Advances in Foundational Mass Communication Theories

Edited by Ran Wei



Routledge
Taylor & Francis Group
www.routledge.com

an informa business

ISBN 978-1-138-05822-4



# < es 5 0 na SSDI



# **Advances in Foundational Mass Communication Theories**

Edited by Ran Wei



First published 2018 by Routledge 2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon, OX14 4RN, UK

and by Routledge 711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017, USA

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2018 Mass Communication & Society Division of the Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

*Trademark notice*: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 13: 978-1-138-05822-4

Typeset in Times New Roman by RefineCatch Limited, Bungay, Suffolk

### Publisher's Note

The publisher accepts responsibility for any inconsistencies that may have arisen during the conversion of this book from journal articles to book chapters, namely the possible inclusion of journal terminology.

### Disclaimer

Every effort has been made to contact copyright holders for their permission to reprint material in this book. The publishers would be grateful to hear from any copyright holder who is not here acknowledged and will undertake to rectify any errors or omissions in future editions of this book.

# **Advances in Foundational Mass Communication Theories**

Providing leading-edge perspectives on the legacy theories of mass media and society, this collection advances the foundational theories of mass communications, which have sustained the field of study over the past fifty years. Many of these contributions were originally published as a Deutschmann Scholarly Essay in the *Mass Communication and Society* journal, and together they comprise a remarkable source of knowledge, equipped to lead mass communications theory through the emergence of new technologies, and the evolution of communications, in the 21st century.

Moreover, the contributions gathered in this volume contradict any critics who may claim the theories of the 20<sup>th</sup> century have outlived their usefulness, for these prove to guide contemporary research as forcefully as ever in the digital era. Validating the classic media theories across time and their various forms constitute the second focal section of this volume. Finally, senior media scholars offer their views on the future directions in which mass communication theories can be advanced.

The chapters in this book were originally published in various issues of *Mass Communication and Society*.

Ran Wei is the Gonzales Brothers Professor of Journalism at the University of South Carolina, USA, and current Editor-in-Chief of *Mass Communication and Society*. His research focuses on new media studies, and has won numerous awards, including the Best Article of the Year award in 2013 by *International Marketing Review*. His current research focuses on mobile communication, new media, and the processes and effects of media messages in various contexts (political, social, promotional, health and risk) that involve a wide range of media channels and devices (traditional and emerging). He is a pioneering scholar in mobile communication research, and his mobile phone studies are widely cited. He serves on the editorial board of *Mobile Media & Communication*, and has been a guest editor of *Media Asia*.

### Citation Information

The chapters in this book were originally published in various issues of *Mass Communication and Society*. When citing this material, please use the original page numbering for each article, as follows:

### Chapter 1

Walter Lippmann's Ghost: An Interview With Michael Schudson Michael Schudson Mass Communication and Society, volume 19, issue 3 (May 2016), pp. 221–229

### Chapter 2

Reassessing the People's Choice: Revisiting a Classic and Excavating Lessons for Research About Media and Voting
Stephen Lacy and Michael Stamm
Mass Communication and Society, volume 19, issue 2 (March 2016),
pp. 105–126

### Chapter 3

Reading Lasswell's Model of Communication Backward: Three Scholarly Misconceptions
Zachary S. Sapienza, Narayanan Iyer and Aaron S. Veenstra
Mass Communication and Society, volume 18, issue 5 (September 2015),
pp. 599–622

### Chapter 4

Beyond the Four Theories of the Press: A New Model of National Media Systems
Jennifer Ostini and Anthony Y.H. Fung
Mass Communication and Society, volume 5, issue 1 (January 2002),
pp. 41–56

### CITATION INFORMATION

### Chapter 5

The First-Person Effect and Its Behavioral Consequences: A New Trend in the Twenty-Five Year History of Third-Person Effect Research Guy J. Golan and Anita G. Day Mass Communication and Society, volume 11, issue 4 (October 2008), pp. 539–556

### Chapter 6

A Media Sociology for the Networked Public Sphere: The Hierarchy of Influences Model

Stephen D. Reese and Pamela J. Shoemaker *Mass Communication and Society*, volume 19, issue 4 (July 2016), pp. 389–410

### Chapter 7

Studying Journalists and Journalism Across Four Decades: A Sociology of Occupations Approach

David H. Weaver

Mass Communication and Society, volume 18, issue 1 (January 2015), pp. 4–16

### Chapter 8

New Directions in Agenda-Setting Theory and Research
Maxwell E. McCombs, Donald L. Shaw and David H. Weaver
Mass Communication and Society, volume 17, issue 6 (November 2014),
pp. 781–802

### Chapter 9

The End of Framing as we Know it . . . and the Future of Media Effects Michael A. Cacciatore, Dietram A. Scheufele and Shanto Iyengar Mass Communication and Society, volume 19, issue 1 (January 2016), pp. 7–23

### Chapter 10

Yesterday's New Cultivation, Tomorrow
Michael Morgan, James Shanahan and Nancy Signorielli
Mass Communication and Society, volume 18, issue 5 (September 2015),
pp. 674–699

### CITATION INFORMATION

### Chapter 11

A Three-Decade Retrospective on the Hostile Media Effect Richard M. Perloff Mass Communication and Society, volume 18, issue 6 (November 2015), pp. 701–729

### Chapter 12

Diffusion Theory in the New Media Environment: Toward an Integrated Technology Adoption Model
David J. Atkin, Daniel S. Hunt and Carolyn A. Lin
Mass Communication and Society, volume 18, issue 5 (September 2015), pp. 623–650

### Chapter 13

Defining Identification: A Theoretical Look at the Identification of Audiences With Media Characters

Jonathan Cohen

Mass Communication and Society, volume 4, issue 3 (August 2001),

pp. 245–264

### Chapter 14

Mass Communication Research at the Crossroads: Definitional Issues and Theoretical Directions for Mass and Political Communication Scholarship in an Age of Online Media
Richard M. Perloff
Mass Communication and Society, volume 18, issue 5 (September 2015), pp. 531–556

For any permission-related enquiries please visit: http://www.tandfonline.com/page/help/permissions

### **Notes on Contributors**

- **David J. Atkin** is a Professor in the Department of Communication at the University of Connecticut, USA.
- **Michael A. Cacciatore** is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Advertising and Public Relations at the University of Georgia, USA.
- **Jonathan Cohen** is based in the Department of Communication at the University of Haifa, Israel.
- **Anita G. Day** is the Director of the Louisiana Corporate Communications Group and Research and Policy Manager of the Louisiana Family Recovery Corps, USA.
- **Anthony Y.H. Fung** is Professor in the School of Journalism and Communication at the Chinese University of Hong Kong.
- **Guy J. Golan** is Associate Professor of Public Relations in the Newhouse School of Public Communications at Syracuse University, NY, USA.
- **Daniel S. Hunt** is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Communication at Worcester State University, Massachusetts, USA.
- **Shanto Iyengar** is the Harry and Norman Chandler Professor of Communication and Professor of Political Science at Stanford University, California, USA.
- **Narayanan Iyer** is an Assistant Professor in The Edward R Murrow College of Communication at Washington State University, USA.
- **Stephen Lacy** is a Professor in the School of Journalism at Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan, USA.
- Carolyn A. Lin is a Professor in the Department of Communication at the University of Connecticut, USA.
- **Maxwell E. McCombs** is the Jesse H. Jones Centennial Chair in Communication Emeritus at the University of Texas at Austin, USA.

### NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

- **Michael Morgan** is a Professor in the Department of Communication at the University of Massachusetts, USA.
- **Jennifer Ostini** is a Postdoctoral Research Fellow with the Digital Futures Collaborative Research Network based at the University of Southern Queensland, Australia.
- **Richard M. Perloff** is a Professor of Communication, Psychology and Political Science at Cleveland State University, Ohio, USA.
- **Stephen D. Reese** is Jesse H. Jones Professor in the School of Journalism at the University of Texas, Austin, TX, USA.
- **Zachary S. Sapienza** is a graduate student in the College of Mass Communication and Media Arts at Southern Illinois University–Carbondale, USA.
- **Dietram A. Scheufele** is the John E. Ross Professor in Science Communication and Vilas Distinguished Achievement Professor at the University of Wisconsin–Madison, USA, and Honorary Professor at the Technische Universität Dresden, Germany.
- **Michael Schudson** is Professor of Journalism and Adjunct Professor of Sociology at Columbia University, New York City, USA.
- **James Shanahan** is Dean of the Media School at Indiana University, Bloomington, Indiana, USA.
- **Donald L. Shaw** is Kenan Professor of Journalism Emeritus at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, USA
- **Pamela J. Shoemaker** held the John Ben Snow Research Chair in the Newhouse School for Public Communication at Syracuse University, NY, USA.
- **Nancy Signorielli** is a Professor in the Department of Communication at the University of Delaware, USA.
- **Michael Stamm** is an Associate Professor in the Department of History and School of Journalism at Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan, USA.
- **Aaron S. Veenstra** is an Associate Professor in the School of Journalism at Southern Illinois University–Carbondale, USA.
- **David H. Weaver** is Roy W. Howard and Distinguished Professor Emeritus of Journalism at Indiana University–Bloomington, USA.
- **Ran Wei** is the Gonzales Brothers Professor of Journalism at the University of South Carolina, USA, and current Editor-in-Chief of *Mass Communication and Society*.

## **Contents**

|    | Citation Information Notes on Contributors   | vii<br>xi |
|----|--|-----------|
|    | Introduction: Extending the Deep Legacy of Our Field's Top Scholars <i>Ran Wei</i>   | 1         |
|    | Part I: Theories of Mass Media and Society: From the 21st Century Perspective  |           |
| 1. | Walter Lippmann's Ghost: An Interview With Michael Schudson<br>Michael Schudson  | 7         |
| 2. | Reassessing the People's Choice: Revisiting a Classic and Excavating Lessons for Research About Media and Voting Stephen Lacy and Michael Stamm                    | 16        |
| 3. | Reading Lasswell's Model of Communication Backward:<br>Three Scholarly Misconceptions<br>Zachary S. Sapienza, Narayanan Iyer and Aaron S. Veenstra                 | 38        |
| 4. | Beyond the Four Theories of the Press: A New Model of<br>National Media Systems<br>Jennifer Ostini and Anthony Y.H. Fung   | 62        |
| 5. | The First-Person Effect and Its Behavioral Consequences: A New Trend in the Twenty-Five Year History of Third-Person Effect Research Guy J. Golan and Anita G. Day | 78        |
| 6. | A Media Sociology for the Networked Public Sphere: The Hierarchy of Influences Model  Stephen D. Reese and Pamela J. Shoemaker                                     | 96        |

### CONTENTS

| 7.  | Studying Journalists and Journalism Across Four Decades:<br>A Sociology of Occupations Approach<br>David H. Weaver  | 118 |
|-----|---|-----|
|     | Part II: Advancing Classic Media Effects Theories Across<br>Time and Media Forms  |     |
| 8.  | New Directions in Agenda-Setting Theory and Research Maxwell E. McCombs, Donald L. Shaw and David H. Weaver   | 131 |
| 9.  | The End of Framing as we Know itand the Future of Media Effects  Michael A. Cacciatore, Dietram A. Scheufele and Shanto Iyengar   | 153 |
| 10. | Yesterday's New Cultivation, Tomorrow<br>Michael Morgan, James Shanahan and Nancy Signorielli   | 170 |
| 11. | A Three-Decade Retrospective on the Hostile Media Effect Richard M. Perloff   | 196 |
| 12. | Diffusion Theory in the New Media Environment: Toward an Integrated Technology Adoption Model David J. Atkin, Daniel S. Hunt and Carolyn A. Lin   | 225 |
| 13. | Defining Identification: A Theoretical Look at the Identification of Audiences With Media Characters  Jonathan Cohen  | 253 |
|     | Part III: Whither Mass Communication Theories?<br>Reflections and Future Directions   |     |
| 14. | Mass Communication Research at the Crossroads: Definitional Issues and Theoretical Directions for Mass and Political Communication Scholarship in an Age of Online Media Richard M. Perloff | 273 |
|     | Index   | 299 |

# Introduction: Extending the Deep Legacy of Our Field's Top Scholars

### Ran Wei

This book is about theory, more specifically, about long-standing mass communication theories, which form the foundation of the discipline now for nearly a century. The established body of knowledge regarding the processes and effects of mass communication in society was built upon these foundational theories (Lowery & DeFleur, 1995), which footed the media effect research tradition in the field (Sherry, 2004). Despite the challenges from the digital media, they remain the touchstones of the field as well as our legacy. The range of theory-based knowledge about mass media and society is vast and expanding; to deepen it, the Deutschmann Scholar essays published in *Mass Communication and Society* made accessible the top scholars in the field to junior scholars and graduate students.

### A FAST GROWING FIELD IN PERSPECTIVE

By any account, the number of journalism and communications programs offered on college campuses in the United States has continued to grow. University communications programs now total more than 750, and the total of accredited schools of journalism and mass communications reached 118 in 2016. In the age of ubiquitous media and saturated communication in our society, it is easy to take such high numbers for granted. Considering the relatively short history of mass

### ADVANCES IN FOUNDATIONAL MASS COMMUNICATION THEORIES

communications as a field in institutions of higher education, we cannot take this growth and expansion for granted.

Mass communications research was filled with challenges in the formative years following World War II. After a brief stint at mass communication research, prominent scholars such as Carl Hovland of Yale University went back to their home disciplines (in his case, psychology) after the war. Focusing on communication-centered issues, mass communications researchers were guided by scientific research principles and began to move toward an independent, or what Pooley (2008) called an "institutionalized field" (p. 46), in the 1960s. It took a few trailblazers to do the pioneer work in building and growing the field in the years that followed.

Paul J. Deutschmann (1917–1963), dean and pioneering faculty member of the College of Communication Arts and Sciences at Michigan State University, was a visionary leader. As the AEJMC website states, he was a central force in the movement to use scientific methods to study journalism and mass communications. Deutschmann had been a newspaper editor in Oregon and Colorado, who received his Ph.D. in mass communications from Stanford University. Deutschmann's research was dedicated to the resolution of human problems, and was among the first to identify—and quantify—the social importance of mass media. *The Paul J. Deutschmann Award for Excellence in Research* was created in the 1960s by the AEJMC Elected Standing Committee on Research, to honor an academic who has built an outstanding record of achievement in journalism and mass communication research. When no qualified candidates are identified, the award is not given. As a result, in the nearly half century of the award's history, only 24 awards have been bestowed, on 26 scholars. Clearly, *The Paul J. Deutschmann Award for Excellence in Research* is known as the field's most prestigious award.

The first Deutschmann scholar was Chilton "Chick" Bush of Stanford University in 1969, who was recognized as a great innovator. He was credited with introducing the first-of-its-kind interdisciplinary doctoral program in the country (three of the first four students later became deans or directors of major journalism schools). The next recipients of the prestigious award were Ralph O. Nafziger in 1972 and Wilber Schramm in 1973, two of the most familiar names in mass communications research.

Where are the Deutschmann scholars now? In planning for this book, we verified that nearly half of them have passed away. Most are fully retired or semi-retired, and only four of the scholars remain active faculty members (see Table 1 in appendix).

# EXCELLENCE IN MASS COMMUNICATION RESEARCH: THE RICH LEGACY

The Deutschmann scholar essays, therefore, serve to celebrate the achievements of our top scholars; a group of high-achieving individuals whom we also call mentors,