# Understanding

Race,
Class,
Gender,
and Sexuality



A Conceptual Framework

Lynn Weber

# Understanding Race, Class, Gender, and Sexuality

# A Conceptual Framework

Lynn Weber

University of South Carolina



Boston Burr Ridge, IL Dubuque, IA Madison, WI New York San Francisco St. Louis Bangkok Bogotá Caracas Kuala Lumpur Lisbon London Madrid Mexico City Milan Montreal New Delhi Santiago Seoul Singapore Sydney Taipei Toronto

## McGraw-Hill Higher Education χ

A Division of The McGraw-Hill Companies

# UNDERSTANDING RACE, CLASS, GENDER, AND SEXUALITY A CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

Published by McGraw-Hill, an imprint of The McGraw-Hill Companies, Inc. 1221 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY, 10020. Copyright © 2001 by The McGraw-Hill Companies, Inc. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or distributed in any form or by any means, or stored in a data base or retrieval system, without the prior written consent of The McGraw-Hill Companies, Inc., including, but not limited to, in any network or other electronic storage or transmission, or broadcast for distance learning. Some ancillaries, including electronic and print components, may not be available to customers outside the United States.

This book is printed on acid-free paper.

234567890 FGR/FGR 0987654321

ISBN 0-07-243461-9

Editorial director: Phillip A. Butcher Sponsoring editor: Sally Constable Developmental editor: Katherine Blake

Project manager: Laura Griffin

Manager, new book production: Melonie Salvati

Designer: Matthew Baldwin

Supplement coordinator: Joyce J. Chappetto

Cover design: Adam Rooke

Cover illustration: Diana Ong/SuperStock Compositor: Shepherd Incorporated Typeface: 10/12 Times Roman

Printer: Quebecor World Fairfield Inc.

#### Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Weber, Lynn.

Understanding race, class, gender, and sexuality: a conceptual framework / Lynn Weber.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-07-243461-9 (alk. paper)

1. Social stratification. 2. Race discrimination. 3. Sex discrimination. I. Title.

HM821 .W44 2001

305--dc21

00-048679

www.mhhe.com

# Interactive Graphics for Data Analysis

**Principles and Examples** 

Chapman & Hall/CRC

### **Computer Science and Data Analysis Series**

The interface between the computer and statistical sciences is increasing, as each discipline seeks to harness the power and resources of the other. This series aims to foster the integration between the computer sciences and statistical, numerical, and probabilistic methods by publishing a broad range of reference works, textbooks, and handbooks.

#### **SERIES EDITORS**

David Blei, Princeton University
David Madigan, Rutgers University
Marina Meila, University of Washington
Fionn Murtagh, Royal Holloway, University of London

Proposals for the series should be sent directly to one of the series editors above, or submitted to:

#### Chapman & Hall/CRC

4th Floor, Albert House 1-4 Singer Street London EC2A 4BQ UK

#### **Published Titles**

Bayesian Artificial Intelligence Kevin B. Korb and Ann E. Nicholson

Computational Statistics Handbook with

MATLAB®, Second Edition

Wendy L. Martinez and Angel R. Martinez

Clustering for Data Mining:

A Data Recovery Approach

Boris Mirkin

Correspondence Analysis and Data

Coding with Java and R

Fionn Murtagh

Design and Modeling for Computer

Experiments

Kai-Tai Fang, Runze Li, and Agus Sudjianto

Exploratory Data Analysis with MATLAB®

Wendy L. Martinez and Angel R. Martinez

Interactive Graphics for Data Analysis:

Principles and Examples

Martin Theus and Simon Urbanek

Introduction to Machine Learning and Bioinformatics

Sushmita Mitra, Sujay Datta,

Theodore Perkins, and George Michailidis

Pattern Recognition Algorithms for

Data Mining

Sankar K. Pal and Pabitra Mitra

R Graphics

Paul Murrell

R Programming for Bioinformatics

Robert Gentleman

Semisupervised Learning for

Computational Linguistics

Steven Abney

Statistical Computing with R

Maria L. Rizzo

# About the Author

Lynn Weber has been the Director of Women's Studies and a Professor of Sociology at the University of South Carolina since 1996. She arrived at South Carolina after serving two years as Distinguished Professor in Race, Class, and Gender at the University of Delaware and having spent the previous 13 years co-founding and later directing the Center for Research on Women at the University of Memphis.

Founded in 1982 by Weber, Bonnie Thornton Dill, and Elizabeth Higginbotham, the Center for Research on Women was the first in the nation to focus on women of color and on the intersections of race, class, and gender. Over the years, Weber-in conjunction with many scholars associated with the Center-provided pioneering scholarship on race, class, and gender and served as a leader in innovative teaching and curriculum change focused on race, class, and gender. Many of today's leading race, class, and gender scholars have been deeply involved with the work of the Center, serving on the faculty, on the advisory board, as visiting scholars, and as curriculum workshop leaders and participants. These scholars include Patricia Hill Collins, Maxine Baca Zinn, Evelyn Nakano Glenn, Judith Rollins, Esther Chow, Elaine Bell Kaplan, Cheryl Gilkes, Kenneth Goings, Sharon Harley, Leith Mullings, Sandra Morgen, Kathy Ward, Denise Segura, Ruth Zambrana, Mary Romero, Bernice Barnett, Sheryl Ruzek, and many others. For the pioneering research of the center, Weber, Dill, and Higginbotham received the Jessie Bernard Award of the American Sociological Association in 1993, and for innovative pedagogical work, they received the ASA's Distinguished Contributions to Teaching Award in the same year—a dual honor never bestowed before or since.

Co-author of *The American Perception of Class*, Weber has published on the intersections of race, class, and gender—especially in the process of upward social mobility, in mental health, and in the lives of professional-managerial women. In addition, she has published articles on teaching race, class, and gender, including the lead article, "A Conceptual Framework for Understanding Race, Class, Gender, and Sexuality," in a recent special issue of *Psychology of Women Quarterly* devoted to teaching about gender and ethnicity.

Weber has consulted with many higher education institutions of all types on ways to integrate race, class, and gender into the curriculum. Her special focus has been on classroom dynamics and ways to convey difficult and potentially volatile material so that learning is enhanced.

# Preface

By the time I reached the University of Delaware for my sabbatical in the fall of 1994, I was burned out. I had been administering the Center for Research on Women at the University of Memphis for the previous 12 years, a rewarding but continuous struggle. I had been writing and running grants for which the timetables were always too short, the money too little, and the deadlines too soon.

Because I always felt unprepared, it had been a while since I had walked into a classroom feeling excited. I fell behind in reading the latest works in the growing field of race, class, gender, and sexuality, and I felt that I hadn't revised my pedagogy enough. Despite receiving consistently good teaching evaluations from my students and being the recipient of an ASA teaching award, I had begun to think of myself as a bad teacher.

But, as the Distinguished Visiting Professor in Race, Class, and Gender at the University of Delaware, I was teaching only one course, a graduate seminar in race, class, and gender. I had few other responsibilities. I read, rested, exercised, thought, and taught. I loved teaching again. I went to class feeling prepared, a luxury in today's academy, and I began to see that I hadn't been a bad teacher after all—just an exhausted one. As I became energized in my teaching, I started to address a problem that had bothered me for some time—namely, the lack of a conceptual framework for evaluating the scholarship on, and for teaching about, the nature of race, class, gender, and sexuality as systems of oppression.

Those of us who had been teaching about the intersections of race, class, gender, and sexuality had relied on anthologies<sup>2</sup> or course packets of articles and books to demonstrate how these systems of social inequality operate simultaneously and are inextricably intertwined, and thus must be examined together. Yet, while the anthologies very clearly illustrate how truly interconnected these systems are—especially in our individual lives—they fail to provide us with a frame-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>For a history of the Center for Research on Women, see Weber, Higginbotham, and Dill (1998). <sup>2</sup>For a list of some of these anthologies, see Weber and Dillaway (2001), *Understanding Race, Class, Gender, and Sexuality: Case Studies*. New York: McGraw-Hill.

work for conducting such analyses ourselves or for assessing the studies we read for their effectiveness and quality in revealing the intersecting dynamics and fundamental character of race, class, gender, and sexuality.

Even as I began this project, I had doubts that it should be done. The study of race, class, gender, and sexuality arose primarily from women of color, from working-class and lesbian scholars who critiqued feminist scholarship for its unstated and unproblematized White, middle-class, Eurocentric, and heterosexual bent. In their critiques, these scholars contended that, to be inclusive, feminist scholarship should be historically and geographically/globally situated—in time and place—and clear about the social locations or standpoints of the groups studied and the scholars themselves. Furthermore, the critiques implied that claiming to have uncovered universal or at least pervasive truths about women and gender from analyses that were based only on dominant-culture women's lives was as problematic as the universal claims of male-centered scholarship that White feminists had so vehemently and correctly contradicted.<sup>3</sup> So, I had to ask myself if it would be possible to construct a conceptual framework for understanding race, class, gender, and sexuality that would not be abstract and ahistorical and a replication of the very model it would be designed to replace.

As it turned out, I didn't have to ponder these possibilities for too long, for I was thrust into this book project by a request that made the need for such a framework even more clear to me. I was asked to be one of six scholars of race, class, gender, and sexuality to write a response to an article entitled "Doing Difference," by Candace West and Sarah Fenstermaker (1995), which *Gender & Society* was planning to publish in a forthcoming issue of the journal (see Collins et al. 1995). Earlier, West and Don Zimmerman (1987) had written an influential piece entitled "Doing Gender" that made a case for the social construction of gender but was subsequently criticized for omission of race and class. "Doing Difference" was written in response to the criticism. At the time, I thought writing my response to "Doing Difference" would give me a chance to clarify the common themes I had started to identify in the scholarship on race, class, gender, and sexuality. I even hoped that West and Fenstermaker would give us the framework that I was looking for.

However, as I read that piece, I became angry. Surprised at my own reaction, I began frantically writing about all the problems I had with the article. Most significantly, I felt their argument—that gender, race, and class are, foremost, patterns of behavior created in small-group, face-to-face interactions—minimized the ways that the macro-institutional, political, economic, and ideological power arrangements shape every interaction among individuals in our society. To fail to make the connection between these face-to-face interactions and the historically embedded political, economic, and ideological structures shaping the nation was to miss the point.

I wrote and wrote and quickly realized that my response had gone way beyond the couple of pages I would be allotted. More importantly, I came to see that

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>For an example of these debates in which I participated, see Baca Zinn et al. (1986).

my reaction was so intense because West's and Fenstermaker's argument had run counter to several of the characteristic themes and common assumptions that ran through the scholarship on race, class, gender, and sexuality. At that point, I realized that I wanted and needed to write a book.

The book that I have written is in many ways a collaborative effort, which includes the feedback and understandings about curriculum transformation that I gained from faculty from across the nation in workshops beginning in the early 1980s at the Center for Research on Women. It reflects the perspective I developed from years of working with Bonnie Thornton Dill and Elizabeth Higginbotham. More directly, in the early stages of work on the book, I benefited from brainstorming sessions and the critical pedagogical, empirical, and theoretical insights of two good colleagues—Higginbotham and Tina Hancock. They were especially helpful in thinking about the use of case studies in the book. Over the next few years, as I continued to work on the conceptual framework, I was invited to publish it as the lead article in a special issue of *Psychology of Women Quarterly* devoted to teaching about gender and ethnicity. The feedback I received from Janet Hyde, Margaret Madden, and the anonymous reviewers greatly improved the manuscript.

But this book was primarily developed in the classroom. From 1994, when I began this project, until the spring of 2000, I incorporated the framework and the latest iteration of the text into my classes. My students, graduate and undergraduate, at the University of Delaware and the University of South Carolina, gave me honest and valuable feedback. They were my best critics. They took my seminar on race, class, gender, and sexuality, my seminar in women's studies, and my sociology of gender courses. They came from a wide array of disciplinary backgrounds. They pushed me to strive for greater clarity and to make my analysis better—to make it consistent with the ideals I claimed to be working towards and to make it useful for the purposes of social justice. Because there were no similar books to serve as models, I tried a number of different formats. My students helped me decide what worked and what didn't, and they always encouraged me to pursue the project even when I wasn't sure I would ever finish it or if it would ever be published. As they read it now in its final form, I'm sure they will see that I couldn't make it go all of the places or address all of the issues they had recommended. These are the limits of my vision. But I hope they recognize that the final product is so much a reflection of their prodding, insights, and input. I cannot name all of the students here, but I deeply appreciate their help.

Throughout the process of writing this book, I was aided by a group of incredibly hardworking and insightful graduate student research assistants. The historical time line in Chapter 2 was a major research project, begun by Enashea Kohler and finished (a task that included rechecking every reference) by Rebecca Shrum and Kerry McLoughlin. Shannon Hunnicutt worked for the last three years researching almost every topic covered. Shannon's, Rebecca's, and Kerry's persistent, steady, and meticulous work kept me on track, and their insights often helped me to reshape an argument. Heather Dillaway's co-authorship of the case studies book that accompanies this text reflects the collaboration involved in that project, but I also benefited greatly from her feedback on the text itself. I am also indebted to Rosa

Thorn, program coordinator, and Jackie McClary, administrative assistant, of the Women's Studies Program at the University of South Carolina. They have supported my work and the project in numerous ways, not the least of which was making sure I had the time and resources to get the job done.

Several colleagues read the manuscript and gave detailed and enormously helpful critiques—Judith Barker, Kathleen Blee, Craig Kridel, Mary Margaret Fonow, Joan Spade, Susan Spivey, Kathy Ward, and Bruce Williams. Bonnie Thornton Dill not only read the manuscript, but also used a draft in her women's studies seminar on power and conflict at the University of Maryland. I thank both Bonnie and her students for their critical vision and many good suggestions for improving the manuscript. My editors at McGraw-Hill, Sally Constable and Kathy Blake, and the project manager, Laura Griffin, were a pleasure to work with. Even when we ran into snags, they were always professional, supportive, and maintained a much appreciated sense of humor. I am also grateful to my friends Chris, Russ, Annie, and Kate Bohner, who have engaged in numerous discussions of the issues and themes contained in the book and who have always given me thoughtful and honest feedback.

Finally, in writing this book, I often had to confront my own doubts. How can any one person claim to write clearly and succinctly about such a massive and complex topic and to do it well? Even with all the encouragement I received from students, colleagues, and friends, this project would not have been completed without the unflagging confidence and support of Jean Astolfi Bohner, to whom I dedicate this book. She consistently encouraged me when I just didn't think I could possibly finish. She talked to me about every issue in the book, and she used her amazing editing skills to fine-tune the manuscript. Most importantly, she lives her life as a model for relating across differences, and in so doing helps me to see new ways of achieving justice.

Lynn Weber University of South Carolina

# **Brief Contents**

ABOUT THE	OUT THE AUTHOR	
PREFACE	xiii	

#### Introduction

#### Section One LAYING THE FOUNDATION

1. Defining Contested Concepts

17

2. A Historical Time Line of **Indicators of Oppression** 

31

1

#### Section Two A CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK: FIVE THEMES

3. The Story of Margaret Welch: A Case Study

61

73

Themes: Historically and Geographically/Globally Contextual, Socially Constructed Power Relations

5. Themes: Macro Social Structural and Micro Social Psychological Levels, Simultaneously Expressed

93

#### Section Three A RACE, CLASS, GENDER, AND SEXUALITY ANALYSIS OF EDUCATION

6.	Theo Wilson and Lynn Johnson: A Case Study	113	9. Themes: Power Relationship Macro Social Structural and Micro Social Psychological Levels, Simultaneously Expressed	Î
7.	Education and the American Dream	122		152
8.	Themes: Historically and		10. Envisioning Social Justice	175
1	Geographically/Globally Contextual, Socially Constructed	132	APPENDIX: HISTORICAL TIME LINE REFERENCES 183 REFERENCES 190 PERMISSION ACKNOWLEDGMENTS 204	

INDEX 206

# **Contents**

ABOUT THE AUTHOR xi PREFACE xiii

Introduction	1
STYLE, FORM, AND STRUCTURE OF THE BOOK	7
Style—Simple but not Simplistic Form	7 7
Organization	8
Education as an Example	9
What's in It for You? The Personal Benefits of Developing	
A RACE, CLASS, GENDER, AND SEXUALITY ANALYSIS	10
Recognizing Limiting Views of Others	10
Recognizing the Oppressor within—Internalized Oppression	11
Recognizing the Cost of Dominance	11
Gaining a Realistic Assessment of Our Environment	12
Achieving Good Mental Health	13
When Society Improves, We All Gain	13

# Section One LAYING THE FOUNDATION

1.	Defining Contested Concepts	17
	RACE, CLASS, GENDER, AND SEXUALITY AS COMPLEX SOCIAL SYSTEMS	17
	PROCESSES THAT OBSCURE RACE, CLASS, GENDER, AND SEXUALITY	18

	DOMAINS AND STRUCTURES OF OPPRESSION	33
	Social Institutions Social Relations of Control	26 28
2.	A Historical Time Line of Indicators of Oppression	31
	Limits of the Time Line War of Maneuvers War of Position	31 32 32
	HIGHLIGHTS OF THE TIME LINE	34
	HISTORICAL TIME LINE OF RACE, CLASS, GENDER, AND SEXUALITY CONTESTS IN THE UNITED STATES	35
	Education Polity Work/Economy Marriage/Reproduction	35 40 48 53
	Section Two A CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK: Five Themes	
3.	The Story of Margaret Welch: A Case Study	61
	An Interview by Studs Terkel	61
	Interpreting Margaret's Story	64
	PARTIAL TRUTHS: RACE, CLASS, GENDER, AND SEXUALITY AS SEPARATE SYSTEMS	67
	Race Class Gender Sexuality	67 68 69 69
	FIVE THEMES: AN OVERVIEW OF THE CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK	70
4.	Themes: Historically and Geographically/Globally Contextual, Socially Constructed Power Relations	73
	HISTORICALLY AND GEOGRAPHICALLY GLOBALLY CONTEXTUAL	73
	Race Class Gender Sexuality	74 76 77 78

	SOCIALLY CONSTRUCTED	80
	Race Gender Sexuality Social Class	81 82 84 85
	POWER RELATIONSHIPS	87
5.	Themes: Macro Social Structural and Micro Social Psychological Levels, Simultaneously Expressed	93
	Macro-Micro Processes in the Ideological Domain	95
	Macro Processes Micro Processes	9: 9
	Macro-Micro Processes in the Political Domain	98
	Macro Processes Micro Processes	98 99
	Macro-Micro Processes in the Economic Domain	100
	Macro Processes Micro Processes	100 103
	SIMULTANEOUSLY EXPRESSED	104
	QUESTIONS TO ASK WHEN ANALYZING RACE, CLASS, GENDER AND SEXUALITY	100
	Historically and Geographically/Globally Contextual Socially Constructed Power Relationships Macro and Micro Levels Simultaneously Expressed Implications for Social Action and Social Justice	100 107 108 109 109
	Section Three A RACE, CLASS, GENDER, AND SEXUALITY ANALYSIS OF EDUCATION	
6.	Theo Wilson and Lynn Johnson: Case Studies	113

THE CASE OF THEO WILSON

THE CASE OF LYNN JOHNSON

CONTENTS VII

113

116

	Partial Truths: Race, Class, Gender, and Sexuality	
	AS SEPARATE SYSTEMS	118
	Race	118
	Class	119
	Gender	119
	Sexuality	119
	RACE, CLASS, GENDER, AND SEXUALITY AS INTERRELATED SYSTEMS:	
	QUESTIONS TO ASK	120
7.	Education and the American Dream	122
	Dreams and Oppression	122
	PREMISES OF THE AMERICAN DREAM	123
	PARADOXES OF THE AMERICAN DREAM	124
	EDUCATION: THE CORNERSTONE OF THE AMERICAN DREAM	127
	Individuals, Education, and the Dream	128
	Groups, Education, and the Dream	128
8.	Themes: Historically and Geographically/Globally	
	Contextual, Socially Constructed	132
	HISTORICAL CONSTRUCTION OF RACE, CLASS, GENDER, AND SEXUALITY	
	IN EDUCATION	134
	The Educational Model	135
	Testing	136
	Educating "Others"	137
	Higher Education and Credentials	140
	CONTEMPORARY SOCIAL CONSTRUCTIONS OF RACE, CLASS, GENDER,	
	AND SEXUALITY IN EDUCATION	140
	School Segregation	141
	Class Segregation	142
	Race Segregation	144
	Gender Segregation Sexuality Segregation	145
	Segregation within Schools: Tracking	146 147
	Different School Continuation and Dropout Rates	150
	Different School Communion and Dropout Rules	150
9.	Themes: Power Relationships, Macro Social Structural and M	icro
	Social Psychological Levels, Simultaneously Expressed	152
	MACRO SOCIAL STRUCTURAL POWER RELATIONS	152
	Political Power and Education	153

		CONTENTS 1
	Economic Power and Education Ideological Power and Education	150 153
	MICRO SOCIAL PSYCHOLOGICAL POWER RELATIONS	160
	Preschool First, Second, and Third Grades Fourth, Fifth, and Sixth Grades Junior High School and High School	16 162 160
	SIMULTANEOUSLY EXPRESSED	168
	IMPLICATIONS FOR ACTIVISM AND SOCIAL JUSTICE	169
	Recommendations for Educational Reform	172
10.	Envisioning Social Justice	17:
	Vison	177
	Understanding/Knowledge	178
	Action	182
REF	ENDIX: HISTORICAL TIME LÎNE REFERENCES 183 ERENCES 190 MISSION A CINNOW ED GMENTS 204	

**INDEX** 

206