

ASPEN PUBLISHERS

DUKEMINIER
KRIER
ALEXANDER
SCHILL

PROPERTY

*Seventh
Edition*



Wolters Kluwer

Law & Business

ASPEN PUBLISHERS

PROPERTY

Seventh Edition

Jesse Dukeminier

Late Maxwell Professor of Law
University of California
Los Angeles

James E. Krier

Earl Warren DeLano Professor of Law
University of Michigan

Gregory S. Alexander

A. Robert Noll Professor of Law
Cornell Law School

Michael H. Schill

Dean and Harry N. Wyatt Professor of Law
University of Chicago



Wolters Kluwer
Law & Business

AUSTIN BOSTON CHICAGO NEW YORK THE NETHERLANDS

Copyright © 2010 David Sanders as Trustee of the David Sanders Living Trust, James E. Krier as Trustee of the James E. Krier Living Trust, Gregory S. Alexander, and Michael H. Schill

Published by Aspen Publishers. All Rights Reserved.

No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission to make copies of any part of this publication should be mailed to:

Aspen Publishers
Attn: Permissions Department
76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor
New York, NY 10011-5201

To contact Customer Care, e-mail customer.care@aspenpublishers.com, call 1-800-234-1660, fax 1-800-901-9075, or mail correspondence to:

Aspen Publishers
Attn: Order Department
PO Box 990
Frederick, MD 21705

Printed in the United States of America.

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0

ISBN 978-0-7355-8899-8

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Property / Jesse Dukeminier . . . [et al.]. — 7th ed.
p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-7355-8899-8

1. Property — United States — Cases. I. Dukeminier, Jesse.

KF560.D8 2010

346.7304 — dc22

2009050651

This book contains paper from well-managed forests to SFI standards.

PROPERTY

EDITORIAL ADVISORS

Vicki Been

Elihu Root Professor of Law
New York University School of Law

Erwin Chemerinsky

Dean and Distinguished Professor of Law
University of California, Irvine, School of Law

Richard A. Epstein

James Parker Hall Distinguished Service Professor of Law
University of Chicago Law School
Peter and Kirsten Bedford Senior Fellow
The Hoover Institution
Stanford University

Ronald J. Gilson

Charles J. Meyers Professor of Law and Business
Stanford University
Marc and Eva Stern Professor of Law and Business
Columbia Law School

James E. Krier

Earl Warren DeLano Professor of Law
The University of Michigan Law School

Richard K. Neumann, Jr.

Professor of Law
Hofstra University School of Law

Robert H. Sitkoff

John L. Gray Professor of Law
Harvard Law School

David Alan Sklansky

Professor of Law
University of California at Berkeley School of Law

Kent D. Syverud

Dean and Ethan A. H. Shepley University Professor
Washington University School of Law

Elizabeth Warren

Leo Gottlieb Professor of Law
Harvard Law School

About Wolters Kluwer Law & Business

Wolters Kluwer Law & Business is a leading provider of research information and workflow solutions in key specialty areas. The strengths of the individual brands of Aspen Publishers, CCH, Kluwer Law International and Loislaw are aligned within Wolters Kluwer Law & Business to provide comprehensive, in-depth solutions and expert-authored content for the legal, professional and education markets.

CCH was founded in 1913 and has served more than four generations of business professionals and their clients. The CCH products in the Wolters Kluwer Law & Business group are highly regarded electronic and print resources for legal, securities, antitrust and trade regulation, government contracting, banking, pension, payroll, employment and labor, and healthcare reimbursement and compliance professionals.

Aspen Publishers is a leading information provider for attorneys, business professionals and law students. Written by preeminent authorities, Aspen products offer analytical and practical information in a range of specialty practice areas from securities law and intellectual property to mergers and acquisitions and pension/benefits. Aspen's trusted legal education resources provide professors and students with high-quality, up-to-date and effective resources for successful instruction and study in all areas of the law.

Kluwer Law International supplies the global business community with comprehensive English-language international legal information. Legal practitioners, corporate counsel and business executives around the world rely on the Kluwer Law International journals, loose-leafs, books and electronic products for authoritative information in many areas of international legal practice.

Loislaw is a premier provider of digitized legal content to small law firm practitioners of various specializations. Loislaw provides attorneys with the ability to quickly and efficiently find the necessary legal information they need, when and where they need it, by facilitating access to primary law as well as state-specific law, records, forms and treatises.

Wolters Kluwer Law & Business, a unit of Wolters Kluwer, is headquartered in New York and Riverwoods, Illinois. Wolters Kluwer is a leading multinational publisher and information services company.

For my mother at 95

—*J.E.K.*

To the memory of my parents

—*G.S.A.*

To my parents

—*M.H.S.*

Preface to the Seventh Edition

The first edition of this book appeared in 1981. It has changed considerably over the years since, thanks to periodic revisions occasioned by developments in the law and literature, but the original aims and methods of the book have held steady. They are set forth in the Preface to the First Edition, reprinted in part on the following page.

As always, our work on the book has benefitted from the contributions of students, colleagues, and friends. We are grateful to them for their help, and hope the following list does justice to everyone: Sam Charlton, Lyndsey Clark, Gunnar Doetker-Martz, Stuart Edmiston, Danielle Gaier, Wesley Gorman, Francis Lewis, Scott Loresch, Caroline Staudt, Thomas Powell, and Alyssa Simon (for research assistance); Ann Carlson, Michael Carrier, Teresa Collett, Michael Doran, Stephen Dycus, Stephen Munzer, Craig Oren, and Eduardo Peñalver, teachers all (for ideas and materials sent our way); Dorothy Kryskowski (for managing manuscript preparation with care, skill, and good cheer); Renee Cote, Eric Holt, Meri Keithley, and Peter Skagestad (for graphics, layout, and editing); and, finally, David Cunningham and Wendy Wilkes (for help above and beyond).

James E. Krier
Gregory S. Alexander
Michael H. Schill

January 2010

From the Preface to the First Edition

Property is a thoroughly modern subject of thoroughly antiquated origins. Probably in no other area of law does one see more, or even as many, strains of the old in the new. As an institution for allocating resources and distributing wealth and power, property bears in fundamentally important ways on central issues in contemporary life; as a body of doctrine, it discharges these modern-day tasks with rules and concepts drawn from age-old ways of looking at social relations in an ordered society. Property law has, to be sure, undergone constant change, but—at least in Anglo-American experience—it has not been revolutionized. Its enduring mix of old and new, rife with uneasy tensions, reflects more than an institution that has evolved over centuries and across cultures; it reflects as well two often conflicting objectives—promoting stability and accommodating change—that property systems must serve. To study property is to study social history, social relations, and social reform.

It is also, of course, to study law. The primary objective of this coursebook is to help students learn the complicated structure and functions of property doctrine and something of legal method, legal reasoning, and legal analysis. We have, however, secondary objectives as well, suggested by our opening remarks. How, why, and with what implications does the property system order relations in present-day America? What sorts of incentives does it create in terms of constructive use of scarce, valuable resources? How fairly does it confer benefits and impose burdens? To what extent is today's system a valuable, or a useless, legacy of the past? What sorts of reforms are suggested, and what might they achieve?

To pursue such secondary questions as these, and especially to accomplish the primary end of learning law and legal method, we need large doses of doctrine, but also a sense of history and of methods of critiquing institutional performance. There is, then, lots of law in what follows—in cases, statutes, text, and problems. There is also a consistent effort to trace historical antecedents. Finally, there is a fairly systematic, but by no means dominating, attempt to critique—often through an economic lens. Economics, like property, is in large part about resources. The economics in the book can be managed easily, we think, even by the totally uninitiated; it can also be ignored or even scorned. So too for the history, if one likes.

Jesse Dukeminier
James E. Krier

February 1, 1981

Acknowledgments

The authors acknowledge the permissions kindly granted to reproduce excerpts from, or illustrations of, the materials indicated below.

Books and Articles

- American Law Institute, Restatement (Third) of Property, Servitudes (2000). Copyright ©2000 by the American Law Institute.
- Baird, Douglas G., Common Law Intellectual Property and the Legacy of International News Service v. Associated Press, 40 U. Chi. L. Rev. 411 (1983). Copyright ©1983 by University of Chicago Law Review. Reproduced with permission of the University of Chicago Law School via Copyright Clearance Center.
- Barnett, Walter, Marketable Title Acts — Panacea or Pandemonium?, 53 Cornell L. Rev. 45, 52-54. Copyright ©1967 by Cornell Law Review. Reprinted by permission of the Cornell Law Review via Copyright Clearance Center.
- Berger, Lawrence, The Public Use Requirement in Eminent Domain, 57 Or. L. Rev. 203 (1978).
- Demsetz, Harold, Toward a Theory of Property Rights, 57 Am. Econ. Rev. 347 (Pap. & Proc. 1967). Reprinted by permission of the American Economic Association.
- Dukeminier, Jesse, and James E. Krier, The Rise of the Perpetual Trust, 50 UCLA L. Rev. 1303 (2003). Reprinted with permission.
- Egan, Timothy, The Serene Fortress: Many Seek Security in Private Communities, N.Y. Times, Sept. 3, 1995. Copyright ©1995 by The New York Times Company. Reprinted by permission.
- McDougal, Myres S., & John W. Brabner-Smith, Land Tide Transfer: A Regression, 48 Yale L.J. 1125 (1939). Reprinted by permission of The Yale Law Journal Company and Fred B. Rothman & Co.
- Miceli, Thomas J., and C.F. Sirmans, Torrens versus Title Insurance: An Economic Analysis of Land Title Systems, Illinois Real Estates Letter (Fall 1997). Reprinted with permission.
- Michelman, Frank, Property, Utility, and Fairness: Comments on the Ethical Foundations of “Just Compensation Law,” 80 Harv. L. Rev. 1168 (1967). Copyright ©1967 by the Harvard Law Review Association.
- Perry, Sandra White, Letter to editors regarding Jessie Lide’s house (1988).
- Posner, Richard A., Economic Analysis of Law (7th ed. 2007). Copyright ©2007. Reprinted by permission of Aspen Publishers, Inc.
- Powell, Richard R., The Law of Real Property (Michael A. Wolf gen. ed. 2000). Copyright ©2000 by Matthew Bender & Co., Inc., and reprinted by permission.
- Rubinfeld, Jed, Usings, 102 Yale L.J. 1077 (1993). Reprinted by permission of the Yale Law Journal Company and Fred B. Rothman & Co.

- Samuels, Elizabeth J., *Stories Out of School: Teaching the Case of Brown v. Voss*, 16 *Cardozo L. Rev.* 1445 (1995).
- Silverman, Rachel Emma, *Amid Congressional Scrutiny, Huge Sums Pour Into States That Allow "Dynasty Trusts," Wall Street Journal*, Feb. 16, 2005, at D1. ©2005 by Dow Jones & Co. Inc. Reproduced with permission of Dow Jones & Co. Inc. via Copyright Clearance Center.

Illustrations

- Blackstone, Sir William, portrait by Sir Joshua Reynolds, from the National Portrait Gallery, London.
- Brandeis, Louis Dembitz, photograph, collection of the Supreme Court of the United States.
- Day, Robert, cartoon. ©1958, 1986, Robert Day/Conde Nast Publications/cartoon bank.com. All Rights Reserved.
- Delfino v. Vealencis, Bristol, Connecticut, map of land, from Manuel Baucells & Steven A. Lippman, *Justice Delayed is Justice Denied: A Co-operative Game Theoretic Analysis of Hold Up in Co-Ownership*, 22 *Cardozo L. Rev.* 1191, 1222 (2001).
- Development Rights Transfer, from John J. Costonis, *Space Adrift* (1974). Copyright ©1974 by the University of Illinois Press.
- DOONESBURY ©2001 G. B. Trudeau. Reprinted with permission of UNIVERSAL UCLICK. All rights reserved.
- Emporia, Kansas, Berkley Hills Addition, house, 1991 photograph by Chad Johnson.
- Giant Tire, Detroit, Michigan, photograph by Wendy L. Wilkes.
- Gray's Mansion, Chanute, Kansas, photograph by Vernon R. Parham, M.D.
- Green Lawn Subdivision, Detroit, Michigan, photograph by Wendy L. Wilkes.
- Greenwald, Racquel, and her son, Ari, photograph. ©Associated Press/Bill Clare. Reprinted with permission.
- Gulf Terrace Condominium, Destin, Florida, photograph by Lucy Howell.
- Gwernhaylod House, Overton-on-Dee, Shropshire, photograph, courtesy of John Riddell.
- Haunted House, Nyack, New York, photograph. Reproduced by permission of AP/Wide World Photos.
- Henry VIII, painting by Hans Holbein the Younger. Copyright ©Fundacion Coleccion Thyssen-Bornemisza, Madrid.
- Holmes, Oliver Wendell, photograph, collection of the Supreme Court of the United States.
- Howard v. Kunto, Washington, map ©1995 by Barry C. Nelson.
- Klimt, Gustav, painting entitled 'Schloss Kammer am Attersee II.' Private collection. Reproduced by permission of Galerie St. Etienne, New York.
- Lachaise, Gaston, sculpture, *Standing Woman*, 1932. Bronze, 88 1/2" high (225 cm.). University of California, Los Angeles, Franklin D. Murphy Sculpture Garden. Photographer: Donald Blumberg.
- Ladue, Missouri, residences, 1999, photographs by Stuart Banner.
- Lakeside Village Condominiums, Culver City, California, photograph by Jesse Dukeminier.
- Lake Naomi, Pennsylvania, photograph, from Emma Miller Waygood, *Changing Times in the Poconos* (1972). Reprinted by permission of Mary Brower.

- Lake Naomi, Pennsylvania, map, from the appellant's brief in *Miller v. Lutheran Conference & Camp Assn.*, courtesy of Barlow Burke.
- Lake Tahoe photograph, reprinted by permission of the photographer, Declan McCullagh.
- Leicester Square, London, etching, from the British Museum, London.
- Lide, Jessie, Knoxville, Tennessee, house, 1956 photograph, courtesy of Sandra White Perry.
- Livery of seisin, etching, from Daniel Coquillette, *The Anglo-American Legal Heritage: Introductory Materials* (1999), with copyright permission from Akademie Verlag, GmbH, Berlin.
- Loretto's Apartment House, New York City, photograph by Michael S. Gruen.
- Lucas v. South Carolina Coastal Council, lots, 2000, photograph by David S. Sanders.
- Maslin, Michael, cartoon. ©2009 Michael Maslin/Conde Nast Publications/ www.cartoonbank.com. All Rights Reserved.
- Marshall, John, portrait by Chester Harding. Reproduced by permission of the Boston Athenaeum.
- Messersmith, Caroline, Dickinson, North Dakota, house, 1999 photograph by Richard Volesky.
- Metropolitan Opera Bill (von Stade), 2000, photograph by Charles Cronin.
- Mount Laurel, end of litigation, photograph, from N.Y. Times, Apr. 12, 1997. Photographer: Laura A. Pedrick. Reproduced by permission of NYT Permissions.
- Nahrstedt, Natore, photograph by Alan J. Duignan from Los Angeles Times, Dec. 24, 1992. Reproduced by permission.
- Neponsit, New York houses, 1980, photograph by David S. Sanders.
- New London, Connecticut homes (AP Photo/Bob Child). Reprinted with permission of AP/World Wide Photos.
- Nollan v. California Coastal Commission, house and beach, 2001, photographs by David S. Sanders.
- Odd Fellows Building, Los Banos, California, photographs by Todd Benjamin.
- O'Keeffe, Georgia, painting entitled 'Seaweed,' 1926. Copyright ©2009 Georgia O'Keeffe Museum/Artist Rights Society (ARS) New York. Reprinted by permission.
- O'Keeffe, Georgia, 1968 photograph by Arnold Newman. Copyright ©Arnold Newman/Getty Images (1968).
- Oxford House, Edmonds, Washington, photograph, courtesy of Oxford House.
- Pierre Apartments, Hackensack, New Jersey, photograph by David S. Sanders.
- Residences on lots 19, 20, and 4, Chanute, Kansas, photograph by Vernon R. Parham, M.D.
- River View Towers, Fort Lee, New Jersey, photograph by David S. Sanders.
- Snout houses, photographs, from N.Y. Times, April 20, 2000. Photographer: Shane Young. Reproduced by permission of NYT Permissions.
- Starke, Leslie, cartoon. ©1947 Leslie Stark/Conde Nast Publications/ www.cartoonbank.com. All Rights Reserved.
- Steiner, Peter, cartoon. ©1996 Peter Steiner/Conde Nast Publications/ www.cartoonbank.com. All Rights Reserved.
- Stoyanoff house, Ladue, Missouri, 2001 drawing by Stephen Harby.
- Symphony Space, New York City, photograph by Charles Langelia, 2001 advertising poster.
- Trever, John, cartoon. ©2005 John Trever and the Albuquerque Journal. Reprinted by permission.

- Van Pelt, J. F., photograph, from The Steve Hill Collection, Mitchell Community College, North Carolina. Reproduced by permission of Bill Moose.
- Van Pelt Residence, Statesville, North Carolina, etching, courtesy of Bill Moose.
- Van Sandt v. Royster, Lots 19, 20, and 4, map by Greg R. Vetter and Marcilynn A. Burke.
- Vealencis, Helen, photograph from Manel Baucells & Steven A. Lippman, Justice Delayed is Justice Denied: A Cooperative Game Theoretic Analysis of Hold-Up in Co-Ownership, 22 Cardozo L. Rev. 1191, 1249 (2001).
- Weber, Robert, cartoon. ©1977 Robert Weber/Conde Nast Publications/www.cartoonbank.com. All Rights Reserved.
- Wells Fargo Legacy Trust advertisement. Reprinted with permission of Wells Fargo Bank South Dakota, N. A.
- World's Columbian Exposition, Chicago, 1893, photograph, ICHi-02530, View looking east at the Court of Honor, photographer — C. D. Arnold. Reproduced by permission of the Chicago Historical Society.
- Wright, Frank Lloyd, Broadacre City, photograph, from Frank Lloyd Wright, The Living City, 1958. Copyright ©1998 by The Frank Lloyd Wright Foundation, Scottsdale, Arizona.

PROPERTY

Summary of Contents

Contents	xi
List of Illustrations	xxv
Preface to the Seventh Edition	xxix
From the Preface to the First Edition	xxxix
Acknowledgments	xxxiii
 Part I. An Introduction to Some Fundamentals	 1
Chapter 1. First Possession: Acquisition of Property by Discovery, Capture, and Creation	 3
Chapter 2. Subsequent Possession: Acquisition of Property by Find, Adverse Possession, and Gift	 97
 Part II. The System of Estates (Leaseholds Aside)	 183
Chapter 3. Possessory Estates	185
Chapter 4. Future Interests	253
Chapter 5. Co-ownership and Marital Interests	319
 Part III. Leaseholds: The Law of Landlord and Tenant	 419
Chapter 6. Tradition, Tension, and Change in Landlord- Tenant Law	 421
 Part IV. Transfers of Land	 517
Chapter 7. The Land Transaction	519
Chapter 8. Title Assurance	645
 Part V. Land Use Controls	 729
Chapter 9. Judicial Land Use Controls: The Law of Nuisance	 731
Chapter 10. Private Land Use Controls: The Law of Servitudes	 763
Chapter 11. Legislative Land Use Controls: The Law of Zoning	 925
Chapter 12. Eminent Domain and the Problem of Regulatory Takings	 1061
 Appendix A	 1197
Appendix B	1199
Table of Cases	1201
Author Index	1211
Subject Index	1219

Contents

List of Illustrations	xxv
Preface to the Seventh Edition	xxix
From the Preface to the First Edition	xxxix
Acknowledgments	xxxiii

Part I. An Introduction to Some Fundamentals 1

Chapter 1. First Possession: Acquisition of Property by Discovery, Capture, and Creation	3
A. Acquisition by Discovery	3
<i>Johnson v. M'Intosh</i>	3
Notes and Questions	10
B. Acquisition by Capture	18
<i>Pierson v. Post</i>	18
Notes and Questions	22
<i>Ghen v. Rich</i>	26
Notes and Questions	28
<i>Keeble v. Hickeringill</i>	30
Notes and Questions	31
Problems: More on the Rule of Capture and Wild Animals	33
Notes, Questions, and Problems: The Rule of Capture and Other "Fugitive" Resources	36
Harold Demsetz, Toward a Theory of Property Rights	39
Note: "Externalities"	46
Notes and Questions	50
C. Acquisition by Creation	56
1. Property in One's Ideas and Expressions: General Principles of Intellectual Property	56
<i>International News Service v. Associated Press</i>	56
<i>Cheney Brothers v. Doris Silk Corp.</i>	61
Smith v. Chanel, Inc.	62
Douglas G. Baird, Common Law Intellectual Property and the Legacy of International News Service v. Associated Press	63
Notes and Questions	63

2. Property in One's Persona	65
<i>White v. Samsung Electronics America, Inc.</i>	66
Note	70
3. Property in One's Person	70
<i>Moore v. Regents of the University of California</i>	70
Notes and Questions: Property in One's Person	83
Note: The Right to Include, the Right to Exclude	88
<i>Jacque v. Steenberg Homes, Inc.</i>	89
<i>State v. Shack</i>	90
Notes and Questions: More on the Right to Exclude	92
Note and Questions: The Right to Destroy	96
 Chapter 2. Subsequent Possession: Acquisition of Property by Find, Adverse Possession, and Gift	 97
A. Acquisition by Find	97
<i>Armory v. Delamirie</i>	98
Notes and Questions	98
<i>Hannah v. Peel</i>	101
Notes and Questions	106
<i>McAvoy v. Medina</i>	107
Notes and Questions	108
B. Acquisition by Adverse Possession	116
1. The Theory and Elements of Adverse Possession	116
Powell on Real Property §91.01	116
Henry W. Ballantine, Title by Adverse Possession	117
Oliver Wendell Holmes, The Path of the Law	118
Notes and Questions	118
<i>Van Valkenburgh v. Lutz</i>	122
Notes and Questions	131
Note: Color of Title and Constructive Adverse Possession	134
Problems	135
<i>Mannillo v. Gorski</i>	136
Notes, Questions, and Problems	140
2. The Mechanics of Adverse Possession	142
<i>Howard v. Kunto</i>	142
Question	147
Problems: Tacking	148
Problems: Disabilities	149
Note: Adverse Possession Against the Government	150