

CRITICAL ESSAYS ON

*Margaret Fuller*

MYERSON

# *Critical Essays on Margaret Fuller*

---

*Joel Myerson*

**G. K. Hall & Co. • Boston, Massachusetts**

Copyright © 1980 by Joel Myerson

---

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data*

Main entry under title:

Critical essays on Margaret Fuller.

(Critical essays on American literature)

Bibliography:

Includes index.

1. Ossoli, Sarah Margaret Fuller, marchesa d', 1810-1850—Criticism and interpretation—Addresses, essays, lectures. I. Myerson, Joel. II. Series.

PS2507.C7 818'.3'09 79-17244

ISBN 0-8161-8283-3

---

*This publication is printed on permanent/durable acid-free paper*  
MANUFACTURED IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

# CRITICAL ESSAYS ON AMERICAN LITERATURE

This series seeks to publish the most important reprinted criticism on writers and topics in American literature along with, in various volumes, original essays, interviews, bibliographies, letters, manuscript sections, and other materials brought to public attention for the first time. Joel Myerson's volume on Margaret Fuller represents the most substantial collection of scholarship on this writer ever published. In addition to reprinted reviews and essays, it contains an important overview of scholarship by Myerson and an important new essay on Fuller's *Woman in the Nineteenth Century* by Marie Oleson Urbanski. We are confident that this collection will make a permanent and significant contribution to American literary scholarship.

JAMES NAGEL, GENERAL EDITOR

*Northeastern University*

# INTRODUCTION

Critical commentary on Margaret Fuller has always been marked by a degree of personalism, for few writers have been able to judge Fuller's works without bringing in her personality as well. In contemporary reviews of her works she is portrayed as a perceptive and astringent critic of American life and letters, while at the same time she is criticized for arguing feminism and being a Transcendentalist. Recent criticism, too, seems unable to avoid bringing in biography and the opportunity to discuss her admittedly colorful life.

Realizing that her position in life would have been different and much higher had she been a man, Fuller from youth concentrated on cultivating her mental powers and competing with men on purely intellectual terms. The pattern of her life—from prodigy to author to revolutionary—is not only intrinsically interesting, but also influenced the lives of those who knew her. Horace Greeley, Nathaniel Hawthorne, Henry David Thoreau, and especially Ralph Waldo Emerson, whose usually defensive reserves she tried to break down, were all affected by her during important phases of their lives. Fuller's personality and what happened when she came in conflict with the restraints of the time are of interest to all students of American literature and the history of women in America. This interest is reflected in the large body of criticism written about Fuller.

Early studies of Fuller examined the woman, not the writer. The 1852 *Memoirs of Margaret Fuller Ossoli* portrayed Fuller as a self-centered and aloof person, a picture that Thomas Wentworth Higginson tried to balance in his 1884 biography. In this reaction to her life by contemporaries and later writers, one can trace the history of woman's position in America: as woman's role became less confining, the less traditional aspects of Fuller's life—her individualism, her aggressive intellectuality, her romantic liason with her future husband Ossoli—became more acceptable. More recent studies have centered on her feminist positions, her interest in continental—and especially German—literatures, and her critical writings.

In choosing the contents for *Critical Essays on Margaret Fuller*, I have tried to select a series of works that would accurately reflect criticism on Fuller from 1840 to the present. Because every book-length study of Fuller is in print and readily available in libraries, I have decided not to reprint sections from these books, preferring instead to make available less accessible works of equal quality. I have also avoided the “standard” works, such as Higginson's biography or the *Memoirs*, because they are easily found and because they have already been quoted at length in other books on Fuller. This volume, then, complements the book-length publications on Fuller already available with essays that have not been, in nearly every case, reprinted.

William J. Pabodie's review of the first number of the *Dial* in July 1840

shows that, from the start, critics reviewed Fuller more often than they did her works. The three reviews of *Summer on the Lakes, in 1843* show the varied reactions of men who knew her: James Freeman Clarke, a friend, praises the book; Caleb Stetson, an acquaintance, writes a mixed review; and Orestes A. Brownson, who disliked Fuller, slashes the book.

The six reviews of *Woman in the Nineteenth Century* also reflect the personalism involved in Fuller's contemporary reception. Lydia Maria Child and Charles Lane, both reformers sympathetic to the Transcendentalists, praise the work, while Brownson, who was not impressed by Transcendentalism, pans it. Both Charles F. Briggs and the *Ladies' National Magazine* are put off by claims for female equality, and this is reflected in the reviews. Brownson and Briggs, as well as Frederic Dan Huntington are all disturbed by the "peculiarities of style and manner" they see among the Transcendentalists, including Fuller, and this colors their reviews. The six reviews of *Papers on Literature and Art* show a more balanced approach, as they mostly avoid personal comments. But, again, Fuller's "Transcendental" style is attacked, even as her judgments are, for the most part, upheld. Not surprisingly, the seven reviews of the *Memoirs of Margaret Fuller Ossoli*, the biographical work put together by Emerson, William Henry Channing, and Clarke, reflect a great deal of personal criticism of Fuller's life and personality.

The other essays reprinted here fall into two groups: personal comments by her contemporaries (and the controversies over them) and general critical assessments of her work.

The personal comments on Fuller by Rufus W. Griswold, Edgar Allan Poe, Matthew Arnold, Caroline Healey Dall, A. Bronson Alcott, Harriet Martineau, and Henry James also show how Fuller's personality influenced their response to her writings. James Russell Lowell's poetic attacks on Fuller, the result of her negative comments on his poetry, should be read in conjunction with Martin Duberman's summary of the events. Harry R. Warfel's piece on Emerson points out many of the problems in that relationship, as does the selection from O. W. Firkins. The essays by Julian Hawthorne, Frederick T. Fuller, Oscar Cargill, and Austin Warren all comment on Fuller and Hawthorne. The anonymous article on "The Real Margaret Fuller" reinforces the problem Fuller had in gaining critical acceptance because of her personality. More positively, the essays by Harriet Hall Johnson and Granville Hicks show Fuller as, respectively, a dedicated teacher and a gifted conversationalist. Madeleine B. Stern's description of the challenges presented by studying Fuller's life is an excellent summary statement for this group of essays.

The twentieth-century essays here reprinted all deal with Fuller's writings. Arthur R. Schultz and Henry A. Pochmann both evaluate Fuller's works on German literature. Roland Crozier Burton and Wilma R. Ebbitt discuss Fuller's critical powers. Francis E. Kearns examines Fuller and abolitionism, while Vernon Louis Parrington and Margaret V. Allen present an overview of Fuller's life and writings. Marie Olesen Urbanski's essay, written especially for this volume, concludes the selections with a detailed study of one work, *Woman in the Nineteenth Century*.

The standard bibliography of writings by Fuller is Joel Myerson, *Margaret Fuller: A Descriptive Bibliography* (Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1978). Of the nearly 350 articles, essays, and poems Fuller contributed to newspapers and periodicals, most remain uncollected. Fuller published five books during her life: *Conversations with Goethe in the Last Years of His Life* (Boston: Hilliard, Gray, 1839); *Günderode* (Boston: Elizabeth Peabody, 1842); *Summer on the Lakes, in 1843* (Boston: Charles C. Little and James Brown, 1844); *Woman in the Nineteenth Century* (New York: Greeley & McElrath, 1845); and *Papers on Literature and Art*, 2 vols. (New York: Wiley & Putnam, 1846). The first two, translations from the German, have not been reprinted since 1852 and 1861, respectively. However, a new facsimile reprinting of *Conversations with Goethe* will be published in 1979 by Brunner/Mazel of Larchmont, New York, with an introduction by Joel Myerson. The University of South Carolina Press will publish, also in 1979, a facsimile of the 1845 *Woman in the Nineteenth Century*, with an introduction by Madeleine B. Stern and a textual afterward by Joel Myerson.

Arthur B. Fuller took up the task of editing his sister's writings after her death: his edited text of *Woman in the Nineteenth Century*, a few dozen uncollected *New York Tribune* essays, and many previously unpublished extracts from letters and journals appeared as *Woman in the Nineteenth Century, and Kindred Papers* (Boston: John P. Jewett, 1855); his edited texts of *Summer on the Lakes* and the travel letters from Europe to the *Tribune* were published as *At Home and Abroad* (Boston: Crosby, Nichols, 1856); reviews and miscellaneous writings from the *Western Messenger*, *Dial*, and *Tribune*, along with a generous selection of poetry, were collected as *Life Without and Life Within* (Boston: Brown, Taggard, and Chase, 1860). Fuller's translation of *Tasso* was added to the contents of *Papers on Literature and Art* to form *Art, Literature, and the Drama* (Boston: Brown, Taggard, and Chase, 1860). None of Arthur Fuller's texts are faithful to his sister's original intentions, since he attempted to polish her style and eliminate matter he believed unnecessary. An unrecovered and abortive work by Fuller is discussed in Alexander E. Jones, "Margaret Fuller's Attempt to Write Fiction," *Boston Public Library Quarterly*, 6 (April 1954), 67-73. There are three modern anthologies of Fuller's writings: *The Writings of Margaret Fuller*, ed. Mason Wade (New York: Viking, 1941); *Margaret Fuller: American Romantic*, ed. Perry Miller (Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday, 1963); and *Margaret Fuller: Essays on American Life and Letters*, ed. Joel Myerson (New Haven: College and University Press, 1978). Only the last one is edited according to modern textual standards and is fully annotated.

An edition of Fuller's letters—nearly 1,000—is being done by Robert N. Hudspeth, and when completed it will provide a much-needed single and reliable text. An annotated list of the letters Hudspeth has located, as well as a list of known but unlocated letters, has been published: "A Calendar of the Letters of Margaret Fuller," *Studies in the American Renaissance 1977*, ed. Joel Myerson (Boston: Twayne, 1978), pp. 49-143. At present, most of Fuller's manuscript letters are at the Boston Public Library and the Houghton Library

at Harvard University. A glimpse of the Boston Public Library's holdings is given in Margaret Munsterberg, "Margaret Fuller Centenary," *Boston Public Library Quarterly*, 2 (July 1950), 245–268. Published texts are generally untrustworthy. Many letters are printed in the *Memoirs of Margaret Fuller Ossoli*, 2 vols. (Boston: Phillips, Sampson, 1852); but the editors—Emerson, William Henry Channing, and James Freeman Clarke—took great liberties in transcription and lost many of the manuscripts as well. Most of Fuller's letters to Emerson are printed accurately in *The Letters of Ralph Waldo Emerson*, ed. Ralph L. Rusk, 6 vols. (New York: Columbia University Press, 1939); those to James Nathan, with whom she was romantically involved in New York, are printed with less accuracy in *Love-Letters of Margaret Fuller* (New York: D. Appleton, 1903). Three important collections of letters to Fuller are: *The Letters of James Freeman Clarke to Margaret Fuller*, ed. John Wesley Thomas (Hamburg: Cram, de Gruyter, 1957); Leona Rostenberg, "Mazzini to Margaret Fuller, 1847–1849," *American Historical Review*, 47 (October 1941), 73–80; and Leopold Willis, *The Friendship of Margaret Fuller D'Ossoli and Adam Mickiewicz* (New York: Polish Book Importing Company, 1947). Extensive selections from Fuller's European correspondence are given in Emma Detti, *Margaret Fuller Ossoli E I Suoi Corrispondenti* (Firenze: Félce Le Monnier, 1942 [Italian and English]).

There is no edition of Fuller's journals. Sections of them are printed inaccurately and at random in the *Memoirs*. Two journals have been edited with care: Joel Myerson, "Margaret Fuller's 1842 Journal: At Concord with the Emersons," *Harvard Library Bulletin*, 21 (July 1973), 320–340; and Leona Rostenberg, "Margaret Fuller's Roman Diary," *Journal of Modern History*, 12 (June 1940), 209–220.

The standard bibliography of writings about Fuller is Joel Myerson, *Margaret Fuller: An Annotated Secondary Bibliography* (New York: Burt Franklin, 1977). The bibliography in Madeleine B. Stern, *The Life of Margaret Fuller* (New York: Dutton, 1942), is excellent for material published through 1942 on the people and events surrounding Fuller.

Biographical information on Fuller is available in the many accounts of the Fuller family. Of general interest are [Arthur B. Fuller], "Historical Notices and Genealogy of the Fuller Family," *New England Historic and Genealogical Register*, 13 (October 1859), 351–363, revised and expanded as *Historical Notices of Thomas Fuller and His Descendants, with a Genealogy of the Fuller Family, 1638–1902* (Cambridge, Mass.: n. p., 1902); and Arthur B. Nichols, "Thomas Fuller and His Descendants," *Publications of the Cambridge Historical Society*, 28 (1943), 11–28. Fuller's father is the subject of Leona Rostenberg, "The Diary of Timothy Fuller in Congress, January 12–March 15, 1818," *New England Quarterly*, 12 (September 1939), 521–529. For information on Arthur B. Fuller, see "Arthur Buckminster Fuller," *Heralds of a Liberal Faith*, ed. Samuel A. Eliot (Boston: American Unitarian Association, 1910), III, 128–31; Richard F. Fuller, *Chaplain Fuller* (Boston: Walker, Wise, 1864); and [Thomas Wentworth Higginson], "Arthur Buckminster Fuller," *Harvard Me-*



*morial Biographies*, [ed. Higginson] (Cambridge, Mass.: Sever and Francis, 1866), I, 79–94. Richard Fuller's impressions of his sister and their contemporaries are given in *Recollections of Richard F. Fuller* (Boston: Privately printed, 1936) and in "The Younger Generation in 1840 from the Diary of a New England Boy," *Atlantic Monthly*, 136 (August 1925), 216–224; see also Walter Harding, "Visit to the Wachusett, July 1842 by Richard Fuller," *Thoreau Society Bulletin*, no. 121 (Fall 1972), 1–4. The Fuller Family Papers are in the Houghton Library of Harvard University.

There are a number of full-length biographies of Fuller. The *Memoirs* greatly influenced the public's picture of her for years to come: a picture of an egotistic, intellectually aloof person. An overly sympathetic portrait of Fuller by one who knew her is Julia Ward Howe, *Margaret Fuller (Marchesa Ossoli)* (Boston: Roberts, 1883). The best nineteenth-century biography is Thomas Wentworth Higginson, *Margaret Fuller Ossoli* (Boston: Houghton, Mifflin, 1884), which quotes extensively from her journals and letters in an attempt to correct the picture of Fuller as "a little too much in the clouds," the impression given in the *Memoirs*. The narrow focus of Katherine Anthony, *Margaret Fuller. A Psychological Biography* (New York: Harcourt, Brace and Howe, 1920), and the semi-fictional approach of Margaret Bell, *Margaret Fuller* (New York: Charles Boni, 1930), limit their usefulness today. Mason Wade, *Margaret Fuller: Whetstone of Genius* (New York: Viking, 1940), is a good general biography but lacks annotation, as does Faith Chipperfield, *In Quest of Love: The Life and Death of Margaret Fuller* (New York: Coward-McCann, 1957), a thesis-ridden book of little scholarly use. Paula Blanchard, *Margaret Fuller: From Transcendentalism to Revolution* (New York: Delacorte Press, 1978), is a good overview of Fuller's life. Fuller's last years are discussed in detail by Joseph Jay Deiss, *The Roman Years of Margaret Fuller* (New York: Thomas Y. Crowell, 1969), which quotes extensively from her writings during this period. The best introductory book on Fuller is Arthur W. Brown, *Margaret Fuller* (New York: Twayne, 1964), a conscientiously researched and concisely stated study of Fuller's life and writings. Bell Gale Chevigny, *The Woman and the Myth: Margaret Fuller's Life and Writings* (Old Westbury: Feminist Press, 1976), is an interesting collection of Fuller's writings and comments on her by contemporaries, tied together with a good running discussion of Fuller's life and thought. Good brief biographies, both by Joel Myerson, are the "Introduction" to Myerson's edition of *Margaret Fuller: Essays on American Life and Letters*, pp. 7–30, and the Fuller entry in *The American Renaissance in New England*, ed. Joel Myerson (Detroit: Gale Research, 1978), pp. 66–72. Stern's *The Life of Margaret Fuller* remains today as the most valuable biography. It is the most detailed and best researched life, and it is especially strong in describing Fuller's environment.

Certain aspects of Fuller's life have attracted scholars more than others. Her stay in Providence is the subject of Charles R. Crowe, "Transcendentalism and the Providence Literati," *Rhode Island History*, 14 (July 1955), 65–78; Henry L. Green, "The Greene-St. School of Providence, and Its Teachers,"

*Publications of the Rhode Island Historical Society*, n.s. 6 (January 1899), 199–219; Edward A. Hoyt and Loriman S. Brigham, "Glimpses of Margaret Fuller: The Green Street School and Florence," *New England Quarterly*, 29 (March 1956), 87–98; \*Harriet Hall Johnson, "Margaret Fuller as Known by her Scholars," *Christian Register*, 21 April 1910, pp. 426–429;<sup>1</sup> and Annie Russell Marble, "Margaret Fuller as Teacher," *Critic*, 43 (October 1903), 334–345. Manuscript journals kept by students in Fuller's school at Providence are located at the American Antiquarian Society, Brown University, and the University of South Carolina.

Fuller was best known for her conversational powers; unfortunately, the only extended account of her Conversations is in Caroline Healey Dall, *Margaret and Her Friends* (Boston: Roberts, 1895), discussed in Joel Myerson, "Mrs. Dall Edits Miss Fuller: The Story of *Margaret and Her Friends*," *Papers of the Bibliographical Society of America*, 72 (II Quarter 1978), 187–200. \*Granville Hicks, "A Conversation in Boston," *Sewanee Review*, 39 (April–June 1931), 129–143, writes an imaginative reconstruction of a Conversation by Fuller in November 1840.

Fuller's role as editor of the *Dial* can be traced in George Willis Cooke, *An Historical and Biographical Introduction to Accompany THE DIAL*, 2 vols. (Cleveland: Rowfant Club, 1902); Joel Myerson, *The New England Transcendentalists and the Dial: A History of the Magazine and Its Contributors* (Madison, N.J.: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 1979); and Myerson, "An Annotated List of Contributions to the Boston *Dial*," *Studies in Bibliography*, 26 (1973), 133–166. Her critical principles as editor are discussed in Helen Hennessy, "The *Dial*: Its Poetry and Poetic Criticism," *New England Quarterly*, 31 (March 1958), 66–87; and Donald F. Warders, "'The Progress of the Hour and the Day': A Critical Study of *The Dial*," Ph.D. dissertation, University of Kansas, 1973. A more general view of Fuller's periodical career is provided in Clarence L. F. Gohdes, *The Periodicals of American Transcendentalism* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1931).

A general account of Fuller's relations with Brook Farm is Karl Knortz, *Brook Farm und Margaret Fuller* (New York: Druck von Hermann Bartsch, 1886 [German]). Comments on Fuller at Brook Farm are listed in Joel Myerson, *Brook Farm: An Annotated Bibliography and Resources Guide* (New York: Garland, 1978). An excellent picture of her life at New York is in Constance Penta, "Fuller's Folly: The Eccentric World of Margaret Fuller and the Greeleys," M.A. thesis, Columbia University, 1960.

Much of Fuller's reputation lies not with her writings but rather with the effect she had upon those who knew her. Martha Ann Tull, "Contemporary Portraiture of Margaret Fuller," M.A. thesis, George Peabody College, 1929, presents a general survey of published comments by Fuller's contemporaries. Her relationship with Emerson—with Fuller unsuccessfully attempting to force him from his usually aloof position—has always fascinated scholars. Most of their correspondence is printed in *The Letters of Ralph Waldo Emerson*, ed.

<sup>1</sup>Items preceded by an asterisk are reprinted in the present volume.

Rusk. Fuller's comments in Joel Myerson, "Margaret Fuller's 1842 Journal: At Concord with the Emersons," are valuable, as are Emerson's comments on her in *The Correspondence of Emerson and Carlyle*, ed. Joseph Slater (New York: Columbia University Press, 1964), and *The Journals and Miscellaneous Notebooks of Ralph Waldo Emerson*, ed. William H. Gilman et al., 14 vols. to date (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1960– ). Interesting studies of their friendship are John Bard McNulty, "Emerson's Friends and the Essay on Friendship," *New England Quarterly*, 19 (September 1946), 390–394; Ralph L. Rusk, *The Life of Ralph Waldo Emerson* (New York: Scribners, 1949); Marie Olesen Urbanski, "The Ambivalence of Ralph Waldo Emerson Towards Margaret Fuller," *Thoreau Journal Quarterly*, 10 (July 1978), 26–36; and \*Harry R. Warfel, "Margaret Fuller and Ralph Waldo Emerson," *PMLA*, 50 (June 1935), 576–594.

No less intriguing is Fuller's relationship with Hawthorne, whose possible use of her in his writings is discussed by Francis E. Kearns, "Margaret Fuller as a Model for Hester Prynne," *Jahrbuch für Amerikastudien*, 10 (1965), 191–97; and Kelly Thurman, "Margaret Fuller in Two American Novels: *The Blithedale Romance* and *Elsie Venner*," M.A. thesis, University of Kentucky, 1945. Hawthorne's comments in *The American Notebooks*, ed. Claude M. Simpson (Columbus: Ohio State University Press, 1972), are important. General studies of the two are \*Oscar Cargill, "Nemesis and Nathaniel Hawthorne," *PMLA*, 52 (September 1937), 848–862; Paul John Eakin, "Margaret Fuller, Hawthorne, James, and Sexual Politics," *South Atlantic Quarterly*, 75 (Summer 1976), 323–338; William Peirce Randel, "Hawthorne, Channing, and Margaret Fuller," *American Literature*, 10 (January 1939), 472–476; and \*Austin Warren, "Hawthorne, Margaret Fuller, and 'Nemesis,'" *PMLA*, 54 (June 1939), 615–618.

Information concerning Fuller and Alcott can be found in *The Journals of Bronson Alcott*, ed. Odell Shepard (Boston: Little, Brown, 1938); *The Letters of A. Bronson Alcott*, ed. Richard L. Herrnstadt (Ames: Iowa State University Press, 1969); F. B. Sanborn and William T. Harris, *A. Bronson Alcott: His Life and Philosophy*, 2 vols. (Boston: Roberts, 1893); and Odell Shepard, *Pedlar's Progress: The Life of Bronson Alcott* (Boston: Little, Brown, 1937). Thoreau's relationship with Fuller can be followed in *The Correspondence of Henry David Thoreau*, ed. Walter Harding and Carl Bode (New York: New York University Press, 1958); Walter Harding, *The Days of Henry Thoreau* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1965); Marie Olesen Urbanski, "Henry David Thoreau and Margaret Fuller," *Thoreau Journal Quarterly*, 8 (October 1976), 24–30; and Charles Thomas Waller, "A Contrast of the Religious Thought of Henry David Thoreau and Margaret Fuller," M.A. thesis, University of Georgia, 1959.

Studies of other figures of the time who knew Fuller well are also informative. Among the most useful are Helene G. Baer, "Mrs. Child and Miss Fuller," *New England Quarterly*, 26 (June 1953), 249–255; Charles E. Blackburn, "James Freeman Clarke: An Interpretation of the Western Years (1833–40)," Ph.D. dissertation, Yale University, 1952; Arthur S. Bolster, *James Freeman Clarke: Disciple to Advancing Truth* (Boston: Beacon, 1954); George Willis

Cooke, *John Sullivan Dwight: Brook-Farmer, Editor, and Critic of Music* (Boston: Small, Maynard, 1898); Charles Crowe, *George Ripley: Transcendentalist and Utopian Socialist* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1967); Jane Ball Davidson, "Margaret Fuller and Edgar Allan Poe: A Relationship Between Literati," M.A. thesis, American University, 1968; Edwin Gittleman, *Jones Very: The Effective Years 1833-1840* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1967); Horace Greeley, "Margaret Fuller," *Recollections of a Busy Life* (New York: J. B. Ford, 1868), pp. 169-191; William Harlan Hale, *Horace Greeley: Voice of the People* (New York: Harpers, 1950); Robert N. Hudspeth, *Ellery Channing* (New York: Twayne, 1973); Georgiana Bruce Kirby, *Years of Experience: An Autobiographical Narrative* (New York: Putnams, 1887); Frederick T. McGill, Jr., *Channing of Concord: A Life of William Ellery Channing II* (New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press, 1967); Joel Myerson, "Caroline Dall's Reminiscences of Margaret Fuller," *Harvard Library Bulletin*, 22 (October 1974), 414-428; *The Journals of Charles King Newcomb*, ed. Judith Kennedy Johnson (Providence: Brown University Press, 1946); F. B. Sanborn, *Recollections of Seventy Years*, 2 vols. (Boston: Richard G. Badger, 1909); John Wesley Thomas, *James Freeman Clarke: Apostle of German Culture to America* (Boston: John W. Luce, 1949); and David Alec Wilson, "Margaret Fuller Has to Listen (1846)," *Carlyle on Cromwell and Others (1837-1848)* (London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trubner, 1925), pp. 346-351. The background to Lowell's devastating satire on Fuller in *A Fable for Critics* can be pieced together from *Letters of James Russell Lowell*, ed. Charles Eliot Norton, 2 vols. (New York: Harpers, 1894); \*Martin Duberman, *James Russell Lowell* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1966); and Leon Howard, *Victorian Knight-Errant: A Study of the Early Literary Career of James Russell Lowell* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1952). A possible influence on Fuller is discussed in Fordyce Richard Bennett, "Margaret Fuller, Greaves, and the Sexes," *American Transcendental Quarterly*, No. 21 (Summer 1976), 35.

Critical studies of Fuller's writings have centered either on her comments on foreign literature or on her criticism in general. The most inclusive study of Fuller and foreign literature is Russell E. Durning, *Margaret Fuller, Citizen of the World. An Intermediary Between European and American Literatures* (Heidelberg: Carl Winter, 1969). Particular areas of her interest are discussed in Lucy Gregory, "The Influence of George Sand on Margaret Fuller," M.A. thesis, Columbia University, 1918; Ursula Kearns, "The Translations of Margaret Fuller," M.A. thesis, Columbia University, 1949; Mary Ruth Miller, "Margaret Fuller's Part in the Language Interests of American Transcendentalism," M.A. thesis, University of North Carolina, 1946; Maud Cannell Quayle, "Margaret Fuller's Attitude Toward France," M.A. thesis, University of California, 1913; and William Silas Vance, "Margaret Fuller," "Carlyle and the American Transcendentalists," Ph.D. dissertation, University of Chicago, 1941, pp. 329-355.

German literature exerted the greatest influence on Fuller; good general studies in this area are \*Henry A. Pochmann, *German Culture in America: Philosophical and Literary Influences 1600-1900* (Madison: University of

Wisconsin Press, 1957); °Arthur R. Schultz, "Margaret Fuller—Transcendentalist Interpreter of German Literature," *Monatshefte für Deutschen Unterricht*, 34 (April 1942), 169–182; and Stanley M. Vogel, *German Literary Influences on the American Transcendentalists* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1955). Probably the author who exerted the most influence on Fuller was Goethe, and not surprisingly much has been published on this subject: Frederick Augustus Braun, *Margaret Fuller and Goethe* (New York: Henry Holt, 1910); Braun, "Margaret Fuller's Translation and Criticism of Goethe's *Tasso*," *Journal of English and Germanic Philology*, 13 (April 1914), 202–213; Russell E. Durning, "Margaret Fuller's Translation of Goethe's 'Prometheus,'" *Jahrbuch für Amerikastudien*, 12 (1967), 240–245; Harry Slochower, "Margaret Fuller and Goethe," *Germanic Review*, 7 (April 1932), 130–144; and J. Wesley Thomas, "New Light on Margaret Fuller's Projected 'Life of Goethe,'" *Germanic Review*, 24 (October 1949), 216–223.

The most worked-over area of Fuller scholarship is that of her published criticism. Her theoretical ideas are examined in Roland Crozier Burton, "Margaret Fuller's Criticism: Theory and Practice," Ph.D. dissertation, University of Iowa, 1941; and °Wilma R. Ebbitt, "Margaret Fuller's Ideas on Criticism," *Boston Public Library Quarterly*, 3 (July 1951), 171–187. Fuller's literary criticism is discussed by Patrick Frederick Berger, "Margaret Fuller: Critical Realist as Seen in Her Works," Ph.D. dissertation, St. Louis University, 1972; Wilma R. Ebbitt, "The Critical Essays of Margaret Fuller from the New York *Tribune*," Ph.D. dissertation, Brown University, 1943; Josephine J. Fay, "Margaret Fuller, Literary Critic," Ph.D. dissertation, St. John's University, 1951; Sharon Kaye George, "Margaret Fuller: American Literary and Social Critic," Ph.D. dissertation, University of Texas, 1975; Henry Lawrence Golemba, "The Balanced View in Margaret Fuller's Literary Criticism," Ph.D. dissertation, University of Washington, 1971; Vivian C. Hopkins, "Margaret Fuller: American Nationalist Critic," *Emerson Society Quarterly*, No. 55 (II Quarter 1969), 24–41; Helen Neill McMaster, "Margaret Fuller as a Literary Critic," *University of Buffalo Studies*, 7 (December 1928), 35–100; and Margaret Wallace, "Margaret Fuller: Critic," *Bookman*, 69 (March 1929), 60–67. Specific areas of Fuller's criticism are covered in °Roland Crozier Burton, "Margaret Fuller's Criticism of the Fine Arts," *College English*, 6 (October 1944), 18–23; and Elizabeth F. Shore, "Margaret Fuller and Welfare Journalism," M.S.W. thesis, University of California, 1956.

Other aspects of Fuller's thoughts and writings are discussed by Margaret V. Allen, "The Political and Social Criticism of Margaret Fuller," *South Atlantic Quarterly*, 72 (Autumn 1973), 560–573; °Allen, "'This Impassioned Yankee': Margaret Fuller's Writing Revisited," *Southwest Review*, 58 (Spring 1973), 162–171; Elsie Furbush Brickett, "Studies in the Poets and Poetry of New England Transcendentalism," Ph.D. dissertation, Yale University, 1937; Lawrence Buell, *Literary Transcendentalism: Style and Vision in the American Renaissance* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1973); Susan P. Conrad, *Perish the Thought: Intellectual Women in Romantic America 1830–1860* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1976); Ann Douglas, *The Feminization of*

*American Culture* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1977); Kathleen Deidre Guerin, S.N.D., "Margaret Fuller d'Ossoli: Modern American Humanist," Ph.D. dissertation, University of Minnesota, 1975; Vivian C. Hopkins, "Margaret Fuller: Pioneer Women's Liberationist," *American Transcendental Quarterly*, No. 18 (Spring 1973), 29–35; °Francis E. Kearns, "Margaret Fuller and the Abolition Movement," *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 25 (January–March 1964), 120–127; Kearns, "Margaret Fuller's Social Criticism," Ph.D. dissertation, University of North Carolina, 1960; Mary Maxine, "Margaret Fuller: From Liberal to Radical, a Foreshadowing of the Feminist Movement," Ph.D. dissertation, University of New Mexico, 1973; °Vernon Louis Parrington, "Margaret Fuller: Rebel," *The Romantic Revolution in America 1800–1860* (New York: Harcourt, Brace, 1927), pp. 426–434; Kathryn A. Pippin, "Margaret Fuller's Views on Education," M.A. thesis, University of North Carolina, 1972; Daniel Edgar Rider, "The Musical Thought and Activities of the New England Transcendentalists," Ph.D. dissertation, University of Minnesota, 1964; and Barbara Welter, *Dimity Convictions: The American Woman in the Nineteenth Century* (Athens: Ohio University Press, 1976).

Only two of Fuller's books have been studied in detail. *Summer on the Lakes* is the subject of Richard V. Carpenter, "Margaret Fuller in Northern Illinois," *Journal of the Illinois State Historical Society*, 2 (January 1910), 7–22; Madeleine B. Stern in her introduction to the B. De Graff facsimile reprinting of *Summer* (Nieuwkoop, The Netherlands, 1972). An able study of Fuller's feminist book is Marie Olesen Urbanski, "Margaret Fuller's *Woman in the Nineteenth Century*," Ph.D. dissertation, University of Kentucky, 1973. Fuller's reception in Britain is incompletely surveyed in Frances M. Barbour, "Margaret Fuller and the British Reviewers," *New England Quarterly*, 9 (December 1936), 618–625. For a more complete listing of contemporary reviews of Fuller's writings, consult Joel Myerson, *Margaret Fuller: An Annotated Secondary Bibliography*.

Despite the amount of material published on Fuller, much good scholarship needs to be done: an accurate and complete edition of her writings; a new and comprehensive biography built upon the large amount of material made available since Madeleine B. Stern's book in 1942; studies of Fuller and her contemporaries; and more detailed examinations of *Summer on the Lakes* and *Woman in the Nineteenth Century*. An instructive article in this respect is °Madeleine B. Stern, "A Biographer's View of Margaret Fuller," *AB Bookman's Weekly*, 53 (4 February 1974), 427–428, 430.

I am grateful to James and Gwen Nagel for editorial assistance and reading the manuscript; to Janice Gandy for typing; and to Robert E. Burkholder and Stephen and Carrie Garrison for much assistance. And to Greta, of course, many thanks and much gratitude—it is not easy to share a house with what James called the "Margaret-ghost."

J.M.

Columbia, South Carolina  
22 November 1978

# CONTENTS

Introduction	vii
William J. Pabodie, "The Dial"	1
James Freeman Clarke, [ <i>Summer on the Lakes</i> ]	2
Caleb Stetson, [ <i>Summer on the Lakes</i> ]	3
Orestes A. Brownson, [ <i>Summer on the Lakes</i> ]	5
Lydia Maria Child, "Woman in the Nineteenth Century"	7
Charles F. Briggs, [ <i>Woman in the Nineteenth Century</i> ]	8
Anonymous, [ <i>Woman in the Nineteenth Century</i> ]	16
Orestes A. Brownson, "Miss Fuller and Reformers"	19
Frederic Dan Huntington, [ <i>Woman in the Nineteenth Century</i> ]	26
Charles Lane, [ <i>Woman in the Nineteenth Century</i> ]	28
Rufus Wilmot Griswold, [Margaret Fuller]	32
Edgar Allan Poe, "Sarah Margaret Fuller"	35
Anonymous, " <i>Miss Fuller's Papers on Literature and Art</i> "	40
Anonymous, "Modern English Poets"	46
Anonymous, [ <i>Papers on Literature and Art</i> ]	53
Anonymous, [ <i>Papers on Literature and Art</i> ]	56
Anonymous, [ <i>Papers on Literature and Art</i> ]	57
Frederic Henry Hedge, [ <i>Papers on Literature and Art</i> ]	62
Rufus Wilmot Griswold, [Margaret Fuller]	63
James Russell Lowell, ["Miranda"]	64
James Russell Lowell, "Studies for Two Heads. I."	66
Charles Mayo Ellis, [ <i>Memoirs of Margaret Fuller Ossoli</i> ]	68
Anonymous, "Memoirs of Margaret Fuller"	70
Anonymous, "Memoirs of Margaret Fuller Ossoli"	73
Anonymous, "Memoirs of Sarah Margaret Fuller"	81
Anonymous, "Vanity <i>versus</i> Philosophy. Margaret Fuller Ossoli"	89
Émile Montégut, "Margaret Fuller Ossoli"	92
Matthew Arnold, [Margaret Fuller]	96
Anonymous, [ <i>Memoirs of Margaret Fuller Ossoli</i> ]	97
Caroline Healey Dall, "Margaret Fuller Ossoli"	102
A. Bronson Alcott, "Margaret Fuller"	110
Harriet Martineau, [Margaret Fuller]	112

Julian Hawthorne, [Margaret Fuller and Hawthorne]	114
Frederick T. Fuller, "Hawthorne and Margaret Fuller Ossoli"	117
Julian Hawthorne, "Mr. Hawthorne and His Critics"	129
Henry James, [Margaret Fuller]	131
Anonymous, "The Real Margaret Fuller"	133
Harriet Hall Johnson, "Margaret Fuller as Known by her Scholars"	134
O. W. Firkins, [Margaret Fuller and Emerson]	141
Vernon Louis Parrington, "Margaret Fuller, Rebel"	143
Granville Hicks, "A Conversation in Boston"	150
Harry R. Warfel, "Margaret Fuller and Ralph Waldo Emerson"	161
Oscar Cargill, "Nemesis and Nathaniel Hawthorne"	178
Austin Warren, "Hawthorne, Margaret Fuller, and 'Nemesis' "	192
Arthur R. Schultz, "Margaret Fuller—Transcendentalist Interpreter of German Literature"	195
Roland Crozier Burton, "Margaret Fuller's Criticism of the Fine Arts"	209
Wilma R. Ebbitt, "Margaret Fuller's Ideas on Criticism"	216
Henry A. Pochmann, [Margaret Fuller and Germany]	228
Francis E. Kearns, "Margaret Fuller and the Abolition Movement"	247
Martin Duberman, [Fuller and Lowell's <i>A Fable for Critics</i> ]	255
Margaret V. Allen, "'This Impassioned Yankee': Margaret Fuller's Writing Revisited"	257
Madeleine B. Stern, "A Biographer's View of Margaret Fuller"	264
Marie Olesen Urbanski, "The Genesis, Form, Tone, and Rhetorical Devices of <i>Woman in the Nineteenth Century</i> "	268
Index	281



## “The Dial”

---

William J. Pabodie\*

Miss Fuller is a woman of extraordinary application and industry, and is of consequence in possession of rich stores of varied learning. Her command of expression is wonderful, so that she finds no difficulty in putting forth her information in the best possible manner. Nothing is allowed to rest in dust-gathering obscurity on the loaded shelves of her store house; but all her rich wares, whether of domestic manufacture or foreign importation, (and 'tis in the latter she most largely deals) are brought forward, as occasion requires, and displayed to the admiring gaze of her astonished auditors. 'Tis with open eyed wonder and admiration that we have listened to her rich and eloquent conversation. She has exquisite humor and satirical acerbity, great tact, has somewhat tho' not much of the speculative reason, surpassing memory, is quick in her perceptions, voluble. But in the higher powers of the soul, in those powers which constitute genius, we think her sadly deficient. She has little or no intuitive perception of either truth or beauty, and with all her application, no genuine love of knowledge, it seems to us, for its own sake, but for the eclat with which it is attended. And yet to a superficial, an indiscriminating observer she might appear to be a woman of extraordinary genius—so replete is her memory with the ideas of the best writers. But for her opinions, in so far as they are her own, we regret to say that we have no respect. She is deficient in that faculty which the transcendentalist would term the spontaneous of pure reason, wanting insight. Her mind is chiefly valuable as a repository—admirable arranged, 'tis true, as well kept. She is a great woman in her way, but her course lies not among the stars.

\*From W[illiam]. J. P[abodie], “The Dial,” *Providence Daily Journal*, 27 July 1840, p. 2.