

How Interpretation Makes International Law

On Semantic Change and Normative Twists

Ingo Venzke



How Interpretation Makes International Law

On Semantic Change and Normative Twists

INGO VENZKE





Great Clarendon Street, Oxford, OX2 6DP.

United Kingdom

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford. It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship, and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press in the UK and in certain other countries

© Oxford University Press, 2012

The moral rights of the author have been asserted First Edition published in 2012

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted by law, by licence or under terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the address above

You must not circulate this work in any other form and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer

Crown copyright material is reproduced under Class Licence Number C01P0000148 with the permission of OPSI and the Queen's Printer for Scotland

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press 198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, United States of America

> British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data Data available

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data Data available

ISBN 978-0-19-965767-4

Links to third party websites are provided by Oxford in good faith and for information only. Oxford disclaims any responsibility for the materials contained in any third party website referenced in this work.

HOW INTERPRETATION MAKES INTERNATIONAL LAW

Meinen Eltern Jürgen und Elisabeth Venzke

此为试读,需要完整PDF请访问: www.ertongbook.com

Kein Imperativ ohne Imperator. Hans Kelsen, *Allgemeine Theorie der Normen* (1979), 23.

Acknowledgements

The path leading to this book has taken numerous turns and I am profoundly indebted to many people for their input along the way. This work is the product of my doctoral studies at the Max Planck Institute in Heidelberg, conducted under the supervision of Armin von Bogdandy. I am grateful for his generous support and subtle guidance. I have learned an immense amount through his insightful comments and our vivid discussions over the years. Among the colleagues and guests at the Institute, I wish to thank Sergio Dellavalle and Alec Walen who both kept me from falling into too obvious philosophical traps. Jochen von Bernstorff, Isabel Feichtner, and Matthias Goldmann critiqued my work and shaped my arguments through many debates. I am also obliged to the input of Jelena von Achenbach, Jürgen Bast, Miriam Clados, Marie von Engelhardt, Jürgen Friedrich, Felix Hanschmann, Marc Jacob, András Jakab, Thomas Kleinlein, Matthias Kottmann, Niels Petersen, Julia Sattelberger, Stephen Schi, and Maja Smrkolj. The Institute's administrative and library staff offered superb assistance.

This book leans on developments in linguistic theory and gained key inspirations from stimulating exchanges in the Heidelberg-Mannheim juristic-linguistic discussion group. Special thanks are due to Ralph Christensen, Ekkehard Felder, Friedrich Müller, Marcus Müller, and Rainer Wimmer.

Beyond the homestead of the Heidelberg Institute, I am grateful for the opportunities I gained as a Visiting Scholar at the Cegla Center at Tel Aviv University where I again benefited from rich discourses. Eyal Benvenisti, Assaf Likhovski, Ziv Bohrer, Shai Dothan, Aya Shalom, and others made my stay truly enriching. As did Orna Ben-Naftali.

With Georg Nolte's support I was able to participate in the International Law Commission's yearly seminar and debate on the topic of 'treaties over time'. I appreciate his candid criticism and our discussions of this book's argument in Geneva and Berlin.

I embarked on new projects as a Hauser Research Scholar at New York University, but the present work ripened all the same. I am thankful for the sponsorship and input of Robert Howse and Richard Stewart. Joseph Weiler engaged with my work, invited me to conduct a workshop on its basis, and thus offered a wonderfully vigorous and very enriching experience. I am also indebted to friends and colleagues at NYU, specifically to Mattias Kumm, Federico Mucciarelli, Maxi Scherer, Fuad Zarbiyev, and Josephine van Zeben.

I defended my doctoral thesis at the University of Frankfurt and thank Michael Bothe for a swift and reflective second opinion. In the aftermath, Sabino Cassese read the manuscript and offered valuable feedback, as did Horatia Muir Watt. I would also like to thank anonymous reviewers and appreciate OUP's professional editorial work.

At my current (academic) home at the University of Amsterdam new discourses opened up and inspired the final touches to the manuscript. Many thanks to Jean d'Aspremont, Maarten den Heijer, Hege Elisabeth Kjos, Joana Mendes, Anne van Mulligen, André Nollkaemper, Tim Staal, and Marjoleine Zieck for their careful reading and feedback.

I would also like to thank my friends who have supported me despite the fact that this book sometimes took priority over my time with them. Among them, Kate Emery deserves special mention. Seline Trevisanut's limitless and continuing support lifted my spirit and smoothed my writing. Finally, without my parents' wholehearted backing over the years I could not have come close to writing this book—I therefore dedicate it to them.

Amsterdam, April 2012

List of Abbreviations

AB Appellate Body

ACHPR African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights

ACHR American Convention on Human Rights

ADA Anti-Dumping Agreement

ArabCHR Arab Convention on Human Rights

CAT Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading

Treatment or Punishment

Cf. Confer

CIL Customary International Law

DSB Dispute Settlement Body

DSU Dispute Settlement Understanding

ECHR European Convention on Human Rights

ECJ European Court of Justice
ECOSOC Economic and Social Council
ECtHR European Court of Human Rights
EJIL European Journal of International Law

EU European Union

ExCom Executive Committee of the High Commissioner's Programme

FAO Food and Agricultural Organization

GA General Assembly

GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade

IACtHR Inter-American Court of Human Rights
IASC Inter-Agency Standing Committee

IBDR International Bank for Reconstruction and Development

ICC International Criminal Court

ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

ICESCR International Covenant on Economic Social and Cultural Rights

ICI International Court of Justice

ICRC International Committee of the Red Cross

ICSID International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes

ICTR International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda

ICTY International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia

IDP Internally Displaced Person
ILC International Law Commission
IMO International Maritime Organization

IO International Organization

IRO International Refugee Organization

111	T
XV111	List of Abbreviations
26 1 111	2000 0 1100 000000000000000000000000000

ITLOS International Tribunal of the Law of the Sea

Mn Margin number

MPEPIL Max Planck Encyclopedia of Public International Law

OCHA Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs

PCIJ Permanent Court of International Justice

PPM Production and Process Method

RSD Refugee Status Determination

SC Security Council

TEC Treaty of the European Community

TEU Treaty on European Union

TFEU Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union

UDHR Universal Declaration of Human Rights

UNC United Nations Charter

UNCLOS United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea

UNDRO Office of the United Nations Disaster Relief Coordinator

UNHCR Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

UNREF United Nations Refugee Fund

UNRRA United Nations Relief and Rehabilitation Administration

VCLT Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties

WCO World Customs Organization WHO World Health Organization

WTO World Trade Organization

Table of Cases

EUROPEAN COURT OF JUSTICE (COURT OF JUSTICE OF THE EUROPEAN UNION)

Amministrazione delle Finanze dello Stato v Simmenthal SpA (Case 106/77), [1978] ECR 629 260 n291 CIMADE and GISTI v Ministry of the Interior (Case C-179/11) 121 n257 Costa v ENEL (Case 6/64), [1964] ECR 585 260 n291 Debus (Cases C-13/91 and C-113/91), [1992] ECR 1-3617 182 n231 Federal Republic of Germany v Y (Case C-71/11) 121 n257 Federal Republic of Germany v Z (Case C-99/11) 121 n257 Foto-Frost v Hauptzollamt Lübeck-Ost (Case 314/85), [1987] ECR 4199 260 n291 Internationale Handelsgeselleschaft mbH v Einfuhr-und Vorratsstelle für Getreide 260 n291 Kadi v Commission (Case T-85/09), Judgment of 30 September 2010 260 n297 Kadi & Al Barakaat v Council & Commission (Cases C-402 P and 415/05 P), 260 [2008] ECR I 6351 260
Sandoz (Case 174/82), [1983] ECR 2445
EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
Bayatyan v Armenia, Judgment of 27 October 200939 n116Emonet and others v Switzerland, Judgment of 13 December 200739 n116Gillow v The United Kingdom, Judgment of 24 November 1986183 n232Johnston and others v Ireland, Judgment of 18 December 198639 n116M.S.S. v Belgium and Greece, Judgment of the Grand Chamber of 21 January 2011121 n255Scoppola v Italy (No. 2), Judgment of the Grand Chamber of 17 September 200939 n116
GENERAL AGREEMENT ON TARIFF AND TRADE
GATT Panel Report, Canada—Measures Affecting Exports of Unprocessed Herring and Salmon, L/6268, adopted 22 March 1988, BISD 35S/98

INTERNATIONAL CENTER FOR THE SETTLEMENT OF INVESTMENT DISPUTES

Saipem S.p.A. v The People's Republic of Bangladesh, ICSID Case No ARB/05/7, Award, 30 June 2009
INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE
Aegean Sea Continental Shelf (Greece v Turkey), Judgment of 19 December 1978, ICJ Reports 3
13 December 1999, ICJ Reports 1045
Nicaragua), Judgment of 13 July 2009
Opinion of 20 July 1962, ICJ Reports 151
Corfu Channel Case (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland v Albania), Judgment of 9 April 1949, ICJ Reports 4
Gabíkovo-Nagymaros Project (Hungary v Slovakia), Judgment of 25 September 1997, ICJ Reports 7
25 July 1974, ICJ Reports 3
Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons, Advisory Opinion of 8 July 1996, ICJ Reports 226
Military and Paramilitary Activities in and Against Nicaragua (Nicaragua v United States of America), Judgment of 27 June 1986, ICJ Reports 14 25 n40, 183 n234 South West Africa (Ethiopia v South Africa; Liberia v South Africa), Judgment of
18 July 1966, ICJ Reports 6
1994, ICJ Reports 6
INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS
Prosecutor v Akayesu, Case No ICTR-96-4-T, 2 September 1998. 127 n290 Prosecutor v Jelisic, Case No IT-95-10-A, 5 July 2001. 127 n290 Prosecutor v Jelisić, Case No IT-95-10-T, 14 December 1999. 238 n194 Prosecutor v Krstic, Case No IT-98-33-T, 2 August 2001 127 n290

PERMANENT COURT OF ARBITRATION

Arbitration Regarding the Iron Rhine ('Ijzeren Rijn') Railway (Belgium v The Netherlands), Award of 24 May 2005
WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION
Appellate Body Report, Brazil—Measures Affecting Imports of Retreaded Tyres, WT/DS332/AB/R, 3 December 2007
Chicken Cuts, WT/DS286/AB/R, 12 September 2005
Certain Poultry Products, WT/DS69/AB/R, 13 July 1998
WT/DS245/AB/R, 16 November 2003
Frozen Beef, WT/DS161 & 169/AB/R, 11 December 2000
Appellate Body Report, United States—Definitive Safeguard Measures on Imports of Circular Welded Carbon Quality Line Pipe from Korea, WT/DS202/AB/R, 15 February 2002

Appellate Body Report, United States—Measures Affecting the Cross-Border Supply of Gambling and Betting Services, WT/DS285/AB/R, 7 April 2005
NATIONAL COURTS
Australia
Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs v QAAH of 2004, High Court of Australia, 15 November 2006, [2006] HCA 53
Canada
Canada (Attorney General) v Ward, Supreme Court of Canada, 30 June 1993, [1993] 2 SCR 689
Germany
Görgülü, Constitutional Court, 111 BVerfG 307, 14 October 2004258Lissabon, Constitutional Court, 123 BVerfGE 267, 30 June 2009.259, 260Maastricht, Constitutional Court, 89 BVerfGE 155, 12 October 1993.260 n292Rundberg et al. v Bundesrepublik Deutschland, Federal Administrative Court, 1C 118.62, 1 June 1965.125Solange I, Constitutional Court, 37 BVerfGE 271, 29 May 1974.259 n290Solange II, Constitutional Court, 73 BVerfGE 339, 22 October 1986.259 n290
-

Wencker, Constitutional Court, 19 BVerfG 342, 15 December 1965
4 February 1975
New Zealand
Re S.A., Refugee Appeal No 1/92, New Zealand, Refugee Status Appeals Authority, 30 April 1992
United Kingdom
AE and FE v Secretary of State for the Home Department, Court of Appeal (England
and Wales), 16 July 2003, [2003] EWCA Civ 1032
and Another, ex parte Shah, House of Lords, 25 March 1999, [1999] UKHL 20
19 December 2000, [2001] 2 AC 477
R v Uxbridge Magistrates' Court and Another, ex parte Adimi, English High Court
(Divisional Court), 29 July 1999, [1999] Imm AR 560, [1999] 4 All ER 520
Secretary of State for the Home Department v Fornah, House of Lords, 18 October 2006, [2006] UKHL 46
Secretary of State for the Home Department v Khalif Mohamed Abdi, Court of Appeal
(England and Wales), 20 April 1994, [1994] Imm AR 402
Sepet and Bulbul v Secretary of State for the Home Department, House of Lords,
20 March 2003, [2003] UKHL 15
T v Secretary of State for the Home Department, House of Lords, 22 May 1996,
[1996] 2 All ER 865
United States
Immigration and Naturalization Service v Cardoza-Fonseca, US Supreme Court, 480
US 421, 107 S Ct 1207, 9 March 1987
Immigration and Naturalization Service v Juan Anibal Aguirre-Aguirre, US Supreme
Court, 526 US 415, 119 S Ct 1439, 3 May 1999
Murray v The Schooner Charming Betsy, (1804) 6 US (2 Cranch) 64

Contents

Table of Cases		xi
	of Abbreviations	xvii
I.	In the Beginning was the Deed	1
	Problématique	2
	Agenda	10
	Programme	14
II.	The Practice of Interpretation: A Theoretical Perspective	16
	A. Lawmaking in communicative practice	18
	1. On the sources of international law	19
	2. Sovereignty, sources, and semantic change	27
	3. From sources to communicative practice	29
	B. Semantic struggles in the practice of legal interpretation	37
	1. Practice between agency and structure	38
	2. On the form and substance of legal interpretation	46
	3. Power and authority in semantic struggles	57
	C. Actors in the practice of interpretation	64
	1. Private norm entrepreneurs	65
	2. The disaggregated state	67
	3. International institutions: Bureaucracies and judicial bodies	69
III.	UNHCR and the Making of Refugee Law	72
	A. International bureaucracies as actors in legal discourse	76
	1. Delegation from principals to agents	77
	2. The authority of international bureaucracies	82
	B. The expansion of UNHCR's Statute	87
	 Expectations and concerns 	90
	2. International protection and humble beginnings	95
	3. Material assistance, good offices, and displaced persons	98
	4. Humanitarian aid and voluntary repatriation	104
	C. UNHCR and the meaning of the Convention	109
	UNHCR's role in developing the Convention	110
	2. Semantic change at work: Shifting elements in the	100
	meaning of 'refugee'	122
	D. Conclusions: Change and contexts	130

x Contents

IV.	Adjudication in the GATT/WTO: Making General	
	Exceptions in Trade Law	135
	A. International adjudicators as actors in legal discourse	139
	1. Historiography: Longing for international adjudication	140
	2. Judicial decisions and precedents	144
	3. The GATT/WTO context	147
	B. Article XX in the era of the GATT	150
	 General exceptions: A general prologue 	150
	2. The creation of a high threshold	157
	3. A territorial limitation?	163
	C. Article XX in the era of the WTO	167
	 Institutional changes and the working of precedents 	167
	2. A new beginning with the Appellate Body	172
	3. Proportionality, interpretation, and legitimacy	180
	D. Conclusions: Adjudication, precedents, and legitimacy	190
V.	Creative Interpretations: Normative Twists	196
	A. The bittersweet taste of justice in legal discourse	198
	1. Narratives of progress and advents of justice	200
	2. Scepticism and realism	207
	3. The practice of interpretation and communicative action	214
	B. The centrality of law: Dissonances and developments in	
	legal doctrine	223
	1. The appeal and futility of soft law	225
	2. Intertemporal law and subsequent practice: shortening the leash?	230
	3. Global administrative law and international public authority	240
	C. Evasive foundations: Semantic authority in a normative	
	pluriverse	245
	 Principles of democracy and ultimate authority 	248
	2. Architectural renovation and institutional design	252
	3. Attitudes and interpretation at critical junctures	256
VI.	Epilogue: In the End there is Eternity	262
Bibl	iography	266
	Index	