# Corporate Disclosure and Corporate Governance in China

JANE FU



## KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL

# **Corporate Disclosure and Corporate** Governance in China

Jane Fu



AUSTIN BOSTON CHICAGO NEW YORK THE NETHERLANDS

Published by: Kluwer Law International PO Box 316 2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn The Netherlands Website: www.kluwerlaw.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:
Aspen Publishers, Inc.
7201 McKinney Circle
Frederick, MD 21704
United States of America
Email: customer.service@aspenpublishers.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by: Turpin Distribution Services Ltd. Stratton Business Park Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ United Kingdom Email: kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 978-90-411-2669-6

© 2010, Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without prior written permission of the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA. E-mail: permissions@kluwerlaw.com

Printed in Great Britain.

## About the Author

Jane (Jian) Fu, LLB (Beijing), LLM (Canberra) and PhD (UNSW), worked for eight years as a draftsperson for the Legislative Affairs Commission of the Standing Committee of the PRC National People's Congress in Beijing. During this period, she was a Judge at the People's Court in Beijing, as a researcher at School of Law, City University of Hong Kong and as an associate in the office of an international law firm in Hong Kong. Ms Fu worked at four Australian law schools as an academician. She is currently a Senior Lecturer in Law in the School of Law, Deakin University, Australia. She also held visiting positions at Oxford University in 2006, and University of California at Berkeley in 2006 and 2007. Ms Fu publishes her work extensively in China, Australia and elsewhere. Her publications focus on Chinese commercial law, Chinese civil law, comparative study of China's company and securities law and the Australian corporations law.

#### Foreword

Dr Jane Fu's book reviews the development of China's securities market and seeks to convey an in-depth understanding of its corporate disclosure laws and rules by examining their origins and functions. This is the first book, as far as I know, that particularly focuses on China's lawmaking process and the manner in which foreign experiences have been drawn upon in this process. Through a comparative study, this book persuasively argues that the inefficiency of China's current disclosure regulations have, to a great extent, resulted from the lack of empirical studies of foreign corporate disclosure laws and the mistakes made by the drafters of Chinese laws and regulations in the process of transplanting foreign laws into China. This book also recommends Australia as a model for incorporating foreign laws into China's unique environment.

Dr Fu was educated at law schools in both China and Australia. She has drawn upon her work experience as a draftsperson for the Legislative Affairs Commission of the People's Republic of China's Standing Committee of the National People's Congress and as a legal academic in Australia to undertake her research on corporate disclosure issues under both Chinese law and Australian law. Her book casts a much-needed light upon features of the background of Chinese corporate disclosure law that are not often discussed and debated by legal academics. It also reviews the unique history of the development of the Australian corporate disclosure system that spans more than a century. Dr Fu's empirical research supports her detailed descriptions, discussions, and evaluations of corporate disclosure laws in both China and Australia.

Dr Fu's work is an important source for further study and research on Chinese securities law, not only for legal academics, legal researchers, legal practitioners, and members of the business community, but also for Chinese lawmakers and policy makers. With the development of globalization and internationalization, it is necessary for all countries in the world to examine their lawmaking methods

and processes from a comparative perspective. This is especially important for emerging and transitional countries such as China. It is equally important for other countries to understand Chinese law from a comparative perspective.

For these reasons, I commend this book of my former colleague, Dr Jane Fu, to scholars, legal practitioners, and students, as well as to lawmakers and policy makers who are concerned with China's securities laws and policy issues.

Li Fei Vice Chairman Legislative Affairs Commission Standing Committee of the National People's Congress The People's Republic of China

#### Preface

Information disclosure is a fundamental technique in securities regulation and corporate governance. Most countries with securities markets have developed securities regulatory regimes that strongly focus on corporate disclosure. The modern securities market in the People's Republic of China re-emerged in the late 1980s and developed extremely quickly thereafter. This market has been modelled on Western markets, especially the United States model. Chinese securities regulation reformers advocated the establishment of United States-style securities regulation, which includes a detailed corporate disclosure regime.

After the establishment of the Chinese securities market, the improvement and further reform of China's corporate disclosure regime continued to follow the United States model. Further research on Chinese securities markets has tended to be focused upon segmented areas of regulation without regard to the overall context of disclosure in China. There has been little, if any, in-depth research on the historical development of China's securities market and the formation and reform of its corporate disclosure laws and regulations. This book is intended to fill these gaps.

I have been following the development of the Chinese securities market since the mid-1990s, when I left my position as a draftsperson for the Legislative Affairs Commission of the Standing Committee of the People's Republic of China's National People's Congress so as to pursue postgraduate studies in Australia. The lack of a wide understanding of the Chinese securities market from a historical and comparative perspective prompted my interest in researching this area. My interest in this research continued after I finished my postgraduate studies. This book reports on my decade-long research efforts, and I hope it will be of interest to legal researchers, policy makers, and legal practitioners. It provides a detailed picture of the Chinese corporate disclosure regime that has emerged during the period of China's economic transition since the 1990s.

This book could not have been completed without strong support from a number of people. I wish to thank Professors Roman Tomasic, Angus Corbett, Ian Ramsay, Paul Redmond, Wang Baoshu, Wang Weiguo, Zhao Xudong, Gu Gongyun, and Jiang Ping for their kind encouragement, valuable direction, and the comments that they provided as Australian or Chinese company law authorities. I would also like to express my special gratitude to my former colleagues at the Legislative Affairs Commission of the National People's Congress for their friendly support and help. Finally, I wish to thank the anonymous interviewees who assisted me with this research, as well as Dr Hu Ruyin, Mr Yuan Xiuguo, and Mr Ouyang Danian of the Shanghai Stock Exchange, and Mr Zhang Yujun, formerly of the Shenzhen Stock Exchange, for sharing their views and insights. I should add that any errors or omissions that may exist in this book are entirely my own.

I am greatly indebted to Mr Simon Bellamy and his editorial team at Kluwer Law International for their patience and professional support of this project.

This book is dedicated to my parents. Without their unselfish support, I could not have achieved what I have in my life. During the writing of this book, my children have sustained me and have given me great joy, comfort, and support.

Jane Fu Melbourne January 2010

Foreign Laws Using the Australian

Transplantation Experience

**About the Author** 

rore	word		ΧV
Prefa	ace		xvii
Chaj	pter 1		
Corp	orate I	Disclosure, Corporate Governance, and Law	
Refo	rm in t	he People's Republic of China	1
1.1.	Why F	Has the Study of Corporate Governance in the	
	People	's Republic of China Become Important?	1
1.2.	An Overview of Corporate Disclosure and Corporate		
	Govern	nance in China	3
	1.2.1.	The Concept of Corporate Governance Used in China	3
	1.2.2.	Is Corporate Governance in China Improved	
		by the Adoption of a Top-Down or	
		Bottom-Up Approach?	6
	1.2.3.	Stages of Corporate Governance	
		Development in the PRC	12
	1.2.4.	Major Corporate Governance Issues in China	13
1.3.	Establ	ishing the Corporate Disclosure Regime	
	as a T	ool for Improving Corporate Governance in China	15
1.4.	Transp	planting Foreign Corporate Disclosure Laws into China	16
1.5.		ving the Approach of Transplanting	

xiii

16

Char	oter 2				
Intro	duction		17		
2.1.	Backgr	ound of the Formation of the Corporate			
	Disclos	sure Regime in the PRC	17		
2.2.	The Sig	The Significance of This Book			
2.3.	Three I	Three Hypotheses Explored in This Book			
2.4.		utline of This Book	29		
2.5.	Method	dology	31		
2.6.	The Cu	ut-Off Date	32		
	pter 3				
		tion to the Chinese Legal System:			
		Context for Securities Law Reform	33		
	Introdu		33		
3.2.		History of the PRC	34		
		The Importance of Reviewing Chinese Legal History	34		
		A Brief Review of Chinese Legal History	35		
3.3.		s of Law in the PRC and Their Importance	44		
		Introduction	44		
		Forms of Legal Sources in the PRC	50		
3.4.		aking Bodies in the PRC	56		
3.5.		aking Processes in the PRC	58		
		Lawmaking Process of the NPC	58		
	3.5.2.	Lawmaking Process of the Standing Committee			
		of the NPC	60		
	3.5.3.	Process for Making Administrative Regulations			
		by the State Council	63		
	3.5.4.	The Making of Local Regulations by Local			
		People's Congresses	65		
	3.5.5.				
		Rules by the Ministries and Commissions of the State			
		Council and the Making of Local Administrative			
		Rules by the Provincial Governments	65		
3.6.		rement of Law in the PRC	66		
	3.6.1.	The Enactment of the Company Law of 1993			
		and the Securities Law of 1998 and			
		Their Amendments in 2005, as Well as Relevant			
		Administrative Regulations			
		and Administrative Rules	70		
	3.6.2.	How Did the PRC Start Regulating the			
		Securities Market?	71		
	3.6.3.				
		Law Enacted?	72 76		
3.7.	Conclusion				

Char	oter 4		
Gate	keepers	in the Chinese Securities Market	79
4.1.	Introdu	ction	79
	4.1.1.	Re-emergence of Securities Issue and Regulation	80
	4.1.2.	Corporate Disclosure Rules	93
4.2.	The Re	gulator of the Chinese Securities Market: The CSRC	93
	4.2.1.	Regulation by Other Bodies of the Central	
		Government before 1998	93
		Trying to Centralize Securities Regulation	94
		The Functions of the SCSC and the CSRC	95
	4.2.4.	The CSRC's Rules on Disclosure	102
	4.2.5.	Overview of the Functions of the CSRC	103
4.3.	The Re	gulators of the Chinese Securities Market:	
	Other I	Departments under the State Council	106
	4.3.1.	Regulation by the PBOC	106
	4.3.2.	Other Departments of the State Council	110
4.4.	The Re	egulators: Local Governments	114
	4.4.1.	Regulation by Local Governments before the	
		CSRC was Established	114
	4.4.2.	The Role of Local Governments after 1998	116
4.5.	Other I	Regulatory Bodies: The Stock Exchanges	116
	4.5.1.	Why the Shanghai and Shenzhen Stock	
		Exchanges Were Established	116
		The Shanghai Stock Exchange (SSE)	117
		The Shenzhen Stock Exchange (SZSE)	121
		Overview of the Role of Stock Exchanges in the PRC	122
4.6.	Self-Re	egulatory Organizations	123
		Securities Industry Association	123
		Other SROs	125
4.7.	Conclu	sion	125
	pter 5		
		Rules Dealing with Disclosure in the PRC's	
	irities M		127
5.1.	Introdu		127
	5.1.1.	The state of the s	131
	5.1.2.	Companies' Duty of Disclosure versus Directors'	
		Duty of Disclosure	132
	5.1.3.	Where Are the Disclosure Rules?	134
		5.1.3.1. The Structure of Disclosure Rules	134
		5.1.3.2. The Disclosure Rules under the National Laws	135
		5.1.3.2.1. The Company Law of 2005	135
		5.1.3.2.2. The Securities Law of 2005	136
		5.1.3.2.3. The Criminal Law of 1979	137

		5.1.3.3.	Disclosure	Provisions under Administrative	
			Regulation	1S	138
			5.1.3.3.1.	The State Council's Interim	
				Regulations on Administration of	
				Share Issuing and Trading of 1993	
				(The 1993 Interim Regulations)	138
			51332	The Regulations on the Issue of	150
			3.1.3.3.2.	Foreign Shares by Listed	
					139
			51222	Companies inside China of 1995	139
			5.1.3.3.3.	The Special Provisions on Share	
				Issuing and Listing outside China	1.10
				by Listed Companies of 1994	140
		5.1.3.4.		Rules under Departmental	2.22
				ative Rules	140
			5.1.3.4.1.	Disclosure Rules in the Accounting	
				Standards Set by the Ministry	
				of Finance	140
			5.1.3.4.2.	Disclosure under the Administrative	
				Rules and Other Regulatory Rules	
				of the CSRC	140
		5.1.3.5.	Disclosure	e Provisions Concerning	
				e in the Listing Rules and Business	
				he Stock Exchanges	142
	5.1.4.	Brief Con		the Disclosure Regime	143
5.2.	Major Rules Dealing with Disclosure in Fundraising				
				Public Offerings (IPOs)	144 144
	D11111	5.2.1.1.		f Rules on IPOs	144
		5.2.1.2.	IPOs and	Offerings of Other Shares	145
		5.2.1.3.	The Verif	ication System Versus the	110
		J.2.1.5.		ion and Approval System	
				Offers of Company Shares	146
		5.2.1.4.		es for IPOs	150
		5.2.1.5.		on Documents for IPOs	152
		5.2.1.6.			153
			Prospectu		
		5.2.1.7.		es for B-Share Issuing	154
F 2	a .:	5.2.1.8.	Overview	of Disclosure Rules Regarding IPOs	157
5.3.		uous Disc		- CCD C	157
5.4.	Special Disclosure Rules of the CSRC				158 159
5.5.		or Issues on Disclosure			
	5.5.1.				
		Securitie			159
				C Adopt Compulsory Disclosure?	160
			for Disclosu		161
	5.5.4.	What Sh	ould Be Dis	sclosed?	162
		5511	The Anni	al Peport	165

		<ul> <li>5.5.4.2. The Half-Yearly Report</li> <li>5.5.4.3. The Quarterly Report</li> <li>5.5.4.4. The Interim Report</li> <li>5.5.4.5. Related Party Transactions</li> </ul>	166 166 166 167
5.6.	The Fo	ormation of Disclosure Rules and Their Functions	168
5.7.		ew of the Corporate Disclosure Regime in the PRC	170
2.1.	5.7.1.	The Enforcement of Laws and Regulations	170
		The Defects in the National Laws	170
		How Should Foreign Experiences Be Adopted?	171
5.8.		ision: What Can the PRC Learn from the	1.7.1
J.0.		odel in Terms of Disclosure?	171
Chai	oter 6		
		the Securities Market and Disclosure in the PRC	175
		evelopment of the Securities Market	175
		Re-emergence of the Securities Market in the PRC	175
	6.1.2.	The History of Securities Markets in China before 1949	177
	6.1.3.	The Securities Market after the Founding of the PRC	179
	6.1.4.	The Securities Market Since the 1980s	179
6.2.		Securities	184
		A-Shares and B-Shares in the Domestic Markets	184
		Four Types of Shares in Shareholding	
		Companies Converted from SOEs	186
	6.2.3.	Bonds	193
		Funds	195
6.3.	Openia	ng of the PRC Securities Market after Its WTO Accession	196
		Means for Share Issuing	196
		Formation and Abolition of the Quota System	.,,
	Ciciai	for Share Issuing	197
	6.3.3	From an Examination and Approval System	121
		to a Verification System	199
	6.3.4.	The Main Board and the High-Tech Board	200
6.4.		ors in the Securities Market	201
6.5.		ties Companies	201
6.6.		c Cases Involving Disclosure on the PRC Securities Market	202
0.0.		The Baoyan Incident	202
	6.6.2.	The Case of Beihai Zhengda Company's	202
	0.0.2.	Takeover of the Shares of Susanshan Company	203
	6.6.3.	The <i>Qiongminyuan</i> Case of a False Financial Report	203
	6.6.4.	The Chengdu Hongguang Case of Profits	203
	0.0.1.	Forgery and Fraudulent Listing	204
	6.6.5.	The Yinguangxia Fraud Case	204
	6.6.6.		204
	6.6.7.	I was	200
		Disclosure Cases	205
			See Va

6.7.	Exchange and Cooperation with Securities					
	Regula	tory Bodies	in Other Countries	206		
	6.7.1.	The Intern	ational Organization of Securities Commissions	206		
			ational Accounting Standards Committee	207		
			apital from Abroad	207		
6.8.	Conclu			208		
6.9.	Information Availability, Mechanism for Enforcing					
			ions, and Remedies for Investors			
		lave Suffere		210		
			on Availability	210		
			on Availability under the Law and in Practice	212		
			volving Enforcement of Securities Regulations	213		
			rs of the CSRC Dealing with Cases Involving			
	0.7.1.		tion of Disclosure Provisions	214		
	695		dies Available to Investors Who Have	21		
	0.7.0.	Suffered L		219		
			Administrative Remedies	219		
			Criminal Remedies	219		
			Civil Remedies	220		
	606	Conclusion		221		
	0.7.0.	Conclusion		221		
Cha	pter 7					
		ts of the A	ustralian Corporate Disclosure			
	ulatory			223		
0	Introdu			223		
7.2.			of Australian Securities Markets	226		
1.2.	7.2.1.		gence and Development of Securities	2220		
	1 . 600 . 1		n Australian Colonies before 1900	226		
	7.2.2.		ement towards a Uniform Companies	220		
	1 . 2 . 2 .		Uniform Securities Market since the 1930s	230		
	723			230		
	7.2.3. Current Development of the Securities Markets in Australia					
		7.2.3.1.	Stock Exchange Automated Trading System	237		
		1.4.3.1.	(SEATS)	238		
		7.2.3.2.		250		
		1.4.3.4.	(CHESS)	239		
		7222				
	721		Influence of Foreign Markets	239		
	1.2.4.		Disclosure and Committees of Enquiry	246		
			ocess of Corporate Law Reform	240		
		7.2.4.1.	The Select Committee on Joint Stock			
			Companies and the Joint Stock Companies	0.46		
		7242	Acts of 1844 and 1856	240		
		7.2.4.2.	The 1895 Davey Report of the UK,			
			the Companies Act of 1896 (Victoria),	2		
			and the 1906 Loreburn Report of the UK	241		

		7.2.4.3.	The Greene Report of 1925–1926			
			and the Companies Act of 1929 of the UK	242		
		7.2.4.4.	The Cohen Report of 1945 of the UK	242		
		7.2.4.5.	The Jenkins Committee Report of 1962			
		,	of the UK	243		
		7.2.4.6.	The Eggleston Committee Report of 1970	243		
		7.2.4.7.	The Rae Report of 1974	243		
		7.2.4.8.	The 1975 Corporations and Securities	2,0		
		1.2.7.0.	Industry Bill	245		
		7.2.4.9.	The 1983 Green Paper	245		
		7.2.4.10.	The Griffiths Report of 1989	246		
		7.2.4.11.	The CASAC Report of 1991 and the Lavarch	270		
		1.4.4.11.	Committee Report of 1991	247		
		72412		254		
		7.2.4.12.	The 1992 Cadbury Report of the UK			
		7.2.4.13.	The Ramsay Report of 2001	255		
		7.2.4.14.	Principles of Good Corporate Governance			
			and Best Practice Recommendations of the			
			ASX Corporate Governance Council of 2003	0.57		
			and Its Amendments	256		
		7.2.4.15.	The HIH Royal Commission Report of 2003	256		
		7.2.4.16.	The Corporate Law Economic Reform			
			Program (Audit Reform and Corporate			
			Disclosure) Act of 2004 (The CLERP 9 Act)	257		
	7.2.5.		of the Formation and Development			
		of Austra	lian Securities Regulatory Regime	258		
7.3.	The Establishment and Development of the Disclosure					
	Regulatory Framework in Australia					
	7.3.1.	The Sour	ces of Corporate Disclosure Rules in Australia	261		
	7.3.2.	What Information Should Be Disclosed?				
		7.3.2.1.	Prospectus and Other Forms of Disclosure			
			for Fundraising in the Primary Market	264		
		7.3.2.2.	Periodic Disclosure in the Secondary Market	265		
		7.3.2.3.	Continuous Disclosure	267		
		7.3.2.4.	Specific Disclosure	270		
			7.3.2.4.1. Content of Specific Disclosure	270		
			7.3.2.4.2. Disclosure of Corporate			
			Governance Practices	271		
			7.3.2.4.3. Disclosure of Directors' Remuneration	272		
			7.3.2.4.4. Disclosure of Short Selling	272		
	7.3.3.					
	Regulatory Regime in Australia					
	7.3.4.		s for Disclosure	273		
	1.0.1.	7.3.4.1.	Statutory Standards for Financial Reporting	277		
		7.3.4.2.	Professional Standards for Disclosure			
		7.3.4.2.	The Disclosure Standards of ASIC	277		
		1.0.1.0.	THE DISCUSSIFE STANDARDS OF ASIC	278		

	7.3.5.	Duty of Disclosure: Does a Company Director	
		or the Company Owe Such a Duty to Shareholders?	279
	7.3.6.	The Theoretical Debates over Mandatory	
		Corporate Disclosure	282
		7.3.6.1. Unequal Possession of Information	
		among Investors	283
		7.3.6.2. Monitoring of Management	284
		7.3.6.3. The Social Waste Hypothesis	285
		7.3.6.4. The Public Good Hypothesis	286
		7.3.6.5. The Public Choice Theory	287
		7.3.6.6. The Efficient Capital Market Hypothesis	287
	7.3.7.	Overview of the Establishment of the Australian	401
	1.3.1.		200
7.4	The D	Securities Regulation Framework	289
		articipants of Securities Regulation and Their Roles	200
		closure Regulation	290
		The History of ASIC	290
		Functions and Powers of ASIC	291
		Functions of the ASX in Disclosure Regulation	293
		Functions of Corporations and Markets Advisory Committee	295
		Quality of Disclosure in Australia	296
		ustralian Securities Market and Globalization	298
7.6.		ecurities Disclosure Regime in Australia	
		s Adoption of Foreign Experiences	298
	7.6.1.	The Influence of English Law	299
		The Influence of US Law	299
		The Canadian Influence	300
7.7.	Conclu	ısion	301
C14			
Chap			2000
		s and Suggestions	303
	Introd		303
		s Culture	305
		s Politics	307
		nd Its Economic Implications	308
8.5.		stablishment and Development of the PRC Corporate	
	Disclo	sure Regime: What Has Been the Effect?	309
8.6.	The C	hoice of Foreign Corporate Disclosure Models	
	and Its	s Impact on the PRC's Practices	311
8.7.	Direct	ors' Duties of Disclosure	312
8.8.	Sharel	nolders' Remedies	312
8.9.	Concl	usion and Suggestions	314
		***	
Bibli	Bibliography 31		
Index	Index 34		

Chapter 1

Corporate Disclosure, Corporate Governance, and Law Reform in the People's Republic of China

1.1. WHY HAS THE STUDY OF CORPORATE GOVERNANCE IN THE PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA BECOME IMPORTANT?

On 1 October 2009, the People's Republic of China (hereinafter PRC) held the sixtieth anniversary celebration of its founding in 1949. For the Chinese people, sixty years traditionally constitute a cycle. The PRC government organized a grand and lavish event, celebrating its many significant achievements. In his National Day Speech, PRC President Hu Jintao, wearing a Sun Yatsen suit, as Chairman Mao Zedong did on the founding day of the PRC on 1 October 1949, proudly announced that, 'today a socialist China has stood straight in the East of the world, facing modernization, facing the world and facing the future'. <sup>1</sup>

Rapid economic development has attracted attention from around the world upon China's corporate governance developments. There is no doubt that China can be proud of its achievements since the commencement of the economic reform effort some thirty years ago. According to the World Bank, by 2007, China had become the third-largest economy in the world.<sup>2</sup> In the past few years, some of China's companies, mainly large state-owned companies (usually known as SOEs), have been aggressively buying foreign businesses overseas. The failed bid

<sup>1. &</sup>lt;a href="http://cpc.people.com.cn/GB/64093/64094/10152026.html">http://cpc.people.com.cn/GB/64093/64094/10152026.html</a>, 2 Oct. 2009.

 <sup>&#</sup>x27;Li Rongrong Encourages Takeover Overseas', <www.caijing.com.cn/2009-07-04/ 110193145.html>, 5 Jul. 2009.