

The Hague Academy of International Law

International Law for Humankind

Towards a New *Jus Gentium*

Antônio Augusto Cançado Trindade

Martinus Nijhoff Publishers

THE HAGUE ACADEMY OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

International Law for Humankind

Towards a New *Jus Gentium*

by

Antônio Augusto Cançado Trindade



MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS

LEIDEN • BOSTON

Printed on acid-free paper.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Trindade, Antônio Augusto Cançado, 1947-

International law for humankind : towards a new jus gentium / by Antonio Augusto Cançado Trindade.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-90-04-18428-2 (hardback : alk. paper) 1. International law. 2. Natural law. I. Title.

KZ3410.T78 2010

341--dc22

2010021678

ISBN: 978 9004 18428 2

© 2010 The Hague Academy of International Law.

Published by Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, an imprint of Koninklijke Brill NV.

<http://www.brill.nl>

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use is granted by Brill provided that the appropriate fees are paid directly to The Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Suite 910, Danvers MA 01923, USA.

Fees are subject to change.



Mixed Sources

Productgroep uit goed beheerde bossen
en andere gecontroleerde bronnen.

www.fsc.org Cert no. CU-COC-803902
© 1996 Forest Stewardship Council

Glossary of Abbreviations*

AIDI:	<i>Annuaire de l'Institut de Droit International</i>
ASEAN:	Association of South-East Asian Nations
CEPAL:	U.N. Economic Commission for Latin America
COPUOS:	Committee on the Peaceful Uses of Outer Space
CTBT:	Comprehensive Nuclear-Test-Ban Treaty
EComHR:	[former] European Commission of Human Rights
ECOSOC:	U.N. Economic and Social Council
ECtHR:	European Court of Human Rights
EEC:	[former] European Economic Community
EJIL:	<i>European Journal of International Law</i>
FAO:	U.N. Food and Agriculture Organization
HRC:	U.N. Human Rights Committee
IAComHR:	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights

* This is not meant to be an exhaustive glossary of abbreviations; it deliberately contains the abbreviations only of some of the expressions or sources more often referred to in the text; other abbreviations (such as those of national periodicals or yearbooks of International Law) can be found in the footnotes themselves. – Likewise, for editorial space limitations, the case-law referred to in the text can be found, rather than in an annex, in the footnotes themselves.

IACtHR:	Inter-American Court of Human Rights
ICRC:	International Committee of the Red Cross
IAEA:	International Atomic Energy Agency
ICC:	International Criminal Court
ICJ:	International Court of Justice
ICJ Reports:	<i>Reports of the International Court of Justice</i>
ICTFY:	<i>ad hoc</i> International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
ICTR:	<i>ad hoc</i> International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ILO:	International Labour Organization
ILC:	U.N. International Law Commission
IMO:	International Maritime Organization
ITLOS:	International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea
ITU:	International Telecommunication Union
KFOR:	Kosovo Protection Force
MRE:	Ministry of External Relations [various]
NATO:	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NPT:	Non-Proliferation Treaty [Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons]
OAS:	Organization of American States
OAU:	[former] Organization of African Unity [nowadays African Union]
OPANAL:	Organism for the Prohibition of Nuclear Weapons in Latin America
O.R.:	<i>Official Records</i> [various]

PCIJ:	Permanent Court of International Justice
PLO:	Palestine Liberation Organization
RCADI:	<i>Recueil des Cours de l'Académie de Droit International de La Haye</i>
RICR:	<i>Revue internationale de la Croix-Rouge</i>
SWAPO:	South West Africa People's Organization
UNCED:	United Nations Conference on Environment and Development
U.N. Charter:	Charter of the United Nations
UNCLOS:	United Nations Conference on the Law of the Sea
UNCLT:	United Nations Conference on the Law of Treaties
UNCTAD:	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development
UNDP:	United Nations Development Programme
UNEP:	United Nations Environment Programme
UNESCO:	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNHCR:	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNIDO:	United Nations Industrial Development Organization
UNMIK:	United Nations Interim Administration in Kosovo
UNMISET:	United Nations Support Mission in East Timor
UNTAET:	United Nations Transitional Administration in East Timor
UNU:	United Nations University
YILC:	<i>Yearbook of the International Law Commission</i>
WHO:	World Health Organization
WTO:	World Trade Organization

Table of Contents

Glossary of Abbreviations	xvii
Introduction: Preliminary Considerations	1
Part I Prolegomena	7
Chapter I The Evolution towards a New <i>Jus Gentium</i>: The International Law for Humankind	9
I. The Historical Emergence of <i>Jus Gentium</i>	9
II. The Legacy of the Evolving <i>Jus Gentium</i> : <i>Recta Ratio</i> and the Pursuit of the Common Good	11
III. The Fragmentation of <i>Jus Gentium</i> into <i>Jus inter Gentes</i>	14
IV. The Fallacy of Voluntarist Positivism	16
V. International Law-Making and the Reconstruction of <i>Jus Gentium</i>	20
VI. International Law, Pluralism and Universalism	22
VII. The Identification of the Basic Feature of the New <i>Jus Gentium</i>	24
VIII. The Universalist Conception of International Law	27
Chapter II Time and Law Revisited: International Law and the Temporal Dimension	31
I. Introduction	31
II. Time and Law: Some Precisions and Lessons	31
III. The Incidence of the Temporal Dimension in International Law	34
IV. Time and International Law in Face of New Needs of Protection	36
V. The Presence of the Preventive Dimension in Domains of Protection	39
VI. The Expansion of Provisional Measures of Protection	41
VII. The Myopia of Political “Realism”	47
VIII. Concluding Observations	50

Part II	Foundations of International Law	53
Chapter III	Foundations of International Law: The Role and Importance of Its Basic Principles	55
I.	Introduction	55
II.	The Position and Role of the General Principles of Law	56
III.	The Fundamental Principles as Substratum of the Legal Order Itself	59
IV.	The Acknowledgement of General Principles of Law by the Statute of the Hague Court (PCIJ and ICJ)	62
1.	General Principles of Law and the Quest for Justice	62
2.	Principles of International Law as Pillars of the International Legal System	63
V.	The 1970 U.N. Declaration on Principles of International Law concerning Friendly Relations and Cooperation among States Revisited	65
1.	General Considerations in Historical Perspective	65
2.	The Formulation of the Principles of International Law	68
3.	The 1970 Declaration of Principles as a Contribution to the Identification of the <i>Opinio Juris Communis</i>	74
VI.	Concluding Observations	77
1.	The Sustained Validity of the Principles of International Law	77
2.	The Projection in Time of the Evolving Principle of Self-Determination of Peoples	81
3.	Principles of International Law, the Quest for Justice and the Universality of International Law	84
Chapter IV	The Primacy of International Law over Force	87
I.	Introduction	87
II.	The Crystallization and Continuing Validity of the Principle of Non-Use of Force	87
III.	The Primacy of Law over Force as a Cornerstone of Contemporary International Law	93
IV.	The Emerging Right to Humanitarian Assistance	97
V.	The Decivilizing Effects of Unwarranted Use of Force	101
VI.	Final Observations: The Primacy of Law over Force as an Imperative of <i>Jus Cogens</i>	106
Part III	Formation of International Law	111
Chapter V	Contemporary International Law-making: A Reassessment of the Theory of Formal "Sources" of International Law	113
I.	Introduction	113
II.	General Considerations on the Formal "Sources" of International Law	114
III.	The Formal "Sources" Enumerated in Article 38 of the ICJ Statute	116
1.	International Custom	116

2. Treaties	119
3. General Principles of Law	121
4. Judicial and Arbitral Decisions	123
5. Doctrine	125
6. Equity	127
IV. The Formal “Sources” Not Enumerated in Article 38 of the ICJ Statute	128
1. Unilateral Juridical Acts of States	128
2. Resolutions of International Organizations	129
V. The Process of Formation of Contemporary International Law: From Consent to Consensus	132
VI. <i>Opinio Juris</i> beyond Custom: Its Wide Scope and Role in the Formation of Contemporary International Law	134
Chapter VI The Material Source of International Law: Manifestations of the Universal Juridical Conscience	139
I. Introduction: Insufficiencies of the Formal “Sources” and the Relevance of the Material “Source” of International Law	139
II. Human Conscience, <i>Recta Ratio</i> , and the Universality of International Law	141
III. The Material Source of International Law Beyond State Legal Positivism	145
IV. Invocation and Assertion of Juridical Conscience in International Treaties	147
V. Universal Juridical Conscience: The Historical Significance of the Martens Clause	150
VI. Invocation of Juridical Conscience in Judicial Proceedings and International Case-Law	152
VII. Invocation and Assertion of Juridical Conscience in International Legal Doctrine	153
VIII. Final Observations: The Achievements of International Law and the Universal Juridical Conscience	156
Part IV Subjects of International Law	163
Chapter VII States as Subjects of International Law and the Expansion of International Legal Personality	165
I. Introduction: International Legal Personality Expanded	165
II. Statehood and Recognition	165
III. Rights and Duties of States	167
IV. States and the Expansion of International Law	170
V. The Erosion of the Domestic Jurisdiction of States	172
VI. Final Observations: States and the New Horizons of International Legal Personality	177

Chapter VIII	International Organizations as Subjects of International Law	181
I.	Introduction: International Organizations and the Modification of the Structure of the International Legal Order	181
II.	International Organizations and the Ideal of the Realization of Justice	182
III.	International Organizations and the Expansion of International Legal Personality and Responsibility	185
IV.	The Expansion of International Law Itself by the Law of International Organizations	190
1.	International Organizations and the Ascertainment of <i>Opinio Juris</i>	191
2.	International Organizations and Treaty-Making Capacity	193
3.	Composition of International Organizations: Evolving Issues	194
4.	The Growth of Multilateralism and International Cooperation	196
V.	The Projected Reforms of the International Organizations, Particularly of the United Nations	200
VI.	Concluding Observations: The Contribution of International Organizations to the Progressive Development of International Law	206
1.	International Organizations: Contents and Legal Effects of Resolutions	206
2.	Responses to New Needs and Aspirations of the International Community	208
Chapter IX	The Legal Personality of the Individual as Subject of International Law	213
I.	Introduction	213
II.	The Individual as Subject of the Emerging Law of Nations	213
III.	The Attempted Exclusion of the Individual from the International Legal Order	217
IV.	The Individual's Presence and Participation in the International Legal Order	220
V.	The Rescue of the Individual as Subject of International Law	224
VI.	The Legal Personality of the Individual as a Response to a Need of the International Community	232
VII.	The Attribution of Duties to the Individual Directly by International Law	234
VIII.	Personality and Capacity: The Individual's Access to Justice at International Level	236
IX.	Final Observations: The Historical Significance of the International Subjectivity of the Individual	239

Chapter X	The Legal Capacity of the Individual as Subject of International Law	243
I.	Introduction	243
II.	The International Legal Capacity of the Individual: Legal Foundations, Nature and Scope	243
1.	Legal Foundations of the Access of the Human Being to International Tribunals	243
2.	Juridical Nature and Scope of the Right of International Individual Petition	247
III.	The Emancipation of the Individual from His Own State	251
IV.	The <i>Locus Standi</i> of Individuals in the Procedures before International Human Rights Tribunals	255
1.	Developments in the European System of Protection	256
2.	Developments in the Inter-American System of Protection	261
V.	The Individual Right of Direct Access (<i>Jus Standi</i>) to International Human Rights Tribunals	264
1.	Antecedents of Domestic Law: The Subjective Right, and the Direct Access (<i>Jus Standi</i>) to National Tribunals	266
2.	Developments in International Law: The Direct Access (<i>Jus Standi</i>) to International Human Rights Tribunals	267
VI.	The Right of Access <i>Lato Sensu</i> of Individuals to International Justice	268
VII.	Concluding Observations	271
Chapter XI	Humankind as a Subject of International Law	275
I.	The Perception and Awareness of Common and Superior Interests of Humankind as Such	275
II.	The Fundamental Principle of Humanity	276
III.	Humankind and Considerations of Humanity: A Conceptual Precision	280
IV.	The Emergence of Humankind as a Subject of International Law	281
V.	Legal Consequences of the Acknowledgement of Humankind as Subject of International Law	286
1.	The Relevance of the Human Rights Framework	286
2.	The Question of the Capacity to Act and Legal Representation	286
Part V	Construction of the International Law for Humankind	289
Chapter XII	Conceptual Constructions: <i>Jus Cogens</i> and Obligations <i>Erga Omnes</i>	291
I.	Introduction: Fundamental Values of the International Community	291
II.	International <i>Jus Cogens</i> (Peremptory Norms of General International Law)	292
1.	Emergence and Content of <i>Jus Cogens</i>	292
2.	Evolving Scope of <i>Jus Cogens</i>	295
3.	The Gradual Expansion of the Material Content of <i>Jus Cogens</i>	299

4.	<i>Jus Cogens</i> as a Pillar of the New <i>Jus Gentium</i> , the International Law for Humankind	310
III.	Obligations <i>Erga Omnes</i> of Protection	312
1.	Emergence and Scope of the Obligations	312
2.	Horizontal and Vertical Dimensions of the Obligations	317
IV.	Obligations <i>Erga Omnes</i> and the Emergence of <i>Actio Popularis</i>	320
V.	Concluding Observations	322
Chapter XIII Conceptual Constructions: Common Heritage of Mankind and Common Concern of Mankind		327
I.	Introduction	327
II.	The Content and Significance of the Concept of Common Heritage of Mankind	327
1.	In the Domain of the International Law of Outer Space	329
2.	In the Domain of the Law of the Sea	331
3.	In the Domain of the International Law of Bioethics	336
4.	In the Domain of International Environmental Law	339
III.	The Content and Significance of the Concept of Common Concern of Mankind	344
1.	The Emergence of the New Concept	344
2.	The Contribution of the New Concept	346
3.	The Co-existence between Common Heritage and Common Concern of Mankind, and Their Legacy to International Law	348
IV.	Concluding Observations	350
Chapter XIV Conceptual Constructions: The Right to Peace and the Right to Development		353
I.	The Formulation of the Right to Peace in International Law	353
1.	Elements of the Right to Peace in International Law	353
2.	Recent Developments in the Formulation of the Right to Peace	355
II.	The Formulation of the Right to Development in International Law	357
1.	Elements of the Right to Development in International Law	357
2.	Crystallization of the Right to Development as a Human Right	360
3.	The Conceptual Construction of Human Development	361
4.	Lessons from the Crystallization of the Right to Development	364
Chapter XV Conceptual Constructions: Responsibility for International Crimes and Universal Jurisdiction		367
I.	Introduction	367
II.	The International Responsibility of the State and of the Individual: Recent Developments	367
III.	State Responsibility, the Criminalization of Grave Violations of Human Rights and the Realization of Justice	369
IV.	Complementarity between the International Responsibility of States	

and the International Criminal Responsibility of Individuals	372
V. Some Considerations on the Crime of State Revisited	
1. Configuration of the Crime of State	374
2. The Crime of State in Relation to the Fundamental or Superior Interests of the International Community	377
VI. Juridical Consequences of the Crime of State	379
VII. The Principle of Universal Jurisdiction	383
VIII. Concluding Observations	389
Part VI Humanization of International Law	391
Chapter XVI Basic Considerations of Humanity in the <i>Corpus Juris</i> of International Law	393
I. Introduction: The Relevance of Basic Considerations of Humanity	393
II. The Omnipresence of Basic Considerations of Humanity	395
1. Illustrations of International Case-Law	395
2. Illustrations of International Legal Doctrine	398
III. Concluding Observations	399
Chapter XVII Basic Considerations of Humanity in Relation to Disarmament	401
I. Introduction	401
II. The Search for Peace: The Creation of Zones of Peace	401
1. The Attainment of Peace and Human Security: A Permanent Goal	401
2. The Initiative of Zones of Peace	404
III. The Establishment of Nuclear-Weapon-Free Zones	405
IV. The Endeavours towards General and Complete Disarmament	410
V. The Illegality of Nuclear Weapons	413
VI. Final Observations	423
Chapter XVIII Basic Considerations of Humanity in Relation to the Law of Treaties	429
I. Introduction	429
II. Considerations on the Interpretation of Treaties	429
1. General Remarks	429
2. Procedural Issues	433
3. Substantive Law	434
III. Considerations on the Reservations to Treaties	435
IV. Considerations on the Denunciation of Treaties	445
V. Considerations on the Termination and Suspension of the Operation of Treaties	448
VI. Concluding Observations	449

Chapter XIX Basic Considerations of Humanity in Relation to State Responsibility	453
I. State Responsibility and the General Interests of the International Community	453
II. The Birth of the International Responsibility of States	456
III. The Implementation of the International Responsibility of States	462
IV. Serious Breaches of Obligations under Peremptory Norms of International Law	464
V. Concluding Observations	467
 Chapter XX Basic Considerations of Humanity in Relation to State Succession	 469
I. Distinct Moments and Contexts of State Succession	469
II. State Succession and the General Interests of the International Community	471
III. State Succession and Continuity of Conventional Obligations Concerning Human Rights	472
IV. Concluding Observations	476
 Chapter XXI Basic Considerations of Humanity in Relation to Territory	 479
I. Prerequisites of Statehood Revisited	479
II. Non-Self-Governing Territories	482
III. Non-Militarization and Peaceful Uses of Antarctica	484
IV. Territory and Zonal Initiatives for Peace	486
V. Transitional Administration of Territory on Behalf of the International Community	486
1. The Case of Kosovo	487
2. The Case of East Timor	489
3. The Centrality of Protection of the Populations	490
 Chapter XXII Basic Considerations of Humanity in Relation to Diplomatic and Consular Law	 493
I. Introduction: Diplomatic and Consular Law beyond the Inter-State Outlook	493
II. Diplomatic and Consular Law and Universal International Law	495
III. The Right to Information on Consular Assistance in the Framework of the Guarantees of the Due Process of Law	497
IV. The Humanization of Consular Law in Contemporary International Practice	501
V. Concluding Observations	507

Chapter XXIII Basic Considerations of Humanity in Relation to the Convergences of Regimes of Protection of the Human Person	511
I. The Consolidated Convergences between the Regimes of Protection of the Human Person	511
II. The Intensified Convergences between the Regimes of Protection of the Human Person	514
III. The Contemporary Phenomenon of Uprootedness as a Problem Pertaining to the Rights of the Human Person	518
IV. The Character of <i>Jus Cogens</i> of the Principle of <i>Non-Refoulement</i>	520
V. Concluding Observations	525
Part VII Settlement of Disputes	529
Chapter XXIV Peaceful Settlement of International Disputes: Current State and Perspectives	531
I. Introduction: The Basic Problem of Compulsory Jurisdiction	531
II. Interaction or Complementarity of Means of Peaceful Settlement	533
III. Settlement of Disputes in Multilateral Treaties	541
IV. Current Developments: Fact-Finding and the Search for Justice and the Prevalence of the Rule of Law	544
V. The Search for <i>ad hoc</i> Solutions	547
1. The Experience of Contadora	549
2. The Experience of Guarantor States	550
VI. Endeavours of Systematization	552
VII. Peaceful Settlement and the Renunciation of the Use of Force in International Relations	555
VIII. Peaceful Settlement beyond State Voluntarism: Some New Trends	556
IX. Peaceful Settlement and the General Interests of the International Community	559
X. Concluding Observations	562
Chapter XXV International Rule of Law: The Need and Quest for International Compulsory Jurisdiction	567
I. International Rule of Law Beyond Peaceful Settlement of Disputes	567
II. International Rule of Law: The Saga of the Optional Clause of Compulsory Jurisdiction	568
1. From the Professed Ideal to a Distorted Practice	568
2. International Compulsory Jurisdiction: Reflections <i>Lex Lata</i>	572
3. International Compulsory Jurisdiction: Reflections <i>De Lege Ferenda</i>	579
III. The Recurring Need and Quest for Compulsory Jurisdiction	582
IV. International Rule of Law: The Growth of International Jurisdiction	586

Part VIII	Perspectives	593
Chapter XXVI	The Legacy of the Recent Cycle of World Conferences of the United Nations	595
I.	Preliminary Observations: The International Legal Order in a World of Profound Contradictions	595
1.	A Transformation of Epoch	596
2.	The Spirit of Our Epoch	597
3.	Universalism and Cultural Diversity	598
II.	The Legacy of the Cycle of U.N. World Conferences: Conditions of Life as a Matter of International Concern	599
1.	U.N. Conference on Environment and Development (Rio de Janeiro, 1992)	600
2.	II World Conference on Human Rights (Vienna, 1993)	601
3.	International Conference on Population and Development (Cairo, 1994)	602
4.	World Summit for Social Development (Copenhagen, 1995)	603
5.	IV World Conference on Women (Beijing, 1995)	605
6.	U.N. Conference on Human Settlements (Habitat-II, Istanbul, 1996)	606
7.	U.N. Conference on the Establishment of an International Criminal Court (Rome, 1998)	607
8.	World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance (Durban, 2001)	609
9.	U.N. Millenium Summit (2000) and World Summit Outcome (2005)	610
III.	The United Nations and the Rule of Law at National and International Levels	614
IV.	Concluding Observations	619
Chapter XXVII	Codification and Progressive Development of a Universal International Law	623
I.	Introduction	623
II.	Codification and Progressive Development in Historical Perspective	623
III.	Codification and Progressive Development: Lessons and Projections	626
IV.	Concluding Observations: Codification and Progressive Development Moved by the Universal Juridical Conscience	628
Chapter XXVIII	Conclusions: International Law for Humankind – Towards a New <i>Jus Gentium</i>	635
I.	The Process of Gradual Humanization of Public International Law	635
II.	The New <i>Jus Gentium</i> : International Law for Humankind	637
1.	Foundations	637
2.	Subjects	639
3.	Conceptual Constructions	640

4. Basic Considerations of Humanity	642
5. International Rule of Law	644
III. Epilogue: A Message of Confidence	645
Select Bibliography	647
Table of Cases	693
Index	707