

Love's Enlightenment

Rethinking Charity in Modernity

Ryan Patrick Hanley



Love's Enlightenment

Rethinking Charity in Modernity

RYAN PATRICK HANLEY

Marquette University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107105225

© Ryan Patrick Hanley 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Hanley, Ryan Patrick, 1974– author.

Title: Love's enlightenment: rethinking charity in modernity /

Ryan Patrick Hanley, Marquette University.

Description: New York: Cambridge University Press, 2017.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016016147 | ISBN 9781107105225 (hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Love – Philosophy. | Empathy. | Attitude (Psychology) | Altruism.

Classification: LCC BD436.H265 2016 | DDC 177/.7–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2016016147>

ISBN 978-1-107-10522-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Love's Enlightenment

A number of prominent moral philosophers and political theorists have recently called for a recovery of love. But what do we mean when we speak of love today? *Love's Enlightenment* examines four key conceptions of other-directedness that transformed the meaning of love and helped to shape the way we understand love today: Hume's theory of humanity, Rousseau's theory of pity, Smith's theory of sympathy, and Kant's theory of love. It argues that these four Enlightenment theories are united by a shared effort to develop a moral psychology that can provide both justificatory and motivational grounds for concern for others in the absence of recourse to theological or transcendental categories. In this sense, each theory represents an effort to redefine the love of others that used to be known as *caritas* or *agape* – a redefinition that came with benefits and costs that have yet to be fully appreciated.

Ryan Patrick Hanley holds the Mellon Distinguished Professorship in Political Science at Marquette University. He is the author of *Adam Smith and the Character of Virtue* (Cambridge, 2009), and the editor of *Adam Smith: His Life, Thought, and Legacy* (2016), and the Penguin Classics edition of Adam Smith's *Theory of Moral Sentiments* (2010). His articles on eighteenth-century philosophy have recently appeared or are forthcoming in the *American Political Science Review*, the *Archiv für Geschichte der Philosophie*, the *Journal of Politics*, and the *Journal of the History of Philosophy*, among others. He is also the recipient of fellowships from the Arete Initiative, the Earhart Foundation, and the National Endowment for the Humanities.

For my father

Acknowledgments

I am deeply grateful to a number of institutions and individuals for their help with this project. A "Defining Wisdom" Fellowship from the University of Chicago's Arete Initiative enabled me to begin the project in earnest. As it began to take form, I was fortunate to receive helpful feedback from fellow participants and audiences at presentations and workshops at the University of Antwerp, the University of Arizona, the University of Chicago, the École Normale Supérieure-Lyon, Harvard University, the University of Illinois-Chicago, Northern Illinois University, and the University of Notre Dame. Parts of the project were also presented at annual meetings of the American Society for Eighteenth-Century Studies and the Association for Political Theory. At these events and in correspondence and discussion, several scholars generously shared their wisdom and insight with me. For engaging my work and challenging me to develop my arguments further, I am deeply grateful to, among others, Ruth Abbey, Larry Arnhart, Derek Barker, Kate Bermingham, Bruno Bernardi, Richard Boyd, Lauren Brubaker, Paddy Bullard, Maria Carrasco, Josh Cherniss, Susan Collins, Remy Debes, Patrick Deneen, Sam Fleischacker, Fonna Forman, Michael Frazer, Christel Fricke, Michael Gill, Charles Griswold, James Harris, Warren Herrold, Sharon Krause, Jonathan Lear, Wim Lemmens, Harvey Mansfield, Philip Muñoz, Clifford Orwin, Jennifer Pitts, Andrea Radesanu, Santi Sanchez, Eric Schliesser, Claudia Schmidt, Dave Schmidt, Michelle Schwarze, John Scott, Houston Smit, Alexis Tadié, Jacqueline Taylor, Mark Timmons, Helga Varden, David Williams, Nick Wolterstorff, Mark Yellin, Scott Yenor, Catherine Zuckert, and Michael Zuckert. Three anonymous reviewers at Cambridge University Press also provided helpful comments

and suggestions. My work on this project was also greatly aided by the contributions of several excellent research assistants: Brittany Hickman, Anthony Lanz, Christy Lennon, Darren Nah, Shana Scogin, and Lilya Yakova.

I am also grateful for permission to reprint material that previously appeared elsewhere in different forms. An earlier version of the Hume chapter was published as "David Hume and the 'Politics of Humanity'," *Political Theory* 39 (2011): 205–233. An earlier version of the Smith chapter was published as "Adam Smith: From Love to Sympathy," *Revue Internationale de Philosophie* 68 (2014): 251–273. And some material in the Rousseau chapter first appeared in French in "Pitié développée: Aspects éthiques et épistémiques," in *Philosophie de Rousseau*, ed. Blaise Bachofen, Bruno Bernardi, André Charrak, and Florent Guénard (Paris: Classiques Garnier, 2014), 305–318.

This work on love owes to those I love – and especially my mother, my sister, my daughter, and my wife – more than I know how to say. I dedicate it to my late father, whose love and support made it, and so much else, possible.

Texts and Abbreviations

Citations to the works of Hume, Rousseau, Smith, and Kant are, wherever possible, to the standard English-language scholarly versions of their collected works: the *Clarendon Edition of the Works of David Hume*; the *Collected Writings of Jean-Jacques Rousseau*; the *Glasgow Edition of the Works and Correspondence of Adam Smith*; and the *Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant*. For Rousseau and Kant, citations are also given to the standard editions of the French and German originals, the *Oeuvres complètes* and the *Akademie Ausgabe*. Passages in those texts of Hume and Smith for which there exist standard systems of paragraph numbering are cited using these numbers; all other passages are cited by page number (and series volume number, when available), with individual titles abbreviated as below.

HUME

| | |
|----------|---|
| Abstract | Abstract of the <i>Treatise</i> , in T. |
| DCNR | <i>Dialogues Concerning Natural Religion</i> , ed. Richard H. Popkin (Indianapolis, IN: Hackett, 1980). |
| DP | <i>Dissertation on the Passions</i> , ed. Tom L. Beauchamp (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2007). |
| EMPL | <i>Essays, Moral, Political, and Literary</i> , ed. Eugene F. Miller (Indianapolis, IN: Liberty Fund, 1985). |
| EHU | <i>An Enquiry Concerning Human Understanding</i> , ed. Tom L. Beauchamp (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2000). |
| EPM | <i>An Enquiry Concerning the Principles of Morals</i> , ed. Tom L. Beauchamp (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998). |

- H *The History of England*, ed. William B. Todd, 6 vols. (Indianapolis, IN: Liberty Fund, 1983).
- NHR *Natural History of Religion*, ed. Tom L. Beauchamp (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2007).
- T *A Treatise of Human Nature*, ed. David F. Norton and Mary J. Norton (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2007).

ROUSSEAU

- C *The Confessions*, trans. Christopher Kelly, in *The Confessions and Correspondence, Including the Letters to Malesherbes*, ed. Christopher Kelly, Roger D. Masters, and Peter G. Stillman (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 1995).
- DPE *Discourse on Political Economy*, trans. Judith R. Bush, in *Discourse on the Origins of Inequality, Polemics, and Political Economy*, ed. Roger D. Masters and Christopher Kelly (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 1992).
- E *Emile, or On Education*, trans. Allan Bloom, in *Emile, or On Education, includes Emile and Sophie, or The Solitaries*, ed. Christopher Kelly (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 2010).
- EL *Essay on the Origin of Languages*, trans. John T. Scott, in *Essay on the Origins of Languages and Writings Related to Music*, ed. John T. Scott (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 1998).
- ES *Emile and Sophie; or, The Solitaries*, trans. Christopher Kelly, in *Emile, or On Education, includes Emile and Sophie, or The Solitaries*, ed. Christopher Kelly (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 2010).
- FD *Discourse on the Sciences and Arts (First Discourse)*, trans. Judith R. Bush, in *Discourse on the Sciences and Arts and Polemics*, ed. Roger D. Masters and Christopher Kelly (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 1992).
- FG "Fragments on God and Revelation," trans. Christopher Kelly, in *Autobiographical, Scientific, Religious, Moral, and Literary Writings*, ed. Christopher Kelly (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 2006).
- J *Julie, or the New Heloise*, trans. Philip Stewart and Jean Vaché (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 1997).

- LB *Letter to Beaumont*, trans. Judith R. Bush and Christopher Kelly, in *Letter to Beaumont, Letters Written from the Mountain, and Related Writings*, ed. Christopher Kelly and Eve Grace (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 2001).
- LdA *Letter to d'Alembert*, trans. Allan Bloom, in *Letter to d'Alembert and Writings for the Theater*, ed. Christopher Kelly (Hanover, NH: University of New England Press, 2004).
- LF *Letter to Franquières*, trans. Terence E. Marshall, in *The Reveries of the Solitary Walker, Botanical Writings, and Letter to Franquières*, ed. Christopher Kelly (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 2000).
- LP *Letter to Philopolis*, trans. Christopher Kelly and Roger D. Masters, in *Discourse on the Origins of Inequality, Polemics, and Political Economy*, ed. Roger D. Masters and Christopher Kelly (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 1992).
- LS *Letters to Sara*, trans. Christopher Kelly, in *Autobiographical, Scientific, Religious, Moral, and Literary Writings*, ed. Christopher Kelly (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 2006).
- ML *Moral Letters*, trans. Christopher Kelly, in *Autobiographical, Scientific, Religious, Moral, and Literary Writings*, ed. Christopher Kelly (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 2006).
- OC *Oeuvres complètes*, ed. Bernard Gagnebin and Marcel Raymond, 5 vols. (Paris: Gallimard, 1959–1995).
- RSW *Reveries of the Solitary Walker*, trans. Charles E. Butterworth, in *The Reveries of the Solitary Walker, Botanical Writings, and Letter to Franquières*, ed. Christopher Kelly (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 2000).
- SD *Discourse on the Origins of Inequality* (Second Discourse), trans. Judith R. Bush, in *Discourse on the Origins of Inequality, Polemics, and Political Economy*, ed. Roger D. Masters and Christopher Kelly (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 1992).

SMITH

- CAS *Correspondence of Adam Smith*, ed. E. C. Mossner and I. S. Ross (Indianapolis, IN: Liberty Fund, 1987).

- ED "Early Draft" of the *Wealth of Nations*, in LJ.
- EPS *Essays on Philosophical Subjects*, ed. W. P. D. Wightman and J. C. Bryce (Indianapolis, IN: Liberty Fund, 1982).
- LER "Letter to the *Edinburgh Review*," in EPS.
- LJ *Lectures on Jurisprudence*, ed. R. L. Meek, D. D. Raphael, and P. G. Stein (Indianapolis: Liberty Fund, 1982) [LJA = "Report of 1762–63" and LJB = "Report dated 1766"].
- LRBL *Lectures on Rhetoric and Belles-Lettres*, ed. J. C. Bryce (Indianapolis, IN: Liberty Fund, 1985).
- TMS *The Theory of Moral Sentiments*, ed. D. D. Raphael and A. L. Macfie (Indianapolis, IN: Liberty Fund, 1982).
- WN *An Inquiry into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Nations*, ed. R. H. Campbell, A. S. Skinner, and W. B. Todd (Indianapolis, IN: Liberty Fund, 1981).

KANT

- A *Anthropology from a Pragmatic Point of View*, trans. Loudon, in *Anthropology, History, and Education*, ed. Günter Zöller and Loudon (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007).
- AA *Kants gesammelte Schriften (Akademie Ausgabe)*, ed. Royal Prussian Academy of Sciences, 29 vols. (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1900–).
- CPrR *Critique of Practical Reason*, trans. Mary J. Gregor, in *Practical Philosophy*, ed. Mary J. Gregor (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999).
- G *Groundwork of The Metaphysics of Morals*, trans. Mary J. Gregor, in *Practical Philosophy*, ed. Mary J. Gregor (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999).
- LE *Lectures on Ethics*, trans. Peter Heath (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001).
- LoP *Lectures on Pedagogy*, trans. Robert B. Loudon, in *Anthropology, History, and Education*, ed. Günter Zöller and Loudon (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007).
- MM *The Metaphysics of Morals*, trans. Mary J. Gregor, in *Practical Philosophy*, ed. Mary J. Gregor (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999).
- O *Observations on the Feeling of the Beautiful and Sublime*, trans. Paul Guyer, in *Anthropology, History,*

- and Education*, ed. Günter Zöller and Robert B. Louden (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007).
- RWL *Religion within the Boundaries of Mere Reason*, trans. George di Giovanni, in *Religion and Rational Theology*, ed. Allen W. Wood (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001).
- R “Remarks in the *Observations on the Beautiful and Sublime*,” trans. Patrick Frierson and Paul Guyer et al. in *Observations on the Feeling of the Beautiful and Sublime and Other Writings*, ed. Patrick Frierson and Paul Guyer (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011).



Contents

| | |
|---|---------|
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> | page ix |
| <i>Texts and Abbreviations</i> | xi |
| 1 Introduction | I |
| Today's Challenge | I |
| Love's Tradition | 5 |
| Love's Enlightenment | 13 |
| Four Concepts and a Challenge | 17 |
| Notes | 24 |
| 2 Hume on Humanity | 31 |
| The "Politics of Humanity" | 31 |
| Love, Transcendence, and Humanity | 32 |
| Humanity: Normative Dimensions | 36 |
| Humanity: Epistemic Dimensions | 40 |
| From Sympathy to Humanity | 44 |
| Humanity and "Cool Preference" | 50 |
| Conclusion | 55 |
| Notes | 58 |
| 3 Rousseau on Pity | 66 |
| The "Politics of Compassion" | 66 |
| <i>Eros</i> , Patriotism, <i>Agape</i> | 68 |
| Natural Pity: What, How, and for Whom | 75 |
| Developing Pity: Epistemic Elements in the <i>Essay</i> | 79 |
| Developed Pity: From Epistemology to Ethics in <i>Emile</i> | 83 |
| Pity: Benefits and Challenges | 92 |
| Notes | 96 |

| | | |
|---|---|-----|
| 4 | Smith on Sympathy | 104 |
| | From Love to Sympathy | 104 |
| | Smith's Critique of <i>Eros</i> : Particularity and Universality | 106 |
| | From <i>Eros</i> to <i>Agape</i> : Smith on Christian Love | 111 |
| | From <i>Eros</i> and <i>Agape</i> to Sympathy | 120 |
| | Sympathy: Benefits and Challenges | 126 |
| | Notes | 129 |
| 5 | Kant on Love | 135 |
| | Rethinking Kant via Kant's Rethinking | 135 |
| | Sympathy and Self-Love in the Precritical Kant | 136 |
| | The Critical Solution: The <i>Groundwork</i> and the Second <i>Critique</i> | 146 |
| | Love and Respect in the <i>Metaphysics of Morals</i> | 155 |
| | Notes | 165 |
| | <i>Epilogue</i> | 171 |
| | <i>Index</i> | 175 |