# Functional Jurisdiction in the Law of the Sea

MARIA GAVOUNELI

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS LEIDEN / BOSTON

# Functional Jurisdiction in the Law of the Sea

MARIA GAVOUNELI

This book is printed on acid-free paper.

A Cataloging-in-Publication record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN: 978 90 04 16345 4

© 2007 Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill Academic Publishers, Martinus Nijhoff Publishers and VSP.

http://www.brill.nl

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use is granted by Brill Academic Publishers provided that the appropriate fees are paid directly to The Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Suite 910, Danvers MA 01923, USA. Fees are subject to change.

Printed and bound in The Netherlands.

Every book is a story. This is a story about haddocks, stingrays and the ship above them.

I wrote it surrounded by a bevy of willing young minds and a host of old friends and family. For the comfort, the support, the helping hand, the little messages of kind words, I thank you all.

And all my gratitude and love for  $\tau ov \kappa \alpha \lambda \delta$   $\mu ov$ , in the truest Greek sense of the word. For bearing with me...

Athens, March 2007

#### **FOREWORD**

It is a commonplace observation that the 1982 UN Convention on the Law of the Sea establishes a framework for the Law of the Sea that is based upon two different concepts. One is a zonal analysis, which takes the juridical zones into which the seas are divided and stipulates the basic rules applicable to each of them in turn. The other is a topical analysis, taking some of the main activities on the seas, such as fishing, marine research and pollution, and again setting out the basic rules for each. The framework is, however, incomplete, and a great deal is left open, not only to be worked out in more detailed treaties but also to be governed by more general principles of international law. In this way the 1982 regime will continue to develop to meet new challenges and changed circumstances.

In this monograph Dr Gavouneli explores these issues and offers an expert insight into the jurisdictional developments that are clearly discernable a quarter-century after the adoption of the Convention. Her keen analysis moves from fundamental principles governing jurisdiction in international law to shrewd reflections on the significance of current developments such as the Proliferation Security Initiative and questions of jurisdiction over the international seabed area. This thoughtful text will be of real interest to all who have a concern with the directions in which the contemporary Law of the Sea is growing.

Vaughan Lowe Oxford, August 2007

## **ABBREVIATIONS**

ADM Annuaire du Droit de la Mer

AEDPA Anti-terrorism & Effective Death Penalty Act (USA)

AFDI Annuaire français de droit international

African JICL African Journal of International & Comparative Law

AJCL American Journal of Comparative Law AJIL American Journal of International Law

APM Associated Protective Measures

ARIEL Austrian Review of International & European Law
Arizona JICL Arizona Journal of International & Comparative Law

Asia Pacific JEL Asia Pacific Journal of Environmental Law

Asian YBIL Asian Yearbook of International Law

ASR Articles on State Responsibility

ATBA Areas to be Avoided

AWPPA Arctic Waters Pollution Prevention Act (Canada)

BCN weapons Biological, chemical & nuclear weapons Berkeley JIL Berkeley Journal of International Law

BOE Boletín oficial del Estado

**Boston College** 

ICLR Boston College International & Comparative Law Review

Boston ULR Boston University Law Review

Brooklyn JIL Brooklyn Journal of International Law
Buffalo HRLR Buffalo Human Rights Law Review
BYBIL British Yearbook of International Law

California LR California Law Review

California

Western ILJ California Western International Law Journal

Cambridge YB European Legal

Studies Cambridge Yearbook of European Legal Studies

Canadian YBIL Canadian Yearbook of International Law

CAS Condition Assessment Scheme

CBD Convention on Biological Diversity

CCAMLR Convention for the Conservation of

Antarctic Marine Living Resources

CCSBT Commission for the Conservation of Southern Bluefin Tuna

CDEMs Construction, design, equipment and manning standards

CETS Council of Europe Treaty Series
CFR Code of Federal Regulations

CFSP Common Foreign & Security Policy (European Union)

CITES Convention on international trade in endangered species

of wild fauna & flora

CMLR Common Market Law Review

Colorado JIELP Colorado Journal of International Environmental Law

& Policy

COLREG Convention on the International Regulations for Preventing

Collisions at Sea (IMO)

Columbia J

Transn'l L Columbia Journal of Transnational Law

Cornell Law Review
CSA

Canada Shipping Act

DOALOS Division for Ocean Affairs and the Law of the Sea

EC European Community

ECHR European Court of Human Rights

ECJ European Court of Justice
Ecology LQ Ecology Law Quarterly
ECOSOC Economic & Social Council

ECR European Court Reports

EEC European Economic Community

EEnvLR European Environmental Law Review

EEZ Exclusive Economic Zone

EJIL European Journal of International Law

Emory ILR Emory International Law Review

Env'l &

Planning LJ Environmental & Planning Law Journal

ETS European Treaty Series

EU European Union

European LR European Law Review

FAO Food & Agricultural Organisation

#### **ABBREVIATIONS**

Florida JIL Florida Journal of International Law

Georgetown

IELR Georgetown International Environmental Law Review
Georgia JICL Georgia Journal of International & Comparative Law

Georgia JICLQ Georgia Journal of International Comparative Law Quarterly

Georgia LR Georgia Law Review

GFCM General Fisheries Commission for the Mediterranean

GYBIL German Yearbook of International Law Harvard ILJ Harvard International Law Journal Harvard JLPP Harvard Journal of Law & Public Policy

Hofstra LR Hofstra Law Review

IATCC Inter-American Tropical Tuna Commission

ICC International Criminal Court

ICCAT International Commission for the Conservation

of Atlantic Tunas

ICCPR International Covenant on Civil & Political Rights

ICJ International Court of Justice

ICLO International & Comparative Law Quarterly

ICTY International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia

IELR International Environmental Law Reports

LIMCL International Journal of Marine & Coastal Law

ILA International Law Association
 ILC International Law Commission
 ILM International Legal Materials
 ILO International Labour Organisation

ILR International Law Reports

IMO International Maritime Organisation
INDEMER Institut du droit économique de la mer
Indian JIL Indian Journal of International Law
IOFC Indian Ocean Fishery Commission
IOrg. R. International Organisations Law Review

IOrgLR International Organisations Law Review

IOTC Indian Ocean Tuna Commission
ISA International Seabed Authority

ISM Code International Code for the Safe Operation of Ships and

for Pollution Prevention (IMO)

Israel YBHR Israel Yearbook of Human Rights
Italian YBIL Italian Yearbook of International Law

ITLOS International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea
IUU fishing Illegal, Unreported & Unregulated fishing

IWC International Whaling Committee

JDI Journal de droit international

JEL Journal of Environmental Law

JENRL Journal of Energy and Natural Resources Law
JHA Justice & Home Affairs (European Union)
JICJ Journal of International Criminal Justice
JIML Journal of International Maritime Law
JMLC Journal of Maritime Law & Commerce

JO Journal Officiel (France)

Leiden JIL Leiden Journal of International Law

LOSC Law of the Sea Convention

MARPOL International Convention for the Prevention of Pollution

from Ships (IMO)

Max Planck

YBUNL Max Planck Yearbook of United Nations Law

Melbourne JIL Melbourne Journal of International Law Melbourne ULR Melbourne University Law Review

MERC Marine Environment Protection Committee (IMO)

Michigan JIL Michigan Journal of International Law

MOU Memorandum of Understanding
NAFO North Atlantic Fisheries Organisation

NEAFC North-Eastern Atlantic Fisheries Commission

NGO Non Governmental Organisation

NILR Netherlands International Law Review
Nordic JIL Nordic Journal of International Law
NPT Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons

NRJ Natural Resources Journal

NYBIL Netherlands Yearbook of International Law

NYUJILP New York University Journal of International Law & Policy

NZJEL New Zealand Journal of Environmental Law

OAS Organization of American States

Ocean YB Ocean Yearbook

OCLJ Ocean & Coastal Law Journal

ODIL Ocean Development & International Law

OECD Organisation of Economic Cooperation & Development

OJ Official Journal

OPA Oil Pollution Act (USA)

Oregon LR Oregon Law Review

OSPAR Convention for the Protection of the Marine Environment

of the North-East Atlantic

Ottawa LR Ottawa Law Review

Pace ILR Pace International Law Review PCA Permanent Court of Arbitration

PCIJ Permanent Court of International Justice

PC-TJ Committee of Experts on Transnational Justice (CoE)

PSI Proliferation Security Initiative
PSSA Particularly Sensitive Sea Area
RBDI Revue belge de droit international

RCADI Recueil des cours de l'Académie de droit international

RCDIP Revue critique de droit international privé

RDI Rivista di diritto internazionale

RECIEL Review of European Community &

International Environmental Law

REDI Revista española de derecho internacional
RFMO Regional Fisheries Management Organisation

RFO Regional Fisheries Organisation RGA Rivista giuridica dell'ambiente

RGDIP Revue général de droit international public
RHDI Revue hellénique de droit international
RJE Revue juridique de l'environnement

RMCUE Revue de marché commun et de l'Union européenne

S.Ct. Supreme Court (USA)

San Diego ILJ San Diego International Law Journal

San Diego LR San Diego Law Review

SAR International Convention on Maritime Search & Rescue (IMO)

SEAFO Convention on the conservation & management

of the fisheries resources of the South East Atlantic

Singapore JICL Singapore Journal of International & Comparative Law

SIPRI Stockholm International Peace Research Institute

SOFA Status of Forces Agreement

SOLAS International Convention on the Safety of Life at Sea (IMO)

South African

YBIL South African Yearbook of International Law

Spanish YBIL Spanish Yearbook of International Law SPAW Specially Protected Areas & Wildlife

SPRFMO South Pacific Regional Fisheries Management Organisation

STCW International Convention on Standards of Training, Certification & Watchkeeping for Seafarers (IMO)

SUA Convention for the Suppression of Unlawful Acts against

Convention the Safety of Maritime Navigation (IMO)

Suffolk

Transn'l LR Suffolk Transnational Law Review

Sydney LR Sydney Law Review

Syracuse JICL Syracuse Journal of International & Comparative Law Syracuse JILC Syracuse Journal of International Law & Commerce

TAC Total Allowable Catch

Temple ICLJ Temple International & Comparative Law Journal

Tennessee LR Tennessee Law Review

Texas JIL Texas Journal of International Law

Texas LR Texas Law Review

TIJMCL The International Journal of Marine & Coastal Law

Transportation

LJ Transportation Law Journal

Tulane ELJ Tulane Environmental Law Journal

Tulane JICL Tulane Journal of International & Comparative Law

Tulane LR Tulane Law Review

U Miami IALR University of Miami Interamerican Law Review

UDHR Universal Declaration of Human Rights

UK United Kingdom
UN United Nations

UNCED United Nations Conference on Environment & Development

UNCLOS United Nations Conference on the Law of the Sea

UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific & Cultural Organisation

UNHCR United Nations High Commission for Refugees
UNICPLOS United Nations Informal Consultative Process

on the Law of the Sea

UNRIAA United Nations Reports of International Arbitral Awards

UNTS United Nations Treaty Series

#### **ABBREVIATIONS**

US United States

USC United States Code
UST United States Treaties

Vanderbilt J

Transn'l L Vanderbilt Journal of Transnational Law

Vermont LR Vermont Law Review

Virginia JIL Virginia Journal of International Law

VTS Vessel Traffic Services

WCPFC Western & Central Pacific Fisheries Committee

West Indian LJ West Indian Law Journal WHO World Health Organisation

Wisconsin ILJ Wisconsin International Law Journal

WMD Weapons of Mass Destruction

WMUJMA World Maritime University Journal of Maritime Affairs

WTO World Trade Organisation

Yale JIL Yale Journal of International Law

YBIEL Yearbook of International Environmental Law YBILC Yearbook of the International Law Commission ZaöRV Zeitschrift für ausländisches öffentliches Recht

& Völkerrecht

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Forew	ord	ix
Abbre	viations	xi
Part I		
Jurisa	liction in the Law of the Sea	1
Chapt		
The m	nanifestations of jurisdiction	5
1.	Territoriality	7
2.	Nationality	13
3.	Universality	19
4.	Passive personality & the protective principle	29
Chapt	er 2	
State j	urisdiction in the sea	33
1.	The flag State	34
2.	The coastal State	39
3.	The port State	44
4.	Concurrent jurisdiction in the law of the sea	49
Part II		
Challe	enges to the jurisdictional zones	59
Chapt	er 3	
	iction in the exclusive economic zone	61
1.	The balance of power	62
2.	The outer limits of a balancing act	69
3.	The attraction of unilateralism	82
4.	De uni pluria?	90
Chapt	er 4	
	ries jurisdiction in the high seas	97
1.	The traditional regulation of high seas fisheries	98

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

2.	Institutional approaches to jurisdictional challenges	107
3.	Jurisdiction without consent?	118
4.	From freedom to fish to a right of access?	127
Part II	I	
Challe	nges to the allocation of jurisdiction	131
Chapte	er 5	
Jurisdi	ction in the deep sea	133
1.	The jurisdictional exception of the deep seabed	136
2.	An institutional approach?	141
3.	Manifestations of the freedoms of the high seas	147
4.	Parallel jurisdictions in the deep sea.	152
Chapte	er 6	
Challe	nges to jurisdiction in the high seas	157
1.	The limits of flag State jurisdiction	159
2.	Expanding jurisdiction?	165
3.	Limitations to flag State exclusivity?	171
4.	A solid foundation	177
Table of treaties		179
Table	of documents	191
Table of legislation		203
Table of cases		209
Bibliography		215
Index		277

#### PARTI

## JURISDICTION IN THE LAW OF THE SEA

When on 10 December 1982 the Law of the Sea Convention<sup>1</sup> was finally concluded, after one of the lengthier ever negotiations in international law-making, the end-product was truly impressive. Much more than a codifying treaty in progressive development of a very old branch of international law or even simply "a constitution for the oceans"<sup>2</sup>, the new instrument created an integral normative system, complete with a compulsory dispute settlement mechanism and its own (though non-exclusive) judicial forum. It was also a new blueprint for the partition of the sea<sup>3</sup>, a monumental allocation of powers strongly reminiscent of – and certainly comparable to – the very real struggle<sup>4</sup> underpinning the intellectual duel evidenced in Huig de Groot's *Mare liberum* (1609)<sup>5</sup> and John Shelden's *Mare clausus* (1635)<sup>6</sup>. As such the Law of the Sea Convention (LOSC) was the culmination of the tug-of-war between the sovereignty of the coastal State, which atavistically purports to expand its power further and further away from land; and the freedom of the

<sup>1 1833</sup> UNTS 396; 21 ILM 1982, pp. 1261-1354.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Thus the statement of Tommy T.B. Koh, President of the Third UN Conference on the Law of the Sea; see <www.un.org/Depts/los/convention\_agreements/texts/koh\_english.pdf>; see also Robin R. Churchill, 10 Years of the UN Convention on the Law of the Sea – Towards a global ocean regime? A general appraisal, 48 GYBIL 2005, pp. 81-116, at pp. 84-88; Shirley V. Scott, The Law of the Sea Convention as a constitutional regime for the oceans, in Alex G. Oude Elferink (ed.), Stability and change in the Law of the Sea: The role of the Law of the Sea Convention (Martinus Nijhoff, 2005) pp. 9-38; Bernard H. Oxman, The rule of law and the United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 7 EJIL 1996, pp. 353-371.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> P.J. Allott, Power-sharing in the Law of the Sea, 77 AJIL 1983, pp. 1-30.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> For the history of the law of the sea in detail see D.P. O'Connell, *The International Law of the Sea* (vol. I, Clarendon, Oxford 1982) pp. 1-28; R.P. Anand, *Origin and Development of the Law of the Sea: History of International Law Revisited* (Martinus Nijhoff, The Hague 1983); Hugo Caminos & Vicente Marotta Rangel, Sources of the Law of the Sea, *in* René-Jean Dupuy & Daniel Vignes (eds.), *A Handbook of the New Law of the Sea* (Martinus Nijhoff, Dordrecht 1991) pp. 29-139; T. Scovazzi, The evolution of international law of the sea: New issues, new challenges, 286 *RCADI* 2000, pp. 39-244, at pp. 55-121.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Anonymous, Mare liberum sive de jure, quod Batavis competit ad Indicana commercia, dissertatio (Ludguni Batavorum 1609); Hugo Grotius, The Freedom of the Seas (Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, New York, reprinted 1952).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> J. Seldenus, Mare clausum seu de dominio maris libri duo (Londini 1635).

high seas, a principle partly created as a reflexion of the impossibility to subdue the vast expanse of water for long centuries in human history.

The trend was already in place when the 1930 Hague Conference for the Codification of International Law was convened, where Bases of Discussion No. 1 stated: "A State possesses sovereignty over a belt of sea around its coasts; this belt constitutes its territorial waters". The 1945 Truman Proclamations on the continental shelf and coastal fisheries ushered in a wave of similar proclamations in a continuing wave of expansion — all the way to the Chilean concept of *mar presencial*, first introduced by Admiral Jorge Martinez Busch, Commander in Chief of the Chilean Navy and tentatively defined as

"[a] type of contiguous zone to the exclusive economic zone, in which the State may prevent infringements of its fishing, research and resources exploitation interests in the exclusive economic zone" 13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Thus Joe Verhoeven, *Droit international public* (Larcier, Bruxelles 2000) at p. 521; although one should also keep in mind the Roman *mare nostrum* approach to the Mediterranean Sea and the *Inter Caetera* bull of Pope Alexander VI, done on 4 May 1493; text available at <br/>
<br/>
sullsburning.itgo.com/essays/Caetera#theBull>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Reproduced in S. Rosenne (ed.), League of Nations Conference for the Codification of International Law 1930 (vol. II, Oceana, New York 1975) at p. 235. See also Jesse S. Reeves, The codification of the law of territorial waters, 24 AJIL 1930, pp. 486-499.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Presidential Proclamation No. 2667, Policy of the United States with respect to the natural resources of the subsoil and the sea bed of the continental shelf, 28 September 1945, 10 Federal Registry 12303, [1943-48] 3 CFR §68. It was further supplemented by Executive Order No. 9633, 28th September 1945, 10 Federal Registry 12305, [1943-48] 3 CFR §437. See also Donald Cameron Watt, First steps in the enclosure of the oceans. The origins of Truman's Proclamation on the Resources of the Continental Shelf, 3 Marine Policy 1979, pp. 211-214.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Presidential Proclamation No. 2668, Policy of the United States with respect to coastal fisheries in certain areas of the high seas, 28 September 1945, 10 Federal Registry 12304, [1943-48] 3 CFR §68. Again it was further supplemented by Executive Order No. 9634, 28th September 1945, 10 Federal Registry 12305, [1943-48] 3 CFR §437.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> 4 Whiteman's Digest of International Law 1964, at p. 740. See, however, Georges Scelle, Plateau continental et droit international, RGDIP 1955, pp. 5-65.

<sup>12 &</sup>quot;La gran tarea de esta generación es la ocupación efectiva de nuestro mar", Clase magistral dictada por el Comandante en Jefe de la Armada, Valparaíso, 4 May 1990; Jorge Martinez Busch, El mar presencial: un nuevo concepto unificador del derecho internacional del mar, 60 Revista de Derecho de la Universidad de Concepción 1992, pp. 7-24.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Jane Gilliland Dalton, The Chilean *mar presencial*: A harmless concept or a dangerous precedent? 8 *IJMCL* 1993, pp. 397-418, at p. 400. For an overview see Francisco Orrego Vicuña, La 'mer de présence': un nouveau développement en droit international à l'égard de la pêche en haute mer, 7 *Espaces et ressources maritimes* 1993, pp. 32-46; *contra*: Thomas A. Clingan, Jr., Mar presencial (the presential sea): déjà-vu all over again? – a response to Francisco Orrego Vicuña, 24 *ODIL* 1993, pp. 93-97; Christopher C. Joyner & Peter N. DeCola, Chile's presential sea proposal: implications for straddling stocks and the international law of fisheries, 24 *ODIL* 1993, pp. 99-121; Bernard Labat, Le concept chilien de 'mer presentielle'

The 1958 UN Conference on the Law of the Sea (UNCLOS I) ended up with the adoption of four conventions<sup>14</sup> and the creation of five zones in the sea15: internal waters, territorial sea, the contiguous zone, the high seas and, underneath it all, the continental shelf. This zonal approach, mostly based on concentric circles drawn from the baseline, was further accentuated in the Law of the Sea Convention, where the distance element was replaced by a spatial element tout court. We now have six categories of marine water spaces: internal waters<sup>16</sup>, territorial sea<sup>17</sup>, archipelagic waters<sup>18</sup>, contiguous zone<sup>19</sup>, exclusive economic zone (EEZ)<sup>20</sup>, high seas<sup>21</sup>; and two categories of marine underwater areas: the continental shelf<sup>22</sup> and the Area<sup>23</sup> – and perhaps even a archaeological zone<sup>24</sup>. The 'unlimited expanse' of Grotius has been converted into tidy stripes of jurisdiction, often vying for the same territory. In a typical example25, the contiguous zone is a part of the high seas, if the coastal State has not declared an exclusive economic zone; otherwise, it becomes a part of the exclusive economic zone. Similarly, when no exclusive economic zone exists, the waters above the continental shelf are the high

et ses conséquences sur le régime de la pêche dans la partie de la haute mer adjacente à la limite des 200 milles marins, 2 *Annuaire du Droit de la Mer* 1997, pp. 29-52.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Convention on the High Seas, 450 UNTS 82; Convention on the Continental Shelf, 499 UNTS 311; Convention on the Territorial Sea and Contiguous Zone, 516 UNTS 205; Convention on Fishing and Conservation of the Living Resources of the High Seas, 559 UNTS 285.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Arthur H. Dean, The Geneva Conference on the Law of the Sea: What was accomplished, 52 AJIL 1958, pp. 607-628; Wolfgang Friedmann, Selden Redivinus – Toward a Partition of the Seas?, 65 AJIL 1971, pp. 757-770.

<sup>16</sup> Article 8 LOSC.

<sup>17</sup> Article 2 LOSC.

<sup>18</sup> Articles 46-54 LOSC.

<sup>19</sup> Article 33 LOSC.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Article 55 LOSC.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Article 86 LOSC.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Article 76 LOSC.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Article 1 paragraph 1(1) LOSC.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Articles 303 and 149 LOSC. For an overview see A. Strati, *The protection of the underwater cultural heritage: An emerging objective of the contemporary law of the sea* (Martinus Nijhoff, The Hague 1995); Tullio Scovazzi, The protection of underwater cultural heritage: Article 303 and the UNESCO Convention, *in* David Freestone, Richard Barnes & David Ong (eds.), *The Law of the Sea. Progress and Prospects* (Oxford 2006) pp. 120-136; Anastasia Strati, Protection of the underwater cultural heritage: From the shortcomings of the UN Convention on the Law of the Sea to the compromises of the UNESCO Convention, *in* A. Strati, M. Gavouneli & N. Skourtos (eds.), *Unresolved Issues and New Challenges to the Law of the Sea* (Martinus Nijhoff, Leiden/Boston 2006) pp. 21-62.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Mentioned also by Yoshifumi Tanaka, Zonal and integrated management approaches to ocean governance: Reflections on a dual approach in the international law of the sea, 19 *TIJMCL* 2004, pp. 483-514, at p. 485.