

ASPEN SELECT SERIES

THADDEUS HOFFMEISTER

CRIMINAL LAW



Wolters Kluwer

ASPEN SELECT SERIES

CRIMINAL LAW

Thaddeus Hoffmeister

Professor of Law
University of Dayton



Wolters Kluwer

Copyright © 2017 CCH Incorporated. All Rights Reserved.

Published by Wolters Kluwer in New York.

Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S. serves customers worldwide with CCH, Aspen Publishers, and Kluwer Law International products. (www.WKLegaledu.com)

No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or utilized by any information storage or retrieval system, without written permission from the publisher. For information about permissions or to request permissions online, visit us at www.WKLegaledu.com, or a written request may be faxed to our permissions department at 212-771-0803.

To contact Customer Service, e-mail customer.service@wolterskluwer.com, call 1-800-234-1660, fax 1-800-901-9075, or mail correspondence to:

Wolters Kluwer
Attn: Order Department
PO Box 990
Frederick, MD 21705

Printed in the United States of America.

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0

ISBN 978-1-4548-8771-3

CRIMINAL LAW

EDITORIAL ADVISORS

Rachel E. Barkow

Segal Family Professor of Regulatory Law and Policy
Faculty Director, Center on the Administration of Criminal Law
New York University School of Law

Erwin Chemerinsky

Dean and Distinguished Professor of Law
Raymond Pryke Professor of First Amendment Law
University of California, Irvine School of Law

Richard A. Epstein

Laurence A. Tisch Professor of Law
New York University School of Law
Peter and Kirsten Bedford Senior Fellow
The Hoover Institution
Senior Lecturer in Law
The University of Chicago

Ronald J. Gilson

Charles J. Meyers Professor of Law and Business
Stanford University
Marc and Eva Stern Professor of Law and Business
Columbia Law School

James E. Krier

Earl Warren DeLano Professor of Law
The University of Michigan Law School

Tracey L. Meares

Walton Hale Hamilton Professor of Law
Director, The Justice Collaboratory
Yale Law School

Richard K. Neumann, Jr.

Professor of Law
Maurice A. Deane School of Law at Hofstra University

Robert H. Sitkoff

John L. Gray Professor of Law
Harvard Law School

David Alan Sklansky

Stanley Morrison Professor of Law
Stanford Law School
Faculty Co-Director
Stanford Criminal Justice Center

About Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S.

Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S. delivers expert content and solutions in the areas of law, corporate compliance, health compliance, reimbursement, and legal education. Its practical solutions help customers successfully navigate the demands of a changing environment to drive their daily activities, enhance decision quality and inspire confident outcomes.

Serving customers worldwide, its legal and regulatory solutions portfolio includes products under the Aspen Publishers, CCH Incorporated, Kluwer Law International, ftwilliam.com and MediRegs names. They are regarded as exceptional and trusted resources for general legal and practice-specific knowledge, compliance and risk management, dynamic workflow solutions, and expert commentary.

This book is dedicated to A and Z.

Acknowledgments

The author would like to thank Mary Boston, who had the arduous task of transcribing 18th Century English criminal law cases. This book also benefitted from the efforts of my two Research Assistants, Marty Gehres and Elizabeth Watson. These hard working third-year law students were instrumental in getting this book project completed on time. I would also like to thank the individuals and entities who granted me permission to republish the following works:

Chad Flanders, *The One State-Solution to Teaching Criminal Law, or, Leaving the Common Law and the MPC Behind*, 8 Ohio St. J. Crim. L. 167 (2010).

James Q. Whitman, *The Origins of Reasonable Doubt: Theological Roots of the Criminal Trial*, Yale University Press (2008).

S. Adele Shank, *The Death Penalty in Ohio: Fairness, Reliability, and Justice at Risk—A Report on Reforms in Ohio's Use of the Death Penalty Since the 1997 Ohio State Bar Association Recommendations Were Made*, 63 Ohio St. L. J. 371 (2002).

Frank R. Baumgartner, *The Impact of Race, Gender, and Geography on Ohio Executions*, January 28, 2016.

Summary of Contents

Acknowledgments

xvii

Part I: Background and Punishment

Chapter 1: Background	3
Chapter 2: Punishment	31

Part II: General Principles

Chapter 3: Actus Reus	55
Chapter 4: Mens Rea	93
Chapter 5: Causation and Concurrence of Elements	121

Part III: Crimes Against the Person

Chapter 6: Murder	139
Chapter 7: Felony Murder and the Death Penalty	151
Chapter 8: Voluntary Manslaughter	195
Chapter 9: Involuntary Manslaughter	207
Chapter 10: Assault	221
Chapter 11: Sexual Assault	233
Chapter 12: Kidnapping and Robbery	263

Part IV: Crimes Against Property

Chapter 13: Larceny and False Pretenses	279
Chapter 14: Embezzlement and Receipt of Stolen Property	307
Chapter 15: Burglary	335

Part V: Inchoate Crimes and Accomplice Liability

Chapter 16: Attempt	353
Chapter 17: Solicitation	377
Chapter 18: Conspiracy	387
Chapter 19: Accomplice Liability	417

Part VI: Defenses

Chapter 20: Self-Defense	431
Chapter 21: Insanity	467
Chapter 22: Infancy and Intoxication	493
Chapter 23: Entrapment	519
Chapter 24: Necessity and Duress	539
<i>Table of Cases</i>	557

Contents

Acknowledgments

xvii

Part I: Background and Punishment

Chapter 1: Background 3

- A. The Book 3
 - 1. Common Law 6
 - State v. Boggs*, 2003 WL 22994531 (Ohio Ct. App. 2003) 7
 - 2. Model Penal Code 13
 - State v. Collins*, 54 Ohio App. 134 (1988) 14
 - 3. Criminal Law vs. Criminal Procedure 16
 - United States v. Drew*, 259 F.R.D. 449 (C.D. Cal. 2009) 16
- B. Criminal Law 24
 - In re Winship*, 397 U.S. 358 (1970) 24

Chapter 2: Punishment 31

- A. Theories of Punishment: Retributivism and Utilitarianism 31
- B. Principles of Punishment 31
 - United States v. Blarek*, 7 F. Supp. 2d 192 (E.D.N.Y. 1998) 32
 - Regina v. Dudley and Stephens*, 14 Q.B.D. 273 43
- C. Defining Punishment 45
 - Kansas v. Hendricks*, 521 U.S. 346 (1997) 45

Part II: General Principles

Chapter 3: Actus Reus 55

- A. Voluntary Act or Omission 55
 - State v. Sowry*, 151 Ohio App. 3d 742 (2004) 55
 - Jones v. United States*, 308 F.2d 307 (D.C. Cir. 1962) 58
- B. Vicarious Liability 62
 - United States v. Park*, 421 U.S. 658 (1975) 63
 - State v. Tomaino*, 135 Ohio App. 3d 309 (1999) 76
- C. Status Crimes 81
 - Powell v. Texas*, 392 U.S. 514 (1968) 81

Chapter 4: Mens Rea 93

- A. Purposely, Knowingly, Recklessly, and Negligently 93
 - O.R.C. 2901.22 Degrees of Mental States* 93

	<i>State v. Robinson</i> , 2013-Ohio-4375 (Ohio Ct. App. 2013)	94
	<i>State v. Tipton</i> , 1978 WL 215891 (Ohio Ct. App. 1978)	98
B.	Strict Liability	103
	<i>State v. Collins</i> , 89 Ohio St. 3d 524 (2000)	103
C.	Specific Intent, General Intent, Malice, and Strict Liability	110
D.	Defenses of Mistake of Fact and Mistake of Law	111
1.	Mistake of Fact	111
	<i>State v. Rawson</i> , 2006 WL 279003 (Ohio Ct. App. 2006)	111
2.	Mistake of Law	115
	<i>Lambert v. California</i> , 355 U.S. 225 (1957)	115

Chapter 5: Causation and Concurrence of Elements **121**

A.	Proximate and Actual Cause	121
	<i>State v. Losey</i> , 23 Ohio App. 3d 93 (1985)	121
B.	Intervening Act	127
	<i>United States v. Hamilton</i> , 182 F. Supp. 548 (D.D.C. 1960)	127
C.	Concurrence	131
	<i>In re L.D.</i> , 63 Ohio Misc. 2d 303 (Ohio Ct. Com. P. 1993)	132

Part III: Crimes Against the Person

Chapter 6: Murder **139**

A.	Malice Aforethought	139
	<i>Fouts v. State</i> , 8 Ohio St. 98 (1857)	139
B.	Degrees of Murder	143
	<i>O.R.C. 2903.01 Aggravated Murder</i>	143
	<i>O.R.C. 2903.02 Murder</i>	143
C.	Prior Calculation and Design	144
	<i>State v. Walker</i> , 2014-Ohio-1827 (Ohio Ct. App. 2014)	144

Chapter 7: Felony Murder and the Death Penalty **151**

A.	Felony Murder Proof Requirements	151
	<i>State v. Miller</i> , 96 Ohio St.3d 384 (2002)	151
B.	Death of a Co-Felon	157
	<i>State v. Dixon</i> , 2002 Ohio App. LEXIS 472 (Ohio Ct. App. 2002)	157
C.	Attempted Felony Murder	164
	<i>State v. Nolan</i> , 2013-Ohio-2829 (Ohio Ct. App. 2013)	164
D.	Independent Merger Doctrine	171
	<i>State v. Cherry</i> , 2002-Ohio-3738 (Ohio Ct. App. 2002)	171
E.	Death Penalty Process	179

S. Adele Shank, <i>The Death Penalty in Ohio: Fairness, Reliability, and Justice at Risk—A Report on Reforms in Ohio’s Use of the Death Penalty Since the 1997 Ohio State Bar Association Recommendations Were Made</i>	179
O.R.C. 2929.04 <i>Death Penalty or Imprisonment—Aggravating and Mitigating Factors</i>	181
F. Race, Gender, and Death Penalty	183
Frank R. Baumgartner, <i>The Impact of Race, Gender, and Geography on Ohio Executions</i>	183
Chapter 8: Voluntary Manslaughter	195
A. Provocation	195
State v. <i>Shane</i> , 63 Ohio St.3d 630 (1992)	195
B. Burden of Proof	202
State v. <i>Rhodes</i> , 63 Ohio St. 3d 613 (1992)	202
C. Imperfect Self-Defense	205
State v. <i>Goff</i> , 2013-Ohio-42 (Ohio Ct. App. 2013)	206
Chapter 9: Involuntary Manslaughter	207
A. Minor-Misdemeanor Murder	207
State v. <i>Weitbrecht</i> , 86 Ohio St.3d 368 (1999)	207
B. Negligent Homicide	212
State v. <i>Hill</i> , 31 Ohio App. 3d 65 (1987)	212
C. Reckless Homicide	215
State v. <i>English</i> , 2014-Ohio-89 (Ohio Ct. App. 2014)	215
Chapter 10: Assault	221
A. Background	221
State v. <i>Williams</i> , 1990 WL 47451 (Ohio Ct. App. 1990)	221
B. Felonious Assault and Aggravated Assault	226
State v. <i>Deem</i> , 40 Ohio St. 3d 205 (1988)	226
Chapter 11: Sexual Assault	233
A. Force	233
State v. <i>El-Berri</i> , 2008 WL 2764873 (Ohio Ct. App. 2008)	234
B. Statutory Rape	248
In re <i>D.B.</i> , 129 Ohio St. 3d 104 (2011)	249
C. Rape Shield Statute	254
Lewis v. <i>Wilkinson</i> , 307 F. 3d 413 (6th Cir. 2002)	254
Chapter 12: Kidnapping and Robbery	263
A. Kidnapping, Abduction, and Unlawful Restraint	263
State v. <i>Kroesen</i> , 2000 WL 1715764 (Ohio Ct. App. 2000)	263

B.	Robbery	267
1.	Level of Force	267
	<i>State v. Weaver</i> , 1993 WL 441799 (Ohio Ct. App. 1993)	267
2.	Deadly Weapon	271
	<i>State v. Wharf</i> , 86 Ohio St. 3d 375 (1999)	271

Part IV: Crimes Against Property

Chapter 13: Larceny and False Pretenses 279

A.	Larceny	279
1.	Concurrence and Larceny by Trick	280
	<i>Rex v. Pear</i> , 1 Leach 212, 168 English Report 208 (1779)	280
2.	Asportation	281
	<i>State v. Cadle</i> , 2008-Ohio-3639 (Ohio Ct. App. 2008)	281
3.	Lost and Abandoned Property	285
	<i>Brooks v. State</i> , 35 Ohio St. 46 (1878)	285
B.	False Pretenses	289
1.	Past or Present Fact and Material Misrepresentation	290
	<i>Winnett v. State</i> , 18 Ohio C.C. 515 (1899)	290
2.	Obtaining Title	297
	<i>Blackledge v. United States</i> , 447 A.2d 46 (D.C. Ct. App. 1982)	297
	<i>Locks v. United States</i> , 388 A. 2d 873 (1978)	301

Chapter 14: Embezzlement and Receipt of Stolen Property 307

A.	Background	307
	<i>Rex v. Bazeley</i> , 2 Leach 835 (1799)	307
B.	Intent to Defraud	319
	<i>Ambrose v. United States</i> , 45 App. D.C. 112 (1916)	319
C.	Larceny, False Pretenses, and Embezzlement	328
	<i>Eiseman & Landsman v. State</i> , 1932 WL 1699 (Ohio Ct. App. 1932)	328
D.	Receipt of Stolen Property	331
	<i>State v. Diephaus</i> , 55 Ohio App. 3d 90 (1989)	331

Chapter 15: Burglary 335

A.	Breaking and Entering	335
	<i>Goins v. State</i> , 90 Ohio St. 176 (1914)	335
B.	Felony Therein	339
	<i>In re L.D.</i> , 63 Ohio Misc. 2d 303 (Ohio Ct. Com. P. 1993)	339
	<i>State v. Gardner</i> , 118 Ohio St. 3d 420 (2008)	339

Part V: Inchoate Crimes and Accomplice Liability

Chapter 16: Attempt 353

- A. Substantial Step 354
 - United States v. Mandujano*, 499 F.2d 370 (1974) 354
 - State v. Group*, 98 Ohio St. 3d 248 (2002) 361
- B. Legal Impossibility 367
 - State v. Brown*, 1996 WL 139626 (Ohio Ct. App.1996) 367
- C. Abandonment 373
 - State v. Arnold*, 9 Ohio Misc. 2d 14 (Hamilton County Mun. Ct. 1983) 373

Chapter 17: Solicitation 377

- United States v. White*, 610 F. 3d 956 (7th Cir. 2010) 377

Chapter 18: Conspiracy 387

- A. Unilateral vs. Bilateral 388
 - State v. Marian*, 62 Ohio St. 2d 250 (1980) 388
- B. Overt Act and Withdrawal 392
 - State v. Baugh*, 1978 WL 216550 (Ohio Ct. App. 1978) 392
- C. Pinkerton Liability 401
 - Pinkerton v. United States*, 328 U.S. 640 (1946) 401
- D. Wharton's Rule 408
 - Iannelli v. United States*, 420 U.S. 770 (1975) 408

Chapter 19: Accomplice Liability 417

- A. Background 417
 - State v. Mitzel*, 1989 WL 110827 (Ohio Ct. App. 1989) 417
- B. Mere Presence 419
 - State v. Johnson*, 93 Ohio St.3d 240 (2001) 419
- C. Actions of the Principal 425
 - In re T.K.*, 109 Ohio St.3d 512 (2006) 425

Part VI: Defenses

Chapter 20: Self-Defense 431

- A. Burden of Proof 431
 - Martin v. Ohio*, 480 U.S. 228 (1987) 431
- B. Castle Doctrine 441
 - State v. Kozlosky*, 195 Ohio App.3d 343 (2011) 441
- C. Initial Aggressor and Proportionality 446
 - Stewart v. State*, 1 Ohio St. 66 (1852) 447
 - United States v. Peterson*, 483 F. 2d 1222 (1973) 452

D.	Defense of Others	460
	<i>City of Columbus v. Wenger</i> , 1978 Ohio App. LEXIS 7886	460
Chapter 21: Insanity		467
A.	Background	467
	<i>State v. Staten</i> , 247 N.E. 2d 293 (Ohio 1969)	467
B.	Mens Rea and Level of Proof	473
	<i>State v. Curry</i> , 45 Ohio St. 3d 109 (1989)	473
C.	Diminished Capacity	480
	<i>State v. Wilcox</i> , 70 Ohio St.2d 182 (1982)	480
Chapter 22: Infancy and Intoxication		493
A.	Infancy	493
	<i>Deluca v. Bowden</i> , 42 Ohio St.2d 392 (1975)	493
	<i>In re Washington</i> , 75 Ohio St.3d 390 (1996)	493
B.	Intoxication	495
	<i>State v. Johnston</i> , 2015-Ohio-450 (Ohio Ct. App. 2015)	495
	<i>Montana v. Egelhoff</i> , 518 U.S. 37 (1996)	500
Chapter 23: Entrapment		519
A.	Subjective vs. Objective	519
	<i>State v. Doran</i> , 5 Ohio St. 3d 187 (1983)	519
B.	Predisposition	527
	<i>Jacobson v. United States</i> , 503 U.S. 540 (1992)	527
Chapter 24: Necessity and Duress		539
A.	Background	539
	<i>United States v. Contento-Pachon</i> , 723 F. 2d 691 (1984)	539
	<i>City of Columbus v. Spingola</i> , 144 Ohio App.3d 76 (2001)	544
B.	Incarceration	548
	<i>State v. Cross</i> , 58 Ohio St. 2d 482 (1979)	548
C.	Homicide	552
	<i>State v. Grinnell</i> , 678 N.E. 2d 231 (1996)	552
	<i>Table of Cases</i>	557

PART I
Background and Punishment