

人文社科新论丛书

刘树森 编

基督教在中国： 比较研究视角下的 近现代中西文化交流



53



上海人民出版社


45

人文社科新论丛书

刘树森 编

基督教在中国： 比较研究视角下的 近现代中西文化交流

B978-53
L676

 上海人民出版社

图书在版编目(CIP)数据

基督教在中国:比较研究视角下的近现代中西文化交流/刘树森编. —上海:上海人民出版社,2010
(人文社科新论丛书)

ISBN 978-7-208-08656-2

I. 基... II. 刘... III. ①基督教-宗教文化-作用-文化交流-中国、西方国家-近代②基督教-宗教文化-作用-文化交流-中国、西方国家-现代 IV. B978-53
G04-53

中国版本图书馆CIP数据核字(2009)第104818号

责任编辑 孙瑜

封面装帧 王小阳

· 人文社科新论丛书 ·

基督教在中国

——比较研究视角下的近现代中西文化交流

刘树森 编

世纪出版集团

上海人民出版社出版

(200001 上海福建中路193号 www.ewen.cc)

世纪出版集团发行中心发行

上海华业装璜印刷厂有限公司印刷

开本 890×1240 1/32 印张 10.5 插页 3 字数 258,000

2010年1月第1版 2010年1月第1次印刷

ISBN 978-7-208-08656-2/B·755

定价 25.00 元

出版说明

近十几年来，出版界愈益为生计所累，纯学术著作因印数较少，出版颇为困难。而在另一方面，随着我国国民素质的普遍提高，高校招生的迅速扩大，整个社会的学术创造力大大增强，学术成果愈见丰厚。除学术专著以外，频繁举行的国内或国际学术会议，也形成了大量群体性的学术成果。有鉴于此，本社决定策划出版《人文社科新论》丛书，意在给高质量的学术论文集的出版开辟一个新的园地，使广大学者积年研究所得的学术心得能够嘉惠学林，传诸后世。

本社向以传播和译介学术文化为己任，为将优秀的学术成果转化高质量的出版物而努力。出版一流学者的一流学术著作固然是我们不懈的追求，但学术成果的价值常常需要时间的检验，凡能采用新材料、运用新方法、提出新观点，新颖、扎实的学术著作我们均竭诚欢迎。列入这套丛书的论文集中的文章，或许在各自领域里所取得的成果有大有小，但这些成果都是逐步成长累积的学术大厦的必要组成部分。

属于人文社会科学的学科林林总总，决定了这套丛书的选题范围比较宽广。在丛书出版的初始阶段，取稿以研究中国传统文化者为主，且暂不作分类，待到有一定的积累和规模后，或可按学科分类构成若干专题。

学术为天下公器，立言可达人生不朽。我们殷切期待海内外学者不吝赐稿，为学术文化事业的繁荣发展共同做好这件有意义的事情。

Abstracts

Christianity in China: Perspectives and Methodologies as Comparative Studies is the proceedings of the titular seminar, which was held on November 25~26, 2006 at Peking University. The proceedings consist of sixteen essays, in addition to three forewords respectively by such professors as Zhou Zhenhe (Fudan University), Meng Hua (Peking University) and Yang Huilin (Renmin University), and an afterword by Professor Liu Shusen (Peking University). For the convenience of English readers, the English abstracts of the sixteen Chinese essays are provided below in the alphabetic order of their authors.

Chinese Literature and Christian Culture

Chen Weihua (Hunan Normal University)

Based on a statistical account of the Chinese publications as translated texts of biblical stories through different periods in the 20th century, the essay makes a general analysis of the thematic features and cultural connotations of such publications and further discusses the influence of biblical literature on Chinese novelists such as Mao Dun, interpreting the interaction as a driving force for literary development and reform.

The Chinese Recorder and Chinese Versions of God in Early Modern China: Looking into the Controversy of Missionary Translators

Cheng Xiaojuan (Henan University)

As an intensive study of the debates published in *The Chinese Recorder*, a leading missionary journal in China in the 19th century, the essay is intended to look into the controversies over finding Chinese equivalences of God when Western missionaries made efforts to translate *Bible* from English to Chinese in the second half of the 19th century. As missionaries understood their mission as well as Chinese cultural heritage from different standpoints and perspectives, they adopted different translation strategies. As a result, they were prone to choosing their own Chinese equivalence for God. The controversy lasted over half a century and came to the virtual agreement that a few Chinese equivalences were acceptable for the common goal of Christianity.

The Image of China from the Perspectives of American Missionaries to China in the 19th Century

Cui Lifang (Nankai University)

As representatives of American missionaries who were active in China in the 19th and 20th centuries, John Livingstone Nevius, Samuel Wells Williams, William Alexander Parsons Martin, and Arthur Henderson Smith were prone to idealizing Chinese politics, education, law and other aspects of Chinese civilization in their works such as *China and the Chinese* and *The Lore of Cathay, or the Intellect of China*. The essay interprets this phenomenon from the perspective of the “other” and compares their idealization with negative views of American diplomats. Such idealization of Chinese civilization and society comes from the collective imagination of American missionaries and also mirrors their disappointment on the social reality in their motherland.

From Fusion to Transcendence: Western Missionaries in Ming and Qing Dynasties and Their Interpretation of Chinese Classics in *The True Meaning of the Lord of Heaven* and *Tian Ru Yin*

Guang Ensen (Shangdong University at Weihai)

As missionary pioneers who ventured into China in the Ming Dynasty, Matteo Ricci and Antonio de Santa María Caballero took different strategic attitudes toward Confucianism, which could find best expression in their influential works such as *The True Meaning of the Lord of Heaven* and *Tian Ru Yin* (*Concordantia legis divinae cum quatuor libris sinicis*). The essay discusses the background and evolution of their attitudes from fusion of Confucianism toward the conscious transcendence in order to arrive at the integration of western and Chinese cultures. Their attitudes have been proven to have profound influence on their successors in Qing Dynasty.

Western Missionaries in the Late Ming and Early Qing Dynasties and Translation: A Study of Adaptation as Translation Strategy

Huang Zhonglian (Huazhong Normal University)

By introducing the advanced western learning in science and technology as the path for Christianity to have access to Chinese people, Western Missionaries in Late Ming Dynasty and Early Qing Dynasty made adroit use of adaption as their translation strategy. On the above assumption, the essays explores how Matteo Ricci, Didaco de Pantoja, Sabatino de Ursis, Giulios Aleni and other missionaries cooperated with their Chinese assistants and manipulated the translated texts by deliberately deleting some of the content of the original text, adding new information,

editing and commenting on the Chinese version, so as to fulfill their missionary missions in the Chinese context.

Destinies of Christian Pacifists in Early Modern China and Japan: A Comparative Study of P. C. Hsu and Toyohiko Kagawa

Liu Jiafeng (Huazhong Normal University)

The essay is a comparative case study of P. C. Hsu and Toyohiko Kagawa as representatives of Chinese and Japanese pacifists in the first half of the 20th century. In addition to finding their identical belief in Christian love as the solution to international conflicts and social injustice, the essay attempts to explain the difference of their thoughts in terms of nationalism and peacemaking ideals, with a chronological narrative of their major activities as pacifists.

Joseph-Marie Amiot and Chinese Music: A Study of the Evolution of His Identity

Long Yun (Peking University)

Apart from his other achievements as musician, Joseph-Marie Amiot distinguished himself by his outstanding contribution to translating and disseminating Chinese music into the musical circles of the west. The essay explores the evolution of his identity from French missionary musician to a student of Chinese music and eventually a master of Chinese music. With his masterpieces such as *Mémoire de la Musique des Chinois, tant anciens que modernes* (1776), he contributed significantly to enriching the fusion of western music and Chinese music.

Western Interpreters Assisted by Chinese Writers and the Reception of “Political Economy” in Late Qing Dynasty: A Study of the Chinese Version of *Political Economy for Use in School, and for Private Instruction*

Sun Qing (Fudan University)

With the reference of the original English text by William Chambers & Robert Chambers, the essay makes a comparative study of both Chinese and Japanese versions of *Political Economy for Use in School, and for Private Instruction*, along with a detailed analysis of their translation samples. Though the former was translated by John Fryer and his Chinese assistants in 1885, eighteen years after the Japanese version appeared, it contributed to bringing the western theory of political economics into China and exerted significant influence on Chinese audience not only by the theory itself but also by the translation strategy John Fryer and his collaborators used in manipulating the translated texts for the expected reception of western political economics.

The Image of Mongols from the Perspective of James Gilmour

Temur Temule (Nanjing University)

The Scottish missionary James Gilmour performed missionary work in Mongolia nearly through the last quarter of the 19th century and published prolifically on the history and life of Mongols according to his own experiences as missionary traveler to many places in Mongolia. Most of his essays about Mongols were collected in *Among the Mongols*, which has been considered as a major source about the image of Mongols. The essay gives a critical account of how James Gilmour shaped the image of

Mongols with a focus on his perspective as the western “Other” in narrating and interpreting the nature and life of Mongols.

The Tungwen College in Peking and The Boji Medical School in Canton: A Comparative Study

Wang Fang (Sun Yat-sen University)

Through a detailed narrative of the founding and function of The Tungwen College in Peking and The Boji Medical School in Canton, the essay discusses their different efforts to introduce western learning and languages into China. The study is also made of their different approaches to contributing to the reforms and developments of China in early modern times. The function and contributions of such missionaries as William Alexander Parson Martin and John Glassgow Kerr are highlighted with statistic interpretation. Sun Yat-sen and a few of his colleagues were cited as representatives of influenced Chinese students of the Boji Medical School in Canton.

James Legge and His View on Confucianism

Wang Hui (Hong Kong Baptist University)

The essay looks into James Legge's English translation of Chinese classics, as represented by his eight-volume *The Chinese Classics*, with a critical study of his understanding of Confucianism through different phases of his career as missionary translator. Besides, James Legge's involvement with the debate over Chinese equivalences of God in the second half of the 19th century is interpreted as a necessary step for him to identify Confucianism as monotheism.

A Comparative Study of Chinese and Western Secretaries in Young Women's Christian Association of China

Wang Li (Capital Normal University)

The essay compares its Chinese and Western Secretaries of Young Women's Christian Association of China in the 1920's, in terms of their religious belief, education, leadership, and personality, and makes an analysis of their discrepancies and cooperative efforts for Christian missions. Grace Copock and Maud Russell are emphatically studied with regard to their contribution to training Chinese secretaries. It also argues that the nature of their cooperative relation relates to the complicated interaction of western and Chinese cultures.

William Alexander Parsons Martin and His Chinese Translation of *Elements of International Law*

Wu Baoxiao (Hebei Normal University)

On the basis of a comparison of the English original and its Chinese version, the essay discusses William Alexander Parsons Martin's Chinese translation of *Elements of International Law*, including his attitude as missionary translator and his strategy and skills. In addition, it also argues that his Chinese version was not a complete one and far from being faithful to the original text, with intentional mistranslation of many key terms. Thus the role of the Chinese version of *Elements of International Law* was both inspiring and misleading.

The Japanese Experiences as Model and The Legal Recognition of Christian Schools in the Reign of the Republic of China

Zhang Yongguang (Huazhong Normal University)

The essay first traces the development of Christian schools in Japan in the second half of the 19th century and the legal prohibition of Christian education in 1899, and then explores its consequence on Christian education in China. In spite of the social disagreements on the legal prohibition or recognition of Christian education, the official attitude of the Chinese government remained relatively tolerant to Christian education in the first half of the 20th century. That accounts for the steady development of Christian education and the dissemination of western learning in the process of China's modernization.

Donald MacGillivray's Chinese Translation of *Parables from Nature*: A Study of literary Translation by Protestant Women Missionaries

Zhu Jing (Peking University)

From the perspectives of both gender studies and missionary studies, the essay gives a historical and critical account of protestant Women Missionaries' Chinese translation of biblical or allegorical literature, as represented by Donald MacGillivray, Laura M. White, Calvin Wilson Mateer and their Chinese disciples. Then it focuses on Donald MacGillivray's Chinese version of *Parables from Nature*, illustrating the thematic structure and moral enlightenment of the tales in the book as well as the skills she used as missionary translator.

On Two Missionary Cases during the Reign of Emperor Qianlong

Zhou Pingping (Tsinghua University)

The essay is an effort to explore the nature of the official policy of prohibiting western missionaries from activities in the reign of Emperor Qianlong. By analyzing the discrepancy of the official attitudes toward

two missionary cases in 1747 and 1754, it argues that the overall prohibition and punishment of missionaries in 1747 was in light of the increasing tension between the Chinese government and Vatican, particularly as a result of the latter's forbiddance of Chinese disciples from worshipping Confucius, and that the relatively forgiving policy in 1754 was an exceptional departure from the consistent strategy of treating missionaries in the reign of Emperor Qianlong.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

“Christianity in China: Perspectives and Methodologies as Comparative Studies” was a supervised seminar for young scholars in China, which was held on November 25~26, 2006 at Peking University. Major funding for the titular research project, including the seminar and the subsequent publication of the proceedings as the final result of the research project, was provided by the Institute of Comparative Literature and Culture at Peking University, Department of English at Peking University, the Institute for the Study of Christian Culture at Renmin University of China, and The Endowed EDS-Stewart Chair for Chinese-Western Cultural History and Asian Scholarship Fund of the Ricci Institute for Chinese-Western Cultural History at the University of San Francisco Center for the Pacific Rim.

The academic committee of “Christianity in China: Perspectives and Methodologies as Comparative Studies” wishes to thank all the sponsors of the research project. Without their generous and significant support, it would have been next to impossible to image the successful completion of the research project.

序

周振鹤

一般以为 20 世纪初是比较史学的开端，只不过被认为是比较史学开山的布洛赫本人也承认，他并不是比较方法的创造者：“比较方法已不再需要加以创造。在人类的许多科学领域中，比较方法很久以来就已经证明了自身的效能。”这样说是很得体的。比较观点或比较视角是许多学科，尤其是历史研究的自然的行为。历史学家在编纂历史或一般人们在阅读历史时自然而然产生的就是比较的思路。司马迁所谓“通古今之变”，这个“变”就是通过比较才能看得出来的。司马光之所以将历史看作为“资治通鉴”，也就是对历代的统治进行比较的结果。

不过用比较视角与比较方法来研究历史，并不等于就是比较史学。用余英时先生的话来说，比较史学“是一种专门之学。而且尚在发展阶段，一时不易见其归趋”。比较史学的最终目的也许是在寻找历史的规律性的东西，以创立新的历史观。这个鹄的比较高远，因此无论在中国在西方，比较史学还是不很发达的一个领域。不过，即使我们今天不必追求比较史学的高度，但对历史比较研究的实践，也是应该加以重视的。因为就认识论看来，比较是认识事物与现象不可或缺的手段与方法。在历史领域中，遇到与自身不同的历史现象时，比较视角往往油然而生。大而言之，黑格尔说中国没有历史，那是与欧

洲的历史发展相比较而言的，因为他以为光是王朝的更替并非历史的真谛。小而言之，19世纪来华的新教传教士在他们主办的杂志上刊登《东西史记和合》，将中国历史与西洋历史并列写出，为的是让中国人知道西方也有自己的历史，这些都是显而易见的例子。即使在只知道自身而不知他者的历史时，也同样会有比较行为产生，那就是时代不同的比较。以司马迁与司马光等人为代表的中国史家所著述的典籍里就充满了比较的事例。

比较观点看似自然，其实能够做到认真的比较而且获得真正的认识并不容易。而且比较的视角，除了主观的原因外，有时也要受到客观的制约。当世界东西方还相对处于隔离状态时，双方对于对方的了解往往不免于天方夜谭，因此以自身为世界中心的观点在许多文明里都出现过，而在中国则尤其突出。从古到今，中国人经历了一个中国的世界、中国的亚洲（或东方）与世界的中国三个阶段。可以说，在晚明以前，中国人是没有世界观念的，有的只是“天下”的意识，视整个世界只是由中国与四夷所组成，所谓“四海之内，六合之中”，都与“天下”是一个意思，所以在在一个很长的时期里世界就是中国，或者说是中国与四夷之和。晚明以后，天主教传教士带来了全新的世界地理知识，绘制了《坤輿万国全图》，有细心的中国士人开始对“天下”的意识发生怀疑，因为从这幅地图上，与中国发生朝贡关系或受中国文化影响的国家只有五十来个，只占世界的五分之一。中国原来并不等于世界，这让一部分知识分子感到了强烈的震撼，于是而有“无远弗届，是耶非耶”的疑问产生。这就是比较的结果。

但至少到晚明的时候中国还等于东方。虽然中国文化的广被不至于无远弗届，但在东方在亚洲还是处于中心的位置。只是这个地理现实在晚明并不是任何人都认同的，有人是不愿正视，更多的人是还蒙在鼓里。到了清代，这种情况并没有改善，康乾盛世时期的皇帝是知

道这个真实世界的，因为宫廷里有各种传教士所绘制的世界地图，但他们依然以中国加四夷的天下来看世界。即使魏源的《海国图志》已经具备世界地理眼光，但他仍然认为英国不过是一个海国，也就是放远去了的四夷之一而已。不过此时许多知识分子，已经知道中国不等于世界，最多只等于亚洲了。比如，徐继畲写《瀛寰志略》时，有人还建议他要中国地图放在亚洲地图前面。大约要到清帝国在甲午战争中为日本所败，许多中国人才完全觉得中国不过是世界万国之一而已，不但不是世界的中心，也难以说是亚洲的中心了。换句话说，也只是在 20 世纪快来临时，中国士人才明白中国不过是万国之一。

地理空间知识的扩展是最为明确、最为客观的事实，但要承认这一事实，并且加以客观上的比较，尚且如此不易，因而如何将历史事件、历史现象以及历史人物的比较研究放在一个相对的客观视野中，必然是更不容易了。这种不容易，有时并非客观上的原因，而往往是主观上的无视或臆想。乾隆皇帝就不愿意承认英夷有跟中国可以比较的资格，意识不到这个九万里外的海国对中国存在的潜在威胁。更有甚者，晚清以来西方科学技术虽使许多中国人折服，但与中国古代典籍作比较后，有相当多的知识分子却得出“西学中源论”的结论来。也就是说，所有西方先进的科技，不但是小道，是末学，而且全都起源于中国。这样的比较可有一点实际的意义？

以是，用比较的观点来研究历史看似简单容易，其实包含着极其复杂的内涵。2006 年底，我参加了“基督教在中国：比较研究的视角与方法”青年学者研讨会，那次会议的讨论结集成了这本论文集。从中我们可以看到，年轻的学子们不但已经开始历史的比较研究，而且已经有了不俗的成绩。他们比较的视角既有时间系列上前后阶段的纵向比较，也有同一阶段不同地域的横向比较，而且他们已经尝试在比较同中之异与异中之同。例如说，以类似的宗教事件在不同国家的