

CRITICISM

VOLUME

58

Poetry Criticism

Excerpts from Criticism of the Works of the Most Significant and Widely Studied Poets of World Literature

Volume 58

Lawrence J. Trudeav Project Editor

江苏工业学院图书馆 藏 书 章





Poetry Criticism, Vol. 58

Project Editor Lawrence J. Trudeau

Editorial

Jessica Bomarito, Kathy D. Darrow, Jeffrey Hunter, Jelena O. Krstović, Michelle Lee, Ellen McGeagh, Joseph Palmisano, Linda Pavlovski, Thomas J. Schoenberg, Russel Whitaker **Data Capture**

Francis Monroe, Gwen Tucker

Indexing Services

Synapse, the Knowledge Link Corporation

Rights and Acquisitions

Imaging and Multimedia

Dean Dauphinais, Leitha Etheridge-Sims, Lezlie Light, Dan Newell Composition and Electronic Capture Kathy Sauer

Manufacturing

Rhonda Williams

Product Manager Janet Witalec

© 2005 Thomson Gale, a part of The Thomson Corporation. Thomson and Star Logo are trademarks and Gale is a registered trademark used herein under license.

For more information, contact Thomson Gale 27500 Drake Rd. Farmington Hills, MI 48331-3535 Or you can visit our internet site at http://www.gale.com

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

No part of this work covered by the copyright herein may be reproduced or used in any form or by any means—graphic, electronic, or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, taping, Web distribution, or information storage retrieval systems—without the written permission of the publisher.

This publication is a creative work fully protected by all applicable copyright laws, as well as by misappropriation, trade secret, unfair competition, and other applicable laws. The authors and editors of this work have added value to the underlying factual material herein through one or more of the following: unique and original selection, coordination, expression, arrangement, and classification of the information.

For permission to use material from the product, submit your request via the Web at http://www.gale-edit.com/permissions, or you may download our Permissions Request form and submit your request by fax or mail to:

Permissions Department
Thomson Gale
27500 Drake Rd.
Farmington Hills, MI 48331-3535
Permissions Hotline:
248-699-8006 or 800-877-4253, ext. 8006
Fax 248-699-8074 or 800-762-4058

Since this page cannot legibly accommodate all copyright notices, the acknowledgments constitute an extension of the copyright notice

While every effort has been made to secure permission to reprint material and to ensure the reliability of the information presented in this publication, Thomson Gale neither guarantees the accuracy of the data contained herein nor assumes any responsibility for errors, omissions or discrepancies. Thomson Gale accepts no payment for listing; and inclusion in the publication of any organization, agency, institution, publication, service, or individual does not imply endorsement of the editors or publisher. Errors brought to the attention of the publisher and verified to the satisfaction of the publisher will be corrected in future editions.

LIBRARY OF CONGRESS CATALOG CARD NUMBER 91-118494

ISBN 0-7876-8692-1 ISSN 1052-4851

Printed in the United States of America 10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Preface

Poetry Criticism (PC) presents significant criticism of the world's greatest poets and provides supplementary biographical and bibliographical material to guide the interested reader to a greater understanding of the genre and its creators. Although major poets and literary movements are covered in such Gale Literary Criticism series as Contemporary Literary Criticism (CLC), Twentieth-Century Literary Criticism (TCLC), Nineteenth-Century Literature Criticism (NCLC), Literature Criticism from 1400 to 1800 (LC), and Classical and Medieval Literature Criticism (CMLC), PC offers more focused attention on poetry than is possible in the broader, survey-oriented entries on writers in these Thomson Gale series. Students, teachers, librarians, and researchers will find that the generous excerpts and supplementary material provided by PC supply them with the vital information needed to write a term paper on poetic technique, to examine a poet's most prominent themes, or to lead a poetry discussion group.

Scope of the Series

PC is designed to serve as an introduction to major poets of all eras and nationalities. Since these authors have inspired a great deal of relevant critical material, PC is necessarily selective, and the editors have chosen the most important published criticism to aid readers and students in their research. Each author entry presents a historical survey of the critical response to that author's work. The length of an entry is intended to reflect the amount of critical attention the author has received from critics writing in English and from foreign critics in translation. Every attempt has been made to identify and include the most significant essays on each author's work. In order to provide these important critical pieces, the editors sometimes reprint essays that have appeared elsewhere in Thomson Gale's Literary Criticism Series. Such duplication, however, never exceeds twenty percent of a PC volume.

Organization of the Book

Each PC entry consists of the following elements:

- The Author Heading cites the name under which the author most commonly wrote, followed by birth and death dates. Also located here are any name variations under which an author wrote, including transliterated forms for authors whose native languages use nonroman alphabets. If the author wrote consistently under a pseudonym, the pseudonym will be listed in the author heading and the author's actual name given in parenthesis on the first line of the biographical and critical introduction. Uncertain birth or death dates are indicated by question marks. Singlework entries are preceded by the title of the work and its date of publication.
- The **Introduction** contains background information that introduces the reader to the author and the critical debates surrounding his or her work.
- A **Portrait of the Author** is included when available.
- The list of **Principal Works** is ordered chronologically by date of first publication and lists the most important works by the author. The first section comprises poetry collections and book-length poems. The second section gives information on other major works by the author. For foreign authors, the editors have provided original foreign-language publication information and have selected what are considered the best and most complete English-language editions of their works.
- Reprinted Criticism is arranged chronologically in each entry to provide a useful perspective on changes in critical evaluation over time. All individual titles of poems and poetry collections by the author featured in the entry are printed in boldface type. The critic's name and the date of composition or publication of the critical work are given at the beginning of each piece of criticism. Unsigned criticism is preceded by the title of the source in which it appeared. Footnotes are reprinted at the end of each essay or excerpt. In the case of excerpted criticism, only those footnotes that pertain to the excerpted texts are included.

- Critical essays are prefaced by brief Annotations explicating each piece.
- A complete **Bibliographical Citation** of the original essay or book precedes each piece of criticism.
- An annotated bibliography of Further Reading appears at the end of each entry and suggests resources for additional study. In some cases, significant essays for which the editors could not obtain reprint rights are included here. Boxed material following the further reading list provides references to other biographical and critical sources on the author in series published by Thomson Gale.

Cumulative Indexes

A Cumulative Author Index lists all of the authors that appear in a wide variety of reference sources published by Thomson Gale, including PC. A complete list of these sources is found facing the first page of the Author Index. The index also includes birth and death dates and cross references between pseudonyms and actual names.

A Cumulative Nationality Index lists all authors featured in PC by nationality, followed by the number of the PC volume in which their entry appears.

A Cumulative Title Index lists in alphabetical order all individual poems, book-length poems, and collection titles contained in the PC series. Titles of poetry collections and separately published poems are printed in italics, while titles of individual poems are printed in roman type with quotation marks. Each title is followed by the author's last name and corresponding volume and page numbers where commentary on the work is located. English-language translations of original foreign-language titles are cross-referenced to the foreign titles so that all references to discussion of a work are combined in one listing.

Citing Poetry Criticism

When writing papers, students who quote directly from any volume in the Literary Criticism Series may use the following general format to footnote reprinted criticism. The first example pertains to material drawn from periodicals, the second to material reprinted from books.

Sylvia Kasey Marks, "A Brief Glance at George Eliot's *The Spanish Gypsy*," *Victorian Poetry* 20, no. 2 (Summer 1983), 184-90; reprinted in *Poetry Criticism*, vol. 20, ed. Ellen McGeagh (Detroit: The Gale Group), 128-31.

Linden Peach, "Man, Nature and Wordsworth: American Versions," *British Influence on the Birth of American Literature*, (Macmillan Press Ltd., 1982), 29-57; reprinted in *Poetry Criticism*, vol. 20, ed. Ellen McGeagh (Detroit: The Gale Group), 37-40.

Suggestions are Welcome

Readers who wish to suggest new features, topics, or authors to appear in future volumes, or who have other suggestions or comments are cordially invited to call, write, or fax the Product Manager:

Product Manager, Literary Criticism Series
Thomson Gale
27500 Drake Road
Farmington Hills, MI 48331-3535
1-800-347-4253 (GALE)

Fax: 248-699-8054

Acknowledgments

The editors wish to thank the copyright holders of the criticism included in this volume and the permissions managers of many book and magazine publishing companies for assisting us in securing reproduction rights. We are also grateful to the staffs of the Detroit Public Library, the Library of Congress, the University of Detroit Mercy Library, Wayne State University Purdy/Kresge Library Complex, and the University of Michigan Libraries for making their resources available to us. Following is a list of the copyright holders who have granted us permission to reproduce material in this volume of *PC*. Every effort has been made to trace copyright, but if omissions have been made, please let us know.

COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL IN *PC*, VOLUME 58, WAS REPRODUCED FROM THE FOLLOWING PERIODICALS:

Bucknell Review, v. XXXVIII, 1994 for "An Origin Like Water": The Poetry of Eavan Boland and Modernist Critiques of Irish Literature" by Ann Owens Weekes. Edited by John S. Rickard. Copyright © 1994 by Associated University Presses, Inc. Reproduced by permission.—Chaucer Review, v. 4, 1970; v. 13, summer, 1978; v. 14, spring, 1980; v. 31, 1997; v. 32, 1997. Copyright © 1970, 1978, 1980, 1997 by The Pennsylvania State University. All reproduced by permission of the publisher.—Chicago Review, v. 17, 1964. Copyright © 1964 by Chicago Review. Reproduced by permission.—Colby Quarterly, v. XXXII, June, 1996; v. XXIII, December, 1997; v. XXXV, December, 1999; v. XXXVI, September, 2000; . XXXVII, December, 2001. Copyright © 1996, 1997, 1999, 2000, 2001 by Colby Quarterly. All reproduced by permission.—English Language Notes, v. 22, 1985; v. 25, March, 1988. Copyright © 1985, 1988 by Regents of the University of Colorado. All rights reserved. Both reproduced by permission.—Exemplaria, v. 5, March, 1993; v. 8, spring, 1996. Copyright © 1993, 1996 by Center for Medieval and Early Renaissance Studies, SUNY. Both reproduced by permission.— French Forum, v. 13, January, 1988. Copyright © The University of Nebraska Press, 1988. v. 19, May, 1994. Copyright © 1994 by French Forum. Both reproduced by permission of the University of Nebraska Press.—Explicator, v. 60, winter. 2002. Copyright © 2002 by Helen Dwight Reid Educational Foundation. Reproduced with permission of the Helen Dwight Reid Educational Foundation, published by Heldref Publications, 1319 18th Street, NW, Washington, DC 20036-1802.— L'Esprit Créateur, v. XXXII, summer, 1992; v. XXXVI, fall, 1996. Copyright © 1992, 1996 by L'Esprit Créateur. Both reproduced by permission.—Medium Aevum, v. 58, 1989. Copyright © 1989 by Society for the Study of Mediaeval Languages and Literature. All rights reserved. Reproduced by permission.—Mosaic, v. 33, September, 2000. Copyright © Mosaic 2000. Acknowledgment of previous publication is herewith made.—Neophilologus, v. 75, January, 1991 for "A Coverchief or a Calle': The Ultimate End of the Wife of Bath's Search for Sovereignty" by Colin A. Ireland. Reproduced by permission of the author. / v. 85, January, 2001. Copyright © 2001 by Kluwer Academic Publishers. Reproduced by permission of Kluwer Academic Publishers.—Orbis Litterarum, v. 41, 1986. Copyright © 1986 Munksgaard International Publishers, Ltd. Reproduced by permission of Blackwell Publishers.—P.N. Review, v. 18, January-February, 1992 for "Inside and Outside History" by Anne Stevenson, Copyright © 1992 by Poetry Nation Review. All rights reserved. Reproduced by permission of the author. / v. 25, January-February, 1999 for "A Certain Slant of Light" by David Ward. Copyright © 1999 by Poetry National Review. All rights reserved. Reproduced by permission of the author.—PMLA, v. 102, January, 1987. Copyright © 1987 by the Modern Language Association of America. Reproduced by permission of the Modern Language Association of America.—Poetry, v. CXXVIII, June, 1976 for "Stances on Love" by David Mus. Copyright © 1976 by the Modern Poetry Association. Reprinted in Mus, The Essays, Ateneo Roma, 1988, Reproduced by permission of the Editor of Poetry and the author.—Romance Notes, v. XIX, fall, 1978. Copyright © 1978 by Romance Notes. Reproduced by permission.—Southern Review, Louisiana State University, v. 35, spring, 1999 for "Ireland's Best" by Kate Daniels. Copyright © 1999 by Kate Daniels. Reproduced by permission of the author.—Studies in 20th Century Literature, v. 13, winter, 1989. Copyright © 1989 by Studies in 20th Century Literature. Reproduced by permission.— TriQuarterly, v. 54, spring, 1982 for "Talking about Writings through Finnegan's Wake" by John Cage and Richard Cory Kostelanetz. Copyright © 1982 by TriQuarterly, Northwestern University. Reproduced by permission of the respective authors.—Twentieth Century Literature, v. 37, winter, 1991. Copyright © 1992 by Hofstra University. Reproduced by permission.—Women: A Cultural Review, v. 8, spring, 1997. Copyright © 1997 by Oxford University Press. Reproduced by permission of Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group at http://www.tandf.co.uk/journals.—Women's Studies, v. 11, 1984. Copyright © 1984 by H. Marshall Leicester, Jr. / v. 15, 1988. Copyright © 1988 by Gordon and Breach, Science Publishers, Inc. Both reproduced by permission.

COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL IN PC, VOLUME 58, WAS REPRODUCED FROM THE FOLLOWING BOOKS:

Blamires, Alcuin, From "Refiguring the 'Scandalous Excess' of Medieval Woman: The Wife of Bath and Liberality," in Gender in Debate from the Early Middle Ages to the Renaissance (Series, The New Middle Ages). Edited by Thelma S. Fenster and Clare A. Lees. Palgrave, 2002. Copyright © 2002 by Thelma S. Fenster and Clare A. Lees. All rights reserved. Reproduced by permission of Palgrave Macmillan.—Caws, Mary Ann. From Yves Bonnefoy. Twayne Publishers, 1984. Copyright © 1984 by G. K. Hall & Co. Reproduced by permission of The Gale Group.—Conboy, Katie. From "Revisionist Cartography: The Politics of Place in Boland and Heaney," in Border Crossings: Irish Women Writers and National Identities, Edited by Kathryn Kirkpatrick. The University of Alabama Press, 2000. Copyright © 2000 by The University of Alabama Press. All rights reserved. Reproduced by permission.—Herwitz, Daniel. From "John Cage's Approach to the Global," in John Cage: Composed in America. Edited by Marjorie Perloff and Charles Junkerman. University of Chicago Press, 1994. Copyright © 1994 by University of Chicago. All rights reserved. Reproduced by permission.—Kostelanetz, Richard. From "Empty Words (1974-1975)," in John Cage (ex)plain(ed). Schirmer, 1996. Copyright © 1996 by Richard Kostelanetz. All rights reserved. Reproduced by permission of the author.—Perloff, Marjorie. From "The Music of Verbal Space: John Cage's 'What You Say …'," in Sound States: Innovative Poetics and Acoustical Technologies. Edited by Adalaide Morris. University of North Carolina Press, 1997. Copyright © 1997 by Marjorie Perloff. Used by permission of the publisher.—Perloff, Marjorie. From "Unimpededness and Interpenetration": The Poetic of John Cage," in A John Cage Reader: In Celebration of His 70th Birthday. Edited and compiled by Peter Gena and Jonathan Brent. C. F. Peters Corporation, 1982, Copyright © 1982 by C. F. Peters Corporation. All rights reserved. Reproduced by permission of the author.—Sabatini, Arthur J. From "Silent Performances: On Reading John Cage," in John Cage at Seventy-Five. Edited by Richard Fleming and William Duckworth. Bucknell University Press, 1989. Copyright © 1989 by Associated University Presses, Inc. All rights reserved. Reproduced by permission.—Treharne, Elaine. From "The Stereotype Confirmed? Chaucer's Wife of Bath," in Writing Gender and Genre in Medieval Literature: Approaches to Old and Middle English Texts. Edited by Elaine Treharne, D. S. Brewer, 2002. Copyright © 2002 by The English Association, All rights reserved. Reproduced by permission of Boydell & Brewer Ltd.

PHOTOGRAPHS AND ILLUSTRATIONS APPEARING IN *PC*, VOLUME 58, WERE RECEIVED FROM THE FOLLOWING SOURCES:

Boland, Eavan, photograph by Kevin Casey. Reproduced by permission of the photographer.—Bonnefoy, Yves, photograph. Copyright © Bassouls Sophie/Corbis. Reproduced by permission.—Cage, John, lecturing at Sanders Theater, Harvard University, 1989, photograph. AP/Wide World Photos.—Chaucer, Geoffrey, author portrait. Copyright © Bettmann/Corbis.—Chaucer, Geoffrey, illustration by Walter Appleton Clark. Reproduced by permission of Mary Evans Picture Library.

Thomson Gale Literature Product Advisory Board

The members of the Thomson Gale Literature Product Advisory Board—reference librarians from public and academic library systems—represent a cross-section of our customer base and offer a variety of informed perspectives on both the presentation and content of our literature products. Advisory board members assess and define such quality issues as the relevance, currency, and usefulness of the author coverage, critical content, and literary topics included in our series; evaluate the layout, presentation, and general quality of our printed volumes; provide feedback on the criteria used for selecting authors and topics covered in our series; provide suggestions for potential enhancements to our series; identify any gaps in our coverage of authors or literary topics, recommending authors or topics for inclusion; analyze the appropriateness of our content and presentation for various user audiences, such as high school students, undergraduates, graduate students, librarians, and educators; and offer feedback on any proposed changes/enhancements to our series. We wish to thank the following advisors for their advice throughout the year.

Barbara M. Bibel

Librarian Oakland Public Library Oakland, California

Dr. Toby Burrows

Principal Librarian
The Scholars' Centre
University of Western Australia Library
Nedlands, Western Australia

Celia C. Daniel

Associate Librarian, Reference Howard University Washington, D.C.

David M. Durant

Reference Librarian Joyner Library East Carolina University Greenville, North Carolina

Nancy Guidry

Librarian
Bakersfield Community College
Bakersfield, California

Steven R. Harris

English Literature Librarian University of Tennessee Knoxville, Tennessee

Mary Jane Marden

Collection Development Librarian St. Petersburg College Pinellas Park, Florida

Heather Martin

Arts & Humanities Librarian University of Alabama at Birmingham, Sterne Library Birmingham, Alabama

Susan Mikula

Director Indiana Free Library Indiana, Pennsylvania

Thomas Nixon

Humanities Reference Librarian University of North Carolina, Davis Library Chapel Hill, North Carolina

Mark Schumacher

Jackson Library University of North Carolina Greensboro, North Carolina

Gwen Scott-Miller

Assistant Director Sno-Isle Regional Library System Marysville, Washington

Donald Welsh

Head, Reference Services College of William and Mary, Swem Library Williamsburg, Virginia

Contents

Preface vii

Acknowledgments ix

Literary Criticism Series Advisory Board xi

Eavan Boland 1944	1
Yves Bonnefoy 1923- French poet, essayist, critic, fabulist, editor, and translator	103
John Cage 1912-1992	181
Geoffrey Chaucer 1340?-1400	227

Literary Criticism Series Cumulative Author Index 377

PC Cumulative Nationality Index 475

PC-58 Title Index 479

Eavan Boland 1944-

(Full name Eavan Aisling Boland) Irish poet and critic.

INTRODUCTION

Boland is viewed as one of the most important poets in contemporary Irish literature. Critics commend her exploration of feminist issues in her work, particularly the role of women in Irish literature and society. In her poetry she has also subverted traditional Irish mythology and concepts of female identity in order to express a more accurate perspective on the contributions and achievements of women in Irish history, politics, and culture.

BIOGRAPHICAL INFORMATION

Boland was born on September 24, 1944, in Dublin. Her father, the Irish diplomat Frederick H. Boland, was posted in 1950 as the Irish Ambassador to the Court of St. James in London, and then in 1956 as the President of the United Nations General Assembly. Growing up in London and New York City, Boland felt alienated from her Irish heritage, particularly in London, where she encountered prejudice against the Irish. As a teenager she returned to Ireland and attended the Holy Child Convent in Killiny, County Dublin. She immersed herself in Irish culture and began to write poetry. In 1962 she attended Trinity College in Dublin and published her first collection of verse, 23 Poems. In 1966 she received degrees in English and Latin from Trinity and was hired by the English department as a lecturer. In a short time, however, she left Trinity and became a full-time literary critic and poet. Much of her early poetry focused on domestic concerns, such as marriage, children, and her home in a suburb of Dublin. Yet with the publication of In Her Own Image (1980), critics began to take notice of her exploration of feminist issues, particularly the role of female poets within the patriarchal literary establishment in Ireland. Her work generated much controversy and brought her international recognition as a feminist literary figure. She has taught at several universities, including University College, Dublin; Bowdoin College; the University of Utah; and Stanford University. In addition, she has received several awards for her work, such as the Lannan Award for Poetry in 1994, the Bucknell Medal of Merit in 2000, and the Frederick Nims Memorial Prize in 2002.



MAJOR WORKS

Boland's early poems were conventional in style, centered on a celebration of domestic issues such as marriage and children, and were heavily influenced by the work of William Butler Yeats. Yet even at this early stage she demonstrated a recurring interest in the role of women in Irish literature and society, which later became a central thematic concern of her poetry and essays. In In Her Own Image, Boland explores such topics as domestic abuse, anorexia, breast cancer, and infanticide. She also addresses the lack of real women in Irish myths and national history and announces her suspicion of the male literary tradition and its portrayal of women. Night Feed (1982) considers the concept of female identity through an examination of ordinary women as well as female figures who have been marginalized in Irish mythology. Through these depictions of regular women, she celebrates the complexity of women's lives. In Outside History (1990) she continues her exploration of female identity, and strives to uncover

the silence of generations of women whose lives and contributions to history and culture have been largely ignored. For example, "The Achill Woman" portrays Boland's encounter, during a stay in Achill, with an old woman, who discusses of the Irish Famine and the people's struggle to survive such difficult times. The poet relates this woman's story to her own life and realizes her own failure in recognizing the importance of this woman's voice and her own connection to women throughout Irish history. In these collections, Boland also rejects the notion that women who live in suburbia and raise families are unworthy of attention. Her poetry celebrates the beauty in these lives and the importance of family, marriage, and domestic responsibilities. The Lost Land (1998) returns to the dynamics of family, as Boland reflects on her children growing up and leaving home and the ways in which this process affects her sense of identity. In Against Love Poetry (2001), Boland once again finds value and beauty in everyday existence and explores the tension between marriage and independence.

CRITICAL RECEPTION

Boland has emerged as one of the most important female voices in Irish poetry. Feminist critics have applauded her attempts to locate herself within the Irish poetic tradition by rejecting and reexamining the limited, traditional role of women in Irish mythology and history. By subverting these myths and history, they contend, she succeeds in repossessing her identity as an Irish woman and poet. In a broader sense, critics maintain, Boland's poetic development reflects the dramatic political and cultural shifts in Ireland in the past several decades. Commentators have noted the exploration of such controversial themes as child abuse, violence against women, self-esteem, and eating disorders in her verse. She also touches on issues of alienation, assimilation, identification, and exile. Critics praise her painterly consciousness, poignant lyrics, keen sense of poetic ethics, and use of the concrete to reveal hidden stories in Irish histories. A few critics caution against a strict feminist reading of her poems, contending that this minimizes her work and her contribution to modern poetry. Others have derided her verse as strident and accuse her of mythologizing the domestic sphere and the suburban life. Yeats and Adrienne Rich are regarded as profound influences on Boland's poetry, and commentators have found affinities between the poetry of Boland and Seamus Heaney.

PRINCIPAL WORKS

Poetry

23 Poems 1962 New Territory 1967

In Her Own Image 1980 The War Horse 1980 Introducing Eavan Boland 1981 Night Feed 1982 The Journey 1983 Selected Poems 1990 Outside History: Selected Poems, 1980-90 1990 In a Time of Violence 1994 Collected Poems 1995 An Origin Like Water: Collected Poems, 1967-1987 1996 Anna Liffey 1997 The Lost Land 1998 Limitations 2000 Against Love Poetry 2001 Journey with Two Maps: An Anthology 2002 Three Irish Poets, An Anthology: Eavan Boland, Paula Meehan, Mary O'Malley [edited by Boland] 2003

Other Major Works

W. B. Yeats and His World [with Michael MacLiammoir] (nonfiction) 1970

A Kind of Scar: The Woman Poet in National Tradition (nonfiction) 1989

Object Lessons: The Life of the Woman and the Poet in Our Time (nonfiction) 1995

CRITICISM

Patricia L. Hagen and Thomas W. Zelman (essay date winter 1991)

SOURCE: Hagen, Patricia L., and Thomas W. Zelman. "We Were Never on the Scene of the Crime': Eavan Boland's Repossession of History." *Twentieth Century Literature* 37, no. 4 (winter 1991): 442-53.

[In the following essay, Hagen and Zelman assert that Boland aims to "repossess" her place within the Irish literary tradition.]

From Yeats and the Celtic Revival onward, Irish poets have recorded, shaped, and criticized their nation's emerging independent identity. In the process, of course, they also attempted to reforge links to the past by creating for Ireland a literary tradition incorporating the myths, folklore, and symbols of a long-suppressed Gaelic heritage. Now, at the end of the twentieth century, the literary tradition wished into existence by Yeats has been expanded, modified, complicated, and virtually completed: it has become, so the argument goes, a "given" in Irish literature, a dead issue. Thus in Modern Irish Poetry, Robert Garratt "assumes a change

among a younger generation of writers in their attitude toward tradition" (5). For today's poets, Garratt argues, the "need to create and establish a tradition in literature no longer appears foremost in their thoughts" (5); contemporary poets no longer feel compelled to write the "definitions" and "apologetics" that so obsessed their poetic forefathers.

Although Garratt does not use the word, forefathers is by implication a key concept in his formulation; the tradition Garratt traces ("from Yeats to Heaney") is exclusively male. For women, who until recently have appeared only as subjects and objects of poems, not as their authors, the matter of tradition carries considerably more urgency than it does for their male counterparts. Indeed, just as the early Revivalists sought reconnection with a Gaelic heritage suppressed by centuries of English domination, so Irish women poets seek reconnection with a female heritage suppressed by centuries of male domination. Eavan Boland, a major figure in the current generation of Irish poets, is vitally concerned with the "ethics" underlying the Irish poetic tradition, most notably the ethical choices involved in a writer's selection of themes worth exploring in poetry. for these themes will naturally reveal the writer's—and. collectively, the tradition's—ability to bear witness to the truth of experience.

As a poet and a critic, Eavan Boland displays a painterly consciousness, a keen, painful awareness of the shaping power of language, and a fundamental sense of poetic ethics, three strands that merge into a vital concern with the artistic image and its relationship to truth. Art—poetry, painting, history—outlasts human lives; its images offer us a sense of the past which allows us to view and situate ourselves, individually and collectively, as heirs to tradition. As Boland notes, "we ourselves are constructed by our constructs" (Kind of Scar 20). Given the relation between image and selfhood, the poet—especially the woman poet—has an ethical obligation to de- and re-construct those constructs that shape literary tradition, bearing witness to the truths of experience suppressed, simplified, falsified by the "official" record.

In their broad strokes these issues are not, of course, uniquely Irish; as Boland acknowledges, "poetic ethics are evident and urgent in any culture where tensions between a poet and her or his birthplace are inherited and established" (Kind of Scar 7)—a view suggesting the difficulty women poets encounter as they approach a sanctioned national myth. Nevertheless, it is within the Irish poetic tradition that, by both birth and choice, Eavan Boland locates herself. Indeed, because of her upbringing, as she describes in "Irish Childhood in England," issues of assimilation and estrangement, identification and exile—issues themselves central to an Irish tradition in literature—became significant for her at an early age. She arrived in England, a "freckled six year old"

overdressed and sick on the plane when all of England to an Irish child was nothing more than what you'd lost and how. . . .

(Journey 50-51)

For this child in exile, "filled with some malaise / of love for what [she'd] never known [she] had" (50), educated in English schools, the songs and poems of her birth-country—the Irish poetic tradition—in many ways created Ireland for her. "Fond Memory" (Journey 52) juxtaposes her early sense of identification with the Ireland of song and poem against her adult sense of estrangement from that construction. Evoking her disturbingly peaceful childhood in postwar England, one in which she "wore darned worsted" and

. . . learned how wise the Magna Carta was, how hard the Hanoverians had tried . . .

Boland moves from her primary-school experience in the first half of the poem to her home in the second, where her father plays the "slow / lilts of Tom Moore" at the piano. She is affected strongly by the music and

. . . as much as I could think—
I thought this is my country, was, will be again, this upward-straining song made to be our safe inventory of pain. And I was wrong.

(52)

As an adult, she rejects the "safe inventory of pain," with its manifold falsifications and simplifications, but nonetheless retains a fundamental sense of identity as an Irish poet. "I didn't know what to hold, to keep" (Journey 50), the speaker claims in "An Irish Childhood in England: 1951."

"On the one hand," Boland writes, "I knew that as a poet, I could not easily do without the idea of a nation. . . . On the other, I could not as a woman accept the nation formulated for me by Irish poetry and its traditions" (Kind of Scar 8). The only reconciliation possible for her was to "repossess" that tradition. By affirming herself as an Irish poet, and thus rejecting the common notion that women's poetry should be quarantined from mainstream literature, Boland is in essence claiming her birthright, her say in that tradition, her right to "establish a discourse with the idea of a nation" (Kind of Scar 20).

As Boland cautions, such "repossession" is neither a single nor a static act, but a fluid process of de- and reconstruction. It is as if she has been presented with a seemingly completed jigsaw puzzle, but herself holds a series of additional pieces. In defiance of those who suggest she create a nice border around the original, Boland would break apart the completed picture and reconstruct a new image. In this model, the first part of the tradition to be shattered must be its alienating "fusion of the national and the feminine which seemed to

simplify both" (Kind of Scar 7). Instead of real lives, the tradition offers Dark Rosaleen, the Old Woman of the Roads, and Cathleen Ni Houlihan, images that by their mythic and ornamental nature necessarily reduce the complex feelings, aspirations, and lives of real women—but not only of women. Boland views these emblematic women, "passive projection[s] of a national idea" (Kind of Scar 13), as "an underlying fault in Irish poetry; almost a geological weakness" because "all good poetry depends on an ethical relation between imagination and image. Images are not ornaments; they are truths" (Kind of Scar 23). By recasting a defeated nation into a triumphant woman, the Irish literary tradition may have gained aesthetically, but it lost ethically: gone were the "human truths of survival and humiliation" and in their place were the "hollow victories . . . the rhyming queens" (Kind of Scar 13).

Boland's poems, then, attempt to unseat the rhyming queens and reinscribe the human truths they have suppressed, to "repossess" those portions of history ignored by the Irish canon and to reassess the truth of the national identity. In this task, her starting point is frequently the driving of a wedge into the "almost geological weakness" of the Irish poetic tradition. In its simplest terms, the resulting division is the distance between male and female—the split, in Boland's terms, between "hearth and history," her hearth and his story. Her world, if seen at all, is confined to the margins of his story, the celebration of the grand sweep of Irish heroism. As Boland notes, while the nation's "flags and battle-cries, even its poetry" at times use feminine imagery, "the true voice and vision of women are routinely excluded" (Kind of Scar 19). "It's our alibi / for all time," she writes in "It's a Woman's World," "that as far as history goes / we were never / on the scene of the crime" (357). In the official records—the history books, battle-cries, songs, and poems—women exist largely as lamenting voices, mouthpieces, ornaments: the Young Queen, the Old Mother, the Poor Old Woman. "So when the king's head / gored its basket," the speaker notes, "we were gristing bread"

or getting the recipe for a good soup to appetize our gossip.

(357)

"Like most historic peoples," women are "defined / by what we forget, by what we never will be: / star-gazers, / fire-eaters" (357). The unsensational and therefore unwritten sufferings of ordinary women, ordinary people, are doomed to become unhistory: "And still no page / scores the low music / of our outrage" (358). Within his story, gristing bread is of no consequence, despite its overwhelming importance in sustaining life; her hearth (a precondition of the "heroics" celebrated

by his story), trivialized into recipes and gossip, is beneath notice in the records of mythic "big events." History rests, that is, on the assumption that the ordinary and the important are mutually exclusive categories, an assumption that justifies omitting women's experience from the records even today; women's aspirations, sufferings, and unglamorous heroics are rendered invisible by their ordinariness:

. . . appearances still reassure. That woman there, craned to the starry mystery

is merely getting a breath of evening air, while this one here her mouth

a burning plume—she's no fire-eater, just my frosty neighbor coming home.

(358)

The "reassuring" qualifiers merely and just are instructive, marking the boundaries between the traditional reading of women's lives and the speaker's reinscription of them. While the "historian" may dismiss one woman as "merely" getting a breath of air, the other as "just" a neighbor, the speaker subverts these tidy reductions by allowing us to see the star-gazer in the woman taking the air, the fire-eater in the "frosty neighbor." Both are still "ordinary women," but ordinary is no longer pejorative, no longer synonymous with simple and unimportant.

Although real women are "never on the scene of the crime" in the Irish literary tradition, their mythic counterparts appear with predictable regularity. The reductive force of the fusion of the feminine and the national, with its corollary invisibility of real, complex women, makes the subversion of this image a natural starting point in Boland's act of repossession. This subversion permeates such divergent poems as the "Tirade for the Mimic Muse," "Envoi," "Making Up," and "Mise Eire."

The title of the latter poem (rendered into English as "I Am Ireland") is particularly evocative, for it echoes both Cathleen Ni Houlihan and Patrick Pearse's poem "I Am Ireland," two prototypical examples of the "Ireland is a woman" tradition. Boland's title, however, also suggests, at least visually, both mise en scène (pointing up the staginess of the typical nationalist poem) and the misery of that stock figure, Mother Ireland, who, in Pearse's poem, expresses a conventional pride in the heroics of "Cuchulain the valiant" and an equally conventional shame at bearing "children that

sold their mother" (*Irish Verse* 295). Boland's poem begins by destabilizing the conventional evocation of the passive, all-patient, all-sorrowful woman-who-is-Ireland; suddenly the woman is digging in her heels, demanding a divorce from the mystic: "I won't go back to it," she insists,

my nation displaced into old dactyls, oaths made by the animal tallows of the candle—

(Journey 11)

Dissociating herself from the canonical tendency to venerate the heroism of Cuchulain and Finn, she divorces herself as well from

the songs that bandage up the history the words that make a rhythm of the crime

where time is time past.

(11)

Finally, she rejects the bloodless, abstract portrait typically presented of her, insisting on her right to appear in less idealized roles: as the camp follower who trades sex for cambric and rice-colored silks, or as the emigrant woman with her half-dead baby,

mingling the immigrant guttural with the vowels of homesickness who neither knows nor cares that

a new language is a kind of scar and heals after a while into a passable imitation of what went before.

(11)

For these women, whose "roots are brutal," defeat is not transmuted into victory, not even into myth. The image of Cathleen protected by Cuchulain does nothing to soothe their anger and suffering.

"Mise Eire" shatters the poetic idea of defeated nation reborn as triumphant woman, insisting instead on bearing witness to the real defeats of Irish history, the real sufferings of Irish women. In A Kind of Scar Boland writes.

The wrath and grief of Irish history seemed to me—as it did to many—one of our true possessions. Women were part of that wrath, had endured that grief. It seemed to me a species of human insult that at the end of all, in certain Irish poems, they should become elements of style rather than aspects of truth.

(12)

"Mise Eire" redresses that insult and thrusts before the reader images of Irish women to take the place of stylized, falsified ones.

As the title of her collection *In Her Own Image* suggests, the poems in this volume comprise a subversive, repossessive discourse. In the first poem in the collection, "Tirade for the Mimic Muse," Boland blasts the whorish muse who parades for men but refuses to involve herself in real households where real families live. The speaker begins by holding up a mirror to force the aged and ugly muse to confront herself: "I've caught you out. You fat trout" (9). Yeats may have been inspired, like Aengus, by this trout-cum-beautiful-girl, this piece of silvery Celtic twilight, the speaker implies, but "I know you for the ruthless bitch you are":

Eye-shadow, swivel brushes, blushers,
Hot pinks, rouge pots, sticks,
Ice for the pores, a mud mask—
All the latest tricks.
Not one of them disguise
That there's a dead millennium in your eyes.
You try to lamp the sockets of your loss:
The lives that famished for your look of love.
Your time is up. There's not a stroke, a flick
Can make your crime cosmetic.

(10)

The speaker, of course a woman, sees through the seductress's tricks of ornamentation and make-up, the cosmetics of language that allow us to "make an ornament of the past; to turn the losses to victories and to restate humiliations as triumphs" (*Kind of Scar* 24); her "tirade" lays bare the Muse's aesthetic that favors the mythic and the fraudulent:

With what drums and dances, what deceits, Rituals and flatteries of war, Chants and pipes and witless empty rites And war-like men And wet-eyed patient women You did protect yourself from horrors. . . .

(*Image* 10)

In this catalogue of the stock elements of the Irish poetic tradition, the speaker reviles the Muse for inspiring celebrations of martial splendor and female passivity, thus turning "a terrible witness into an empty decoration" (*Kind of Scar* 24). Had poets taken as their muse a real woman, not merely a male construct, she could have turned them to face the real conditions of life:

The kitchen screw and the rack of labour,
The wash thumbed and the dish cracked,
The scream of beaten women,
The crime of babies battered,
The hubbub and the shriek of daily grief. . . .

(*Image* 11)

Indeed, this is a world the Muse "could have sheltered in [her] skirts," but instead she primly "latched [her] belt and itched [her] hem / And shook it off like dirt" (*Image* 11).

The speaker's rage is compounded by her recognition that she too was once implicated in this crime, once constructed by this construct: I "mazed my way to womanhood," she tells us, "Through all your halls of mirrors, making faces." But "in a nappy stink, by a soaking wash / Among stacked dishes"—that is, in the details of her own life, the truth of her own experience—"Your glass cracked," she tells the Muse.

Your luck ran out. Look. My words leap Among your pinks, your stench pots and sticks, They scatter shadow, swivel brushes, blushers. Make your face naked, Strip your mind naked, Drench your skin in a woman's tears.

(11)

The ordinary details of experience create an upheaval, causing an earthquake along the "almost geological fault" in the Irish tradition. In an act of repossession, the poet strips off the Muse's makeup and forces upon her an aesthetic of inclusiveness: "You are the Muse of all our mirrors. / Look in them and weep" (11). With the *all* of this announcement, Boland is ready to inaugurate her own aesthetic, one that truly bears witness.

"Envoi," a companion piece, affirms the speaker's belief that "My muse must be better than those of men / who made theirs in the image of their myth" (Journey 43). Boland's homely (but not conventional) images contrast sharply with the "chants and pipes and witless empty rites" inspired by the Mimic Muse of the Irish poetic tradition:

Under the street-lamps the dustbins brighten. The winter flowering jasmine casts a shadow outside my window in my neighbor's garden. These are the things that my muse must know.

(Journey 43)

The final quatrain of the poem establishes Boland's aesthetic—and her poetic ethics—with great clarity:

If she will not bless the ordinary, if she will not sanctify the common, then here I am and here I stay and then am I the most miserable of women.

(43)

This artistic restructuring of given myths Boland extends to another art form—painting. Inspired by works of Renoir, Canaletto, and Chardin, among other artists, she problematizes what she sees, extending the

two-dimensional canvas in a further dimension to include that which the artist simplifies away, i.e., the subject's interior complexity. For example, "Self-Portrait on a Summer Evening" imagines how Jean-Baptiste Chardin, in "painting a woman," diminishes her:

All summer long he has been slighting her in botched blues, tints, half-tones, rinsed neutrals.

(Journey 12)

The faint colors, the suggestive forms—"the sky that odd shape of apron"—encroach upon the woman to seal off her possibilities, to "shrink" and "reduce" her realm of experience, and, by extension, that of the viewer, Boland herself. Stepping into the portrait, Boland sees herself

crossing between
the garden and the house,
under the whitebeam trees,
keeping an eye on
the length of the grass,
the height of the hedge,
the distance of the children
I am Chardin's woman

edged in reflected light, hardened by the need to be ordinary.

(12)

In this painting "the common" is present, but not "sanctified"; the woman is "edged in reflected light," reduced by the painter's vision to a collection of "tints / half-tones," and "neutrals," a nonentity. In the painter's view, she is "hardened by / the need to be ordinary" and therefore can be no fire-eater or star-gazer. Implicit here is a critique of the tradition in which one can be either ordinary or heroic, common or complex, a male aesthetic that "hardens" the woman in the portrait and the one viewing her. In "The Journey" the poet's guide, Sappho, shows her women and children and cautions her, "be careful. / Do not define these women by their work" (Journey 41); these women are not to be simplified into laundresses, court ladies, and washerwomen, as Chardin's woman is reduced to a mere housewife. By adopting the perspective of Chardin's woman, Boland destabilizes the neat category, the exclusionary aesthetic that denies both the woman-assubject and the woman-as-viewer their complexity, their potential to be fire-eaters and housewives, star-gazers and women, indeed poets and mothers.

Although Boland is deeply concerned with the way in which the grand, mythic tradition of Irish poetry has silenced and trivialized women, she implies as well that

it has also silenced many of the genuine voices of men: the distance between male and female, while real enough, is subsumed by the more critical distance between the official image and the human truth. Poetic renderings of Irish heroism, with their seductive assurances about Irish history and Irish womanhood, are, Boland claims, narcotic and amnesiac (or, in Joycean terms, "paralytic"), seducing female and male readers to embrace a collective fantasy, to pursue an unreal self-image, both personally and nationally. "The Glass **King**" illustrates the destructive power of this tradition. In this poem Boland explores the misery King Charles VI inflicts upon himself and his queen Isabella in his belief that he is made of glass. Isabella, "an ordinary honest woman" perplexed by the King's madness, remembers the marital pleasure they once took in each other:

They were each other's fantasy in youth. No splintering at all about that mouth when they were flesh and muscle, woman and man, fire and kindling. See that silk divan!

Enough said. . . .

(Journey 59)

Yet the sensuality and intimacy of their former relationship has been sacrificed to Charles's distorted perceptions, a madness suggesting the narcissism and insularity that result from a preoccupation with *history* and its corollary rejection of the quotidian. The speaker, "wanting nothing more than the man / she married," thinks, "I need his hand now."

Outside my window October soaks the stone; you can hear it; you'd almost think the brick was drinking it; the rowan drips

and history waits. Let it wait. I want no elsewheres. . . .

(59)

History, an abstract composite of flags and battle-cries and momentary deeds, denies the value of what, to Isabella, are the truly important matters: the rain, the rowan, the silk divan, the flesh and blood, the "ordinary," the "common," the real. By contrast, Charles, more fully constructed by the constructs of history, is "demented in a crystal past," capable of seeing himself only "in mirrors, self-deceptions, self-regardings" (60). The idealized images in the glass quite literally define him; he turns himself into an abstraction.

The destructive power of the Irish poetic tradition is explicit as the poet "elect[s]" Charles, in his madness, "emblem / and ancestor of our lyric:"

it fits you like a glove—doesn't it?—the part; untouchable, outlandish,

esoteric, inarticulate and out of reach

of human love. . . .

(60)

Such a lyric, in Boland's schema, is a kind of scar, the aftermath of something genuine and powerful, or, as she says in "The Women" (Journey 27), the wound of a real event "heal[ed] into myth" and become inert. Charles's myth has placed at a distance—has marginalized—the love of his wife, who wants "nothing more than the man / she married, all her sorrows in her stolid face" (Journey 60). It has also, of course, isolated him, hardened him by the need to be un-ordinary, and driven him mad, completely destroying him. The consequences of his story have been reaped not only by women.

Through her "dialogue with the idea of a nation," Eavan Boland destabilizes the "emblems and enchantments" of the Irish poetic tradition, exposing ways in which the "exhausted fictions of the nation" have "edit[ed] ideas of womanhood and modes of remembrance," leaving Irish poetry informed "not [by] the harsh awakenings, but the old dreams" (Kind of Scar 13). By working to "repossess" Ireland, she points toward a new ethic for Irish poetry, one that reinscribes the ordinary and restores its complexity, recognizing that everyday experience is always intricate, frequently harsh and disappointing, yet extremely fragile, vulnerable to "the grace music gives to flattery / and language borrows from ambition" ("The Achill Woman," Kind of Scar 4). Thus Boland's poetry is microcosmic and keenly observant; her interest in the meaning of Ireland is an interest in houses, flowers, blackbirds, and children, in the "great people" who suffered the famine, in the "teddy bears and rag dolls and tricycles and buckets" that constitute "love's archaeology" ("The Journey," Journey 41). It is as if by particularizing, Boland will avoid "the harmonies of servitude," the soothing rhetoric of generalization. Committed to the keen scrutiny that "witness-bearing" entails, Eavan Boland reintroduces to public discourse the perspectives that run counter to the demands of Irish myth, to lead away from the safety of amnesia and toward the risky complexity of life.

Works Cited

Boland, Eavan. In Her Own Image. Dublin: Arlen House, 1980.

——. "It's a Woman's World." *Contemporary Irish Poetry.* Ed. Anthony Bradley. Berkeley: U of California P, 1988. 357-58.

——. A Kind of Scar: The Woman Poet in a National Tradition. Dublin: Attic Press, 1989.

——. The Journey and Other Poems. Dublin: Arlen House, 1986.

Garratt, Robert, ed. Modern Irish Poetry: Tradition and Continuity from Yeats to Heaney. Berkeley: U of California P, 1986.

Pearse, Patrick. "I Am Ireland." The Penguin Book of Irish Verse. Ed. Brendan Kennelly. 2nd ed. New York: Viking-Penguin, 1981. 295.

Anne Stevenson (essay date January-February 1992)

SOURCE: Stevenson, Anne. "Inside and Outside History." *P.N. Review* 18, no. 3 (January-February 1992): 34-5.

[In the following essay, Stevenson regards Boland's encounter with the Achill woman, chronicled in her verse and her essay "Outside History," as an important moment in her life and work.]

As will be evident to anyone who has followed Eavan Boland's purgatorial journey into self-placement, the story of her meeting with the Achill woman occurs at least twice in her published work: once in the verse sequence of *Outside History* (Carcanet, 1990), and again as a prologue to her essay of the same title (*P.N.R.* 75). Boland, then a student at Trinity College, had borrowed a friend's cottage on Achill Island for a week at Easter, bringing with her, for study, a volume of the Court poets of the Silver Age, 'those 16th century songwriters like Wyatt and Raleigh, whose lines appear so elegant . . . yet whose poems smell of the gallows'. Since the cottage was without water, an old woman carried it up every evening in a bucket.

I remember the cold rosiness of her hands. She bent down and blew on them like broth. And round her waist, on a white background, in coarse, woven letters, the words 'glass cloth'. And she was nearly finished for the day. And I was all talk, raw from college— . . .

Both poem and essay mark the occasion as an epiphany, an incident that affected the direction of the poet's life and thinking. 'She was the first person to talk to me about the famine. The first person, in fact, to speak to me with any force about the terrible parish of survival and death which the event had been in those regions.' When the young poet turned her back on the woman and re-entered the cottage to light a fire and memorize lines from the Court Poets, she was ignorantly turning, she says, away from her own history, away from the Achill woman and what she represented of Ireland's past in order 'to commit to memory the songs and artifices of the very power system which had made [the old woman's] own memory such an archive of loss'.

In her poetry, Eavan Boland raises the problem of her Irish identity in the context of that 'archive of loss'. At the same time, her concerns are much broader. Memory,

change, loss, the irrecoverable past—such are the shared conditions of humankind with which she scrupulously engages. Her poems give an impression of a grave, even solemn intelligence, very little ruffled by the politics of nationalism, or, for that matter, of the women's movement. A sensitive poet, then, a poet unafraid of thought, rarely thrown off balance by anger; a poet willing to brave current fashions by freely advancing ideas—though she works, usually, with concrete images. Daringly, she calls a poem 'We are Human History. We are not Natural History', placing her children in a 'short-lived' and 'elegiac' light of a particular encounter with nature (a wild bees nest) so as to explore, in tentative yet exact language, her sense of the uniquely human experience of time, which is selective memory. 'And this- / this I thought, is how it will have been / chosen from those summer evenings / which under the leaves of the poplars- / striped dun and ochre, simmering over / the stashed-up debris of old seasons— / a swarm of wild bees is making use of." (My italics).

Given the distinction Boland makes between human history and the natural world, one might expect an essay entitled 'Outside History' to point to an area of release. Human history, seen as a record of power struggle, war and wastage, is indeed a horror story; the whole of it (and natural history, too) could be described as 'a parish of survival and death'. But to see around 'history' into the filtering byways of individual creation and discovery can liberate the mind from useless selflaceration. I opened the essay, 'Outside History', with an expectation, founded on the poems, of engaging with a personal philosophy of survival. To my surprise, the essay, though very personal, turned out to be a polemic: a disquisition on the 'virulence and necessity of the idea of a nation', and especially on how the poetic inheritance of Ireland has cut across the poet's identity as a woman.

Though Eavan Boland as an Irishwoman and I as an American are separated by very different historical experiences, the undergraduate encounter with the Achill woman is easy enough to share. The title 'Outside History' perhaps points to that silent majority excluded from the history books whom the practitioners of 'total history' have sought to bring inside history (as, for example, with Peter Laslett's The World We Have Lost). For most of us probably, who seek to identify with the past but who feel excluded by gender or class or much else from the conventional national pasts of the history books, it is through these silent majorities that we must make our connections. Yet, is it only my American background that makes me pause before the 'virulence and necessity of the idea of a nation'? For a Serbian or Croatian poet entering new nightmares after the long Ottoman centuries the language fits well enough. But for an Irish poet in a republic secure in the