

漢唐之間的宗教藝術與考古

BETWEEN HAN AND TANG

RELIGIOUS ART AND ARCHAEOLOGY
IN A TRANSFORMATIVE PERIOD

巫鴻 主編

Edited by WU HUNG

文物出版社

北京·2000

CULTURAL RELICS PUBLISHING HOUSE

BEIJING · 2000

漢唐之間的宗教藝術與考古

巫 鴻 主編



文物出版社
北京·2000

BETWEEN HAN AND TANG:
RELIGIOUS ART AND ARCHAEOLOGY IN A TRANSFORMATIVE PERIOD

Edited by
Wu Hung



CULTURAL RELICS PUBLISHING HOUSE
BEIJING • 2000

責任編輯：張小舟 李 力

封面設計：程星濤

責任印制：梁秋卉

圖書在版編目(CIP)數據

漢唐之間的宗教藝術與考古/巫鴻主編. - 北京：文物出版社，2000. 5

ISBN 7 - 5010 - 1213 - X

I. 漢… II. 巫… III. 宗教藝術 - 中國 - 古代 - 國際學術會議 - 文集

IV. J120.93 - 53

中國版本圖書館 CIP 數據核字(2000)第 22422 號

漢唐之間的宗教藝術與考古

巫鴻 主編

★

文物出版社出版發行

北京五四大街 29 號

<http://www.wenwu.com>

E-mail: web@wenwu.com

北京燕華印刷廠印刷

新華書店經銷

2000 年 6 月第一版 2000 年 6 月第一次印刷

787 × 1092 16 開 印張：36.75

ISBN 7 - 5010 - 1213 - X/K · 502 定價：198 圓



編輯委員會

楊 泓	馬世長	巫 鴻	羅世平
李裕群	蔣人和	李崇峰	汪悅進

EDITORIAL COMMITTEE

Yang Hong	Ma Shichang	Wu Hung
Luo Shiping	Li Yuqun	Katherine R. Tsiang
Li Chongfeng	Eugene Y. Wang	

前言

這是《漢唐之間的藝術與考古》三卷論文集中的第一卷，主題為宗教藝術與考古。漢唐之間的四個世紀，或稱三國、兩晉、南北朝和隋，是中國歷史和美術史上極為重要的一個時期。諸種歷史因素，包括地方自治、民族混合和大規模人口遷徙等等，因統一帝國的分裂而在文化和藝術的發展中起到領先作用。許多新的文化和藝術現象出現了，開創了唐代文化藝術高峰之先河。

這些新現象中之三項尤為重要，可說是代表了這一時期文化藝術中的幾個主要趨勢。一是因國家分裂而形成的文化傳播的新模式：本期內中國文化和藝術發展的主要形式不再是中央文化通過統一行政系統輻射式的擴散，而更多地是通過地方和中心、本土與外域多元文化傳統的互動。這種互動極大地影響了各種藝術和視覺形式，如建築、繪畫、雕塑、服飾及喪葬藝術等等。

第二，作為這一廣泛文化互動現象的一個重要組成部分，佛教大規模地傳入中國。佛教藝術被統治階層和一般百姓接受和推崇，隨之而發生的是中國宗教和宗教藝術中的一個根本轉變：與以家族為單位的祖先崇拜和以個人為單位的求僊長生不同，以宗教社團為基礎的佛教信仰激發了人們修造寺廟和偶像的巨大熱情。佛教也刺激了對新建築形式如塔剎和石窟寺的創造，作為這些宗教建築有機組成部分的壁畫和雕塑亦得到長足的發展。這些佛教建築、美術形式及有關的宗教儀軌和視覺模式又強烈地影響了道教寺觀藝術在這一時期內的建立。

第三，以繪畫和書法而論，這一時期中的一個極為重要的現象是獨立藝術家的產生，其作品越來越多地采取了可供個人欣賞和收集的卷軸形式，其觀眾也更多是有文化藝術修養的上層人士。這種精英藝術與以往無名工匠所創造的宗教和實用美術判然有別。隨着收藏書畫興趣的高漲，在這一時期內也出現了鑒定學以及品評書畫、概述書畫歷史和美學的著作，其寫作方式和提出的美學原則強烈地影響了中國書畫藝術在隨後一千五百年內的發展。

這三卷論文集是一個大型學術合作研究項目的成果。這一研究項目由芝加哥大學發起，其他四個主辦單位包括北京大學考古文博院、中國社會科學院考古研究所、中央美術學院美術史系及哈佛大學建築和美術史系。我們的一個主要目的是通過中外學者的合作，為這一複雜歷史時期中美術和考古的研究打下一個新的基礎。這個基礎的一個因素是對新考古材料的介紹、使用和不斷綜合，另一個因素是對新的研究方法的討論和在考古材料基礎上對習用歷史概念的反思。

三卷論文集分別以這一時期中美術和物質文化的三個重要方面為主題。本卷的主題是宗教藝術與考古；第二卷將集中討論地區間文化和藝術的互動和影響；第三卷的主題是各種“世俗”藝術和物質文化形式，包括器物、書畫、城市、墓葬等等。每卷計劃收入二十篇左右具有新材料或新觀點的論文，其作者來自不同國家的文物和學術機構。論文的選題由來自以上所列五個大學和研究所的八名學者組成的編輯委員會推薦審核。這些論文首先由其著者在本計劃所組織的三次國際學術會議上宣讀并由與會學者討論，經修改後收入文集。

根據這一程序，本卷論文集可說是於1999年11月在芝加哥大學召開的第一次《漢唐之間的藝術與考古》國際學術會議的成果。文集中所收的十八篇論文歸入四個部分，每一部分反映了這一時期宗教美術和考古研究的一個主要方面或方向。第一部分中的論文是對若干省份和地區內中、小型石窟及石刻、摩崖的調查和研究。論文作者的調查範圍超出如雲岡、龍門和敦煌等著名大型石窟，所提供的材料對研究本期宗教藝術有特殊價值，其意義在於把學者的注意力從孤立的遺址，引導到廣大地域內宗教設施的網狀聯繫及特殊藝術風格和圖像的地理分布。

這一地域觀念在論文集的第二部分中得到進一步發展。這個部分的四篇論文均以新疆與河西地區的佛教美術為題，其研究範圍的一致突出了其研究方法上的側重。論文作者或以考古學分類方法對庫車地區石窟作整體調查，或探討克孜爾石窟與古代交通要道的關係，或研究印度和新疆壁畫圖像學之淵源，或重新考慮河西地區早期石窟的建造者和年代。

第三部分的主題是佛教寺院和造像。近年來對洛陽永寧寺遺址的發掘使學者得以確定六世紀初北魏皇室推崇的一種特殊雕塑風格，並思考其對當時宗教和墓葬雕塑一般發展的影響。山東和四川出土的大量造像又為研究南朝宗教藝術、南北藝術交流及其所反映的教派思想提供了極豐富的材料。比較這些基於考古新材料的討論，文集中這一部分的其他論文則重新考察熟知的佛教美術材料。這些考察多反映了作者在方法論上的思考，或嘗試解釋某一石窟裝飾設計的內在邏輯，或對如龍門古陽洞這樣複雜石窟的建造過程作研究方法上的討論。

對解釋方法的重視在文集第四部分中尤為突出，成為這一部分所收論文最主要的特點。文章作者集中對贊助人在宗教藝術創作中的作用進行了考察。所討論之贊助人包括具有強烈政治企圖的外族統治者、不同等級和階層的女施主及地方宗教社團的成員等等。在綜合分析考古和文獻材料的基礎上，這些作者得以確定這些贊助人的身份和他們支持宗教藝術的意圖。與此同時，他們探討了建造佛寺和製作造像的若干特殊歷史背景，也對早期道教美術的地域性以及佛、道藝術的複雜關係提出了自己的看法。

總的來說，這些論文的目的不是下結論，而是希望為這一時期宗教藝術和考古的研究提供新的材料和開拓新的路徑。讀者可以發現這些文章反映了多種研究方法、觀點和解釋。本卷的內容和編輯因此都反映了一定的歷史和史學觀念。以內容而論，本卷的研究重心從中國藝術的某些“巔峰”時刻轉移到混亂時期中重要歷史潮流的產生和初期發展。以編輯思想而論，編輯委員會的主導觀念不是強求方法和論點的一致，而是鼓勵不同方法和立場間的討論與合作，從而把這個研究領域推向一個新的階段。

《漢唐之間的藝術與考古》合作研究項目及三次國際會議由美國路斯基金會提供經費，本論文集由唐研究基金會資助出版。我們在此表示謝意。同時感謝文物出版社對出版論文集的全力支持。

王鴻

2000年5月10日

Introduction

This is the first of a series of three volumes of research papers, entitled collectively “Between Han and Tang: Art and Archaeology in a Transformative Period.” The approximately four centuries between the Han and Tang Dynasties, also known as the “Three Kingdoms, Two Jins, and Northern and Southern Dynasties,” was one of the most important periods in Chinese history and art history. The early dynasties of Qin and Han which first unified China had fallen. The break up of the empire brought new forces into play in the development of Chinese art and culture: regional autonomy, foreign incursions, and resettlement of populations. Many important changes in art and visual culture took place and initiated subsequent developments during the Sui and Tang dynasties.

Three pivotal changes characterized the art and material culture of this period: first, the political division of the country introduced new modes of cultural and artistic exchange. No longer dominated by a single metropolitan tradition and bureaucratic system. Chinese culture and art developed in new directions through the growth and interaction of regional traditions and foreign influences. Such cultural and artistic interaction became evident in every art form and in all domains of visual culture, including architecture, painting, sculpture, fashion, and funerary art.

Second, as part of this broad cultural interaction. Buddhism was introduced to China, and Buddhist art was promoted by both the central authority and local communities. This then brought about a fundamental change in religious art : instead of serving family-based ancestral cults and the individual pursuit for immortality, enormous effort was dedicated to creating temples and icons for a community-based worship. Buddhist faith inspired new types of monuments, such as cave chapels and pagodas; murals and sculptures were designed as integral elements of these structures. These Buddhist art and architectural forms, as well as related conventions in visual perception and imagination, also stimulated the formation of religious Daoist art during this period.

Third, in the sphere of painting and calligraphy, a group of individual artists

emerged from the ranks of anonymous artisans. Their work increasingly took the form of portable scrolls that were appreciated by an educated audience and collected by royal patrons. This elite art demonstrated an important departure from the mainly anonymous art made for ceremonial purposes in previous centuries. Along with interest in art collecting, there also appeared writings on art criticism, art theory and classification, and connoisseurship. These inventions strongly influenced the development of Chinese art over the next fifteen hundred years.

This series is a result of a large collaborative project. Initiated by the University of Chicago, it involves four other organizing institutions in China and the U. S. : the School of Archaeology and Museology at Peking University; the Institute of Archaeology at the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences; the Department of Art History at the Central Institute of Fine Arts, Beijing; and the Department of Art and Architecture at Harvard University. A general goal of the research project is to build up a new basis for studying Chinese art and archaeology during this complex historical period through collaboration between international scholars. While synthesizing new archaeological materials, this project and its publications also encourage serious discussion of research methods and re-examination of historical concepts.

Each of the three volumes in the series focuses on a crucial aspect of Chinese art and material culture during the period between the third and sixth centuries. The subject of this volume is religious art and archaeology; the central theme of the second volume is cultural and artistic interaction; the third volume investigates various artistic forms and material culture. Each volume includes 18-22 articles, which are hoped to present the most up-to-date scholarship in this field, including new archaeological finds and new interpretations. The contributors are from many research institutions inside and outside China, and have been selected by the Editorial Committee (constituted by scholars from the above mentioned five institutions) through a systematic survey of the field and a screening process. Before their final inclusion in the volumes, the papers in each volume have been presented and discussed at one of three international conferences, and have been revised based on such scholarly interaction.

The current volume results from the first of these international conference, which took place at the University of Chicago in early November, 1999. The 18 papers in the volume are grouped into four sections, each representing a major aspect or direction of research on religious art and architecture during this period. The first

section publishes for the first time surveys and research on small and middle-sized Buddhist cave-temples and stone carvings in various regions. Introducing materials beyond the famous Buddhist monuments at Yungang, Longmen and Dunhuang, these papers provide invaluable information about Buddhist art during this period and suggest a new direction in studying this art, as they shift our attention from isolated sites to large regional networks of Buddhist establishments and to the geographical distribution of distinct artistic styles and subjects.

This regional approach is further developed in the second section, which focuses on religious art in the Kucha region and the Hexi Corridor. This geographical concentration allows the authors to study a regional Buddhist art tradition from a variety of perspectives, from an archaeological survey of small and middle-sized caves to an investigation of the relationship between an important cave complex and an ancient traffic route, and from iconographic links between Indian and Xinjiang murals to the possible patronage and dates of cave chapels in the Hexi Corridor.

The central subjects of the third section are Buddhist temples and icons. The recent excavation of the site of the Yongning Pagoda in Luoyang has allowed scholars to define a distinctive sculptural style favored by the Northern Wei ruling elite and to speculate on its influence in Buddhist and funerary art. Other sculptures unearthed in Sichuan provide new evidence for studying Buddhist art of the Southern Dynasties and its doctrinal bases. In contrast to these studies based on new archaeological finds, other papers in this section reinterpret well-known examples of Chinese Buddhist art. Characterized by a strong methodological orientation, these interpretations either explore the internal logic of a cave's design and decoration, or lay a new basis for investigating the complex construction process of a particular cave temple such as the Guyang Cave at Longmen.

This emphasis in interpretation becomes a dominant factor in the papers grouped in the fourth section, which all focus on the identities and roles of patrons of religious art and architecture. These patrons include non-Chinese rulers with a strong political agenda, women of different social status, and local communities of religious worshippers. Based on synthetic analyses of archaeological and textual evidence, the authors are able to identify these groups and uncover their intentions in making religious dedications. In so doing, they reconstruct specific historical situations in which religious art served particular political and social purposes, and speculate on the regional development of early Daoist art and the complex relationship between Buddhist and Daoist art.

Rather than providing well-formulated conclusions, these papers aim to provide research materials and to open up new ways in studying religious art during this important period. In fact, readers will find different research methods, approaches, and interpretations throughout the volume. Instead of emphasizing uniformity, the Editorial Committee believes that such differences will encourage discussion in this field and will lead to a renewed understanding of art and material culture during this period. The significance of the volume thus lies in both its subject matter and editorial approach. In terms of content, it departs from the traditional emphasis on a few “Golden Ages” in Chinese art, and focuses instead on the emergence and early development of historical trends in an era of political chaos and instability. In terms of editorial approach, it promotes the exchange of ideas and collaboration between scholars, because in our view only such exchange and collaboration will bring the scholarship in the field to the next stage.

The collaborative research project “Between Han and Tang: Art and Archaeology in a Transformative Period, ” as well as the three international conferences on the subject, is funded by the Luce Foundation. The publication of this volume is funded by the Tang Research Foundation. Here we want to thank these two foundations for their generous support, and also want to express our gratitude toward the Cultural Relics Publishing House for bringing out these volumes.



May 10th. 2000

目 錄

前言	巫 鴻 (1)
第一部分：地域宗教遺址考古調查	
河南中小型石窟調查的主要收獲	陳 平 (3)
山南北朝時期小型石窟的考察與研究	李裕群 (27)
北朝至隋山東佛教藝術查研新得	張 總 (61)
四川綿陽平楊府君闕闕身造像 ——兼談四川地區南北朝佛道龕像的幾個問題	孫 華 (89)
漢隋之間的西藏原始宗教本教題材岩畫	熊文彬 (139)
第二部分：新疆與河西佛教藝術新探	
新疆龜茲地區中小型石窟調查	李 麗 (163)
克孜爾石窟興廢與渭干河谷道交通	吳 焯 (183)
克孜爾中心柱窟主室正壁畫塑題材及有關問題	李崇峰 (209)
四世紀河西走廊地區涼州佛教藝術與其中亞風格的轉變	何恩之 (235)
第三部分：寺院、石窟、造像	
佛教石窟的時空觀及圖像附會 ——雲岡第 38 窟北魏雕刻布局構思淺議	汪悅進 (279)

龍門古陽洞重構中的時間、文本和造像的歧異	蔣人和 (313)
北魏洛陽永寧寺塔塑像的藝術與時代特徵	李 力 (353)
青州龍興寺造像的藝術成就	
——兼論青州背屏式造像及北齊“曹家樣”	金維諾 (377)
四川南朝佛教造像的初步研究	羅世平 (397)

第四部分：贊助人、宗教身份、地域傳統

地域考古與對“五斗米道”美術傳統的重構	巫 鴻 (431)
陝西省的北魏雕刻：來源、贊助、願望	阿部賢次 (461)
敦煌最早三窟供養人及相關問題研究	寧 强 (489)
南北朝時期之婦女資助佛教造像	王靜芬 (535)

CONTENTS

Introduction	Wu Hung (1)
---------------------	---------------

Part One: Archaeological Investigation and Research of Regional Sites

Results of Examinations of Small and Medium-Sized Cave Sites in Henan Province	Chen Ping (3)
Examination and Research on Small-Scale Cave Sites of the Northern Dynasties in Shanxi	Li Yuqun (27)
Survey of New Discoveries in Buddhist Art in Shandong from the Northern Dynasties and Sui	Zhang Zong (61)
A Study of Buddhist and Daoist Images on the Pingyang Fujun Pillars in Sichuan	Sun Hua (89)
Cliff Carvings of the Early Tibetan Bon Religion between Han and Tang	Xiong Wenbin (139)

Part Two: On Cross Roads – Buddhist Art in Xinjiang and the Hexi Corridor

Small and Medium-Sized Caves in the Kucha Region of Xinjiang	Li Li (163)
On the Rise and Decline of the Kizil Caves and the Weigan River Valley Transportation Route	Wu Zhou (183)
The Subject of Principal Images in Central-Pillar Caves at Kizil and Some Related Questions	Li Chongfeng (209)
Liang Patronage of Buddhist Art in the Gansu Corridor during the Fourth Century and the Transformation of a Central Asian Style	Angela F. Howard (235)

Part Three: Temple, Grotto, and Icon

- Grotto-Shrine as Chronotope and the Working of Analogous
Iconography: The Sixth-Century Sculptural Program
in Cave 38 at Yungang in Perspective Eugene Y. Wang (279)
- Disjunctures of Time, Text, and Imagery in Reconstructions
of the Guyang Cave at Longmen Katherine R. Tsiang (313)
- The Artistic and Period Characteristics of Sculptures Found
at the Yongning Pagoda in Luoyang Li Li (353)
- Artistic Achievements of Buddhist Sculpture from the Longxingsi
in Qingzhou – On the Qingzhou Style and
the Northern Qi “Cao School” Jin Weinuo (377)
- A Preliminary Study of Buddhist Statues of the Southern Dynasties
Found in Sichuan Luo Shiping (397)

Part Four: Patronage, Identity, and Regional Tradition

- Regional Archaeology and the Visual Culture of “Wudoumi” Daoism
Wu Hung (431)
- Northern Wei Sculpture from Shaanxi Province:
Provenance, Patronage, Desire Stanley Abe (461)
- Patrons of the Earliest Dunhuang Caves: A Historical
Investigation Ning Qiang (489)
- Women as Buddhist Art Patrons During the Northern
and Southern Dynasties Dorothy C. Wong (535)

第一 部 分

地域宗教遺址考古調査

