

EUROPEAN SOFTWARE DIRECTIVES AND EUROPEAN SOFTWARE PATENTS

ALEXANDRU CRISTIAN STRENC



Wolters Kluwer

European Software Directives and European Software Patents

Alexandru Cristian Strenc

This book was originally published as a monograph in the International
Encyclopaedia of Laws/Intellectual Property Law.

Founding Editor: Roger Blanpain

General Editor: Frank Hendrickx

Volume Editor: Hendrik Vanhees



Wolters Kluwer

Published by:

Kluwer Law International B.V.
PO Box 316
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn
The Netherlands
Website: www.wolterskluwerlr.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:

Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S.
7201 McKinney Circle
Frederick, MD 21704
United States of America
Email: customer.service@wolterskluwer.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by:

Quadrant
Rockwood House
Haywards Heath
West Sussex
RH16 3DH
United Kingdom
Email: international-customerservice@wolterskluwer.com

DISCLAIMER: The material in this volume is in the nature of general comment only. It is not offered as advice on any particular matter and should not be taken as such. The editor and the contributing authors expressly disclaim all liability to any person with regard to anything done or omitted to be done, and with respect to the consequences of anything done or omitted to be done wholly or partly in reliance upon the whole or any part of the contents of this volume. No reader should act or refrain from acting on the basis of any matter contained in this volume without first obtaining professional advice regarding the particular facts and circumstances at issue. Any and all opinions expressed herein are those of the particular author and are not necessarily those of the editor or publisher of this volume.

Printed on acid-free paper

ISBN 97890-411-8750-5

e-Book: ISBN 97890-411-8773-4

web-PDF: ISBN 97890-411-8803-8

This title is available on www.kluwerlawonline.com

© 2017, Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S., 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA. Website: www.wolterskluwerlr.com

Printed and Bound by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY.

The Author



Dr Alexandru Cristian Strenc was born on 17 December 1949. He graduated from the Polytechnic University of Bucharest, Faculty of Control and Computers in 1972 and did his Ph.D. in Process Control Systems in 1983.

Between 1972 and 1984, he was researcher in the 'Institute for Design and Research in Control Systems' and from 1984, he headed a working team on 'Computer aided design' set up in the mentioned institute.

Since 1988, he has worked with the State Office for Inventions and Trademarks as patent examiner in the field of computer-implemented inventions and from 1990 up to 2014 as Deputy Director General; however, between 1996 and 1998 and respectively for short time intervals in 2013 and 2014 he held the position of Acting Director General.

He is the author of numerous books, articles and papers in Intellectual Property field, published in Romania and abroad.

The most relevant books published in Romania are: 'Handbook on Patent Law' in two volumes issued in 2005 and 2007, 'Information Technology-Protection and Enforcement of Intellectual Property Rights' issued in 2010 and 'Capitalization of the Research Results in Universities- Intellectual Property and Business Plan'.

Dr Strenc is main author of the monograph 'Intellectual Property Law in Romania' appeared with Wolters Kluwer in 2002, 2012 and 2016.

In 2000, 2001 and 2003 he affected stages of studies at the Max Planck Institute for Intellectual Property, the European Patent Office, the US Patent and Trademark Office, the WIPO, the Danish School for Public Administration. In 1997 and 1998 he acted as Vice-President of the General Assembly of WIPO.

Dr Strenc was up to 2014 member of the Administrative Council and Patent Law Committee and of the European Patent Organization, and between 2011 and 2014 Chair of the Supervisory Board of the European Patent Academy.

The Author

He also headed the Romanian Delegation in the Administrative Council of the Community Plant Variety Office and in the Working Party of Intellectual Property-Patents of the EU Council which negotiated the Unitary Patent Package.

Dr Strenc was President of the Editorial Board of the Romanian Review of Industrial Property and teaches since 2007 on IP matters at Bucharest Polytechnic University. Actually, he is European and national patent attorney and is managing the IP Company 'Strenc Solutions for Innovation'.

Table of Contents

The Author	3
List of Abbreviations	11
Preface	13
General Introduction	15
§1. GENERAL BACKGROUND	15
I. Contextual Meaning of ‘European’	15
II. Software Directive	15
III. Software Patents	16
IV. Case Law	16
Chapter 1. Protection of Computer Programs under IP Law	17
§1. DEFINITION AND CONCEPTUAL ASPECTS	17
I. Definition	17
II. Conceptual Aspects of a Computer Program	18
III. IP Related Types of Computer Programs	19
A. Computer Program Under Copyright Law	19
B. Computer Program ‘as such’ and CIIs	19
C. Computer Program Under Trade Secret	20
D. Computer Programs Outside Copyright Protection	20
1. Free Software	20
2. Public Domain Software	22
3. Open Source Software – OSS	22
IV. Complementarity of the Protection of Computer Programs by Copyright and Patent	22
A. Complementarity	22
1. Pros and Cons Patenting	25
Chapter 2. European Software Directive	27
§1. COUNCIL DIRECTIVE 91/250/EEC OF 14 MAY 1991 ON THE LEGAL PROTECTION OF COMPUTER PROGRAMS	27

Table of Contents

I.	Objective Necessity	27
II.	Historical Development Towards the Original Software Directive from 1991	29
	A. Pros and Cons Reverse Engineering	30
III.	Route from the Original Directive 1991 to the Codified Directive 2009	31
§2.	SUBSTANCE OF THE CODIFIED DIRECTIVE	33
I.	Article 1 Object of protection	33
	A. Legal Provision	33
	B. General Aspects	33
	C. Specific Considerations	34
	1. Computer Program	34
	2. Copyright Protection for Computer Programs	35
	3. Protection ‘as Literary Works Within the Meaning of the Berne Convention’	35
	4. Preparatory Design Material	36
	5. Protection Granted only to Expression in any Form of a Computer Program	37
	6. Functionality of Computer Programs	38
	7. Programming Languages	38
	8. Format of Data Files used to Exploit the Functions of a Computer Program	39
	9. Exclusion of Protection of Ideas and Concepts Underlying to Computer Programs	39
	10. Program Interface	40
	11. Graphic User Interface (GUI)	41
	12. Protection Granted only for Original Computer Programs	42
II.	Article 2 Authorship	44
	A. Legal Provision	44
	B. General Aspects	45
	C. Specific Consideration	45
	1. Author – Natural or Legal Person(s)	45
	2. Computer Programs as Collective Works	46
	3. Joint Ownership of Computer Program	47
	4. Computer Programs Created by Employees	48
	5. Presumption of Authorship or Ownership	49
III.	Article 3 Beneficiaries of Protection	49
	A. Legal Provision	49
	B. General Aspects	49
IV.	Article 4 Restricted Acts	50
	A. General Aspects	50
	B. Specific Considerations	51
	1. Reproduction	51

Table of Contents

2. Permanent or Temporary Reproduction	52
3. Reproduction by any Means and in any Form	53
4. Reproduction in Part or in Whole	53
5. Loading, Displaying, Running, Transmission or Storage of the Computer Program Necessitating Reproduction	54
6. Translation, Adaptation, Arrangement or any Other Alteration of a Program	54
7. Without Prejudice Clause for the Person Altering the Program	55
8. Any Form of Distribution to the Public, Including Rental	55
9. Right of Communication to the Public	57
10. Community Exhaustion of the Distribution Right	57
V. Article 5 Exceptions to the Restricted Acts	59
A. Legal Provision	59
B. General Aspects	60
C. Specific Considerations	60
1. Lawful Acquirer <i>versus</i> Lawful User	60
2. Acts Necessary for the Use of the Computer Program	62
3. Use of the Computer Program in Accordance with its Intended Purpose	62
4. Error Correction	63
5. Back Up Copy	64
6. Observing, Studying or Testing the Functioning of a Program	65
7. Loading, Displaying, Running, Transmitting or Storing the Program	66
8. Private Copying	67
VI. Article 6 Decompilation	67
A. Legal Provision	67
B. General Aspects	68
C. Specific Considerations	68
1. Decompilation	68
2. Interoperability	70
3. Acts Indispensable to Obtain the Information Necessary to Achieve Interoperability	71
4. Legitimate Developer	72
5. Interface Information not Previously Available	72
6. Acts Confined only to Parts of the Original Program Containing Interoperable Information	73
7. Restricted Use of the Information Obtained by Decompilation	73
8. Consistency with Berne Convention	74
VII. Article 7 Special Measures of Protection	75

Table of Contents

A. Legal Provision	75
B. General Aspects	75
C. Specific Considerations	76
1. No Prejudicial Appropriate Remedies	76
2. Seizure	77
VIII. Article 8 Continued Application of Other Legal Provisions	77
A. Legal Provision	77
B. General Aspects	77
C. Specific Considerations.	78
1. Non-prejudicial Clause on Other Legal and Contractual Provisions	78
2. Legal Provision	79
3. General Aspects	79
IX. Article 10 Repeal	79
A. Legal Provision	79
B. General Aspects	80
X. Article 11 Entry into Force	80
A. Legal Provision	80
B. General Aspects	80
XI. Article 12 Addressees	80
A. Legal Provision	80
B. General Aspects	80
XII. Article 10 of the Directive 1991, Repealed Under Codified Directive	81
A. Legal Provision	81
B. General Considerations	81
§3. CHALLENGES TO THE COMPUTER PROGRAM DIRECTIVE	82
I. Implementation Issues	82
II. Harmonization of the EU Directive with Relevant International Copyright Agreements on Computer Program Protection as Literary Works	85
A. Berne Convention	85
B. TRIPS Agreement	87
C. WIPO Copyright Treaty-WCT	89
III. Synergy of EU Directive with Relevant ‘Acquis Communautaire’	92
A. Copyright Term Directive 2006/116/EC	92
B. Rental Directive 2006/115/EC	93
C. Copyright/InfoSoc Directive 2001/29/EC	94
D. Database Directive 96/9/EC	98
E. Enforcement Directive 2004/48/EC	99
IV. Limitations and Reflection Points on Possible Updating	99
A. Approximation with European and International Developments	99

Table of Contents

1.	Distribution Right and Right to Communicate to the Public	99
2.	Back-up and Private Copy	100
3.	Remedies	100
4.	Technical Devices	101
B.	Technological Developments in Computer Systems Field	102
1.	Authorship of Computer Programs Produced Automatically	102
2.	Restricted Acts and Exceptions to the Restricted Acts, in a New Software World	103
Chapter 3.	European Patents for CII's	104
§1.	PROPOSAL FOR A DIRECTIVE ON THE PATENTABILITY OF COMPUTER-IMPLEMENTED INVENTIONS	104
I.	Historical Developments	104
II.	Basic Provision	106
A.	Article 1 Scope	106
1.	Legal Provision	106
2.	General Considerations	106
B.	Article 2 Definitions	106
1.	Legal Provision	106
2.	General Considerations	107
C.	Article 3 Computer-implemented Inventions as a Field of Technology	107
1.	Legal Provision	107
2.	General Considerations	107
D.	Article 4 Conditions for Patentability	108
1.	Legal Provision	108
2.	General Considerations	109
E.	Article 5 Form of Claims	111
1.	Legal Provision	111
2.	General Considerations	111
F.	Article 6 Relationship with Directive 91/250 EC	111
1.	Legal Provision	111
2.	General Considerations	111
G.	Articles 9, 10 and 11	112
1.	General Considerations	112
III.	Consequences of the Proposed Directive Rejection on the European Practice	112
§2.	PROVISIONS OF THE EPC ON COMPUTER PROGRAMS	113
§3.	EUROPEAN PRACTICE ON PATENTABILITY WITH A VIEW TO CII's	115

Table of Contents

I.	Computer Programs as such and Patentable Technical Inventions	115
A.	EPO Approaches on Patentability	119
1.	Contribution Approach	119
2.	Further Technical Effect	119
3.	Problem-Solution Approach	120
§4.	PATENTABILITY CONDITIONS	120
I.	Technical Character	121
A.	Further Effects of Programs for Computers	123
B.	Technical Effect on a Physical Entity	124
C.	Programming a Computer	124
D.	Implementation of a Function on a Computer System	125
E.	Methods Performed by a Computer	126
F.	Computer-Implemented Simulation Methods	127
G.	Technical Character of Business Methods	128
II.	Novelty	129
A.	Article 54 EPC on Novelty	129
B.	Assessing Novelty	129
III.	Inventive Step	130
A.	Article 56 EPC on Inventive Step	130
B.	Assessing Inventive Step	130
1.	Obvious Invention	131
2.	Person Skilled in the Art	131
3.	Combination of Technical and Non-technical Features	132
4.	Problem-Solution Approach	132
5.	Closest Prior Art	133
6.	Objective Technical Problem	133
IV.	Industrial Applicability	134
A.	Article 57 on Industrial Applicability	134
B.	Assessing Industrial Applicability	134
§5.	EUROPEAN PRACTICE OF CLAIMING A CII	134
I.	Process Claims	135
II.	Product Claims	135
III.	General Considerations	136
	Selected Bibliography	139
	Index	143

European Software Directives and European Software Patents

Alexandru Cristian Strenc

This book was originally published as a monograph in the International
Encyclopaedia of Laws/Intellectual Property Law.

Founding Editor: Roger Blanpain
General Editor: Frank Hendrickx
Volume Editor: Hendrik Vanhees



Wolters Kluwer

The Author



Dr Alexandru Cristian Strenc was born on 17 December 1949. He graduated from the Polytechnic University of Bucharest, Faculty of Control and Computers in 1972 and did his Ph.D. in Process Control Systems in 1983.

Between 1972 and 1984, he was researcher in the 'Institute for Design and Research in Control Systems' and from 1984, he headed a working team on 'Computer aided design' set up in the mentioned institute.

Since 1988, he has worked with the State Office for Inventions and Trademarks as patent examiner in the field of computer-implemented inventions and from 1990 up to 2014 as Deputy Director General; however, between 1996 and 1998 and respectively for short time intervals in 2013 and 2014 he held the position of Acting Director General.

He is the author of numerous books, articles and papers in Intellectual Property field, published in Romania and abroad.

The most relevant books published in Romania are: 'Handbook on Patent Law' in two volumes issued in 2005 and 2007, 'Information Technology-Protection and Enforcement of Intellectual Property Rights' issued in 2010 and 'Capitalization of the Research Results in Universities- Intellectual Property and Business Plan'.

Dr Strenc is main author of the monograph 'Intellectual Property Law in Romania' appeared with Wolters Kluwer in 2002, 2012 and 2016.

In 2000, 2001 and 2003 he affected stages of studies at the Max Planck Institute for Intellectual Property, the European Patent Office, the US Patent and Trademark Office, the WIPO, the Danish School for Public Administration. In 1997 and 1998 he acted as Vice-President of the General Assembly of WIPO.

Dr Strenc was up to 2014 member of the Administrative Council and Patent Law Committee and of the European Patent Organization, and between 2011 and 2014 Chair of the Supervisory Board of the European Patent Academy.

The Author

He also headed the Romanian Delegation in the Administrative Council of the Community Plant Variety Office and in the Working Party of Intellectual Property-Patents of the EU Council which negotiated the Unitary Patent Package.

Dr Strenc was President of the Editorial Board of the Romanian Review of Industrial Property and teaches since 2007 on IP matters at Bucharest Polytechnic University.

Actually, he is European and national patent attorney and is managing the IP Company 'Strenc Solutions for Innovation'.

Table of Contents

The Author	3
List of Abbreviations	11
Preface	13
General Introduction	15
§1. GENERAL BACKGROUND	15
I. Contextual Meaning of 'European'	15
II. Software Directive	15
III. Software Patents	16
IV. Case Law	16
Chapter 1. Protection of Computer Programs under IP Law	17
§1. DEFINITION AND CONCEPTUAL ASPECTS	17
I. Definition	17
II. Conceptual Aspects of a Computer Program	18
III. IP Related Types of Computer Programs	19
A. Computer Program Under Copyright Law	19
B. Computer Program 'as such' and CII's	19
C. Computer Program Under Trade Secret	20
D. Computer Programs Outside Copyright Protection	20
1. Free Software	20
2. Public Domain Software	22
3. Open Source Software – OSS	22
IV. Complementarity of the Protection of Computer Programs by Copyright and Patent	22
A. Complementarity	22
1. Pros and Cons Patenting	25
Chapter 2. European Software Directive	27
§1. COUNCIL DIRECTIVE 91/250/EEC OF 14 MAY 1991 ON THE LEGAL PROTECTION OF COMPUTER PROGRAMS	27

Table of Contents

I.	Objective Necessity	27
II.	Historical Development Towards the Original Software Directive from 1991	29
	A. Pros and Cons Reverse Engineering	30
III.	Route from the Original Directive 1991 to the Codified Directive 2009	31
§2.	SUBSTANCE OF THE CODIFIED DIRECTIVE	33
I.	Article 1 Object of protection	33
	A. Legal Provision	33
	B. General Aspects	33
	C. Specific Considerations	34
	1. Computer Program	34
	2. Copyright Protection for Computer Programs	35
	3. Protection ‘as Literary Works Within the Meaning of the Berne Convention’	35
	4. Preparatory Design Material	36
	5. Protection Granted only to Expression in any Form of a Computer Program	37
	6. Functionality of Computer Programs	38
	7. Programming Languages	38
	8. Format of Data Files used to Exploit the Functions of a Computer Program	39
	9. Exclusion of Protection of Ideas and Concepts Underlying to Computer Programs	39
	10. Program Interface	40
	11. Graphic User Interface (GUI)	41
	12. Protection Granted only for Original Computer Programs	42
II.	Article 2 Authorship	44
	A. Legal Provision	44
	B. General Aspects	45
	C. Specific Consideration	45
	1. Author – Natural or Legal Person(s)	45
	2. Computer Programs as Collective Works	46
	3. Joint Ownership of Computer Program	47
	4. Computer Programs Created by Employees	48
	5. Presumption of Authorship or Ownership	49
III.	Article 3 Beneficiaries of Protection	49
	A. Legal Provision	49
	B. General Aspects	49
IV.	Article 4 Restricted Acts	50
	A. General Aspects	50
	B. Specific Considerations	51
	1. Reproduction	51