

佛耶對談

A DEBATE

Is the Teaching of Gautama Buddha
more Noble than the Teaching of Jesus of Nazareth?

Bhikkhu Upaya

James D. Bales, PH. D.



世界萬佛舍利寶塔寺落成開光紀念
僕公老人往生三十八年涅槃紀念日

普為施資及讚誦受持
輾轉流通者迴向偈曰

願以此功德 消除宿現業
增長諸福慧 圓成勝善根
所有刀兵劫 及與饑饉等
悉皆盡滅除 人各習禮讓
一切助成人 輾轉流通者
現眷咸安樂 先亡獲超昇
風雨常調順 人民悉康寧
法界諸含識 同證無上道
願生西方淨土中
九品蓮花為父母
花開見佛悟無生
不退菩薩為伴侶

佛曆二五四五年

(西曆二〇〇一年)

農曆歲次辛巳年

敬印 壹萬本

佛耶對談

倡印者： Creating Hope Bring Support

創做希望帶來支持基金會

承印者： 香港實業公司

地址： 香港葵涌華星街8號

華達工業中心A座

18字樓6室

電話： 二四二四 八三八〇

免費贈閱・敬請大家廣為介紹流通

「佛教是否較耶教更高尚」之論辯

「佛教是否較耶教更高尚」之論辯

A DEBATE

Is the Teaching of Gautama Buddha
more Noble than the Teaching of Jesus
of Nazareth?

呂繩安譯

正方第一篇

比丘優培雅

在此論中我將對具有論理思想的男人或女人，證明佛陀的智慧宗教，較耶穌所傳的感情宗教，更為合理與高尚。我將逐點說明此印度大聖之哲學，以供諸君明斷。

First Affirmative

By the Bhikkhu Upaya.

In this discussion I shall attempt to show to the logically thinking man or woman that the Wisdom-religion of Gautama Buddha is more ethical and noble than the Emotional religion as taught by Jesus of Nazareth. Point by point, I shall illustrate the philosophy of the great Sage of India for your careful judgment.

第一、容我作一關於佛陀之簡述。佛陀在耶穌誕生前六百年，生於北印度。他貴為太子，本可繼其父王位，然他卻立志尋求人道，以及使人類發生痛苦的憂悲苦惱之解脫方法。二十九歲時棄家學道，到處參訪，受教於當時盛行於印度之各宗教領袖座前。他曾親近過許多外道大師，但發現其中無一真能指出解脫之道。勤學苦修經六年後，他決意獨自靜慮，直至發現真理或人類解脫之道方止。終于他發現了四諦及八正道之法。

First, however, let me give a very brief outline concerning the Buddha. He lived in the sixth century before the birth of Jesus, in North India. He was born a prince who would have inherited the throne of his father, but he chose to seek for humanity, liberation from the sorrows and suffering that afflicted all men. At the age of twenty-nine he entered the homeless state, travelling from place to place and listening to various teachings of the religious leaders who prevailed in India in his time. He sat at the feet of many strange masters, but the true path of liberation, he discovered, none of them could reveal. After six years of search and ardent practice of the most logical among other teachings, he resolved to meditate till Truth or the way for liberation of man revealed itself. At last he discovered the Four Noble Truths, and the Eight-Fold Path.

第一諦（苦諦）是：一切眾生皆不免於苦。
第二諦（集諦）是：一切痛

The First Noble Truth is: That all must suffer.
The Second Noble Truth

苦皆有其因。

第三諦（滅諦）是：苦因滅則苦止。

第四諦（道諦）是：八正道法。

八正道法，又稱中道法，依次序為正見、正思維、正語、正業、正命、正勤、正念、正定。這就是大覺佛陀所發現的，吾人皆能實行的中道法，能導吾人至和平、慧辨、覺悟，而終至涅槃。修學此法者，能了澈苦，苦因、苦之消滅，及究竟之福祉。

第一步（正見），戒除殺人或任何生物。不取未經給與之物。戒除邪淫。避免說不實語，戒除兩舌，惡口及綺語。任何時處不作貪求。除盡心中之瞋念。了知不行此

is: That there is a cause for all suffering.

The Third Noble Truth is: Destroy its cause and suffering ends.

The Fourth Noble Truth is: The Eight-Fold Path.

The Eight-Fold Path, often called the "Middle-Way," is, in order, namely: 1. Right Understanding. 2. Right Thought. 3. Right Speech. 4. Right Action. 5. Right Livelihood. 6. Right Effort. 7. Right Mindfulness. 8. Right Concentration. This is the Middle Path which the Perfect One has found upon which we can travel; a way that leads to peace, discernment, enlightenment, and, at length Nirvana. If we follow the Path, we will understand suffering, the origin of suffering, the extinguishing of suffering, and ultimate Bliss.

FIRST STEP.....Refrain from killing either man or any living creature. Do not take things not given. Refrain from unrighteous sexual intercourse. Abstain from telling untruths. Refrain from tale-bearing. Do

三

道者難免憂悲苦惱。

第二步(正思維)，清除自心之貪心及欲念，不起惡意，根除殘忍及報復之意念。

第三步(正語)，戒絕妄語兩舌惡口，發言必為柔和高尚，免作無益之談，而認語言為使人增長慈悲及和善之工具。

四 第四步(正業)，此步導向正行。對於有需求者，不僅援以一臂，而須盡兩臂之力以助之。嚴謹生活，使自己內心之思想，縱為舉世人士所知，亦僅令人起敬愛之

not speak in harsh language. Abstain from frivolous talk. Do not covet anything, anywhere at anytime. Remove all ill-will from the mind. Understand fully that sorrow and suffering is our lot if we do not walk in this Path.

SECOND STEP.....Free yourself from lust and greed. Free yourself from all thoughts of illwill. Cleanse your mind from all thoughts of cruelty and revenge.

THIRD STEP.....Abstain from lying. Abstain from talebearing. Abstain from coarse talk and speak only words that are gentle and noble. Abstain from all kinds of vain talk and look upon speech as a treasure that may be utilized to enrich the minds of others with thoughts of mercy and kindness.

FOURTH STEP...This is the step that leads to Right Action. Not to extend only a helping hand, but to extend both hands to those in need. Living one's life so that should the whole world know

感。這就是說要做到對一切有情慈愛普及。

第五步(正命)，此步是以正當方法為生。任何欺騙、叛逆、占卜、敲詐、及高利貸等之職業，皆應避免。

第六步(正勤)，此步是對諸根之控制。由控制五根而避免痛苦和憂惱。經由此步，學者漸能毫無偏私地愛護一切有情，而能避免五根所馳求之對外境之繫縛。

第七步(正念)，正念能使人淨化一切思想行為。此一步驟，為捨棄對於一切世俗諸法之貪念。因諸法無常，學者必須修習對境不起染着，果能斷除一切繫縛，則憂苦消除而能確證心境之寧靜。

your innermost thoughts, you would be respected and loved. This means radiating kind and loving thoughts towards all sentient beings.

FIFTH STEP...This is the step towards earning a Right Livelihood. Any trade or profession where there is practice of deceit, treachery, soothsaying, trickery or usury, is to be avoided.

SIXTH STEP.... By this step we gain control over our senses. By controlling the five senses we learn to avoid suffering and sorrow. We learn, by taking this step, how to love all kindred beings in an unselfish manner. We avoid attachment to all things the senses crave.

SEVENTH STEP...This is the step of Right Mindfulness that leads to the purifying of all our thoughts and actions. It is a putting away of all craving for things of a mundane nature. Since such things are impermanent, one will cultivate non-attachment for them. When one is not

五

第八步（正定），最後一步，導人入於正定。對於以上諸步驟之微密觀照，能使人漸趨超出世俗之路。由此一切貪瞋癡，及對諸虛妄法之欲求，皆漸消失，終證覺道。學者在親獲全部或部分解脫後，理應以言語或身教，導他人入於正道。

行此正道者，了知生命僅為識、生、痛苦、煩惱、憂愁、哭泣、失望及絕望等所組成的和合之連續而已。行者了達怨憎會苦，愛別離苦，變易不定苦、世界諸法之真相，顯露無遺。貪求人天福壽者，皆因不了諸無常法之實性所致。生命可樂之大幻覺，培養了對於生天長生之自私而無價值之貪求，

attached to anything, sorrow ends and tranquility of mind is assured.

EIGHTH STEP...This is the last step and leads us into Right Concentration of thought. By contemplating the other steps with a sincere and open mind, we will enter the Supermundane Path where all thoughts of ill-will, anger, craving, lusting for transitory beings will vanish. We have attained the state of Enlightenment, or Bliss. When we have attained liberation in part or whole, we are encouraged to teach others how to walk in the Path, by word and example.

When we have entered upon the Path, we realize that Life is but a conditioned process initiated by conception, birth pain, sorrow, grief, wailing, disappointment, and despair. We learn that there is grief in union with objects we hate. We discover that there is also grief in becoming separated from that which we love, such as wife, children, friends or our own life. We find that

此生所受之少許歡樂，徒增歡樂消失時之痛苦而已。嗜過苦癩菓後，雖能食甜果更覺有味，食甜果後，却也能使人更覺苦果難以入口。人們在了知諸行無常，諸法不實，一切可樂轉眼消逝後，對於世間之真相，方能看澈，而獲得心靈之安寧。

sorrow is in all coming and going. There is no delusion about the true nature of objects in this world. The craving for life in this world and life in Heaven is nourished by ignorance or delusion about the real nature of transitory things. The great delusion that life is desirable nourishes the craving for an eternal life in heaven, which in essence, is selfish and unworthy. The little joys and pleasures we may experience in this life only increases the feeling of grief when they come to an end. While it may be true that the eating of a bitter apple will cause one to better appreciate the sweet fruit, it is equally true that eating the sweet fruit will make the bitter apple more terrible in taste. When we have learned that all life and things associated with life are of a transitory nature, that nothing we hold dear can be ours to have and hold, except for fleeting moments, then we are seeing the true

八正道，不僅是道德之典範，而亦為生活之方法，佛教告訴我們，生命既非真性之始，亦非其終。吾人之真性永存不滅，既無始亦無終。佛教是一種最優美的智慧宗教，因其不僅為合理的，亦且為科學的。佛教之中，沒有神秘之聲音在講着互相矛盾的話。它不是一種天啟之教，不用崇祀任何神靈。吾人雖亦崇敬佛教之創立者，大覺的喬達摩佛陀，但佛教並非一種信仰之宗教，而係一智慧之宗教，它歡迎對任何部份教理之懷疑，直至人心能接受其中不變之真理為止。佛教不是失望之宗教，而是充滿希望之宗教；它真能握住每一有思想而誠意研究其信條者的注意。

nature of all worldly coming and going; and peace of mind is attained.

The Eight-Fold Path is more than a code of morality. It is a way of life. Buddhism teaches that life is not the beginning or the end of our true natures. Our true nature is immortal, it never had a beginning and consequently can never end. Buddhism is a Wisdom-Religion par-excellence as it is not only logical, but scientific too. It recommends itself in that no mysterious voices speak in contradicting ways. It is not a so-called revealed religion and does not require the worship of any god or gods. We do show reverence to the founder, Gautama, as the World Enlightened One. Instead of being a belief-religion it is strictly a knowledge-religion that invites doubt of any of its tenets until the mind can accept the inherent truths it teaches. It is a religion of hope, instead of despair, and holds the attention of thinking men when they once make an honest search into its creed.

反方第一篇

貝爾斯

(哈定學院哲學博士)

基本的失敗 一種制度，較另一種為好，必須要依據某種標準來衡量。牛頓（按：優培雅比丘，俗姓牛頓，名弗蘭克）根據什麼標準來衡量基督與佛陀？（一）是佛的教理？牛頓有何證據來建立這標準？（二）還是別種標準？若是，則那是什麼？為何我們要接受這標準？牛頓根本不能建立一種標準，而基督徒有充足的理由去接受基督為標準。

智慧與情感 牛頓假設，而非證明，佛教是智慧之教，而耶穌教乃情感之教。基督並不忽視情感，但情感並非即標準。使徒們必先說服有智者，然後激發其情感，這樣才會做他們認為應做的。因此使徒們在五旬節，請求奇蹟、預言、復活的證據（使徒行傳二：二二、二五～三五，三三、三一～三二）。

First Negative

By James D. Bales, Ph. D.
Harding College

A Fundamental Failure.

One system can be better than another only in the light of some **standard**. By what standard does Newton propose to evaluate Christ and Buddha? (1) Buddha's teaching? What proof does Newton offer to establish this standard? (2) Is there some other standard? If so, what is it? Why should we accept it? Newton failed to establish the standard. Christians maintain that there is sufficient reason to accept Christ as the standard.

Wisdom and Emotion.

Newton assumed, not proved, that Buddhism is the Wisdom-religion, and Jesus taught the Emotional-religion. Christ does not neglect the emotions, but they are not the standard. The apostles aimed first to convince the intellect and then stimulate the emotions so that people would do what they saw they ought to do. Thus on Pentecost they appealed

九

根據這些證據，他們才給結論謂耶穌是主及基督（使徒行傳二章三六節）。此後，他們才勸勉人們服從基督（使徒行傳二章四〇節）。

顯示 在何種方式下，真性顯現於佛陀之前？他怎知道顯現的是真理？

佛教中的真理 基督徒不否認佛教中確有某些真理。甲、有些很為明顯，如苦惱之普遍性，苦必有因、因滅則果滅等。乙、有些是好的。這證實了聖經所訓，人也有些分別是非的能力（羅馬書第二章）。丙、佛教中的一切真理，基督都有。丁、基督不偏袒差誤，而佛陀却偏袒某些差誤。

完善者 佛陀憑什麼自稱及表現其完善？根據什麼標準？

to the evidence of miracles, prophecy and the resurrection (Acts 2:22, 25-35, 33, 31-32.) On the basis of such evidence they drew the conclusion that Jesus is both Lord and Christ (Acts 2:36.) Afterwards they exhorted the people to obey Him. (Acts 2:40).

Revelation. In what way did Truth reveal itself to Buddha? How did he know that it was truth which revealed itself?

Truth in Buddhism. Christians do not deny that there is some truth in Buddhism. (a) Some of it is obvious, such as the universality of suffering, that suffering is caused, and that destruction of the cause destroys the effect. (b) Some of it is good. This proves the Biblical teaching that man has some consciousness of good and evil (Rom 2). (c) Whatever truth Buddhism has, Christ has. (d) Christ does not advocate error, but Buddha does advocate some error.

Perfect One. Did Buddha claim and demonstrate perfection? In the light of what standard?

究竟之福祉 那是什麼？
牛頓也希求福祉麼？

整個的制度 佛教如僅就某些方面看，則不無優點，但從別方面看則又不然。試想：一、人的生存，便是災惡；對生命及將來的欲望，為十惡之二。欲獲得救，必須消滅此等欲望。二、婚姻：「男人對女人之愛，少許未盡，縱使極微，即不能出縛」（法句二八四）。三、真理與定律：「……一種鐵一般的，定命律似的觀念，無情的譴斥一切乃至生活於人間或天上之欲望，驅使一切生物至終極的消滅」。在其中，「沒有真與美，僅有虛偽與黯淡」（開洛葛氏：亞洲之光與世界之光二八一頁）。四、善與惡：「智者既具智慧，不樂世間，亦不自責」（經集）。真正的聖者，是「超越世間善惡，不為善惡所繫」（法句四一二，開洛葛所著三一—）。五、佛教提倡虛偽的禁欲主義。六、佛教要消滅一切諸有（開洛

Ultimate Bliss. What is it? Does Newton desire Bliss?

The Total System. If only certain aspects of Buddhism are seen it has its measure of beauty, but things are otherwise when other aspects are viewed. Consider: (1) Personal existence is evil. Desire for life and hereafter are two of the Ten Sins. One must eliminate such desire to achieve salvation. (2) Marriage. "So long as the love of man toward woman, even the smallest, is not destroyed, so long is his mind in bondage." (Dhammapada, 284). (3) Truth and Law. "...a conception of an iron law of doom which sternly condemns even the desire to live in earth or heaven, and drives all creatures to final extinction." In this "there is neither truth nor beauty, only falsehood and a rayless gloom" (S. H. Kellogg, **The Light of Asia and the Light of the World. P. 281**). (4) Good and evil. "The wise man, being wise, does not cling to the world, neither does he blame himself." (Sutta Nipata; Maha-

葛三二〇頁)，因此亦消滅一切愛。如果誰要想得救的話，「勿使人愛任何物，因所愛喪失即為惡」（法句二一一）。「情感生起憂惱，情感生起恐懼，無情感者則不知憂惱與恐懼」（法句二一三，開洛葛三五〇）。

第一步 佛教以此為其法典之最高，抑為最低面？一、殺，「佛陀曾說過殺死一蚤一蟲，即犯殺戒」（佛音之譬寓八章一五三頁，開洛葛二九〇頁）。牛頓，用硫磺與豬油，治療疥瘡是否集體屠殺？「為了要證明稍微破戒的極大罪惡，據說佛陀還講過李希潘杜加巴之故事：彼在做木匠時，不慎以木條刺殺一蠅，後來雖行善

viyuha sutta, 19; S.B.E., X, P. 174). The true saint is one "Who in this world is above good and evil, above the bondage of both." (Dhammapada, 412. Kellogg, 311). (5) Buddhism advocates a false asceticism. (6) It would eliminate all attachments (Kellogg, P. 320), and thus all love, if one is to obtain "salvation." Let no man love anything, for loss of the beloved is evil." (Dhammapada, 211). "From affection comes grief, from affection comes fear; he who is free from affection, knows neither grief nor fear." (Dhammapada, 213; Kellogg, 350).

First Step. Does Buddhism view this as the highest or lowest aspect of their code? (1) Killing. "The Buddha is represented as having said that this law is broken by the killing of so much as a louse, a bug, or a tick." (**Buddhaghosha's Parables**, ch. viii, P. 153. Kellogg, P. 290). Newton, is it mass murder to use sulphur and lard on scabies? "In illustration of the great sin involved in even such a trifl-

事，終不免杖刑報」(開洛葛二九〇頁)。牛頓！撲殺一蠅的人，是否有冒殺其祖宗的危險？

第二步「行八正道者，對於最善及最惡之人，同樣的不動於心。絕不容任何殘忍、迫害、暴行邪惡來擾亂他澄靜之心」(開洛葛三五二)。如此則雖然佛教教人摒絕惡念，同時也教人在道德上是非不分。

第三步 牛頓之言雖然，但勿忘佛教認為苦行者是最高級的聖人(開洛葛三二一)。

ing breach of the commandment, he is said to have added that 'the Rishi Pandukabra, as a consequence of his having, when he was a carpenter, pierced a fly with a splinter of wood, had, while engaged...in the performance of good works, to suffer the torture of being impaled.' (P. 154. Kellogg, P. 290) Newton, does one run the risk of killing an ancestor by killing a fly?

Second Step. "The Buddhist who has entered the Noble Path is to maintain the same imperturbable attitude of mind alike toward the best and the worst of men. No cruelty or oppression, no enmity of wickedness is to be allowed to ruffle the serenity of his composure." (Kellogg, 352). Thus though it teaches one to have no ill-will, it also has other teachings which encourages moral neutrality.

Third Step. Newton's statement is good, but remember that Buddhism teaches that a mendicant is the highest type of saint (Kellogg, 321).

真性 所謂不生滅的「吾人之真性」，是什麼？

崇敬 佛教不敬上帝，而崇敬一個人，喬達摩。

智慧的宗教 牛頓先生！
以下諸項，究竟是信仰上的事，還是智慧上的事？甲、人之永久性。乙、轉世。丙、涅槃。丁、知覺的消滅。戊、喬達摩其人。

如謂信仰，則尚頗合理，牛頓根據什麼而說這些不是信仰而是智慧？

歡迎對教理之懷疑 基督教教人察驗諸事，而持守其善美的（帖撒羅尼迦前書五章二一節）。

希望之宗教 佛教標榜一切感情與生命為惡。

基督之教更為高尚 一、更佳之條件：甲、基督教導人以創造者一上帝，而佛教為不可思議論，冷漠派，或無神論。（佛學，三八～四三頁）乙、上帝按照自己的

True Nature. What is "our true nature" which is immortal?

Reverence. Buddhism refuses to reverence God. It reverences a man Gautama.

Knowledge-Religion. Mr. Newton, are the following matters of belief or knowledge? (a) Man's eternity. (b) Transmigration. (c) Nirvana. (d) Extinction of consciousness. (e) Gautama lived.

A belief may be well founded, but on what grounds does Newton assert that these are matters of knowledge in contrast with belief.

Invites Doubt. Christianity tells us to prove all things and hold fast the good. (1 Thess. 5:21).

"Religion of Hope." It labels all affection and life as evil.

Christ's Teaching more Noble. (1) Better postulates. (a) Christianity teaches the personal, Creator God, while Buddhism is either agnosticism, indifferent or, some say, atheistic, (**Buddh-**