

# DISTRIBUTED COMPUTING

*through*

# COMBINATORIAL TOPOLOGY



**MK**  
MORGAN KAUFMANN

Maurice Herlihy  
Dmitry Kozlov  
Sergio Rajsbaum

# Distributed Computing Through Combinatorial Topology

**Maurice Herlihy**

**Dmitry Kozlov**



AMSTERDAM • BOSTON • HEIDELBERG • LONDON  
NEW YORK • OXFORD • PARIS • SAN DIEGO  
SAN FRANCISCO • SINGAPORE • SYDNEY • TOKYO

Morgan Kaufmann is an imprint of Elsevier



**Acquiring Editor:** Todd Green

**Editorial Project Manager:** Lindsay Lawrence

**Project Manager:** Punithavathy Govindaradjane

**Designer:** Maria Inês Cruz

Morgan Kaufmann is an imprint of Elsevier  
225 Wyman Street, Waltham, MA 02451, USA

Copyright © 2014 Elsevier Inc. All rights reserved.

No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher. Details on how to seek permission, further information about the Publisher's permissions policies and our arrangements with organizations such as the Copyright Clearance Center and the Copyright Licensing Agency, can be found at our website: [www.elsevier.com/permissions](http://www.elsevier.com/permissions).

This book and the individual contributions contained in it are protected under copyright by the Publisher (other than as may be noted herein).

### Notices

Knowledge and best practice in this field are constantly changing. As new research and experience broaden our understanding, changes in research methods or professional practices, may become necessary. Practitioners and researchers must always rely on their own experience and knowledge in evaluating and using any information or methods described herein. In using such information or methods they should be mindful of their own safety and the safety of others, including parties for whom they have a professional responsibility.

To the fullest extent of the law, neither the Publisher nor the authors, contributors, or editors, assume any liability for any injury and/or damage to persons or property as a matter of products liability, negligence or otherwise, or from any use or operation of any methods, products, instructions, or ideas contained in the material herein.

### Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Herlihy, Maurice.

Distributed computing through combinatorial topology / Maurice Herlihy, Dmitry Kozlov, Sergio Rajsbaum.  
pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-12-404578-1 (alk. paper)

1. Electronic data processing—Distributed processing—Mathematics.

2. Combinatorial topology. I. Kozlov, D. N. (Dmitrii Nikolaevich) II. Rajsbaum, Sergio. III. Title.

QA76.9.D5H473 2013

004'.36—dc23

2013038781

### British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-0-12-404578-1

Printed and bound in the United States of America

14 15 16 17 18 10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

For information on all MK publications  
visit our website at [www.mkp.com](http://www.mkp.com)



Working together  
to grow libraries in  
developing countries

[www.elsevier.com](http://www.elsevier.com) • [www.bookaid.org](http://www.bookaid.org)

# Distributed Computing Through Combinatorial Topology



*For my parents, David and Patricia Herlihy, and for Liuba, David, and Anna.*

*To Esther, David, Judith, and Eva-Maria.*

*Dedicated to the memory of my grandparents, Itke and David, Anga and Sigmund,  
and to the memory of my Ph.D. advisor, Shimon Even.*



# Acknowledgments

We thank all the students, colleagues, and friends who helped improve this book: Hagit Attiya, Irina Calciu, Armando Castañeda, Lisbeth Fajstrup, Eli Gafni, Eric Goubault, Rachid Guerraoui, Damien Imbs, Petr Kuznetsov, Hammurabi Mendez, Yoram Moses, Martin Raussen, Michel Raynal, David Rosenblueth, Ami Paz, Vikram Seraph, Nir Shavit, Christine Tasson, Corentin Travers, and Mark R. Tuttle. We apologize for any names inadvertently omitted.

Special thanks to Eli Gafni for his many insights on the algorithmic aspects of this book.



# Preface

This book is intended to serve as a textbook for an undergraduate or graduate course in theoretical distributed computing or as a reference for researchers who are, or want to become, active in this area. Previously, the material covered here was scattered across a collection of conference and journal publications, often terse and using different notations and terminology. Here we have assembled a self-contained explanation of the mathematics for computer science readers and of the computer science for mathematics readers.

Each of these chapters includes exercises. We think it is essential for readers to spend time solving these problems. Readers should have some familiarity with basic discrete mathematics, including induction, sets, graphs, and continuous maps. We have also included mathematical notes addressed to readers who want to explore the deeper mathematical structures behind this material.

The first three chapters cover the *fundamentals* of combinatorial topology and how it helps us understand distributed computing. Although the mathematical notions underlying our computational models are elementary, some notions of combinatorial topology, such as simplices, simplicial complexes, and levels of connectivity, may be unfamiliar to readers with a background in computer science. We explain these notions from first principles, starting in Chapter 1, where we provide an intuitive introduction to the new approach developed in the book. In Chapter 2 we describe the approach in more detail for the case of a system consisting of two processes only. Elementary graph theory, which is well-known to both computer scientists and mathematicians, is the only mathematics needed.

The graph theoretic notions of Chapter 2 are essentially one-dimensional simplicial complexes, and they provide a smooth introduction to Chapter 3, where most of the topological notions used in the book are presented. Though similar material can be found in many topology texts, our treatment here is different. In most texts, the notions needed to model computation are typically intermingled with a substantial body of other material, and it can be difficult for beginners to extract relevant notions from the rest. Readers with a background in combinatorial topology may want to skim this chapter to review concepts and notations.

The next four chapters are intended to form the core of an advanced undergraduate course in distributed computing. The mathematical framework is self-contained in the sense that all concepts used in this section are defined in the first three chapters.

In this part of the book we concentrate on the so-called *colorless* tasks, a large class of coordination problems that have received a great deal of attention in the research literature. In Chapter 4, we describe our basic operational and combinatorial models of computation. We define tasks and asynchronous, fault-tolerant, wait-free shared-memory protocols. This chapter explains how the mathematical language of combinatorial topology (such as simplicial complexes and maps) can be used to describe concurrent computation and to identify the colorless tasks that can be solved by these protocols. In Chapter 5, we apply these mathematical tools to study colorless task solvability by more powerful protocols. We first consider computational models in which processes fail by *crashing* (unexpectedly halting). We give necessary and sufficient conditions for solving colorless tasks in a range of different computational models, encompassing different crash-failure models and different forms of communication. In Chapter 6, we show how the same mathematical notions can be extended to deal with *Byzantine* failures, where faulty processes, instead of crashing, can display arbitrary behavior. In Chapter 7, we show how to use *reductions* to transform results about one model of computation to results about others.

Chapters 8–11 are intended to form the core of a graduate course. Here, too, the mathematical framework is self-contained, although we expect a slightly higher level of mathematical sophistication. In this part, we turn our attention to *general tasks*, a broader class of problems than the colorless tasks covered earlier. In Chapter 8, we describe how the mathematical framework previously used to model colorless tasks can be generalized, and in Chapter 9 we consider manifold tasks, a subclass of tasks with a particularly nice geometric structure. We state and prove Sperner’s lemma for manifolds and use this to derive a separation result showing that some problems are inherently “harder” than others. In Chapter 10, we focus on how computation affects *connectivity*, informally described as the question of whether the combinatorial structures that model computations have “holes.” We treat connectivity in an axiomatic way, avoiding the need to make explicit mention of homology or homotopy groups. In Chapter 11, we put these pieces together to give necessary and sufficient conditions for solving general tasks in various models of computation. Here notions from elementary point-set topology, such as open covers and compactness are used.

The final part of the book provides an opportunity to delve into more advanced topics of distributed computing by using further notions from topology. These chapters can be read in any order, mostly after having studied Chapter 8. Chapter 12 examines the renaming task, and uses combinatorial theorems such as the Index Lemma to derive lower bounds on this task. Chapter 13 uses the notion of shellability to show that a number of models of computation that appear to be quite distinct can be analyzed with the same formal tools. Chapter 14 examines simulations and reductions for general tasks, showing that the shared-memory models used interchangeably in this book really are equivalent. Chapter 15 draws a connection between a certain class of tasks and the Word Problem for finitely-presented groups, giving a hint of the richness of the universe of tasks that are studied in distributed computing. Finally, Chapter 16 uses Schlegel diagrams to prove basic topological properties about our core models of computation.

Maurice Herlihy was supported by NSF grant 000830491.

Sergio Rajsbaum by UNAM PAPIIT and PAPIME Grants.

Dmitry Kozlov was supported by the University of Bremen and the German Science Foundation.

---

## Companion Site

This book offers complete code for all the examples, as well as slides, updates, and other useful tools on its companion web page at:

<https://store.elsevier.com/product.jsp?isbn=9780124045781&pagename=search>.

# CONTENTS

Acknowledgments.....	.xi
Preface.....	xiii

## PART I FUNDAMENTALS

---

<b>CHAPTER 1 Introduction .....</b>	<b>3</b>
1.1 Concurrency Everywhere .....	3
1.2 Distributed Computing .....	9
1.3 Two Classic Distributed Computing Problems.....	12
1.4 Chapter Notes .....	18
1.5 Exercises .....	19
<b>CHAPTER 2 Two-Process Systems .....</b>	<b>21</b>
2.1 Elementary Graph Theory .....	22
2.2 Tasks .....	25
2.3 Models of Computation .....	28
2.4 Approximate Agreement.....	33
2.5 Two-Process Task Solvability .....	36
2.6 Chapter Notes .....	37
2.7 Exercises .....	38
<b>CHAPTER 3 Elements of Combinatorial Topology .....</b>	<b>41</b>
3.1 Basic Concepts.....	42
3.2 Simplicial Complexes .....	44
3.3 Standard Constructions.....	47
3.4 Carrier Maps .....	50
3.5 Connectivity .....	53
3.6 Subdivisions .....	55
3.7 Simplicial and Continuous Approximations .....	60
3.8 Chapter Notes .....	64
3.9 Exercises .....	64

## PART II COLORLESS TASKS

---

<b>CHAPTER 4 Colorless Wait-Free Computation.....</b>	<b>69</b>
4.1 Operational Model .....	70
4.2 Combinatorial Model.....	78

<b>4.3</b>	The Computational Power of Wait-Free Colorless Immediate Snapshots.....	88
<b>4.4</b>	Chapter Notes .....	92
<b>4.5</b>	Exercises .....	93
<b>CHAPTER 5</b>	<b>Solvability of Colorless Tasks in Different Models .....</b>	<b>97</b>
<b>5.1</b>	Overview of Models .....	98
<b>5.2</b>	<i>t</i> -Resilient Layered Snapshot Protocols.....	99
<b>5.3</b>	Layered Snapshots with <i>k</i> -Set Agreement .....	103
<b>5.4</b>	Adversaries .....	105
<b>5.5</b>	Message-Passing Protocols.....	108
<b>5.6</b>	Decidability.....	112
<b>5.7</b>	Chapter Notes .....	117
<b>5.8</b>	Exercises .....	118
<b>CHAPTER 6</b>	<b>Byzantine-Resilient Colorless Computation .....</b>	<b>123</b>
<b>6.1</b>	Byzantine Failures .....	123
<b>6.2</b>	Byzantine Communication Abstractions .....	125
<b>6.3</b>	Byzantine Set Agreement .....	128
<b>6.4</b>	Byzantine Barycentric Agreement.....	128
<b>6.5</b>	Byzantine Task Solvability .....	129
<b>6.6</b>	Byzantine Shared Memory .....	131
<b>6.7</b>	Chapter Notes .....	132
<b>6.8</b>	Exercises .....	132
<b>CHAPTER 7</b>	<b>Simulations and Reductions .....</b>	<b>135</b>
<b>7.1</b>	Motivation.....	135
<b>7.2</b>	Combinatorial Setting.....	137
<b>7.3</b>	Applications .....	139
<b>7.4</b>	BG Simulation .....	140
<b>7.5</b>	Conclusions.....	143
<b>7.6</b>	Chapter Notes .....	144
<b>7.7</b>	Exercises .....	145
<b>PART III GENERAL TASKS</b>		
<b>CHAPTER 8</b>	<b>Read-Write Protocols for General Tasks.....</b>	<b>149</b>
<b>8.1</b>	Overview.....	149
<b>8.2</b>	Tasks .....	150
<b>8.3</b>	Examples of Tasks .....	152
<b>8.4</b>	Protocols .....	158

<b>8.5 Chapter Notes .....</b>	163
<b>8.6 Exercises .....</b>	164
<b>CHAPTER 9 Manifold Protocols .....</b>	<b>167</b>
<b>9.1 Manifold Protocols .....</b>	168
<b>9.2 Layered Immediate Snapshot Protocols .....</b>	173
<b>9.3 No Set Agreement from Manifold Protocols .....</b>	178
<b>9.4 Set Agreement vs. Weak Symmetry Breaking .....</b>	182
<b>9.5 Chapter Notes .....</b>	188
<b>9.6 Exercises .....</b>	189
<b>CHAPTER 10 Connectivity .....</b>	<b>191</b>
<b>10.1 Consensus and Path Connectivity .....</b>	191
<b>10.2 Immediate Snapshot Model and Connectivity .....</b>	193
<b>10.3 <math>k</math>-Set Agreement and <math>(k - 1)</math> Connectivity .....</b>	199
<b>10.4 Immediate Snapshot Model and <math>k</math>-Connectivity .....</b>	199
<b>10.5 Chapter Notes .....</b>	203
<b>10.6 Exercises .....</b>	204
<b>CHAPTER 11 Wait-Free Computability for General Tasks .....</b>	<b>205</b>
<b>11.1 Inherently Colored Tasks: The Hourglass Task .....</b>	205
<b>11.2 Solvability for Colored Tasks .....</b>	208
<b>11.3 Algorithm Implies Map .....</b>	212
<b>11.4 Map Implies Algorithm .....</b>	212
<b>11.5 A Sufficient Topological Condition .....</b>	222
<b>11.6 Chapter Notes .....</b>	227
<b>11.7 Exercises .....</b>	227
<b>PART IV ADVANCED TOPICS</b>	
<b>CHAPTER 12 Renaming and Oriented Manifolds .....</b>	<b>231</b>
<b>12.1 An Upper Bound: Renaming with <math>2n + 1</math> Names .....</b>	232
<b>12.2 Weak Symmetry Breaking .....</b>	236
<b>12.3 The Index Lemma .....</b>	237
<b>12.4 Binary Colorings .....</b>	240
<b>12.5 A Lower Bound for <math>2n</math>-Renaming .....</b>	242
<b>12.6 Chapter Notes .....</b>	244
<b>12.7 Exercises .....</b>	244

<b>CHAPTER 13 Task Solvability in Different Models.....</b>	<b>247</b>
13.1 Shellability.....	248
13.2 Examples.....	249
13.3 Pseudospheres.....	251
13.4 Carrier Maps and Shellable Complexes.....	253
13.5 Applications.....	256
13.6 Chapter Notes .....	270
13.7 Exercises .....	271
<b>CHAPTER 14 Simulations and Reductions for Colored Tasks .....</b>	<b>273</b>
14.1 Model.....	273
14.2 Shared-Memory Models .....	275
14.3 Trivial Reductions.....	277
14.4 Layered Snapshot from Read-Write .....	277
14.5 Immediate Snapshot from Snapshot .....	279
14.6 Immediate Snapshot from Layered Immediate Snapshot.....	280
14.7 Snapshot from Layered Snapshot .....	284
14.8 Exercises .....	287
14.9 Chapter Notes .....	287
<b>CHAPTER 15 Classifying Loop Agreement Tasks.....</b>	<b>289</b>
15.1 The Fundamental Group .....	290
15.2 Algebraic Signatures.....	291
15.3 Main Theorem.....	293
15.4 Applications.....	296
15.5 Torsion Classes .....	297
15.6 Conclusions.....	297
15.7 Chapter Notes .....	297
15.8 Exercises .....	298
<b>CHAPTER 16 Immediate Snapshot Subdivisions .....</b>	<b>299</b>
16.1 A Glimpse of Discrete Geometry .....	299
16.2 Chapter Notes .....	304
16.3 Exercises .....	304
<b>Bibliography .....</b>	<b>305</b>
<b>Index.....</b>	<b>313</b>

PART

Fundamentals

I

