

帝國夾縫中的台灣 國際研討會 論文集

主辦單位：

行政院文化建設委員會
清華文教基金會

承辦單位：

國立清華大學當代中國研究中心

協辦單位：

國立清華大學社會學研究所
國立清華大學台灣研究室

Taiwan at the Edge of Empires

D675.8-532
20071

「帝國夾縫中的台灣」國際研討會 論文集



主辦單位：

行政院文化建設委員會
清華文教基金會

承辦單位：

國立清華大學當代中國研究中心

協辦單位：

國立清華大學社會學研究所
國立清華大學台灣研究室

序言 Foreword

台灣的歷史發展，備受中國、日本和美國三個帝國系統興衰之衝擊與挑戰。近年來，由於我國民主政治的逐步實現，伴隨後冷戰以來國際關係與國族認同圖像的不變，而引發諸多實務界以及學術界的新議題。從政治經濟史的角度來觀察，兩世紀以來上述三個帝國系統互有消長，曾經分別或共同在台灣社會留下深刻的烙印。十九世紀末，新興的日本帝國擊敗中國滿清政府，取得台灣的控制權。太平洋戰爭結束後，國民政府獲得台灣的控制權，然由於冷戰的關係，台灣隨即被納入以美國為主導的資本主義陣營，而與中國大陸展開長達半世紀的軍事政治對峙。冷戰結束，一方面美國獨霸世界，另一方面中國開放門戶發展市場經濟，挾其雄厚的市場潛力進而爭逐東亞霸權。隨著中國的崛起，以及全球政治經濟的複雜變化，台灣面對的國際情勢愈發詭譎多變。而最受關注的統獨爭議，不只是兩岸之爭，更攸關國際社會的安全與繁榮。同時，在中國大陸，一種新形式的民族主義也伴隨著市場社會的發展而興起。由於台灣與中國之間特殊的歷史因素，其對台灣的衝擊自不可輕忽。這些歷史軌跡深刻地影響著台灣的現代化議程、國際處境、兩岸關係、以及國族認同的圖像。在此歷史與現實的叢結中，台灣如何尋找自己在國際上的定位，走出具有前景的未來，並具備國際視野的歷史觀與實踐性考察，乃是刻不容緩的要務。

源於此歷史省思，行政院文化建設委員會特別委託國立清華大學當代中國研究中心，於2004年12月18、19兩日，假國家圖書館舉辦「帝國夾縫中的台灣」(Taiwan at the Edge of Empires) 國際研討會。

本次研討會邀請到國際著名歷史社會學家——美國加州大學洛杉磯分校的講座教授麥可曼 (Michael Mann)，來台發表重要的專題演說。麥可曼教授擅長由地緣政治與國際資本主義分析國家發展。麥可曼教授最近出版的新書《自相矛盾的帝國》(*Incoherent Empire*, Verso, 2003)，對於美國近年來的國際行為有深入而引人深思的批判，因此他的參與為本研討會提供了權威觀點的洞察。他為大會特別準備的專題演講稿——「帝國網絡中的台灣：戰爭、資本主義、以及帝國」(“Taiwan in the Web of Empires: Wars, Capitalism and Empires”)，從長程的歷史視野，觀察台灣在國際間的獨特位置，並從西方民族國家發展史的比較觀點，解釋兩岸統獨問題的癥結，並分析美、中、日等強權在此問題中的關鍵角色。

本次研討會也邀請到多位來自美、日、以及中國大陸的國際知名學者，分別從「新國際秩序」、「帝國與國家」、「帝國與文化」、「菁英與政商結構」等主題發表精闢的論文，探討帝國系統變遷對於台灣的影響，與國內學者進行精彩的對話。除了上述四個研討主題，另規劃了一場圓桌論壇「新帝國系統、兩岸關係、台灣的國際處境」，引言者各自從獨特的觀點，深入討論台灣當前生存於帝國夾縫中的處境，引起與會者的熱烈迴響。

本研討會乃是近年來第一個由國際政經結構系統切入，全面性地探討台灣政治、經濟與社會文化史的盛會，並藉由台灣特殊的位置來檢視三大帝國系統在東亞區域的運作，提供了海內外學者一次難得的對話空間，激發出新視野的交流，對台灣的歷史出路提出引人深思的見解，並有助於推動新的學術研究課題。本人謹代表文建會感謝所有與會學者先進的參與，並感謝清華大學當代中國研究中心在長達一年的籌備工作上的用心。此次會議的成功，顯示台灣作為國際社會一個重要成員在國際學界日漸受到重視。本人誠摯期盼這個研討主題能夠持續不斷，為我們國家的發展前景提供更多豐富的洞見。

行政院文化建設委員會主任委員 陳其南 謹序

目 錄 Contents

序 言 Forward	1
目 錄 Contents	3
議 程 Program	5
開幕致詞 Opening Ceremony Speech	7
專題演講 Keynote Speech :	
Taiwan in the Web of Empires: Wars, Capitalism and Empires	11
第一場：新國際秩序 Session I: New International Order	43
中國的「東亞共同體論」• 新國際秩序的構想與台灣	45
A New Asia-Pacific Order and Taiwan	57
A Taiwan Realism	73
Conflict across the Taiwan Strait and the Washington- Beijing- Taipei Strategic Triangle	106
第二場：帝國與國家 Session II: Empires and the State	145
從兩岸僵局到東亞統合：臺灣與中國的出路	147
The State, Historicity, and Late Development: Taiwan's Developmental State in Withering	202
第三場：帝國與文化 Session III: Empires and Cultures	257
「帝國」的藏書—從田中長三郎到楊雲萍	259
“Cosmopolitanism among Empires”	273
“Chain Reaction:” The Politics of <i>Ressentiment</i> in China and Taiwan	283
第四場：菁英與政商結構 Session IV: Elite during Power Transfer	305
Colonial Modernity for an Elite Taiwanese, Lim Bo-seng :	
The Labyrinth of Cosmopolitanism	307
Elite Survival in Regime Transition: Government-merchant Cooperation in	

Taiwan's Trade with Japan, 1950-1961.....	325
政權移轉與精英絕續：台灣對日貿易中的政商合作(1950-1961).....	349
圓桌論壇：新帝國系統、兩岸關係、台灣的國際處境	
Round Table: "New Imperial Systems, Cross-Strait Relations, and Taiwan's	
International Situation"	381
告別帝國夾縫中的台灣.....	383
帝國夾縫中的台灣.....	386
Changing Regions in East Asia -- Historical perspectives.....	389
在帝國夾縫中的台灣.....	390
閉幕詞 Closing Remarks	399
與會人員名錄 List of Speakers.....	400

議程 Program

第一 天 12月18日 (星期六)		
9:30~10:00	報 到 Registration	
10:00~10:30	開 幕 致 詞 Opening	
	陳其南 (文建會主任委員) (林正儀主任秘書代) Chi-Nan Chen (Minister, the Council for Cultural Affairs) 徐遐生 (國立清華大學校長) Frank Hsia-San Shu (President, National Tsing Hua University)	
10:30~12:00	專 題 演 講 Keynote Speech	
	主持人：周碧娥 (國立清華大學) Moderator: Bih-Er Chou (National Tsing Hua University)	
	演講人Keynote Speaker：Michael Mann (Distinguished Professor of Sociology, UCLA, U.S.A.美國加州大學洛杉磯分校) "Taiwan in the Web of Empires: Wars, Capitalism and Empires."	
12:00~13:30	午 餐 Lunch	
13:30~15:50	第一場：新國際秩序 Session I: New International Order	
	主持人：林碧炤 (國立政治大學) Moderator: Bih-Jaw Lin (National Chengchi University)	
	發表人 Presenters	評論人 Discussants
	天兒慧 (日本早稻田大學) Satoshi Amako (Waseda University, Japan)： 〈中國的「東亞共同體論」・新國際秩序的構想與台灣〉	楊念祖 (中華民國高等政策研究會) Nien-Chu Yang (Chinese Council of Advanced Policy Studies)
	林文程 (國立中山大學) Wen-Cheng Lin (National Sun Yat-sen University)： "A New Asia-Pacific Order and Taiwan"	
	徐斯儉 (中央研究院) Szu-Chien Hsu (Academia Sinica)： "A Taiwan Realism"	陶儀芬 (國立台灣大學) Yi-Feng Tao (National Taiwan University)
	林繼文 (中央研究院) Jih-Wen Lin (Academia Sinica)： "Conflict Across the Taiwan Strait and the Washington-Beijing-Taipei Strategic Interaction"	
15:50~16:10	茶 敘 Tea Break	
16:10~17:50	第二場：帝國與國家 Session II: Empires and the State	
	主持人 Moderator：Michael Mann	
	發表人 Presenters	評論人 Discussants
	黃樹仁 (國立台北大學) Su-Jen Huang (National Taipei University)： 〈從兩岸僵局到東亞統合：臺灣與中國的出路〉 "From Sino-Taiwanese Conflict to East Asian Union: A Vision for Taiwan and China"	吳介民 (國立清華大學) Jieh-Min Wu (National Tsing Hua University)
	許甘霖 (國立成功大學) Kan-Lin Hsu (National Cheng Kung University)： "The State, Historicity, and Late Development: Taiwan's Developmental State in Withering"	黃崇憲 (東海大學) Chung-Hsien Huang (Tung Hai University)

第二天 12月19日 (星期日)		
09:30~10:00	報 到 Registration	
10:00~12:00	第三場：帝國與文化 Session III: Empires and Cultures	
	主持人：陳萬益（國立清華大學） Moderator: Wan-Yi Chen (National Tsing Hua University)	
	發表人 Presenters	評論人 Discussants
	黃英哲（日本愛知大學） Ying-Che Huang (Aichi University, Japan) : 〈論「帝國」的藏書—從田中長三郎到楊雲萍〉	吳密察（國立台灣大學） Mi-Cha Wu (National Taiwan University)
	史書美（美國加州大學洛杉磯分校） Shu-Mei Shih (UCLA, U.S.A.) : "Cosmopolitanism among Empires"	廖炳惠（國立清華大學） Ping-Hui Liao (National Tsing Hua University)
12:00~13:30	汪宏倫（中央研究院） Horng-Luen Wang (Academia Sinica) : " 'Chain Reaction' : The Politics of <i>Ressentiment</i> in China and Taiwan."	李丁讚（國立清華大學） Ding-Tzann Lii (National Tsing Hua University)
	午 餐 Lunch	
13:30~15:10	第四場：菁英與政商結構 Session IV: Elite during Power Transfer	
	主持人：劉翠溶（中央研究院） Moderator: Ts'ui-Jung Liu (Academia Sinica)	
	發表人 Presenters	評論人 Discussants
	駒込武（日本京都大學） Takeshi Komagome (Kyoto University, Japan) : "Colonial Modernity for an Elite Taiwanese, Lim Bo-seng : The Labyrinth of Cosmopolitanism"	姚人多（國立清華大學） Jen-To Yao (National Tsing Hua University)
15:10~15:30	林滿紅（中央研究院） Man-Houng Lin (Academia Sinica) : 〈政權移轉與精英絕續：台灣對日貿易中的政商合作 (1950-1961)〉 "Elite Survival in Regime Transition: Government-merchant Cooperation in Taiwan's Trade with Japan, 1950-1961"	吳文星（國立師範大學） Wen-Hsing Wu (National Taiwan Normal University)
	茶 敘 Tea Break	
15:30~17:30	圓桌論壇：新帝國系統、兩岸關係、台灣的國際處境 Round Table: "New Imperial Systems, Cross-Strait Relations, and Taiwan's International Situation"	
	主持人：蕭新煌（中央研究院） Moderator: Michael Hsin-Huang Hsiao (Academia Sinica)	
	與談人 Panelists : 阮銘（淡江大學）Ming Ran (Tamkang University)—〈告別帝國夾縫中的台灣〉 吳密察（國立台灣大學）Mi-Cha Wu (National Taiwan University)—〈帝國夾縫中的台灣〉 濱下武志（日本京都大學）Takeshi Hamashita (Kyoto University, Japan) 廖炳惠（國立清華大學）Ping-Hui Liao (National Tsing Hua University)—〈在帝國夾縫中的台灣〉	
17:30~17:40	周碧娥（國立清華大學） Bih-Er Chou (National Tsing Hua University)	

開幕致詞 Opening Ceremony Speech

林正儀 Jeng-Yi Lin

徐校長、周主任、各位貴賓、各位與會的女士先生們：

大家好，今天陳主委因另有要務在身不克出席，謹由本人代表文建會歡迎學界諸先進蒞臨參與這場盛會指導，共同關心夾處中美日帝國間台灣的處境。近幾世紀以來台灣始終在夾縫間求生，我們的歷史發展、現代化進程以及國族認同的實踐與論述無一不受到各帝國系統的衝擊與挑戰。本研討會宗旨便是希望對台灣所屬的國際政治經濟結構，做歷史性與實踐性的考察，可以說，本會是近年來第一個由國際政經結構系統切入，全面性地探討台灣政治、經濟與社會文化史的盛會；從另個角度來看，亦是藉由台灣特殊的位置，檢視三大帝國系統在東亞的運作。這次會議將提供海內外學者一次難得的對話空間，我們也自我期許將有助於推動新的研究課題。

相當難得的，這次研討會邀請到多位來自美日的國際知名學者，從國際政治、社會、文化與經濟等面向，就「新國際秩序」、「帝國與國家」、「帝國與文化」、「菁英與政商結構」等主題，與國內學界進行兩天的討論，可以預期將會激盪出精彩的思辨與對話。首先，我們很榮幸能邀請到 Prof. Michael Mann 作一場以“Taiwan in the Web of Empires: Wars, Capitalism and Empires.”為題的專題演講。Prof. Michael Mann 是國際知名歷史社會學者，目前任教於美國加州大學洛杉磯分校社會學系，是加州大學的傑出教授。他的著作與論文在學術界深受肯定及推崇，尤其在歷史社會學、比較社會學、政治社會學等領域的教學研究中被廣為閱讀引用。其著作等身，最近的大作“*Incoherent Empire*”(2003)這本書甫於今年五月獲得德國 Friedrich Ebert 基金會頒獎。Michael Mann 教授對台灣政治經濟情勢深感興趣，能邀請他蒞會演講，與我們分享精闢的觀察，我們感到非常榮幸。

本會開始的第一場討論「新國際秩序」，由林碧炤副校長主持，邀請到早稻田大學天兒慧(Satoshi Amako)教授、中山大學林文程教授、中研院政治所籌備處林繼文教授、徐斯儉教授，為我們就亞太秩序和區域政治作分析，再請中華高等政策研究會楊念祖秘書長和台大政治系陶儀芬教授作評論。

第二場請 Prof. Michael Mann 主持討論「帝國與國家」，邀請到台北大學社會系黃樹仁教授、成功大學公衛所許甘霖教授為我們就兩岸關係和發展提出見解，也請清大社會所吳介民教授、東海社會所黃崇憲教授回應。

第三場讓我們把眼光轉向文化層次，請清大台文所陳萬益教授主持，由日本愛知大學黃英哲教授、美國 UCLA 比較文學系史書美教授以及中研院社會所汪宏倫教授剖析帝國系統對台灣文化的刻畫，再由台大歷史系吳密察教授、清大外語系廖炳惠教授及清大社會所李丁讚教授為我們作評。

第四場請到中研院劉翠溶副院長為我們主持對「菁英與政商結構」的討論，日本京都大學駒込武 (Takeshi Komagome) 教授和中研院近史所林滿紅教授觀察殖民時期菁英人物，提出對後來台灣政商關係與經濟發展的影響，並請清大社會所姚人多教授、師大文學院長吳文星教授回應。

本研討會並安排一場圓桌論壇——「新帝國系統、兩岸關係、台灣的國際處境」，由中研院社會所蕭新煌教授主持，四位引言者是淡江大陸研究所阮銘教授、台大歷史系吳密察教授、京都大學濱下武志 (Takeshi Hamashita) 教授和清大外語系廖炳惠教授，就台灣當前狀況作深入對話。

此次會議得以舉辦，首先向合辦單位清華文教基金會致謝，其次對承辦單位的清華大學當代中國研究中心全體籌備委員、協辦單位清華大學社會所與台灣研究室致上謝意，並祝大會圓滿成功。

徐遐生 Frank Hsia-San Shu

Secretary General Lin, Prof. Chou, Prof. Chen, Distinguished Guests, Prof. Mann, Ladies & Gentlemen:

Good morning and welcome. NTHU, through its Center for Contemporary China, is honored to host this important international conference of “Taiwan at the Edge of Empires”. Given the situation in the world today, including the results of the recent elections in the United States and Taiwan, this is perhaps a most timely occasion to hold such a conference.

Although I am an astrophysicist by training, I must admit that the subject matter of this conference greatly intrigued me. I wondered exactly what the organizers and participants had in mind: a clash of civilizations with Taiwan at the turbulent interface, or a high-stakes chess game with Taiwan as a pawn, either to be sacrificed or to be queened? Not being an expert, I would not dare to offer any theories to this expert audience, but please permit me to venture an indirect opinion. This opinion concerns one of images: it is often very surprising to find how one’s own self-image differs considerably of the image others may have of you. As with people, so is it sometimes with nations.

Evil does exist in the world, but almost never is a whole nation evil, independent of the quality of its leaders. Yet in the post 9/11 era and the age of globalized world trade, we live in a time when there seems to be greater misunderstanding on this issue than ever. In particular, we live in a time when the self-images of two of the most influential and powerful countries in the world, America and China, differ vastly from the projected-images that other countries have of them. At the interface of these this dichotomy is Taiwan, which has, in addition to problems concerning international relations, deep internal divisions about its own self-image and its identity and future. Misunderstandings and missteps at the interface that is the Taiwan Strait could prove to be catastrophic, for Taiwan, for China, for the United States, and for the world.

How can we alleviate the dangers? Is it within the power of academics to have their suggestions, even if wisely formulated and deliberated, heard in the highest corridors of power? I do not know. But I do think that communication is a necessary step. In my experience, the people in all three regions under discussion are, at heart, of good will and intent. Ultimately, we must rely on the understanding of these people. In turn, we must try to appreciate their aspirations for a better tomorrow. These aspirations do not include world conquest or world domination, be it in the military or the economic sphere. In the end, they understand in the words of John F. Kennedy that “we all inhabit this small planet, we all breathe the same air, we all cherish our children’s future, and we are all mortal.” This greater public needs to understand that the same is true of their counterparts across the Pacific or across the

Strait. I personally believe that this greater public is the most effective audience for conferences like this one, and I hope the organizers and participants will encourage the public dissemination of the exciting and revealing interchanges that I am sure you will have these two coming days. I wish you the most successful and productive of meetings.

專題演講

Keynote Speech:

Taiwan in the Web of Empires: Wars, Capitalism and Empires

演講人 Keynote Speaker
Michael Mann

Introduction of Prof. Michael Mann

周碧娥 Bih-Er Chou

Secretary General Lin, President Shu, Distinguished Guests, Colleagues, Friends, Ladies and Gentlemen, Good Morning!

On behalf of the Center for Contemporary China and the organizing committee of the conference, I would like to once again welcome all of the participants to this conference. CfCC (of Tsing Hua University) is a fair new and young research institution dedicated to the promotion and establishment of interdisciplinary study of Contemporary China with Taiwan perspective. CfCC is very proud to have this opportunity to organize this conference under the sponsorship of Council for Cultural Affairs and Tsing Hua Cultural Foundation.

It is my great honor to introduce to you the speaker of our Keynote Speech of this conference -- Professor Michael Mann. Professor Mann, currently a distinguished professor of the department of sociology at the University of California, Los Angeles, is a world-renowned historical sociologist. Professor Mann has a long and well accomplished academic career which he started in the University of Oxford, England in 1964 and continued on the other side of the Atlantic Ocean when he move to UCLA, USA in 1987. Indeed, it is almost to another ocean, the Pacific Ocean. Besides these two principal positions, Prof. Mann held various visiting professorial positions across England and the US. He also received many prestigious Awards and Honors for his academic achievement. Among them, he received an Honorary Degree in Literature (Hon. D. Litt.) from McGill University in 1998, Honorary Fellowship of University of Leiden in 1995, Gold Medal of the University of Helsinki in 1994, Distinguished Scholarly Publication Award of the American Association for The Sources of Social Power (Vol 1) in 1988.

Prof. Mann has a long list of publications, which if I were to go through will take up all the time allowed for this session. So I will just mentioned that, of the more than half of a hundred principal publications, there were nine books with worldly acclaimed reputation, such as the two volumes of *The Sources of Social Power* which were translated into German, Spanish, Japanese and Chinese. His *Incoherent Empire* published in 2003 not only is being translated into various different languages, including both the Chinese and Japanese, the German edition won the Friedrich Ebert Foundation for the best books on politics in 2003. It is also worth mentioning that Prof. Mann's *Consciousness and Action in the Western Working Class* (London: MacMillan, 1973) was translated into Dutch but was banned in South Africa during the 1970's. Put in our Taiwan context, Prof. Mann was on the black list then. His forty-some papers appeared either in such prestigious journal as *ASR*, the *British Journal of Sociology*, and the *New Left Review* or in books by publishers with critical academic reputation. Many of these articles were translated into international languages and/or reprinted repeatedly by many academic readers or collections.

Prof. Mann has worked on subjects of wide range of academic interests and

significant socio-political consequences. His writings continue to address the vexing issues of Class, particular working class, the State, Power and Democracy in comparative and historical perspectives. Recently, he also focused on the increasing threat on peace due to Ethnic Conflict and Inequality in the Processes of Globalization and the rise of new military Empires. These are key words which we read often in our academic trade books and mass media. They are also social realities which many human beings have to face in their everyday lives or suffer its political consequences with increasing intensity in some parts of world today. Therefore, it is only logical that Prof. Mann shall be the speaker of this conference on “Taiwan at the Edge of Empires”. His topic of speech today is Taiwan in the Web of Empires: Wars, Capitalism and Empires. So, ladies and gentlemen, without any further delay, let's welcome Prof. Mann.

Taiwan in the Web of Empires: Wars, Capitalism and Empires

Michael Mann

Introduction

While recognizing the uniqueness of the Taiwan Straits issue, I will here attempt to apply to it an analysis derived from comparative and historical sociology. I first examine the changing relations between war, empire and capitalism in the world and in East Asia in particular, and then derive some local implications. I started from one proposition and two puzzles. The proposition is that the world has passed from an Age of Empires to an Age of Nation-States – which I first argued in *Incoherent Empire* (2003). This means that the nature of war has also changed, from being dominated by inter-imperial wars to being dominated by wars over (not between) nation-states.

The two puzzles concern different aspects of war. The first puzzle concerns capitalism. All definitions of capitalism envisage it as entirely peaceful (for example, “the taking of profit through markets” or “the production of commodities”), yet capitalism’s actual expansion through the globe has been extremely warlike and imperialist. I will address this by distinguishing between four types of imperial domination and between two forms of economic acquisition abroad, through markets and territories.

The second puzzle is the very different incidence of wars in those continents of the world which have contained multi-state systems. Inter-state wars were common in Europe until 1945. They also dominated the rise of the modern state, as both Charles Tilly and I have demonstrated (see Tilly, 1990; and Mann 1986, 1993). It is generally assumed that these have been wars between nations or national states or nation-states. Yet other continents have not followed this European pattern. In Latin America, which became a multi-state system in the early 19th century, inter-state wars have been much less frequent and severe, and they were much less important in state formation, as Centeno (2002) has shown. That has also been true of post-colonial Africa, as Herbst (2000) has noted. Asia is more complex but not like Europe, as we shall see. Then, across the world as a whole since 1945, inter-state wars have greatly declined, while internal civil wars have greatly increased. European history before 1945 – which generated most models of international relations – was actually deviant, no place to ground a general theory of states and war. In fact, a sociological vision will underpin my analysis. I will argue that states qua states share few common attributes. Different kinds of state, mobilizing different levels of military force, regulating different