

PARTICIPATIVE MANAGEMENT

Implementing Empowerment

"The best book on the subject. It should be read by every manager who wants to get employees involved to boost bottom-line results."

**—Tod White, founder
Blessing/White**

Lorne C. Plunkett & Robert Fournier

Participative Management Implementing Empowerment

**Lorne C. Plunkett
Robert Fournier**

John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

New York • Chichester • Brisbane • Toronto • Singapore

In recognition of the importance of preserving what has been written, it is a policy of John Wiley & Sons, Inc., to have books of enduring value published in the United States printed on acid-free paper, and we exert our best efforts to that end.

Copyright © 1991 by John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

All rights reserved. Published simultaneously in Canada.

Reproduction or translation of any part of this work beyond that permitted by Section 107 or 108 of the 1976 United States Copyright Act without the permission of the copyright owner is unlawful. Requests for permission or further information should be addressed to the Permissions Department, John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional person should be sought. *From a Declaration of Principles jointly adopted by a Committee of the American Bar Association and a Committee of Publishers.*

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Plunkett, Lorne C.

Participative management : implementing
empowerment / by Lorne Plunkett and Robert Fournier.
p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 0-471-54374-8 (cloth : alk. paper)

1. Industrial management—Employee participation. I. Fournier.

R. O. II. Title.

HD5650.P537 1991

658.3'152—dc20

91-15588

Printed in the United States of America

10 9 8 7 6 5 4

PREFACE

WHO SHOULD READ THIS BOOK?

We wrote this book hoping that leaders, supervisors, hourly paid workers, and employee representatives (e.g., union stewards) all would benefit from reading it. We wrote it primarily with those people in mind because they are the ones who will experience the participative management process as both a personal and an organizational event. We also hope that internal and external change agents—whether they be organization development consultants or trainers—will gain value from our experiences. The change agent is helpful or not, depending on what processes or programs are recommended to the clients. For practitioners, our message is simply to ask, “If I was paying the bill for my services, would I feel that I was spending my organization’s money effectively?”

OVERVIEW OF THE CONTENTS

Chapter 1 provides an overview of participative management from our perspective. We also describe a case with which we have been associated that exemplifies the concept and practice of participative management and reinforces our belief that the process pays off organizationally. In Chapter 2, we attempt to demystify what we view as the “top ten” myths of participative management. We explore the traps associated with the myths and try to illustrate the impact of subscribing to them.

PREFACE

Chapter 3 addresses the issues for the organization in the participative management process. Chapter 4 explores issues for teams and groups. Chapter 5 offers some techniques that we have found useful in working with varieties of teams we have encountered in the participative management process.

In Chapter 6, we discuss issues for the individuals in the participative management process, which we too often find are simply not addressed. In this chapter, we write of the “unspeakables” because we believe that to ignore them is to ignore the very foundation on which participative management is built.

Chapter 7 attempts to look into the future and predict where participative management is going.

The Appendixes in this book are intentionally different from many other appendixes. We seized the opportunity to turn the book into a working document of sorts. We offer some tools that have worked for others, some examples of successful pieces in the participative management process, and a list of reference books that we found especially useful in our work with clients.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

For many years, we talked about the collaborating for this book. In 1990, we put the plan in progress, and in doing so we experienced some of the same successes and failures that we describe in this book. We have certainly increased our empathy toward our clients as they struggle with participative management issues. In the end, however, we persisted and the feeling of completion is empowering! The book was written in two different cities (we live 400 miles apart), and we had to invent some creative ways to apply teamwork in our efforts to meet deadlines. We owe an incredible debt to the inventors of the telephone, the fax machine, and the courier service.

We wrote this book for a number of reasons. First, we felt a strong need to share our own experiences, beliefs, and concerns about participative management and how it is “done.” Second, we believed that if we could marry our “internal-external” consulting perceptions, we could come up with a clearer view of participative management concepts and techniques. Third, our spouses suggested we should either write the book or stop talking about it!

You can't write a book like this without help and support from a lot of people. We want to acknowledge all of our clients, particularly the following who allowed us to share their experiences: the polyvinyl chloride expansion team at Esso Chemical Canada's Sarnia site, Shell Canada, Camco, Nova's Polysar site, General Electric Canada, Peterborough, and Martin Marietta, Denver.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Special thanks from Bob to Bill Dyer and Bob Tannenbaum, whose words of experience and wisdom to the Pepperdine class were inspirational and clarifying at a time when both were needed most.

Special thanks from Lorne to colleagues at Lorne Plunkett & Associates Ltd. and the clients who have become friends for reading drafts and sharing their insights. Lorne particularly thanks Mike Hamilton, our editor, from John Wiley for his patience and support of our efforts.

Three other people were instrumental in helping write this book. Diane Plunkett and Debbie Fournier, whose third-party interventions got us going again at critical points in the writing process, and Pam Whitty, whose skill in transforming our different writing styles to legibly typed pages, and in keeping us coordinated and on track, helped enormously.

CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION: IF PARTICIPATIVE MANAGEMENT IS THE ANSWER, WHAT WAS THE QUESTION? 1

- What Makes This Book Different? 4
- What Is Participative Management? 4
- Why Participative Management? 6
- Participative Management at Esso Chemical Canada 7

CHAPTER 2

MYTHS OF PARTICIPATIVE MANAGEMENT 17

- Myth 1, Participative Management Can Be Imposed by
Top Management 20
- Myth 2, Participative Management Is New and Is an
Invention or Discovery of the 1980s and 1990s 22
- Myth 3, Participative Management Is for Wage/Hourly
Employees Only 25
- Myth 4, People Want Empowerment, but They Have
Been Waiting for Management to Introduce It in
the Organization 26
- Myth 5, Participative Management Is Organizational
Democracy 28
- Myth 6, Participative Management Means Teams and
Leads to Self-Directing Teams 31
- Myth 7, Participative Management Is Free 34

CONTENTS

Myth 8, Consensus Is the Only Way to Make Decisions in a Participative Environment	35
Myth 9, Participative Management Is a Program, Not a Process	40
Myth 10, Participative Management Leads to Error-Free Quality Performance	42
How To Manage Failure	43
Summary	47

CHAPTER 3

ISSUES FOR THE ORGANIZATION 49

A Case for Participative Management	52
Issue 1, Need for a Road Map	54
Issue 2, Impact of Participative Management on Organizational Structure and Hierarchy	66
Issue 3, Resourcing a Participative Management Process	70
Issue 4, Impact of Participative Management on Decision Making	80
Issue 5, Impact of Participative Management Process on Roles	94
Summary	106

CHAPTER 4

ISSUES FOR TEAMS/GROUPS 107

If Teams Are the Answer, What Was the Question?	110
Teams, Groups, and Other Motley Crews	113
Natural Work Groups	115
Natural Work Teams	119
Integrated Teams	123

CONTENTS

Short-Term Task/Project Teams	129
Long-Term Committees	139
Summary	141

CHAPTER 5

HOW TEAMS WORK 143

Team Effectiveness Model	146
Goal Clarification	147
Role Clarification	151
Relationships	168

CHAPTER 6

ISSUES FOR THE INDIVIDUAL 171

Individual Losses and Gains	173
Individuality versus Teams	178
Opting In/Opting Out	182
The Leader's Role	183
Representation Role	187
First-Line Supervisor's Role	189
The Individual and Stress Levels	193
Summary	197

CHAPTER 7

THE FINAL CHAPTER: WHERE NEXT? 199

Prediction 1, Participative Management Will Grow in Usage by Organizations	201
Prediction 2, Participative Management Will Be Institutionalized by Organizations Currently Embarking on a Shift of Philosophy	202

CONTENTS

Prediction 3, Business and Engineering Schools Will Have to Change Their Curriculum to Include Participative Management	203
Prediction 4, Participative Management Will Probably Change Its Name to Reflect Another Guru's Interpretation	204
Conclusion	205

APPENDIXES	207
-------------------	------------

I. Participative Management Elements	209
II. Managing Participation Model	222
III. Team Effectiveness	224
IV. Group Process Observation Guide	226
V. Types of Groups and Teams	230
VI. Meetings	232
VII. Types of Processes to Resolve Team Situations	239
VIII. A Case Study on Some of the Issues	249

SELECTED READINGS	265
--------------------------	------------

INDEX	269
--------------	------------

1

INTRODUCTION

**IF PARTICIPATIVE
MANAGEMENT IS THE ANSWER,
WHAT WAS THE QUESTION?**

Have you been on a trip when you had to refer to maps and checkpoints so constantly that you asked yourself, "Why did I undertake this journey?" This same feeling is probably rampant in organizations undertaking the shift in management philosophy to participative management. We consistently meet managers who are checking progress, mapping out tactics, confronting detours, and trying to keep the "kids in the backseat quiet." What started out as a "grand journey" is becoming a "never-to-be-repeated experience." This book is not meant to be a travel guide for visiting the world of participative management. Instead, it is meant to provide some *working* answers that might reduce the anxiety intrinsic to making a necessary and challenging business decision.

In this book, we want to provide you with a different slant to participative management. Most of the literature in the field is "missionary" in nature, extolling the benefits of a new way of working. They make promises to managers of a nirvana that is hard to ignore. We maintain that reality is the road to nirvana, and this book is about reality. We intend to share our experiences—both the failures and the successes. Our clients have allowed us to discuss their experiences in the hopes that other managers will either avoid some of the pitfalls or not feel that they alone have moments of doubt.

This is not a negative book. We believe deeply in the philosophy of participative management. However, good intentions alone are not enough to achieve success.

INTRODUCTION

WHAT MAKES THIS BOOK DIFFERENT?

Several features make this book different:

1. We focus on the individual in an organization. Participative management cannot be successful if there is not a proper reconciliation of the individual's needs and the organization's need to change.
2. We emphasize the difficulties faced in a move to participative management. Managers cannot fight a battle without being aware of the battlefield.
3. We provide no panacea. Creating a challenging and fulfilling workplace is not as simple as many consultants would like managers to believe. There is no *one* right way. Success is based on using a wide range of strategies to get to a clearly defined end point.
4. We introduce participative management as a "business decision." Our approach is simple: "Don't do participative management for your employees' sake; do it for the business' sake. We believe the purpose is business stability and growth, not employee fulfillment. Participation is a means, not an end.

WHAT IS PARTICIPATIVE MANAGEMENT?

Although the literature of management abounds with definitions of participative management, we could not find a satisfactory definition. In our view, participative management is a philosophy that demands that organizational decision making

WHAT IS PARTICIPATIVE MANAGEMENT?

be made in such a way that *input* and *responsibility* are extended to the lowest level appropriate to the decision being made.

The purpose of participative management is to ensure that effective decisions are made by the right people. Empowerment is a means to achieve participative management. It is the mechanism by which responsibility is vested in teams or individuals. Involvement, on the other hand, is the mechanism for ensuring appropriate input to decision making. Thus, empowerment and involvement become the building blocks for a participative management philosophy.

Throughout this book, the concept of teams plays an important part. Consistent with our definition of participative management, teams are another tool in the participative management toolbox. Although teams are critical for participative management, they are not participative management by themselves. If a team is created but not consulted or empowered, participative management will not exist. Many writers and practicing consultants tend to use football or hockey teams as effective analogies for participative management. We have a small problem with this. Football and hockey assume that everyone is involved in every play. Each player on the field or ice surface has a totally interdependent role with everyone else. In business, however, this is not necessarily true. Very few teams are so integrated that true interdependence is required. Baseball seems to be a better example for understanding teams in a participative management philosophy. In baseball, although there is definitely a need for role specialization and goal clarity, it is not uncommon for a left fielder to go three or four innings and never touch the ball. The game goes on, but the left fielder has little, if any ability to influence the course of events. What is critical for the team is that when the left fielder is needed, he or she is ready to carry out the designated responsibilities.

INTRODUCTION

Participative management is more like baseball in that each individual is not involved in every decision in the organization, but is required to be effective when his or her input is required. Participative management also requires that the organization and its leadership recognize when to involve people and when to let them get on with running the business. Many of these issues are covered in later chapters.

WHY PARTICIPATIVE MANAGEMENT?

Every organization moves to participative management for its own reasons. However, there seem to be two recurring themes:

1. Sharing success rather than hoarding failure. The traditional methods of management are inefficient for many organizations. Many companies are seeing market share and size diminish due to loss of quality standards, increasing militancy of an unhappy workforce, or a competitor's increased effectiveness. In considering solutions, many companies focus on the Japanese philosophy. Roger Smith, chief executive officer of General Motors, believed that the lesson to be learned from the Japanese was robotics. Xerox opted for customer service as its main competitive response. Ford has taken the philosophy that "quality is job one." All these strategies include some form of participative management as part of the total solution. Increasing business effectiveness is *impossible* without increasing the effectiveness of the human resources in the company. Participative management provides an opportunity to share responsibility, risk, and success. The old days of the heroic leader who battles impossible odds on behalf of his or her people are over. Organizations know that sharing the responsibility with