

LEUVEN
GLOBAL
GOVERNANCE
SERIES

A photograph of three tall, lattice-structured oil drilling rigs in a landscape. In the background, there are small houses and rolling hills under a cloudy sky. The bottom half of the cover is a solid blue arc.

Regulating Shale Gas

The Challenge of Coherent
Environmental and Energy Regulation



Leuven Centre
for Global
Governance Studies

Leonie Reins

Regulating Shale Gas

The Challenge of Coherent Environmental
and Energy Regulation

Leonie Reins

*Post Doctoral Research Fellow, Department of International and European
Law; Senior Member of the Leuven Centre for Global Governance Studies,
KU Leuven, Belgium*

LEUVEN GLOBAL GOVERNANCE

 **Edward Elgar**
PUBLISHING

Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA

© Leonie Reins 2017

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical or photocopying, recording, or otherwise without the prior permission of the publisher.

Published by
Edward Elgar Publishing Limited
The Lypiatts
15 Lansdown Road
Cheltenham
Glos GL50 2JA
UK

Edward Elgar Publishing, Inc.
William Pratt House
9 Dewey Court
Northampton
Massachusetts 01060
USA

A catalogue record for this book
is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Control Number: 2016957255

This book is available electronically in the **Elgaronline**
Law subject collection
DOI 10.4337/9781786433190



ISBN 978 1 78643 318 3 (cased)
ISBN 978 1 78643 319 0 (eBook)

Typeset by Columns Design XML Ltd, Reading
Printed and bound by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

Acknowledgements

Writing this book would not have been possible without the help and support of a great number of individuals.

First and foremost I want to thank Prof. Dr. Geert Van Calster. It has been an honour and great pleasure to work with and for him for the last years. He gave me the freedom to explore on my own, and at the same time provided the guidance and feedback I needed. He provided insightful discussions about the research and taught me, both consciously and subconsciously, how good research is conducted. I appreciate all his contributions of time, ideas and funding which made this writing experience productive and stimulating. I would further like to thank Prof. Dr. Terrence Centner, Prof. Dr. Geert De Baere, Prof. Dr. Steven Lierman and Prof. Dr. Thomas Schomerus for their time, interest and helpful comments on earlier versions of the manuscript. Special thanks are owed to Prof. Dr. Thomas Schomerus for having made my research stay at the University of Texas-Pan American possible; it was a truly worthwhile and fun experience.

In addition, the members of the Department of International and European Law at KU Leuven have contributed immensely to my personal and professional time in Leuven: thank you for that. I also thank my friends in Belgium and Germany for providing the support and friendship that I needed.

Lastly, I would like to thank my family for all their love and encouragement. To my parents who raised me with dedication and supported me in all my pursuits. To my brother who put his arm around me when needed. To my husband who is always there for me.

Further, I gratefully acknowledge the FWO project funding that made this research possible.

Abbreviations

ACELG	Amsterdam Centre of European Law and Governance
BAT	Best Available Technique
BGR	Bundesanstalt für Geowissenschaften und Rohstoffe
BREF	Best Available Techniques Reference documents
CCS	Carbon Capture and Storage
CEP	Common European Energy Policy
CO ₂	Carbon Dioxide
CoR	Committee of the Regions
CESAR	CO ₂ Enhanced Separation and Recovery
CLP	Classification, Labelling and Packaging
DG	Directorate General (of the European Commission)
DG AGRI	Directorate General for Agriculture
DG CLIMA	Directorate General for Climate Change
DG ENER	Directorate General for Energy
DG ENV	Directorate General for Environment
EASST	European Association for the Study of Science and Technology
ECHA	European Chemical Agency
ECJ	European Court of Justice
ECT	European Community Treaty
EEB	European Environmental Bureau
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
EREF	European Renewable Energy Federation
EU	European Union
Etc.	et cetera
ETS	European Emission Trading Scheme

FP	Framework Programme
GBP	British Pound
GHG	Greenhouse Gas
GMO	Genetically Modified Organisms
IED	Industrial Emission Directive
IEHN	Investor Environmental Health Network
IGC	Intergovernmental Conference
IPPC	Integrated Pollution Prevention Control
ISO	International Organization for Standardization
JRC–IPTS	Joint Research Centre – Institute for Prospective Technological Studies
MS	Member States
MW	Megawatt
MWD	Mining Waste Directive
Nano	Nanotechnology
NEC	National Emission Ceilings
NESHAP	National Emissions Standards for Hazardous Air Pollutants
NGO	Non-Government Organization
NGS	Natural Gas from Shale
NIMBY	Not In My Back Yard
No.	Number
NORM	Naturally Occurring Radioactive Materials
OPPPW	Polish Exploration and Production Industry Organization
QMV	Qualified Majority Voting
REACH	Regulation on Registration, Evaluation, Authorisation and Restriction of Chemicals
REC	Reduced Emissions Completions
RoHS Directive	Directive restricting the use of hazardous substances in electrical and electronic equipment
SEA	Strategic Environmental Assessment
SET-Plan	European Strategic Energy Technology Plan
SGEIS	Supplemental Generic Environmental Impact Statement

STS	Science and Technology Studies
SUSPROC	Sustainable Production and Consumption
TEU	Treaty on the European Union
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
TTIP	Transatlantic Trade and Investment Partnership
UBA	Umweltbundesamt (German Federal Environmental Agency)
UK	United Kingdom
UNECE	United Nations Economic Commission for Europe
US	United States
USD	United States Dollar
VOC	Volatile Organic Compounds
WEEE	Waste Electrical and Electronic Equipment
WFD	Water Framework Directive

Table of cases

EUROPEAN COURT OF JUSTICE

<i>Azienda Agro-Zootecnica Franchini Srl, Eolica di Altamura Srl v. Regione Puglia</i> , Case C-2/10 [2011] ECR I-06561	45
<i>ClientEarth</i> , Case C-404/13, ECLI:EU:C:2014:2382	109–10
<i>Commission v. Belgium</i> C-435/09 [2011] ECR 36	56
<i>Commission v. Council (Titanium Dioxide)</i> , Cases C-300/89 [1991] ECR I-2867	46–8
<i>Commission v. Council</i> , Case C-45/86 [1987] ECR I-1493	47
<i>Commission v. Council</i> , Case C-94/03 [2006] ECR I-1	47
<i>Commission v. Council</i> , Case C-155/91 [1993] ECR I-939	46–7
<i>Commission v. Council</i> , Case C-176/03 [2005] ECR I-7879	46–7
<i>Commission v. Council</i> , Case C-242/87 [1989] ECR I-1425	47
<i>Commission v. Council</i> , Case C-338/01 [2004] ECR I4829	47–8
<i>Commission v. Council</i> , Case C-440/05 [2007] ECR I-9097	46
<i>Commission v. France</i> , Case C-280/02 [2004] ECR I-8573	53–4
<i>Commission v. France</i> , Case C-333/08 [2010] ECR I-757	104
<i>Commission v. Greece</i> , Case C-420/02 [2004] ECR I-11175	53
<i>Commission v. Ireland</i> , Case C-215/06 [2008] ECR 4911	54
<i>Commission v. Ireland</i> , Case C-392/96 [1999] ECR 5901	56
<i>Commission v. Italy</i> , Case C-297/08 [2010] EHR I-1749	53
<i>Commission v. Italy</i> , Case C-486/04 [2006] ECR I1025	54
<i>Commission v. Italy</i> , Cases C-365/97 [1999] ECR I-7773	53
<i>Commission v. Netherlands</i> Case C-255/08 [2009] ECR 167	56
<i>Commission v. Parliament and Council</i> , Case C-178/03 [2006] ECR I-107	47–8
<i>Commission v. Poland</i> , Case C-504/09 P ECLI:EU:C:2012:178	37
<i>Commission v. Portugal</i> , Case C-37/09 [2010] ECR I-76	53
<i>Commission v. Spain</i> , Case C-474/99 [2002] ECR 5293	56
<i>Commission v. UK</i> , C-508/03 [2006] ECR I-4475	53
<i>Commission v. UK</i> , Case C-300/07 [2009] ECR I-214	53–4
<i>Commission v. UK</i> , Case C-390/07 [2009] ECR I-214	53–4
<i>EREF v. Commission</i> , Case T-694/14	30
<i>Germany v. Commission</i> , Case T-374/04 [2007] ECR II, 4431	37
<i>Germany v. Parliament and Council</i> , Case C-376/98 [2000] ECR I-8419	47
<i>Gowan Comércio Internacional e Serviços</i> , Case C-77/09 [2010] ECR I-13533	103, 105
<i>Grimaldi Case</i> , Case C-322/88 [1989] ECR I-4407	44–5
<i>Huber</i> , Case C-336/00 [2002] ECR I-7699	47
<i>Isle of Wight Council</i> , Case C-288/07 [2008] ECR 7203	59

<i>Kaasfabriek Eyssen</i> , Case 53/80 [1981] ECR 409	103
<i>Marktgemeinde Straßwalchen and Others</i> , Case C-531/13 ECLI:EU:C:2015:79	55
<i>Laboratoires pharmaceutiques Bergaderm a.o. v. Commission</i> , Case C-353/98P [2000] ECR 5291	103
<i>Linster</i> , Case C-287/98 [2000] ECR 6917	54
<i>Parliament v. Council</i> (' <i>International Fund for Ireland</i> '), Case C-166/07 [2009] ECR I-07135	47–8
<i>Parliament v. Council</i> , Case C-155/07 [2008] ECR I-8103	47
<i>Parliament v. Council</i> , Case C-166/07 [2009] ECR I-7135	47
<i>Parliament v. Council</i> , Case C-271/94 [1996] ECR I-1689	48
<i>Pfizer Animal Health v. Council</i> , Case T-13/99 [2002] ECR II-3305	103–4
<i>Sandoz</i> , Case 174/82 [1983] ECR 2445	103
<i>Srl CILFIT and Lanificio di Gavardo SpA v. Ministry of Health</i> , Case C-283/81 [1982] ECR 3415	11
<i>United Kingdom v. Commission</i> , Case C-180/96 [1998] EHR I-226	102–3
<i>Van Bennekom</i> , Case C-227/82 [1983] ECR I- 3883	102–3
<i>Waddenvereniging and Vogelbeschermingsvereniging</i> , Case C-127/02 [2004] ECR, I-7405	56
<i>Waterschap Zeeuws Vlaanderen</i> , Case C-378/02 [2005] ECR I-4685	59

NATIONAL CASES

France

<i>Société Schuepbach Energy LLC</i> , Le Conseil Constitutionnel, Décision 2013-346	77
---	----

Germany

<i>BverfG in BVerfG</i> , Beschluss vom 08.08.1978 – 2 BvL 8/77 (Kalkar – Beschluss)	95
---	----

United Kingdom

<i>R (on the application of ClientEarth) v. Secretary of State for the Environment, Food and Rural Affairs</i> [2015] UKSC 28	110
---	-----

Table of policy documents

EUROPEAN COMMISSION

An energy Policy for the European Union, Brussels, 13.12.1995, COM(95) 682	63–4
Better Regulation – simply explained, 2006	91
Better regulation for better results – An EU agenda, Strasbourg, 19.5.2015, COM(2015) 215	158
Better Regulation Guidelines. Commission Staff Working Document, Strasbourg, 19.5.2015, SWD (2015) 111	158
BREF for Large Combustion Plants, Industrial Emissions Directive 2010/75/EU, Draft 1 (June 2013)	165
BREF on Management of Tailings and Waste- Rock in Mining Activities (2009)	165–6, 192
Communication on Energy 2020 – A strategy for competitive, sustainable and secure energy, Brussels, 10.11.2010, COM(2010) 639	65
Communication on Energy Union Package – A framework strategy for a resilient energy union with a forward-looking climate change policy, Brussels, 25.2.2015, COM(2015) 80	66
Communication on the exploration and production of hydrocarbons (such as shale gas) using high volume hydraulic fracturing in the EU, Brussels, 17.3.2014, COM(2014) 23	5, 61, 112, 174, 183, 192
Communication on the Future of Carbon Capture and Storage in Europe, Brussels, 27.3.2013, COM(2013) 180	137, 168
Communication on the precautionary principle, Brussels, 2.2.2000, COM(2000) 1	105, 112
Communication on the regulatory aspects of nanomaterials, Brussels, 17.6.2008, COM(2008) 366	132
Communication on the short-term resilience of the European gas system – Preparedness for a possible disruption of supplies from the East during the fall and winter of 2014/2015, Brussels, 16.10.2014, COM(2014) 654	66
Energy Roadmap 2050, Brussels, COM(2011) 885/2	65–6, 68
Ensuring safe and environmentally sound CCS, DG CLIMA	87, 119
European Energy Security Strategy, Brussels, 28.5.2014	69–70
European Governance – A white paper, COM(2001) 428, OJ C 287, 12.10.2001	10
European Governance: Better lawmaking, COM(2002) 275	158
A European Strategy for Sustainable, Competitive and Secure Energy, Brussels, 8.3.2006, COM(2006) 105	5, 61
First guidelines for a Community Energy Policy, (1968), COM (68) 1040	63

Impact Assessment – Accompanying document to the Proposal for a Directive on the geological storage of carbon dioxide, Brussels, 23.1.2008, COM(2008)	129–130
Impact Assessment, Exploration and production of hydrocarbons (such as shale gas) using high volume, hydraulic fracturing in the EU, Brussels, 22.1.2014, SWD(2014)21	112, 114
Implementation of Directive 2009/31/EC on the Geological Storage of Carbon Dioxide Guidance Document 1 – CO ₂ Storage Life Cycle Risk Management Framework, 2011	120–21
Implementation Report from 2007 on the nanotechnology action plan, Brussels, 6.9.2007, COM(2007) 505	132
The Internal Energy Market, Commission Working Document, Brussels, 2.5.1988, COM (88)238	63
Nanosciences and nanotechnologies: an Action Plan for Europe 2005–2009 (COM(2005) 243)	86, 132
Public Awareness and Acceptance of CO ₂ capture and storage (Special Eurobarometer, 2011)	152
Recommendation 2011/696/EU on the definition of nanomaterial, [2011] OJ L275/38	7, 129, 145–50
Recommendation on a Code of Conduct for responsible nanosciences and nanotechnologies research, C(2008) 424	7, 86, 129, 132, 190
Recommendation on the definition of nanomaterial, [2011] OJ L 275/38	86
Recommendation on minimum principles for the exploration and production of hydrocarbons (such as shale gas) using high-volume hydraulic fracturing, OJ [2014] L39/72 (22 January 2014)	31, 39, 43–4, 99, 111, 129, 163, 189
Renewable Energy Road Map – Renewable energies in the 21st century: building a more sustainable future, Brussels, 10.1.2007, COM(2006) 848	66, 68
Report on the Thematic Strategy on the Prevention and Recycling of Waste, 19.1.2011, COM(2011) 13	109
Report to the European Council on the Adaptation of Community Legislation to the Subsidiarity Principle, COM (93) 545	35
Report Under Article 14(2) of Directive 2004/35/CE on the environmental liability with regard to the prevention and remedying of environmental damage', Brussels, 12.10.2010, COM(2010) 581	115–16
Second Regulatory Review on Nanomaterials, Brussels, 3.10.2012, COM(2012) 572	157
Taking sustainable use of resources forward: A Thematic Strategy on the prevention and recycling of waste, 21.12.2005, COM(2005) 666	109
Towards a European strategy for nanotechnology, Brussels, 12.5.2004, COM(2004) 338	86, 146
Towards a European strategy for the security of energy supply, Brussels, 29.11.2000, COM(2000)769	63–4

EUROPEAN COUNCIL

Conclusions of 4 February 2011, 8 March 2011, EUCO 2/1/11 REV 1	5
---	---

EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

Assessment of the Effects of Certain Public and Private Projects on the Environment: Provisions concerning the Quality of the EIA COD 2012/0297	55
Draft Opinion on Supporting Early Demonstration of Sustainable Power Generation from Fossil Fuels, (2008/2140(INI)), 23.7.2008.	165
Resolution of 24 April 2009 on regulatory aspects of nanomaterials, P6 TA(2009)0328	146

TABLE OF EUROPEAN LEGISLATION

Council Resolutions on energy and the environment [1975] OJ C 168/2 (3 March 1975)	24–5
--	------

Directives

77/388/EEC on the harmonization of the laws relating to turnover taxes – 6th VAT Directive [1977] OJ L 145/1	59–60
89/391/EEC on the introduction of measures to encourage improvements in the safety and health of workers at work, [1989] OJ L 183/1	23
91/414/EEC concerning the placement of plant protection products on the market, [1991] OJ L 230/1	23
92/43/EEC on the conservation of natural habitats and of wild fauna and flora [1992] OJ L 206/7	56–7, 60
96/82/EC on the control of major-accident hazards involving dangerous substances, [2007] OJ L 10/3,	143
98/8/EC concerning the placement of biocidal products on the market, [2007] OJ L 247/21	141–2
2000/60/EC establishing a framework for Community action in the field of water policy, [2000] OJ L 327/1	7, 87
2001/37/EC on the approximation of the laws, regulations and administrative provisions of the Member States concerning the manufacture, presentation and sale of tobacco, [2001] OJ L 194/26	24
2001/42/EC on the assessment of the effects of certain plans and programmes on the environment, [2001] OJ L 197/30	76
2001/80/EC on the limitation of emissions of certain pollutants into the air from large combustion plants, [2011] OJ L 309/1	122
2002/30/EC on the establishment of rules and procedures with regard to the introduction of noise-related operating restrictions at Community airports, [2002] OJ L 85/40	23
2003/87/EC establishing a scheme for greenhouse gas emission allowance trading within the Community and amending Council Directive 96/61/EC, [2003] OJ L 275/32	28
2003/96/EC restructuring the Community framework for the taxation of energy products and electricity, [2003] OJ L 283/51	23

2004/35 on environmental liability [2004] OJ L 143/56	57
2006/12/EC on waste, [2006] OJ L 114/9	7
2006/21/EC on the management of waste from extractive industries and amending Directive 2004/35/EC, [2006] OJ L 102/15	165
2007/47/EC concerning medical devices [2007] OJ L 247/21	141–2
2008/1/EC on integrated pollution prevention and control (IPPC Directive) [2008] OJ L 24/8	146, 164–5
2008/50/EC on ambient air quality and cleaner air for Europe [2008] OJ L 152/1	109
2009/28/EC on the promotion of the use of energy from renewable sources [2009] OJ L 140/16	28, 45, 57–8
2009/31/EC on the geological storage of carbon dioxide [2009] OJ L 140/114	7, 28, 119–22, 129
2009/72/EC concerning common rules for the internal market in electricity, [2009] OJ L 211/55	27, 49
2009/73/EC concerning common rules for the internal market in natural gas, [2009] OJ L 211/94	27, 49
2010/31/EU on the energy performance of buildings, [2010] OJ L 153/13	70
2010/75/EU on industrial emissions OJ L 334/17	108
2011/92/EU on the assessment of the effects of certain public and private projects on the environment, [2012] OJ L 26/1	54–6, 122, 125, 190
2012/27/EU on energy efficiency [2012] OJ L 315/1	45, 70
draft Directive on the geological storage of carbon dioxide, Brussels, 23.1.2008, COM(2008) 18	152

Regulations

528/2012 concerning the making available on the market and use of biocidal products, [2012] OJ L 167/1	23, 146
713/2009/EC establishing an agency for the cooperation of energy regulators, [2009] OJ L 211/1	27, 49
714/2009/EC on conditions for access to the network for cross-border exchanges in electricity, [2009] OJ L 211/15	27, 49
715/2009 on conditions for access to the natural gas transmission networks and repealing Regulation (EC) No 1775/2005, [2009] OJ L 211/36	27, 49
994/2010 concerning measures to safeguard security of gas supply [2010] OJ L 295/1	42, 66
1013/2006 on shipments of waste [2006] OJ L 190/1	122
1169/2011 on the provision of food information to consumers [2011] OJ L 304/ 18	141
1223/2009 on cosmetic products, [2009] OJ L 342/59	141–2
1907/2006 concerning the registration, evaluation, authorisation and restriction of chemicals (REACH Regulations) and establishing a European Chemicals Agency [2006] OJ L 396/1	86
draft Regulation on medical devices, Brussels, 26.9.2012, COM(2012) 542	146

TABLE OF NATIONAL LEGISLATION

France

Decree No. 2012-232 on the mandatory reporting of nanomaterials	147
---	-----

TABLE OF TREATIES

Draft European Constitutional Treaty (TCE) (29 October 2004)	26, 53
EURATOM Treaty 1957	24, 63
European Coal and Steel Community Treaty 1951 (ECSC)	24, 63
Preamble	79
Single European Act 1986	
Article 8a	26
Article 130r – 130t	22, 53
TFEU (Treaty of the Functioning of the European Union) 2009	
Article 2(1)	34
Article 2(2)	34
Article 2(6)	33
Article 3	33
Article 3(2)	72
Article 4	33
Article 4(2)(e)	34
Article 6	33
Article 7	10–11
Article 11	11, 30, 68
Article 26	26
Article 43	23
Article 67	80
Article 80	80
Article 100	23
Article 101–106	28
Article 113	23
Article 114	22, 23, 26, 49–50
Article 122	80
Article 122(1)	80
Article 153	23, 153
Article 168(3)	72
Article 170–172	27
Article 180	72
Article 182	23
Article 191	3, 35, 38, 48–9, 68, 102
Article 191(2)	102, 107
Article 192	27–9, 45–6, 50–51, 57–8, 60
Article 192(2)(c)	50–52, 57, 60, 187
Article 194	4, 28, 30–31, 35, 40–43, 45–53, 57–9, 72, 79–82

Article 194(1)	41–3, 58–9, 72
Article 194(2)	30, 41, 50–52, 58, 81–2, 185–6
Article 196	24
Article 207	23–4
Article 211	72
Article 214	24
Article 222	24, 80, 81–2
Article 292	34, 39, 41
Article 347	80
Article 352	22, 27, 48
Declaration 35	80
Declaration 37	80
Declaration 62	80
Protocol 25	34
Protocol 28	80
Treaty Establishing the European Economic Community 1957 (TEC)(Treaty of Rome)	
Article 14	26
Article 81–88	27
Article 95	26
Article 100a	22
Article 154–156	27
Article 175	27
Article 235	22
Article 308	27
Treaty Establishing the European Community 1992 (ECT)(Maastricht Treaty)	
Article 2	25, 63
Article 3(b)	23, 80
Article 8a	36
Article 8a	26
Article 130r	22, 53
Article 130s	22, 53
Article 130t	22, 53
Preamble	79
Treaty on European Union 1997 (TEU)(Amsterdam Treaty)	
Article 3	80
Article 4(1)	32–3
Article 5(3)	36–7
Article 5(4)	32–3, 38–9
Article 21	80
Declaration 18	34
Protocol 2	36–9, 41
Protocol 30	36

Contents

<i>List of figures</i>	ix
<i>List of tables</i>	x
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xii
<i>Table of cases</i>	xv
<i>Table of policy documents</i>	xvii
1 Introduction – a research agenda for shale gas in the European Union	1
1 Challenges for coherent regulation of shale gas in the European Union	1
2 Shale gas technology and its impacts on the environment	12
3 Methodology	16
2 In search of the legal basis for energy and environmental regulation at the EU level: the case of unconventional gas extraction and its impacts on a common European energy policy	19
1 Introduction	19
2 ‘Energy’ and ‘environment’ before and after the Lisbon Treaty	22
3 The vertical division of competences and shale gas	31
4 The horizontal competences and shale gas	45
5 Emerging trends in shale gas regulation: towards a common energy policy or Member States’ sovereignty?	60
6 Conclusion	81
3 Regulation of technology versus technology of regulation – risk and regulatory design of ‘new’ technologies in the European Union – lessons for and from shale gas	85
1 Introduction	85
2 Problem statement: law, science and new technologies	89
3 Risks, uncertainties and science: the role of the prevention and precautionary principles	100

4	Cross-cutting 'new' technologies and their regulation in the past	118
5	Regulation of 'new' technologies: aligning the approaches	127
6	Conclusion	178
4	Conclusion	184
	<i>Index</i>	197