overwhelming evidence that most consumers make systematic and persistent mistakes with their money, create an even greater need for *a conceptual framework* that goes beyond amusing anecdotes regarding dollar bills left lying on the street.

Likewise, from the perspective of students in the engineering and sciences, it is often difficult for those who are interested in personal finance problems to find a background textbook that provides an overview of the relevant institutional features of personal finance and insurance together with the mathematical treatments used to solve these problems. Often, mathematics students have to sit through various courses offered in business schools, occasionally extracting useful information from a mountain of tangential material.

So, like any authors embarking on an ambitious writing project, we believe there is a niche to be filled. In particular, our goal in writing this book – and the way we approach the topic in class – is to *teach personal finance from the perspective of the lifecycle model* (LCM), originally formulated mathematically by Ramsey (1928), economically by Fisher (1930), then refined by Modigliani and Brumberg (1954) as well as Friedman (1957), and finally adjusted for lifetime uncertainty by Yaari (1965). Our intention is to extract as many practical insights as possible in an accessible and analytically tractable manner. If there is one question that links every single dilemma in personal finance, it is: What course of action will help me maximize my standard of living – in the smoothest way possible – over the rest of my life?

To avoid distraction, mathematical techniques are only presented when they are absolutely needed. Our emphasis is on the practical aspects of these techniques rather than mathematical rigor. The first twelve chapters of this book - which are geared toward undergraduates in business and finance present the lifecycle model of investment and consumption under very simple assumptions about wages, retirement dates, and investment returns. The final two chapters (13 and 14) are (much) more mathematical and present advanced material related to the LCM, leading up to the Merton (1990) work on asset allocation in continuous time. The two final chapters are more suitable for an advanced undergraduate audience in economics and applied mathematics, or perhaps a first year graduate course, assuming they have the mathematical maturity and interest. As far as the numerical examples and case studies are concerned, we focus our examples on the Canadian environment (and in particular the tax material in Chapter 6) mainly because this is where we are located and where we currently teach. The other chapters or sections that contain a substantial amount of Canadian content are so designated. That said, most of the conceptual material – which forms the majority of this book – is universal enough to apply anywhere.

In writing this book we aimed to "prove" that personal finance can be taught to university students in an intellectually satisfying manner, within a rational and strategic framework. We hope you agree.

TWO

Mathematical Preliminaries – Working with Interest Rates

Learning Objectives

In this chapter, we will review the concepts of interest rates and time value of money (TVM). There are several types of present-value and future-value formulas, each of which is used in specific circumstances. Our goal is to make sure that you understand when (i.e., in what context) these formulas should be used. A good understanding of this chapter is needed to proceed to future chapters, where we will need to calculate the amounts of your consumption and savings at various points in time.

Although we believe that most of you have covered these materials in your previous finance courses, we recommend that you take another look at them and familiarize yourself with the notations we will use in the rest of this book.

2.1 Interest Rates

As you may recall, an interest rate is the rate of return that a borrower promises to pay for the use of money that he or she borrows from the lender. Normally, it is expressed in terms of per-annum percentage rates (e.g., 4% p.a.). To express it properly, however, we also need to state the compounding frequency of the rate, which is the number of compounding periods in one year. In other words, it is the number of times in a year that interest is calculated and added to the principal of the loan.

For example, annual compounding means that interest is added to the principal once a year. Suppose you invest \$1 for one year at the interest rate of 4% p.a., annual compounding. At the end of the year, you will receive:

$$(1+0.04)^1 = 1.04.$$