



WORLD TAX REFORM

Case Studies of
Developed and
Developing
Countries

EDITED BY

Michael J. Boskin
and Charles E. McLure, Jr.

INTERNATIONAL CENTER FOR ECONOMIC GROWTH

WORLD TAX REFORM

**Case Studies of Developed and
Developing Countries**

**Edited by
Michael J. Boskin
and Charles E. McLure, Jr.**



An International Center for Economic Growth Publication

**ICS PRESS
San Francisco, California**

© 1990 International Center for Economic Growth

Printed in the United States of America. All rights reserved. No part of this book may be used or reproduced in any manner without written permission except in the case of brief quotations in critical articles and reviews.

Publication signifies that the Center believes a work to be a competent treatment worthy of public consideration. The findings, interpretations, and conclusions of a work are entirely those of the author and should not be attributed to ICEG, its affiliated organizations, its board of overseers, or organizations that support ICEG.

Inquiries, book orders, and catalogue requests should be addressed to ICS Press, 243 Kearny Street, San Francisco, California, 94108. Telephone: (415) 981-5353; FAX: (415) 986-4878.

Cover design by Judy Hicks.

Second Printing

Distributed to the trade by National Book Network, Lanham, Maryland.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

World tax reform : case studies of developed and developing countries
/ edited by Michael Boskin and Charles E. McLure, Jr.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 1-55815-092-7. — ISBN 1-55815-077-3 (pbk.)

1. Taxation—Case studies. I. Boskin, Michael J. II. McLure, Charles E.

HJ2305.W68 1990

336.2'05—dc20

89-26902

CIP

Preface

A wave of tax reforms and tax reform proposals swept the globe in the 1980s. From one country to another, these reforms have exhibited several common features: a focus on making taxation economically “neutral” (that is, ensuring that the tax system does not distort people’s economic decisions), a trend toward lower marginal tax rates, a response to international tax pressures, and a consideration—particularly in many developing countries—of the value-added tax as a broad-based source of revenue.

In late 1987 and early 1988 the International Center for Economic Growth sponsored a project on world tax reform, directed by Michael Boskin, then of Stanford University and currently chairman of President George Bush’s Council of Economic Advisers. That work led to a conference in October 1988, where a group of distinguished scholars presented case studies from developed and developing countries, as well as several broad issues papers. This volume brings together the results of that conference and provides convincing evidence that we have indeed learned a great deal about effective tax policy in the past several decades. In addition, *World Tax Reform* shows where current thinking has been neglected in the policy-making process.

At the end of 1988, Dr. Boskin wrote the introduction and overview that appears as the first chapter in this book. At that point, anticipating his new responsibilities in Washington, D.C., he turned the manuscripts over to Charles E. McLure, Jr., of the Hoover Institution, to complete the editing and

to write a special conclusion, which also appears herein. We list them together as coeditors of the final product.

World Tax Reform reveals the interaction among academic thinking, administrative practice, and political reality that is causing the field of taxation to evolve so rapidly around the world. We hope the book will be useful in the tax reform debates now taking place, at both an academic and a policy-making level.

Nicolás Ardito-Barletta
General Director
International Center for Economic Growth

March 1990
Panama City, Panama

Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>		vii
<i>List of Figures</i>		xi
<i>Preface</i>		xiii
Part I	Introduction and Overview	
Chapter 1	New Directions in Tax Policy <i>Michael J. Boskin</i>	3
Part II	General Issues	
Chapter 2	Tax Principles in an International Economy <i>Joel Slemrod</i>	11
Chapter 3	Principles of Taxation Applied to Developing Countries: What Have We Learned? <i>Arnold C. Harberger</i>	25
Part III	Tax Reform and Developed Countries	
Chapter 4	Tax Reform in Australia <i>Michael G. Porter and Christopher Trengove</i>	49

Chapter 5	Recent Tax Reform in Canada: Policy Responses to Global and Domestic Pressures <i>John Whalley</i>	73
Chapter 6	The 1988 Tax Reform Proposal in Israel <i>Eytan Sheshinski</i>	93
Chapter 7	Tax Reform Debates in Japan <i>Yukio Noguchi</i>	111
Chapter 8	Sweden: Tax Reform in a High-Tax Environment <i>Ingemar Hansson and Charles Stuart</i>	127
Chapter 9	Tax Reform in the United Kingdom: The Recent Experience <i>Andrew W. Dilnot and J. A. Kay</i>	149
Chapter 10	The U.S. Tax Reform of 1986: Is It Worth Copying? <i>John B. Shoven</i>	177
Part IV	Tax Reform and Developing Countries	
Chapter 11	Economic Reform in the People's Republic of China, 1979–1988 <i>Roger H. Gordon</i>	189
Chapter 12	Tax Reform in an Inflationary Environment: The Case of Colombia <i>Charles E. McLure, Jr.</i>	205
Chapter 13	Tax Reform and the Value-Added Tax: Indonesia <i>Malcolm Gillis</i>	227
Chapter 14	Tax Reform Issues in Mexico <i>Francisco Gil Díaz</i>	251
Part V	Conclusion	
Chapter 15	Appraising Tax Reform <i>Charles E. McLure, Jr.</i>	279
	<i>Notes and References</i>	289
	<i>About the Contributors</i>	319
	<i>Index</i>	323

List of Tables

Table 4.1	Federal Government Tax Receipts in Australia, 1954/55 to 1988/89	51
Table 4.2	OECD and Australian Tax Shares by Source	52
Table 4.3	Evolution of the Personal Income Tax Scale in Australia, 1954/55, 1974/75, and 1984/85	53
Table 4.4	Average Earnings and the Top Rate of Tax in Australia, 1954/55 to 1988/89	55
Table 4.5	The Progress of Australian Tax Reform	62
Table 4.6	Disposable Incomes and Tax Rates in Australia, 1954/55 to 1988/89	71
Table 5.1	Main Features of Canada's Tax System	74
Table 5.2	Federal Personal Income Tax Rates in Canada, before and after Reform, 1988	79
Table 5.3	Conversion of Exemptions to Credits under Proposed Income Tax Changes in Canada, 1987	80
Table 5.4	Aggregate Efficiency Effects of Canadian Tax Reforms	87
Table 5.5	Distributional Effects of Canadian Tax Reforms	88

Table 5.6	Distributional Effects of Various Methods to Reduce Regressivity of Canadian Sales Tax Reform	90
Table 6.1	Current and Proposed Tax Rates in Israel	97
Table 6.2	Top Individual Income Tax Rates in Selected Countries, 1984–1990	97
Table 6.3	Current and Proposed Credit Points and Tax Thresholds in Israel	98
Table 6.4	Effect of the Proposed Reform on Net Income in Israel	99
Table 6.5	Effect of the April 1987 Tax Cut and Proposed Reform on Net Income in Israel	100
Table 6.6	Effect of Tax Base Expansion on Israel's Tax Revenues	101
Table 7.1	Trends in Government Revenues in Japan, FY 1970–1988	112
Table 8.1	Levels of Taxation in Countries of the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD)	128
Table 9.1	Tax Revenues in the United Kingdom, 1988/89	150
Table 9.2	Income Tax Rates and Thresholds in the United Kingdom, 1948–1989	157
Table 9.3	Percentage of U.K. Taxpaying Population Paying Tax Rates over 40 Percent, 1978/79 and 1983/84	158
Table 9.4	Main Features of the 1984 Reforms to the U.K. Corporation Tax	161
Table 9.5	Distribution of Taxable Profits in the United Kingdom, 1982–1988	162
Table 9.6	Income Tax Allowances under Current U.K. System	164
Table 9.7	Ratios of Current and Proposed U.K. Income Tax Allowances to Single Allowance	165
Table 9.8	Marginal Tax Payments under Old and New Benefit Systems in the United Kingdom	170
Table 9.9	Degree of Fiscal Privilege of Assets for Three Groups of U.K. Taxpayers, 1988/89	171
Table 10.1	Changes in Corporate Tax Revenue in the United States, 1987–1991	183
Table 12.1	Inflation and Indebtedness of Companies in Colombia, 1950–1985	212

Table 12.2	Term Structure of Debt of Manufacturing Companies in Colombia, 1970–1980	218
Table 13.1	Two Decades of Value-Added Taxation in Selected Developing Countries, 1966–1988	230
Table 13.2	Indonesia's Tax Structure before and after Reform	232
Table 13.3	Domestic Tax Revenues in Indonesia as Percentage of GDP, 1967–1987	234
Table 13.4	Sales Tax and VAT Revenues in Indonesia, 1984–1987	244
Table 13.5	Government Spending, Revenue, and Deficits in Indonesia before and after Tax Reform	245
Table 14.1	Structure of Mexico's GDP, 1930–1987	253
Table 14.2	Federal Government Tax Revenues and Social Security Contributions in Mexico, 1940–1988	255
Table 14.3	Real Revenue from the VAT in Mexico, 1980–1988	264
Table 14.4	Effect of Inflation on Mexico's Tax Revenues, 1980–1988	267
Table 14.5	Domestic Debt and Taxes of Mexican Firms, 1980–1987	268
Table 14.6	Share of Wages and Salaries and Fringe Benefits in Total Labor Income in Mexico's Manufacturing Sector, 1978–1988	271
Table 15.1	Tax Rates in Selected Countries, before and after Tax Reform	282

List of Figures

Figure 4.1	Composition of Federal and State Tax Receipts in Australia, 1986/87	50
Figure 4.2	Movement in Average Tax Rates in Australia, 1954/55 to 1984/85	54
Figure 4.3	Effective Marginal Rates of Tax for Families in Australia, 1988	68
Figure 6.1	Estimated Distribution of Tax Revenue Lost as a Result of Exemptions in Israel, by Income Decile, 1987	94
Figure 6.2	Share of Taxes in Israel's GNP, 1978–1988	95
Figure 6.3	Increase in Net Monthly Income with Proposed Tax Reforms in Israel	99
Figure 8.1	Various Taxes' Share of GNP in Sweden, 1950–1986	129
Figure 8.2	Income Inequality and Transfers for Selected Countries	131
Figure 8.3	Ratio of Gross to Net Earnings in Sweden, 1955–1986	132

Figure 8.4	Weekly Hours of Work per Working Individual in Sweden, 1976–1987	134
Figure 8.5	Total Hours Worked Annually in Sweden according to National Income Accounts, 1970–1987	134
Figure 8.6	Taxes Paid on Capital Income as a Share of Total Income in Sweden, 1982	137
Figure 8.7	Formal Tax Progressivity in Sweden, 1982	137
Figure 8.8	Actual Tax Progressivity in Sweden, 1982	138
Figure 9.1	Tax Revenue as a Percentage of GDP in the United Kingdom, 1960–1988	152
Figure 9.2	Average Tax Rate Paid in the United Kingdom, 1984	156
Figure 9.3	Average Tax and Benefit Rate in the United Kingdom, 1984	156
Figure 9.4	Current U.K. National Insurance Contribution Schedule	168
Figure 9.5	Marginal Tax Rates for Married Men in the United Kingdom, 1988/89	169
Figure 9.6	Average Tax Rates for Married Men in the United Kingdom, 1988/89	170
Figure 9.7	Degree of Fiscal Privilege for Selected Assets in the United Kingdom, 1978/79 and 1988/89	172

Part I

Introduction and Overview

New Directions in Tax Policy

By the mid-1980s, many of the world's countries—both advanced and developing—had either enacted or were considering substantial tax reforms. This extraordinary series of tax reforms occurred in response to intellectual, historical, and political currents that appeared during the 1970s. In some cases the reforms reflected primarily domestic economic and political circumstances; in others they reflected economic circumstances common to many countries. Ideas tried in one country then spread to others. And as the economies of the world have become more closely interrelated, the tax reforms in the largest countries, such as the United States and Japan, have affected their trading partners as well. Although the world's economies have widely varying tax systems even after a decade of reform, some common themes—most notably, the attempt to lower marginal tax rates—run through most of these reforms.

Common intellectual themes included concern about the adverse incentive effects of high marginal tax rates and about distortions caused by differential tax treatment of economically similar activities, and a downplaying of vertical equity as a central objective of tax policy. Interest in incentives started to develop especially in the 1970s, a decade in which relatively high inflation artificially increased tax rates, especially for the middle class. This episode highlighted the inequities and distortions resulting from an unindexed tax system in inflationary times. There was concern about tax evasion and about the effort diverted from productive economic

activity into tax shelters and unproductive investment, and perceptions of unfairness were growing. Finally, of course, the internationalization of the world economy created competitive pressures on countries to respond to tax reforms elsewhere.

In the United States, the case with which I am most familiar, tax reform took place in response to many of the same factors that encouraged reforms in other places. Between 1965 and 1980 the number of U.S. taxpayers facing high marginal tax rates quadrupled, creating a powerful political constituency for tax reform.

Some of these issues, such as high marginal tax rates, affected developed and developing countries alike. Others had special relevance primarily for one group of countries or the other. Therefore, the lessons to be learned by individual countries from others' experiences varied with circumstance to some degree.

Because the level and structure of taxation affects so many economic decisions, the rapid pace of tax reform in many countries may well have significant, lasting effects on the world economy. Although the reform process continues in a number of countries, it is worthwhile to evaluate what has happened in major countries where reform has occurred and to set forth an agenda of reforms still to be considered. That is the purpose of this volume. It brings together leading specialists on taxation and tax reform, writing about a variety of the economies that have undergone or are considering major tax reform in both the developed and the developing worlds. The volume stresses the economics and tax policy side of the reforms, with some reference to their political context. It is hoped that similarities and differences in various country experiences can be highlighted to yield lessons about the differences between good tax policy and bad tax policy and about how to implement a strategy for reform.

The volume grew out of a project the International Center for Economic Growth (ICEG) asked me to organize in 1987. I invited leading tax experts and scholars who had participated in or observed tax reform movements in various countries, and this volume is the result of their work. Several of the authors were the primary technical participants in the tax reform process, either in their own country or in other countries. Others played a key role in evaluating alternative proposals and assisting government officials in deciding among them. I attempted not only to achieve substantial coverage by including a wide number of countries that had undergone, were undergoing, or were contemplating, tax reform, but also to represent a wide range of views on tax policy questions. As a consequence, the authors represented here express very different views on some major tax issues.

Each author was asked to write on a particular topic. The authors remain solely responsible for the views expressed in their own chapters. No attempt was made either by me, while I was still participating in the project, or by Charles McLure, to change anyone's opinions or expressions of them. But in order to offer the perspective, judgment, and experience of all of the partici-

pants as a potential input into the drafting of individual chapters, ICEG sponsored a working session for the authors to discuss first drafts of their papers. The seminar, held in San Francisco in October 1988, yielded an extremely useful interchange of information and views, and new insights and perspectives emerged.

The volume begins with two general essays on tax principles: Joel Slemrod, writing on tax principles in an international economy, focuses on the need for tax policy to include considerations of international trade in goods and capital and features of tax rules that affect multinational organizations. Arnold Harberger presents an evaluation of principles of taxation applied to developing countries, which share many concerns of advanced economies, but also have some issues that are quite specific to their circumstances, including the administrative capabilities of their tax regimes. Harberger puts these together as a set of lessons about good tax policy.

The next set of essays turns to discussions and evaluations of recent tax reform, or tax reform debates, in advanced economies. This section begins with a chapter by Michael Porter and Chris Trengove discussing tax reform in Australia, which attempted to use an unusual consensus political approach to achieve reform. Faced with an erosion of the personal income tax because of tax shelters and fringe benefits, Australia reduced its top rate from 60 to 49 percent and adopted an "imputation" system to reduce the double taxation of corporate income, but rejected a broad-based sales tax (retail sales tax or value-added tax). It also added taxation of fringe benefits, which is unusual.

John Whalley, who has been especially active in the Canadian debate on the value-added tax (VAT), then considers tax policy reform in Canada. As the largest U.S. trading partner, Canada is especially interesting because of its response to international pressures, as well as its consideration of a VAT. Whalley discusses that country's reductions in marginal tax rates, its reductions in investment credits and depreciation, and its replacement of a defective manufacturer's sales tax with a VAT. He then tries to estimate the allocative and distributional effects of reform.

Eytan Sheshinski discusses the tax reform proposals made in Israel in 1988 by a tax reform commission he headed. Israel had galloping inflation; hence, questions related to indexing, the measurement of real income, and the interaction of inflation and the tax code were among the important issues in Israel. As in many other economies, there was a concern in Israel that the tax base was eroding, and tax rates were far too high.

Yukio Noguchi discusses the tax reform debates in Japan, which focused on the hard-to-tax groups. With little emphasis on vertical equity, the debates have considered the levels of corporate income taxes, the tax treatment of interest and capital gains, the financing of social security, and a proposed land tax. To reduce individual and corporate income tax rates and to increase revenue available for social security payments, the country has instituted a small value-added tax, which has turned out to be tremendously (and surprisingly) controversial.