

HONG KONG CASES

1982

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Butterworths Asia

Hong Kong • Singapore • Kuala Lumpur

The Butterworth Group of Companies

Hong Kong	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA (HONG KONG) 19/F Eight Commercial Tower 8 Sun Yip Street, Chai Wan, Hong Kong Tel: 29651400 Fax: 29760840
Singapore	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA 10 Anson Road #32-01 International Plaza, Singapore 0207
Malaysia	MALAYAN LAW JOURNAL SDN BHD Suite 1001/02 10th Floor Wisma Hamzah Kwong Hing No 1 Leboh Ampang 50100 Kuala Lumpur
Australia	BUTTERWORTHS Sydney, Melbourne, Brisbane, Adelaide, Perth, Canberra
Canada	BUTTERWORTHS CANADA LTD Toronto and Vancouver
Ireland	BUTTERWORTH (IRELAND) LTD Dublin
New Zealand	BUTTERWORTHS OF NEW ZEALAND LTD Wellington and Auckland
Puerto Rico	BUTTERWORTH OF PUERTO RICO, INC San Juan
UK	BUTTERWORTH & Co (PUBLISHERS) LTD London and Edinburgh
USA	MICHELLE BUTTERWORTH Carlsbad, California and Charlottesville, Virginia

©

Butterworths Asia*
1995

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any material form or by any means, including photocopying and recording, or storing in any medium by electronic means and whether or not transiently or incidentally to some other use of this publication, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher. Such written permission must also be obtained before any part of this publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

*Butterworths Asia is a division of Reed Elsevier (Singapore) Pte Ltd.

ISSN 0218-7809

Typeset by Butterworths Asia and Corporate Press (HK) Ltd
Produced by Mandarin Offset Ltd
Printed and bound in Hong Kong

◀ *General Editor*

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Associate Editors

Grenville Cross QC

Ruy Barretto, Barrister

Michael Ozorio, Barrister

Mohan Bharwaney, Barrister

Susan Kwan, Barrister

Peter Garland, Barrister

Malcolm Merry, Barrister

Aarif Barma, Barrister

Andrew Cheung, Barrister

Peter Ng, Barrister

Joseph Fok, Barrister

Anderson Chow, Barrister

Teresa Cheng, Barrister

David Fitzpatrick, Barrister

Patrick WS Cheung, Barrister

Andrew Byrnes, Hong Kong University

Johannes Chan, Hong Kong University

Reporters in this volume

Edmund Cham, Solicitor

Daniel WS Chan, Barrister

Earnest WH Cheung, Barrister

MC Chiu, Barrister

Christina FY Choi, Solicitor

Danny Choi, Barrister

Lindy Course, Barrister

Gary Kwan, Barrister

Jasper Kwan, Barrister

Lawrence Law, Barrister

Cindy Lee, Barrister

Rebecca MK Lee, Barrister

PY Lo, Barrister

Herman LH Poon, Barrister

Jennifer Tsang, Barrister

Raymond Tsui Wai Nam, Barrister

Wu Yuk Fung, Barrister

Dominic Yeung, Barrister

Hareed Zafrullah, City University

Angela Ho

Jeanne Tan

Butterworths Asia

Managing Editor: Anthony P Kinnear

Deputy Managing Editor: Zarinah Marican

Editors: Noorunnisa Ibrahim Kutty, Teoh Swee Leng, Bala Shanmugam,

Sharon Kaur

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The publishers are grateful to and acknowledge the significant contribution and support of the Hong Kong Superior Court Judgments Database project, directed by the four members of the Faculty of Law, whose names are mentioned below. The judgments database project (1989–1994) was funded primarily by the University of Hong Kong's Conference and Research Grants Committee with assistance from the Department of Professional Legal Education, at the Faculty of Law. The Faculty members responsible for the project are (in alphabetical order) Andrew Byrnes, Lecturer, Department of Law; Rick Glofcheski, Lecturer, Department of Law; Gary N Heilbronn, Senior Lecturer, Department of Professional Legal Education; and Sarah Nield, Senior Lecturer, Department of Professional Legal Education (until 1992). The project administrator is James Garrity, Research Officer, Faculty of Law.

TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS

List of abbreviations used in this volume (excluding reports):

A	High Court Action
ACJ	Acting Chief Justice
A-G	Attorney General
AR	Application for Review
Adm	Admiralty Action
App	Appendix
art	article
Aust	Australia
CA	Court of Appeal
CA	Civil Appeal Number in references to unreported cases (eg CA 2/92)
CC	High Court Criminal Case
CJ	Chief Justice
Cap	Chapter (as in Chapter Number of an Ordinance)
Crim App	Criminal Appeal
Comm L	Commercial List
Con L	Construction List
ch	chapter (as in chapter number of a book)
cl(l)	clause(s)
DC	District Court
DCA	District Court Action
DJ	District Court Divorce Jurisdiction
DJ	District Judge
DPP	Director of Public Prosecutions
EC	European Communities
ECC	Economic Compensation Case
ECHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECJ	Court of Justice of the European Communities
EEC	European Economic Communities
Ed	Edition
Ex Ch	Court of Exchequer Chamber
exh	exhibit
fn	footnote
HC	High Court
HL	House of Lords
J(J)	Justice(s)
J(J)A	Justice(s) of Appeal
LT(A)	Labour Tribunal (Appeal)
LC	Lord Chancellor
Ld T(A)	Lands Tribunal (Appeal)
MA	Magistracy Appeal
MP	Miscellaneous Proceedings
MR	Master of the Rolls
n	note
NSW	New South Wales
O	Order (of the Rules of the Supreme Court)
PC	Privy Council

Abbreviations

PO	Presiding Officer
PRC	People's Republic of China
PCA	Privy Council Appeal
Pt	Part
para(s)	paragraph(s)
RSC	Rules of the Supreme Court
r(r)	rule(s)
reg(s)	regulation(s)
s(s)	section(s)
sub-s(s)	subsection(s)
Sch	Schedule
UN	United Nations
Uncitral	United Nations Commission on International Trade Law
VP(P)	Vice-President(s)
WCC	Workers' Compensation Case

List of abbreviations of law reports:

AC	Law Reports, Appeal Cases (HL and PC); since 1890
ACLR	Australian Company Law Reports; 1974-current
All ER	All England Law Reports; since 1936
App Cas	Law Reports, Appeal Cases, House of Lords, 15 volumes; 1875-1890
B & C	Barnewell & Cresswell; since 1822-1830
B & S	Best & Smith; 1861-1871
Camp	Campbell; 1807-1816
Ch	Law Reports, Chancery Division; since 1890
CLR	Commonwealth Law Reports; since 1903
CPD	Cape Provisional Division, SA; 1910-1946
Cr App R	Criminal Appeal Reports (HL and CA(UK)); since 1908
Crim LR	Criminal Law Review; since 1954
DLR	Dominion Law Reports; since 1912
De GF & J	De Gex & Jones, temp Cranworth, Chelmsford & Campbell; 1857-1859
ER	English Reports; since 1220-1865
E & B	Ellis & Blackburn; 1851-1858
El & Bl	Ellis & Blackburn; 1851-1858
EG	Estates Gazette; since 1858
Ex D	Law Reports, Exchequer Division, 5 vols, 1875-1880
Exch	Exchequer Reports (Welshby, Hurlstone, and Gordon), 11 vols, 1847-1856
FSR	Fleet Street Patent Law Reports, since 1963
H & C	Hurlstone & Coltman; 1862-1866
HKC	Hong Kong Cases
HKDCLR	Hong Kong District Court Law Reports
HKLJ	Hong Kong Law Journal
HKLR	Hong Kong Law Reports

Hong Kong Cases

HKLTLR	Hong Kong Land Tribunal Law Report
KB	King's Bench
LJ Ch	Law Journal
LJQB	Law Journal Reports, New Series, Queens Bench; 1831-1949
LR CP	Common Pleas (10 vols) (UK); 1865-1875
LR HL	Eng & Irish Appeals and Peerage Claims (HL) (7 vols) (UK); 1866-1875
LR PC	Privy Council (6 vols)(UK); 1865-1875
LT	Law Times Reports (UK); 1861-1947
Lloyd's Rep	Lloyd's List Law Reports; since 1951
Moo PC	Moore EF; 1836-1862
NZLR	New Zealand Law Reports; since 1883
P	Probate, Divorce & Admiralty (UK) (cf PD, Fam); 1891-1971
QB	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1891–1900, and since 1952
QB	Queen's Bench Reports (Adolphus and Ellis, New Series), 18 volumes; 1841–1852
QBD	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1875–1890
R & IT	Rating & Income Tax; 1924-1960
RPC	Reports of Patents Cases (UK); 1884-1955: date judgment in parens, vol no; since 1956: date vol in brackets
SASR	South Australian State Reports; since 1921
SC	Session Cases, Scotland 6th series (UK); since 1907
SJ	Solicitors' Journal; since 1857
SLR	Scottish Law Reporter; 1865-1925
SLR	Scottish Land Reports; since 1913
SLT	Scots Law Times; since 1893
TLR	The Times Law Reports, 71 volumes; 1884–1950 The Times Law Reports; since 1951
Term Rep	Term Reports (Durnford and East), fol, 8 vols, 1785-1800
VLR	Victorian Law Reports, Australia; 1875-1956
WLR	Weekly Law Reports; since 1953

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

The mode of citation of cases reported in this volume of *Hong Kong Cases* is [1982] HKC (page).

	Page		Page
A			
Aik San Realty Ltd & Ors v Attorney General	[PC] 320	Chan Tse Kei; R v	[HC] 283
Allied International Insurance Ltd v Hsia Jone Shu & Anor [CA]	4	Chan Yau Yik v Lung Kwong Hung Thomas & Anor	[CA] 169
Amery China Building Co Ltd, Re	[HC] 197	Cheung Ching Kiang & Ors; Attorney General v	[HC] 1
Archambaud v Sino Com- munication Holding Ltd	[HC] 339	Cheung Choi Lee; Wong Chi Shing v	[CA] 560
Asia Furniture; Jebesen & Co Ltd v	[HC] 218	Cheung Chor Suen; R v	[HC] 250
Atari Incorporated & Ors; Video Technology Ltd & Ors v	[CA] 504	Cheung Ping Kei; R v	[CA] 575
Attorney General v Cheung Ching Kiang & Ors	[HC] 1	Cheung Tin Shun & Ors; Gande Price (Importers & Distributors) Ltd v	[HC] 456
Attorney General v China Light & Power Co Ltd	[HC] 207	Cheung Wong Shi v Chan Fook Tai	[DC] 450
Attorney General v Ho Hing Mui	[CA] 424	China Light & Power Co Ltd; Attorney General v	[HC] 207
Attorney General v Li Ching Kwan	[CA] 445	China Steel Corp & Anor v Virginia Panama SA	[HC] 163
Attorney General v Lui Lok ...	[CA] 410	Chow Cho Dak & Anor; Re ...	[HC] 301
Attorney General; Aik San Realty Ltd & Ors v	[PC] 320	Commissioner of Rating and Valuation; Mauriello v	[LdT] 596
Automatic Vending Co Ltd; Re	[CA] 548	Commissioner of Rating and Valuation; Yiu Lian Machinery Repairing Works Ltd & Ors v	[LdT] 55
B		Confecciones Del Atlantico v Lamont Shipping Incorporated & Ors	[HC] 327
Bank of Canton Ltd v Chalkland Co Ltd	[HC] 657	D	
C		Director of Lands; CG & L Investment Ltd v	[LdT] 610
CG & L Investment Ltd v Director of Lands	[LdT] 610	Djatianom, The	[HC] 521
Chalkland Co Ltd; Bank of Canton Ltd v	[HC] 657	E	
Chan Fook Tai; Cheung Wong Shi v	[DC] 450	East Southasia Investigations Bureau; Lam Hon Kay v	[CA] 43
Chan Kin Kwok; R v	[CA] 530	Estate of Yang Sen Hui (deceased) v Pao Yuen Tung Hsing Yieh Co Ltd	[CA] 81
Chan Kwong; R v	[CA] 463	F	
Chan Oi Ling v Lam King Phung	[HC] 25	Filmo (HK) Ltd; Yau Chau Yeung Wylie t/a International (HK) Trade Ltd v	[HC] 8
Chan Tak Ping; R v	[CA] 374	Fong Chun Wai; R v	[CA] 637

Hong Kong Cases

	Page		Page
Fung Kwok Wai; Shing Yip Co Ltd v [DC]	478	J	
G		Jebsen & Co Ltd v Asia Furniture [HC]	218
Gande Price (Importers & Distributors) Ltd v Cheung Tin Shun & Ors [HC]	456	Jones Photo Supplies Ltd, Re [HC]	578
Great Mace Trading Co Ltd; Lee Chui Foon v [CA]	629	K	
Guardforce Ltd & Ors; Murray-Jones v [HC]	31	Ko Wing On; Kwong Cheung Sun v [CA]	404
H		Komala Deccof & Co & Ors v Perusahaan Pertambangan Ninyik Dan Gas Bumi Negara (Pertamina) [CA]	47
Ha Francesca v Tsai Kut Kan & Ors (No 1) [CA]	382	Krohn & Co Import/Export GmbH & Co kg v Oak Steamship Co Ltd & Anor ... [HC]	353
Hang Lung Bank Ltd; Lam Yin Fei t/a Wah Shing Garment Manufacturing Co & Anor v [HC]	187	Kum Susan Ho, The [HC]	289
Ho Hing Mui; Attorney General v [CA]	424	Kwong Cheung Sun v Ko Wing On [CA]	404
Ho Sun Lee Mahjong School v Shum Wai Kwan [HC]	19	L	
Hon Tak San; R v [HC]	296	Lai Chi Ping; R v [CA]	592
Hong Kong Metropolitan Bank Ltd v Sun Sun Garments Factory & Ors [HC]	119	Lam Chi v Yip Ching [CA]	623
Hong Kong Tramways Ltd & Ors v Realty Development Corp Ltd & Ors [HC]	346	Lam Hon Kay v East Southasia Investigations Bureau [CA]	43
Hong Yuk Lin; v R [CA]	44	Lam King Phung; Chan Oi Ling v [HC]	25
Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corp & Ors; Murray-Jones v [CA]	127	Lam Shek Yiu; R v [HC]	314
Hop Woo Cheung Enterprises Ltd v Intergroup Industries Ltd [HC]	436	Lam Yin Fei t/a Wah Shing Garment Manufacturing Co & Anor v Hang Lung Bank Ltd [HC]	187
Hsia Jone Shu & Anor; Allied International Insurance Ltd v [CA]	4	Lamont Shipping Incorporated & Ors; Confecciones Del Atlantico v [HC]	327
Hui Chung Kak & Anor; Tan Kam Ming v [CA]	582	Lau Alexander; R v [DC]	174
I		Lau Wong Fat & Anor; Tang Yuk Lam v [CA]	539
Intergroup Industries Ltd; Hop Woo Cheung Enterprises Ltd v [HC]	436	Law Society of Hong Kong v A Solicitor [HC]	650
Ip Wai Hung; R v [HC]	136	Lee Chui Foon v Great Mace Trading Co Ltd [CA]	629
		Lee Ing Chee & Ors; Ng Pak Shing David & Ors v [PC]	226
		Lee Pui Leung; Secretary for the New Territories v [LdT]	494

Table of Cases Reported

	Page		Page
Lee Wing Chun; R v	[CA] 653	Pang Ying Tung; R v	[HC] 111
Lee Yat Lung & Ors; R v	[CA] 543	Pao Yuen Tung Hsing Yieh Co Ltd; Estate of Yang Sen Hui (Deceased) v	[CA] 81
Leung Cho Sze; Wong Wai Fong (administratrix of the estate of Wong Fok, deceased) v	[HC] 263	Perusahaam Pertanbangan Ninyik Dan Gas Bumi Negara (Pertamina); Komala Deccof & Co & Ors v	[CA] 47
Leung Kam Cheuk & Anor; Wong Sau Wah & Anor (administrators of the estate of Chui Yau Hang, deceased) v	[CA] 333	R	
Li Ching Kwan; Attorney General v	[CA] 445	R v Chan Kin Kwok	[CA] 530
Lui Lok; Attorney General v ..	[CA] 410	R v Chan Kwong	[CA] 463
Lung Kwong Hung Thomas & Anor; Chan Yau Yik v	[CA] 169	R v Chan Tak Ping	[CA] 374
M		R v Chan Tse Kei	[HC] 283
Mauriello v Commissioner of Rating and Valuation	[LdT] 596	R v Cheung Chor Suen	[HC] 250
Moses; The Stewards of the Royal Hong Kong Jockey Club v	[CA] 12	R v Cheung Ping Kei	[CA] 575
Murray-Jones v Guardforce Ltd & Ors	[HC] 31	R v Fong Chun Wai	[CA] 637
Murray-Jones v HongKong and Shanghai Banking Corp & Ors	[CA] 127	R v Hon Tak San	[HC] 296
N		R v Hong Yuk Lin	[CA] 44
Nanyang Commercial Bank Ltd; Root & Anor v	[HC] 417	R v Ip Wai Hung	[HC] 136
Ng Pak Shing David & Ors v Lee Ing Chee & Ors	[PC] 226	R v Lai Chi Ping	[CA] 592
Ng Po Chui; Wong Pak v	[HC] 243	R v Lam Shek Yiu	[HC] 314
Nippon Yusen Kaisha & Anor; Well Hoped Ltd & Anor v ...	[HC] 155	R v Lau Alexander	[DC] 174
O		R v Lee Wing Chun	[CA] 653
Oak Steamship Co Ltd & Anor; Krohn & Co Import/ Export GmbH & Co kg v	[HC] 353	R v Lee Yat Lung & Ors	[CA] 543
Owners of the Ship or vessel Happy Pioneer; Palace Hotel Ltd v	[HC] 640	R v Pang Ying Tung	[HC] 111
P		R v Shek Kam Ming	[HC] 286
Palace Hotel Ltd v Owners of the ship or vessel Happy Pioneer	[HC] 640	R v Tam Kit Nin	[CA] 40
		R v Tong Cho Yan	[CA] 254
		R v Tsang Hin Lam	[CA] 492
		R v Tsang Ying Kit & Ors	[HC] 443
		R v Wai Man	[CA] 139
		R v Wong Kam Tong & Ors ..	[CA] 113
		R v Wong Wai Fat & Anor ...	[HC] 132
		R v Yau Koon Yau	[HC] 590
		R v Yeung Pak Lun	[CA] 184
		Realty Development Corp Ltd & Ors; Hong Kong Tramways Ltd & Ors v	[HC] 346
		Root & Anor v Nanyang Commercial Bank Ltd	[HC] 417
		S	
		Secretary for the New Territories v Lee Pui Leung	[LdT] 494

Hong Kong Cases

	Page		Page
Shek Kam Ming; R v [HC]	286	Virginia Panama SA; China Steel Corp & Anor v [HC]	163
Shing Yip Co Ltd v Fung Kwok Wai [DC]	478	Vonchai Tumtonkitkul, Re [HC]	181
Shum Wai Kwan; Ho Sun Lee Mahjong School v [HC]	19	W	
Sino Communication Holding Ltd; Archambaud v [HC]	339	Wai Man; R v [CA]	139
Solicitor, A; Law Society of Hong Kong v [HC]	650	Well Hoped Ltd & Anor v Nippon Yusen Kaisha & Anor [HC]	155
Stewards of the Royal Hong Kong Jockey Club v Moses . [CA]	12	Wong Chi Shing v Cheung Choi Lee [CA]	560
Sun Sun Garments Factory & Ors; Hong Kong Metropolitan Bank Ltd v [HC]	119	Wong Kam Tong; R v [CA]	113
T		Wong Pak v Ng Po Chui [HC]	243
Tam Kit Nin; R v [CA]	40	Wong Sau Wah & Anor (administrators of the estate of Chui Yau Hang, deceased) v Leung Kam Cheuk & Anor [CA]	333
Tan Kam Ming v Hui Chung Kak & Anor [CA]	582	Wong Wai Fat & Anor; R v ... [HC]	132
Tang Yuk Lam v Lau Wong Fat & Anor [CA]	539	Wong Wai Fong (administratrix of the estate of Wong Fok, deceased) v Leung Cho Sze [HC]	263
Tong Cho Yan; R v [CA]	254	Yau Chau Yeung Wylie t/a International (HK) Trade Ltd v Filmo (HK) Ltd [HC]	8
Tsai Kut Kan & Ors (No 1); Ha Francesca v [CA]	382	Yau Koon Yau; R v [HC]	590
Tsang Cheung Kit & Ors v Hong Kong Housing Authority [HC]	268	Yeung Pak Lun; R v [CA]	184
Tsang Hin Lam; R v [CA]	492	Yin Wing Kwai; Re [HC]	553
Tsang Ying Kit & Ors; R v [HC]	443	Yip Ching; Lam Chi v [CA]	623
V		Yiu Lian Machinery Repairing Works Ltd & Ors v Commissioner of Rating and Valuation [LdT]	55
Video Technology Ltd & Ors v Atari Incorporated & Ors .. [CA]	504		

SUBJECT INDEX

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

Judicial review

Licensing Authority – Revocation of licence – Misstatement of grounds of revocation – Licensee required to answer to one ground when another given as reason for revocation – Breach of rules of natural justice – Miscellaneous Licences Ordinance (Cap 114) s 5(2)

Re Yin Wing Kwai [HC] 553

Royal Hong Kong Jockey Club – Steward’s enquiry – Nature of inquisitorial hearings – Disqualification of jockey by stewards of jockey club for failure to run horse on its merits – Whether fact that stewards had combined duties of detection and decision rendered the hearings inherently unfair

The Stewards of the Royal Hong Kong Jockey Club v Moses [CA] 12

AGENCY

Undisclosed principal

Commencement of proceedings – Intervention – Quality – Pre-existing proceedings by agent – Superior right – Whether agent’s right of suit terminated – Principles – Striking out

Ha Francesca v Tsai Kut Kan & Ors (No 1) [CA] 382

BANKING AND FINANCE

Banker and customer

Nature of relationship where the customer was a deposit account holder – Whether customer had right to withdrawal of money without producing passport – Relevance of rules governing account — Whether capable of overriding common law obligations of banker and customer

Root & Anor v Nanyang Commercial Bank Ltd [HC] 417

Fraud

Forged signatures on cheque – Onus on bank to show why they should not bear loss – Whether bank’s rules amounted to contractual agreement with plaintiffs – Whether carelessness of plaintiffs in not spotting error earlier amounted to estoppel or adoption or ratification

Lam Yin Fei t/a Wah Shing Garment Manufacturing Co & Anor v Hang Lung Bank Ltd [HC] 18

BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION

Construction site safety

Whether electrically qualified workmen performing duties within their expertise protected – Whether electrical substation a ‘construction site’

Attorney General v China Light & Power Co Ltd [HC] 207

BETTING, GAMBLING AND LOTTERIES

Bookmaking

Burden of proof – Whether defendants had burden of disproving prosecution

case – Gambling Ordinance (Cap 148) s 7(a)
R v Tsang Ying Kit & Ors [HC] 443

Whether the words ‘by way of trade or business’ construed so as to restrict it to an employer – Gambling Ordinance (Cap 148) s 7(1)
R v Lam Shek Yiu [HC] 314

Development control

Street shadow area – Interposition of strip of land between boundary of site and boundary of street – Whether building on site ‘fronts’ street – Building (Planning) Regulations reg 16
Aik San Realty Ltd & Ors v Attorney General [PC] 320

Home Ownership Scheme

Date of completion – Failure to complete within time specified – Certificate of extension issued after specified date – Whether valid
Tsang Cheung Kit & Ors v Hong Kong Housing Authority [HC] 268

CIVIL PROCEDURE

Admiralty action

Dismissal of proceedings – Collision between fishing vessels – Failure by plaintiff to file preliminary act within prescribed time – Application by defendant to dismiss action – Whether prejudice to defendant irreparable – Rules of the Supreme Court O 75 rr 18(1) & 19(1)
Wong Wai Fong (administratrix of the estate of Wong Fok, deceased) v Leung Cho Sze [HC] 263

Application for writ of habeas corpus

Extradition proceedings – Application to amend magistrate’s custodial order – Whether court had power to make such amendments – Rules of the Supreme Court O 53, O 54
Re Vonchai Tumtonkitkul [HC] 181

Default judgment

Application to set aside – Personal injury action – Application to set aside – Delay for period of six months – Test to be applied – Whether prejudice to other parties – General balancing exercise to see if reasonable in all circumstances to set aside judgment
Wong Pak v Ng Po Chui [HC] 243

Discovery

Whether there could be discovery in pending proceedings for breach of contract against an innocent participant – Evidence to be obtained by subpoena
Hong Kong Tramways Ltd & Ors v Realty Development Corp Ltd & Ors [HC] 346

Examination of defendant abroad

Defendant fleeing from justice – Whether proper to allow examination

abroad – Witness must be ordinarily resident abroad – Order would not serve purposes of justice – rules of the Supreme Court O 39 r 1(1)
Attorney General v Lui Lok [CA] 410

Imprisonment for failure to pay debt

Application for discharge – Discretion of the court – Distinction between committal for civil contempt and proceedings under O 49B – Whether non-payment of judgment debt amounted to contempt – Punitive aspect and enforcement aspect – Rules of the Supreme Court O 49B r 6(1)
Gande Price (Importers & Distributors) Ltd v Cheung Tin Shun & Ors [HC] 456

Interim injunction

Test of whether applicant had a favourable chance of succeeding in actual hearing – Injunction to lift disqualification of jockey until hearing of judicial review – Whether ‘outside chance’ of success during review sufficient
The Stewards of the Royal Hong Kong Jockey Club v Moses [CA] 12

Joinder of parties

Circumstances under which a party may be struck out – Petition under s 168A of the Companies Ordinance – Joinder of respondents who were not shareholders – Whether abuse of process
Murray-Jones v HongKong and Shanghai Banking Corp & Ors [CA] 127

Service of writ by post

Sufficiency of address – Address on envelop should enable addressee to be discovered without assistance from any other source – Rules of Supreme Court O 6 r 5, O 10, O 12 r 3
Tang Yuk Lam v Lau Wong Fat & Anor [CA] 539

Service of writ out of jurisdiction

Whether breach of contract within the jurisdiction – Whether place of payment in Hong Kong – Ascertainment of creditor’s place of business – Rules of the Supreme Court O 11 r 1(1)(g)
Komala Deccof & Co & Ors v Perusahaan Pertambangan Ninyik Dan Gas Bumi Negara (Pertamina) [CA] 47

Service of writ

Application to strike out – Defendant a foreign company – Whether company carrying on business within jurisdiction – Relevant time of consideration – Rules of the Supreme Court O 11
China Steel Corp & Anor v Virginia Panama SA [HC] 163

Stay of proceedings

Bill of lading – Foreign jurisdiction clause – Action brought in Hong Kong against first defendant who could not rely on clause and second and third defendants who could – Action against second and third defendants time-barred in the foreign jurisdiction – Whether multiplicity of proceedings should be avoided
Confeciones Del Atlantico v Lamont Shipping Incorporated [HC] 327

Test for when stay should be granted – Foreign jurisdiction clause in bill of lading – Whether claims based in tort rather than contract fell within the scope of the jurisdiction clause – Effect of action in Japan being time-barred on stay application

Well Hoped Ltd & Anor v Nippon Yusen Kaisha & Anor [HC] 155

Striking out

Fraud and conspiracy claim – Delay of 30 years – Statement of claim disclosed no cause of action – Whether delay and laches in pleading and evidence – Rules of the Supreme Court O 18 r 19

Estate of Yang Sen Hui (deceased) v Pao Yuen Tung Hsing Yieh Co Ltd [CA] 81

Interlocutory proceedings – Discretion – Interference by appeal court – Principles – Triable issues – Rules of the Supreme Court O 18 r 19

Ha Francesca v Tsai Kut Kan & Ors (No 1) [CA] 382

Striking out for want of prosecution – Inordinate delay by plaintiff in pursuing claim – Limitation periods expired – Consideration of what amounts to serious prejudice – Large amount of interest on claim accrued

Hong Kong Metropolitan Bank Ltd v Sun Sun Garments Factory [HC] 119

Summary judgment

Setting aside – Part of claim admitted – Leave to defend as to residue should not be made conditional on payment of amount due – Rules of the Supreme Court O 2 r 2, O 14

Yau Chau Yeung Wylie t/a International (HK) Trade Ltd v Filmo (HK) Ltd [HC] 8

Writ

Extension of validity – New prescribed form for actions from 15 September 1981 – Purported service of writ on 5 October 1981 – Writ expired – Extension of validity of writ granted by registrar – Whether service of writ a mere irregularity – Principles to apply in exercise of court's discretion to extend validity of writs

Krohn & Co Import/Export GmbH & Co kg v Oak Steamship Co Ltd & Anor [HC] 353

COMPANIES AND CORPORATIONS

Oppression

Proper respondents to action – Petition instituted against company and majority shareholders together with company directors – Company directors held no shares in company – Application to strike out respondents in proceedings on grounds that they were improperly joined – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 168A

Murray-Jones v Guardforce Ltd & Ors [HC] 31

Sale and purchase of shares

Charging and garnishee orders over unpaid price of shares – Whether share

Subject Index

transaction a sham – Whether beneficial ownership of shares passed
Ng Pak Shing David & Ors v Lee Ing Chee & Ors [PC] 226

Winding up order

Whether making of winding-up order must necessarily be within prescribed period of 14 days to invoke s 270(2) of the Companies Ordinance – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 270(2)

Re Jones Photo Supplies Ltd [HC] 578

Winding up

Compulsory winding up by majority creditors – Company assetless – Application by a minority creditor and a contributory for adjournment – Factors relevant to exercise of discretion – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 287

Re Amery China Building Co Ltd [HC] 197

Statutory demand by creditors – Debt owed to each creditor did not meet statutory minimum under s 178(a) of the Companies Ordinance – Whether demand effective notwithstanding that debts severally owed and each less the statutory minimum provided they totalled sum exceeding the minimum – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 178(a)

Re Automatic Vending Co Ltd [CA] 548

CONFLICT OF LAWS

Governing law

Incorporation of foreign Act – Whether Hong Kong court bound to consider foreign Act as governing law of contract

Palace Hotel Ltd v Owners of the ship or vessel Happy Pioneer [HC] 640

Proper law

Stipulation in contract that disputes to be resolved in Amsterdam – Whether court may proceed on ground that law of Hong Kong and the Netherlands were the same – Whether comparisons between inquisitorial and adversarial systems a consideration

Palace Hotel Ltd v Owners of the ship or vessel Happy Pioneer [HC] 640

CONTEMPT OF COURT

Oath

Refusal of Christian witness to take prescribed oath or affirmation – Whether witness entitled to make declaration of own devising – Oaths and Declarations Ordinance (Cap 11) s 7(3)

R v Pang Ying Tung [HC] 111

CONTRACT

Formalities

Sufficient memorandum – Whether matter of evidence – Law Amendment and Reform (Consolidation) Ordinance (Cap 23) s 5

Ha Francesca v Tsai Kut Kan & Ors (No 1) [CA] 382

Terms

Trade customs – Annexing to written contract – Principles – Obiter
Ha Francesca v Tsai Kut Kan & Ors (No 1) [CA] 382

Variation of terms

Intention of parties – Agreement of parties as to terms of sale of goods –
 Whether invoice issued unilaterally by one party after agreement effective to vary
 terms of agreement
Jebsen & Co Ltd v Asia Furniture [HC] 218

COURTS AND JUDICIAL SYSTEM

Small Claims Tribunal

Adjudicator's attempt to settle case – Parties seen separately in private by
 adjudicator – Whether proper practice
Lam Hon Kay v East Southasia Investigations Bureau [CA] 43

Duplication of proceedings

Avoidance of unnecessary proceedings – Labour Tribunal and High Court
 – Possibility of different tribunals coming to different conclusions on fact and law
Archambaud v Sino Communication Holding Ltd [HC] 339

Public interest immunity

Magistrate accused of offence – Disclosure of communications with other
 Crown servants – Relevant considerations – Administration of justice – Damage
 to public service
R v Lau Alexander [DC] 174

Small Claims Tribunal

Power – Whether tribunal has authority to inquire into matters not specifically
 raised by parties
Jebsen & Co Ltd v Asia Furniture [HC] 218

CRIMINAL LAW AND PROCEDURE

Admissibility of statement

Voir dire – Whether defence counsel has a bounden duty to object to the
 admissibility of statement on a voir dire if such statement is challenged
R v Lee Yat Lung & Ors [CA] 543

Appeal

Absence of the accused at trial at which she was convicted – Accused
 unrepresented – Whether an adjournment should be granted
R v Hong Yuk Lin [CA] 44

Evidence – Criminal record produced to magistrate in opposition to bail
 application – Same magistrate heard the trial
R v Yau Koon Yau [HC] 590

Challenge to judge's notes of evidence

Amendment to record of civil and criminal cases without judge's approval