

HONG KONG CASES

1946-1972

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Butterworths Asia

Hong Kong • Singapore • Kuala Lumpur

The Butterworth Group of Companies

Singapore	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA 10 Anson Road #32-01 International Plaza, Singapore 079903
Hong Kong	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA (HONG KONG) 19/F Eight Commercial Tower 8 Sun Yip Street, Chai Wan, Hong Kong Tel: 29651400 Fax: 29760840
Malaysia	MALAYAN LAW JOURNAL SDN BHD Suite 1001/02 10th Floor Wisma Hamzah Kwong Hing No 1 Leboh Ampang 50100 Kuala Lumpur
Australia	BUTTERWORTHS Sydney, Melbourne, Brisbane, Adelaide, Perth, Canberra
Canada	BUTTERWORTHS CANADA LTD Toronto and Vancouver
Ireland	BUTTERWORTH (IRELAND) LTD Dublin
New Zealand	BUTTERWORTHS OF NEW ZEALAND LTD Wellington and Auckland
Puerto Rico	BUTTERWORTH OF PUERTO RICO, INC San Juan
UK	BUTTERWORTH & Co (PUBLISHERS) LTD London and Edinburgh
USA	MICHIE BUTTERWORTH Carlsbad, California Charlottesville, Virginia



Butterworths Asia*
1995

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any material form or by any means, including photocopying and recording, or storing in any medium by electronic means and whether or not transiently or incidentally to some other use of this publication, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher. Such written permission must also be obtained before any part of this publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

*Butterworths Asia is a division of Reed Elsevier (Singapore) Pte Ltd.

ISSN 0218-7809
Typeset by Butterworths Asia, Superskill Graphics
and Corporate Press
Produced by Mandarin Offset Ltd
Printed and bound in Hong Kong

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Associate Editors

Grenville Cross QC

Peter Garland QC

Ruy Barretto, Barrister

Michael Ozorio, Barrister

Mohan Bharwaney, Barrister

Susan Kwan, Barrister

Malcolm Merry, Barrister

Aarif Barma, Barrister

Andrew Cheung, Barrister

Peter Ng, Barrister

Joseph Fok, Barrister

Anderson Chow, Barrister

Teresa Cheng, Barrister

David Fitzpatrick, Barrister

Patrick WS Cheung, Barrister

Andrew Byrnes, Hong Kong University

Johannes Chan, Hong Kong University

Reporters in this volume

Daniel WS Chan, Barrister

Christina Choi, Solicitor

Earnest WH Cheung, Barrister

Charles P Chiu, Barrister

TC Chong, Barrister

MC Chiu, Barrister

Jenny Chung, Solicitor

Lindy Course, Barrister

Victor T Gidwani, Barrister

Richard Khaw, Barrister

Gary Kwan, Barrister

Jasper Kwan, Barrister

Julia Lau, Barrister

Raymond Lau, Barrister

Lawrence Law, Barrister

Stephen Law Shing Yan

Cindy Lee, Barrister

Rebecca MK Lee, Barrister

Richard Leung, Barrister

Raymond Leung, Barrister

Cynthia Li, Barrister

PY Lo, Barrister

Phillip Ross, Barrister

Suzanne Sim, Barrister

KW Tang, Barrister

David Tsang, Barrister

Jennifer Tsang, Barrister

Alexandra Wong, Barrister

Stephen Wong, Barrister

Gerald Wu, Barrister

Dominic Yeung, Barrister

Eric Yeung, Barrister

Angela Ho

Jeanne Tan

Zarinah Marican

Butterworths Asia

Publisher: Anthony P Kinnear

Deputy Managing Editor (Singapore): Zarinah Marican

Editors: Noorunnisa Ibrahim Kutty, Teoh Swee Leng, Bala Shanmugam,
Sharon Kaur

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The publishers are grateful to and acknowledge the significant contribution and support of the Hong Kong Superior Court Judgments Database project, directed by the four members of the Faculty of Law, whose names are mentioned below. The judgments database project (1989–1994) was funded primarily by the University of Hong Kong's Conference and Research Grants Committee with assistance from the Department of Professional Legal Education, at the Faculty of Law. The Faculty members responsible for the project are (in alphabetical order) Andrew Byrnes, Lecturer, Department of Law; Rick Glofcheski, Lecturer, Department of Law; Gary N Heilbronn, Senior Lecturer, Department of Professional Legal Education; and Sarah Nield, Senior Lecturer, Department of Professional Legal Education (until 1992). The project administrator is James Garritty, Research Officer, Faculty of Law.

TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS

List of abbreviations used in this volume (excluding reports):

A	High Court Action
ACJ	Acting Chief Justice
A-G	Attorney General
AR	Application for Review
Adm	Admiralty Action
App	Appendix
art	article
Aust	Australia
CA	Court of Appeal
CA	Civil Appeal Number in references to unreported cases (eg CA 2/92)
CC	High Court Criminal Case
CJ	Chief Justice
Cap	Chapter (as in Chapter Number of an Ordinance)
Crim App	Criminal Appeal
Comm L	Commercial List
Con L	Construction List
ch	chapter (as in chapter number of a book)
cl(l)	clause(s)
DC	District Court
DCA	District Court Action
DJ	District Judge
DPP	Director of Public Prosecutions
EC	European Communities
ECC	Economic Compensation Case
ECHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECJ	Court of Justice of the European Communities
EEC	European Economic Communities
Ed	Edition
Ex Ch	Court of Exchequer Chamber
exh	exhibit
fn	footnote
HC	High Court
HL	House of Lords
HMSO	Her Majesty's Stationery Office
J(J)	Justice(s)
J(J)A	Justice(s) of Appeal
LT(A)	Labour Tribunal (Appeal)
LC	Lord Chancellor
Ld T(A)	Lands Tribunal (Appeal)
MA	Magistracy Appeal
MCA	Magistracy Criminal Appeal
MP	Miscellaneous Proceedings
MR	Master of the Rolls
n	note
NSW	New South Wales

Abbreviations

O	Order (of the Rules of the Supreme Court)
PC	Privy Council
PRC	People's Republic of China
PCA	Privy Council Appeal
Pt	Part
para	paragraph
RSC	Rules of the Supreme Court
r(r)	rule(s)
reg	regulation
s	section
sub-s	subsection
Sch	Schedule
TTA	Tenancy Tribunal Appeal
UN	United Nations
Uncitral	United Nations Commission on International Trade Law
VP(P)	Vice-President(s)
WCC	Workers' Compensation Case

List of abbreviations of law reports:

AC	Law Reports, Appeal Cases (HL and PC); since 1890
Ad & El	Adolphus and Ellis's Reports, King's Bench and Queen's Bench, 12 Vols, 1834–1842
All ER	All England Law Reports; since 1936
App Cas	Law Reports, Appeal Cases, House of Lords, 15 vols; 1875–1890
B	Barber's Gold Law (South Africa)
B & C	Barnewall and Cresswell's Reports, King's Bench, 10 Vols, 1822–1830
B & S	Best and Smith's Reports, Queen's Bench, 10 vols; 1861–1870
BWCC	Butterworths' Workmen's Compensation Cases; 1907–1949
Bing	Bingham's Reports, Common Pleas, 10 Vols, 1822–1834
CB	Common Bench Reports, 18 Vols, 1845–1856
CCC	Canadian Criminal Cases
CL	Current Law, 1947–(current)
CLR	Commonwealth Law Reports; since 1903
CLY	Current Law Yearbook, 1947–(current)
Ch	Law Reports, Chancery Division; since 1890
Ch App	Law Reports, Chancery Appeals, 10 vols; 1865–1875
Ch D	Law Reports, Chancery Division, 45 vols; 1875–1890
Cas T Talb	Cases in Equity temp Talbot, fol vol, 1730–1737
Co Inst	Coke's Institutes
Cox CC	EW Cox's Criminal Law Cases; 1843–1945
Cr App R	Criminal Appeal Reports (HL and CA(UK)); since 1908

Hong Kong Cases

Crim LR	Criminal Law Review; since 1954
De GJ & Sm	De Gex, Jones and Smith's Reports, Chancery, 4 vols; 1862–1865
ER	English Reports, 178 volumes; 1220–1865
F 2d	Federal Reporter, Second Series (USA), 1924–(current)
F & F	Foster & Finlason's Reports, Nisi Prius, 4 Vols, 1856–1857
FSR	Fleet Street Reports
Fam	Family Division; 1972–(current)
Fam Law	Family Law
HKDCLR	Hong Kong District Court Law Reports
HKLJ	Hong Kong Law Journal
HKLR	Hong Kong Law Reports
HKTC	Hong Kong Tax Cases
IR	Irish Reports; since 1892
Irish LTR	Irish Law Times Reports; 1867–
JP	Justice of the Peace
KB	Law Reports, King's Bench Division, 53 vols, 1901–1952
LGR	Local Government Reports; 1902–(current)
LJCP	Law Journal, Common Pleas; 1831–1875
LJKB	Law Journal, King's Bench; 1831–1946
LJQB	Law Journal, Queen's Bench; 1831–1846
LJR	Law Journal Reports, 1947–1949
LRCP	Law Reports, Common Pleas, 10 vols; 1865–1875
LT	Law Times Reports, 177 vols, 1859–1947
Lloyd LR	Lloyd's List Law Reports; 1919–1950
Lloyd's Rep	Lloyd's List Law Reports; since 1951
M & S	Maule & Selwyn's Reports, King's Bench, 6 Vols, 1813–1817
Mac & G	Macnaghten and Gordon's Reports, Chancery, 3 vols; 1849–1852
My & Cr	Mylne and Craig's Reports, Chancery, 5 vols, 1835–1841
NI	Northern Ireland Law Reports, 1925–(current)
NYS	New York Supplement, 1888–1938
NZLR	New Zealand Reports, 1883–(current)
P	Law Reports, Probate, Divorce and Admiralty Division; 1891–1971
P & CR	Planning (Property) and Compensation Reports, 1950–(current)
QB	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1891–1900, and since 1952
QBD	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1875–1890
Qd R	Queensland Reports, 1958–(current)
R & IT	Rating and Income Tax Reports, 53 Vols, 1924–1960
RPC	Reports of Patent Cases, 1884–(current)

Abbreviations

RRC	Ryde's Rating Cases, 1956–(current)
RTR	Road Traffic Reports; 1970–(current)
Sa	South African Law Reports, since 1947
SLT	Scot's Law Times; 1893–(current)
Sol Jo	Solicitor's Journal; since 1856
Stra	Strange's Reports, 2 vols; 1716–1747
TLR	The Times Law Reports, 71 volumes; 1884–1950 The Times Law Reports; since 1951
TR	Taxation Reports
Taunt	Taunton's Reports, Common Pleas, 8 vols; 1807–1819
VLR	Victorian Law Reports, Vols 11–29; 1885–1904
Ves Jun	Vesey Jun's Reports, Chancery, 19 vols; 1789–1817
Ves Sen	Vesey Sen's Reports, 2 Vols, 1747–1756
WIR	West Indian Reports, 1958–(current)
WLR	Weekly Law Reports; since 1953
WN	Law Reports, Weekly Notes, 1866–1952
WR	Weekly Reporter, 54 vols; 1852–1906
WWR	Western Weekly Reports (Canada)
Wils	G Wilson's Reports, King's Bench and Common Pleas, fol, 3 Vols, 1772–1774

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

The mode of citation of cases reported in this volume of *Hong Kong Cases* is [1946–1972] HKC (page).

	Page		Page
A		Chen Wan Yung & Anor; R v [CA]	310
AB Hellenic; Alexandra Knitters Ltd v [HC]	571	Cheng Chung Pong & Anor v Wong Ching & Ors [HC]	544
ABC Commercial Service; Wong Tadpole v [HC]	576	Cheng Pak Hei & Ors; R v [HC]	351
Alexandra Knitters Ltd v AB Hellenic [HC]	571	Chennault & Anor; Civil Air Transport Inc v [CA]	18
Attorney General v Chan Wah [HC]	684	Chinese Rhenish Church HK Synod v Liu Hok Yan t/a Liu Hok Yan & Associates .. [HC]	341
Attorney General v Ng Hung Nam [CA]	114	Choi Mei Po & Ors (Tai Pan Agencies Ltd & Anor, third parties); Wanglee v [DC]	666
Attorney General; Chu Wing Hei v [HC]	536	Chow Hau Yung v Pang Chun Ying [DC]	322
Attorney General (No 1); Cowie v [HC]	520	Chow Sau Sing; R v [CA]	199
Attorney General (No 2); Cowie v [HC]	530	Christianos; Tai Shum Jewellery Trading Co v [HC]	590
Au Yeung Leung & Anor; Ho Shiu Kwong v [CA]	288	Chu Roger; Dah Sing Bank Ltd v [CA]	296
C		Chu Wing Hei v Attorney General [HC]	536
Carreras Ltd v RJ Reynolds Tobacco Co [HC]	493	Chu Yam Om & Anor v Li Tam Toi Hing [PC]	55
Central Air Transport Corp; Civil Air Transport Inc v [PC]	1	Chuen Cheong Hong; Mah Keung Wong v [CA]	262
Central Enterprises Ltd v Sky King Restaurant Ltd [CA]	270	Chung Shing Hing; Li Kwok Chi v [HC]	649
Chan Fui Hing & Ors; Fung Kai Sun v [PC]	69	Civil Air Transport Inc v Central Air Transport Corp .. [PC]	1
Chan Kam Sang; R v [HC]	642	Civil Air Transport Inc v Chennault & Anor [CA]	18
Chan Kau v R [PC]	63	Collector of Stamp Revenue v Chan Yee Yin & Ors [HC]	656
Chan Kwai; Lai Lin Yau v [CA]	210	Commissioner of Inland Revenue v Tai On Machinery Works Ltd [HC]	461
Chan Lee Kuen v Chan Siu Fai [HC]	337	Cowie v Attorney General (No 1) [HC]	520
Chan Siu Fai; Chan Lee Kuen v [HC]	337	Cowie v Attorney General (No 2) [HC]	530
Chan Wah; Attorney General v [HC]	684	D	
Chan William; Robinson v [HC]	607	Dah Sing Bank Ltd v Chu Roger [CA]	296
Chan Wing Kwong (an infant) & Anor v Wong CW Alan ... [CA]	124		
Chan Yee Yin & Ors; Collector of Stamp Revenue v [HC]	656		

Hong Kong Cases

	Page		Page
Defag Construction Co & Anor; Yee Sang Metal Supplies Co v	[HC] 660	Kwo Heung Lum & Anor; Loke Choong Wing v	[HC] 633
Del E Webb International Hotel Co v Hotel Merlin (Hong Kong) Ltd	[HC] 395	L	
F		Lai Lin Yau v Chan Kwai	[CA] 210
Fing Lee Co v Hung Kam Fung & Anor	[HC] 617	Lai Man Yau & Anor v Mak Lau Siu Kan	[CA] 223
Foo Wai Yu, Re	[HC] 565	Lai Man Yau & Anor; Mak Lau Sui Kan v	[HC] 215
Foreign Exchange & Investment Ltd v Rahim	[HC] 610	Lam Tuk Yu; R v	[CA] 237
Fung Kai Sun v Chan Fui Hing & Ors	[PC] 69	Lamb v Monkhouse	[HC] 511
G		Lau Mui v Kowloon Motor Bus Co (1933) Ltd	[CA] 265
Government of the Republic of Indonesia; Juan Ysmael & Co Inc v	[PC] 36	Lee Cheuk v Siu Wai Kin	[CA] 118
H		Lee Chun Chuen v R	[PC] 79
Hangkam Kwintong Woo v Liu Lan Fong	[PC] 45	Lee Wai Tong & Ors v Wong Shek Wah Paul & Ors	[HC] 501
Hewett; R v	[HC] 645	Leong Siew Tuck & Ors; Yeh Tso Lin v	[HC] 626
Ho Shiu Kwong v Au Yeung Leung & Anor	[CA] 288	Li Ching & Ors v Koo Too Shing & Ors	[HC] 414
Hotel Merlin (Hong Kong) Ltd; Del E Webb International Hotel Co v	[HC] 395	Li Kwok Chi v Chung Shing Hing	[HC] 649
Hung Kam Fung & Anor; Fing Lee Co v	[HC] 617	Li Tam Toi Hing; Chu Yam Om & Anor v	[PC] 55
I		Li Taz Chiu v Ngo Chuk Nam	[CA] 246
Iranee; Mahuvawalla v	[CA] 248	Liang Chang Liang Huei; Liang Sang Seng v	[HC] 489
J		Liang Sang Seng v Liang Chang Liang Huei	[HC] 489
Juan Ysmael & Co Inc v Government of the Republic of Indonesia	[PC] 36	Ling Francis & Anor; Yuk Kee (a firm) v	[HC] 557
K		Liu Hok Yan t/a Liu Hok Yan & Associates; Chinese Rhenish Church HK Synod v	[HC] 341
Kai Nam (a firm) v Ma Kam Chan	[PC] 89	Liu Lan Fong; Hangkam Kwintong Woo v	[PC] 45
Ko Chik Nam; R v	[DC] 594	Lo Mon Hung; Nam Wah Investment Co v	[CA] 254
Koo Too Shing & Ors; Li Ching & Ors v	[HC] 414	Loke Choong Wing v Kwo Heung Lum & Anor	[HC] 633
Kowloon Motor Bus Co (1933) Ltd; Lau Mui v	[CA] 265	Lui Wai Chun & Ors; R v	[CA] 111
		Lung Siu Kung; R v	[HC] 551

Table of Cases Reported

	Page		Page
M		R	
Ma Kam Chan;		R v Lam Tuk Yu [CA]	237
Kai Nam (a firm) v [PC]	89	R v Lui Wai Chun & Ors [CA]	111
Mah Keung Wong v		R v Lung Siu Kung [HC]	551
Chuen Cheong Hong [CA]	262	R v Mau Cheung Lung	
Mahuvawalla v Iranee [CA]	248	& Anor [CA]	282
Mak Lau Siu Kan;		R v Ng Wai Kwong [HC]	586
Lai Man Yau & Anor v [CA]	223	R v Yu Po Shing [HC]	623
Mak Lau Sui Kan v		R; Chan Kau v [PC]	63
Lai Man Yau & Anor [HC]	215	R; Lee Chun Chuen v [PC]	79
Mau Cheung Lung & Anor;		RJ Reynolds Tobacco Co;	
R v [CA]	282	Carreras Ltd v [HC]	493
Monkhouse; Lamb v [HC]	511	Rahim; Foreign Exchange	
N		& Investment Ltd v [HC]	610
Nam Wah Investment Co v		Robinson v Chan William [HC]	607
Lo Mon Hung [CA]	254	S	
Ng Hung Nam;		Siu Wai Kin; Lee Cheuk v [CA]	118
Attorney General v [CA]	114	Sky King Restaurant Ltd;	
Ng Wai Kwong; R v [HC]	586	Central Enterprises Ltd v [CA]	270
Ng Wan (Proprietor of Sang		So Yim; Ng Wan	
Kee) v So Yim [CA]	258	(Proprietor of Sang Kee) v ... [CA]	258
Ngo Chuk Nam;		South Sea Textile	
Li Taz Chiu v [CA]	246	Manufacturing Co v Wong	
O		Chit Kee [HC]	555
Ocean Tramp, The [HC]	604	T	
Owners of the Adri XV;		Tai On Machinery Works	
Wong Chun Ho t/a Hong		Ltd; Commissioner of	
Kong World Wise		Inland Revenue v [HC]	461
Enterprises Co v [HC]	579	Tai Shum Jewellery Trading	
P		Co v Christianos [HC]	590
Pang Chun Ying; Chow		Tang Chi Kin v	
Hau Yung v [DC]	322	Tang Fong Chuen [CA]	95
Public Reclamations and		Tang Chi Kin; Tang	
Works Compensation		Fong Chuen v [HC]	107
Tribunal, Re, ex p Tsang		Tang Fong Chuen v	
Shiu Tim & Ors [HC]	368	Tang Chi Kin [HC]	107
R		Tang Fong Chuen;	
R v Chan Kam Sang [HC]	642	Tang Chi Kin v [CA]	95
R v Chen Wan Yung & Anor . [CA]	310	Tse Hung & Ors; Tse Moon	
R v Cheng Pak Hei & Ors [HC]	351	Sak (Executor of the Will of	
R v Chow Sau Sing [CA]	199	Tse Lai Chiu, deceased) v [HC]	160
R v Hewett [HC]	645	Tse Moon Sak (Executor of	
R v Ko Chik Nam [DC]	594	the Will of Tse Lai Chiu,	
		deceased) v Tse Hung	
		& Ors [HC]	160

Hong Kong Cases

	Page		Page
W		Wong Shek Wah Paul	
Wanglee v Choi Mei Po & Ors (Tai Pan Agencies Ltd & Anor, third parties) [DC]	666	& Ors; Lee Wai Tong & Ors v [HC]	501
Wong CW Alan; Chan Wing Kwong (an infant) & Anor v [CA]	124	Wong Tadpole v ABC Commercial Service [HC]	576
Wong Ching & Ors; Cheng Chung Pong & Anor v [HC]	544	Wong Ying Kuen v Wong Yu Shi & Ors [HC]	478
Wong Chit Kee; South Sea Textile Manufacturing Co v [HC]	555	Wong Yu Shi & Ors; Wong Ying Kuen v [HC]	478
Wong Chun Ho t/a Hong Kong World Wise Enterprises Co v Owners of the Adri XV [HC]	579	Y	
Wong Joan; Wong Michael v [CA]	141	Y & Anor (infants), Re [HC]	378
Wong Michael v Wong Joan [CA]	141	Yee Sang Metal Supplies Co v Defag Construction Co & Anor [HC]	660
		Yeh Tso Lin v Leong Siew Tuck & Ors [HC]	626
		Yu Po Shing; R v [HC]	623
		Yuk Kee (a firm) v Ling Francis & Anor [HC]	557

SUBJECT INDEX

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

Habeas corpus

Arrest under Deportation of Aliens Ordinance – Whether warrants for further detention valid – Summary procedure and long procedure – Right to be told of reason for detention – Deportation of Aliens Ordinance (Cap 240) ss 3, 4, 5 & 8

Chu Wing Hei v Attorney General HC 536

Judicial review

Decision of Public Reclamation and Works Tribunal – Extinguishment of marine rights – Whether qualification to compensation applicable to injurious affection under the English legislation applicable here – Whether betterment should be off set – Public Reclamation and Works Ordinance (Cap 113) ss 5 & 6
Re Public Reclamations and Works Compensation Tribunal, ex p Tsang Shiu Tim & Ors HC 368

Right to judicial review – Decision of Public Reclamation and Works Tribunal – Whether failure to provide for some mode of appeal in Ordinance prevented a party from applying for judicial review – Public Reclamation and Works Ordinance (Cap 113) s 7

Re Public Reclamations and Works Compensation Tribunal, ex p Tsang Shiu Tim & Ors HC 368

ARBITRATION

Award

Application to set aside – Misconduct of arbitrators – Failure to allow applicant right to be heard on documentary evidence adduced on request by arbitrators – Whether applicant waived right to such hearing – Arbitration Ordinance s 26(2)

Wong Chun Ho t/a Hong Kong World Wise Enterprises Co v Owners of the ADRI XV HC 579

BANKRUPTCY AND INSOLVENCY

Bankruptcy notice

Setting aside – Cross-demand by party served with notice – Stay of execution of judgment

Re Foo Wai Yu HC 565

BETTING, GAMBLING AND LOTTERIES

Wagering agreement

Reciprocal risk of loss – Whether betting slips were lottery tickets – Gambling Ordinance (Cap 148) ss 2(1) & 9(b)

Attorney General v Chan Wah HC 684

CIVIL PROCEDURE

Adjournment

Case set down in fixture list – Matters to be considered

Tai Shum Jewellery Trading Co v Christianos HC 590

Appeal

Case stated – Failure to state findings of facts in case stated – Whether defectively drawn – Discretion of court to look at notes of evidence – Form prescribed to magistrates when preparing case stated – Magistrates Ordinance 1932 s 112

Mah Keung Wong v Chuen Cheong Hong CA 262

Grounds of appeal – Grounds of appeal should be substantive and specific

Wong Michael v Wong Joan CA 141

Notes of evidence – Whether judge's direction that a reporter was not necessary proper

Lau Mui v Kowloon Motor Bus Co (1933) Ltd CA 265

Summary judgment – Further evidence – Whether proper upon appeals of this nature to admit further or additional evidence

Robinson v Chan William HC 607

Discovery

Discovery of specific documents – Whether affidavit verifying list of relevant documents possessed by a party conclusive both as to possession and relevance – Rules of the Supreme Court O 24 r 7

Dah Sing Bank Ltd v Chu Roger CA 296

Only relevant documents subject to discovery – Test for relevance

Dah Sing Bank Ltd v Chu Roger CA 296

Further and better particulars

Allegation of fraud – Particulars within the knowledge of the applicant – Whether particulars should be given before or after discovery

Yeh Tso Lin v Leong Siew Tuck & Ors HC 626

Injunction

Inter partes summons – Whether ex parte interlocutory injunction should be continued pending trial

Del E Webb International Hotel Co v Hotel Merlin (Hong Kong) Ltd HC 395

Relevant considerations in the exercise of discretion – Relative strength of the parties' cases – Whether necessary to disturb the status quo – Whether interlocutory relief urgent – Balance of convenience – Intangible factors in quasi-family dispute – Grant of injunction would amount to whole of relief claimed

Lai Man Yau & Anor v Mak Lau Siu Kan CA 223

Interlocutory injunction

Balance of probability that plaintiff was entitled to relief – Injunction would have the effect of granting sole relief claimed – Practice of the court and conditions required

Mak Lau Sui Kan v Lai Man Yau & Anor HC 215

Judgment debtor

Committal under O 44 – Application for release – Jurisdiction of court – Committal for failure to give bail – ‘Until execution of judgment or further order of the court’ – Whether court could entertain repeated applications – Purpose of provision – Rules of the Supreme Court O 44A r 3(2), 4(2) & 5(1)

Foreign Exchange & Investment Ltd v Rahim HC 610

Judgment in default of defence

Application to set aside – Defendant in seeking leave to defend should file affidavit revealing defence on the merits – Leave would be granted if affidavit disclosed reasonable defence – Conditions could be imposed if inconsistencies in affidavit gave rise to doubts about defendant’s bona fides

Fing Lee Co v Hung Kam Fung & Anor HC 617

Judgments and orders

Amendment – Amendment to include award of interest – Whether original failure was accidental slip or omission – Whether equitable to exercise discretion to amend in circumstances – Rules of the Supreme Court O 6 r 2A & O 20 r 11

Yee Sang Metal Supplies Co v Defag Construction Co & Anor HC 660

Consent order – Setting aside – Judgment final and could not be set aside save in the case of fraud or mistake

Ho Shiu Kwong v Au Yeung Leung & Anor CA 288

Consent order – Whether equitable rule that time was not of essence of the contract applicable in the case of consent order – Law Amendment (Miscellaneous Provision) Ordinance (Cap 341) s 8

Ho Shiu Kwong v Au Yeung Leung & Anor CA 288

Pleadings

Striking out – Action by members of defendant association – Locus standi of plaintiff – Whether chairman of association could make contract in capacity as chairman of another company with association – Rules of the Supreme Court O 18 r 19

Lee Wai Tong & Ors v Wong Shek Wah Paul & Ors HC 501

Stay of execution

Assignment of judgment debt – Whether stay of execution of judgment pending trial of third party proceedings in related action should be granted – Rules of the Supreme Court O 45 r 11

Re Foo Wai Yu HC 565

Striking out pleadings

Application should be made by summons and not notice of motion – Rules of the Supreme Court O 18 r 19

Lee Wai Tong & Ors v Wong Shek Wah Paul & Ors HC 501

Summary judgment

Whether triable issue existed – Breach of covenants in tenancy agreement – Whether there was waiver – Whether allegation of conviction in affidavit sufficient admissible evidence to show breach – Rules of the Supreme Court O 14
Central Enterprises Ltd v Sky King Restaurant Ltd CA 270

Writ

Service – Whether defendant carrying on business in Hong Kong as foreign incorporated body – Whether local branch of a foreign company a separate legal entity from head office – Registration under Pt XI of Companies Ordinance and under Business Registration Regulations served as notice to public – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) Pt XI

Alexandra Knitters Ltd v AB Hellenic HC 571

COMPANIES AND CORPORATIONS

Foreign incorporated body

Whether defendant carrying on business in Hong Kong as foreign incorporated body – Whether local branch of a foreign company a separate legal entity from head office – Registration under Pt XI of Companies Ordinance and under Business Registration Regulations – Acknowledgment of service of writ – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) Pt XI

Alexandra Knitters Ltd v AB Hellenic HC 571

CONTRACT

Frustration

Test to be applied – Change in circumstances – Whether so fundamental as to constitute frustration

Hangkam Kwingtong Woo v Liu Lan Fong PC 45

Validity

Contract with enemy – ‘Enemy’ – Whether citizens of occupied territory could be regarded enemy of fellow citizens who left territory for Allied territory
Hangkam Kwingtong Woo v Liu Lan Fong PC 45

COURTS AND JUDICIAL SYSTEM

Jurisdiction

Action against foreign state – Whether Supreme Court had jurisdiction – Whether previous application at magistracy constituted submission to jurisdiction – Magistrates Ordinance (No 41 of 1932) s 43

Yuk Kee (a firm) v Ling Francis & Anor HC 557

CRIMINAL LAW AND PROCEDURE

Appeal

Sentence – Whether appeal by defendant for a more severe sentence an abuse of the process of the court

R v Lui Wai Chun & Ors CA 111

Arrest

Whether arrest had to be justified as well as lawful – Resisting a police officer in due execution of his duty – Proper approach to determining if a power had been validly exercised – Police Force Ordinance (Cap 232) ss 9 & 58

R v Chow Sau Sing CA 199

Cautioned statement

Admissibility – Cautioned statement ringed with artificiality – Application of Judges' Rules – Breach of Judges' Rules

R v Cheng Pak Hei & Ors HC 351

Cross-examination

Cross-examination on inadmissible statement – Cross-examination must be such that jury would not think that statement had been made

R v Lam Tuk Yu CA 237

Dangerous drugs

Unlawful possession – Owner/occupier not necessarily in possession of drugs found on premises – Knowledge of drugs vital – Failure to testify

R v Lung Siu Kung HC 551

Embezzlement

Whether ownership of thing embezzled must be proved – Whether servant who made unauthorized conversion of cheque received proceeds on account of employer

Attorney General v Ng Hung Nam CA 114

Judges' Rules

Applicability – Only pre-1964 rules applicable in Hong Kong

R v Cheng Pak Hei & Ors HC 351

Murder

Provocation – Elements of provocation – Intention to kill – Whether sufficient evidence of provocation to go to jury

Lee Chun Chuen v R PC 79

Provocation – Misdirection upon the law of provocation – Application of proviso in s 82 of Criminal Procedure Ordinance (Cap 221) – Principles on which Privy Council would approach an appeal – Criminal Procedure Ordinance (Cap 221) s 82

Lee Chun Chuen v R PC 79