Redefining sovereignty in international economic law

edited by Wenhua Shan,
Penelope Simons and Dalvinder Singh.

Redefining Sovereignty in International Economic Law

Edited by

Wenhua Shan Penelope Simons and Dalvinder Singh



OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON 2008



Published in North America (US and Canada) by
Hart Publishing
c/o International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Avenue, Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213-3786
USA

Tel: +1 503 287 3093 or toll-free: (1) 800 944 6190 Fax: +1 503 280 8832 E-mail: orders@isbs.com Website: www.isbs.com

© The editors and contributors jointly and severally, 2008

The editors and contributors have asserted their right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as the authors of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission of Hart Publishing, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Hart Publishing at the address below.

Hart Publishing, 16C Worcester Place, OX1 2JW
Telephone: +44 (0)1865 517530 Fax: +44 (0)1865 510710
E-mail: mail@hartpub.co.uk
Website: http://www.hartpub.co.uk

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Data Available

ISBN: 978-1-84113-701-8

Typeset by Hope Services (Abingdon) Ltd. Printed and bound in Great Britain by Antony Rowe Ltd, Chippenham

Studies in International Trade Law Titles in this series:

Volume 1 Basic Legal Instruments for the Liberalisation of Trade Federico Ortino

Volume 2 The Power to Protect: Trade Health, and Uncertainty in the WTO Catherine Button

Volume 3 The WTO, the Internet and Trade in Digital Products Sascha Wunsch-Vincent

Volume 4 Good Faith in the Jurisprudence of the WTO: The Protection of Legitimate Expectations, Good Faith Interpretation and Fair Dispute Settlement Marion Panizzon

Volume 5 Globalisation and Labour Rights: The Conflict between Core Labour Rights and International Economic Law Christine Kaufmann

Volume 6 The World Trade Organization and Human Rights Fiona Macmillan

Volume 7 Redefining Sovereignty in International Economic Law Edited by Wenhua Shan, Penelope Simons and Dalvinder Singh

Volume 8 Law and Ethics in International Trade and Environment Debates Ilona Cheney

Volume 9 Constitutionalism, Multilevel Trade Governance and Social Regulation

Edited by Christian Joerges and Ernst-Ulrich Petersmann

Volume 10 The Human Rights Impact of the World Trade Organisation James Harrison

REDEFINING SOVEREIGNTY IN INTERNATIONAL ECONOMIC LAW

The concept of state sovereignty is increasingly challenged by a proliferation of international economic instruments and major international economic institutions. States from both the south and north are re-examining and debating the extent to which they should cede control over their economic and social policies to achieve global economic efficiency in an interdependent world. International lawyers are seriously rethinking the subject of state sovereignty, in relation to the operation of the main international economic institutions, namely the WTO, the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund (IMF).

The contributions in this volume, bringing together leading scholars from the developed and developing worlds, take up the challenge of debating the meaning of sovereignty and the impact of international economic law on state sovereignty. The first part looks at the issues from the perspectives of general international law, international economic law and legal theory. Part two discusses the impact of trade liberalisation on the sovereignty of both industrialised and developing states and Part three concentrates on the challenge to state sovereignty created by the proliferation of investment treaties and the significant recent growth of investment treaty based arbitration cases. Part four focuses on the domestic and international effects of international financial intermediaries and markets. Part five explores the tensions and intersections between the international regulation of trade and investment, international human rights and state sovereignty.

Studies in International Trade Law: Volume 7

Acknowledgements

We would like to express our gratitude to the Society of Legal Scholars for their generous financial support of the symposium entitled 'Redefining Sovereignty: An International Debate on Sovereignty and International Economic Law', from which this edited collection of papers originates. In particular, we are grateful to Professor Tony Dugdale, then President of the SLS, for attending and speaking at the conference. We thank Mr Karl Falkenberg, Professor Francis Jacobs, Professor Dan Sarooshi, and Dr Hong Zhao for their thought-provoking presentations. Furthermore, we would like to thank Professor James Crawford, Whewell Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge for his support during the symposium and for his keynote address at the conference dinner on May 30th, 2007. We are indebted to Dr Lucy Vickers, Professor of Law and Director of the Centre for Legal Research and Policy Studies for overseeing the planning, organisation and management of the event, as well as to Tamsin Barber, Conference Administrator, Jane Salisbury, Senior Law Administrator, and Nikki Bunce, Law Administrator at Oxford Brookes University. The support provided by the University (Professor Diana Woodhouse), the School of Social Sciences and Law, and the Department of Law (Professor Meryll Dean) was much appreciated. Finally, we extend our sincere thanks to Richard Hart and Hart Publishing for supporting the conference and the publication of this collection.

> Shan, Simons and Singh March 2008, Oxford

Contributors

Mads Andenas is Professor of Law at the University of Leicester. He was Director of the British Institute of International and Comparative Law, London for five years. He is also a Senior Teaching Fellow in European Community Law at the Institute of European and Comparative Law, University of Oxford, and a Fellow of Harris Manchester College, University of Oxford and at the Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London. He is General Editor of the International and Comparative Law Quarterly (OUP) and of European Business Law Review (Kluwer Law International). His most recent work includes: G Canivet, M Andenas and D Fairgrieve (eds), Judicial Independence and Accountability (London, BIICL, 2006); G Alpa and M Andenas Fondamenti del diritto privato europeo (Milano, Guiffré, 2005); M Andenas, B Hess and P Oberhammer (eds), Enforcement Agencies Practice in Europe (London, BIICL, 2005).

Charles Chatterjee is a Professor of Law at London Metropolitan University. He is a Barrister in England and Wales. He has an LLM from the University of Cambridge and an LLM and PhD from the University of London. He has published a considerable number of books and articles on various issues of public international law and international commercial law.

An Chen is a Senior Professor of Law, Xiamen University School of Law, P R China. He is the Chairman of the Chinese Society of International Economic Law and an Arbitrator at the China International Economic and Trade Arbitration Commission (CIETAC) and at the International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes (ICSID). Professor Chen was a Senior Visiting Scholar at Harvard Law School, 1981–1983 and has published numerous books and articles in international economic law.

Jorge Guira Esq, BA, MA, JD, LLM, PhD is Director of the Warwick University Programme in International Corporate Governance and Financial Regulation, and Associate Professor of International Economic and Financial Law. He is also a Senior Visiting Fellow at CCLS, Queen Mary College, University of London.

Robert Howse is Alene and Allan F Smith Professor of Law at the University of Michigan Law School. His recent books include *The Regulation of International Trade*, co-authored with MJ Trebilcock (3rd edn London, Routledge, 2005); *The Federal Vision: Legitimacy and Levels of Governance in the United States and the European Union* co-edited with K Nicolaidis (Oxford, OUP, 2001) and Alexandre Kojeve, B-P Frost (ed), B-P Frost and R Howse

(trans), Outline of a Phenomenology of Right (Lanham MD, Rowman and Littlefield, 2000). He is series editor of the Oxford Commentaries on WTO Law and serves on the editorial advisory board of the European Journal of International Law. He is a frequent consultant or adviser to government agencies and international organizations such as the OECD, UNCTAD, the International Development Bank, the International Centre for Trade and Sustainable Development, the Law Commission of Canada and the UN Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights.

John Jackson is a University Professor of Law at Georgetown University Law Centre and Sometime HE Yntema Professor of Law at the University of Michigan. Over the years, he has advised the US and various foreign governments, international organizations, and in 2000, served as chairperson of a WTO panel for a trade dispute settlement procedure. Professor Jackson has served as a member of the board of editors for the American Journal of International Law, Law and Policy in International Business, International Tax & Business Lawyer, Fordham International Law Journal, and the Maryland Journal of International Law & Trade. He is a member of the editorial board for The World Economy and a past member of the editorial boards for the International Bar Association and the Journal of World Trade Law. He is the editor in chief and a founding editor of the Journal of International Economic Law.

Joachim Karl is a Legal Affairs Officer in the Division on Investment, Technology and Enterprise Development of UNCTAD. Before joining the UN in November 2005, he worked for seven years on international investment matters at the OECD and the Energy Charter Secretariat in Brussels. Dr Karl holds a PhD in international law from the University of Konstanz in Germany, and a Masters of Public Administration from Harvard's JF Kennedy School of Government. He has written numerous articles on international investment issues.

Andrew Lang is a Lecturer in Law at the Department of Law, London School of Economics, teaching Public International Law, with a specialty in International Economic Law. He has a combined BA/LLB degree from the University of Sydney, and his PhD from the University of Cambridge. From 2004–2006, he was the Gott Research Fellow in Law at Trinity Hall, University of Cambridge. He has published on a variety of issues related to the legal aspects of international trade.

Anna Lefcovitch, is a Solicitor at EC Harris, UK.

Vaughan Lowe is Chichele Professor of Public International Law, and a Fellow of All Souls College, University of Oxford. He also practices in the field of international law as a barrister from Essex Court Chambers, London, and has appeared in cases before the English courts, international arbitral tribunals, the

European Court of Human Rights, the Inter-American Commission of Human Rights, the International Tribunal on the Law of the Sea, and the International Court of Justice. He has been a member of arbitral tribunals constituted under the UN Law of the Sea Convention and NAFTA, and is an associé of the Institut de droit international.

Philip Nichols is an Associate Professor of Legal Studies and Business Ethics at The Wharton School of the University of Pennsylvania. Professor Nichols has conducted extensive fieldwork in Central America, Central Asia, East Asia, and the former Soviet Union. He also spent a year as a visiting professor at the National University of Mongolia. Professor Nichols' current projects include a comparison of sovereignty in Europe and China, and the creation of codes of conduct for local businesses in Central America.

Ernst-Ulrich Petersmann is Professor of International and European Law at the European University Institute and joint chair at the Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies, Florence. He was previously professor at the University of Geneva and its Graduate Institute of International Studies, and legal adviser in the GATT and WTO. Recent publications include: Developing Countries in the Doha Round: WTO Decision-Making Procedures and Negotiations on Trade in Agriculture and Services (Fiesole, EUI/RSC, 2005); Reforming the World Trading System: Legitimacy, Efficiency and Democratic Governance, (Oxford, OUP, 2005); The WTO Dispute Settlement System 1995–2003, (co-edited with F Ortino), (Amsterdam, Kluwer, 2004); Transatlantic Economic Disputes. The EU, the US and the WTO, (co-edited with MA Polack), (Oxford, OUP, 2003).

Asif Qureshi is Professor of International Economic Law at the University of Manchester. A barrister since 1978, he has acted as a consultant on WTO law to and for various governments and international organisations including, Pakistan (1998, 2000, 2003), Saudi-Arabia (2001), GCC (1987), the UNDP (1998), the Asian Development Bank (2000), UNCTAD (2001), the Commonwealth Secretariat (2001, 2002, 2003), the Islamic Development Bank (1999), the CTLD (2003), ICTSD (2003), the WTO (1999, 2004), and Cambodia (2005). He is currently working on a book on an aspect of WTO Law for Cambridge University Press, and on a second edition of his book, *International Economic Law* for Sweet & Maxwell.

David Schneiderman is Associate Professor of Law and Political Science at the University of Toronto and is currently visiting sabbatical scholar at Georgetown University Law Center. He has authored numerous articles on Canadian constitutional law and history, comparative constitutional law, and economic globalization and constitutionalism. His most recent publications include, *The Last Word: Media Coverage of the Supreme Court of Canada* (with F Sauvageau and D Taras) (Vancouver, UBC Press, 2006) and Constitutionalizing Economic Globalization: Investment Rules and Democracy's Promise (Cambridge, CUP, 2008).

Wenhua Shan is a Professor of Law at Oxford Brookes University, a University Professor of Law and the Dean of the School of Law of Xi'an Jiaotong University, and a visiting University Chair Professor in Law, Xiamen University, PR China. He has PhDs from both the University of Cambridge, and Xiamen University. Professor Shan is the Co-General-Editor of the China and International Economic Law Series (Hart Publishing) and the 'Overseas Chinese Law Scholars Series' (Peking University Press). His recent publications include The Legal Framework of EU-China Investment Relations: A Critical Appraisal (Hart Publishing, 2005), International Trade Law (vols I and II, Peking University Press, 2000, in Chinese), and Chinese Investment Treaties: Policy and Practice (co-author, OUP, forthcoming).

Penelope Simons is an Associate Professor of Law at the Faculty of Law, University of Ottawa, Canada. She has an LLM and PhD in international law from the University of Cambridge. She was called to the British Columbia Bar in 1996 and practiced corporate/commercial law with McCarthy Tétrault LLP. She subsequently, worked in the nongovernmental sector on peace and disarmament issues. She conducts research and has published on issues of state responsibility for extraterritorial corporate activity, corporate self-regulation and human rights, and the intersection of human rights, international economic law and transnational corporate activity, and is the co-author (with A Macklin and G Gagnon) of The Governance Gap: Business and Human Rights in Conflict Zones (London, Routledge, forthcoming).

Dalvinder Singh is an Associate Professor of Law, University of Warwick. He was formerly a Senior Lecturer in Law at Oxford Brookes University. He is Managing Editor of the Journal of Banking Regulation and an Associate Research Fellow at the Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London. He has acted as a consultant to the IMF, and is the author of Banking Regulation of UK and US Financial Markets, (Aldershot, Ashgate, 2007) and editor (with A Campbell, JR LaBrosse and DG Mayes) Deposit Insurance (Basingstoke, Palgrave Macmillan, 2007).

M Sornarajah is a Professor at the Faculty of Law of the National University of Singapore. He is also a Fellow at the Centre for Energy, Petroleum and Mineral Law and Policy at the University of Dundee, Scotland, where he teaches courses on International Arbitration and International Investment Law. He has been consultant to the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development on Multilateral Investment Treaties and was consultant to the United Nations Development Programme and the Ministry of Justice of Vietnam. He is the author of Pursuit of Nationalized Property (Dordrecht and Boston, Martinus Nijhoff, 1986), International Commercial Arbitration: The Problem of State Contracts (Singapore, Longman 1990), Law of International Joint Ventures (Singapore, Longman Singapore, 1992), The International Law on Foreign Investment (2nd edn Cambridge CUP 2004), The Settlement of Foreign

Investment Disputes (The Hague, Kluwer Law International, 2000) and several articles on international law, international investment law, criminal law and other areas.

Stefan Zleptnig is a Research Fellow at British Institute of International and Comparative Law, London.

List of Tables, Figures and Boxes

Tables

- Table 1: Changes in Domestic Legislation (1991–2005)
- Table 2: Increase in BITs by End 1990s (1959–1999)
- Table 3: BITs (1990-2004)
- Table 4: US BITs with Latin American States
- Table 5: Latin American Members of the ICSID Convention
- Table 6: Restrictive Measures Adopted 2000-2005
- Table 7: Summary of Key Rights and Obligations of Foreign Investors, Host States and Home States

Figures

- Figure 1: Known Investment Treaty Arbitrations (cumulative and newly instituted cases, 1987-end 2006)
- Figure 2: Disputes by Forum of Arbitration (cumulative as of end 2006)
- Figure 3: Main Defendants in State-Investor Cases (as of end 2005)
- Figure 4: BITs Most Frequently Invoked in Investment Arbitration (as of end 2005)

Boxes

- Box 1: Addressing Sovereignty Concerns in IIAs—Substantive Provisions
- Box 2: Limiting Access to Arbitration—Scope and Standing
- Box 3: Limiting Access to Arbitration—Procedural Preconditions
- Box 4: Arbitration Awards—Consistency and predictability

List of Abbreviations

AFSS Assessment of Financial Sector Standards
AGOA Africa Growth and Opportunity Act

AIM Alternative Investment Market
AMS Aggregate Measure of Support
ANC African National Congress

ANCOM Andeans Community
AoA Agreement on Agriculture

APEC Asia Pacific Economic Cooperation

ASEAN Association of South Eastern Asian Nations
Bafin Bundesanstalt fur Finanzdienstleistungsaufsicht

BEE . Black Economic Empowerment
BIS Bank for International Settlements

BITs Bilateral investment treaties

CESCR United Nations Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural

Rights

CESR Committee on European Securities Regulators
CFTC Commodities and Futures Trading Commission
CNBV National Banking and Securities Commission
CODESA Convention for a Democratic South Africa

COSO Committee of Sponsoring Organizations of the Treadway

Commission

DSU WTO Dispute Settlement Understanding

EC European Community
ECB European Central Bank

ECHR European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights

and Fundamental Freedoms

ECJ European Court of Justice
ECJ European Court of Justice

ECtHR European Court of Human Rights
ESC Rights Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

EU European Union

FAO Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations

FDI Foreign Direct Investment

FRRP Financial Reporting Review Panel
FSA Financial Services Authority

FSAP Financial Sector Assessment Program
FSSA Financial System Stability Assessment

FTA Free Trade Agreement

xviii List of Abbreviations

| FTAA | Free Trade Agreement of the Americas |
|-----------|--|
| GAAP | Generally Accepted Accounting Principles |
| GATS | General Agreement on Trade in Services |
| GATT | General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade |
| GDP | Gross domestic product |
| GPA | Agreement on Government Procurement |
| IATP | Institute for Agriculture and Trade Policy |
| ICC | International Chamber of Commerce |
| ICC | International Criminal Court |
| ICCANN | Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers |
| ICCPR | International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights |
| ICESCR | International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural |
| | Rights |
| ICSID | International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes |
| IFRS | International Financial Reporting Standards |
| IIAs | international investment agreements |
| IISD | International Institute for Sustainable Development |
| ILM | International Legal Materials |
| ILO | International Labour Organization |
| IMF | International Monetary Fund |
| IOSCO | International Organisation of Securities Commissioners |
| MAI | Multilateral Agreement on Investment |
| MERCORSUR | Common Market of the South |
| MFN | most favoured nation (treatment) |
| MIGA | Multilateral Investment Guarantee Agency |
| MTN | Medium Term Note |
| NAFTA | North America Free Trade Agreement |
| NFIDCs | Net Food-Importing Developing Countries |
| NGOs | non-governmental organisations |
| NIEO | New International Economic Order |
| NP | (South African) National Party |
| NYSE | New York Stock Exchange |
| OECD | Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development |
| OHCHR | Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights |
| PPPs | public-private partnerships |
| PTIAs | preferential trade and investment agreements |
| QIS | Quantitative Impact studies |
| ROSC | Report on Observance of Standards and Codes |
| RTAs | Regional Trade Agreements |
| SACU | South African Customs Union |
| SAPs | Structural Adjustment Programmes |
| SCC | Stockholm Chamber of Commerce |
| SDT | Special and Differential Treatment |
| SEC | Securities and Exchange Commission |
| | ~ |

List of Abbreviations xix

| SPS | Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures |
|----------|--|
| SPs | Special Products |
| SPS | Agreement on the Application of Sanitary and Phytosanitary |
| | Measures |
| SSG | Special Safeguard Mechanism |
| SSM | Special Safeguard Mechanism (for Developing Countries) |
| TBT | Technical Barriers to Trade |
| TCE | Treaty Establishing a Constitution for Europe |
| TNCs | Transnational Corporations |
| TRIPs | Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights |
| TRQ | Tariff Rate Quota |
| UDHR | Universal Declaration of Human Rights |
| UN | United Nations |
| UNCITRAL | United Nations Commission on International Trade Law |
| UNCTAD | United Nations Conference on Trade and Development |
| UNDP | United Nations Development Programme |
| UNESCO | United Nations Scientific and Cultural Organization |
| UNGA | United Nations General Assembly |
| US | United States |
| USTR | United States Trade Representative |
| VCLT | Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties |
| WHO | World Health Organization |
| WIPO | World Intellectual Property Organization |
| | |

World Trade Organization

WTO

Introduction

W SHAN, P SIMONS AND D SINGH

There exists perhaps no conception, the meaning of which is more controversial than that of sovereignty. It is an indisputable fact that this conception, from the moment when it was introduced into political science until the present day, has never had a meaning which was universally agreed upon.

Lassa Oppenheim, International Law 137 (AD McNair (ed), 4th edn 1928).

Sovereignty HAS ALWAYS been a controversial concept, but perhaps has never attracted as much discussion and debate as it does today. Rapid advancements in transport and communication technologies, together with a proliferation of international treaties and institutions, have led to an increasingly globalised world. The sovereign independence of states seems to have given way to interdependence, particularly in economic spheres. Has the concept of sovereignty lost its relevance in the current international legal system, as has been argued by some?¹ Or does it continue to play a key role in defining relations between states?² International lawyers have thus been debating and rethinking the meaning and significance of state sovereignty.

This same debate is taking place within international economic law in relation to the operation of the major international economic institutions, such as the World Trade Organisation, the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund. This book compiles the papers presented at the Society of Legal Scholars (SLS) Symposium 2006 entitled 'Redefining Sovereignty: An International Debate on Sovereignty and International Economic Law', which was held on 30–31 May 2006 at Oxford Brookes University, Oxford. It is the first collection of writings on this topic by leading scholars from both developed and developing country backgrounds.

The structure of book resembles that of the conference. Thus the book is divided into five parts, with Part One focusing on the general theme and

¹ L Henkin, for instance, has argued for a complete abandonment of the concept of 'sovereignty'. He writes, '[F]or legal purposes at least, we might do well to relegate the term sovereignty to the shelf of history as a relic from an earlier era'. L Henkin, *International Law: Politics and Values* (Dordrecht, Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, 1995) at 10.

² R Jennings, for example, has observed that, '[L]ooking even briefly at such international constitutional law as we have, one can only conclude that the suggested demise of national State sovereignty has been much exaggerated'. R Jennings, 'Sovereignty and International Law', in G Kreijen et al (eds), State, Sovereignty, and International Governance (Oxford, OUP, 2002), at 35.

the other four Parts devoted to trade, investment, banking and human rights respectively. The first Part of the book looks at the impact on state sovereignty. of international economic law and institutions from general and theoretical perspectives. Drawing on his extensive research on this topic, John Jackson argues that the traditional, Westphalian concept of sovereignty no longer represents an adequate understanding of sovereignty in today's globalised world and he identifies a new notion of sovereignty which he refers to as 'Sovereignty-Modern'. The essence of this new approach is that the concept of sovereignty should not be completely discarded or eliminated without establishing a valid substitute, but should be disaggregated and redefined by employing analytical tools such as 'power allocation analysis'. Ernst-Ulrich Petersmann, in his chapter, contends that the effective protection of human rights and market rights requires the constitutionalisation of international law. He develops a case for the extension of rights-based multilevel constitutionalism, which characterises German and EU law, to international economic law and its institutions. For Petersmann, this would entail the strengthening of democratic processes and legal remedies at the global, transnational level to ensure a proper balancing of rights and obligations. Robert Howse questions two commonly held assumptions about state sovereignty: first that states have in fact relinquished sovereign power of control to global markets; and second that economic globalisation and the globalisation of common social values, such as human rights, has led to the shift of sovereign power from the state to international organisations or other international governance mechanisms. Providing poignant examples, Howse suggests that in many cases state sovereignty has not in fact been ceded, but rather strengthened. Vaughan Lowe's contribution provides an excellent conclusion to this Part. For Lowe, the term 'sovereignty' in public international law is a 'signifier', rather than a legal norm, principle or institution, and he argues that, for lawyers, the debate over the term is, strictly speaking, unnecessary.

Part Two of the collection discusses the impact of the WTO's regime on sovereignty of both industrialised and developing states with specific reference to the dispute settlement system and proposals for reforming the organisation. It attempts to address the issue of a law-based system of trade liberalisation and the pressures exerted by state sovereignty. An Chen reviews the outcomes of the last three rounds of trade cases to critique the US unilateralist approach to the multilateralist model adopted by the international community represented by the WTO. Utilising this analysis Chen highlights the threat this unilateralist approach poses to general international peace and security and state sovereignty. Philip Nichols provides a broad survey of international law and sovereignty both from an historical and contemporary perspective. He suggests the WTO should adopt a new criterion for membership to better represent the more modern interpretation of sovereignty in international law and international relations. Asif Qureshi explores the relationship between the WTO and state sovereignty by briefly analysing state sovereignty from the perspective of self determination and the right to development. He uses this perspective to analyse