

# **ROBUST STATISTICS**

---

---

**Peter J. Huber**

A volume in the Wiley Series in Probability and Mathematical Statistics:  
Ralph A. Bradley, J. Stuart Hunter, David G. Kendall, and Geoffrey S.  
Watson—Advisory Editors

# **Robust Statistics**

**PETER J. HUBER**

*Professor of Statistics  
Harvard University  
Cambridge, Massachusetts*

**John Wiley & Sons**

**New York • Chichester • Brisbane • Toronto**

Copyright © 1981 by John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

All rights reserved. Published simultaneously in Canada.

Reproduction or translation of any part of this work beyond that permitted by Sections 107 or 108 of the 1976 United States Copyright Act without the permission of the copyright owner is unlawful. Requests for permission or further information should be addressed to the Permissions Department, John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

***Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data:***

Huber, Peter J

Robust statistics.

(Wiley series in probability and mathematical statistics)

“A Wiley-Interscience publication.”

Includes index.

1. Robust statistics. I. Title.

QA276.H785 519.5 80-18627

ISBN 0-471-41805-6

Printed in the United States of America

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

# WILEY SERIES IN PROBABILITY AND MATHEMATICAL STATISTICS

ESTABLISHED BY WALTER A. SHEWHART AND SAMUEL S. WILKS  
Editors

*Ralph A. Bradley*  
*J. Stuart Hunter*

*David G. Kendall*  
*Geoffrey S. Watson*

## *Probability and Mathematical Statistics*

- ADLER • The Geometry of Random Fields  
ANDERSON • The Statistical Analysis of Time Series  
ANDERSON • An Introduction to Multivariate Statistical Analysis  
ARAUJO and GINE • The Central Limit Theorem for Real and Banach  
Valued Random Variables  
ARNOLD • The Theory of Linear Models and Multivariate Analysis  
BARLOW, BARTHOLOMEW, BREMNER, and BRUNK • Statistical  
Inference Under Order Restrictions  
BARNETT • Comparative Statistical Inference  
BHATTACHARYYA and JOHNSON • Statistical Concepts and Methods  
BILLINGSLEY • Probability and Measure  
CASSEL, SARNDAL, and WRETMAN • Foundations of Inference in  
Survey Sampling  
DE FINETTI • Theory of Probability, Volumes I and II  
DOOB • Stochastic Processes  
FELLER • An Introduction to Probability Theory and Its Applications,  
Volume I, *Third Edition*, Revised  
FELLER • An Introduction to Probability Theory and Its Applications,  
Volume II, *Second Edition*  
FULLER • Introduction to Statistical Time Series  
GRENANDER • Abstract Inference  
HANNAN • Multiple Time Series  
HANSEN, HURWITZ, and MADOW • Sample Survey Methods and  
Theory, Volumes I and II  
HARDING and KENDALL • Stochastic Geometry  
HOEL • Introduction to Mathematical Statistics, *Fourth Edition*  
HUBER • Robust Statistics  
IOSIFESCU • Finite Markov Processes and Applications  
ISAACSON and MADSEN • Markov Chains  
KAGAN, LINNIK, and RAO • Characterization Problems in Mathematical  
Statistics  
KENDALL and HARDING • Stochastic Analysis  
LAHA and ROHATGI • Probability Theory  
LARSON • Introduction to Probability Theory and Statistical Inference,  
*Second Edition*  
LARSON • Introduction to the Theory of Statistics  
LEHMANN • Testing Statistical Hypotheses  
MATHERON • Random Sets and Integral Geometry  
MATTHES, KERSTAN, and MECKE • Infinitely Divisible Point Processes  
PARZEN • Modern Probability Theory and Its Applications  
PURI and SEN • Nonparametric Methods in Multivariate Analysis  
RANGLES and WOLFE • Introduction to the Theory of Nonparametric  
Statistics  
RAO • Linear Statistical Inference and Its Applications, *Second Edition*  
ROHATGI • An Introduction to Probability Theory and Mathematical  
Statistics  
SCHEFFE • The Analysis of Variance  
SEBER • Linear Regression Analysis  
SERFLING • Approximation Theorems of Mathematical Statistics  
TJUR • Probability Based on Radon Measures

*Probability and Mathematical Statistics (Continued)*

- WILLIAMS • Diffusions, Markov Processes, and Martingales, Volume I: Foundations  
ZACKS • Theory of Statistical Inference

*Applied Probability and Statistics*

- ANDERSON, AUQUIER, HAUCK, OAKES, VANDAELE, and WEISBERG • Statistical Methods for Comparative Studies  
ARTHANARI and DODGE • Mathematical Programming in Statistics  
BAILEY • The Elements of Stochastic Processes with Applications to the Natural Sciences  
BAILEY • Mathematics, Statistics and Systems for Health  
BARNETT and LEWIS • Outliers in Statistical Data  
BARTHOLOMEW • Stochastic Models for Social Processes, *Second Edition*  
BARTHOLOMEW and FORBES • Statistical Techniques for Manpower Planning  
BECK and ARNOLD • Parameter Estimation in Engineering and Science  
BELSLEY, KUH, and WELSCH • Regression Diagnostics: Identifying Influential Data and Sources of Collinearity  
BENNETT and FRANKLIN • Statistical Analysis in Chemistry and the Chemical Industry  
BHAT • Elements of Applied Stochastic Processes  
BLOOMFIELD • Fourier Analysis of Time Series: An Introduction  
BOX • R. A. Fisher, The Life of a Scientist  
BOX and DRAPER • Evolutionary Operation: A Statistical Method for Process Improvement  
BOX, HUNTER, and HUNTER • Statistics for Experimenters: An Introduction to Design, Data Analysis, and Model Building  
BROWN and HOLLANDER • Statistics: A Biomedical Introduction  
BROWNLEE • Statistical Theory and Methodology in Science and Engineering, *Second Edition*  
BURY • Statistical Models in Applied Science  
CHAMBERS • Computational Methods for Data Analysis  
CHATTERJEE and PRICE • Regression Analysis by Example  
CHERNOFF and MOSES • Elementary Decision Theory  
CHOW • Analysis and Control of Dynamic Economic Systems  
CLELLAND, BROWN, and deCANI • Basic Statistics with Business Applications, *Second Edition*  
COCHRAN • Sampling Techniques, *Third Edition*  
COCHRAN and COX • Experimental Designs, *Second Edition*  
CONOVER • Practical Nonparametric Statistics, *Second Edition*  
CORNELL • Experiments with Mixtures: Designs, Models and The Analysis of Mixture Data  
COX • Planning of Experiments  
DANIEL • Biostatistics: A Foundation for Analysis in the Health Sciences, *Second Edition*  
DANIEL • Applications of Statistics to Industrial Experimentation  
DANIEL and WOOD • Fitting Equations to Data: Computer Analysis of Multifactor Data, *Second Edition*  
DAVID • Order Statistics, *Second Edition*  
DEMING • Sample Design in Business Research  
DODGE and ROMIG • Sampling Inspection Tables, *Second Edition*  
DRAPER and SMITH • Applied Regression Analysis, *Second Edition*  
DUNN • Basic Statistics: A Primer for the Biomedical Sciences, *Second Edition*  
DUNN and CLARK • Applied Statistics: Analysis of Variance and Regression  
ELANDT-JOHNSON • Probability Models and Statistical Methods in Genetics  
ELANDT-JOHNSON and JOHNSON • Survival Models and Data Analysis

*continued on back*

*Applied Probability and Statistics (Continued)*

- FLEISS • Statistical Methods for Rates and Proportions, *Second Edition*  
GALAMBOS • The Asymptotic Theory of Extreme Order Statistics  
GIBBONS, OLKIN, and SOBEL • Selecting and Ordering Populations: A New Statistical Methodology  
GNANADESIKAN • Methods for Statistical Data Analysis of Multivariate Observations  
GOLDBERGER • Econometric Theory  
GOLDSTEIN and DILLON • Discrete Discriminant Analysis  
GROSS and CLARK • Survival Distributions: Reliability Applications in the Biomedical Sciences  
GROSS and HARRIS • Fundamentals of Queueing Theory  
GUPTA and PANCHAPAKESAN • Multiple Decision Procedures: Theory and Methodology of Selecting and Ranking Populations  
GUTTMAN, WILKS, and HUNTER • Introductory Engineering Statistics, *Second Edition*  
HAHN and SHAPIRO • Statistical Models in Engineering  
HALD • Statistical Tables and Formulas  
HALD • Statistical Theory with Engineering Applications  
HARTIGAN • Clustering Algorithms  
HILDEBRAND, LAING, and ROSENTHAL • Prediction Analysis of Cross Classifications  
HOEL • Elementary Statistics, *Fourth Edition*  
HOLLANDER and WOLFE • Nonparametric Statistical Methods  
JAGERS • Branching Processes with Biological Applications  
JESSEN • Statistical Survey Techniques  
JOHNSON and KOTZ • Distributions in Statistics  
Discrete Distributions  
Continuous Univariate Distributions—1  
Continuous Univariate Distributions—2  
Continuous Multivariate Distributions  
JOHNSON and KOTZ • Urn Models and Their Application: An Approach to Modern Discrete Probability Theory  
JOHNSON and LEONE • Statistics and Experimental Design in Engineering and the Physical Sciences, Volumes I and II, *Second Edition*  
JUDGE, GRIFFITHS, HILL and LEE • The Theory and Practice of Econometrics  
KALBFLEISCH and PRENTICE • The Statistical Analysis of Failure Time Data  
KEENEY and RAIFFA • Decisions with Multiple Objectives  
LANCASTER • An Introduction to Medical Statistics  
LEAMER • Specification Searches: Ad Hoc Inference with Nonexperimental Data  
McNEIL • Interactive Data Analysis  
MANN, SCHAFER and SINGPURWALLA • Methods for Statistical Analysis of Reliability and Life Data  
MEYER • Data Analysis for Scientists and Engineers  
MILLER, EFRON, BROWN, and MOSES • Biostatistics Casebook  
OTNES and ENOCHSON • Applied Time Series Analysis: Volume I, Basic Techniques  
OTNES and ENOCHSON • Digital Time Series Analysis  
POLLOCK • The Algebra of Econometrics  
PRENTER • Splines and Variational Methods  
RAO and MITRA • Generalized Inverse of Matrices and Its Applications  
RIPLEY • Spatial Statistics  
SCHUSS • Theory and Applications of Stochastic Differential Equations  
SEAL • Survival Probabilities: The Goal of Risk Theory  
SEARLE • Linear Models  
SPRINGER • The Algebra of Random Variables  
UPTON • The Analysis of Cross-Tabulated Data  
WEISBERG • Applied Linear Regression  
WHITTLE • Optimization Under Constraints

*Applied Probability and Statistics (Continued)*

- WILLIAMS • A Sampler on Sampling
- WONNACOTT and WONNACOTT • Econometrics, *Second Edition*
- WONNACOTT and WONNACOTT • Introductory Statistics, *Third Edition*
- WONNACOTT and WONNACOTT • Introductory Statistics for Business and Economics, *Second Edition*
- WONNACOTT and WONNACOTT • Regression: A Second Course in Statistics
- ZELLNER • An Introduction to Bayesian Inference in Econometrics

*Tracts on Probability and Statistics*

- BARNDORFF-NIELSEN • Information and Exponential Families in Statistical Theory
- BHATTACHARYA and RAO • Normal Approximation and Asymptotic Expansions
- BIBBY and TOUTENBERG • Prediction and Improved Estimation in Linear Models
- BILLINGSLEY • Convergence of Probability Measures
- JARDINE and SIBSON • Mathematical Taxonomy
- KELLY • Reversibility and Stochastic Networks
- KINGMAN • Regenerative Phenomena

# Preface

The present monograph is the first systematic, book-length exposition of robust statistics. The technical term “robust” was coined only in 1953 (by G. E. P. Box), and the subject matter acquired recognition as a legitimate topic for investigation only in the mid-sixties, but it certainly never was a revolutionary new concept. Among the leading scientists of the late nineteenth and early twentieth century, there were several practicing statisticians (to name but a few: the astronomer S. Newcomb, the astrophysicist A. Eddington, and the geophysicist H. Jeffreys), who had a perfectly clear, operational understanding of the idea; they knew the dangers of long-tailed error distributions, they proposed probability models for gross errors, and they even invented excellent robust alternatives to the standard estimates, which were rediscovered only recently. But for a long time theoretical statisticians tended to shun the subject as being inexact and “dirty.” My 1964 paper may have helped to dispel such prejudices. Amusingly (and disturbingly), it seems that lately a kind of bandwagon effect has evolved, that the pendulum has swung to the other extreme, and that “robust” has now become a magic word, which is invoked in order to add respectability.

This book gives a solid foundation in robustness to both the theoretical and the applied statistician. The treatment is theoretical, but the stress is on concepts, rather than on mathematical completeness. The level of presentation is deliberately uneven: in some chapters simple cases are treated with mathematical rigor; in others the results obtained in the simple cases are transferred by analogy to more complicated situations (like multiparameter regression and covariance matrix estimation), where proofs are not always available (or are available only under unrealistically severe assumptions). Also selected numerical algorithms for computing robust estimates are described and, where possible, convergence proofs are given.

Chapter 1 gives a general introduction and overview; it is a must for every reader. Chapter 2 contains an account of the formal mathematical background behind qualitative and quantitative robustness, which can be skipped (or skimmed) if the reader is willing to accept certain results on faith. Chapter 3 introduces and discusses the three basic types of estimates ( $M$ -,  $L$ -, and  $R$ -estimates), and Chapter 4 treats the asymptotic minimax



theory for location estimates; both chapters again are musts. The remaining chapters branch out in different directions and are fairly independent and self-contained; they can be read or taught in more or less any order.

The book does not contain exercises—I found it hard to invent a sufficient number of problems in this area that were neither trivial nor too hard—so it does not satisfy some of the formal criteria for a textbook. Nevertheless I have successfully used various stages of the manuscript as such in graduate courses.

The book also has no pretensions of being encyclopedic. I wanted to cover only those aspects and tools that I personally considered to be the most important ones. Some omissions and gaps are simply due to the fact that I currently lack time to fill them in, but do not want to procrastinate any longer (the first draft for this book goes back to 1972). Others are intentional. For instance, adaptive estimates were excluded because I would now prefer to classify them with nonparametric rather than with robust statistics, under the heading of nonparametric efficient estimation. The so-called Bayesian approach to robustness confounds the subject with admissible estimation in an *ad hoc* parametric supermodel, and still lacks reliable guidelines on how to select the supermodel and the prior so that we end up with something robust. The coverage of *L*- and *R*-estimates was cut back from earlier plans because they do not generalize well and get awkward to compute and to handle in multiparameter situations.

A large part of the final draft was written when I was visiting Harvard University in the fall of 1977; my thanks go to the students, in particular to P. Rosenbaum and Y. Yashizoe, who then sat in my seminar course and provided many helpful comments.

P. J. HUBER

*Cambridge, Massachusetts*  
*July 1980*

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>GENERALITIES</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	Why Robust Procedures?	1
1.2	What Should a Robust Procedure Achieve?	5
1.3	Qualitative Robustness,	7
1.4	Quantitative Robustness,	10
1.5	Infinitesimal Aspects,	13
1.6	Optimal Robustness,	16
1.7	Computation of Robust Estimates,	17
<b>2</b>	<b>THE WEAK TOPOLOGY AND ITS METRIZATION</b>	<b>20</b>
2.1	General Remarks,	20
2.2	The Weak Topology,	20
2.3	Lévy and Prohorov Metrics,	25
2.4	The Bounded Lipschitz Metric,	29
2.5	Fréchet and Gâteaux Derivatives,	34
2.6	Hampel's Theorem,	40
<b>3</b>	<b>THE BASIC TYPES OF ESTIMATES</b>	<b>43</b>
3.1	General Remarks,	43
3.2	Maximum Likelihood Type Estimates ( <i>M</i> -Estimates),	43
3.3	Linear Combinations of Order Statistics ( <i>L</i> -Estimates),	55
3.4	Estimates Derived from Rank Tests ( <i>R</i> -Estimates),	61
3.5	Asymptotically Efficient <i>M</i> -, <i>L</i> -, and <i>R</i> -Estimates,	68
<b>4</b>	<b>ASYMPTOTIC MINIMAX THEORY FOR ESTIMATING A LOCATION PARAMETER</b>	<b>73</b>
4.1	General Remarks,	73
4.2	Minimax Bias,	74
4.3	Minimax Variance: Preliminaries,	76
4.4	Distributions Minimizing Fisher Information,	77

4.5	Determination of $F_0$ by Variational Methods,	82
4.6	Asymptotically Minimax $M$ -Estimates,	94
4.7	On the Minimax Property for $L$ - and $R$ -Estimates,	97
4.8	Descending $M$ -Estimates,	100
4.9	Questions of Asymmetric Contamination,	104
<b>5</b>	<b>SCALE ESTIMATES</b>	<b>107</b>
5.1	General Remarks,	107
5.2	$M$ -Estimates of Scale,	109
5.3	$L$ -Estimates of Scale,	110
5.4	$R$ -Estimates of Scale,	114
5.5	Asymptotically Efficient Scale Estimates,	116
5.6	Distributions Minimizing Fisher Information for Scale,	118
5.7	Minimax Properties,	122
<b>6</b>	<b>MULTIPARAMETER PROBLEMS, IN PARTICULAR JOINT ESTIMATION OF LOCATION AND SCALE</b>	<b>127</b>
6.1	General Remarks,	127
6.2	Consistency of $M$ -Estimates,	127
6.3	Asymptotic Normality of $M$ -Estimates,	132
6.4	Simultaneous $M$ -Estimates of Location and Scale,	135
6.5	$M$ -Estimates with Preliminary Estimates of Scale,	140
6.6	Quantitative Robustness Properties of Simultaneous Estimates for Location and Scale,	141
6.7	The Computation of $M$ -Estimates,	146
6.8	Studentizing,	148
<b>7</b>	<b>REGRESSION</b>	<b>153</b>
7.1	General Remarks,	153
7.2	The Classical Linear Least Squares Case,	155
7.3	Robustizing the Least Squares Approach,	162
7.4	Asymptotics of Robust Regression Estimates,	164
7.5	Conjectures and Empirical Results,	170
7.6	Asymptotic Covariances and Their Estimation,	172
7.7	Concomitant Scale Estimates,	175
7.8	Computation of Regression $M$ -Estimates,	179
7.9	Moderate Leverage Points,	192
7.10	Analysis of Variance,	195

<b>8</b>	<b>ROBUST COVARIANCE AND CORRELATION MATRICES</b>	<b>199</b>
8.1	General Remarks,	199
8.2	Estimation of Matrix Elements through Robust Variances,	202
8.3	Estimation of Matrix Elements through Robust Correlation,	204
8.4	An Affinely Invariant Approach,	211
8.5	Estimates Determined by Implicit Equations,	213
8.6	Existence and Uniqueness of Solutions,	215
8.7	Influence Functions and Qualitative Robustness,	223
8.8	Consistency and Asymptotic Normality,	226
8.9	Breakdown Point,	227
8.10	Least Informative Distributions,	229
8.11	Some Notes on Computation,	237
<b>9</b>	<b>ROBUSTNESS OF DESIGN</b>	<b>243</b>
9.1	General Remarks,	243
9.2	Minimax Global Fit,	243
9.3	Minimax Slope,	251
<b>10</b>	<b>EXACT FINITE SAMPLE RESULTS</b>	<b>253</b>
10.1	General Remarks,	253
10.2	Lower and Upper Probabilities and Capacities,	254
10.3	Robust Tests,	264
10.4	Sequential Tests,	273
10.5	The Neyman-Pearson Lemma for 2-Alternating Capacities,	275
10.6	Estimates Derived from Tests,	278
10.7	Minimax Interval Estimates,	282
<b>11</b>	<b>MISCELLANEOUS TOPICS</b>	<b>286</b>
11.1	Hampel's Extremal Problem,	286
11.2	Shrinking Neighborhoods,	290
	<b>REFERENCES</b>	<b>294</b>
	<b>INDEX</b>	<b>301</b>

## CHAPTER 1

# Generalities

### 1.1 WHY ROBUST PROCEDURES?

Statistical inferences are based only in part upon the observations. An equally important base is formed by prior assumptions about the underlying situation. Even in the simplest cases, there are explicit or implicit assumptions about randomness and independence, about distributional models, perhaps prior distributions for some unknown parameters, and so on.

These assumptions are not supposed to be exactly true—they are mathematically convenient rationalizations of an often fuzzy knowledge or belief. As in every other branch of applied mathematics, such rationalizations or simplifications are vital, and one justifies their use by appealing to a vague continuity or stability principle: a minor error in the mathematical model should cause only a small error in the final conclusions.

Unfortunately, this does not always hold. During the past decades one has become increasingly aware that some of the most common statistical procedures (in particular, those optimized for an underlying normal distribution) are excessively sensitive to seemingly minor deviations from the assumptions, and a plethora of alternative “robust” procedures have been proposed.

The word “robust” is loaded with many—sometimes inconsistent—connotations. We use it in a relatively narrow sense: for our purposes, *robustness signifies insensitivity to small deviations from the assumptions.*

Primarily, we are concerned with *distributional robustness*: the shape of the true underlying distribution deviates slightly from the assumed model (usually the Gaussian law). This is both the most important case and the best understood one. Much less is known about what happens when the other standard assumptions of statistics are not quite satisfied and about the appropriate safeguards in these other cases.

The following example, due to Tukey (1960), shows the dramatic lack of distributional robustness of some of the classical procedures.

**Example 1.1** Assume that we have a large, randomly mixed batch of  $n$  “good” and “bad” observations  $x_i$  of the same quantity  $\mu$ . Each single observation with probability  $1-\varepsilon$  is a “good” one, with probability  $\varepsilon$  a “bad” one, where  $\varepsilon$  is a small number. In the former case  $x_i$  is  $\mathcal{N}(\mu, \sigma^2)$ , in the latter  $\mathcal{N}(\mu, 9\sigma^2)$ . In other words all observations have the same mean, but the errors of some are increased by a factor of 3.

Equivalently, we could say that the  $x_i$  are independent, identically distributed with the common underlying distribution

$$F(x) = (1-\varepsilon)\Phi\left(\frac{x-\mu}{\sigma}\right) + \varepsilon\Phi\left(\frac{x-\mu}{3\sigma}\right), \quad (1.1)$$

where

$$\Phi(x) = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \int_{-\infty}^x e^{-y^2/2} dy \quad (1.2)$$

is the standard normal cumulative.

Two time-honored measures of scatter are the mean absolute deviation

$$d_n = \frac{1}{n} \sum |x_i - \bar{x}| \quad (1.3)$$

and the mean square deviation

$$s_n = \left[ \frac{1}{n} \sum (x_i - \bar{x})^2 \right]^{1/2}. \quad (1.4)$$

There was a dispute between Eddington (1914, p. 147) and Fisher (1920, footnote on p. 762) about the relative merits of  $d_n$  and  $s_n$ . Eddington advocated the use of the former: “This is contrary to the advice of most textbooks; but it can be shown to be true.” Fisher seemingly settled the matter by pointing out that for normal observations  $s_n$  is about 12% more efficient than  $d_n$ .

Of course, the two statistics measure different characteristics of the error distribution. For instance, if the errors are exactly normal,  $s_n$  converges to  $\sigma$ , while  $d_n$  converges to  $\sqrt{2/\pi} \sigma \approx 0.80\sigma$ . So we must be precise about how their performances are to be compared; we use the asymptotic relative

efficiency (ARE) of  $d_n$  relative to  $s_n$ , defined as follows:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{ARE}(\epsilon) &= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\text{var}(s_n)/(Es_n)^2}{\text{var}(d_n)/(Ed_n)^2} \\ &= \frac{\left[ \frac{3(1+80\epsilon)}{(1+8\epsilon)^2} - 1 \right] / 4}{\frac{\pi(1+8\epsilon)}{2(1+2\epsilon)^2} - 1}. \end{aligned}$$

The results are summarized in the Exhibit 1.1.1.

The result is disquieting: just 2 bad observations in 1000 suffice to offset the 12% advantage of the mean square error, and  $\text{ARE}(\epsilon)$  reaches a maximum value greater than 2 at about  $\epsilon=0.05$ .

This is particularly unfortunate since in the physical sciences typical "good data" samples appear to be well modeled by an error law of the form (1.1) with  $\epsilon$  in the range between 0.01 and 0.1. (This does not imply that these samples contain between 1% and 10% gross errors, although this is very often true; the above law (1.1) may just be a convenient description of a slightly longer-tailed than normal distribution.) Thus it becomes painfully clear that the naturally occurring deviations from the idealized model are large enough to render meaningless the traditional asymptotic optimality theory: in practice we should certainly prefer  $d_n$  to  $s_n$ , since it is better for all  $\epsilon$  between 0.002 and 0.5.

$\epsilon$	$\text{ARE}(\epsilon)$
0	0.876
0.001	0.948
0.002	1.016
0.005	1.198
0.01	1.439
0.02	1.752
0.05	2.035
0.10	1.903
0.15	1.689
0.25	1.371
0.5	1.017
1.0	0.876

**Exhibit 1.1.1** Asymptotic efficiency of mean absolute relative to mean square deviation.

From Huber (1977b), with permission of the publisher.

To avoid misunderstandings, we should hasten to emphasize what is *not* implied here. First, the above does not imply that we advocate the use of the mean absolute deviation (there are still better estimates of scale). Second, some people have argued that the example is unrealistic insofar as the “bad” observations will stick out as outliers, so any conscientious statistician will do something about them before calculating the mean square error. This is beside the point; outlier rejection followed by the mean square error might very well beat the performance of the mean absolute error, but we are concerned here with the behavior of the *unmodified* classical estimates.

The example clearly has to do with longtailedness: lengthening the tails of the underlying distribution explodes the variance of  $s_n$  ( $d_n$  is much less affected). Shortening the tails, on the other hand, produces quite negligible effects on the distributions of the estimates. (It may impair the absolute efficiency by decreasing the asymptotic Cramér-Rao bound, but the latter is so unstable under small changes of the distribution that this effect cannot be taken very seriously.)

The sensitivity of classical procedures to longtailedness is typical and not limited to this example. As a consequence “distributionally robust” and “outlier resistant,” although conceptually distinct, are practically synonymous notions. Any reasonable, formal or informal, procedure for rejecting outliers will prevent the worst.

We might therefore ask whether robust procedures are needed at all; perhaps a two-step approach would suffice:

- (1) First clean the data by applying some rule for outlier rejection.
- (2) Then use classical estimation and testing procedures on the remainder.

Would these steps do the same job in a simpler way?

Unfortunately they will not, for the following reasons:

- (1) It is rarely possible to separate the two steps cleanly; for instance, in multiparameter regression problems outliers are difficult to recognize unless we have reliable, robust estimates for the parameters.
- (2) Even if the original batch of observations consists of normal observations interspersed with some gross errors, the cleaned data will not be normal (there will be statistical errors of both kinds, false rejections and false retentions), and the situation is even worse when the original batch derives from a genuine nonnormal distribution, instead of from a gross-error framework. Therefore the classical normal theory is not applicable to cleaned samples, and the



actual performance of such a two-step procedure may be more difficult to work out than that of a straight robust procedure.

- (3) It is an empirical fact that the best rejection procedures do not quite reach the performance of the best robust procedures. The latter apparently are superior because they can make a smooth transition between full acceptance and full rejection of an observation.

## 1.2 WHAT SHOULD A ROBUST PROCEDURE ACHIEVE?

We are adopting what might be called an “applied parametric viewpoint”: we have a parametric model, which hopefully is a good approximation to the true underlying situation, but we cannot and do not assume that it is exactly correct. Therefore any statistical procedure should possess the following desirable features:

- (1) It should have a reasonably good (optimal or nearly optimal) efficiency at the assumed model.
- (2) It should be robust in the sense that small deviations from the model assumptions should impair the performance only slightly, that is, the latter (described, say, in terms of the asymptotic variance of an estimate, or of the level and power of a test) should be close to the nominal value calculated at the model.
- (3) Somewhat larger deviations from the model should not cause a catastrophe.

If asymptotic performance criteria are used, some care is needed. In particular, the convergence should be uniform over a neighborhood of the model, or there should be at least a one-sided uniform bound, because otherwise we cannot guarantee robustness for any finite  $n$ , no matter how large  $n$  is. This point has often been overlooked in the past.

It should be emphasized once more that the occurrence of gross errors in a small fraction of the observations is to be regarded as a small deviation, and that, in view of the extreme sensitivity of some classical procedures, a primary goal of robust procedures is to safeguard against gross errors.

The literature contains many other explicit and implicit goals for robust procedures, for example, high asymptotic *relative efficiency* (relative to some classical reference procedures), or high *absolute efficiency*, and this either for completely arbitrary (sufficiently smooth) underlying distributions, or for a specific parametric family.