

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL

RELIGION AND LAW IN GERMANY

GERHARD ROBBERS



Wolters Kluwer
Law & Business

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL

Religion and Law in Germany

Gerhard Robbers

This book was originally published as a monograph in the International
Encyclopaedia of Laws/Religion.

General Editor: Roger Blanpain
Associate General Editor: Michele Colucci
Volume Editor: Rik Torfs



Wolters Kluwer

Law & Business

AUSTIN BOSTON CHICAGO NEW YORK THE NETHERLANDS

Published by:

Kluwer Law International
PO Box 316
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn
The Netherlands
Website: www.kluwerlaw.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:

Aspen Publishers, Inc.
7201 McKinney Circle
Frederick, MD 21704
United States of America
Email: customer.service@aspenpublishers.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by:

Turpin Distribution Services Ltd.
Stratton Business Park
Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade
Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ
United Kingdom
Email: kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com

DISCLAIMER: The material in this volume is in the nature of general comment only. It is not offered as advice on any particular matter and should not be taken as such. The editor and the contributing authors expressly disclaim all liability to any person with regard to anything done or omitted to be done, and with respect to the consequences of anything done or omitted to be done wholly or partly in reliance upon the whole or any part of the contents of this volume. No reader should act or refrain from acting on the basis of any matter contained in this volume without first obtaining professional advice regarding the particular facts and circumstances at issue. Any and all opinions expressed herein are those of the particular author and are not necessarily those of the editor or publisher of this volume.

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 978-90-411-3352-6

© 2010 Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA. Email: permissions@kluwerlaw.com

Printed and bound in Great Britain by
CPI Antony Rowe, Chippenham and Eastbourne

Religion and Law in Germany

Table of Contents

| | |
|------------------------------------------------|----|
| The Author | 3 |
| List of Abbreviations | 15 |
| Preface | 21 |
| General Introduction | 23 |
| §1. GENERAL BACKGROUND OF THE COUNTRY | 23 |
| I. Basic Structures | 23 |
| II. General Legal System | 24 |
| §2. SOCIAL FACTS ABOUT RELIGION | 26 |
| I. Religious Affiliation | 26 |
| II. Religious Practice | 36 |
| §3. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND | 37 |
| I. Impact of History | 37 |
| II. The Middle Ages | 37 |
| III. The Reformation and Its Effects | 38 |
| IV. The Nineteenth Century | 41 |
| V. The Twentieth Century until Today | 43 |
| Selected Bibliography | 47 |
| Part I. Legal Framework and Sources | 75 |
| Chapter 1. Constitutional Position of Religion | 75 |
| §1. BASIC LAW | 75 |
| I. The Preamble | 75 |
| II. Freedom of Religion or Belief | 76 |
| III. Institutional Guarantees | 76 |
| IV. Religious Instruction in Public Schools | 78 |
| V. Equal Treatment | 78 |
| VI. Oath of Office | 79 |

Table of Contents

§2. CONSTITUTIONAL PROVISIONS OF THE *LÄNDER* 79

 I. Religion in the Preambles 79

 II. Individual Freedom of Religion or Belief 80

 III. Institutional Guarantees 80

 IV. Education 82

 V. Treaty Law and Various Issues 83

Chapter 2. Other Legislation with Regard to Religion 84

§1. RANGE OF LEGISLATION 84

§2. TREATY LAW 84

§3. BASIC STRUCTURES OF LEGISLATION 85

Chapter 3. Typology of the System 86

§1. SEPARATION AND COOPERATION 86

§2. NEUTRALITY 86

§3. TOLERANCE 87

§4. PARITY 88

§5. PLURALISM 88

§6. INSTITUTIONALISM 88

§7. OPENNESS TOWARDS RELIGION 88

§8. FREEDOM OF RELIGION OR BELIEF 89

Part II. Religious Freedom in General 91

Chapter 1. Individual Religious Freedom 91

§1. NORMATIVE STRUCTURES 91

§2. FUNCTIONS 92

§3. SCOPE OF INDIVIDUAL GUARANTEE 94

 I. Nationality 94

 II. Religious Maturity 94

 A. Role of Parents and Legal Guardians 94

 B. Federal Act on the Religious Upbringing of Children 94

 C. Bavaria and the Saarland 95

 D. Practical Implications of Religious Maturity 96

Table of Contents

| | |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| §4. FORUM INTERNUM AND MANIFESTATIONS OF RELIGION OR BELIEF | 97 |
| §5. THE RIGHT NOT TO BELIEVE | 97 |
| §6. DEFINITIONS OF RELIGION AND BELIEF | 98 |
| §7. PROTECTED MANIFESTATIONS | 99 |
| I. General Scope of Guarantee | 99 |
| II. Specific Issues | 100 |
| A. Proselytism | 100 |
| B. Conscientious Objection | 101 |
| 1. Dress Requirements | 101 |
| 2. Co-educative Physical Education | 101 |
| 3. Work on Religious Holidays | 102 |
| 4. Conscientious Objection to Medical Treatment | 102 |
| 5. Conscientious Objection To Take an Oath | 103 |
| 6. Conscientious Objection and Military Service | 103 |
| 7. Conscientious Objection in the Judiciary | 105 |
| C. Parental Care | 105 |
| D. Ritual Slaughter and Other Religious Food Requirements | 105 |
| 1. Ritual Slaughter | 105 |
| 2. Religious Food Requirements in Public Institutions | 107 |
| §8. HORIZONTAL APPLICATION | 107 |
| §9. LIMITATIONS TO FREEDOM OF RELIGION OR BELIEF | 107 |
| I. General Principles of Limitation | 107 |
| A. Special Importance of Freedom of Religion or Belief | 107 |
| B. The Variety of Limitations | 108 |
| C. System of Limitation Clauses | 108 |
| II. Specific Limitations to Freedom of Religion or Belief | 110 |
| 1. Scope of limitations | 110 |
| 2. A Minority View: Article 136 Section 1 WRV in Conjunction with Article 140 GG | 110 |
| 3. Structural Limitations | 111 |
| 4. State of Defence or Emergency: No Valid Reason for Limitation | 111 |
| III. Limitations of Limitations | 111 |
| §10. EXAMPLES OF CASE LAW ON LIMITATIONS TO FREEDOM OF RELIGION OR BELIEF | 113 |
| I. Criteria of Selection | 113 |
| II. Cases | 113 |
| 1. The Tobacco Case | 113 |
| 2. Conscientious Objection, Alternative Service, and Total Objection | 114 |
| 3. Governmental Warnings against Religious Communities | 115 |

Table of Contents

| | |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 4. The Headscarf Issue | 115 |
| 5. Church Bells and Muezzin-Call | 120 |
| Chapter 2. Collective Religious Freedom | 121 |
| §1. BASIC PRINCIPLES | 121 |
| Chapter 3. Organizational Religious Freedom | 122 |
| §1. BASIC PRINCIPLES | 122 |
| I. Corporative Freedom | 122 |
| II. Freedom to Form Religious Communities | 122 |
| III. Fundamental Rights of Legal Persons | 122 |
| A. Scope of Legal Persons | 122 |
| B. Domestic Legal Persons | 123 |
| C. Religious Communities as Corporations under Public Law | 123 |
| D. Nature of Rights | 124 |
| E. Notion of Religious Community | 124 |
| §2. CASE LAW | 125 |
| Chapter 4. Religious Freedom and Equality | 127 |
| §1. CONSTITUTIONAL GUARANTEES | 127 |
| §2. GENERAL NON-DISCRIMINATION | 127 |
| §3. NON-DISCRIMINATION IN PUBLIC OFFICE | 128 |
| §4. INSTITUTIONAL EQUALITY | 128 |
| §5. EQUAL TREATMENT OF NON-RELIGIOUS, PHILOSOPHICAL COMMUNITIES | 129 |
| Part III. Legal Status of Religious Communities | 131 |
| Chapter 1. Formal Status of Religious Communities | 131 |
| §1. RELIGIOUS COMMUNITIES AS PRIVATE LAW CORPORATIONS | 131 |
| I. Basic Principles | 131 |
| II. Non-Profit Associations | 132 |
| A. Idealistic Aim | 132 |
| B. Registration Requirements | 132 |
| C. Special Treatment of Religious Communities: The Bahá'í Case | 133 |
| D. Termination of Non-Profit Associations | 133 |
| §2. RELIGIOUS COMMUNITIES AS PUBLIC LAW CORPORATIONS | 135 |
| I. General Principles | 135 |

Table of Contents

| | |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------|
| II. Special Rights and Duties of Religious Communities as Public Law Corporations | 137 |
| III. Range of Religious Communities with Public Law Status | 148 |
| IV. Termination of Status of Public Law Corporations | 154 |
| V. Specific Issues of Organization | 155 |
| Chapter 2. Autonomy of Religious Communities | 157 |
| §1. GENERAL PRINCIPLES | 157 |
| §2. LIMITATIONS OF THE RIGHT TO SELF-DETERMINATION | 158 |
| §3. RELIGIOUS COMMUNITIES AND STATE COURT SYSTEM | 161 |
| Chapter 3. Fundamental Rights and Religious Communities | 166 |
| Chapter 4. Contractual Religious Freedom | 169 |
| §1. BASIC PRINCIPLES AND TERMINOLOGY | 169 |
| §2. HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT | 170 |
| §3. RIGHT AND DUTY TO CONCLUDE TREATIES | 170 |
| §4. NATURE OF TREATIES | 172 |
| §5. TREATIES AND GENERAL STATE LAW | 172 |
| §6. THE POWER TO CONCLUDE TREATIES | 173 |
| §7. INTERPRETATION OF TREATY LAW | 174 |
| §8. TERMINATION OF TREATIES | 175 |
| §9. LEGAL ENFORCEMENT | 176 |
| §10. THE <i>REICHSKONKORDAT</i> | 176 |
| §11. OTHER CONCORDATS | 184 |
| §12. PROTESTANT TREATY WITH LOWER SAXONY AND FURTHER TREATIES | 186 |
| §13. TREATIES WITH NON-RELIGIOUS, PHILOSOPHICAL COMMUNITIES | 188 |
| §14. TREATIES WITH THE JEWISH COMMUNITIES | 189 |
| §15. TREATIES WITH MUSLIM ASSOCIATIONS | 194 |

Table of Contents

Part IV. International, Transnational, Regional Effects on Religious Communities 195

Chapter 1. International Law Effects on Religious Communities 195

§1. PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW 195

 I. Basic Principles 195

 II. The European Convention on Human Rights 196

 A. General Relevance 196

 B. Case Law 197

 C. The Right to Self-Determination and the European Court of Human Rights 198

 III. Other International Instruments 202

§2. EUROPEAN UNION LAW 202

 I. Basic Principles 202

 II. Freedom of Religion or Belief in Primary European Union Law 203

 III. The Lisbon Treaty 205

 IV. Religion in Secondary European Union Law 207

 A. Provisions 207

 B. European Union Law and the German General Anti-Discrimination Act 208

 V. The European Court of Justice 209

Chapter 2. Transnational Law Effects on Religious Communities 210

Chapter 3. Regional Law Effects on Religious Communities 211

Part V. Religion and Politics 213

Chapter 1. Religious Influence in Politics 214

§1. CONSTITUTIONAL LAW FOUNDATIONS 214

§2. RELIGIONS IN POLITICS BASED ON TREATY LAW 215

§3. MEDIA AND RELIGIONS 216

§4. RELIGIONS AND STATE POLITICAL INSTITUTIONS 217

§5. RELIGIONS AND POLITICAL PARTIES 217

§6. POLITICAL REPRESENTATION OF RELIGIONS 219

Table of Contents

| | |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| §7. POLITICAL IMPACT OF RELIGIOUS COMMUNITIES | 220 |
| §8. RELIGIOUS COMMUNITIES AND ELECTION CAMPAIGNS | 221 |
| Chapter 2. Political Influence in Religions | 223 |
| Chapter 3. Interaction between Religions and State on a Political and Legal Level | 225 |
| Part VI. Labour Law within Religious Communities | 227 |
| Chapter 1. Scope of Application of Labour Law | 227 |
| §1. FACTUAL SITUATION | 227 |
| §2. INDIVIDUAL LABOUR LAW | 228 |
| I. General Principles | 228 |
| II. Secular Labour Law and its Application on Religious Communities | 230 |
| III. Individual Churches | 233 |
| A. The Evangelical Church | 233 |
| B. The Catholic Church | 236 |
| §3. COLLECTIVE LABOUR LAW | 237 |
| §4. THE SOCIAL SECURITY SYSTEM | 240 |
| I. General Principles | 240 |
| II. Employment Promotion | 240 |
| III. Health Insurance | 241 |
| IV. Pensions Insurance | 242 |
| V. Accident Insurance | 243 |
| Chapter 2. Religious Ministers and Labour Law | 244 |
| Chapter 3. Other Church Employees and Labour Law | 245 |
| Part VII. Religious Communities and Protections of the Individual | 247 |
| Chapter 1. Protection of Privacy | 248 |
| §1. GENERAL PRINCIPLES | 248 |
| §2. DATA PROTECTION | 248 |
| Chapter 2. Freedom to Marry | 249 |
| Chapter 3. Freedom of Expression | 250 |

Table of Contents

Chapter 4. Due Process Norms and Religious Groups 251

Chapter 5. Professional Secrecy 252

Chapter 6. Medical Deontology 253

Chapter 7. Non-Discrimination 255

Chapter 8. Penal Law and Religion 256

§1. RELIGIOUS PEACE 256

§2. RELIGIOUS PROPERTY 257

§3. RELIGIOUS TITLES, GARMENT, AND EMBLEMS 258

§4. CONFESSIONAL SECRET 259

§5. POSITION OF RELIGIOUS COMMUNITIES 260

§6. SPECIAL DUTIES OF RELIGIOUS OFFICE HOLDERS 260

§7. ADMINISTRATIVE MISDEMEANOURS 261

§8. CRIMES AGAINST INTERNATIONAL LAW 261

Part VIII. Church Financing 265

Chapter 1. Direct Financing of Religious Communities 265

§1. PROTECTION OF PROPERTY 265

§2. STATE SUBSIDIES IN GENERAL 265

§3. CHURCH TAX 266

 I. Basic Facts 266

 II. Taxable Persons 266

 III. Objection to Church Tax 266

 IV. Tax Rate 267

 V. Administration of the Church Tax 267

 VI. Example: North Rhine-Westphalia 267

 VII. Religious Communities that Levy Church Tax 270

 VIII. Church Due 271

 IX. Case Law 271

§4. STATE SUBSIDIES 273

Table of Contents

| | |
|--------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| §5. EXAMPLES OF FACTS AND FIGURES | 274 |
| I. The Evangelical Church in Germany | 274 |
| II. The Evangelical Land Church in Baden | 276 |
| III. Archdiocese of Freiburg | 278 |
| IV. The Jewish Faith Communities | 279 |
| Chapter 2. Indirect Financing of Religious Communities | 280 |
| Part IX. Education | 281 |
| Chapter 1. Religious Education in Public and Private Schools | 281 |
| §1. RELIGIOUS EDUCATION IN PUBLIC SCHOOLS | 281 |
| I. General Principles of Public Education | 281 |
| II. Religious Instruction in Public Schools | 285 |
| §2. RELIGIOUS INSTRUCTION IN PRIVATE SCHOOLS | 295 |
| Chapter 2. Religious Schools | 296 |
| Chapter 3. Theological Faculties and Religious Universities | 298 |
| Part X. Matrimonial and Family Law | 305 |
| Chapter 1. Legal Position of Religious Marriage | 305 |
| Chapter 2. Legal Position of Religious Family Law | 306 |
| Part XI. Religion and Culture | 307 |
| Chapter 1. Religion and Art | 307 |
| §1. RELIGIOUS MONUMENTS | 307 |
| §2. RELIGION IN THE ARTS | 308 |
| Chapter 2. Religion and Media | 310 |
| Chapter 3. Religion and Civil Society | 314 |
| Chapter 4. Religion and Public Debate | 315 |
| Part XII. Religious Assistance in Public Institutions | 317 |
| Chapter 1. General Principles | 317 |

Table of Contents

| | |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| Chapter 2. Institutions | 318 |
| §1. CURE OF SOULS IN HOSPITALS | 318 |
| §2. CURE OF SOULS IN THE POLICE FORCES | 318 |
| §3. CURE OF SOULS IN PRISONS | 318 |
| §4. MILITARY CHAPLAINCY | 319 |
| §5. SPECIAL QUESTIONS | 321 |
| Part XIII. Religions in the Social Field | 323 |
| Chapter 1. Basic Principles and Activities | 323 |
| Chapter 2. Kindergartens | 328 |
| Part XIV. Sunday and Religious Holiday Protection | 331 |
| Chapter 1. General Protection of Sundays and Religious Holidays | 331 |
| Chapter 2. Sundays, Religious Holidays and Shop Closing | 335 |
| Part XV. The Burial System | 337 |
| Part XVI. Data Law | 339 |
| Chapter 1. Registration of Residents | 339 |
| Chapter 2. Census and Religious Affiliation | 342 |
| Part XVII. The Law on Aliens | 343 |
| Part XVIII. The Law on Foundations | 345 |
| Table of Statutes | 347 |
| Table of Cases | 369 |
| Index | 377 |

Germany

by
Gerhard Robbers
University of Trier
Germany

The Author



Gerhard Robbers is a professor of public law at the University of Trier, Germany. He is the director of the Institute for European Constitutional Law and director of the Institute for Legal Policy at the University of Trier. Prof. Robbers also serves as a judge at the Constitutional Court of Rhineland-Palatinate.

Born in Bonn, Germany, in 1950, he received his doctoral degree in law in 1978 and his final law degree in 1980 in Freiburg. In 1986, he obtained his habilitation in law. From 1988 to 1989 he was professor of law at the University of Heidelberg.

In 2003–2004 Prof. Robbers was president of the European Consortium for Church and State Research, of which he is a member. He is also member of the Advisory Council for Freedom of

Religion or Belief at ODIHR/OSCE. Prof. Robbers has taught as a guest professor in many universities in the world.

A selection of the author's publications includes: *Encyclopedia of World Constitutions* (ed.), 3 volumes, New York: Facts on File 2006; *State and Church in the European Union* (ed.), 2nd edition 2005 (also in German, French, Greek, Polish, and Russian), 1st edition 1997 (also in German, French, Italian, Spanish, Hungarian, and Czech); *An Introduction to German Law*, 4th edition 2006 (also in German: 4th edition 2006). Further publications cover public law, civil ecclesiastical law, legal philosophy, constitutional history and European Union law.