

HONG KONG CASES

1986

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Butterworths Asia
Hong Kong • Singapore • Kuala Lumpur

The Butterworth Group of Companies

| | |
|-------------|---|
| Hong Kong | BUTTERWORTHS ASIA (HONG KONG) 19/F Eight Commercial Tower 8 Sun Yip Street, Chai Wan, Hong Kong Tel: 29651400 Fax: 29760840 |
| Singapore | BUTTERWORTHS ASIA 10 Anson Road #32-01, International Plaza, Singapore 0207 |
| Malaysia | MALAYAN LAW JOURNAL SDN BHD Suite 1001/02 10th Floor Wisma Hamzah Kwong Hing No 1 Leboh Ampang 50100 Kuala Lumpur |
| Australia | BUTTERWORTHS Sydney, Melbourne, Brisbane, Adelaide, Perth, Canberra |
| Canada | BUTTERWORTHS CANADA LTD Toronto and Vancouver |
| Ireland | BUTTERWORTH (IRELAND) LTD Dublin |
| New Zealand | BUTTERWORTHS OF NEW ZEALAND LTD Wellington and Auckland |
| Puerto Rico | BUTTERWORTH OF PUERTO RICO, INC San Juan |
| UK | BUTTERWORTH & Co (PUBLISHERS) LTD London and Edinburgh |
| USA | BUTTERWORTH LEGAL PUBLISHERS Salem, New Hampshire and Carlsbad, California |

Butterworths Asia is a division of Reed Elsevier (Singapore) Pte Ltd.

© Butterworths Asia, 1995

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any material form or by any means, including photocopying and recording, or storing in any medium by electronic means and whether or not transiently or incidentally to some other use of this publication, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher. Such written permission must also be obtained before any part of this publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

ISSN 0218-7809

Typeset by Butterworths Asia and Corporate Press (HK) Ltd
Produced by Mandarin Offset Ltd
Printed and bound in Hong Kong

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Associate Editors

Grenville Cross QC

Peter Garland QC

Ruy Barretto, Barrister

Michael Ozorio, Barrister

Mohan Bharwaney, Barrister

Susan Kwan, Barrister

Malcolm Merry, Barrister

Aarif Barma, Barrister

Andrew Cheung, Barrister

Peter Ng, Barrister

Joseph Fok, Barrister

Anderson Chow, Barrister

Teresa Cheng, Barrister

David Fitzpatrick, Barrister

Patrick WS Cheung, Barrister

Andrew Byrnes, Hong Kong University

Johannes Chan, Hong Kong University

Reporters in this volume

Charles P Chiu, Barrister

Edmund Cham, Solicitor

TC Chong, Barrister

Lindy Course, Barrister

Victor T Gidwani, Barrister

Gary Kwan, Barrister

Osmond Lam, Barrister

Julia Lau, Barrister

Cindy Lee, Barrister

Walter Lee, Solicitor

Rebecca MK Lee, Barrister

Raymond Leung, Barrister

PY Lo, Barrister

Victor Luk, Barrister

Herman LH Poon, Barrister

Jennifer Tsang, Barrister

Raymond Tsui Wai Nam, Barrister

Dominic Yeung, Barrister

Hareed Zafrullah, City University

Butterworths Asia

Managing Editor: Anthony P Kinnear

Deputy Managing Editor: Zarinah Marican

Legal Editor: Angela Ho

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The publishers are grateful to and acknowledge the significant contribution and support of the Hong Kong Superior Court Judgments Database project, directed by the four members of the Faculty of Law, whose names are mentioned below. The judgments database project (1989–1994) was funded primarily by the University of Hong Kong's Conference and Research Grants Committee with assistance from the Department of Professional Legal Education, at the Faculty of Law. The Faculty members responsible for the project are (in alphabetical order) Andrew Byrnes, Lecturer, Department of Law; Rick Glofcheski, Lecturer, Department of Law; Gary N Heilbronn, Senior Lecturer, Department of Professional Legal Education; and Sarah Nield, Senior Lecturer, Department of Professional Legal Education (until 1992). The project administrator is James Garritty, Research Officer, Faculty of Law.

TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS

List of abbreviations used in this volume (excluding reports):

| | |
|----------|---|
| A | High Court Action |
| ACJ | Acting Chief Justice |
| A-G | Attorney General |
| AR | Application for Review |
| Adm | Admiralty Action |
| App | Appendix |
| art | article |
| Aust | Australia |
| CA | Court of Appeal |
| CA | Civil Appeal Number in references to unreported cases (eg CA 2/92) |
| CC | High Court Criminal Case |
| CJ | Chief Justice |
| Cap | Chapter (as in Chapter Number of an Ordinance) |
| Crim App | Criminal Appeal |
| Comm L | Commercial List |
| Con L | Construction List |
| ch | chapter (as in chapter number of a book) |
| cl(l) | clause(s) |
| DC | District Court |
| DCA | District Court Action |
| DJ | District Court Divorce Jurisdiction |
| DJ | District Judge |
| DPP | Director of Public Prosecutions |
| EC | European Communities |
| ECC | Economic Compensation Case |
| ECHR | European Court of Human Rights |
| ECJ | Court of Justice of the European Communities |
| EEC | European Economic Communities |
| Ed | Edition |
| Ex Ch | Court of Exchequer Chamber |
| exh | exhibit |
| fn | footnote |
| HC | High Court |
| HL | House of Lords |
| J(J) | Justice(s) |
| J(J)A | Justice(s) of Appeal |
| LT(A) | Labour Tribunal (Appeal) |
| LC | Lord Chancellor |
| Ld T(A) | Lands Tribunal (Appeal) |
| MA | Magistracy Appeal |
| MP | Miscellaneous Proceedings |
| MR | Master of the Rolls |
| n | note |
| NSW | New South Wales |
| O | Order (of the Rules of the Supreme Court) |
| PC | Privy Council |

Hong Kong Cases

| | |
|----------|--|
| PRC | People's Republic of China |
| PCA | Privy Council Appeal |
| Pt | Part |
| para(s) | paragraph(s) |
| RSC | Rules of the Supreme Court |
| r(r) | rule(s) |
| reg(s) | regulation(s) |
| s(s) | section(s) |
| sub-s(s) | subsection(s) |
| Sch | Schedule |
| UN | United Nations |
| Uncitral | United Nations Commission on International Trade Law |
| VP(P) | Vice-President(s) |
| WCC | Workers' Compensation Case |

List of abbreviations of law reports:

| | |
|------------|--|
| AC | Law Reports, Appeal Cases (HL and PC); since 1890 |
| All ER | All England Law Reports; since 1936 |
| All ER Rep | All England Law Reports Reprint |
| App Cas | Law Reports, Appeal Cases, House of Lords, 15 volumes; 1875–1890 |
| Build LR | Building Law Reports |
| BLR | Business Law Review |
| CB(NS) | Common Bench, New Series; 1856–1865 |
| CCC | Canadian Criminal Cases |
| Ch | Law Reports, Chancery Division; since 1890 |
| Ch D | Law Reports, Chancery Division, 45 volumes; 1875–1890 |
| CLR | Commonwealth Law Reports; since 1903 |
| CPD | Common Pleas Division; 1875–1880 |
| Cr App R | Criminal Appeal Reports (HL and CA(UK)); since 1908 |
| Crim LR | Criminal Law Review; since 1954 |
| DLR | Dominion Law Reports; since 1912 |
| EG | Estates Gazette; since 1858 |
| F 2d | Federal Reporter, second series (USA); since 1924 |
| F & F | Foster & Finlayson; 1858–1867 |
| Fam | Family Division; since 1971 |
| FSR | Fleet Street Patent Law Reports, since 1963 |
| H & N | Huristone & Norman, 7 volumes; 1856–1862 |
| Hare | Hare, 11 volumes; 1841–1853 |
| HKC | Hong Kong Cases |
| HKDCLR | Hong Kong District Court Law Reports |
| HKLR | Hong Kong Law Reports |
| HKLTLR | Hong Kong Lands Tribunal Law Reports |
| HL Cas | House of Lords Cases, 11 volumes; 1847–1866 |
| ICR | Industrial Cases Reports; since 1972 |

Abbreviations

| | |
|-------------|---|
| IR | Irish Reports; since 1838 |
| ITR | Industrial Tribunal Reports; since 1966 |
| KB | King's Bench |
| LJMC | Law Journal, Magistrates Cases; 1831–1896 |
| LR | Law Reports First Series; since 1865 |
| LR CP | Common Pleas Cases, 10 volumes; 1865–1875 |
| LR Eq | Equity cases, 20 volumes; 1866–1875 |
| LR Exch | Exchequer Cases; 10 volumes; 1865–1875 |
| LI LR | Lloyd's List Law Reports; 1919–1950 |
| Lloyd's Rep | Lloyd's List Law Reports; since 1951 |
| My & Cr | Mylne & Craig, 5 volumes; 1835–1841 |
| NE | North Eastern Reporter (USA); 1885–1936 |
| NI | Northern Ireland Law Reports; since 1925 |
| NZLR | New Zealand Law Reports; since 1883 |
| QB | Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1891–1900, and since 1952 |
| QB | Queen's Bench Reports (Adolphus and Ellis, New Series), 18 volumes; 1841–1852 |
| QBD | Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1875–1890 |
| RPC | Reports of Patent Cases; since 1884 |
| RRC | Ryde's Rating Cases; since 1956 |
| RTR | Road Traffic Reports; since 1970 |
| Sch & Lef | Schoales & Lefroy (Ir); 1802–1806 |
| Sel Cas Ch | Select Cases in Chancery, 1 volume; 1724–1733 |
| Sim & St | Simons and Stuart's Reports, Chancery, 2 volumes; 1822–1826 |
| VR | Victorian Reports; since 1957 |
| WLR | Weekly Law Reports; since 1953 |
| WN | Weekly Notes (Reports); 1866–1952 |

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

The mode of citation of cases reported in this volume of *Hong Kong Cases* is [1986] HKC (page).

| | Page | | Page |
|----------------------------------|------|-----------------------------------|------|
| A | | Chan Dai Shing; Leung | |
| Andros, The [CA] | 277 | Hei v [HC] | 340 |
| Attorney General v Chan | | Chan Hon Piu; R v [HC] | 422 |
| Lee Kong [CA] | 310 | Chan Lee Kong; Attorney | |
| Attorney General v Chan | | General v [CA] | 310 |
| Wing Sheung [HC] | 648 | Chan Ping & Anor; R v [CA] | 414 |
| Attorney General v Fung | | Chan Ting Wai (t/a Wing Tai | |
| Si Tsou [CA] | 567 | International Co (HK)) v | |
| Attorney General v Li | | Both Good Co [CA] | 375 |
| Hok Ting [CA] | 105 | Chan Wai Hung; R v [HC] | 26 |
| Attorney General v Liu Ching | | Chan Wing Sheung; Attorney | |
| Sun t/a Sun Lee Aircondition | | General v [HC] | 648 |
| Co [HC] | 302 | Chan Yip Kan; R v [CA] | 35 |
| Attorney General v Ng | | Chan Yu Wai Ming v Chan | |
| Enterprises Ltd [HC] | 484 | Cheak Wing Raymond [HC] | 16 |
| Attorney General v Snen Bao | | Chan Yuet Hung & Anor; | |
| Charng [HC] | 85 | R v [CA] | 290 |
| Attorney General v Tse Hung | | Chau Sau Suen; Chow Hak | |
| Lit & Anor [PC] | 294 | Sing v [HC] | 133 |
| Attorney General; TS Cheng | | Cheng Cheung Wang v Lo | |
| & Sons Ltd v [HC] | 607 | Noi Yung & Ors [CA] | 329 |
| Attorney General; Yau Fook | | Cheng Ching Kwong & Anor; | |
| Hong Co Ltd v [PC] | 502 | R v [CA] | 109 |
| Attorney General & Anor v | | Cheng Pak Yan & Anor; | |
| Humphreys Estate (Queen's | | Wui Yip Asphalt Co v [HC] | 487 |
| Gardens) Ltd [PC] | 592 | Cheung Chi Keung; R v [HC] | 653 |
| B | | Cheung Donald & Ors; Fester | |
| Berthier Godown Ltd v E Wah | | Corp Ltd & Ors v [CA] | 458 |
| Realty Ltd & Anor [HC] | 8 | Cheung Yuk Sai v Director of | |
| Both Good Co; Chan Ting Wai | | Immigration [CA] | 205 |
| (t/a Wing Tai International | | Chiu Ming Sun v Ma Wing | |
| Co (HK)) v [CA] | 375 | Michael & Ors [HC] | 217 |
| C | | Cho Campo Juan En Kui | |
| Centro-Sound Ltd; Li Lai Fun | | & Ors; R v [CA] | 636 |
| & Ors v [HC] | 541 | Chow Cheuk Kin; R v [CA] | 548 |
| Champion Dragon Development | | Chow Hak Sing v Chau Sau | |
| Ltd; Toppan Printing | | Suen [HC] | 133 |
| Co Ltd v [HC] | 371 | Chow Ng Lau & Anor; R v [HC] | 518 |
| Chan Cheak Wing Raymond; | | Chow Shu Sun; Chow So | |
| Chan Yu Wai Ming v [HC] | 16 | Kam Lin v [CA] | 72 |
| Chan Cho Nam & Anor; R v .. [CA] | 603 | Chow So Kam Lin v Chow | |
| Chan Chun Man; R v [CA] | 261 | Shu Sun [CA] | 72 |

Hong Kong Cases

| | Page |
|--|------|
| Chung Pun v Hsin Chong Construction Co Ltd & Ors .. [CA] | 454 |
| Citibank NA v Lai Tat Cheung & Anor [HC] | 155 |
| Collin Navigation Co SA v Perusahaan Pertambangan Minyak Dan Gas Bumi Negara (Pertamina) [CA] | 78 |
| Collin Navigation SA & Ors v Perusahaan Pertambangan Minyak Dan Gas Bumi Negara (Pertamina) [HC] | 584 |
| Commissioner of Rating & Valuation; Wong Tak Woon v [LT] | 190 |
| Commissioner of Rating and Valuation; HongKong Canton Export Co Ltd v [LT] | 41 |
| Computer Land Ltd v Registrar of Companies & Anor [HC] | 49 |
| Computerland Corp v Yew Seng Computer (HK) Ltd [HC] | 494 |
| D | |
| Director of Immigration; Cheung Yuk Sai v [CA] | 205 |
| E | |
| E Wah Realty Ltd & Anor; Berthier Godown Ltd v [HC] | 8 |
| Eng Bouy; R v [CA] | 427 |
| European Asian Bank AG v Reicar Investments Ltd & Ors [HC] | 350 |
| F | |
| Fan Ping Sun; R v [CA] | 358 |
| Fan Siu Man; R v [HC] | 474 |
| Fester Corp Ltd & Ors v Cheung Donald & Ors [CA] | 458 |
| Fok Shin Yee Cynthia & Ors v Wong Kimball & Ors [CA] | 175 |
| Foreign Exchange & Investment Ltd v Liu Chong Hing Bank Ltd [CA] | 146 |
| Fuleekoo Co Ltd v Spiral Tubes International Ltd [CA] | 269 |
| Fung Chi Wah; Li Hing Wan v [CA] | 333 |

| | Page |
|--|------|
| Fung Si Tsou; Attorney General v [CA] | 567 |
| G | |
| GTE Directories (HK) Ltd v Ng Ping Lun & Ors [DC] | 390 |
| Gilman Engineering Ltd v Ho Shek On Simon [HC] | 523 |
| Golden Harvest Co v JW International Co (a firm) [HC] | 118 |
| H | |
| Ho Shek On Simon; Gilman Engineering Ltd v [HC] | 523 |
| Hong Kong Industrial and Commercial Bank Ltd v Wong Siu Leung Tommy & Ors [CA] | 101 |
| Hong Kong Shanghai (Shipping) Ltd; MCY Finance Ltd SA & Ors v [HC] | 323 |
| HongKong Canton Export Co Ltd v Commissioner of Rating and Valuation [LT] | 41 |
| Hsin Chong Construction Co Ltd & Ors; Chung Pun v [CA] | 454 |
| Hsin Chong Construction Co Ltd v Yaton Realty Co Ltd .. [HC] | 406 |
| Humphreys Estate (Queen's Gardens) Ltd; Attorney General & Anor v [PC] | 592 |
| I | |
| Ip Kar Sui & Anor; R v [CA] | 430 |
| J | |
| JW International Co (a firm); Golden Harvest Co v [HC] | 118 |
| Jentech Ltd & Anor; North Way Industrial Ltd v [HC] | 443 |
| K | |
| Kao Yu Kuei; Kincheng Banking Corp v [CA] | 212 |
| Kincheng Banking Corp v Kao Yu Kuei [CA] | 212 |
| King's Dyeing & Weaving Factory Ltd (No 2), Re [HC] | 621 |
| King's Dyeing and Weaving Factory Ltd (No 1), Re [HC] | 382 |

Table of Cases Reported

| | Page | | Page |
|--|----------|--|----------|
| Kwan Ngar Yin; World Realty Ltd v | [HC] 508 | Lim Yiong Lin; New Japan Securities International (HK) Ltd v | [HC] 435 |
| Kwong Lung Co Ltd; R v | [HC] 199 | Liu Ching Sun t/a Sun Lee Aircondition Co; Attorney General v | [HC] 302 |
| L | | Liu Chong Hing Bank Ltd & Ors; Tai Hing Cotton Mill Ltd v (No 2) | [PC] 20 |
| Lai Tai Kwong; R v | [HC] 432 | Liu Chong Hing Bank Ltd; Foreign Exchange & Investment Ltd v | [CA] 146 |
| Lai Tat Cheung & Anor; Citibank NA v | [HC] 155 | Liu Man Bun & Anor v Li Yek Leung | [CA] 183 |
| Lam Chi Wai; R v | [CA] 240 | Lo Noi Yung & Ors; Cheng Cheung Wang v | [CA] 329 |
| Lau Ming (t/a Hong Kong Packets Corp), ex p Sin Hua Trust, Savings and Commercial Bank Ltd | [HC] 387 | Loh & Co; Survival Technology v | [CA] 64 |
| Lee Fung Hing; R v | [HC] 244 | Loke Girdly; R v | [CA] 209 |
| Lee Kam Chuen; R v | [CA] 1 | Longo Construction Ltd & Anor; Wong Kwok Chiang & Ors v | [HC] 362 |
| Lee Siu Cheung; R v | [CA] 656 | M | |
| Lee Yau Cheung v Leto King Tung & Ors (t/a Tung Lee Building Construction Co (a firm)) & Anor | [HC] 246 | MCY Finance Ltd SA & Ors v Hong Kong Shanghai (Shipping) Ltd | [HC] 323 |
| Len Shing Construction Co Ltd & Ors; Yeung Kam Fuk v | [HC] 160 | Ma Wing Michael & Ors; Chiu Ming Sun | [HC] 217 |
| Leto King Tung & Ors (t/a Tung Lee Building Construction Co (a firm)) & Anor; Lee Yau Cheung v | [HC] 246 | Middle East Finance International Ltd (No 2); Sujanani v | [CA] 93 |
| Leung Hei v Chan Dai Shing.. | [HC] 340 | Mo Choi & Anor (Pacific Insurance Co Ltd, third party); Tam Hing Wah & Anor v | [HC] 553 |
| Leung Wing Yin; Yu Tai Hing Land Agency Ltd v | [CA] 574 | N | |
| Li & Fung (Trading) Ltd v Wing Hing (Tangs) Fabrics Manufacturing Co Ltd | [HC] 627 | New Japan Securities International (HK) Ltd v Lim Yiong Lin | [HC] 435 |
| Li Hing Wan v Fung Chi Wah | [CA] 333 | Ng Enterprises Ltd; Attorney General v | [HC] 484 |
| Li Hok Ting; Attorney General v | [CA] 105 | Ng Ping Lun & Ors; GTE Directories (HK) Ltd v | [DC] 390 |
| Li Keung Tak; R v | [HC] 69 | Ng Wai Yuen & Anor; R v | [HC] 30 |
| Li Kwai; R v | [DC] 125 | North Way Industrial Ltd v Jentech Ltd & Anor | [HC] 443 |
| Li Lai Fun & Ors v Centro-Sound Ltd | [HC] 541 | P | |
| Li Yee Chung; R v | [CA] 336 | Pang Cheung So; Yau Fook Hong Co Ltd & Ors v | [CA] 313 |
| Li Yek Leung; Liu Man Bun & Anor v | [CA] 183 | | |
| Like Soon Co Ltd v Tsai Kut Kan & Ors | [CA] 142 | | |

| | Page | | Page |
|--|------|---|------|
| Perusahaan Pertambangan Minyak Dan Gas Bumi Negara (Pertamina); Collin Navigation Co SA v [CA] | 78 | Reicar Investments Ltd & Ors; European Asian Bank AG v [HC] | 350 |
| Perusahaan Pertambangan Minyak Dan Gas Bumi Negara (Pertamina); Collin Navigation SA & Ors v [HC] | 584 | S | |
| R | | Shu Jaan Chang; R v [HC] | 284 |
| R v Chan Cho Nam & Anor ... [CA] | 603 | Sin Hua Trust, Savings and Commercial Bank Ltd, ex p; Lau Ming (t/a Hong Kong Packets Corp) [HC] | 387 |
| R v Chan Chun Man [CA] | 261 | Snen Bao Charn; Attorney General v [HC] | 85 |
| R v Chan Hon Piu [HC] | 422 | Spiral Tubes International Ltd; Fuleekoo Co Ltd v [CA] | 269 |
| R v Chan Ping & Anor [CA] | 414 | Sujanani v Middle East Finance International Ltd (No 2) [CA] | 93 |
| R v Chan Wai Hung [HC] | 26 | Survival Technology v Loh & Co [CA] | 64 |
| R v Chan Yip Kan [CA] | 35 | T | |
| R v Chan Yuet Hung & Anor [CA] | 290 | TS Cheng & Sons Ltd v Attorney General [HC] | 607 |
| R v Cheng Ching Kwong & Anor [CA] | 109 | Tai Hing Cotton Mill Ltd v Liu Chong Hing Bank Ltd & Ors (No 2) [PC] | 20 |
| R v Cheung Chi Keung [HC] | 653 | Tam Hing Wah & Anor v Mo Choi & Anor (Pacific Insurance Co Ltd, third party) [HC] | 553 |
| R v Cho Campo Juan En Kui & Ors [CA] | 636 | Texuna International Ltd; Wocom Commodities Ltd v [CA] | 392 |
| R v Chow Cheuk Kin [CA] | 548 | Toppan Printing Co Ltd v Champion Dragon Development Ltd [HC] | 371 |
| R v Chow Ng Lau & Anor [HC] | 518 | Trishul (UK) Ltd v Winnie Fung Tong (t/a Winda Product) [HC] | 465 |
| R v Eng Bouy [CA] | 427 | Tsai Kut Kan & Ors; Like Soon Co Ltd v [CA] | 142 |
| R v Fan Ping Sun [CA] | 358 | Tsang Hau Chung & Anor; Yue Pei Mei v [LT] | 257 |
| R v Fan Siu Man [HC] | 474 | Tse Hung Lit & Anor; Attorney General v [PC] | 294 |
| R v Ip Kar Sui & Anor [CA] | 430 | W | |
| R v Kwong Lung Co Ltd [HC] | 199 | Wan Ying Lam & Anor; Wayfoong Credit Ltd v [HC] | 75 |
| R v Lai Tai Kwong [HC] | 432 | | |
| R v Lam Chi Wai [CA] | 240 | | |
| R v Lee Fung Hing [HC] | 244 | | |
| R v Lee Kam Chuen [CA] | 1 | | |
| R v Lee Siu Cheung [CA] | 656 | | |
| R v Li Keung Tak [HC] | 69 | | |
| R v Li Kwai [DC] | 125 | | |
| R v Li Yee Chung [CA] | 336 | | |
| R v Loke Girdly [CA] | 209 | | |
| R v Ng Wai Yuen & Anor [HC] | 30 | | |
| R v Shu Jaan Chang [HC] | 284 | | |
| Registrar of Companies & Anor; Computer Land Ltd v [HC] | 49 | | |

Table of Cases Reported

| | Page | | Page |
|--|------|--|------|
| Wayfoong Credit Ltd v Wan Ying Lam & Anor [HC] | 75 | World Realty Ltd v Kwan Ngar Yin [HC] | 508 |
| Wing Hing (Tangs) Fabrics Manufacturing Co Ltd; Li & Fung (Trading) Ltd v [HC] | 627 | Wui Yip Asphalt Co v Cheng Pak Yan & Anor [HC] | 487 |
| Winnie Fung Tong (t/a Winda Product); Trishul (UK) Ltd v [HC] | 465 | | |
| Wocom Commodities Ltd v Texuna International Ltd ... [CA] | 392 | Y | |
| Wong Kimball & Ors; Fok Shin Yee Cynthia & Ors v [CA] | 175 | Yaton Realty Co Ltd; Hsin Chong Construction Co Ltd v [HC] | 406 |
| Wong Kwok Chiang & Ors v Longo Construction Ltd & Anor [HC] | 362 | Yau Fook Hong Co Ltd & Ors v Pang Cheung So [CA] | 313 |
| Wong Pe Wun & Ors; Yu Jing Jenn v [HC] | 624 | Yau Fook Hong Co Ltd v Attorney General [PC] | 502 |
| Wong Siu Leung Tommy & Ors; Hong Kong Industrial and Commercial Bank Ltd v [CA] | 101 | Yeung Kam Fuk v Len Shing Construction Co Ltd & Ors .. [HC] | 160 |
| Wong Tak Woon v Commissioner of Rating & Valuation [LT] | 190 | Yeung Yu, ex parte; Re Wong Yung [HC] | 5 |
| Wong Yung, Re, ex parte Yeung Yu [HC] | 5 | Yew Seng Computer (HK) Ltd; Computerland Corp v [HC] | 494 |
| | | Yu Jing Jenn v Wong Pe Wun & Ors [HC] | 624 |
| | | Yu Tai Hing Land Agency Ltd v Leung Wing Yin [CA] | 574 |
| | | Yue Pei Mei v Tsang Hau Chung & Anor [LT] | 257 |

SUBJECT INDEX

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

Bias

Judge's friendship with party to action – Whether judge should disqualify himself – Test

Fester Corp Ltd & Ors v Cheung Donald & Ors CA 458

Judicial review

Immigration Appeals Tribunal – Removal order – Delegation of duties by Director to a 'specified officer' – Whether applicant had prospect of success – Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap 1) s 43 – Immigration Ordinance (Cap 115) s 53C

Cheung Yuk Sai v Director of Immigration CA 205

Registrar of Companies – Permission for incorporation of companies – Name – Close resemblance with existing company – Intent to deceive – Passing-off – Legislation declaratory of common law – Reasonableness – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) ss 20(1)(a), 337B

Computer Land Ltd v Registrar of Companies & Anor HC 49

AGENCY

Liability of principal

Fraudulent misrepresentation by agent – Authority of agent – Express – Implied – Whether injured party misguided to believe in agent

Wocom Commodities Ltd v Texuna International Ltd CA 392

ARBITRATION

Interim injunction

Power of court – No need for separate action – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) s 14(6)(h)

Hsin Chong Construction Co Ltd v Yaton Realty Co Ltd HC 406

BANKING AND FINANCE

'Letter of authority'

Assignment by way of charge – Notice of prior charge – Whether finance company had notice of bank's interest under letter of authority – Whether 'confirmation' issued by finance company amounted to notice of charge

Foreign Exchange & Investment Ltd v Liu Chong Hing Bank Ltd CA 146

Moneylenders

Loans rolled over – Interest on loans accrued but unpaid – Whether compound interest – Whether enforceable – Money Lenders Ordinance (Cap 163) ss 18 & 22

New Japan Securities International (HK) Ltd v Lim Yiong Lin HC 435

Margin account – Primary business that of stock-broking – Loans made in ordinary course of that business – Whether loans exempted – Money Lenders Ordinance (Cap 163) s 22 & First Schedule, Pt II, para 5

New Japan Securities International (HK) Ltd v Lim Yiong Lin HC 435

BANKRUPTCY

Bankruptcy notice

Bankruptcy notice based upon judgment against deceased's estate – Administratrixes had sold and transferred assets of estate out of jurisdiction – Whether amounted to act of bankruptcy – Whether administratrixes were personally liable

Re Wong Yung, ex parte Yeung Yu HC 5

Whether bankruptcy notice incurably bad because founded on two judgment debts – Injustice suffered by debtor – Whether relevant – Bankruptcy Ordinance (Cap 6) s 4

Lau Ming (t/a Hong Kong Packets Corp), ex p Sin Hua Trust, Savings and Commercial Bank Ltd HC 387

Dismissal of petition

Lack of present or future assets – 15% rule – General principles – Public interest – Bankruptcy Ordinance (Cap 6) s 9(3)

Sujanani v Middle East Finance International Ltd (No 2) CA 93

BILLS OF EXCHANGE AND OTHER NEGOTIABLE INSTRUMENTS

Cheques

Indorsement – Whether person signed as indorser of cheques – Whether intention to become party to cheques – Whether cheques presented prematurely – Whether defendant a 'backer' of cheque – Whether consideration passed – Bills of Exchange Ordinance (Cap 19) ss 28, 56

Chow Hak Sing v Chau Sau Suen HC 133

Letters of credit

Restraining payment by bank – Whether sufficient evidence of clear fraud

North Way Industrial Ltd v Jentech Ltd & Anor HC 443

BRIBERY AND CORRUPTION

Time bar

'Complaint being made or information laid' – Complaint must be made to or information laid before court – Complaint to investigating authorities insufficient – Time bar cannot be avoided by convicting on alternative charge – Prevention of Bribery Ordinance (Cap 201) s 31A

Attorney General v Fung Si Tsou CA 567

Trial

Discretion of trial judge – Whether leave should have been given to amend particulars of offences – Whether witness given immunity ought to have been recalled for cross-examination by defence – Whether statutory presumption correctly considered and applied – Prevention of Bribery Ordinance (Cap 201) ss 25, 32

Attorney General v Fung Si Tsou CA 567

CIVIL PROCEDURE

Abuse of process

Estoppel – Vesting order made in earlier proceedings – Party seeking to raise new matter contradictory to assumption behind vesting order proceedings in separate proceedings – Whether separate proceedings an abuse of process – Rules of the Supreme Court O 18 r 19

Berthier Godown Ltd v E Wah Realty Ltd & Anor HC 8

Appeal

Interim order – Whether appeal can be brought from an order made expressly on an interim basis

Cheng Cheung Wang v Lo Noi Yung & Ors CA 329

Application to amend statement of claim

Claim in writ not incorporated in statement of claim – Whether delay or prejudice

Collin Navigation SA & Ors v Perusahaan Pertambangan Minyak Dan Gas Bumi Negara (Pertamina) HC 584

Contractual claim for costs

Nature of claim – Whether it was a claim in the nature of damages – Whether considered an unliquidated claim

GTE Directories (HK) Ltd v Ng Ping Lun & Ors DC 390

Costs

Meaning of ‘costs to follow the event’ – Whether means outcome of litigation rather than interlocutory appeal – Whether inconsistent for word ‘event’ to have different meanings in different contexts – ‘Costs in any event’

Like Soon Co Ltd v Tsai Kut Kan & Ors CA 142

Privy Council appeal – Whether travelling expenses of Hong Kong counsel allowable – Jurisdiction of Registrars in Hong Kong and Privy Council with regard to costs incurred in two countries – Hong Kong (Appeal to Privy Council) Order in Council of 10 August 1909 r 25 – Judicial Committee (General Appellate Jurisdiction) Rules Order 1982, Sch 2, r 76

Tai Hing Cotton Mill Ltd v Liu Chong Hing Bank Ltd (No 2) PC 20

Default judgment

District Court – Application to be made to Registrar unless mixed claim – District Judge has no jurisdiction to entertain default judgment where mixed claim – District Court Civil Procedure (General) Rules r 22

GTE Directories (HK) Ltd v Ng Ping Lun & Ors DC 390

Examination of judgment debtor

Examination of ‘officer’ of company – Whether includes officer who has resigned – Rules of the Supreme Court O 48 r 1

Toppan Printing Co Ltd v Champion Dragon Development Ltd HC 371

Mareva injunction

Whether good arguable case – Injunction sought pending arbitration – Whether sufficient to exhibit pleadings only – Burden not discharged – No need for separate action – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) s 14(6)(h)

Hsin Chong Construction Co Ltd v Yaton Realty Co Ltd HC 406

Parties

Whether 'individual' included a body corporate – Rules of the Supreme Court O 81 r 9

Survival Technology v Loh & Co CA 64

Pleadings

Striking out – Action frivolous, vexatious and an abuse of the process of the court – Previous actions based on substantially the same circumstances and transactions – Rules of the Supreme Court (Cap 4) O 18 r 19

Chiu Ming Sun v Ma Wing Michael & Ors HC 217

Proceedings begun by originating summons

Whether there were genuine issues of fact — Whether proceedings should have been allowed to go to trial — Claim for moneys due under mortgage on land — Whether plaintiff had notice of irregularities

European Asian Bank AG v Reicar Investments Ltd & Ors HC 350

Prohibition order

Application for fresh order – Whether justified in making application – Supreme Court Ordinance (Cap 4) s 21B

Hong Kong Industrial and Commercial Bank Ltd v Wong Siu Leung Tommy & Ors CA 101

Security for costs

Power of court to make costs order against legal aided persons – Whether respondent financially prejudiced as against legal aided persons – Legal Aid Ordinance (Cap 91) ss 16C(1)(a)(ii), (1)(b)(i), 19 – Rules of the Supreme Court O 59 r 10(5)

Li Hing Wan v Fung Chi Wah CA 333

Service of process

Whether defendant had place of business in Hong Kong – Relevant test – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 341 – Rules of the Supreme Court O 11

MCY Finance Ltd SA v Hong Kong Shanghai (Shipping) Ltd HC 323

Service of writ out of jurisdiction

Setting aside – Whether good arguable case – Whether claim brought in second action barred by reason of cause of action estoppel or issue estoppel – Whether second action vexatious – Rules of the Supreme Court O 12 r 8

Collin Navigation Co SA v Perusahaan Pertambangan Minyak Dan Gas Bumi Negara (Pertamina) CA 78

Striking out

Originating summons seeking injunction restraining use of documents – Information obtained as result of Anton Piller order in earlier action – Whether vexatious and abuse of process of court

Computerland Corp v Yew Seng Computer (HK) Ltd HC 494

Summary judgment

Rescission of agreement for sale of property – Scope of O 86 of Rules of the Supreme Court – Whether weight should be attached to ‘etc’ appearing in heading of O 86 – Whether scope of word ‘rescission’ restricted – Rules of the Supreme Court O 86 r 1(1)

Yau Fook Hong Co Ltd & Ors v Pang Cheung So CA 313

Third party claim

Judgment by consent between plaintiffs and defendants – No trial of issues between plaintiffs and defendants – Defendants raising issue inconsistent with admission in defence to main claim in third party proceedings – Whether res judicata – Whether permissible

Tam Hing Wah & Anor v Mo Choi & Anor (Pacific Insurance Co Ltd, third party) HC 553

Trial

Interpretation – Duty of interpreter where party did not understand the language of the proceedings – Whether party entitled to relief

Chan Ting Wai (t/a Wing Tai International Co (HK)) v Both Good Co CA 375

COMPANIES AND CORPORATIONS

Directors

Powers – Whether including execution of mortgage – Whether resolution on mortgages passed by shareholders during EGM valid

European Asian Bank AG v Reicar Investments Ltd & Ors HC 350

Receiver

Powers – Whether includes power or duty to defend proceedings brought against company – Whether power in debenture deed to get in property and assets includes defending actions – Difference between interest of debenture holder and wider interests of company – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) ss 79, 265

Li Lai Fun & Ors v Centro-Sound Ltd HC 541

Registration of company name

Registrar of Companies – Close resemblance with existing company – Intent to deceive – Passing-off – Legislation declaratory of common law – Judicial review of Registrar’s decision – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) ss 20(1)(a), 337B

Computer Land Ltd v Registrar of Companies & Anor HC 49

Rights of shareholders

Right to vote at meetings – Whether right remained even if shareholder had given proxy to third party – Need to give notice to such shareholders

European Asian Bank AG v Reicar Investments Ltd & Ors HC 350