

Graduate Texts in Mathematics

F.H. Clarke

R.J. Stern

Yu.S. Ledyaev

P.R. Wolenski

Nonsmooth Analysis and Control Theory

非光滑分析和控制论

Springer

世界图书出版公司

www.wpcbj.com.cn

F.H. Clarke
Yu.S. Ledyaeu
R.J. Stern
P.R. Wolenski

Nonsmooth Analysis and Control Theory



Springer

图书在版编目 (C I P) 数据

非光滑分析和控制论=Nonsmooth Analysis and Control Theory: 英文/(法)科拉克 (Clarke,F.H.) 著. —北京: 世界图书出版公司北京公司, 2008.12

数学研究生教程

ISBN 978-7-5062-9265-8

I.非… II.科… III.数学分析—研究生—教材—英文
IV.017

中国版本图书馆CIP数据核字 (2008) 第195291号

书 名: Nonsmooth Analysis and Control Theory

作 者: F. H. Clarke & Y. S. Ledyaev

中译名: 非光滑分析和控制论

责任编辑: 高蓉 刘慧

出 版 者: 世界图书出版公司北京公司

印 刷 者: 三河国英印务有限公司

发 行: 世界图书出版公司北京公司 (北京朝内大街 137 号 100010)

联系电话: 010-64015659

电子信箱: kjsk@vip.sina.com

开 本: 24开

印 张: 12.5

版 次: 2009 年 01 月第 1 次印刷

版权登记: 图字:01-2008-4620

书 号: 978-7-5062-9265-8/O · 650

定 价: 39.00 元

世界图书出版公司北京分公司已获得 Springer 授权在中国大陆独家重印发行

*The authors dedicate this book:
to Gail, Julia, and Danielle;
to Sofia, Simeon, and Irina;
to Judy, Adam, and Sach; and
to Mary and Anna.*

Preface

Pardon me for writing such a long letter; I had not the time to write a short one.

—Lord Chesterfield

Nonsmooth analysis refers to differential analysis in the absence of differentiability. It can be regarded as a subfield of that vast subject known as nonlinear analysis. While nonsmooth analysis has classical roots (we claim to have traced its lineage back to Dini), it is only in the last decades that the subject has grown rapidly. To the point, in fact, that further development has sometimes appeared in danger of being stymied, due to the plethora of definitions and unclearly related theories.

One reason for the growth of the subject has been, without a doubt, the recognition that nondifferentiable phenomena are more widespread, and play a more important role, than had been thought. Philosophically at least, this is in keeping with the coming to the fore of several other types of irregular and nonlinear behavior: catastrophes, fractals, and chaos.

In recent years, nonsmooth analysis has come to play a role in functional analysis, optimization, optimal design, mechanics and plasticity, differential equations (as in the theory of viscosity solutions), control theory, and, increasingly, in analysis generally (critical point theory, inequalities, fixed point theory, variational methods ...). In the long run, we expect its methods and basic constructs to be viewed as a natural part of differential analysis.

We have found that it would be relatively easy to write a very long book on nonsmooth analysis and its applications; several times, we did. We have now managed not to do so, and in fact our principal claim for this work is that it presents the essentials of the subject clearly and succinctly, together with some of its applications and a generous supply of interesting exercises. We have also incorporated in the text a number of new results which clarify the relationships between the different schools of thought in the subject. We hope that this will help make nonsmooth analysis accessible to a wider audience. In this spirit, the book is written so as to be used by anyone who has taken a course in functional analysis.

We now proceed to discuss the contents. Chapter 0 is an Introduction in which we allow ourselves a certain amount of hand-waving. The intent is to give the reader an *avant-gout* of what is to come, and to indicate at an early stage why the subject is of interest.

There are many exercises in Chapters 1 to 4, and we recommend (to the active reader) that they be done. Our experience in teaching this material has had a great influence on the writing of this book, and indicates that comprehension is proportional to the exercises done. The end-of-chapter problems also offer scope for deeper understanding. We feel no guilt in calling upon the results of exercises later as needed.

Chapter 1, on proximal analysis, should be done carefully by every reader of this book. We have chosen to work here in a Hilbert space, although the greater generality of certain Banach spaces having smooth norms would be another suitable context. We believe the Hilbert space setting makes for a more accessible theory on first exposure, while being quite adequate for later applications.

Chapter 2 is devoted to the theory of generalized gradients, which constitutes the other main approach (other than proximal) to developing nonsmooth analysis. The natural habitat of this theory is Banach space, which is the choice made. The relationship between these two principal approaches is now well understood, and is clearly delineated here. As for the preceding chapter, the treatment is not encyclopedic, but covers the important ideas.

In Chapter 3 we develop certain special topics, the first of which is value function analysis for constrained optimization. This topic is previewed in Chapter 0, and §3.1 is helpful, though not essential, in understanding certain proofs in the latter part of Chapter 4. The next topic, mean value inequalities, offers a glimpse of more advanced calculus. It also serves as a basis for the solvability results of the next section, which features the Graves–Lyusternik Theorem and the Lipschitz Inverse Function Theorem. Section 3.4 is a brief look at a *third* route to nonsmooth calculus, one that bases itself upon directional subderivates. It is shown that the salient points of this theory can be derived from the earlier results. We also present here a self-contained proof of Rademacher's Theorem. In §3.5 we develop some

machinery that is used in the following chapter, notably measurable selection. We take a quick look at variational functionals, but by-and-large, the calculus of variations has been omitted. The final section of the chapter examines in more detail some questions related to tangency.

Chapter 4, as its title implies, is a self-contained introduction to the theory of control of ordinary differential equations. This is a biased introduction, since one of its avowed goals is to demonstrate virtually all of the preceding theory in action. It makes no attempt to address issues of modeling or of implementation. Nonetheless, most of the central issues in control are studied, and we believe that any serious student of mathematical control theory will find it essential to have a grasp of the tools that are developed here via nonsmooth analysis: invariance, viability, trajectory monotonicity, viscosity solutions, discontinuous feedback, and Hamiltonian inclusions. We believe that the unified and geometrically motivated approach presented here for the first time has merits that will continue to make themselves felt in the subject.

We now make some suggestions for the reader who does not have the time to cover all of the material in this book. If control theory is of less interest, then Chapters 1 and 2, together with as much of Chapter 3 as time allows, constitutes a good introduction to nonsmooth analysis. At the other extreme is the reader who wishes to do Chapter 4 virtually in its entirety. In that case, a jump to Chapter 4 directly after Chapter 1 is feasible; only occasional references to material in Chapters 2 and 3 is made, up to §4.8, and in such a way that the reader can refer back without difficulty. The two final sections of Chapter 4 have a greater dependence on Chapter 2, but can still be covered if the reader will admit the proofs of the theorems.

A word on numbering. All items are numbered in sequence within a section; thus Exercise 7.2 precedes Theorem 7.3, which is followed by Corollary 7.4. For references between two chapters, an extra initial digit refers to the chapter number. Thus a result that would be referred to as Theorem 7.3 within Chapter 1 would be invoked as Theorem 1.7.3 from within Chapter 4. All equation numbers are simple, as in (3), and start again at (1) at the beginning of each section (thus their effect is only local). A reference to §3 is to the third section of the current chapter, while §2.3 refers to the third section of Chapter 2.

A summary of our notational conventions is given in §0.5, and a Symbol Glossary appears in the Notes and Comments at the end of the book.

We would like to express our gratitude to the personnel of the Centre de Recherches Mathématiques (CRM) of l'Université de Montréal, and in particular to Louise Letendre, for their invaluable help in producing this book.

Finally, we learned as the book was going to press, of the death of our friend and colleague Andrei Subbotin. We wish to express our sadness at his passing, and our appreciation of his many contributions to our subject.

Francis Clarke, Lyon

Yuri Ledyayev, Moscow

Ron Stern, Montréal

Peter Wolenski, Baton Rouge

May 1997

F.H. Clarke
Institut Desargues
Université de Lyon I
Villeurbanne, 69622
France

Yu.S. Ledyev
Steklov Mathematics Institute
Moscow, 117966
Russia

R.J. Stern
Department of Mathematics
Concordia University
7141 Sherbrooke St. West
Montreal, PQ H4B 1R6
Canada

P.R. Wolenski
Department of Mathematics
Louisiana State University
Baton Rouge, LA 70803-0001
USA

Editorial Board

S. Axler
Mathematics Department
San Francisco State
University
San Francisco, CA 94132
USA

F. W. Gehring
Mathematics Department
East Hall
University of Michigan
Ann Arbor, MI 48109
USA

K.A. Ribet
Department of Mathematics
University of California
at Berkeley
Berkeley, CA 94720-3840
USA

Mathematics Subject Classification (1991): 49J52, 58C20, 90C48

With 8 figures.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Nonsmooth analysis and control theory / F.H. Clarke . . . [et al.].

p. cm. – (Graduate texts in mathematics ; 178)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-387-98336-8 (hardcover : alk. paper)

1. Control theory. 2. Nonsmooth optimization. I. Clarke, Francis H. II. Series.

QA402.3.N66 1998

515'.64—dc21

97-34140

©1998 Springer-Verlag New York, Inc.

All rights reserved. This work may not be translated or copied in whole or in part without the written permission of the publisher (Springer-Verlag New York, Inc., 175 Fifth Avenue, New York, NY 10010, USA), except for brief excerpts in connection with reviews or scholarly analysis. Use in connection with any form of information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed is forbidden.

The use of general descriptive names, trade names, trademarks, etc., in this publication, even if the former are not especially identified, is not to be taken as a sign that such names, as understood by the Trade Marks and Merchandise Marks Act, may accordingly be used freely by anyone.

This reprint has been authorized by Springer-Verlag (Berlin/Heidelberg/New York) for sale in the People's Republic of China only and not for export therefrom.

Graduate Texts in Mathematics

continued from page ii

- 61 WHITEHEAD. Elements of Homotopy Theory.
- 62 KARGAPOLOV/MERLZIAKOV. Fundamentals of the Theory of Groups.
- 63 BOLLOBAS. Graph Theory.
- 64 EDWARDS. Fourier Series. Vol. I 2nd ed.
- 65 WELLS. Differential Analysis on Complex Manifolds. 2nd ed.
- 66 WATERHOUSE. Introduction to Affine Group Schemes.
- 67 SERRE. Local Fields.
- 68 WEIDMANN. Linear Operators in Hilbert Spaces.
- 69 LANG. Cyclotomic Fields II.
- 70 MASSEY. Singular Homology Theory.
- 71 FARKAS/KRA. Riemann Surfaces. 2nd ed.
- 72 STILLWELL. Classical Topology and Combinatorial Group Theory. 2nd ed.
- 73 HUNGERFORD. Algebra.
- 74 DAVENPORT. Multiplicative Number Theory. 2nd ed.
- 75 HOCHSCHILD. Basic Theory of Algebraic Groups and Lie Algebras.
- 76 IITAKA. Algebraic Geometry.
- 77 HECKE. Lectures on the Theory of Algebraic Numbers.
- 78 BURRIS/SANKAPPANAVAR. A Course in Universal Algebra.
- 79 WALTERS. An Introduction to Ergodic Theory.
- 80 ROBINSON. A Course in the Theory of Groups. 2nd ed.
- 81 FORSTER. Lectures on Riemann Surfaces.
- 82 BOTT/TU. Differential Forms in Algebraic Topology.
- 83 WASHINGTON. Introduction to Cyclotomic Fields. 2nd ed.
- 84 IRELAND/ROSEN. A Classical Introduction to Modern Number Theory. 2nd ed.
- 85 EDWARDS. Fourier Series. Vol. II. 2nd ed.
- 86 VAN LINT. Introduction to Coding Theory. 2nd ed.
- 87 BROWN. Cohomology of Groups.
- 88 PIERCE. Associative Algebras.
- 89 LANG. Introduction to Algebraic and Abelian Functions. 2nd ed.
- 90 BRØNSTED. An Introduction to Convex Polytopes.
- 91 BEARDON. On the Geometry of Discrete Groups.
- 92 DIESTEL. Sequences and Series in Banach Spaces.
- 93 DUBROVIN/FOMENKO/NOVIKOV. Modern Geometry—Methods and Applications. Part I. 2nd ed.
- 94 WARNER. Foundations of Differentiable Manifolds and Lie Groups.
- 95 SHIRYAEV. Probability. 2nd ed.
- 96 CONWAY. A Course in Functional Analysis. 2nd ed.
- 97 KOBLITZ. Introduction to Elliptic Curves and Modular Forms. 2nd ed.
- 98 BRÖCKER/TOM DIECK. Representations of Compact Lie Groups.
- 99 GROVE/BENSON. Finite Reflection Groups. 2nd ed.
- 100 BERG/CHRISTENSEN/RESSEL. Harmonic Analysis on Semigroups: Theory of Positive Definite and Related Functions.
- 101 EDWARDS. Galois Theory.
- 102 VARADARAJAN. Lie Groups, Lie Algebras and Their Representations.
- 103 LANG. Complex Analysis. 3rd ed.
- 104 DUBROVIN/FOMENKO/NOVIKOV. Modern Geometry—Methods and Applications. Part II.
- 105 LANG. $SL_2(\mathbb{R})$.
- 106 SILVERMAN. The Arithmetic of Elliptic Curves.
- 107 OLVER. Applications of Lie Groups to Differential Equations. 2nd ed.
- 108 RANGE. Holomorphic Functions and Integral Representations in Several Complex Variables.
- 109 LEHTO. Univalent Functions and Teichmüller Spaces.
- 110 LANG. Algebraic Number Theory.
- 111 HUSEMÖLLER. Elliptic Curves.
- 112 LANG. Elliptic Functions.
- 113 KARATZAS/SHREVE. Brownian Motion and Stochastic Calculus. 2nd ed.
- 114 KOBLITZ. A Course in Number Theory and Cryptography. 2nd ed.
- 115 BERGER/GOSTIAUX. Differential Geometry: Manifolds, Curves, and Surfaces.
- 116 KELLEY/SRINIVASAN. Measure and Integral. Vol. I.
- 117 SERRE. Algebraic Groups and Class Fields.
- 118 PEDERSEN. Analysis Now.

- 119 ROTMAN. An Introduction to Algebraic Topology.
- 120 ZIEMER. Weakly Differentiable Functions: Sobolev Spaces and Functions of Bounded Variation.
- 121 LANG. Cyclotomic Fields I and II. Combined 2nd ed.
- 122 REMMERT. Theory of Complex Functions. *Readings in Mathematics*
- 123 EBBINGHAUS/HERMES et al. Numbers. *Readings in Mathematics*
- 124 DUBROVIN/FOMENKO/NOVIKOV. Modern Geometry—Methods and Applications. Part III.
- 125 BERENSTEIN/GAY. Complex Variables: An Introduction.
- 126 BOREL. Linear Algebraic Groups. 2nd ed.
- 127 MASSEY. A Basic Course in Algebraic Topology.
- 128 RAUCH. Partial Differential Equations.
- 129 FULTON/HARRIS. Representation Theory: A First Course. *Readings in Mathematics*
- 130 DODSON/POSTON. Tensor Geometry.
- 131 LAM. A First Course in Noncommutative Rings.
- 132 BEARDON. Iteration of Rational Functions.
- 133 HARRIS. Algebraic Geometry: A First Course.
- 134 ROMAN. Coding and Information Theory.
- 135 ROMAN. Advanced Linear Algebra.
- 136 ADKINS/WEINTRAUB. Algebra: An Approach via Module Theory.
- 137 AXLER/BOURDON/RAMEY. Harmonic Function Theory.
- 138 COHEN. A Course in Computational Algebraic Number Theory.
- 139 BREDON. Topology and Geometry.
- 140 AUBIN. Optima and Equilibria. An Introduction to Nonlinear Analysis.
- 141 BECKER/WEISPFENNING/KREDEL. Gröbner Bases. A Computational Approach to Commutative Algebra.
- 142 LANG. Real and Functional Analysis. 3rd ed.
- 143 DOOB. Measure Theory.
- 144 DENNIS/FARB. Noncommutative Algebra.
- 145 VICK. Homology Theory. An Introduction to Algebraic Topology. 2nd ed.
- 146 BRIDGES. Computability: A Mathematical Sketchbook.
- 147 ROSENBERG. Algebraic K-Theory and Its Applications.
- 148 ROTMAN. An Introduction to the Theory of Groups. 4th ed.
- 149 RATCLIFFE. Foundations of Hyperbolic Manifolds.
- 150 EISENBUD. Commutative Algebra with a View Toward Algebraic Geometry.
- 151 SILVERMAN. Advanced Topics in the Arithmetic of Elliptic Curves.
- 152 ZIEGLER. Lectures on Polytopes.
- 153 FULTON. Algebraic Topology: A First Course.
- 154 BROWN/PEARCY. An Introduction to Analysis.
- 155 KASSEL. Quantum Groups.
- 156 KECHRIS. Classical Descriptive Set Theory.
- 157 MALLIAVIN. Integration and Probability.
- 158 ROMAN. Field Theory.
- 159 CONWAY. Functions of One Complex Variable II.
- 160 LANG. Differential and Riemannian Manifolds.
- 161 BORWEIN/ERDÉLYI. Polynomials and Polynomial Inequalities.
- 162 ALPERIN/BELL. Groups and Representations.
- 163 DIXON/MORTIMER. Permutation Groups.
- 164 NATHANSON. Additive Number Theory: The Classical Bases.
- 165 NATHANSON. Additive Number Theory: Inverse Problems and the Geometry of Sumsets.
- 166 SHARPE. Differential Geometry: Cartan's Generalization of Klein's Erlangen Program.
- 167 MORANDI. Field and Galois Theory.
- 168 EWALD. Combinatorial Convexity and Algebraic Geometry.
- 169 BHATIA. Matrix Analysis.
- 170 BREDON. Sheaf Theory. 2nd ed.
- 171 PETERSEN. Riemannian Geometry.
- 172 REMMERT. Classical Topics in Complex Function Theory.
- 173 DIESTEL. Graph Theory.
- 174 BRIDGES. Foundations of Real and Abstract Analysis.
- 175 LICKORISH. An Introduction to Knot Theory.
- 176 LEE. Riemannian Manifolds.
- 177 NEWMAN. Analytic Number Theory.
- 178 CLARKE/LEDYAEV/STERN/WOLENSKI. Nonsmooth Analysis and Control Theory.

Contents

Preface	vii
List of Figures	xiii
0 Introduction	1
1 Analysis Without Linearization	1
2 Flow-Invariant Sets	7
3 Optimization	10
4 Control Theory	15
5 Notation	18
1 Proximal Calculus in Hilbert Space	21
1 Closest Points and Proximal Normals	21
2 Proximal Subgradients	27
3 The Density Theorem	39
4 Minimization Principles	43
5 Quadratic Inf-Convolutions	44
6 The Distance Function	47
7 Lipschitz Functions	51
8 The Sum Rule	54
9 The Chain Rule	58
10 Limiting Calculus	61
11 Problems on Chapter 1	63

2	Generalized Gradients in Banach Space	69
1	Definition and Basic Properties	69
2	Basic Calculus	74
3	Relation to Derivatives	78
4	Convex and Regular Functions	80
5	Tangents and Normals	83
6	Relationship to Proximal Analysis	88
7	The Bouligand Tangent Cone and Regular Sets	90
8	The Gradient Formula in Finite Dimensions	93
9	Problems on Chapter 2	96
3	Special Topics	103
1	Constrained Optimization and Value Functions	103
2	The Mean Value Inequality	111
3	Solving Equations	125
4	Derivate Calculus and Rademacher's Theorem	136
5	Sets in L^2 and Integral Functionals	148
6	Tangents and Interiors	165
7	Problems on Chapter 3	170
4	A Short Course in Control Theory	177
1	Trajectories of Differential Inclusions	177
2	Weak Invariance	188
3	Lipschitz Dependence and Strong Invariance	195
4	Equilibria	202
5	Lyapounov Theory and Stabilization	208
6	Monotonicity and Attainability	215
7	The Hamilton–Jacobi Equation and Viscosity Solutions	222
8	Feedback Synthesis from Semisolutions	228
9	Necessary Conditions for Optimal Control	230
10	Normality and Controllability	244
11	Problems on Chapter 4	247
	Notes and Comments	257
	List of Notation	263
	Bibliography	265
	Index	273

List of Figures

0.1	Torricelli's table.	12
0.2	Discontinuity of the local projection.	13
1.1	A set S and some of its boundary points.	22
1.2	A point x_1 and its five projections.	24
1.3	The epigraph of a function.	30
1.4	ζ belongs to $\partial_P f(x)$	35
4.1	The set S of Exercise 2.12.	195
4.2	The set S of Exercise 4.3.	204

0

Introduction

Experts are not supposed to read this book at all.

—R.P. Boas, *A Primer of Real Functions*

We begin with a motivational essay that previews a few issues and several techniques that will arise later in this book.

1 Analysis Without Linearization

Among the issues that routinely arise in mathematical analysis are the following three:

- to minimize a function $f(x)$;
- to solve an equation $F(x) = y$ for x as a function of y ; and
- to derive the stability of an equilibrium point x^* of a differential equation $\dot{x} = \varphi(x)$.

None of these issues imposes by its nature that the function involved (f , F , or φ) be smooth (differentiable); for example, we can reasonably aim to minimize a function which is merely continuous, if growth or compactness is postulated.

Nonetheless, the role of derivatives in questions such as these has been central, due to the classical technique of *linearization*. This term refers to

the construction of a linear local approximation of a function by means of its derivative at a point. Of course, this approach requires that the derivative exists. When applied to the three scenarios listed above, linearization gives rise to familiar and useful criteria:

- at a minimum x , we have $f'(x) = 0$ (Fermat's Rule);
- if the $n \times n$ Jacobian matrix $F'(x)$ is nonsingular, then $F(x) = y$ is locally invertible (the Inverse Function Theorem); and
- if the eigenvalues of $\varphi'(x^*)$ have negative real parts, the equilibrium is locally stable.

The main purpose of this book is to introduce and motivate a set of tools and methods that can be used to address these types of issues, as well as others in analysis, optimization, and control, when the underlying data are not (necessarily) smooth.

In order to illustrate in a simple setting how this might be accomplished, and in order to make contact with what could be viewed as the first theorem in what has become known as *nonsmooth analysis*, let us consider the following question: to characterize in differential, thus local terms, the global property that a given continuous function $f: \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ is decreasing (i.e., $x \leq y \implies f(y) \leq f(x)$).

If the function f admits a continuous derivative f' , then the integration formula

$$f(y) = f(x) + \int_x^y f'(t) dt$$

leads to a sufficient condition for f to be decreasing: that $f'(t)$ be nonpositive for each t . It is easy to see that this is necessary as well, so a satisfying characterization via f' is obtained.

If we go beyond the class of continuously differentiable functions, the situation becomes much more complex. It is known, for example, that there exists a *strictly* decreasing continuous f for which we have $f'(t) = 0$ almost everywhere. For such a function, the derivative appears to fail us, insofar as characterizing decrease is concerned.

In 1878, Ulysse Dini introduced certain constructs, one of which is the following (lower, right) *derivate*:

$$Df(x) := \liminf_{t \downarrow 0} \frac{f(x+t) - f(x)}{t}.$$

Note that $Df(x)$ can equal $+\infty$ or $-\infty$. It turns out that Df will serve our purpose, as we now see.

1.1. Theorem. *The continuous function $f: \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ is decreasing iff*

$$Df(x) \leq 0 \quad \forall x \in \mathbb{R}.$$

Although this result is well known, and in any case greatly generalized in a later chapter, let us indicate a nonstandard proof of it now, in order to bring out two themes that are central to this book: optimization and nonsmooth calculus.

Note first that $Df(x) \leq 0$ is an evident necessary condition for f to be decreasing, so it is the sufficiency of this property that we must prove.

Let x, y be any two numbers with $x < y$. We will prove that for any $\delta > 0$, we have

$$\min\{f(t): y \leq t \leq y + \delta\} \leq f(x). \quad (1)$$

This implies $f(y) \leq f(x)$, as required.

As a first step in the proof of (1), let g be a function defined on $(x - \delta, y + \delta)$ with the following properties:

- (a) g is continuously differentiable, $g(t) \geq 0$, $g(t) = 0$ iff $t = y$;
- (b) $g'(t) < 0$ for $t \in (x - \delta, y)$ and $g'(t) \geq 0$ for $t \in [y, y + \delta)$; and
- (c) $g(t) \rightarrow \infty$ as $t \downarrow x - \delta$, and also as $t \uparrow y + \delta$.

It is easy enough to give an explicit formula for such a function; we will not do so.

Now consider the minimization over $(x - \delta, y + \delta)$ of the function $f + g$; by continuity and growth, the minimum is attained at a point z . A necessary condition for a local minimum of a function is that its Dini derivate be nonnegative there, as is easily seen. This gives

$$D(f + g)(z) \geq 0.$$

Because g is smooth, we have the following fact (in nonsmooth calculus!):

$$D(f + g)(z) = Df(z) + g'(z).$$

Since $Df(z) \leq 0$ by assumption, we derive $g'(z) \geq 0$, which implies that z lies in the interval $[y, y + \delta)$. We can now estimate the left side of (1) as follows:

$$\begin{aligned} \min\{f(t): y \leq t \leq y + \delta\} &\leq f(z) \\ &\leq f(z) + g(z) \quad (\text{since } g \geq 0) \\ &\leq f(x) + g(x) \quad (\text{since } z \text{ minimizes } f + g). \end{aligned}$$