

Children in the Global Sex Trade

Julia O'Connell Davidson

Copyright © Julia O'Connell Davidson 2005

The right of Julia O'Connell Davidson to be identified as Author of this Work has been asserted in accordance with the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published in 2005 by Polity Press Ltd.

Polity Press 65 Bridge Street Cambridge CB2 1UR, UK.

Polity Press 350 Main Street Malden, MA 02148, USA

All rights reserved. Except for the quotation of short passages for the purposes of criticism and review, no part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publisher.

ISBN 0 7456 2927 X ISBN 0 7456 2928 8 (pb)

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library and has been applied for from the Library of Congress.

The publisher has used its best endeavours to ensure that the URLs for external websites referred to in this book are correct and active at the time of going to press. However, the publisher has no responsibility for the websites and can make no guarantee that a site will remain live or that the content is or will remain appropriate.

Typeset in 10.75 on 11 pt Times New Roman by TechBooks Printed and bound in Great Britain by MPG Books, Bodmin, Cornwall.

For further information on Polity, visit our website: www.polity.co.uk

Children in the Global Sex Trade

Acknowledgements

I have accumulated many debts in the course of researching and writing this book. I am grateful to ECPAT International for funding research that I undertook between 1995 and 1996, with Jacqueline Sánchez Taylor, on the identity, attitudes and motivations of tourists who bought sex from child prostitutes in Latin America, the Caribbean, South Africa and India; to Save the Children Sweden and the NGO Group on the Convention on the Rights of the Child for funding research in 2001 for a theme paper for the Second World Congress Against the Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children; and to the Economic and Social Research Council of Great Britain for funding a study of tourist-related prostitution in Jamaica and the Dominican Republic, undertaken with Jacqueline Sánchez Taylor (Award no.: R000237625), an ongoing research project, with Bridget Anderson, Esther Bott and Inka Stock, on the markets for migrant sex and domestic workers in Spain and the UK (Award no.: R000239794), and a research seminar series, 'Beyond Contract: Borders, Bodies and Bonds' (Award no.: R451265075) (co-organized with Jacqueline Sánchez Taylor, Bridget Anderson, Laura Brace, Jo Phoenix and Nirmal Puwar); and to the International Institute for the Sociology of Law (IISL), which hosted a workshop on 'Child Abuse and Exploitation: Social, Legal and Political Dilemmas', May 29–30, 2003 (co-organized with Kate Wilson), all of which have contributed enormously to the empirical materials and theoretical arguments presented in this book. I am also intellectually indebted to all those who participated in the 'Beyond Contract' seminar series and who attended the IISL workshop.

Especially warm thanks go to the following people, who – though they may not agree with the arguments put forward in this book – have over the years variously inspired me, supported me and/or supplied me with useful information, contacts and references: Laura Agustín, Alan Aldridge, Rutvica Andrijasevic, Anne Badger, Tricia Barnett, Della Cavner, Roger Cox, Jo Doezema, Ann Gray, Hanne Helth, John Hoffman, Jude Jones, Vernon Jones, June Kane, Liz Kelly, Kamala Kempadoo, Hilary Kinnell, Travis Kong, Anders Lisborg, Sue Parker, Tatania Pishkina, David Prosser, Vanessa Pupavac, Nirmal Puwar, Maia Rusakova, Hélène Sackstein,

Jeremy Seabrook, Karen Stenson, Nick Stevenson, Sun Wen Bin, Patrizia Testaí, Helen Vietch, Tracey Warren, Jackie West, Mel Wraight, and, above all, Esther Bott. I owe a particular debt to Dick Geary, Iman Hashim, Jim Kincaid and Jacqueline Sánchez Taylor, who read draft chapters of this book and gave me encouraging and very helpful feedback. Many thanks also to the anonymous referees who provided detailed comments on a draft manuscript of this book, and to my editor, Emma Longstaff, for her assistance and advice.

Though the weaknesses of this book are entirely my own responsibility, any strengths that may be found in it are certainly a reflection of the theoretical and political insight and intellectual generosity of three people – Ola Florin, Bridget Anderson and Laura Brace. What they have given me

in the course of writing this book goes beyond gratitude.

Though it seems a poor reward for all the kindness they have shown me (they deserve something much cheerier), I dedicate this book to those whose affection, care and humour kept me going whilst writing it: Inez Grummitt (light of my life), Laura Brace, Matt Clark, Bridget Anderson, Ola Florin, Esther Bott, Django O'Connell Davidson, June Gregory, Frances Brace, Kayleigh Irwin, and, last but never least, Jacqueline Sánchez Taylor.

Contents

Acknowledgements		vii
	Introduction	1
1	Beyond Contract? Dualist Legacies, Late-Modern Anxieties and the Sanctity of the Child Modernity, Contract and the Public/Private Binary The Pursuit of Equality and Late-Modern Anxieties The Sanctity of the Child Connections Imperilled The Impossibility of Children in the Sex Trade	5 11 14 17 19 23
2	Prostitutes, Children and Slaves The Anomaly of Prostitution International Debates on Prostitution: Division and Consensus The Child as Object The Variability of Prostitution Slavery and Freedom Unfree Prostitution in Context	25 26 28 30 33 36 39
3	On Child Prostitutes as Objects, Victims and Subjects Poverty-Plus? Factoring in Other Forms of Oppression Children as Agents Boundary Troubles Revisited Victims of Childhood?	43 45 50 52 56 59
4	Child Migration and 'Trafficking' What is 'Trafficking'? The Politics of 'Trafficking': Part 1 The Politics of 'Trafficking': Part 2 'Trafficking' Defined? Voluntary/Forced and Adult/Child Dualisms Revisited Continuums and Impermanence in Prostitution	64 66 68 70 71 72 76

vi

Contents

	Global Subjects Between Grief and Nothing	79 83
5	'Paedophilia', Pornography and Prostitution Paedophilia and Sexual Politics The Child, the Paedophile and Subject—Object Troubles Consuming Desire: the Case of Child Pornography Paedophilia and Commercially Produced Pornography Paedophiles and Prostitution Beyond Paedophilia	85 86 93 97 101 104 106
6	Children in Mainstream Prostitution: the Problem of Demand Who Buys Sex? Why Consume Commercial Sexual Services? Choosing Children Demand for Embodied Labour Policy Implications	107 110 112 115 118 121
7	Child Sex Tourism 'Paedophiles Who Travel Abroad' and Campaigns Against Them Blurring the Boundary Travel, Sex and Inequality The Scene and the Obscene Saying 'No to Child Sex Tourism!'	125 127 130 132 135 137
8	Beyond Binaries? Redemption Songs Re-imagining the Subject and the Social Bond	140 143 148
Notes References Index		152 156 174

Introduction

The author of a book on children in the global sex trade might reasonably be expected to have some particular and specialist interest in children and childhood. I therefore feel the need to start by confessing that I do not. My interest in children's presence in the sex trade originates in a concern with political, theoretical and empirical questions about sex commerce, and not about children as such. Another confession is that despite – or perhaps because of - my involvement with international policy debates on the commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) over the past nine years, this book is not born of a sense of particular moral or political outrage about children's presence in the global sex trade. I do not mean that I am indifferent to the fate of children who work in prostitution, or who are abused and exploited for purposes of producing pornography, or who have no option but to trade sexual access to their bodies in order to survive on the streets or in refugee camps or in prisons. I am as morally and emotionally moved as the next person by accounts of the horrors that such children endure.

However, I am uncomfortable with what I view as a more general impulse to separate children out as a special case when speaking of economic, social and political problems, as though the only way we can invite people to care about armed conflict or famine or poverty, for example, is by demonstrating the terrible impact these phenomena have on children; or as though it is possible to rank human misery, and be somehow less troubled by the fact that adults are sleeping rough, or working in dangerous and exploitative conditions, or being subjected to violence and abuse, than by the fact that children are subject to the same thing. This process of ranking also goes on within our concern for children as a separate and special group, and I am especially troubled by the fact that the idea of child sexual abuse and commercial sexual exploitation carries such enormous charge the fact that politicians, journalists and ordinary folk not only seem to be unanimous that the sexual use of children is intolerable, but also to wish to loudly and publicly advertise that unanimity, and yet seem so much less eager to publicly deplore the fact that there are children in the world who are malnourished, without access to clean water, dying from preventable diseases, exploited in sweatshops and on plantations, and so on.

The elevation of phenomena such as child prostitution and pornography to a matter of international concern, deserving of two United Nations world congresses and a plethora of new laws and policies, reinforces this sense that the sexual exploitation of children is uniquely terrible. It suggests that while we may be just about able to stomach the idea that children go hungry, or without education, or without medical attention, or labour long hours in appalling conditions, as decent, civilized human beings we cannot possibly accept that a child is at this moment working as a prostitute or being sexually abused for the production of pornography.

I have no wish to contribute to the discourse that constructs CSEC as 'the rape of innocence' or 'innocence destroyed', thereby implying that it is 'innocence', rather than human beings, that needs safeguarding (see Kitzinger, 1997). Indeed, this book is as much concerned to critique that discourse as it is to explore evidence on children's presence in the global sex trade. It therefore begins by asking why it should be that adult—child sexual contact elicits such intense emotions, and why it is that over the past two decades in the West especially we have been urged so insistently to emote about sexual child abuse and exploitation.

Chapter 1 argues that contemporary concerns about sexual child abuse have to be understood against the backcloth of much deeper anxieties about the ordering of social and political relations in late-modern Western societies. In particular, they need to be set against disquiet about contract as the guiding and universal principle of human sociality. For even though contract and contractual relations have been 'held up as moral experiences, the route to self-development and agency' (Brace, 2003, p. 1), the more that contract is universalized, such that every aspect of both men's and women's experience (our 'private' sexual and emotional lives as well as our 'public' political and economic lives) is understood as determined by nothing more than a series of implicit and explicit contracts to which each party freely consents and from which each party may freely withdraw, the more our 'freedom' comes to appear as a burden, a threat to sociality rather than its guarantor. Children, who are socially constructed as beyond or outside contract, promise a refuge from this existential horror, at least so long as we can be certain of their fundamental difference from ourselves. Thus we cherish the innocence, dependency, helplessness and asexuality of 'the child', and rage against 'the paedophile' who defiles it.

The following chapters then explore evidence and debates on child prostitution, 'trafficked' and migrant children's presence in prostitution, paedophilia and child pornography, and 'child sex tourism'. The boundary troubles presented by the categories used to 'make sense' of these phenomena are a recurring theme. So, for example, whilst those who campaign against CSEC follow the United Nations' Convention on the Rights of the Child in defining children as persons under the age of 18, and insist

on a firm line of demarcation between adult and child prostitution, this conceptual boundary does not reflect the realities of sex commerce in the contemporary world. Those aged above and below 18 often work alongside each other, in the same conditions, serving the same clients. Moreover, the same structural factors can underpin both adults' and children's entry into the sex trade and make them vulnerable within it (poverty, uneven economic development, social exclusion, drug addiction, racism, domestic violence, homophobia, and so on). Why limit our concern to persons under the age of 18?

The answer, according to liberal feminists as well as to people involved in campaigns against CSEC, is that adults are in a position to make choices, whereas children are incapable of making an informed decision about whether or not to trade sex. Yet this is to assume that the social categories 'adult' and 'child' refer to monolithic, homogeneous groups, and so to overlook the realities of many people's lived experience. A crack-addicted 38-year-old is not necessarily better positioned than a non-drug-using 17-year-old to make choices about prostitution, and equally we should recognize that some children (even quite young children), like some adults, are faced with such a forlorn set of alternatives that they can and do decide that selling sex is their least-worst option. Furthermore, people below as well as above the age of 18 can and do make strategic use of the exchange value that attaches to sex in pursuit of certain goals (such as day-to-day survival, migration to a safer or more affluent country, increased status and respect in one's own community, social mobility, independence from unsatisfactory parents or husbands, escape from institutional care).

The idea of a sharp and meaningful line between adult and child prostitution is strongly challenged by feminists who campaign for the abolition of prostitution. They argue that *all* sex commerce is an expression of patriarchal power relations, a form of male violence, and a violation of fundamental human rights to dignity and bodily integrity; *all* women and children who prostitute are victims of sexual slavery (for instance, Barry, 1995; Jeffreys, 1997; Hughes, 2000). However, this position is based on an equally problematic disregard for the diverse and complex realities of the lives of those who trade sex in the contemporary world, as well as on the ethically dubious assumption that those who are *treated* as objects by others actually *are* evacuated of all capacity for autonomy and agency.

This book is concerned to deconstruct the presumed boundary between adults and children in the sex trade, but not in order to insist that all those who trade sex should be treated as one homogeneous group. Rather, my hope is that by exploring the nature, causes and meaning of diversity in children's experiences of sexual oppression, abuse and exploitation, and looking at parallels between the experiences of some adults and some children, I can convince readers that we need to tell more complicated stories about the global sex trade than those that are currently popularized in much media coverage, campaigning literature and academic treatments

of the topic. In particular, I hope to persuade readers of the need for stories that recognize the very real differences between human beings in terms of their capacity for self-protection and autonomy, and the extent and severity of the abuse and exploitation to which people (adult as well as child) can be subject within the global sex trade, but that do not insist on a cast-list consisting only of paedophile monsters and innocent children, or of slaves, sinners and saviours.

1 Beyond Contract?

Dualist Legacies, Late-Modern Anxieties and the Sanctity of the Child

The sexual abuse of children has been the focus of much attention and great anxiety in Western societies over the past twenty-odd years, and two features of the discourse that surrounds the phenomenon are particularly noteworthy. First of all, there is an extremely high level of consensus about the wrongness of sexual contact between adults and children and an acceptance, even an expectation, that such contact will inspire intense and violent emotions. Where popular opinion is divided on adults who smack and otherwise physically chastise children in their care, there is virtually unanimous condemnation of adults who use children for their own sexual gratification. People speak of feeling physically sickened by media coverage of cases of child sexual abuse, and 'the paedophile' is one of the most loathed and feared figures in the contemporary Western world. On a number of recent occasions in Britain and the United States, otherwise ordinary, decent, law-abiding folk have come together as angry mobs, either gathering outside courts to shriek abuse and threaten to lynch men on trial for sexual murders of children, or attacking the homes of men who are so much as suspected of having a record of sexual offending against children. Many feel that no punishment can ever be enough for these monstrous perverts. As a leader article in a popular British tabloid recently put it, 'The law must have an iron fist to smash those who prey on children' (The Sun, 12 August 2003, p. 8).

The belief that children are harmed by sexual abuse is not enough, in itself, to explain the ferocity and turbulence of the emotions it arouses. There are many other ways in which children's lives can be blighted, even ended, none of which carry quite the same emotional charge. If a child is killed or maimed in a drink- or careless-driving traffic accident, people are often angry as well as saddened, but 'drink drivers' and 'dangerous drivers' are not socially constructed as icons of evil, even though they are certainly responsible for many, many more child deaths in any given year

than are paedophiles. And even if we turn to cases involving the deliberate harming of children's bodies by adults, responses differ according to whether the child's body has been violated for sexual purposes or for other reasons. Consider, for example, the differential response to child-killing by parents and the sexual murder of children by strangers. In Britain, the latter attracts intense media and public interest, and can dominate the news for periods of days or even weeks, yet when a child is murdered by his own parents or guardians, it rarely makes national news headlines. This is reflected in the processing of such cases within the criminal justice system. In the three years up to December 2000, police in England and Wales dealt with 492 cases – more than three per week – in which children under the age of 10 had been killed by parents or carers. In 61 per cent of cases, no charge was brought, and only 27 per cent ended in conviction, compared with 90 per cent in which a child was killed by a stranger (Dyer, 2002). Again, most people are dismayed by the idea of children dying as a result of parental brutality or neglect, but the horror inspired by such cases is rarely of the same proportions or intensity as the horror inspired by sexual attacks on children.

Or consider the fact that over five million of the world's children per year 'die from illnesses and other conditions caused by the environments in which they live, learn and play' (WHO, 2003). Diarrhoea, caused by lack of access to a clean water supply, is thought to account for 12 per cent of deaths of children aged under 5 in developing countries; malaria kills approximately one million children per year, mostly in sub-Saharan Africa (WHO, 2003). Children in at least sixty-eight countries are at risk from land-mines contaminating the land they live on - Angola, for instance, 'has an estimated 10 million land-mines and an amputee population of 70,000, of whom 8,000 are children' (UNICEF, 2003). Some 300,000 children are believed to be serving as soldiers in current armed conflicts (CSC, 2001), and amongst the estimated 250 million working children between the ages of 5 and 14, there are thought to be over 50 million children aged between 5 and 11 working in hazardous circumstances (ILO, 1996). Such statistics are widely reported in the West, and further publicized by charitable organizations. Most Westerners thus know, even if only in the most general of terms, that vast numbers of the world's children live and die in wretched and miserable circumstances. When forced to think about this reality, many people – probably the majority – are emotionally moved. They are saddened, and often express feelings of helplessness (they would like to help in some way, but the problem is overwhelming) and/or wish to donate money or time to charities that seek to alleviate children's suffering. But few people would describe themselves as revolted by the knowledge that at this moment a child is dying from hunger or preventable disease, or undertaking hazardous and back-breaking labour.

Similarly, when cases are brought to light in which adults have forced children to beg, steal, act as drugs mules or as unpaid servants, the adults involved certainly become objects of moral opprobrium. And yet it would be surprising to hear someone say that he retches when he reads about these forms of abuse and exploitation, or that she would gladly throw the switch to electrocute any adult who had exploited a child domestic worker, for example. But such sentiments are often voiced in relation to cases of sexual child abuse. (By contrast, when Tony Martin, a British man who shot and killed a 16-year-old boy who was burgling his home in 1999, was given a life sentence for murder, many people described the verdict as 'monstrous'. Martin received thousands of supportive letters in prison, and his recent parole after less than three years' imprisonment has been heralded by his supporters as a victory for commonsense, and a reassertion of the right to defend private property. Interestingly, Martin's appeal against the verdict rested in part on the claim that he suffered from a personality disorder which diminished his responsibility, and which was linked to his experience of sexual abuse as a child: BBC News online, 2003.)

The idea of adult—child sexual contact appears to evoke something more than sorrow, consternation and indignation, then. It also arouses disgust. Indeed, the disgust it stirs is potentially so all-consuming that the victim as well as the perpetrator can be enveloped in it. Thus, children who have been sexually abused sometimes find themselves ostracized or rejected instead of comforted by parents, family or community. Meanwhile, those who have experienced sexual abuse in childhood often report strong and violent emotions not simply or necessarily about their abuser, but more particularly about themselves — all too frequently, they are dogged by feelings of self-disgust, self-loathing, self-contempt. The fact that adult—child sexual contact inspires such disgust should alert us to its political import, for, as William Miller has observed:

Some emotions, among which disgust and its close cousin contempt are the most prominent, have intensely political significance. They work to hierarchize our political order: in some settings they do the work of maintaining hierarchy; in other settings they constitute righteously presented claims for superiority; in yet other settings they are themselves elicited as an indication of one's proper placement in the social order. Disgust evaluates (negatively) what it touches, proclaims the meanness and inferiority of its object. (1997, p. 9)

In other words, the social emotions that attach to the sexual abuse of children in contemporary Western societies tell us as much, if not more, about the hierarchies we hold dear as they tell us about the value we place on protecting the vulnerable and defenceless in our midst.

A second important point to note about late twentieth- and early twenty-first-century Western discourse on the sexual abuse of children is that it constructs sexual child abuse as a problem that is rapidly growing, all-pervasive and also insoluble. Chris Jenks observes that 'child abuse is not an original event, there has never been a historical period nor a particular society in which children were not exploited, sexually molested

and subjected to physical and psychological violence' (1996, p. 92), and although the reporting of sexual child abuse has increased dramatically in recent years, there is no real way to support the claim that the incidence of such abuse has grown. However, academic, policy and professional interest in child abuse in general and sexual child abuse in particular has expanded rapidly in the West over the past twenty or so years. Indeed, the latter has now become big business for 'academics, for publishing, for mental health (treatment and recovery) services' (Itzin, 2000, p. 2). It has also become big media business, for it seems that despite finding the idea of adult—child sexual contact horrible and disgusting (or more likely because it disgusts), the general public has an almost insatiable appetite for tales about the sexual abuse of children.

The stories that are told and retold in newspapers, magazines and books, as well as on talk shows and in soap operas, to satisfy this appetite in the USA have been very elegantly deconstructed by James Kincaid (1998), and his analysis can equally be applied to popular narratives of child molesting in Canada, Australia and Western European countries. Scandal after scandal and revelation after revelation construct a tale in which child molesters are almost everywhere – on street corners and in playgrounds, in schools and nurseries, amusement arcades, scout camps, churches, even in Disneyland – and have molested almost everyone from the most famous of film stars through to the woman next door. Such stories also dwell on the consequences of sexual child abuse for the victim, cataloguing the many and various ways in which the damage done may manifest itself, so that virtually any social or emotional ill or dysfunction becomes explicable through reference to abuse. These are stories about an epidemic of child molesting, a terror lurking in every nook and cranny, a horror that touches all of us, and there is 'no solution and no ending' to this narrative (Kincaid, 1998, p. 10). We become more vigilant, and invest more in policing the 'paedophiles' and 'perverts' who threaten our children, only to discover that the problem is even more extensive than we had previously realized (Kincaid, 1998).

Campaigns against the commercial sexual exploitation of children, which gathered steam during the 1990s, were shaped by and also helped to reinforce these narratives of child molesting. Just as child abuse is not an original event, so we can say that there is nothing new about the 'commercial sexual exploitation of children' (CSEC) except the term itself. Where prostitution has existed, so too has what would now be deemed 'child prostitution', and for as long as people have been taking erotic photographs of adults, they have also been producing 'child pornography'. As with child abuse more generally, it would be virtually impossible to produce empirical evidence either to support or to refute the claim that more children are commercially sexually exploited today than ever before, or indeed to measure the extent of the phenomenon in the contemporary world. And yet it is widely believed that CSEC is a huge and growing problem. Its supposed exponential growth represents, according

to campaigners, the dark side of globalization and recent technological advances, and adds another layer of horror to the sexual abuse of children: the idea that there are people who profit from promoting and organizing 'the most abhorrent of crimes – sexual molestation of children' (ECPAT, 1996, p. 10).

CSEC, we are told, 'is a form of violence against the child which amounts to forced labour and a contemporary form of slavery' (ECPAT, 1999, p. 7), and in tales of CSEC, the cast-list of evil-doers is longer still than in stories of non-commercial child molesting. The paedophiles and perverts who abuse children are joined by mafia thugs and other hardened criminals, by callous parents who sell their children into sexual slavery in order to finance the purchase of satellite television, by 'intermediaries, pimps and sometimes even corrupt local authorities earning big money from this life-long psychological and physical injury of children' (Lindgren, 1996, p. 3). And the fate of the victims is even more emphatically sealed. Campaigners tell us that commercially sexually exploited children are often 'so severely injured that it is not possible to rehabilitate them to a normal life. Most children who end up in the sex industry are also soon infected with HIV/Aids or other illnesses and die before they are adults' (Radda Barnen, 1996, p. 16). Indeed, the centrality of this particular story-line to campaigns against CSEC is well illustrated by the fact that all delegates to the First World Congress Against the Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children in Stockholm, 1996, were given a copy of a book titled Rosario is Dead (Axelsson, 1996), which recounts the story a Filipino child who died as a result of sexual abuse at the hands of a tourist client. The same themes are picked up and reworked by journalists. Heather Montgomery cites two newspaper articles detailing the experience of children sold into prostitution in Thai brothels by their parents, then 'rescued by good outsiders for a brief period of happiness before dying' (2001, p. 23). She continues:

In countless other articles, the pattern is repeated: betrayal, abuse, rescue, death. There is a neatness and coherence to this story which is compelling; no loose ends and a predictable outcome. The reader is invited to be outraged at the story, and to pity the victims, but ultimately, there is no escape from the plot and nothing that can be done to help these children. Once the story begins, it can only end, unhappily ever after, with the child's death. (2001, p. 23)

And again, the struggle against those who would prey on children is one of epic proportions, not least because they are at the same time everywhere and nowhere. One moment 'the sex exploiter' appears as an unimaginable fiend, the next as the most ordinary of men, or the most prominent of citizens. As with narratives about non-commercial sexual child abuse, we are presented with a paradox: sexual interest in children is monstrous and unthinkable and yet at the same time rampant; only the most depraved of perverts could wish to use child prostitutes or child pornography, and