

MEDICAL LAW IN IRELAND

SECOND EDITION

DEIRDRE MADDEN



Wolters Kluwer
Law & Business

Medical Law in Ireland

Second Edition

Deirdre Madden

This book was originally published as a monograph in the International
Encyclopaedia of Laws/Medical Law.

General Editor: Roger Blanpain

Associate General Editor: Michele Colucci

Volume Editor: Herman Nys



Wolters Kluwer
Law & Business

Published by:

Kluwer Law International
PO Box 316
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn
The Netherlands
Website: www.kluwerlaw.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:

Aspen Publishers, Inc.
7201 McKinney Circle
Frederick, MD 21704
United States of America
Email: customer.service@aspenpublishers.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by:

Turpin Distribution Services Ltd.
Stratton Business Park
Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade
Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ
United Kingdom
Email: kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com

DISCLAIMER: The material in this volume is in the nature of general comment only. It is not offered as advice on any particular matter and should not be taken as such. The editor and the contributing authors expressly disclaim all liability to any person with regard to anything done or omitted to be done, and with respect to the consequences of anything done or omitted to be done wholly or partly in reliance upon the whole or any part of the contents of this volume. No reader should act or refrain from acting on the basis of any matter contained in this volume without first obtaining professional advice regarding the particular facts and circumstances at issue. Any and all opinions expressed herein are those of the particular author and are not necessarily those of the editor or publisher of this volume.

Printed on acid-free paper

ISBN 978-90-411-5333-3

This title is available on www.kluwerlawonline.com

© 2014, Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA. Email: permissions@kluwerlaw.com

Printed and Bound by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY.

Table of Contents

The Author	3
List of Abbreviations	11
General Introduction	15
Chapter 1. General Background of the Country	15
§1. GEOGRAPHY	15
§2. CULTURAL COMPOSITION	15
§3. POLITICAL SYSTEM	17
§4. POPULATION AND VITAL STATISTICS	18
§5. SOCIAL AND CULTURAL VALUES	19
Chapter 2. Description of the Healthcare System	20
§1. BACKGROUND TO THE IRISH HEALTHCARE SYSTEM	20
§2. REGULATION OF THE HEALTHCARE SYSTEM	26
§3. FINANCING OF THE HEALTHCARE SYSTEM	31
§4. SOURCES OF MEDICAL LAW	32
Part I. The Medical Profession	35
Chapter 1. Access to the Medical Profession	35
§1. MEDICAL EDUCATION	35
§2. MANPOWER PLANNING	40

Table of Contents

I. Freedom of Establishment	40
§3. LICENSING OF PHYSICIANS	41
Chapter 2. The Practice of Medicine	44
Chapter 3. Illegal Practice of Medicine	45
Chapter 4. Control over the Practice of Medicine	47
§1. PROFESSIONAL LIABILITY	47
§2. CIVIL LIABILITY	47
I. Duty of Care	48
II. Standard of Care	49
III. Causation	52
IV. Damage	54
§3. CRIMINAL LIABILITY	55
§4. VICARIOUS LIABILITY	55
§5. QUALITY ASSURANCE	57
§6. REVIEW BOARDS	61
§7. DISCIPLINARY ORGANIZATIONS	61
I. Order of Physicians	61
II. Procedure	62
III. Professional Misconduct	65
IV. Sanctions	67
§8. PROFESSIONAL CODES	72
§9. BIOMEDICAL ETHICS COMMITTEE	74
Part II. The Physician-Patient Relationship	75
Chapter 1. General Description	75
§1. RIGHTS AND DUTIES OF PHYSICIANS AND PATIENTS	75
§2. INFORMED CONSENT	75
I. Capacity to Give Consent	76
II. Determination of Capacity	77
III. Refusal of Consent	82

IV. Disclosure of Information Prior to Giving Consent	85
§3. PRIVACY	91
§4. SECRECY	92
I. Exceptions to Medical Confidentiality	94
§5. COMPLAINTS	97
§6. ACCESS TO MEDICAL RECORDS	99
I. Freedom of Information Acts	99
II. Data Protection Acts	102
Chapter 2. The Physician-Patient Relationship in Specific Terms	104
§1. THE MINOR PATIENT	104
§2. THE MENTAL PATIENT	106
I. Mental Health Act 2001	106
II. Grounds for Involuntary Admission and Detention	107
III. Procedure	108
IV. Voluntary Admissions	110
V. Review of Detention by Mental Health Tribunal	111
§3. THE DYING PATIENT	113
I. General Principles	113
II. Right to Privacy and Bodily Integrity	114
III. Patients without Capacity	115
IV. Advance Directives	121
V. Do Not Resuscitate Orders	127
Chapter 3. Specific Activities	128
§1. ABORTION	128
I. Statutory Provisions on Abortion	128
II. Constitutional Provisions on Abortion	129
III. Legislative Provisions on Provision of Abortion Information	137
IV. Ethical Guidelines	137
§2. STERILIZATION	137
§3. <i>IN VITRO</i> FERTILIZATION	138
I. Ethical Guidelines	139
II. Tissue and Cell Regulations (2006)	139
III. Commission on Assisted Human Reproduction (2005)	140

Table of Contents

IV. Family Law Issues	141
V. Right to Procreate	144
VI. The Common Good Justification in Ireland	146
VII. Constitutional Protection of the Unborn: Article 40.3.3	149
§4. PRENATAL DIAGNOSIS AND GENETICS	155
§5. GENETICS	157
§6. PSYCHOSURGICAL INTERVENTIONS	158
§7. ORGAN TRANSPLANTATION	158
§8. EXPERIMENTS ON HUMAN BEINGS	159
I. Recognition of Ethics Committees	160
II. Composition of Ethics Committees	160
III. Single Ethics Committee Opinion	160
IV. Ethics Committee Supervisory Body	161
V. Indemnity for Ethics Committees	161
VI. Responsibility for Consideration of Insurance	161
VII. Exemption for Academic Research	161
VIII. Research Not Covered by Clinical Trials Regulations	162
IX. Ethical Guidelines	162
§9. EUTHANASIA	163
§10. SUICIDE AND ASSISTED SUICIDE	165
I. Physician-Assisted Suicide	171
§11. OTHERS (TRANSSEXUAL INTERVENTIONS)	171
Part III. The Physician in Relation to the Healthcare System	173
Chapter 1. Relations with Other Healthcare Providers	173
§1. PHARMACISTS	173
§2. NURSES	174
§3. DENTISTS	175
§4. CORONERS	177
I. Powers of the Coroner	180
II. Inquests	181
§5. PARAMEDICAL PROFESSIONALS	181

Table of Contents

Chapter 2. Relations with Other Healthcare Institutions	183
§1. HOSPITALS	183
§2. NURSING HOMES	184
§3. HEALTH INSURANCE	186
Selected Bibliography	189
Index	191

Medical Law in Ireland

Second Edition

Deirdre Madden

This book was originally published as a monograph in the International
Encyclopaedia of Laws/Medical Law.

General Editor: Roger Blanpain

Associate General Editor: Michele Colucci

Volume Editor: Herman Nys



Wolters Kluwer
Law & Business

Published by:

Kluwer Law International
PO Box 316
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn
The Netherlands
Website: www.kluwerlaw.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:

Aspen Publishers, Inc.
7201 McKinney Circle
Frederick, MD 21704
United States of America
Email: customer.service@aspenpublishers.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by:

Turpin Distribution Services Ltd.
Stratton Business Park
Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade
Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ
United Kingdom
Email: kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com

DISCLAIMER: The material in this volume is in the nature of general comment only. It is not offered as advice on any particular matter and should not be taken as such. The editor and the contributing authors expressly disclaim all liability to any person with regard to anything done or omitted to be done, and with respect to the consequences of anything done or omitted to be done wholly or partly in reliance upon the whole or any part of the contents of this volume. No reader should act or refrain from acting on the basis of any matter contained in this volume without first obtaining professional advice regarding the particular facts and circumstances at issue. Any and all opinions expressed herein are those of the particular author and are not necessarily those of the editor or publisher of this volume.

Printed on acid-free paper

ISBN 978-90-411-5333-3

This title is available on www.kluwerlawonline.com

© 2014, Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA. Email: permissions@kluwerlaw.com

Printed and Bound by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY.

The Author



Dr Deirdre Madden is a graduate of University College Cork, National University of Ireland (BCL, LL.M, PhD) and a qualified barrister-at-law. She is a Senior Lecturer in Law in UCC with research interests and publications in the area of medical law and ethics. She was a member of the Irish Medical Council from 2004 to 2013 and is currently a member of the Health and Social Care Professionals Council.

In 2005 she was appointed by the Minister for Health to write a final report on post-mortem practice and procedure, subsequently known as the Madden Report. Dr Madden was also appointed Chairperson of the Commission on Patient Safety and Quality Assurance, which published its report, entitled *Building a Culture of Patient Safety*, in July 2008.

Dr Madden is a member of a number of national and international expert groups and ethics consultant to research projects related to medical law and ethics, and is also a Fellow of the Hastings Center in the United States.

Table of Contents

The Author	3
List of Abbreviations	11
General Introduction	15
Chapter 1. General Background of the Country	15
§1. GEOGRAPHY	15
§2. CULTURAL COMPOSITION	15
§3. POLITICAL SYSTEM	17
§4. POPULATION AND VITAL STATISTICS	18
§5. SOCIAL AND CULTURAL VALUES	19
Chapter 2. Description of the Healthcare System	20
§1. BACKGROUND TO THE IRISH HEALTHCARE SYSTEM	20
§2. REGULATION OF THE HEALTHCARE SYSTEM	26
§3. FINANCING OF THE HEALTHCARE SYSTEM	31
§4. SOURCES OF MEDICAL LAW	32
Part I. The Medical Profession	35
Chapter 1. Access to the Medical Profession	35
§1. MEDICAL EDUCATION	35
§2. MANPOWER PLANNING	40

Table of Contents

I. Freedom of Establishment	40
§3. LICENSING OF PHYSICIANS	41
Chapter 2. The Practice of Medicine	44
Chapter 3. Illegal Practice of Medicine	45
Chapter 4. Control over the Practice of Medicine	47
§1. PROFESSIONAL LIABILITY	47
§2. CIVIL LIABILITY	47
I. Duty of Care	48
II. Standard of Care	49
III. Causation	52
IV. Damage	54
§3. CRIMINAL LIABILITY	55
§4. VICARIOUS LIABILITY	55
§5. QUALITY ASSURANCE	57
§6. REVIEW BOARDS	61
§7. DISCIPLINARY ORGANIZATIONS	61
I. Order of Physicians	61
II. Procedure	62
III. Professional Misconduct	65
IV. Sanctions	67
§8. PROFESSIONAL CODES	72
§9. BIOMEDICAL ETHICS COMMITTEE	74
Part II. The Physician-Patient Relationship	75
Chapter 1. General Description	75
§1. RIGHTS AND DUTIES OF PHYSICIANS AND PATIENTS	75
§2. INFORMED CONSENT	75
I. Capacity to Give Consent	76
II. Determination of Capacity	77
III. Refusal of Consent	82

Table of Contents

IV. Disclosure of Information Prior to Giving Consent	85
§3. PRIVACY	91
§4. SECRECY	92
I. Exceptions to Medical Confidentiality	94
§5. COMPLAINTS	97
§6. ACCESS TO MEDICAL RECORDS	99
I. Freedom of Information Acts	99
II. Data Protection Acts	102
Chapter 2. The Physician-Patient Relationship in Specific Terms	104
§1. THE MINOR PATIENT	104
§2. THE MENTAL PATIENT	106
I. Mental Health Act 2001	106
II. Grounds for Involuntary Admission and Detention	107
III. Procedure	108
IV. 'Voluntary Admissions	110
V. Review of Detention by Mental Health Tribunal	111
§3. THE DYING PATIENT	113
I. General Principles	113
II. Right to Privacy and Bodily Integrity	114
III. Patients without Capacity	115
IV. Advance Directives	121
V. Do Not Resuscitate Orders	127
Chapter 3. Specific Activities	128
§1. ABORTION	128
I. Statutory Provisions on Abortion	128
II. Constitutional Provisions on Abortion	129
III. Legislative Provisions on Provision of Abortion Information	137
IV. Ethical Guidelines	137
§2. STERILIZATION	137
§3. <i>IN VITRO</i> FERTILIZATION	138
I. Ethical Guidelines	139
II. Tissue and Cell Regulations (2006)	139
III. Commission on Assisted Human Reproduction (2005)	140

Table of Contents

IV. Family Law Issues	141
V. Right to Procreate	144
VI. The Common Good Justification in Ireland	146
VII. Constitutional Protection of the Unborn: Article 40.3.3	149
§4. PRENATAL DIAGNOSIS AND GENETICS	155
§5. GENETICS	157
§6. PSYCHOSURGICAL INTERVENTIONS	158
§7. ORGAN TRANSPLANTATION	158
§8. EXPERIMENTS ON HUMAN BEINGS	159
I. Recognition of Ethics Committees	160
II. Composition of Ethics Committees	160
III. Single Ethics Committee Opinion	160
IV. Ethics Committee Supervisory Body	161
V. Indemnity for Ethics Committees	161
VI. Responsibility for Consideration of Insurance	161
VII. Exemption for Academic Research	161
VIII. Research Not Covered by Clinical Trials Regulations	162
IX. Ethical Guidelines	162
§9. EUTHANASIA	163
§10. SUICIDE AND ASSISTED SUICIDE	165
I. Physician-Assisted Suicide	171
§11. OTHERS (TRANSSEXUAL INTERVENTIONS)	171
Part III. The Physician in Relation to the Healthcare System	173
Chapter 1. Relations with Other Healthcare Providers	173
§1. PHARMACISTS	173
§2. NURSES	174
§3. DENTISTS	175
§4. CORONERS	177
I. Powers of the Coroner	180
II. Inquests	181
§5. PARAMEDICAL PROFESSIONALS	181

Table of Contents

Chapter 2. Relations with Other Healthcare Institutions	183
§1. HOSPITALS	183
§2. NURSING HOMES	184
§3. HEALTH INSURANCE	186
Selected Bibliography	189
Index	191