

The Oxford Handbook of ANIMALS IN CLASSICAL THOUGHT AND LIFE

# ANIMALS IN CLASSICAL THOUGHT AND LIFE







Great Clarendon Street, Oxford, OX2 6DP, United Kingdom

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford. It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship, and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press in the UK and in certain other countries

© Oxford University Press 2014

The moral rights of the authors have been asserted

First Edition published in 2014 Impression: 1

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted by law, by licence or under terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the address above

You must not circulate this work in any other form and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press 198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, United States of America

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
Data available

Library of Congress Control Number: 2014941667

ISBN 978-0-19-958942-5

Printed and bound by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CRO 4YY

Links to third party websites are provided by Oxford in good faith and for information only. Oxford disclaims any responsibility for the materials contained in any third party website referenced in this work.

# ANIMALS IN CLASSICAL THOUGHT AND LIFE

### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This volume is the product of a suggestion made to me by Hilary O'Shea, Senior Editor for Classics, Ancient History, and Archaeology at Oxford University Press. I am very grateful to her for her advice, to Taryn Das Neves, Annie Rose, and to all of the staff at OUP for their kind help and to Gráinne Byrne for her help with editing the chapters. I am also very grateful to all of the authors who have contributed to this volume, and apologize to them for the delay in publication. I would like to single out for praise here Liliane Bodson, author of the chapter on ancient zoological knowledge, for her heroic perseverance in the face of severe ill health. I am extremely grateful to her for the excellent chapter that she produced under very difficult conditions.

### LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Emma Aston University of Reading

Mary Beagon University of Manchester

Sinclair Bell Northern Illinois University

Liliane Bodson University of Liège

Gordon Lindsay Campbell National University of Ireland, Maynooth

Daniel A. Dombrowski Seattle University

Rory Egan University of Manitoba

Gunnel Ekroth Uppsala University

Thorsten Fögen Durham University

Ingvild Saelid Gilhus University of Bergen

Veronika Goebel Ludwig-Maximilians-University, Munich

Alastair Harden University of Oxford

Laura Hawtree University of Exeter

Timothy Howe St Olaf College

Geoffrey Kron University of Victoria, British Columbia

Jeremy B. Lefkowitz Swarthmore College

Michael MacKinnon University of Winnipeg

Adrienne Mayor Stanford University

Angela McDonald University of Glasgow

Jeremy McInerney University of Pennsylvania

Stephen T. Newmyer Duquesne University

Daniel Ogden University of Exeter

Ida Östenberg University of Gothenburg

Joris Peters Ludwig-Maximilians-University, Munich

Babette Pütz Victoria University of Wellington

Jo-Ann Shelton University of California Santa Barbara

Peter Struck University of Pennsylvania

Chiara Thumiger Humboldt Universität zu Berlin

Carolyn Willekes University of Calgary

### INTRODUCTION

### GORDON LINDSAY CAMPBELL

There has been quite a surge in recent years in interest in animals in antiquity, and this volume is intended to present a broad survey of attitudes to animals in the classical world by some of the leading contemporary scholars. Each chapter can stand alone as a starting point for investigation into each topic, and each has a useful section on suggested reading for further investigation, but the book may also be read as a whole as a coherent commentary on the whole field of scholarship. The main pre-existing volumes, the Berg *Cultural History of Animals* (Kalof, 2007), and *Pecus: Man and Animal in Antiquity* (Santillo Frizell, 2004) are also very well worth consulting, and may offer in some cases a more theoretical approach than I offer here.

Before I started editing this volume my main interest was in literary and philosophical animals in the ancient world, but, encouraged by the anonymous readers for OUP and my editors, I have broadened out the book to include the realities of animals in the ancient world, and this I hope has provided a much broader and more balanced spread of chapter topics.

Animals are 'good to think with', and ancient treatments of animals, whether in art, literature, or philosophy, often generate more questions than answers. For example, the question 'are we animals?' can be answered in many ways. Most ancient writers who try to answer this definitively say that we are indeed animals, but animals with special attributes that enabled us to separate ourselves from animalkind and develop the language, culture, and technology that make us human. Other writers may agree that we are animals, but warn that we are in danger of backsliding into a bestial state if we fail to continue to practise the culture that originally made us human. The Arcadians in particular are always in danger of turning into wolves if they will insist on carrying on eating people (Hartog, 2001: 133–50). In art and mythology, Centaurs ask a similar question about humans and animals; a Centaur is part human and part horse, a hybrid animal that forms a unity, but the line between horse and human is clearly to be seen. A Centaur is a walking illustration of the impossibility of a human—animal hybrid and at the same time a dire warning of what could happen if we were to transgress the boundaries of

human and divine law, as did Ixion when he tried to rape Hera but only succeeded in raping a cloud, Nephele, who then gave birth to Centaurus, the first Centaur. Seemingly driven by their transgressive origins, the main job of Centaurs in myth is to undermine marriage, the bedrock of Greek society, to attend weddings, get horribly drunk, and try to carry off the bride. Heroes, such as Heracles and Theseus, then have to step in, fight the Centaurs, and restore the sanctity of human marriage (see especially Dubois, 1982).

If the Centaurs display the extremes of inhuman bestiality, there is also a strong tradition in the ancient world of the superiority of animals to humans. Democritus says that we are foolish to imagine that we are superior to animals since they have been our teachers in many arts: the spider in weaving, the swallow in house-building, and the swan in singing (DK68 B154). Similarly Lucretius says that we should not think this world was made for us; if it was made for anyone it was for the animals since they are so much better adapted to it than we are (*On the Nature of the Universe* 5.195–234). This volume starts with some of the earliest examples of the exploration of these questions, Aesop's fables. According to Aesop, once upon a time animals could speak and held assemblies in the woods. They had language and political society, two things that are regularly thought to be specifically human attributes according to many ancient sources. We are intended to learn moral lessons from Aesop's animal fables: to learn from the animals.

Also crucially important in understanding ancient ideas about animals is their treatment in art. Therefore one of the longest chapters in the book is devoted to this subject. This is an extraordinarily rich field of enquiry and worthy of many volumes of its own, but as with all the chapters in this handbook it is intended as an introduction to the subject and supplies valuable advice to aid the reader in further study. Comic, epic, and tragic animals follow, giving strong insights into literary treatments of questions of human, animal, and divine identities and interactions. Often attitudes to and uses of animals in literature cast a powerful light on ancient society. In comedy humans often take on animal characteristics, and sometimes, as in the *Birds*, animals feature as characters in their own right rather than just in animal choruses. In epic, animals may have a moral function, or serve to illustrate the natures of the various heroes and other characters: Achilles is associated with the lion, Odysseus with the eagle, and so on. In tragedy, animal imagery is often used to illustrate deep human emotion, and to explore the 'middle ground' between human and animal.

The realities of human–animal interaction are also well covered in this volume. Animal husbandry, farming, animals and the market, insects, domestication, the fauna of the ancient Mediterranean, fish and fishing, among other topics, are studied in impressive depth and detail. I have learned a very great deal from these chapters and hope to follow the leads suggested by the authors and improve my knowledge of these aspects of animals in the ancient world. On animal domestication, I have been fascinated to learn that humans and animals 'symbiotically domesticated each other in separate regions, on three different continents (Africa, Asia, Europe)', people reaching Cyprus with their herds from the Levant about 9000 BC and the Aegean about 7000 BC. In animal husbandry, 'the technical sophistication and productivity of Graeco-Roman animal husbandry has become increasingly clear', and the quality of ancient livestock would

not be matched until Holland's Golden Age or the agricultural revolution in England. In the chapter on animals and the market, we learn that ancient ideas of wealth and worth were dominated at least from Homer onwards by 'value economics'. That is, that wealth properly should consist of land and animals, and all other forms of wealth and wealth production, especially mercantilism, tended to be regarded as 'improper' and 'grasping'. I am personally very attracted by these ideas. The fauna of the ancient Mediterranean world is also well surveyed here, and I am sure that the reader will be surprised by the presence of some (now) exotic animals in ancient Greece and Italy, including porcupines in Sicily and lions in northern Greece.

More abstract topics such as animal communication, the origin of species, gastronomy and meat eating, and pets are also studied in breadth and detail. The question of whether animals have language, or whether humans exclusively possessed language as our defining characteristic in antiquity is closely examined.

Meat eating in antiquity could be somewhat tricky since most meats were the product of 'luxurious pastures', and usually had to be properly sacrificed before being eaten. Tricky also, unlike other farm products, were cows to barter or take down to the shops expecting change. In late antiquity we hear that special dispensation could be given to the sick for eating unsacrificed meat, given the paucity of sacrificed meat under Christian persecution of ancient religious practices.

Defining what constituted pets can also be difficult. As the author of the chapter on pets in this volume says, the range of possible pets is very broad: 'Sheep dogs, hunting dogs, guard dogs; draught horses, cavalry horses, circus horses; mice-catching weasels, cats, and snakes; even some domestic livestock, including cattle, sheep, goats, pigs, and chickens, among others, may have been named or arguably cared for as "pets", in addition to their roles as "working" or "productive" animals.

I hope my own chapter on the origin of life and of species will be of use to those concerned not only with the ancient world but also with modern theories and the later reception of ancient ideas. The chapter on animals in warfare may well be an eye-opener for many readers, with the use of scorpions and burning pigs as offensive weapons, among other abuses of animals as weapons. It may be satisfying to read that Lucretius was correct in claiming that such 'weapons' frequently rebounded upon those who sent them, as will the chapters on animals and magic, and animals and divination. These aspects of the use of animals are crucial to our understanding of the ancient world. We are not separate from the animal world, and the will of the gods or simply of nature can be determined through the behaviour and health of animals. Otherwise, this close link can be exploited to our advantage or to the disadvantage of others by other humans whom we can curse using animal magic.

Animal sacrifice was crucially important in antiquity and is granted one of the longest chapters in this book. Important questions are of whether we can say we can have a proper society if we do not have shared animal sacrifice, and of whether we can possibly consider ourselves humane if we do sacrifice animals. Animals in late antiquity and Christianity, and part-animal gods, carry on the theme of animals in religion. The author of the chapter on part-animal gods argues that 'The animal god, as an idea, is

dead; but its carcass continues to block the flow of scholarship on the subject of theriomorphism in Greek religion. It has to be moved gently aside, and the best way of doing this is by studying the remarkably prevalent ancient practice of depicting gods in hybrid form, as partly theriomorphic, partly anthropomorphic.' This puts me firmly in my place, at least, and I hope it will do the same to the reader as well.

Metamorphosis is another crucially important topic, closely related to questions about the origins of species and ideas of what makes us and keeps us human, and this topic is also granted one of the longest chapters in the book. Clearly, in the ancient world there was often a fear hovering about the possibility of losing human status. But would that really be a bad thing? Perhaps we could be rescued from the evils of human life by becoming animals once more. Gryllus preferred being a pig, after all. Wondrous animals inhabit a similar conceptual landscape to metamorphic creatures, although they tend to wander the outer regions of the world, especially to the East. Wonder grows as ancient writers survey the East, and the norms of nature start to break down as we meet dog-headed people and gold-mining ants. Egyptian animals are closely related to the wondrous animals of the East, but perhaps more real. Everything is distorted and back to front there, and the interface between the mundane and sacred worlds could well be moderated more between animals and the divine than the human and divine.

Moving more into reality for a few chapters, we survey public exhibitions of animals in triumphs, wild beast shows, and horse and chariot racing. It is difficult for us to understand the cruelty of wild beast shows, and how they could be enjoyable to watch; perhaps this form of entertainment provides the widest cultural gulf between us and antiquity. Horse racing, on the other hand, is still extremely popular, and before we get too pious about our moral superiority over the ancients, we have recently learned what happens to racehorses that don't make the grade.

Then we come to philosophical animals and the arguments and opinions of the ancient schools of philosophy on the place of animals in the world. This is a very valuable survey, as is the following chapter on vegetarianism and animal entitlements. This has been the focus of considerable attention in recent years, and readers way well find these studies illuminating.

The final three chapters return to perhaps more technical territory, with the topics of ancient zoological knowledge, ancient fossil discoveries and interpretations, and veterinary medicine. Readers may well be intrigued by the chapter on fossils and their interpretation in the ancient world. If the author is correct, then we may well have to reconsider how we approach ancient ideas of mythical beasts. I have begun to see ancient fossil evidence everywhere in ancient sources, anyway.

After five years of work, I am very glad that the volume is finally completed. I hope it is a significant addition to the scholarship on animals in the ancient world, and that readers will find it a useful tool and a guide for further investigation. *Nunc est bibendum*.

Gordon Lindsay Campbell National University of Ireland Maynooth, 2014

### REFERENCES

Dubois, P. (1982), Centaurs and Amazons: Women and the Prehistory of the Great Chain of Being, Ann Arbor, University of Michigan Press.

Hartog, F. (2001), Memories of Odysseus, Chicago, University of Chicago Press.

Kalof, L. (ed.) (2007), A Cultural History of Animals in Antiquity, Vol. 1, Oxford and New York, Berg.

Santillo Frizell, B. (ed.) (2004), Pecus: Man and Animal in Antiquity, Proceedings of the conference at the Swedish Institute in Rome, September 9–12, 2002, The Swedish Institute in Rome, Projects and Seminars, 1, ISSN 1824-7725.

## Contents

List of Illustrations List of Contributors		xi xiii
	Introduction Gordon Lindsay Campbell	xv
1.	Aesop and Animal Fable Jeremy B. Lefkowitz	1
2.	Animals in Classical Art Alastair Harden	24
3.	Good to Laugh With: Animals in Comedy BABETTE PÜTZ	61
4.	Animals in Epic Laura Hawtree	73
5.	Animals in Tragedy Chiara Thumiger	84
6.	Domestication and Breeding of Livestock: Horses, Mules, Asses, Cattle, Sheep, Goats, and Swine Timothy Howe	99
7.	Animal Husbandry Geoffrey Kron	109
8.	Value Economics: Animals, Wealth, and the Market Timothy Howe	136
9.	Fauna of the Ancient Mediterranean World MICHAEL MACKINNON	156
10.	Insects Rory Egan	180

11.	Ancient Fishing and Fish Farming GEOFFREY KRON	192
12.	Hunting MICHAEL MACKINNON	203
13.	Animal Communication Thorsten Fögen	216
14.	Origins of Life and Origins of Species GORDON LINDSAY CAMPBELL	233
15.	Civilization, Gastronomy, and Meat-eating JEREMY McInerney	248
16.	Pets Michael MacKinnon	269
17.	Animals in Warfare Adrienne Mayor	282
18.	Animal Magic Daniel Ogden	294
19.	Animals and Divination Peter Struck	310
20.	Animal Sacrifice in Antiquity Gunnel Ekroth	324
21.	Animals in Late Antiquity and Early Christianity Ingvild Saelid Gilhus	355
22.	Part-animal Gods Emma Aston	366
23.	Metamorphosis: Human into Animals Chiara Thumiger	384
24.	Wondrous Animals in Classical Antiquity Mary Beagon	414
25.	Animals in Egypt	441

		CONTENTS ix
26.	Spectacles of Animal Abuse Jo-Ann Shelton	461
27.	Horse Racing and Chariot Racing SINCLAIR BELL AND CAROLYN WILLEKES	478
28.	Animals and Triumphs Ida Östenberg	491
29.	Being the One and Becoming the Other: Animals in Ancier Philosophical Schools Stephen T. Newmyer	nt 507
30.	Philosophical Vegetarianism and Animal Entitlements Daniel A. Dombrowski	535
31.	Zoological Knowledge in Ancient Greece and Rome LILIANE BODSON	556
32.	Ancient Fossil Discoveries and Interpretations Adrienne Mayor	579
33.	Veterinary Medicine Veronika Goebel and Joris Peters	589
Ind	lex	607

# LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

2.1	Animal styles on pottery in the Ure Museum of Greek Art and	
	Archaeology, University of Reading.	25
2.2	Early Cycladic II pyxis in the form of a pig.	27
2.3	The 'Beazley Gem', agate scaraboid depicting Europa riding the	
	bull Zeus (c.480 BC).	39
2.4	The 'Good Shepherd': early Christian red cornelian gem featuring Christ and lambs, third/fourth century AD.	41
2.5	Mithras <i>tauroktonos</i> : cast of a Mithraic sculpture found in Walbrook, England. Late third/early fourth century AD.	42
2.6	'Écorcheur rustique': Roman copy of a Hellenistic statue.	44
2.7	Youth and hare: interior of a red-figure cup attributed to Makron,	
	c.480 BC.	45
2.8	The Great Altar of Pergamon: a dog assists Artemis to fight a giant with	
	serpentine legs.	49
2.9	'Tellus' relief from the Ara Pacis Augustae, Rome.	50
2.10	Hadrianic-era hunting tondo on the north face of the Arch of	
	Constantine, Rome.	52
2.11	Doves mosaic from the Villa of Hadrian at Tivoli. Roman,	
	perhaps related to a Hellenistic original by Sosos of Pergamon.	55
2.12	The 'Uffizi Boar': cast of a statue in Florence, probably a Roman copy of a lost Hellenistic original.	56
22.1	South Italian bronze statuette of Acheloos; early fifth century BC.	369
22.2	Detail from an Attic black-figure oinochoe attributed to the	
	Theseus Painter; $c$ .490–480 BC. Pan as upright goat, with Hermes.	371
25.1a	Ptolemy IV mounted on horseback on the Raphia Decree from	
	Cairo Museum (CG 31088).	442
25.1b	An Egyptian archer during the Battle of Qadesh.	442
25.2a	The varied faces of animal gods in ancient Egypt. Full anthropomorphic	
	form: Amun at Karnak Temple, 19th Dynasty.	443
25.2b	The varied faces of animal gods in ancient Egypt. Full theriomorphic	
	form: Osiris the lion on a Ptolemaic Period stela	192 1990 2000
	from the Cairo Museum (CG 22177).	444

25.2C	The varied faces of animal gods in ancient Egypt. 'Mischgestalt': Falcon-headed Horus at the Temple of Seti I, Abydos, 19th Dynasty.	444
25.3	A so-called battle-lion at a Ptolemaic king's feet, breathing fire on his enemies. Temple of Kom Ombo, Graeco-Roman Period.	449
25.4	Silver denarius minted in Italy in 28 BC, commemorating Augustus's domination of Egypt, symbolized by a captured crocodile.	454
25.5a	A seated Anubis jackal wearing keys on his collar; from a Roman Period shroud from the late second century AD.	455
25.5b	A forward-facing Anubis-jackal perches above Herakleides on his funerary stela. Roman Period, Kom Abu Billo (Terenuthis).	456
27.1	Statue of a boy jockey.	481
27.2	Funerary relief with a circus scene.	484
28.1	Passage relief from Arch of Titus in Rome: Titus in the triumphal <i>quadriga</i> .	493
28.2	Silver cup from Boscoreale. Triumph of Tiberius: a slave pulls the four horses forwards.	494
28.3	Terracotta (so-called Campana) plaque with triumphal scene. Two chained barbarian prisoners seated on a cart drawn by two horses.	495
28.4	Silver cup from Boscoreale. Triumph of Tiberius: bull led to sacrifice.	496
28.5	Silver cup from Boscoreale. Triumph of Tiberius: sacrifice in front of temple of Jupiter.	496
28.6	Aes signatum from the first half of the third century BC depicting an elephant.	499
28.7	Reverse of <i>aureus</i> , minted in Spain in 17 BC. Augustus in elephant <i>biga</i> on a triumphal arch.	504
31.1	Mantis religiosa Linnaeus, 1758. Metapontum. Silver didrachm, c.420.	
32.1	Map of giant bones observed in antiquity.	558
32.2	Heracles and Hesione versus the Monster of Troy, depicted as a	582
34.4	large skull weathering out of a cliff.	587