

# ARCHITECTURAL TEMPERANCE

Spain and Rome, 1700–1759

OUTLEDGE

# Architectural Temperance

Spain and Rome, 1700-1759

Victor Deupi



First published 2015 by Routledge 2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

and by Routledge 711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2015 Victor Deupi

The right of Victor Deupi to be identified as author of this work has been asserted by him in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Trademark notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data Deupi, Victor.

Architectural temperance: Spain and Rome, 1700–1759 / Victor Deupi. pages cm.—(Routledge research in architecture) Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. Architecture and society—Spain—History—18th century.

2. Architecture—Spain—History—18th century. 3. Architecture—Spain—Italian influences. 4. Real Academia de Nobles Artes de San Fernando. 5. Architecture—Study and teaching—Spain—Madrid. 6. Architecture—Study and teaching—Italy—Rome. I. Title.

NA2543.S6D475 2014 720.9456'320946—dc23 2014006114

ISBN: 978-0-415-72439-5 (hbk) ISBN: 978-1-315-76054-4 (ebk)

Typeset in Sabon by Book Now Ltd, London



### **Architectural Temperance**

Spain and Rome, 1700-1759

Architectural Temperance examines relations between Bourbon Spain and papal Rome (1700–1759) through the lens of cultural politics. With a focus on key Spanish architects sent to study in Rome by the Bourbon Kings, the book also discusses the establishment of a program of architectural education at the newly-founded Real Academia de Bellas Artes de San Fernando in Madrid.

Victor Deupi explores why a powerful nation like Spain would temper its own building traditions with the more cosmopolitan trends associated with Rome; often at the expense of its own national and regional traditions.

Through the inclusion of previously unpublished documents and images that shed light on the theoretical debates which shaped eighteenth-century architecture in Rome and Madrid, *Architectural Temperance* provides an insight into readers with new insights into the cultural history of early modern Spain.

Victor Deupi teaches the history of art and architecture at the School of Architecture and Design at the New York Institute of Technology and in the Department of Visual and Performing Arts at Fairfield University. His research focuses on cultural politics in the early modern Ibero-American world.

#### Routledge Research in Architecture

The Routledge Research in Architecture series provides the reader with the latest scholarship in the field of architecture. The series publishes research from across the globe and covers areas as diverse as architectural history and theory, technology, digital architecture, structures, materials, details, design, monographs of architects, interior design and much more. By making these studies available to the worldwide academic community, the series aims to promote quality architectural research.

#### An Architecture of Parts

Architects, Building Workers and Industrialisation in Britain 1940–1970 Christine Wall

Towards an Articulated Phenomenological Interpretation of Architecture Phenomenal phenomenology M. Reza Shirazi

Architectural System Structures Integrating Design Complexity in Industrialised Construction Kasper Sánchez Vibæk

Space Unveiled Invisible Cultures in the Design Studio Carla Jackson Bell

Architectural Temperance Spain and Rome, 1700–1759 Victor Deupi To Jill ieri, oggi, domani...

#### Preface

In the middle decades of the twentieth century, George Kubler and Fernando Chueca Goitia introduced the study of eighteenth-century Spanish architecture and culture to a broad academic audience, bringing to light Spain's masters of building and the countless churches, plazas, and palaces that defined the major cities and towns of the Iberian Peninsula. A quarter of a century later, Carlos Sambricio, Thomas Ford Reese, and Delfín Rodríguez Ruiz shed new light on the topic through their vigorous publication efforts, further illuminating the richness of early modern Spanish architecture and urban planning. Much work has followed, though a great deal remains to be done as very little of this material is available in English. New points of departure and varied interpretations need to be considered, and historians need to reach beyond the confines of Spain, situating Spanish architecture and culture in a broader context by examining its interaction with other centers of Enlightenment culture.

These considerations form the basis of Architectural Temperance, in which I have attempted to approach pivotal moments in the architecture and culture of early eighteenth-century Spain through an examination of the latter's engagement with Rome. The inquiry focuses primarily on architects and their work, though painters, sculptors, patrons, and diplomats are also considered. As it is not, however, a history of Spanish architecture during this period, no attempt has been made to provide a thorough account of the cities, buildings, and landscapes of the Iberian Peninsula, or a complete survey of Spanish monuments in Italy. The emphasis is on Madrid and Rome, though occasionally other centers such as Florence and Seville are considered. Naples is mentioned briefly as well, as it had significant artistic relations with Papal Rome. (Readers wishing to explore further are invited to consult the Bibliography, which lists many works in addition to those cited in the text.) Nevertheless, a complete study of Neapolitan relations with Rome in the eighteenth century is a book by itself; a work presently under consideration by another scholar of the same surname, Dr. Jill Deupi. The reigns of Philip V (1700-46) and Ferdinand VI (1746-59) are given attention over those of Charles III (1759-88) and Charles IV (1788-1808), as the latter two monarchs have received significantly greater study already. Moreover, as one of the principal aims of engaging with Rome was the establishment of an academy of art in Madrid (along the lines of Rome's Accademia di San Luca), the relations of the first half of the century shed far more light on Spain's cultural intentions than do the study of academic projects in the latter half of the century, when the Real Academia de Bellas Artes de San Fernando (officially opened in 1752) and exchanges with Rome were more established. It is also during this time that the church of Santissima Trinità degli Spagnoli was designed and built in Rome (c. 1730–50), providing Iberian architects and artists with a rare opportunity to work first hand on a major monument in the city. The completion of the church and convent represents what is perhaps the most important Spanish contribution to the face of Rome.

More than anything, this book aims to provide the missing link between the rich body of extant work on Spanish Rome before 1700, and parallel studies of Bourbon Naples and Spain in the latter half of the eighteenth century. The years 1700–1759 set the framework for an examination of the architectural diplomacy between Spain and Rome at a time when Europe was in turmoil over the Spanish Succession, and the papacy was ambiguously neutral in its allegiances to the Bourbon and Hapsburg causes. To that end, *Architectural Temperance* explores why a nation such as Spain would temper her own building traditions with the larger, global trends of Roman art – both ancient and modern – rather than cultivate her own national and regional architectural traditions.

The present text represents the culmination of a long and arduous journey. Along the way there were a number of important individuals and institutions that enabled the process to take shape. First, I would like to thank Fran Ford, Jennifer Schmidt, Alex Hollingsworth and Sadé Lee of the Taylor & Francis Group for making the publication of this work so smooth and easy. Their faith and support in my project was extraordinarily humbling. My copy editor, Gary Birch also deserves mention for clarifying a number of points throughout, and making the work that much more readable. I would also like to thank the faculty and staff of the School of Architecture and Design at the New York Institute of Technology (NYIT), and the Department of Visual and Performing Arts (VPA) at Fairfield University for making my time at both institutions so enjoyable and rewarding. In particular, Judith DiMaio (Dean at NYIT) and Dr. Marice Rose (Chair of VPA at Fairfield) deserve special mention for their generous support and encouragement.

I would also like to thank the staff at the many libraries and archives that welcomed me and facilitated my research over the past several years. The list is far too great to include here, but in particular the American Academy in Rome, the Archivio Storico dell'Accademia Nazionale di San Luca, the

Archivo di Stato di Roma, the Real Academia de Bellas Artes de San Fernando in Madrid, the Metropolitan Museum of Art in New York City, and the DiMenna Nyselius Library at Fairfield University deserve special mention. I would like to thank Father Felipe Trigueros Buena of Santissima Trinità dei Domenicani Spagnoli in Rome for his generous assistance in documenting the interiors of the church and in researching its archives. I am deeply grateful to him and the entire community at Santissima Trinità for welcoming me to their wonderful church and monastery.

I am extremely grateful to several architects and writers on architecture that have assisted me over the past several years. In particular, Thomas Ford Reese first pointed me towards Spanish activities in Rome, and Delfín Rodríguez Ruiz introduced me to the fascinating figure of José de Hermosilla. Joseph Rykwert, Thomas Dandelet, John Varriano, and Carlos Sambricio provided me with helpful insights on Rome, Spain, and early modern Europe that I would have otherwise missed. A number of personal friends deserve mention too. Dr. Pablo Vázquez Gestal and Dr. Richard John of the University of Miami both read the manuscript and provided invaluable commentary. Without their critical insight and sincere generosity, this project would have never fulfilled my initial ambitions. The architect Pier Carlo Bontempi of Parma deserves mention as well, for without him I would have never understood the remarkable role that his city played in the culture and politics of early eighteenth-century Spain and Italy.

My greatest debt undoubtedly goes out to my wife Jill, who has been with me throughout every phase of this book, visiting nearly every monument included in the text. Despite her own remarkably busy schedule as the Founding Director and Chief Curator of the Bellarmine Museum of Art at Fairfield University, Jill has been continuously supportive and active in my project. Not only did she read the manuscript and provide necessary commentary, she helped clarify several arguments. Her faithful assurance and encouragement throughout the process has not only made my work that much more enjoyable and fulfilling, but has also made me realize how truly precious life is. This book is as much hers as it is mine.

Newtown CT, 2014

#### **Abbreviations**

AGA

V&A

(Madrid) Archivio General de Simancas (Valladolid) AGS ASF Real Academia de Bellas Artes de San Fernando, Madrid ASR Archivo di Stato di Roma ATSR Archivio dei Trinitari Spagnoli, Rome BHR Bibliotheca Hertziana, Max-Planck-Institut für Kunstgeschichte, Rome BNE Biblioteca Nacional de España, Madrid COAM Colegio Oficial de Arquitectos de Madrid CSIC Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas DBI Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani Detroit Institute of Arts DIA Gabinetto Comunale delle Stampe (Museo di Roma) GCS GRI Getty Research Institute, Los Angeles, CA ING Istituto Nazionale per la Grafica, Rome MA Museo de América, Madrid MMA Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York MR Museo di Roma NGA National Gallery of Art, Washington DC UAM Universidad Autónoma de Madrid

Victoria and Albert Museum, London

Archivo General de la Administración, Alcalá de Henares

#### Contents

	List of figures	ix
	Preface	xiii
	Abbreviations	xvii
	Introduction – Architectural temperance	1
1	Spain and Rome in the early eighteenth century	4
	Bourbon Spain and the War of Succession 4	
	Celebrations of Spanish Succession 8	
2	Italian grandeur	23
	Spanish Rome 23	
	Spanish Italy 45	
3	Metropoli dell'universo	62
	The Spanish Grand Tour 63	
	Roman and Spanish academies 71	
4	Iberian architects in Rome	77
	Emanuel Rodriguez Dos Santos 78	
	Francisco Preciado de la Vega 85	
	Ventura Rodríguez 92	
	Miguel Fernández 94	
	José de Hermosilla 97	
5	Santissima Trinità degli Spagnoli in Via Condotti	105
	Trinitarian Rome 105	

#### viii Contents

The case against Rodriguez Dos Santos 120 Hermosilla's contribution 123

6	Bourbon patronage and Italian influence	135
	Reales sitios 135	
	Solomonic imagery 147	
7	The written word and the artifact	160
	Vitruvian authority 160	
	The Madrid Academy and the course of architecture 168	
	Notes	175
	Bibliography	184
	Index	208

# Figures

1.1	Carlo Fontana, elevation of a meta, with bier and	
	medallion, for the memorial service for Leopold I in	8.4
1.2	Santa Maria dell'Anima, Rome (1705)	14
1.2	Carlo Fontana, façade decoration for the memorial	
	service to King Pedro II of Portugal, Sant'Antonio dei	1.2
1 2	Portoghesi, Rome (1707)	16
1.3	Carlo Fontana, perspective view of the Catafalque and	
	Baldacchino in the crossing for the memorial service to	
	King Pedro II of Portugal, Sant'Antonio dei Portoghesi,	
	Rome (1707)	17
1.4	Carlo Fontana, plan and elevation of the portico of	
	Santa Maria Maggiore, Rome (1709–11)	18
1.5	Filippo Juvarra, monumental throne, from Le simpatie	
	della città di Messina (1720)	21
2.1	Giuseppe Vasi, "Piazza di Spagna," from Le porte e mura	
	di Roma Rome (1747)	24
2.2	San Giacomo degli Spagnoli, Rome	25
2.3	Giuseppe Vasi, "San Giacomo degli Spagnoli," from	
	I collegj, spedali e luoghi pii Rome (1759)	26
2.4	Max Hutzel, Santa Maria in Monserrato, Rome	27
2.5	Sant'Antonio dei Portoghese, Rome	28
2.6	Santissima Trinità degli Spagnoli, Rome	29
2.7	San Pasquale Baylon, Rome	29
2.8	Max Hutzel, San Bartolomeo all'Isola, Rome	30
2.9	Giambattista Nolli, plan of the Piazza di Spagna, from	
	La nuova topografia di Roma (1748)	31
2.10	Via Condotti, Rome	32
2.11	Giuseppe Vasi, "Palazzo (Caetani) Ruspoli," from	
	Le basiliche e chiese antiche di Roma Rome (1753)	33
2.12	Spanish Steps (Scalinata della Trinità dei Monti), Rome	34
2.13	Giovanni Giacomo de' Rossi, "Palazzo Nunez," from Il	
	nuovo teatro delle fabriche, et edificii, in prospettiva di	
	Roma moderna, Rome (1665–99)	34

2.14	Palazzo di Spagna, Rome	35
2.15	Ferdinando Fuga and José de Hermosilla, Pianta del Piano	
	Terreno del Teggio Palazzo di Spagna esistente in	
	Roma (1747)	36
2.16	Ferdinando Fuga and José de Hermosilla, Prospetto	
	della Facciata Principale del Reggio Palazzo di Spagna	
	esistente en Roma (1747)	37
2.17	Nicola Salvi, Apparato efimero per i regi sponsali (1728)	40
2.18	Santa Cecilia, Rome	41
2.19	Girolamo Ticciati, elevation, from the Esequie di Luigi il Cattolico Re di Spagna Santa Maria Novella,	
		47
2.20	Florence (1724), etching by Ferdinando Ruggieri	47
2.20	Girolamo Ticciati, interior section, from the Esequie	
	di Luigi il Cattolico Re di Spagna Santa Maria Novella,	40
2 24	Florence (1724), etching by Ferdinando Ruggieri	48
2.21	Girolamo Ticciati, catafalque, from the Esequie di Luigi	
	il Cattolico Re di Spagna Santa Maria Novella,	1417
	Florence (1724), etching by Ferdinando Ruggieri	49
2.22	Ferdinando Ruggieri, Ornato delle tre porte Santa Maria	
	Novella, Florence (1725)	51
2.23	Ferdinando Ruggieri, triumphal arch for Carlo di Borbone,	
	from the Descrizione dell' arco inalzato dalla nazione	
	Britannica (1732)	52
2.24	Marcus Tuscher, Cuccagna monument in front of	
	the royal palace, Livorno (1732)	54
2.25	Aerial view of the Rocca Sanvitale, Sala Baganza	55
2.26	Palazzo Reale, Colorno	56
2.27	Ferdinando Sanfelice, façade, San Lorenzo Maggiore,	
	from the Relazione della solennità, Naples (1734)	58
2.28	Ferdinando Sanfelice, altar, San Lorenzo Maggiore,	
	from the Relazione della solennità, Naples (1734)	59
4.1	Emanuel Rodriguez Dos Santos, façade, S. Maria	
	Maddalena, Rome (1735)	82
4.2	Francisco Preciado de la Vega, Aeneas and the Cuaean	
	<i>Sibyl</i> , Rome (1744)	86
4.3	Louis-Joseph Le Lorrain, Chinea, Rome (1746)	88
4.4	Francisco Preciado de la Vega, Chinea, Rome (1746)	89
4.5	José de Hermosilla, façade, Nuestra Señora	
110	de la Granada, Llerena (1746–47)	99
4.6	José de Hermosilla, interior, Nuestra Señora	11
7.0	de la Granada, Llerena (1746–47)	100
4.7		100
7./	José de Hermosilla, detail, Nuestra Señora	100
5 1	de la Granada, Llerena (1746–47)	100
5.1	Giuseppe Vasi, "Chiesa della SS. Trinità," from	107
	MINISTER OF THE STATE OF THE ST	111/

5.2	Transfer of Morcillo's remains to the Chapel of	
	the Purissima Concepción in the Cathedral of Lima	
	from the Magnifica parentacion (1744)	109
5.3	Max Hutzel, sacristy with Gaspare Sibilla's	
	Bust of Morcillo, Santissima Trinità degli Spagnoli, Rome	109
5.4	Emanuel Rodriguez Dos Santos, ground floor plan,	
	Santissima Trinità degli Spagnoli, Rome (c. 1733)	111
5.5	Casa per Secolari, Santissima Trinità degli Spagnoli, Rome	111
5.6	Emanuel Rodriguez Dos Santos, cross section,	
	Santissima Trinità degli Spagnoli, Rome (c. 1733)	112
5.7	Emanuel Rodriguez Dos Santos, elevation,	
	Santissima Trinità degli Spagnoli, Rome (c. 1733)	113
5.8	Max Hutzel, chancel, Santissima Trinità degli Spagnoli,	
	Rome	114
5.9	Façade, Santissima Trinità degli Spagnoli, Rome	115
5.10	Baldassare Mattei, Spanish Coat of Arms, Santissima	
	Trinità degli Spagnoli, Rome (c. 1750)	116
5.11	Pietro Pacilli, Angel Releasing two Christian Prisoners,	
	Santissima Trinità degli Spagnoli, Rome (c. 1750)	116
5.12	Max Hutzel, interior, Santissima Trinità degli Spagnoli,	
	Rome	117
5.13	Dome, Santissima Trinità degli Spagnoli, Rome	118
5.14	Emanuel Rodriguez Dos Santos, longitudinal section,	
	Santissima Trinità degli Spagnoli, Rome (c. 1733)	118
5.15	Emanuel Rodriguez Dos Santos, longitudinal section,	
	Santissima Trinità degli Spagnoli, Rome (c. 1733)	119
5.16	Gregorio Guglielmi, Allegory of the Trinitarian Order,	
	Santissima Trinità degli Spagnoli	125
5.17	Gregorio Guglielmi, St. Ambrose with the Founders of the	
	Trinitarian Order, Santissima Trinità degli Spagnoli, Rome	126
5.18	Emanuel Rodriguez Dos Santos, detail, Santissima	
	Trinità degli Spagnoli, Rome (c. 1733)	126
5.19	Side chapel with Gaetano Lapis' St. John of Matha,	
	Santissima Trinità degli Spagnoli, Rome	127
5.20	Max Hutzel, side chapel, Santissima Trinità degli	
	Spagnoli, Rome	128
5.21	Max Hutzel, high altar with Corrado Giaquinto's	
	The Holy Trinity Liberating a Christian Slave,	
	Santissima Trinità degli Spagnoli, Rome	128
5.22	Antonio González Velázquez, Abraham and the Three	
	Angels and Moses and Three Other Prophets,	
	Santissima Trinità degli Spagnoli, Rome	129
5.23	Juan Bautista Villalpando, the "Order of Orders"	
	from Roland Fréart, A Parallel of the Ancient Architecture	
	with the Modern (1733)	130

5.24	José de Hermosilla, interior, Nuestra Señora de la	130
5.25	Granada, Llerena Max Hutzel, choir balcony, Santissima Trinità degli	130
3,23	Spagnoli, Rome	131
5.26	Max Hutzel, side chapel with Francisco Preciado de la Vega's Immaculate Conception, Santissima Trinità degli	131
	Spagnoli, Rome	132
6.1	Santiago Bonavía, church of San Antonio, Aranjuez	138
6.2	Façade, Royal Palace, Madrid	139
6.3	Andrea Procaccini, Patio de la Herradura, Palace of	
	San Ildefonso, La Granja	145
6.4	Andrea Procaccini, Colegiata, Palace of San Ildefonso,	
	La Granja	145
6.5	Filippo Juvarra et al., garden façade, Palace of	
	San Ildefonso, La Granja	146
6.6	Virgilio Rabaglio, Palacio Real de Riofrío (1752-1759)	147
6.7	Tomás Vicente Tosca, "Solomonic Order," from	
	the Tratado de Arquitectura Civil, Montea y Canteria,	
	y Reloxes (1727)	151
6.8	Filippo Juvarra, Chambre du lit, Palace of San Ildefonso,	
	La Granja (1736–37)	152
6.9	Atanasio Genaro Brizguz y Bru (Agustín Bruno	
	Zaragoza y Ebri), "Spanish Order," from the Escuela	
	de arquitectura civil (1738)	153
6.10	Sempronio Subisati et al., tomb of Philip V and	
	Elizabeth Farnese, Palace of San Ildefonso, La Granja	
	(1748, 1756–58)	157
6.11	Francesco Sabbatini et al., tomb of Ferdinand VI,	
	Las Salesas Reales, Madrid (1759)	158
7.1	Claude Perrault, frontispiece, from the Compendio	
	de loz diez libros de arquitectura de Vitruvio (1761)	165
7.2	Christian Rieger, frontispiece, from Elementos de toda la	
	architectura civil (1763)	167
7.3	Christian Rieger, view of the Royal Palace at Caserta, from	
	Elementos de toda la architectura civil (1763)	168

# Introduction – Architectural temperance

Broadly speaking, it seems to me that the customs of the Spaniards are more suited to the Italians than those of the French, because the calm dignity characteristic of the Spaniards seems to me more appropriate to us than the ready vivacity we see in almost everything the French people do.

(Baldassare Castiglione, The Book of the Courtier)1

The cultural relations between Spain and Rome in the early eighteenth century are a study of delicate diplomacy and artistic nuance. At the beginning of the century, Spain was a nation in search of reform, and the new Bourbon monarch, Philip V (r. 1700-46) made it his goal to reaffirm the strength and grandeur that Spaniards once enjoyed in the sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries as one of the most powerful nations in Europe and colonizers of the Americas. Philip's policies of widespread political and cultural regeneration were continued under his successors Ferdinand VI (r. 1746-59), Charles III (r. 1759-88), and Charles IV (r. 1788-1808). Under Bourbon rule, the literature and visual arts of Spain witnessed fundamental changes that were unprecedented in her history. Though the Bourbon succession primarily occurred on the Iberian Peninsula, relations between the Spanish crown and the Hapsburg court that it succeeded were played out largely by foreign diplomats in Rome, with the papacy maintaining an unpredictable role. Engaging directly with Roman artistic - and more specifically architectural - culture was also one of the principal ways that Spain achieved its re-emergence in European politics and culture, as Rome remained the paradigm for all of Europe.

The general perception was that Spain was far removed from the mainstream currents of Italian and European art. The common view or "myth" of Spanish culture at the turn of the century was one of decline, insularity, and crudeness (Kamen 2004: 40–56; Morán Turina 2002: 23–40). But, at the start of the eighteenth century, can it truly be said that Spanish art and architecture were in desperate need of radical reform? Was the problem a matter of sincerity, perception, or simply adjustment? However one interprets the question, in terms of what really happened, artistic relations