



# LANGUAGE POLICY AND POLITICAL ECONOMY

English in a Global Context

Edited by Thomas Ricento





Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford. It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship, and education by publishing worldwide.

Oxford New York Auckland Cape Town Dar es Salaam Hong Kong Karachi Kuala Lumpur Madrid Melbourne Mexico City Nairobi New Delhi Shanghai Taipei Toronto

With offices in Argentina Austria Brazil Chile Czech Republic France Greece Guatemala Hungary Italy Japan Poland Portugal Singapore South Korea Switzerland Thailand Turkey Ukraine Vietnam

Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press in the UK and certain other countries.

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press 198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016

#### © Oxford University Press 2015

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted by law, by license, or under terms agreed with the appropriate reproduction rights organization. Inquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the address above.

You must not circulate this work in any other form and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer.

CIP data is on file at the Library of Congress ISBN-13: 978-0-19-936339-1

## LANGUAGE POLICY AND POLITICAL ECONOMY

Per i miei genitori, Domenico e Flora

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Any authority that I might claim on the subjects dealt within this book is derived in large measure from my life experiences as a language learner and teacher in varied contexts. My first professional experience as a teacher of English as a second language (ESL) occurred at the Cardinal Cushing Center for the Spanish-Speaking in South Boston, Massachusetts, where I taught ESL in the early 1970s. It was there that I witnessed firsthand the dedication and commitment of a Cuban-born teacher who insisted that students lacking literacy in their first language (Spanish) should acquire Spanish literacy to aid their learning of English, a seemingly radical idea at the time. Decades later, this commonsense approach, validated many times over in empirical research, is still questioned and often resisted in countries around the world; yet, the intuitions and unwavering commitment of that teacher to help her students succeed influenced my thinking about the difference that one teacher can make in the lives of her students. I remember with fondness a group of talented and dedicated high school English teachers in Japan who I came to know in my role as professor and "teacher trainer" from 1989 to 1991; their love of and expertise in English and their dedication to teaching were awe inspiring, despite the fact that their primary and expected role was to prepare their students for a high-stakes university English exam mandated and developed by the Ministry of Education, and not to instill a love for Hemingway, Steinbeck, or Fitzgerald, authors they cherished and desperately wished to share with their students. More recently, I remember conversations with professors and graduate students in Santiago, Chile, in November 2012, who commented that in order to advance professionally they had to publish research in international English-language academic journals, even though the circulation of such journals was limited in Chile and they were more comfortable writing in Spanish. The contributions to knowledge that they, along with tens of thousands of Spanish-speaking colleagues around the world, could have made was lost, and we are all, in the end, diminished by that loss. Finally, my recent collaboration with refugees in Calgary has shown me the

#### x · Acknowledgments

amazing resilience of human beings whose lives have been turned upside down but who remain determined to overcome linguistic, cultural, and social obstacles that most of us would find unbearable and insurmountable. These are but a few examples from my personal experiences as an English teacher, collaborator, professor, researcher, and "expert" scholar in contexts where I have seen firsthand how language policies have directly affected the lives of individual human beings. It is experiences like these that, in the end, have motivated my interest to understand why beliefs about language—what it is, how it is acquired, how it is valued (or not) in particular contexts—develop and persist, despite empirical and experiential evidence that beliefs often inform practices and policies that can undermine the goals of democratic inclusion and social equity across diverse ethnolinguistic groups.

I would be remiss if I failed to acknowledge at least some of the many scholars who have greatly influenced my thinking on language, language policy, and political economy, topics that I have been thinking and writing about, in one way or another, for the past two decades. Certainly the work of Robert Phillipson and Tove Skutnabb-Kangas has been seminal and influential in a number of ways; it certainly started many critical conversations about global English and language policies that continue to this day. David Harvey's explanation of Marx's critique of capital, and his lucid explanations on the rise and influence of neoliberal economic and political policy over the past forty-five years, should be required reading for anyone doing research in the social sciences and humanities. Immanuel Wallerstein's many contributions to our understanding of world systems—what they are and how they operate—are highly significant and foundational to a critique of social science theorizing and research that too often separates the political, the social, the historical, and the cultural as isolated areas of inquiry. Jan Blommaert, sociolinguist par excellence, shows us how the movement of people across time and space results in dislocations and conflicts that cannot be adequately addressed by systems of governance and surveillance that are incapable of "translating" ontologically mismatched worlds of meaning.

I especially want to acknowledge the outstanding scholars who have made this book possible; not only do all of them command the highest levels of scholarship and intellectual acumen, but they are all deeply committed to understanding the workings of human society with the goal of effecting social change in the direction of greater inclusivity and, ultimately, human happiness and well-being. Working with such fine scholars has been an optimal experience, personally and professionally.

I want to acknowledge the generous support that I have received as Professor and Research Chair in the Werklund School of Education, the

University of Calgary, over the past seven years. I could not have asked for a more congenial circumstance in which to conduct research, organize conferences, and collaborate with talented graduate students and postdoctoral fellows.

I acknowledge the support and guidance of Hallie Stebbins, my editor at Oxford University Press, who made the process of producing this book a smooth and happy experience. I also want to thank Brian Jansen, doctoral student in English at the University of Calgary, who assisted me in editing the chapters, improving clarity of expression and attending to small details with unflagging care and precision. I would also like to thank two anonymous reviewers for their comments and helpful suggestions on how this book could be improved.

Finally, I dedicate this book to my parents, whose love of language played an important role in my life. Neither of my parents imparted Italian—their first language—to their three children, instead following an English-only policy for us at home, while speaking Italian with their parents and siblings and using both languages fluently in particular contexts for particular purposes. In retrospect, I have come to realize that their choices and calculations regarding the relative value and utility of English and Italian in the United States reflected their assessment of social expectations and social "reality." Understanding how my parents—and millions of other speakers of minority languages—experienced and acted upon their sociolinguistic environments continues to motivate my own research on the complex ways that language and power operate in society.

I have tried my best throughout my career to respond to Noam Chomsky's challenge to intellectuals that they "tell the truth about things that matter to the right audience." Whether or not I have succeeded in that regard I leave to others to decide.

#### Notes on Permissions

"Political Economy and English as a 'Global' Language" appeared in Critical Multilingualism Studies (2012), 1: 30-52, and is reprinted with the permission of the editors of the journal. "Language Education, Economic Development, and Participation in the Greater Mekong Subregion" appeared in International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism (2008), 11: 134-48, and is reprinted with the permission of Taylor & Francis. "Neoliberalism as Language Policy" appeared in Language in Society (2013), 42: 23-44 and is reprinted with the permission of Cambridge University Press. "Why English Dominates the Central Economy: An Economic Perspective on 'Elite Closure'

#### xii • Acknowledgments

and South African Language Policy" appeared in *Language Problems & Language Planning* (2002), 26: 159–77, and is reprinted with the permission of John Benjamins Publishing Company. "The Ground Floor of the World: On the Socioeconomic Consequences of Linguistic Globalization" appeared in *International Political Science Review* (2000), 21: 217–33, and is reprinted with the permission of Sage Publications.

Thomas Ricento, Calgary, Canada May 2014

#### NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

Jeff Bale is Associate Professor of Language and Literacies Education at the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, University of Toronto. His research focuses broadly on critical analysis of language policy, neoliberal education reform in Germany, and second-language teacher education. He is co-editor with Sarah Knopp of Education and Capitalism: Struggles for Learning and Liberation (Haymarket Books, 2012) and has published in Language Policy, Teachers College Record, and Annual Review of Applied Linguistics.

Paul Bruthiaux is a Language Consultant with a PhD in Linguistics from the University of Southern California. Now based in Thailand, he has held university positions in California, Texas, Hong Kong, Singapore, and Thailand. His work in language variation and language in education was published by Oxford University Press and Multilingual Matters and in TESOL Quarterly, Applied Linguistics, Language & Communication, Journal of Multicultural & Multilingual Development, Language Problems & Language Planning, Current Issues in Language Planning, International Journal of Applied Linguistics, International Journal of the Sociology of Language, International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism, and AILA Review.

**Jinhyun Cho** lectures in the Translation and Interpreting Program in the Department of Linguistics at Macquarie University, Sydney, Australia. Jinhyun's research interest is in English as a global language, language and media, and language and gender. She has published in these areas. She is currently working on a book entitled *Interpreting English Language Ideologies* in South Korea.

Peter Ives is Professor of Political Science at the University of Winnipeg, Canada. He is author of *Gramsci's Politics of Language: Engaging the Bakhtin Circle and the Frankfurt School* (University of Toronto Press, 2004); *Language and Hegemony in Gramsci* (Pluto Press, 2004) and co-editor with Rocco Lacorte of *Gramsci*, *Language and Translation* (Lexington, 2010). His articles on

the political implications of the advent of "global English" have been published in *Political Studies, Educational Philosophy and Theory,* and *Studies in Language and Capitalism* as well as various edited collections.

François Grin (PhD, economics) has worked at universities in Montréal and Seattle, and served as Deputy Director of the *European Centre for Minority Issues* in Flensburg, Germany. He is full Professor of Economics at the Faculty of Translation and Interpreting (FTI) at the University of Geneva. His work in language economics and language policy evaluation is reflected in numerous publications. He has carried out large-scale research projects for scientific agencies, national governments and international organizations. He is the Coordinator of the MIME Project ("Mobility and Inclusion in Multilingual Europe," 2014–2018) financed by the European Commission.

Ingrid Piller is Professor of Applied Linguistics at Macquarie University, Sydney, Australia, and serves as editor-in-chief of the international sociolinguistics journal *Multilingua*. Over the course of her international career she has also held appointments at universities in Germany, Switzerland, the United Arab Emirates, and the United States. Ingrid's research expertise is in intercultural communication, the sociolinguistics of language learning and multilingualism, and bilingual education. She has published, lectured, and consulted widely in these areas. A selection of her publications is available through the sociolinguistics portal *Language on the Move* at www.languageonthemove.org.

Thomas Ricento is Professor and Research Chair, English as an Additional Language, University of Calgary, Canada. His PhD is from UCLA in Applied Linguistics. He has published in the areas of language policy, language ideologies, and global English in journals such as Journal of Sociolinguistics, Discourse & Society, Critical Multilingualism Studies, International Journal of the Sociology of Language, Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development, Language Policy, and TESOL Quarterly. His books include An Introduction to Language Policy: Theory and Method (2006), Ideology, Politics and Language Policies: Focus on English (2000), and Language and Politics in the United States and Canada: Myths and Realities (1998). He was Director of English Language Programs at the Japan Center for Michigan Universities, Shiga, Japan (1989–1991) and has been a visiting professor at universities in Spain, Switzerland, Germany, Chile, Costa Rica, and Colombia. He is founding co-editor of the Journal of Language, Identity, and Education (Routledge).

Suzanne Romaine is Merton Professor of English Language in the University of Oxford and Fellow of the Finnish Academy of Science and Letters. Her research focuses on linguistic diversity, multilingualism, language death, language revitalization, language change, and contact. Her book, Vanishing Voices: The Extinction of the World's Languages (Oxford University Press), coauthored with Daniel Nettle, won the British Association for Applied Linguistics Book of the Year Prize. It situates the loss of linguistic diversity within the larger picture of near-total collapse of the worldwide ecosystem. Her most recent research examines the interface between biodiversity, linguistic diversity, and poverty.

Selma K. Sonntag is Professor of Politics at Humboldt State University in California. She is currently Chair of the Research Committee on The Politics of Language of the International Political Science Association. Her book, The Local Politics of Global English: Case Studies in Linguistic Globalization (Lexington, 2003), covered South Asia, Europe, the United States, and South Africa. She has co-edited a forthcoming volume entitled State Traditions and Language Regimes (MQUP, 2014). She has published on language ideology, language movements, linguistic legislation and federalism, and global English in the call-center industry and political theory, among other topics of language politics.

Philippe Van Parijs is Professor at the University of Louvain (Belgium), where he directs the Hoover Chair of Economic and Social Ethics, and a Senior Research Fellow at Nuffield College, Oxford. He is one of the founders of the Basic Income Earth Network and chairs its International Board. His books include Evolutionary Explanation in the Social Sciences (Totowa & London, 1981), Marxism Recycled (Cambridge, 1993), Real Freedom for All (Oxford, 1995), What's Wrong with a Free Lunch? (Boston, 2001), Just Democracy: The Rawls-Machiavelli Programme (Colchester, 2011), and Linguistic Justice for Europe and for the World (Oxford, 2011).

Glyn Williams was Research Professor at University Ramon Llull, Barcelona. He has also been affiliated with the University of San Francisco, the University of Bangor, University of Cardiff, and University College, Dublin. A sociologist, he has written fifteen books and over 100 papers on a variety of topics including language and society, regional development, ethnicity, media, and technology. He is the author of *The Knowledge Economy*, *Language* and Culture (2010).

#### Notes on Contributors

Laurence Wright is a Senior Research Fellow at North-West University, South Africa. He was formerly H. A. Molteno Professor of English and Director of the Institute for the Study of English in Africa at Rhodes University. He writes on South African language policy, language education for teachers, the public role of the humanities, and the history of Shakespeare in South Africa. Elected to the South African Academy of Science, he is also Honorary Life President of the Shakespeare Society of Southern Africa and Vice President of the English Academy of Southern Africa.

## CONTENTS

| Acknowledgments   | ix  |
|---|-----|
| Notes on Contributors   | xii |
| List of Tables  | xvi |
| Introduction: Language Policy and Political Economy —THOMAS RICENTO   | 1   |
| Part I: Political Theory and Political Economy in Language Policy<br>Research on English as a Global Language               |     |
| 1. Political Economy and English as a "Global" Language<br>—тномаs кісенто  | 27  |
| 2. Global English and the Limits of Liberalism: Confronting Global Capitalism and Challenges to the Nation-State—PETER IVES | 48  |
| 3. Language Policy and Global Political Economy—JEFF BALE   | 72  |
| 4. Language, Hegemony, and Economy—GIYN WILLIAMS  | 97  |
| Part II: Political Economy and Global English: Case Studies   |     |
| 5. The Economics of English in Europe—FRANÇOIS GRIN   | 119 |

| 6. Language Education, Economic Development, and Participation in  |     |
|--|-----|
| the Greater Mekong Subregion—PAUL BRUTHIAUX  | 145 |
| 7. Neoliberalism as Language Policy—INGRID PILLER  |     |
| AND JINHYUN CHO  | 162 |
| 0.1971 - F 11.1 D 11.1 G 1.1 F 1.1   |     |
| 8. Why English Dominates the Central Economy: An Economic Perspective on "Elite Closure" and South African Language Policy |     |
| —LAURENCE WRIGHT   | 187 |
|  |     |
| 9. Narratives of Globalization in Language Politics in India   |     |
| —SELMA K. SONNTAG  | 209 |
|  |     |
| Part III: Global English, Development, and Democracy   |     |
| 10. The Ground Floor of the World: On the Socioeconomic  |     |
| Consequences of Linguistic Globalization—PHILIPPE VAN PARIJS   | 231 |
|  |     |
| 11. Linguistic Diversity and Global English: The Pushmi-Pullyu of  |     |
| Language Policy and Political Economy—SUZANNE ROMAINE  | 252 |
| 12. "English," the Global Lingua Franca?—тномая вісенто  | 276 |
| -  |     |
| Index  | 305 |

## LIST OF TABLES

| 3.1  | Four Periodizations of the History of Capitalist |     |
|------|--|-----|
|      | Development                                      | 83  |
| 5.1  | Language-Based Earnings Differentials (%)        | 126 |
| 5.2  | Social Rates of Return on Foreign-Language       |     |
|      | Teaching (%)                                     | 126 |
| 7.1  | Ranking Criteria of Joongang and Chosun          | 176 |
| 10.1 | Number of Native Speakers                        | 247 |
| 10.2 | Original Language of the Official Documents      |     |
|      | Published by the European Commission             | 248 |
| 10.3 | Percentage of Belgian Residents Who Have Studied |     |
|      | in Belgium and Say They can Speak Correctly      |     |
|      | at Least one Language in Addition to Their       |     |
|      | Mother Tongue                                    | 248 |
| 11.1 | Linguistic Diversity and Poverty in Africa       | 258 |

## INTRODUCTION: LANGUAGE POLICY AND POLITICAL ECONOMY

#### Thomas Ricento

English is the common denominator that unites the work presented in this volume; it provides a focal point to illustrate the ways in which a political economic approach is particularly useful in accounting for a range of phenomena in diverse settings in which a "global" language has attained a special status as (an often perceived) tool for socioeconomic mobility. The focus is on postcolonial contexts, such as India and South Africa, and countries where English is widely studied as a foreign or additional language, such as South Korea, countries in the Mekong River Basin, and in many other countries in Asia and in Europe. The findings reveal the complex ways in which governmental leaders and policymakers, as well as communities and individuals in those communities, make decisions within a global economy about the languages that will be taught as subjects or used as media of instruction in schools. Whether or not the "Straight for English" policy that has become popular in various countries in southern Africa and elsewhere is a good or bad idea, in terms of improving school completion and literacy rates, English is often promoted by its advocates as a social "good" with unquestioned instrumental value; yet access to quality English-medium education in low-income countries is mostly restricted to those with sufficient economic means to pay for it.

The research and conceptual analyses that comprise this volume reflect the diverse backgrounds of its contributors whose training is in the fields of socio- and applied linguistics, economics, political theory, sociology, English, and education. Their methodological approaches include ethnography, critical discourse analysis, economic models (capitalist and Marxist), historical, geographical, and linguistic analyses; the conceptual tools of economic and political theory are used to address issues that have been raised, and often strongly contested, in various literatures concerning the nature and effects of English as the most widely used language on the planet. Perhaps the most fundamental questions that