THIRD EDITION

Constitutional Law and Constitutional Rights in Ireland

BRIAN DOOLAN

Constitutional Law and Constitutional Rights in Ireland

THIRD EDITION

BRIAN DOOLAN

GILL & MACMILLAN

Published in Ireland by Gill & Macmillan Ltd Goldenbridge Dublin 8

with associated companies throughout the world © Brian Doolan, 1984, 1988, 1994 0 7171 2047 3 Print origination by Seton Music Graphics Ltd, Bantry, Co. Cork

Printed in Ireland by ColourBooks Ltd, Dublin

All rights reserved.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted in any form or by any means without permission of the publishers or else under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Irish Copyright Licensing Agency, The Writers' Centre, Parnell Square, Dublin 1.

A catalogue record is available for this book from the British Library.

1 3 5 4 2

PREFACE TO THE THIRD EDITION

It is an axiom that constitutional law is the foremost legal subject within our system of laws. As a body of first principles it is rapidly expanding. In the ten years since the first edition of this book, which has become the standard comprehensive introduction to the subject, the case law has increased from 101 primary cases to just over 200. There have been a number of amendments to the Constitution and a number of statutes which have altered areas of the subject matter.

Our constitutional law lends itself to a natural division of the subject matter into political rights and personal rights. This division is emphasised in the scheme of this book. Part One considers such political and governmental matters, from a purely legal viewpoint, as the Nation, the State and the institutions of government. There have been major developments in this area as these aspects of the Constitution are subjected to judicial comment. Part Two concentrates, individually, on the various personal rights available to the individual.

A study of constitutional law would be incomprehensible without a working knowledge of the case law. Law reports are often inaccessible, time-consuming to read because of their length, confusing because of the differences of reasoning or conclusion of the judges on the same subject — even in the one case, and difficult to grasp because of their language, diffusion, and sheer breadth of topics covered. As a first step in the introduction to the case law, I have retained a feature, innovative in the first edition, which was universally welcomed by reviewers and readers alike. Part Three contains, in alphabetical order, a synopsis of the 200 or so cases of constitutional importance. When the case is reached in the text the reader is referred to that case by a distinctive number which provides a quick method of reference to the facts and decision, and the otherwise constant repetition of the facts of the case is thus avoided.

I have endeavoured to explain the law as it stood on 1 January 1994.

Brian Doolan Dublin Institute of Technology 6 January 1994

AMENDMENTS OF THE CONSTITUTION

First Amendment of the Constitution Act 1939	8, 54, 338
Second Amendment of the Constitution Act 1941	8, 33, 50, 54
Third Amendment of the Constitution Act 1972	8, 16, 387
Fourth Amendment of the Constitution Act 1972	8, 83, 387
Fifth Amendment of the Constitution Act 1972	8, 387
Sixth Amendment of the Constitution (Adoption) Act	1979 8, 153, 387
Seventh Amendment of the Constitution	
(Election of Members of Seanad Éireann by Institu	ites of Higher
Education) Act 1979	8, 92, 387
Eighth Amendment of the Constitution	
(Pro-Life) Act 1983	8, 156, 158, 219, 387
Ninth Amendment of the Constitution	
(Extension of Dail Franchise) Act 1984	8, 81, 387, 393
Tenth Amendment of the Constitution Act 1987	8, 16, 387, 390, 393
Eleventh Amendment of the Constitution Act 1992	8, 16, 387
Thirteenth Amendment of the Constitution Act 1992	9, 221, 387, 393
Fourteenth Amendment of the Constitution Act 1992	9, 221, 387

TABLE OF STATUTES

* denotes British statute

Adoption Act 1952	25, 128, 2	262, 334, 37	74, 377, 390
Adoption (Amendment) Act 1974		321, 3	28, 354, 394
Adoption Act 1991		3	91, 393, 394
Age of Majority Act 1985			265
Aliens Act 1935		26, 255, 2	277, 319, 365
Bankrupt and Insolvent Act (Ireland) 18	357*		335
Betting Act 1931			303
Broadcasting Authority Act 1960		237, 375, 3	388, 390, 392
Casual Trading Act 1980		1	82, 279, 324
Central Fund (Permanent Provisions) A	ct 1965		102
Censorship of Films Acts 1923-1970			244
Censorship of Publications Acts 1929-	1967		243
Child Abduction and Enforcement of C	ustody		
Orders Act 1991		2	265, 383, 390
Children Act 1908*			328, 390
Children Act 1941			314
Civil Liability Act 1961	a		345, 388
Committee of Public Accounts of Dáil	Eireann		
(Privileges and Procedures) Act 1976	0		325
Companies Act 1963		2	228, 230, 354
Companies Act 1990			313
Conspiracy and Protection of Property	Act 1875*		233
Courts Act 1981		366,	370, 388, 393
Courts (Establishment and Constitution	i) Act 1961		118
Courts-Martial Appeal Court Act 1983			388
Courts (No. 2) Act 1988			369
Courts (Supplemental Provisions) Act 19	961 316, 34	12, 344, 388,	389, 390, 391

x Table of Statutes

Courts of Justice Act 1924 Courts of Justice Act 1936 Courts of Justice (District Court) Act 1946 Criminal Justice Act 1951 Criminal Justice Act 1964 Criminal Justice Act 1984 142, 189, 190, 19 Criminal Justice Act 1990 Criminal Justice (Legal Aid) Act 1962 Criminal Law Act 1976 Criminal Law (Amendment) Act 1885* Criminal Law (Amendment) Act 1935	33, 61, 71, 73 374 180 349 336
Criminal Law (Jurisdiction) Act 1976 Criminal Law (Rape) Act 1981	145, 182 242, 391
Criminal Law (Rape) Act 1993 Criminal Law (Sexual Offences) Act 1993	392, 394
Criminal Procedure Act 1967	202, 242, 358, 388, 391
Custom (Consolidation) Act 1876*	311
Customs (Temporary Provisions) Act 1945	294, 344
Decimal Currency Act 1969	388
Defence Act 1954	41, 71, 145, 318
Defence (Amendment) Act 1990	228
Domicile and Recognition of Foreign	
Divorces Act 1986	27, 249, 250, 388, 393, 395
Diplomatic Relations and Immunities Act 1	967 390
Dublin Police Act 1842	179
Electoral Act 1923	8, 76, 88, 339
Electoral Act 1963	42, 64, 80, 83, 86, 89, 333, 357
Electoral (Amendment) Act 1959	291, 353
Electoral (Amendment) Act 1972	390, 394
Electoral (Amendment) Act 1985	81
Electoral (Amendment) Act 1992	83
Electoral (Amendment) (No. 2) Act 1986	390, 393
Electricity (Supply) Act 1927	319
Electricity (Supply) (Amendment) Act 198	6 394
Emergency Powers Act 1976	56
Emergency Powers (Amendment) Act 1940	
Employment Equality Act 1977	392, 393
Enforcement of Court Orders Act 1926	206
European Communities Act 1972	17, 309, 343
European Communities Act 1986	17
Excise Management Act 1890*	347

xii Table of Statutes

Industrial Relations Act 1990 Industrial Training Authority Act 1967 Institute of Chartered Accountants in Ireland (Charter Amendment) Act 1966 Interpretation Act 1937 Intoxicating Liquor Act 1927 Irish Nationality and Citizenship Act 1956 Irish Nationality and Citizenship Act 1986	233 304 19 191 378 24, 76, 369 25, 255, 392, 393
Juries Act 1927 Juries Act 1976	311 82, 142, 393
Land Act 1923 Land Bond Act 1934 Landlord and Tenant Act 1931 Larceny Act 1916* Legitimacy Act 1931 Legitimacy Declaration (Ireland) Act 1868* Litter Act 1982 Livestock Marts Act 1967 Local Government Act 1941 Local Government (Nomination of Presidential Callocal Government (Planning and Development) Act 1963 Local Government (Planning and Development) Act 1963 Local Government (Planning and Development) Act 1963 Lunatic Asylums (Ireland) Act 1875*	243, 304, 327
	39 332, 390 334 206, 284, 305 335 100 178, 179, 181, 352, 362 180 352 349, 392 , 144, 178, 182, 184, 187, , 194, 227, 232, 237, 308, 0, 363, 364, 371, 380, 392

Road Transport Acts 1932–33	358
School Attendance Acts 1926–1967	259
Seanad Electoral (Panel Members) Acts 1947–1954	94, 96
Seanad Electoral (University Members) Act 1937	92
Sinn Féin Funds Act 1947	302
Social Welfare (Consolidation) Act 1981	312

xiv Table of Statutes

327 956 394
354
17.70
388, 394
264, 392, 393, 394
283, 303, 350
962 375
246, 247, 298, 350, 388, 390
350
318, 392
348
314, 360
389
507
229, 388
223,000
331
300
245
243
351, 394

TABLE OF CASES

1.	Abbey Films Ltd v Attorney General
~	[1981] IR 158 137, 154, 160, 276, 285, 289
2.	Abbott v ITGWU HC 2/12/1980 226, 289
3.	Abdelkefti v Minister for Justice [1984] ILRM 138 254, 290, 388
	Ambiorix Ltd v Minister for the Environment
	[1992] ILRM 209 34, 108, 109
4.	Article 26 and the Adoption (No. 2) Act 1987 [1989]
	ILRM 266 51, 52, 257, 259, 262, 264, 290
5.	Article 26 and the Criminal Law (Jurisdiction) Bill 1975
	[1977] IR 129; 110 ILTR 69 20, 21, 39, 291, 386
6.	Article 26 and the Electoral (Amendment) Bill 1961
	[1961] IR 169 51, 77, 79, 291, 394
7.	Article 26 and the Electoral (Amendment) Bill 1983
	[1984] IR 268 10, 51, 52, 131, 292
8.	Article 26 and the Emergency Powers Bill 1976
	[1977] IR 159 40, 51, 55, 57, 190, 292
9.	Article 26 and the Housing (Private Rented Dwellings)
	Bill 1981 [1983] IR 181; [1983] ILRM 246 51, 127, 269, 292
10.	Article 26 and the Offences Against the State
	(Amendment) Bill 1940 [1940] IR 470;
	74 ILTR 61 33, 50, 56, 105, 152, 205, 293, 394
11.	Article 26 and the School Attendance Bill 1942
	[1943] IR 334; 77 ILTR 96 30, 44, 51, 259, 293
	Attorney General v Cooke (1924) 58 ILTR 157 240
12.	
	[1984] ILRM 373 128, 160, 235, 280, 294, 386
	Attorney General v Simpson (1959) 93 ILTR 33 243, 245
13.	
	(1960) 94 ILTR 161 269, 294
14.	
- 11	Industry [1993] ILRM 81 30, 101, 29:

xvi Table of Cases

16.	Attorney General v Hamilton [1993] ILRM 821 Attorney General v X. [1992] ILRM 401 Attorney General (Society for the Protection of	59, 295 155, 220, 296
	Unborn Children Ltd) v Open Line Counselling Ltd [1987] ILRM 477; [1989] ILRM 19 155, 160, 16	
	Attorney General (Society for the Protection of Unbor Children Ltd) v Open Door Counselling Ltd SC 20/ Attorney General for England and Wales v Brandon	n
17.	Book Publishers Ltd [1986] IR 579; [1987] ILRM 1 Aughey v Attorney General [1986] ILRM 206;	234
	[1989] ILRM 87	228, 297
18. 19.	Bank of Ireland v Caffin [1971] IR 123 Beamish & Crawford Ltd v Crowley [1969] IR 142	249, 298 113, 298
20.	Becton, Dickinson Ltd v Lee [1973] IR 1 Beechams Group Ltd v Bristol Meyers Co.	225
20.	[1983] IR 325; [1983] ILRM 500	120
	Berkeley v Edwards [1988] IR 217	275
21.	Blake, deceased, In re [1955] IR 69	262, 299
22.	Blake v Attorney General [1981] ILRM 34;	
		66, 268, 292, 299
23.	Boland v An Taoiseach [1974] IR 338; 109 ILTR 13	
	Bourke v Attorney General [1972] IR 36; 107 ILTR 3	
	Brady v Donegal County Council [1989] ILRM 282	118
	Breathnach v Ireland HC 20/12/1991	109
24.	Brendan Dunne Ltd v Fitzpatrick [1958] IR 29	233, 242, 300
25.	Brennan v Attorney General [1984] ILRM 355	166, 273, 300
26.	Browne v Attorney General HC 6/2/1991	274, 301
27.	Buckley v Attorney General [1950] IR 67	30, 282, 302
28.	Burke v Burke [1951] IR 216; 84 ILTR 70	261, 302
	Byrne v Grey [1988] IR 31	183, 199, 276
29.	Byrne v Ireland [1972] IR 241	15, 18, 302, 327
	C. v C. HC 9/12/1981	199
	C. v Director of Public Prosecutions [1992] ILRM 14	1 137
30.	Cafolla v Attorney General [1985] IR 486;	
	[1986] ILRM 177	275, 280, 303
31.	Cahill v Sutton [1980] IR 269	125, 303
	Cahill v Reilly HC 24/3/1992	172
	Campus Oil Ltd v Minister for Energy [1983] IR 88;	
	[1984] ILRM 45	120, 128
	Cartmill v Ireland [1987] IR 192; [1988] ILRM 430	141, 388
32.	Cashman v Attorney General [1990] ILRM 200	32, 303

33.	Central Dublin Development Association v Attorney Ge	neral	
		267, 270,	304
	Charleton v Ireland [1984] ILRM 39		140
34.	Cityview Press Ltd v An Chomhairle Oiliúna [1980] IR	381 45,	304
35.	Clancy v Ireland [1989] IR 670	270,	305
36.		206, 305,	
	Clarke v McMahon [1990] ILRM 648		209
	Condon v CIE HC 16/11/1984		173
37.	Condon v Minister for Labour [1981] IR 62	34,	306
	Connolly v McConnell [1983] IR 172		174
	Connors v McLaughlin [1921] 2 IR 51		181
38.	Conroy v Attorney General [1965] IR 411 33, 139,	140, 219,	306
39.	Conway v Irish National Teachers' Organisation		
	[1991] ILRM 497 163,	260, 265,	307
	Cosgrove v Ireland [1982] ILRM 48	254,	257
40.	Costello v Director of Public Prosecutions		
	[1984] ILRM 413; [1984] IR 436	35, 132,	307
41.	Cowan v Attorney General [1961] IR 44	149,	307
42.	Cox v Attorney General SC 11/7/1991	145, 281,	308
43.	Crotty v An Taoiseach [1987] IR 713;		
	[1987] ILRM 400 16, 17, 36, 99, 103, 105,		
44.	Crowley v Ireland [1980] IR 102	260, 309,	
45.	Cullen v Attorney General [1979] IR 394	139,	
	Cullen v Toibín [1985] ILRM 577		240
	Cumann Luthchleas Gael Teo v Windle SC 22/6/1993		147
	Cunningham v Governor of Mountjoy Prison HC 5/12/	1985	204
46.	Curtis v Attorney General [1985] IR 458; [1986]		
	ILRM 428	137,	
	D. v Director of Public Prosecutions SC 17/11/1993		137
47.		, 164, 222,	
	Dalton v Dalton [1982] ILRM 418		248
10	Davern v Butler [1927] IR 182; 61 ILTR 100	22	239
48.	Deaton v Attorney General [1963] IR 170; 98 ILTR 99	33.	, 311
49.	de Búrca v Attorney General [1976] IR 38;		0.77
=0	111 ILTR 37 85, 127, 131, 142	, 166, 311,	
50.	Deighan v Hearne SC 1/3/1990		312
51.	Dennehy v Minister for Social Welfare	171 170	0.10
	HC 26/7/1984	161, 168	, 312
52.	Desmond v Glackin and Minister for Industry	120 041	211
		, 139, 241	
53.		170	, 313
	Dillon v Minister for Posts & Telegraphs SC 3/6/1981		8.

xviii Table of Cases

54.	Director of Public Prosecutions v Gallagher	183, 286 182, 285
	[1991] ILRM 339	203, 314
	Director of Public Prosecutions v Holly [1984] ILRM 149	105
	Director of Public Prosecutions v McCreesh	
	[1992] ILRM 239 180, 183, 276,	285, 286
	Director of Public Prosecutions v McMahon	
	[1986] IR 393; [1987] ILRM 87	201, 277
	Director of Public Prosecutions v Rooney [1993] ILRM 61	179
	Director of Public Prosecutions v Ryan [1989] ILRM 333	202
	Director of Public Prosecutions v Sheehy [1987] ILRM 142	191
55.	Dooley v Attorney General [1977] IR 205	314
	Dowman v Ireland [1986] ILRM 111	180
	Downes v Director of Public Prosecutions	
	[1987] IR 139; [1987] ILRM 665	136
56.	Doyle, In re SC 21/12/1955;	
	[1989] ILRM 277 158, 219, 257	, 260, 314
57.	Draper v Attorney General [1984] ILRM 643; [1984] IR 277	82, 315
58.	Dreher v Irish Land Commission [1984] ILRM 94	273, 315
	Dunne v Clinton [1930] IR 366; 64 ILTR 136	186, 195
	Dutton v O'Donnell [1989] IR 218	204
50	E D . I D (1001) II DM 105	247 216
59.	E. R. v J. R. [1981] ILRM 125	247, 316
60.	Eamonn Andrews Productions Ltd v Gaiety Theatre	100 216
	Enterprises Ltd [1973] IR 295	120, 316
21	Earle, In re [1938] IR 485	239
61.	East Donegal Co-operative Livestock Mart Ltd v	
	Attorney General [1970] IR 317;	217 201
(0	104 ILTR 81 30, 44, 124, 130, 159, 166, 175	
62.	Eccles v Ireland [1985] IR 545; [1986] ILRM 343	143, 317
63.	Educational Co. of Ireland v Fitzpatrick [1961] IR 345 155, 164, 224	1 222 219
61	Egan v Minister for Defence HC 24/11/1988	281, 318
64.	EI Co. Ltd v Kennedy [1968] IR 69	242
	Ellis v O'Dea [1990] ILRM 87	14, 209
65.		3, 272, 319
03.	ESB V Golffley [1965] ILRIVI 494, [1965] IK 129	5, 212, 317
66.	Fajujonu v Minister for Justice [1990] ILRM 234	255, 319
	Fakih v Minister for Justice HC 6/3/1992	106
67.		7, 320

	Finnegan v An Bord Pleanála SC 27/7/1979 Finucane v McMahon [1990] ILRM 505 209,	84, 85 214, 222	
68.	Fisher v Irish Land Commission [1984] IR 3; 82 ILTR 50 Folens & Co. Ltd v Minister for Education [1981] ILRM 21	148, 320	
69.	Foley v Irish Land Commission [1952] IR 118; 86 ILTR 44	320	
0).	Frost, Infants, In re [1947] IR 3; 82 ILTR 44	256	
	110st, mants, m1c [1747] IK 3, 62 ILTK 44	230	
70.	G. v An Bord Uchtála [1980] IR 32;		
	112 ILTR 25 153, 157, 263,		
71.	G. v G. [1984] IR 368	250, 321	
	Gaffney v Gaffney [1975] IR 133	249	1
	Garda Representative Association v Ireland [1989] IR 193	60)
	Geoghegan v Institute of Chartered Accountants		
	in Ireland HC 9/7/1993	19	
	Geraghty v Minister for Local Government [1975] IR 330	108	
72.	Glavin v Governor of Mountjoy Prison [1991] ILRM 478 115	, 137, 322	2
	Gomaa v Minister for Foreign Affairs HC 24/7/1992	24	ŀ
73.	Goodman International v Tribunal of Inquiry into the Beef		
	Processing Industry [1992] ILRM 145 40, 113, 136,	137, 322	
	Government of Canada v Employment Appeals Tribunal		
	[1992] ILRM 325	106)
	Greene v Minister for Agriculture [1990] ILRM 364	17, 247	1
	H. v H. HC 4/2/1976	261	l
74.	H. v John Murphy & Sons Ltd [1987] IR 621;		
	[1988] ILRM 300	253, 323	3
	Hamilton v Hamilton [1982] IR 466; [1982] ILRM 290 39	, 269, 283	3
75.	Hand v Dublin Corporation [1991] ILRM 556	279, 324	1
	Hannigan v Clifford [1990] ILRM 65	137	7
76.	Hardy v Ireland SC 18/3/1993	137, 324	4
	Harvey v Minister for Social Welfare [1990] ILRM 185	45	5
77.	Haughey, In re [1971] IR 217 31, 41, 60, 61, 139	, 175, 325	5
78.	Heaney v Minister for Finance [1986] ILRM 164	166, 326	5
79.	Hempenstall v Minister for the Environment		
	[1993] ILRM 318	271, 326	5
80.	Holohan v Donohoe [1986] ILRM 250; [1986] IR 45	120, 326	6
	Howard v Commissioners of Public Works SC 26/5/1993	18, 327	7
	Hunt v County Roscommon VEC HC 1/5/1981	109	
	Hutchinson v Minister for Justice [1993] ILRM 602	106, 10	7
82.	Hyland v Minister for Social Welfare [1990] ILRM 213	247, 32	
	Incorporated Law Society v Minister for Justice [1987] ILR		

xx Table of Cases

	Irish Employers' Mutual Insurance, In re [1955] IR 17 Irish Family Planning v Ryan [1979] IR 295	6		386 244
	J, an infant, In re [1966] IR 295 J. C., In re HC 25/7/1985			252 283
83.	J. H. (Otherwise R.), an infant, In re [1985] ILRM 302		0.00	220
02-	[1986] ILRM 65; [1985] IR 375	258,		
osa.	J. v Delap [1989] IR 167		139,	
	Jennings v Quinn [1968] IR 305 Joyce, Corbet v Fagan, In re [1946] IR 277			191 26
	K. D. (Otherwise C.) v M. C. [1985] IR 697; [1987] II	LRM 18	39	249
	K. v W. [1990] ILRM 121			264
	Kane v Governor of Mountjoy Prison			
	[1988] ILRM 724	178,	184,	223
84.	Keady v Commissioner of An Garda Síochána			
-	[1992] ILRM 312	113,	148,	329
85.	Kearney v Minister for Justice [1986] IR 116;			12 2 12
	[1987] ILRM 52		204,	
0.0	Keating v Governor of Mountjoy Prison [1990] ILRM	1 850	189,	
86.	Kennedy v Hearne [1988] ILRM 531			330
87.	Kennedy v Ireland [1987] IR 587; [1988] ILRM 472	15		
0.0	Keegan v de Búrca [1973] ILRM 223	146,		
88.		5, 137,		
89.	Kostan v Ireland [1978] ILRM 12	9, 141,	159,	, 332
90.	L. v L. [1991] ILRM 115		253.	, 332
	L. B. v H. B. [1980] ILRM 257			249
91.	Landers v Attorney General (1975) 109 ILTR 1	168,	259	, 332
	Lawrie v Muir 1950 SC (J) 19			196
	Lennon v Ganly [1981] ILRM 84			223
92.	L'Henryenat v Ireland [1983] IR 193;			
	[1984] ILRM 249	159,	203	, 333
	Little v Cooper [1937] IR 510; 69 ILTR 108			239
93.	Loftus v Attorney General [1979] IR 221		80	, 333
	Lynch v Fitzgerald [1938] IR 382; 71 ILTR 212			232
	Lynham v Butler [1933] IR 74; 67 ILTR 75			112
94.	M. v An Bord Uchtála [1975] IR 81; 109 ILTR 62	76, 334,	391	
	M. v An Bord Uchtála [1977] IR 287			130
95.	M. v The Medical Council [1984] IR 485		149	. 334