TRANSFORMING CONFLICT, LAW, AND POLICY

EDITED BY PETER L. BERGEN AND DANIEL ROTHENBERG

Drone Wars

TRANSFORMING CONFLICT, LAW, AND POLICY

PETER L. BERGEN
and
DANIEL ROTHENBERG



CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title; www.cambridge.org/9781107663381

© Cambridge University Press 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data Drone wars: transforming conflict, law, and policy / Peter L. Bergen and Daniel Rothenberg, editors.

pages em

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-02556-1 (Hardback) - ISBN 978-1-107-66338-1 (Paperback)

Air warfare (International law)
 Uninhabited combat aerial vehicles
 Aeronautics, Military-Law and legislation.
 Afghan War, 2001-Law and legislation.
 <

358.4'14-dc23 2014020421

ISBN 978-1-107-02556-1 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-66338-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

DRONE WARS

Drones are the iconic military technology of many of today's most pressing conflicts, a lens through which US foreign policy is understood, and a means for discussing key issues regarding the laws of war and the changing nature of global politics. Drones have captured the public imagination, partly because they project lethal force in a manner that challenges accepted rules, norms, and moral understandings.

Drone Wars presents a series of essays by legal scholars, journalists, government officials, military analysts, social scientists, and foreign policy experts. It addresses drones' impact on the ground, how their use adheres to and challenges the laws of war, their relationship to complex policy issues regarding national security and foreign affairs, and the ways their deployment and development help us understand the future of war. The book is a diverse and comprehensive interdisciplinary perspective on drones that covers important debates on targeted killing and civilian casualties; presents key data on drone deployment; and offers new ideas on their historical development, significance, and impact on law and policy. Drone Wars documents the current state of the field at an important moment in history when new military technologies are transforming how war is practiced by the United States and, increasingly, by other states and by non-state actors around the world.

Peter L. Bergen is a journalist, documentary producer, and the author of four books about al-Qaeda, three of which were New York Times best-sellers and three of which were named among the best non-fiction books of the year by the Washington Post. He is Vice President, Director of Studies and of Fellows, and Director of the International Security Program at New America in Washington, DC; Professor of Practice in the School of Politics and Global Studies at Arizona State University and Co-Director of the Future of War Project; a Fellow at Fordham University's Center on National Security; editor of the South Asia Channel on Foreignpolicy.com; and a national security analyst at CNN. He has held teaching positions at Harvard University and Johns Hopkins University.

Daniel Rothenberg is Professor of Practice in the School of Politics and Global Studies and the Lincoln Fellow for Ethics and International Human Rights Law at Arizona State University, as well as a Fellow at New America and Co-Director of the Future of War Project. He was the founding Executive Director of the Center for Law and Global Affairs at the Sandra Day O'Connor College of Law. Previously, he worked at the International Human Rights Law Institute at DePaul University College of Law; was a Senior Fellow at the Orville H. Schell Jr. Center for International Human Rights at Yale Law School; and was an Assistant Professor at the University of Michigan and a Fellow in the Michigan Society of Fellows. From 2004 through 2010 he worked in Afghanistan and Iraq designing and managing human rights and rule of law projects.

Contributors

Brad Allenby is the founding Director of the Center for Earth Systems Engineering and Management at Arizona State University, where he is a President's Professor and the Lincoln Professor of Engineering and Ethics. He is also the founding chair of the Consortium for Emerging Technologies, Military Operations, and National Security.

William C. Banks is the Director of the Institute for National Security and Counterterrorism at Syracuse University. He is also a Board of Advisors Distinguished Professor of Law at Syracuse University College of Law and has co-authored two leading texts in the field, National Security Law and Counterterrorism Law.

Peter L. Bergen is Vice President, Director of Studies and of Fellows, and Director of the International Security Program at New America in Washington, DC, as well as Professor of Practice in the School of Politics and Global Studies at Arizona State University. He is CNN's national security analyst and has authored several best-selling books on al-Qaeda, including Manhunt: The Ten-Year Search for Bin Laden from 9/11 to Abbottabad.

Charles Blanchard was the General Counsel of the United States Air Force and the chief legal officer and chief ethics official for the Air Force from 2009 through 2013. He was previously the General Counsel for the United States Army and Chief Legal Counsel for the White House Office of National Drug Control Policy; he is now a partner at Arnold & Porter LLP.

Megan Braun is a JD candidate at Yale Law School. A former Rhodes Scholar, she received an MPhil in International Relations from Oxford University, where she researched the evolution of US drone policy and the interaction between technology, law, and just war tradition.

Rosa Brooks is a Senior Advisor to the National Security Program at New America; a columnist for Foreign Policy; and a Professor at the Georgetown

University Law Center, where she teaches international law and constitutional law. She previously served as Counselor to Under Secretary of Defense for Policy Michele Flournoy.

Werner J. A. Dahm is the founding Director of the Security and Defense Systems Initiative at Arizona State University and Foundation Professor of Aerospace and Mechanical Engineering at Arizona State University. He previously served as the Chief Scientist of the United States Air Force.

Sarah Holewinski was Executive Director of the Center for Civilians in Conflict, which advises warring parties on preventing and responding to civilian harm. A former White House staffer, she is a Senior Fellow with the Truman National Security Project and contributes frequently to the New York Times, Foreign Policy, and the Washington Post.

Saba Imtiaz is a freelance journalist in Pakistan. Her work has appeared in the Christian Science Monitor, the Guardian, and the Express Tribune. She is the author of Karachi, You're Killing Me! and the forthcoming No Team of Angels.

Samuel Issacharoff is the Bonnie and Richard Reiss Professor of Constitutional Law at New York University School of Law. He specializes in civil procedure, law and economics, constitutional law, and employment law. He co-authored Law and Democracy, a casebook in the law of the political process, and he is a Fellow in the American Academy of Arts and Sciences.

Konstantin Kakaes is a journalist who writes about science and technology. From 2011 to 2014, he was a Fellow at New America. He was previously a Fellow of the International Reporting Project of Johns Hopkins University's School of Advanced International Studies and a Knight Science Journalism Fellow at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology.

Tara McKelvey is a features writer for the BBC and former correspondent for Newsweek and thedailybeast.com. She is the author of Monstering: Inside America's Policy of Secret Interrogations and Torture in the Terror War and was awarded a 2011 Guggenheim Fellowship in general non-fiction.

Richard Pildes is the Sudler Family Professor of Constitutional Law at New York University School of Law, where he focuses on democracy and law, constitutional law, and terrorism and law. He served as Co-Director of the NYU Center on Law and Security; co-authored *The Law of Democracy*, a casebook in the law of the political process; and is a Fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences.

David Rohde is a columnist for Reuters, a former reporter for the New York Times, and a two-time recipient of the Pulitzer Prize for his reporting on the

Srebrenica massacre and the New York Times' reporting on Afghanistan and Pakistan. He is the author of Beyond War: Reimagining American Influence in a New Middle East.

Daniel Rothenberg is Professor of Practice at the School of Politics and Global Studies, the Lincoln Fellow for Ethics and International Human Rights Law at Arizona State University, and a Fellow at New America. From 2004 through 2010 he designed and managed human rights and rule of law projects in Afghanistan and Iraq.

Jennifer Rowland is a graduate student at Harvard University's Kennedy School of Government. Previously, she was a Program Associate for the National Security Program at New America. She has co-authored with Peter L. Bergen a number of columns published by CNN.com.

Naureen Shah is a human rights expert and frequent media commentator on US drone policy, as well as the former Associate Director at Columbia Law School's Human Rights Institute and Acting Director of the Columbia Law School's Human Rights Clinic.

Peter W. Singer is Strategist and Senior Fellow at New America. Previously, he was the Director of the Center for 21st Century Security and Intelligence and a Senior Fellow in the Foreign Policy program at the Brookings Institute. He is the author of numerous books on military issues, including the best-seller, Wired for War: The Robotics Revolution and Conflict in the 21st Century.

Christopher Swift is an Adjunct Professor of National Security Studies at Georgetown University and a Fellow at the University of Virginia Law School's Center for National Security Law. He is the author of the forthcoming book *The Fighting Vanguard: Local Insurgencies in the Global Jihad*. He is a practicing attorney in the field of arms control, counterproliferation, and counterterrorism.

David True is an Associate Professor of Religion at Wilson College in Pennsylvania. He is the managing editor of the journal *Political Theology* and is executive editor of its blog, *Political Theology Today*. He writes about the political theology in debates about issues such as immigration, torture, and drones.

Michael Waltz is a former counterterrorism advisor to Vice President Dick Cheney, a Special Forces officer in the reserves, and author of the forthcoming book *Warrior-Diplomat*. He is a Fellow at New America.

Acknowledgments

This book has grown out of a partnership between the two editors, Peter L. Bergen and Daniel Rothenberg, and between New America and Arizona State University (ASU). We decided to work on this book shortly after a joint ASU/New America conference organized in February 2011. Many of the essays collected here are versions of presentations from this event.

As the organizers of the conference and co-editors of this book, we are deeply indebted to the contributors, whose diverse opinions and intellectual perspectives are inspiring and whose patience and collegiality are much appreciated. It is striking what a kind, thoughtful, and generous group this has been, especially in light of the difficult nature of the subject matter and the challenges faced by addressing the ravages of war.

We are also very grateful for the extraordinary support and assistance of a number of dedicated colleagues.

At New America, thanks to Steve Coll, the former President, for the essential support he gave to the International Security Program under whose guidance we began our drone database and research. Thanks also to Anne-Marie Slaughter, the current President and CEO of New America, who has enthusiastically and expertly supported the program and our continued research on drones.

Jennifer Rowland, Bailey Cahall, and Emily Schneider all have made important contributions to our drone research and have assisted in various other ways to make this volume of essays a reality. Megan Braun helped to substantially improve our drone databases, as did Fatima Mustafa, Farhad Peikar, and Annie Osborne. They in turn built on the excellent work of Andrew Lebovich and Katherine Tiedemann. Thanks also to web production manager Nick McClellan, who built the database infrastructure.

In addition, many thanks to the advisory council for New America's International Security Program; its co-chairs Chip Kaye and Fareed Zakaria;

and its members, Rita Hauser, Tom Freston, Fred Hassan, and Bob Niehaus. Without their invaluable support we could not have maintained our drone databases or created projects such as this book. Thanks also to the foundations and program officers who have supported our work: Marin Strmecki of the Smith Richardson Foundation; Lisa Magarrell at the Open Society Foundation; and Stephen Del Rosso at the Carnegie Corporation.

At ASU, special thanks to President Michael Crow and Senior Vice President of University Affairs and Chief of Staff James O'Brien for providing exceptional institutional support for this initiative and for the Future of War project, a joint ASU/New America endeavor. Thanks also to Patrick Kenney, Vice Provost and Dean of the College of Liberal Arts and Sciences; Cameron Thies, Professor and Director of the School of Politics and Global Studies; and Christopher Callahan, founding Dean of the Walter Cronkite School of Journalism.

Thanks to former Dean Paul Berman of the Sandra Day O'Connor College of Law who played a key role in supporting the initial conference and promoting an interdisciplinary approach to international legal issues. In addition, Joel Garreau was essential in linking our two institutions; his enthusiasm for drones and the challenges of addressing technological innovation set the tone for our work. Special thanks to Laura Dickinson, who was instrumental in creating the Center for Law and Global Affairs and guiding many of the ideas that motivated the book; and to Emoline Fox, who provided extraordinary assistance in managing ASU's engagement with the initial conference and larger book project.

In addition, many thanks to key ASU colleagues at the College of Law working on international law and policy issues who provided guidance, support, and a productive and engaging intellectual community including: Kenneth Abbott, Daniel Bodansky, Charles Calleros, Aaron Fellmeth, David Gartner, and current Dean Douglas Sylvester. Also thanks to the drone conference co-sponsors Gary Marchant and Sandy Askland of the Center for Law, Science, and Innovation and Elizabeth Andersen, former Executive Director and Executive Vice President of the American Society of International Law.

In addition, a number of students at the College of Law and the Barrett Honors College provided significant background research, support, and assistance with different aspects of the book, including David Banko, Jason Burgoyne, Christopher Forbes, Christine Peters, Cruz Michael Ramirez, Evan Schechter, Sarah Ella Spears, and Andrew White. Special thanks to Alexa Magee, who devoted many hours transcribing interviews and

researching drone policy; and to Major Michael Wilburn, USAF (Ret.), who provided essential review, research, and technical support.

We would also like to thank our editor, John Berger, for his exceptional guidance and support, David Jou and the others on the staff at Cambridge University Press, as well as Bindu Vinod, Sundararajan Rengarajan, and Lila Stromer for their assistance in making this book a reality.

Finally, Peter Bergen thanks his wife Tresha Mabile for all the essential support she has given him on this book project and others. Daniel Rothenberg thanks his wife Ilissa Lazar for her support, patience, and love.

Contents

Contributors Acknowledgments	page ix
Introduction Peter L. Bergen and Daniel Rothenberg	
PART I DRONES ON THE GROUND	
1 My Guards Absolutely Feared Drones: Reflections o Held Captive for Seven Months by the Taliban David Rohde	n Being
2 Decade of the Drone: Analyzing CIA Drone Attacks and Policy Peter L. Bergen and Jennifer Rowland	, Casualties,
3 Just Trust Us: The Need to Know More About the C Impact of US Drone Strikes Sarah Holewinski	Civilian 42
4 The Boundaries of War? Assessing the Impact of Dr in Yemen Christopher Swift	one Strikes
5 What Do Pakistanis Really Think About Drones? Saba Imtiaz	89

vi Contents

PART II	DRONES	AND THE	LAWS	OF WAR
---------	--------	---------	------	--------

6	It Is War at a Very Intimate Level Drone Pilot	113
7	This Is Not War by Machine Charles Blanchard	118
8	Regulating Drones: Are Targeted Killings by Drones Outside Traditional Battlefields Legal? William C. Banks	129
9	A Move Within the Shadows: Will JSOC's Control of Drones Improve Policy? Naureen Shah	160
10	Defending the Drones: Harold Koh and the Evolution of US Policy Tara McKelvey	185
	PART III DRONES AND POLICY	
11	"Bring on the Magic": Using Drones in Afghanistan Michael Waltz	209
12	The Five Deadly Flaws of Talking About Emerging Military Technologies and the Need for New Approaches to Law, Ethics, and War Peter W. Singer	215
13	Drones and Cognitive Dissonance Rosa Brooks	230
14	Predator Effect: A Phenomenon Unique to the War on Terror Megan Braun	253
15	Disciplining Drone Strikes: Just War in the Context of Counterterrorism David True	285
16	World of Drones: The Global Proliferation of Drone Technology Peter L. Bergen and Jennifer Rowland	300

0				
Co	17.1	te	17	ts

PART IV DRONES AND THE FUTURE OF WAR

17 No One Feels Safe "Adam Khan"	345
18 "Drones" Now and What to Expect over the Next Ten Years Werner J. A. Dahm	348
19 From Orville Wright to September 11: What the History of Drone Technology Says About Its Future Konstantin Kakaes	359
20 Drones and the Dilemma of Modern Warfare Samuel Issacharoff and Richard Pildes	388
21 How to Manage Drones: Transformative Technologies, the Evolving Nature of Conflict, and the Inadequacy of Current Systems of Law Brad Allenby	421
22 Drones and the Emergence of Data-Driven Warfare Daniel Rothenberg	441
Index	463

Introduction

PETER L. BERGEN AND DANIEL ROTHENBERG

Drones are the iconic military technology of the current conflicts in Afghanistan, Pakistan, and Yemen. They have become a lens through which US foreign policy is understood, as well as a means for discussing key issues regarding the laws of war and the changing nature of global politics. In part, this is because drones involve new ways of projecting lethal force that challenge accepted rules, norms, and moral understandings. They enable strikes both within and outside of established war zones, highlighting divisions between the activities of military and intelligence services. They are controlled by pilots located half way around the world, which raises questions about the implications and possibilities of remote warfare. They engage in precision strikes yet harm civilians, opening discussions on the legitimacy, ethics, and legality of targeted killing.

Drones have also captured the public imagination. Stories about drones draw in viewers and readers interested in current affairs and foreign policy. They play a central role in defining conflicts that have continued for well over a decade, minimizing the risks of those that deploy them and expanding the reach of counterterrorism operations. Increasingly, drones appear in movies, television, and multiple forms of popular culture. Their sleek, stark appearance is visually striking. Their lack of an on-board pilot touches on deep-seated fears regarding the rapid advance of technology and a possible future of autonomous killing machines. These and other issues stimulate debates on drones that appear to reveal and heighten political divisions. Polls show that the American public largely supports the US deployment of armed drones abroad, even as significant majorities in other countries strongly object to these policies. Yet when Americans consider the possibility of domestic drone deployment, especially by the state, profound anxieties emerge.

This book addresses many of the issues raised by armed drones through a series of essays by legal scholars, journalists, government officials, social

scientists, foreign policy experts, and others. It is premised on the idea that today's drone wars provide an important opportunity for reflecting on global politics, technological innovation, and conflict within our rapidly changing world. The book is divided into four thematic sections that cover distinct though interrelated elements of drone use, policy, history, meaning, and impact. Each section begins with a personal narrative describing direct experiences with drones. This grounds larger policy discussions with a recognition that, in the end, drone deployment affects individuals and their communities on all sides of the conflict in significant and often transformative ways.

The first section reviews the impact of drones on the ground, with a focus on Afghanistan, Pakistan, and Yemen. It opens with an account by journalist David Rohde (formerly of the New York Times, now with Reuters) of a sevenmonth period when he was held by members of the Haggani Network in Pakistan. He recounts his captors' fear of drones as well as their suspicions that local residents were spies secretly guiding attacks. This is followed by a chapter by Peter L. Bergen and Jennifer Rowland of New America, which discusses CIA drone strikes in Pakistan and Yemen from 2002 through 2013. The information they analyze has been gathered and cross-referenced from multiple news sources, revealing significant conclusions on drone strikes, civilian casualties, and the impact of these attacks on al-Oaeda and the Taliban, Next, Sarah Holewinski, former executive director of the Center for Civilians in Conflict, examines the impact of drone strikes on civilian populations, suggesting that current policies have serious and often poorly addressed consequences for local communities. She considers the secretive and often ambiguous process of targeting and highlights the need for greater transparency and accountability. Christopher Swift, a lawyer and fellow at the University of Virginia Law School's Center for National Security Law, writes about the drone campaign in Yemen based on fieldwork and interviews with tribal leaders, Islamist politicians, Salafi clerics, and others. He argues that understanding the impact of drone strikes in the country requires a contextually sensitive review of how al-Qaeda and its allies operate, using popular resentment as a key means of local recruiting. This approach reveals the political and operational limits of drone warfare in Yemen, with implications for drone use in other parts of the world. Finally, Saba Imtiaz, a Pakistani journalist, reviews what people in her country think about drones, outlining the history of local discussions and media reporting on US drone policy. She argues that the debate is more complicated than opinion polls suggest and is deeply entwined with local party politics, domestic divisions, and Pakistan's struggles to assert its sovereignty and define an inclusive national identity.

The second section considers how drone deployment engages the efficacy and value of the laws of war for regulating current conflicts. It begins with a narrative from a drone pilot operating out of Nellis Air Force Base in Las Vegas, Nevada. He describes the intimacy of drone warfare in which he surveils targets for long periods of time, following the lives of those he may later attack. He also discusses the complexity of modern warfare, in which just after completing a combat mission he might drive home to his family, shop at a mall, or attend a party or baseball game. Next, Charles Blanchard, former General Counsel for the US Air Force, critiques a series of common misunderstandings of drones, which he terms "remotely piloted aircraft," or RPA. He explains that drones are not unmanned in that they require large teams of professionals to perform their various functions, that they are deployed by the military in full accordance with domestic and international laws, and that their value comes from their role as one tool among many within a complex, integrated military strategy. In the next chapter, William C. Banks, of Syracuse University College of Law, uses the case of a drone strike in Yemen against Anwar al-Awlaki, a US citizen, to examine the legal basis for targeted killings. He reviews who can be targeted outside of traditional battle spaces and when, if ever, American citizens may be killed. Next, human rights expert Naureen Shah considers the role of the US military's Joint Special Operations Command (JSOC) in conducting drone strikes, arguing that there is no longer a marked separation between the military's actions in clearly defined war zones and the CIA's covert strikes in Pakistan, Yemen, and elsewhere. She suggests that JSOC's highly secretive nature raises questions as to the legality of the US military's drone operations and may signal a dangerous trend of blurring the traditional divisions between the military and intelligence services. Then journalist Tara McKelvey of the BBC profiles Harold Koh, a fierce opponent of George W. Bush administration's terrorism policies and the former Dean of the Yale Law School, who shifted his position from criticizing US drone strikes and counterinsurgency policies to affirming their legality during his time as the Legal Advisor at the US Department of State.

The third section reviews the implications of today's drone wars for larger policy debates. It opens with a narrative from Michael Waltz, a Special Forces officer who led missions in Afghanistan at a time when drone deployment there was expanding. He outlines the benefits of drones in providing real-time intelligence during combat while also suggesting that an overreliance on new technologies creates a more risk-averse military and may present obstacles to working with local populations. In the next chapter, P. W. Singer, an expert on national security based at New America, describes the "five deadly flaws" of addressing new military technologies. He argues that the transformative nature

of drones and other emerging technologies, coupled with the extraordinary pace of their innovation, require that we openly confront the key legal, ethical, and policy issues they raise. Rosa Brooks, a Georgetown University law professor and former Pentagon official, questions the current fixation on drones over an assessment of the policies governing their use. She argues that current debates mask important questions regarding the ethics and efficacy of drone deployment and calls for a more open and honest policy discussion. Next, Rhodes Scholar Megan Braun writes that drones are not revolutionary but rather represent a particular technology that appeared at a unique moment when their capacities matched the needs of the US government, particularly the CIA. She sees the development of a program of targeted killing as more significant than the drones themselves and wonders about the nature of their future impact. David True, a professor of religion at Wilson College, argues that while drones provide new capabilities and powers, they also raise important ethical questions. He explores these issues by reviewing US drone policy in relation to just war theory and the realism of Reinhold Niebuhr. He argues that there has been inadequate clarity and care in developing an ethically engaged approach to drone deployment, suggesting that the costs of this failure are significant. Then, Peter L. Bergen and Jennifer Rowland consider the growing prevalence of drones around the world. Their chapter includes a detailed table, based on hundreds of news reports and government documents, which reveals that more than eighty countries currently operate drones. The chapter suggests that while the United States enjoys a relative monopoly on armed drones at present, this situation will not last long.

The fourth and final section considers what drone deployment teaches us about the future of war. It begins with the words of "Adam Khan," a pseudonym for a resident of Pakistan's tribal areas along the border with Afghanistan, who was interviewed by former *New York Times* reporter Pir Zubair Shah. Khan reflects on both the accuracy of drone attacks and the fear and uncertainty of living under their constant threat. In the next chapter, Werner J. A. Dahm, former Chief Scientist of the US Air Force, reviews the current and emerging technology of drones. He focuses on how drones present significant new capabilities for intelligence, surveillance, and reconnaissance; how there are no near-term plans to remove people from the "kill chain"; and why within a decade drones are likely to become many times more powerful with greater capacities, longer flight durations, and significantly expanded capabilities. Then Konstantin Kakaes, a journalist and former Fellow at New America, reviews the little-known history of drone development, from the early twentieth century through the present. He traces the testing and use