

Linda Wittor

Democracy as an International Obligation of States and Right of the People

Linda Wittor

**Democracy as an
International Obligation
of States and Right
of the People**

Bibliographic Information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data is available in the internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

Zugl.: Bochum, Univ., Diss., 2015

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Wittor, Linda.

Title: Democracy as an international obligation of states and right of the people / Linda Wittor.

Description: New York : Peter Lang, 2016. | Includes bibliographical references.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016010016 | ISBN 9783631674468

Subjects: LCSH: International law and human rights. | Democratization--Philosophy. | Nation-building--Philosophy. | Humanitarian intervention. | Intervention (International law) | Democratization--International cooperation.

Classification: LCC KZ1266 .W58 2016 | DDC 341.3--dc23 LC record available at <http://lcn.loc.gov/2016010016>

D 294

ISBN 978-3-631-67446-8 (Print)

E-ISBN 978-3-653-06845-0 (E-Book)

DOI 10.3726/978-3-653-06845-0

© Peter Lang GmbH

Internationaler Verlag der Wissenschaften

Frankfurt am Main 2016

All rights reserved.

PL Academic Research is an Imprint of Peter Lang GmbH.

Peter Lang – Frankfurt am Main · Bern · Bruxelles · New York ·
Oxford · Warszawa · Wien

All parts of this publication are protected by copyright. Any utilisation outside the strict limits of the copyright law, without the permission of the publisher, is forbidden and liable to prosecution. This applies in particular to reproductions, translations, microfilming, and storage and processing in electronic retrieval systems.

This publication has been peer reviewed.

www.peterlang.com

To my Parents

Acknowledgement

Writing and publishing this thesis would not have been possible without the support of many people in my life. Representative of all, I would like to thank:

Professor Dr. Markus Kaltenborn and Professor Dr. Adelheid Puttler for corrections and remarks.

Much appreciated was all the work done by my friends Hafsa Zayyan and Ryan Manton, as well as Robin Ramßahaye and Tobias Ackermann. Each one of them read the thesis and gave helpful remarks and comments. Stephan Koloßa was a great help during the preparation for the oral exam.

Lastly, this thesis as well as my whole career would not have been possible without the incredible support of my family. I owe it all to my mother, who literally always kept my spirit up and my feet on the ground; my father who planted the idea of pursuing a PhD and discussed with me on many occasions whether democracy was the ideal form of government; my grandparents who supported me morally and with much appreciated “survival packages”; and my brother who enriches my daily life with his special kind of humor.

Table of contents

Abbreviations	15
A. Introduction – Democracy in international law	23
I. Filling the term with life.....	23
II. An obligation of states	27
III. A right of peoples and individuals.....	28
IV. Mode of inquiry	29
B. Democracy as a legal norm in international law.....	31
I. Is there an international obligation of states to become and remain democratic?.....	32
1. International conventions.....	33
a. Global conventions.....	37
aa. The Charter of the United Nations.....	37
bb. Human rights treaties	38
cc. Other conventions.....	42
b. Regional conventions.....	43
aa. Europe.....	43
bb. The Americas	46
cc. Africa and the Arab region	50
dd. Asia.....	55
c. Conclusion on international conventions.....	55
2. Customary international law.....	56
a. Frequent resolutions of the United Nations General Assembly.....	58
b. Other soft law documents	64
c. Pro-democratic interventions.....	71
aa. The intervention in the Dominican Republic in 1965.....	72
bb. The Grenada intervention in 1983	74

cc.	The Panama intervention in 1989	77
dd.	The Iraq intervention in 2003	81
ee.	Interventions authorised by the United Nations Security Council: Haiti, Sierra Leone, Afghanistan, Libya and Mali	83
ff.	Conclusion on the pro-democratic intervention	90
d.	Membership in international organisations.....	93
aa.	Global organisations	93
bb.	European organisations	95
cc.	American organisations.....	97
dd.	African organisations.....	98
ee.	Asian organisations	99
ff.	Conclusion on the practice of international organisations	99
e.	Democracy clauses in partnership and assistance agreements.....	100
aa.	Global institutions	101
bb.	The European Union.....	103
cc.	American and African economic organisations.....	107
dd.	Conclusion on the practice of democracy clauses	107
f.	Recognition of states and governments.....	108
aa.	Recognition of states	108
bb.	Recognition of governments.....	111
g.	Post-conflict state and nation building.....	116
h.	The practice of regional treaty obligations to democracy	120
i.	Conclusion on international custom	121
3.	Conclusion concerning an international obligation to democracy.....	122
II.	Is there an international right to democracy?	123
1.	International conventions.....	124
a.	The Charter of the United Nations.....	125
b.	Global human rights treaties.....	129
c.	Regional human rights treaties.....	138
aa.	Europe.....	138

bb. The Americas	140
cc. Africa.....	142
dd. Asia.....	144
d. The Charter of the Commonwealth	144
e. Conclusion on international conventions	145
2. Customary international law.....	145
a. The Universal Declaration on Human Rights and other soft law documents.....	146
b. Pro-democratic interventions.....	154
c. Electoral assistance.....	155
d. Post-conflict state and nation building.....	161
e. Conclusion on international custom	163
3. Conclusion concerning an international right to democracy.....	164
III. Conclusion concerning international law on democracy.....	166
 C. The international state obligation and people's right to democracy and existing norms of international law.....	 169
I. Democracy and the prohibition of the use of force.....	170
1. The prohibition of the use of force under the Charter of the United Nations and customary international law	171
a. Is a non-democratic state protected by the prohibition of the use of force?	172
b. Is an armed invasion in order to (re)establish democracy a use of force against the territorial integrity of a state?	175
c. Is an armed invasion in order to (re)establish democracy a use of force against the political independence of a state? ...	177
2. Justification of the use of force under the Charter of the United Nations	180
a. Authorisation by the United Nations Security Council	180
aa. Is the mere existence of a non-democratic state a threat to the peace?.....	181
aaa. The Kantian theory of democratic peace	181
bbb. The case of Afghanistan.....	183
ccc. The case of Libya.....	184

ddd. Conclusion	186
bb. Is the disruption of democracy a threat to the peace?	187
aaa. The case of Haiti	187
bbb. The case of Sierra Leone	189
ccc. The case of Mali	190
ddd. Conclusion	192
cc. The practice of the United Nations Security Council.....	193
b. The inherent right of individual or collective self-defence	194
3. Customary justifications of the use of force	195
a. The doctrine of humanitarian intervention	196
b. The doctrine of pro-democratic intervention.....	203
4. Conclusion on the use of force in the name of democracy	206
II. Democracy and the prohibition of intervention.....	207
1. The scope of protection.....	208
2. Foreign intervention for reasons of democracy.....	212
3. Justification of the intervention	218
a. Responsibility for an internationally wrongful act	219
b. Injury of the intervening state and exceptions to that requirement.....	220
c. Conclusion on the justification of the intervention	224
4. Conclusion on interventions in the name of democracy	224
III. Could the implementation of an international state obligation and people's right to democracy be reviewed under existing international mechanisms?	225
1. The International Court of Justice	225
2. The Human Rights Council.....	228
3. The Human Rights Committee	229
4. Regional enforcement mechanisms.....	231
a. The European Court of Human Rights	231
b. Inter-American judicial bodies.....	233
c. African review mechanisms.....	235
5. Conclusion on the international enforcement mechanisms	237

D. Concluding remarks.....	239
References.....	241
Table of Judicial Decisions	259
Table of International Documents	267

Linda Wittor

**Democracy as an
International Obligation
of States and Right
of the People**

PL ACADEMIC
RESEARCH

Bibliographic Information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data is available in the internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

Zugl.: Bochum, Univ., Diss., 2015

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Wittor, Linda.

Title: Democracy as an international obligation of states and right of the people / Linda Wittor.

Description: New York : Peter Lang, 2016. | Includes bibliographical references.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016010016 | ISBN 9783631674468

Subjects: LCSH: International law and human rights. | Democratization--Philosophy. | Nation-building--Philosophy. | Humanitarian intervention. | Intervention (International law) | Democratization--International cooperation.

Classification: LCC KZ1266 .W58 2016 | DDC 341.3--dc23 LC record available at <http://lcn.loc.gov/2016010016>

D 294

ISBN 978-3-631-67446-8 (Print)

E-ISBN 978-3-653-06845-0 (E-Book)

DOI 10.3726/978-3-653-06845-0

© Peter Lang GmbH

Internationaler Verlag der Wissenschaften

Frankfurt am Main 2016

All rights reserved.

PL Academic Research is an Imprint of Peter Lang GmbH.

Peter Lang – Frankfurt am Main · Bern · Bruxelles · New York ·

Oxford · Warszawa · Wien

All parts of this publication are protected by copyright. Any utilisation outside the strict limits of the copyright law, without the permission of the publisher, is forbidden and liable to prosecution. This applies in particular to reproductions, translations, microfilming, and storage and processing in electronic retrieval systems.

This publication has been peer reviewed.

www.peterlang.com

To my Parents

Acknowledgement

Writing and publishing this thesis would not have been possible without the support of many people in my life. Representative of all, I would like to thank:

Professor Dr. Markus Kaltenborn and Professor Dr. Adelheid Puttler for corrections and remarks.

Much appreciated was all the work done by my friends Hafsa Zayyan and Ryan Manton, as well as Robin Ramßahaye and Tobias Ackermann. Each one of them read the thesis and gave helpful remarks and comments. Stephan Koloßa was a great help during the preparation for the oral exam.

Lastly, this thesis as well as my whole career would not have been possible without the incredible support of my family. I owe it all to my mother, who literally always kept my spirit up and my feet on the ground; my father who planted the idea of pursuing a PhD and discussed with me on many occasions whether democracy was the ideal form of government; my grandparents who supported me morally and with much appreciated “survival packages”; and my brother who enriches my daily life with his special kind of humor.