

REPORT

recodifying criminal law

Revised and Enlarged Edition

31

Canadä

REPORT 31

RECODIFYING CRIMINAL LAW

(Revised and Enlarged Edition of Report 30)

Available by mail free of charge from:

Law Reform Commission of Canada 130 Albert St., 7th Floor Ottawa, Canada K1A 0L6

or

Suite 310 Place du Canada Montréal, Québec H3B 2N2

© Law Reform Commission of Canada 1987 Catalogue No. J31-51/1987 ISBN 0-662-54757-8

Reports and Working Papers of the Law Reform Commission of Canada

Reports to Parliament

- 1. Evidence* (December 19, 1975)
- 2. Guidelines Dispositions and Sentences in the Criminal Process* (February 6, 1976)
- 3. Our Criminal Law (March 25, 1976)
- 4. Expropriation* (April 8, 1976)
- 5. Mental Disorder in the Criminal Process* (April 13, 1976)
- 6. Family Law* (May 4, 1976)
- 7. Sunday Observance* (May 19, 1976)
- 8. The Exigibility to Attachment of Remuneration Payable by the Crown in Right of Canada* (December 19, 1977)
- 9. Criminal Procedure Part 1: Miscellaneous Amendments* (February 23, 1978)
- 10. Sexual Offences* (November 29, 1978)
- 11. The Cheque: Some Modernization (March 8, 1979)
- 12. Theft and Fraud* (March 16, 1979)
- 13. Advisory and Investigatory Commissions* (April 18,
- 14. Judicial Review and the Federal Court* (April 25, 1980)
- 15. Criteria for the Determination of Death* (April 8, 1981)
- 16. The Jury (July 28, 1982)
- 17. Contempt of Court* (August 18, 1982)
- 18. Obtaining Reasons before Applying for Judicial Scrutiny — Immigration Appeal Board (December 16, 1982)
- 19. Writs of Assistance and Telewarrants* (July 22,
- 20. Euthanasia, Aiding Suicide and Cessation of Treatment (October 11, 1983)
- 21. Investigative Tests: Alcohol, Drugs and Driving Offences* (November 10, 1983)
- 22. Disclosure by the Prosecution (June 15, 1984)
- 23. Questioning Suspects (November 19, 1984)
- 24. Search and Seizure (March 22, 1985)
- 25. Obtaining Forensic Evidence (June 12, 1985)
- 26. Independent Administrative Agencies (October 23, 1985)
- 27. Disposition of Seized Property (April 24, 1986)
- 28. Some Aspects of Medical Treatment and Criminal Law* (June 12, 1986)
- 29. Arrest (November 6, 1986)
- 30. Recodifying Criminal Law, Vol. I (December 3, 1986)

Working Papers

- 1. The Family Court* (1974)
- 2. The Meaning of Guilt: Strict Liability* (1974)
- 3. The Principles of Sentencing and Dispositions* (1974)
- 4. Discovery* (1974)
- 5. Restitution and Compensation* (1974)
- 6. Fines* (1974)
- 7. Diversion* (1975)
- 8. Family Property* (1975)

- 9. Expropriation* (1975)
- 10. Limits of Criminal Law: Obscenity: A Test Case* (1975)
- 11. Imprisonment and Release* (1975)
- 12. Maintenance on Divorce* (1975)
- 13. Divorce* (1975)
- 14. The Criminal Process and Mental Disorder* (1975)
- 15. Criminal Procedure: Control of the Process* (1975)
- 16. Criminal Responsibility for Group Action* (1976) 17. Commissions of Inquiry: A New Act* (1977)
- 18. Federal Court: Judicial Review* (1977)
- 19. Theft and Fraud: Offences* (1977)
- 20. Contempt of Court: Offences against the Administration of Justice* (1977)
- 21. Payment by Credit Transfer* (1978)
- 22. Sexual Offences* (1978)
- 23. Criteria for the Determination of Death* (1979)
- 24. Sterilization: Implications for Mentally Retarded and Mentally Ill Persons* (1979)
- 25. Independent Administrative Agencies* (1980)
- 26. Medical Treatment and Criminal Law* (1980)
- 27. The Jury in Criminal Trials* (1980)
- 28. Euthanasia, Aiding Suicide and Cessation of Treatment (1982)
- 29. The General Part: Liability and Defences (1982)
- 30. Police Powers: Search and Seizure in Criminal Law Enforcement* (1983)
- 31. Damage to Property: Vandalism (1984)
- 32. Questioning Suspects* (1984)
- 33. Homicide (1984)
- 34. Investigative Tests* (1984)
- 35. Defamatory Libel (1984)
- 36. Damage to Property: Arson (1984)
- 37. Extraterritorial Jurisdiction (1984)
- 38. Assault (1984)
- 39. Post-seizure Procedures (1985)
- 40. The Legal Status of the Federal Administration* (1985)
- 41. Arrest (1985)
- 42. Bigamy (1985)
- 43. Behaviour Alteration and the Criminal Law (1985)
- 44. Crimes against the Environment* (1985)
- 45. Secondary Liability Participation in Crime and Inchoate Offences (1985)
- 46. Omissions, Negligence and Endangering (1985)
- 47. Electronic Surveillance (1986)
- 48. Criminal Intrusion (1986)
- 49. Crimes against the State (1986)
- 50. Hate Propaganda* (1986)
- 51. Policy Implementation, Compliance and Administrative Law* (1986)
- 52. Private Prosecutions (1986)
- 53. Workplace Pollution (1986)
- 54. Classification of Offences (1986)
- 55. The Charge Document in Criminal Cases (1987)
- 56. Public and Media Access to the Criminal Process (1987)

The Commission has also published over seventy Study Papers on various aspects of law. If you wish a copy of our catalogue of publications, please write to: Law Reform Commission of Canada, 130 Albert Street, Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0L6, or Suite 310, Place du Canada, Montréal, Québec, H3B 2N2.

^{*} Out of print. Available in many libraries.

June, 1987

The Honourable Ray Hnatyshyn, P.C., M.P., Minister of Justice and Attorney General of Canada, Ottawa, Canada

Dear Mr. Minister:

In accordance with the provisions of section 16 of the *Law Reform Commission Act*, we have the honour to submit herewith this Report, with our recommendations on the studies undertaken by the Commission on recodifying criminal law.

Yours respectfully,

Allen M. Linden *President*

Gilles Létourneau Vice-President

Joseph Maingot, Q.C. Commissioner

John Frecker Commissioner

Commission

Mr. Justice Allen M. Linden, President

Mr. Gilles Létourneau, Vice-President

Mr. Joseph Maingot, Q.C., Commissioner

Mr. John Frecker, Commissioner

Her Honour Judge Michèle Rivet, Commissioner*

Secretary and Co-ordinator, Substantive Criminal Law

François Handfield, B.A., LL.L.

Principal Consultant

Patrick Fitzgerald, M.A. (Oxon.)

Consultants

John Barnes, B.A., B.C.L. (Oxon.) Lita Cyr, LL.B. Lynn C. Douglas, B.A., LL.B. Oonagh Fitzgerald, B.F.A., LL.B. Glenn Gilmour, B.A., LL.B. Marie Tremblay, LL.B. Donna White, B.A., LL.B.

^{*}Was not a member of the Commission when this Report was approved.

Table of Contents

INTRO	ODUCTION	1	
RECO	DDIFYING CRIMINAL LAW: RECOMMENDATIONS AND COMMENTARIES	7	
[Preaml	bie]	7	
THE (GENERAL PART	9	
TITLE	TITLE I: General Principles		
Chapte	er 1: Principles of General Application and Interpretation	10	
(2) (3)	Title Definitions Interpretation Application in Law	10 16	
Chapte	er 2: Principles of Liability	17	
(2) (3) (4)	Principle of Legality Conduct and Culpability Conduct. (a) General Rule (b) Omissions (c) Duties (d) Medical Treatment Exception Requirements for Culpability (a) General Requirements as to Level of Culpability (b) Definitions "Purposely" "Recklessly" "Negligently" (c) Greater Culpability Requirement Satisfies Lesser (d) Residual Rule	18 18 19 20 21 21 23 23 24 25 25	
(5)	Corporate Liability	26	
(6)	Causation	27	

Chapt	er 3: Defences	28
Abser (1)	Lack of Control	29 29
(2)	Lack of Knowledge	30 30
(3)	Intoxication	30 30
	ptions	
(4)	Immaturity	
(5)	Unfitness to Plead	
(6)	Mental Disorder	33
Justif	ications and Excuses	
(7)	Mistake or Ignorance of Law	34
(8)	Duress	35
(9)	Necessity	36
	(a) General Rule	36
	(b) Exception	36
(10)	Defence of the Person	36
	(a) General Rule	36
	(b) Exception: Law Enforcement	
(11)	Protection of Movable Property	
(12)	Protection of Immovable Property	
	(a) General Rule	
	(b) Exception	
(13)	Protection of Persons Acting under Legal Authority	
(/	(a) General Rule	
	(b) Force Used by Peace Officers	
(14)	Authority over Children	
(15)	Superior Orders	
(16)	Lawful Assistance	
(17)	Mistaken Belief as to Defence	41
	(a) General Rule	
	(b) Exception	
Chap	ter 4: Involvement in Crime	42
T1		4.2
	vement in Complete Crimes	
(1)	Committing	
(2)	Furthering	44
Invol	vement in Incomplete Crimes	45
(3)	Attempt	
(4)	Attempted Furthering	46

(5) Conspiracy 4 (6) Different Crime Committed from That Furthered 4 (a) General Rule 4 (b) Exception 4 (c) Qualification 4 (7) Alternative Convictions 4 (a) Committing 4 (b) Furthering 4 (c) Attempting 4 (d) Attempted Furthering 4 (e) Unclear Cases 4	47 47 47 47 47 47 47 47
Chapter 5: Territorial Jurisdiction	19
(1) General Rule. 4 (2) Jurisdiction Rules 4	
THE SPECIAL PART	55
TITLE II: Crimes against the Person	55
Part 1: Crimes against Personal Safety and Liberty	55
Chapter 6: Crimes against Life	55
(1) Negligent Homicide 5 (2) Manslaughter 5 (3) Murder 5 (4) First Degree Murder 5 [Alternative — Homicide 6 (5) Furthering Suicide 6 (6) Palliative Care 6	57 57 58 60]
Chapter 7: Crimes against Bodily Integrity	51
(1) Assault by Touching or Hurting 6 (2) Assault by Harming. 6 (3) Exceptions 6 (a) Medical Treatment 6 (b) Sporting Activities 6	62 62 62
Chapter 8: Crimes against Psychological Integrity	54
(1) Harassment	54

Chap	ter 9: Crimes against Personal Liberty	65
(1)	Confinement	
(2)	Kidnapping	66
(3)	Child Abduction	66
Chap	ter 10: Crimes Causing Danger	66
(1)	Endangering	
(2)	Failure to Rescue	67
	(a) General Rule	67
	(b) Exception	67
(3)	Impeding Rescue	68
(4)	Endangering by Motor Vehicle, Etc.	68
(5)	Impaired or with More than Eighty Milligrams	
	of Alcohol in One Hundred Millilitres of Blood	
(6)	Failure or Refusal to Provide Sample	
	(a) General Rule	
	(b) Exception	
(7)	Failure to Stop at Scene of Accident	
(8)	Driving a Motor Vehicle While Disqualified	
(9)	Interfering with Transportation Facilities	70
(10)	Aggravating Factors	71
Part :	2: Crimes against Personal Security and Privacy	71
Chap	ter 11: Unlawful Surveillance	72
(1)	Auditory Surveillance	72
(1)	(a) General Rule	
	(b) Exception.	
(2)	Unauthorized Entry of Private Premises.	
(3)	Unauthorized Search of Private Premises	
(4)		
(5)	Use of Force to Gain Entry	
(3)	Disclosure of Private Communications	
	(a) General Rule	74
	(b) Exceptions	74
Chap	ter 12: Criminal Intrusion	75
(1)	Criminal Intrusion	75
(2)	Aggravated Criminal Intrusion	76
		_

TITLE III. Crimes against Property	76
Part 1: Crimes of Dishonesty	76
Chapter 13: Theft and Related Crimes	77
[Alternative 1] (1) Theft (2) Obtaining Services (3) Fraud	79
[Alternative 2] (1) Theft (2) Obtaining Services (3) Fraud	81
Chapter 14: Forgery and Related Crimes	
 Forgery of Public Documents Forgery of Other Documents Fraudulent Documentary Misrepresentation Obliteration of Identifying Marks 	82 83
Chapter 15: Commercial Frauds and Related Matters	83
 Bribery of Agent. Agent Accepting Bribe. Disposal of Property to Defraud Creditors Receipt of Property to Defraud Creditors Criminal Lending 	84 84 84
Part 2: Crimes of Violence and Damage	85
Chapter 16: Robbery	85
(1) Robbery (2) Aggravated Robbery	
Chapter 17: Criminal Damage	86
(1) Vandalism	87 88

Part 3	3: Crimes of Possession	88		
Chapt	ter 18: Miscellaneous Property Crimes	88		
(1) (2) (3)	Possession of Things in Suspicious Circumstances	91		
(4) (5)	Possession of Forgeries			
(6) (7)	Possession of Things Obtained by Crime			
TITLE	IV: Crimes against the Natural Order	92		
Chapte	er 19: Crimes against the Environment	93		
(1) [(2)	Disastrous Damage to the Environment			
Chapt	ter 20: Crimes against Animals	97		
(1) (2) (3) (4)	Cruelty to Animals Exceptions: Necessary Measures Sporting Events Animal Neglect	98 99		
TITLE	E V: Crimes against the Social Order	99		
Chapte	er 21: Crimes against Social Harmony	100		
(1) (2) [(3)	Stirring up Hatred. Inciting Genocide. Stirring up Hatred in Public Place	100		
Chapte	er 22: Crimes against Public Order	101		
(1) (2)	Disturbing Public Order			
(3)	Unlawful Assembly			
(4)	•			
(5)				
(6)	Raising False Alarm10			
(7)	Public Nuisance			
(8)	Loitering	105		

TITL	E VI: Crimes against the Governmental Order	.106
Chap	ter 23: Corrupting Public Administration	.109
(1) (2) (3)	Bribery	.109
Chap	ter 24: Misleading Public Administration	.110
(1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7)	Perjury. Other False Statements Forging Documents or Fabricating Evidence Using Forged Documents, Fabricated Evidence Impersonation Withholding Information Misleading Public Officer. (a) General Rule (b) Exception	.111 .112 .112 .112 .113 .113
Chap	ter 25: Obstructing Public Administration	.115
(1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10) (11)	Obstructing Public Officers Disrupting Proceedings Failing to Help Public Officers Publishing Identities in Sexual Crimes (a) General Rule (b) Exceptions Publication in Violation of a Court Order Publishing Prejudicial Matters (a) General Rule (b) Exceptions Disobeying Lawful Court Order Bringing Justice into Contempt Jury Offences Escape Obstructing the Course of Justice	.117 .118 .118 .118 .119 .119 .120 .121 .123 .123
	ter 26: Crimes against State Security	
(1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6)	Treason Failing to Prevent Treason (a) General Rule (b) Exception Espionage Gathering and Disclosing Information Exception Sabotage	.128 .128 .128 .129 .129

	mes	
	Crimes	
	<i>'ode</i> Crimes	
The Seven	Statutes	3
APPENDIX A:	Summary of Recommendations	5
	•	
APPENDIX B:	Illustrative Draft Legislation	9
APPENDIX C:	Acknowledgements	7

Introduction

This is a revised and enlarged edition of Report 30 proposing a new Code of Substantive Criminal Law for Canada. Report 30, also entitled *Recodifying Criminal Law*, was tabled in Parliament on December 3, 1986, by the Minister of Justice, the Honourable Ray Hnatyshyn, who commented: "This report is a valuable contribution to criminal law reform and should be recognized as an important first step in the process of renewal."

Preliminary reactions to Report 30 by bench, bar, police, media and public were highly encouraging. The Commission has, therefore, decided to propose a revised and enlarged edition of the new Code. We recognize that this is only a first step in a long process leading ultimately, we hope, to the enactment of a new Criminal Code made in Canada by Canadians for Canadians and more accurately reflecting our national identity and our common values.

Our present Criminal Code³ was originally enacted in 1892⁴ — the fulfilment of Sir John A. MacDonald's dream of giving our fledgling nation a uniform set of criminal laws. Its enactment put Canada in the vanguard of criminal law reform. The ravages of time, however, took their toll, and Canada is no longer in that happy position.

The present *Criminal Code* has served us well over the past ninety-five years but is no longer adequate to our needs. Even though amended many times, with a major revision in 1955,⁵ it remains much the same in structure, style and content as it was in 1892. It is poorly organized. It uses archaic language. It is hard to understand. It contains gaps, some of which have had to be filled by the judiciary. It includes obsolete provisions. It over-extends the proper scope of the criminal law. And it fails to address some serious current problems. Moreover, it has sections which may well violate the *Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms*.⁶

As we mentioned in Report 30, the new Criminal Code proposed by the Commission results from fifteen years of philosophical probing, researching, thinking, debating, writing, consulting and publishing on numerous criminal law subjects. It also represents the full co-operation of federal and provincial governments in the Accelerated

^{1.} Law Reform Commission of Canada, *Recodifying Criminal Law*, vol. 1 (Report 30) (Ottawa: LRCC, 1986) [hereinafter Report 30]. The present revised and enlarged edition supersedes Report 30.

 [&]quot;Justice Minister Tables Report of Law Reform Commission Recodifying Criminal Law, Vol. 1," News Release (Ottawa: Department of Justice, 3 Dec. 1986).

^{3.} Criminal Code, R.S.C. 1970, c. C-34 [hereinafter Criminal Code].

^{4.} Criminal Code, S.C. 1892, c. 29 [hereinafter 1892 Code].

^{5.} Criminal Code, S.C. 1953-54, c. 51.

^{6.} Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, Part I of the Constitution Act, 1982, which is Schedule B of the Canada Act 1982 (U.K.), 1982, c. 11 [hereinafter Charter].

Criminal Law Review. The work of these fifteen years was presented prior to publication of Report 30 in various Reports and Working Papers which should be consulted for a fuller understanding of the present Report. Attention is drawn in particular to the following:

Report 3, Our Criminal Law (1976)

Report 12, Theft and Fraud (1979)

Report 17, Contempt of Court (1982)

Report 20, Euthanasia, Aiding Suicide and Cessation of Treatment (1983)

Working Paper 2, The Meaning of Guilt: Strict Liability (1974)

Working Paper 10, Limits of Criminal Law: Obscenity: A Test Case (1975)

Working Paper 16, Criminal Responsibility for Group Action (1976)

Working Paper 19, Theft and Fraud: Offences (1977)

Working Paper 20, Contempt of Court: Offences against the Administration of Justice (1977)

Working Paper 26, Medical Treatment and Criminal Law (1980)

Working Paper 28, Euthanasia, Aiding Suicide and Cessation of Treatment (1982)

Working Paper 29, The General Part: Liability and Defences (1982)

Working Paper 31, Damage to Property: Vandalism (1984)

Working Paper 33, Homicide (1984)

Working Paper 35, Defamatory Libel (1984)

Working Paper 36, Damage to Property: Arson (1984)

Working Paper 37, Extraterritorial Jurisdiction (1984)

Working Paper 38, Assault (1984)

Working Paper 44, Crimes against the Environment (1985)

Working Paper 45, Secondary Liability — Participation in Crime and Inchoate Offences (1985)

Working Paper 46, Omissions, Negligence and Endangering (1985)

Working Paper 47, Electronic Surveillance (1986)

Working Paper 48, Criminal Intrusion (1986)

Working Paper 49, Crimes against the State (1986)

Working Paper 50, Hate Propaganda (1986)

In producing all this work we have profited enormously from the practical advice of our consultants. These were drawn from across Canada and include eminent judges, criminal lawyers, law teachers, representatives of provincial and federal governments, police chiefs and the general public (Appendix C). We have also benefitted from the flowering of criminal law scholarship in Canada and the burst of judicial creativity on criminal law.

The proposed Criminal Code expresses the essential principles of criminal law and rules of general application. It defines most of the crimes of concern to a modern industrialized society. At the same time it drops archaic provisions but addresses modern day social problems like pollution and terrorism.

In style the new Code aims to be intelligible to all Canadians. It is drafted in a straightforward manner, minimizing the use of technical terms and avoiding complex sentence structure and excessive detail. It speaks, as much as possible, in terms of general principles instead of needless specifics and *ad hoc* enumerations. Finally, it

avoids deeming provisions, piggybacking and other indirect forms of expression, on the basis that the direct way of saying anything is the simplest, the clearest and most readily understandable.

In structure the new Code is like the present *Criminal Code* but begins with crimes against the person instead of crimes against the State. Substantive criminal law is divided into a General Part containing rules of general application and a Special Part defining the particular crimes. Title I is the General Part; Title II contains most of the crimes against the person; Title III enumerates most of the crimes against property; Title IV lists crimes against the natural order; Title V deals with crimes against the social order; and Title VI encompasses crimes against the governmental order.

Each title is subdivided where appropriate by reference to the interests infringed. Crimes against the social order, for example, are divided into crimes against social harmony and crimes against public order.

Each subcategory is further subdivided where appropriate. Crimes against social harmony, for example, are divided into: stirring up hatred and inciting genocide.

Finally, the crimes in these subcategories are mostly listed in ascending order of gravity. Less serious crimes precede more serious ones which include or build upon them. In crimes against public order, disturbing public order precedes unlawful assembly (disturbing by three or more) which in turn precedes riot (unlawful assembly resulting in risk of injury or property damage). Naturally, the provisions in all these titles affect and are affected by the principles set out in the General Part.

Our proposed new Code whose recommendations are summarized in Appendix A is not yet in the form of a Bill to be presented to Parliament; rather it is a proposal for a new statute. What that statute might look like can be seen in the illustrative draft legislation in Appendix B. All references to the proposed Code, however, are to the recommendations and not to the legislative draft. Moreover, though the recommendations and draft Bill are written in the traditional style, the final draft, it is envisaged, will ensure that as far as possible its provisions are gender neutral.

A few topics, because of their specialized nature or because others have dealt with them, are left to be considered later. They include trade and securities frauds, abortion, sex offences, prostitution and pornography. Sentences have not been ascribed to the crimes, as that task has been performed by the Canadian Sentencing Commission. Our work on criminal law procedure, which continues apace, will be put into the form of a proposed new Code of Criminal Procedure in the near future.

Absent from our proposed Criminal Code are provisions dealing with burden of proof and presumptions. Although the present *Criminal Code* contains many such provisions, the Commission has eliminated them entirely from its recommendations to reflect its views on inculpation. Substantive criminal law provisions define conditions

Canadian Sentencing Commission, Sentencing Reform: A Canadian Approach (Ottawa: Supply and Services Canada, 1987).

^{8.} Our forthcoming Code of Criminal Procedure (to be published in 1989) will contain our recommendations on the general principles of criminal procedure already described in LRCC, Our Criminal Procedure (Report 32) (Ottawa: LRCC, 1988) [to be released soon]. All references to the Code of Criminal Procedure are to the former publication.