Lori B. Rassas

EMPLOYMENT LAW

A Guide to Hiring, Managing, and Firing for Employers and Employees

THIRD EDITION





Employment Law: A Guide to Hiring, Managing, and Firing for Employers and Employees

Third Edition

LORI B. RASSAS



Copyright © 2017 CCH Incorporated.

Published by Wolters Kluwer in New York.

Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory US serves customers worldwide with CCH, Aspen Publishers, and Kluwer Law International products. (www.WKLegaledu.com)

No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or utilized by any information storage or retrieval system, without written permission from the publisher. For information about permissions or to request permissions online, visit us at www.WKLegaledu.com, or a written request may be faxed to our permissions department at 212-771-0803.

To contact Customer Service, e-mail customer.service@wolterskluwer.com, call 1-800-234-1660, fax 1-800-901-9075, or mail correspondence to:

Wolters Kluwer Attn: Order Department PO Box 990 Frederick, MD 21705

Printed in the United States of America. 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0

ISBN 978-1-4548-8264-0

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Rassas, Lori B., 1972- author.

Title: Employment law: a guide to hiring, managing, and firing for employers and employees / Lori B.

Rassas.

Description: Third edition. | New York : Wolters Kluwer, [2017]

Identifiers: LCCN 2016043752 | ISBN 9781454882640 Subjects: LCSH: Labor laws and legislation — United States. Classification: LCC KF3319.85.R37 2017 | DDC 344.7301 — dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2016043752

The presentation of legal information in clear and concise language can be a great benefit. However, this guide is intended to be an instructional book, which by its very nature means it is teaching a subject and is therefore not intended to be a substitute for situation-specific advice from a knowledgeable attorney. If you are seeking legal advice, you should consult an attorney who is licensed to practice in your state.



About Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory US

Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory US delivers expert content and solutions in the areas of law, corporate compliance, health compliance, reimbursement, and legal education. Its practical solutions help customers successfully navigate the demands of a changing environment to drive their daily activities, enhance decision quality and inspire confident outcomes.

Serving customers worldwide, its legal and regulatory portfolio includes products under the Aspen Publishers, CCH Incorporated, Kluwer Law International, ftwilliam.com and MediRegs names. They are regarded as exceptional and trusted resources for general legal and practice-specific knowledge, compliance and risk management, dynamic workflow solutions, and expert commentary.

To My Parents

Marge and Aaron

and

in Memory of My Grandparents

Debora and Isak

8

Molly and Ben
Who All Said I Could

And, a Special Shout-out to My Nieces and Nephew

Danica, Jamie, Logan, & Davis

Who Love to Pull This Book Off Their Bookshelves and Read It – Big Words and All

About the Author

Lori B. Rassas, Esq., has close to two decades of experience working on employment and labor issues, and more than a decade of teaching students of all levels. She received an LL.M. in Labor and Employment Law from New York University Law School, a J.D. from the George Washington University Law School, and a B.A. from Tufts University. She is also certified as a Senior Professional in Human Resources (SPHR).

Throughout her career, the author has provided extensive legal and human resources guidance and counsel on all phases of the employment process to both employers and employees. She has developed a pragmatic approach to the navigation of employment relationships that is derived from her experience working to resolve complex legal issues that have arisen on both sides of the bargaining table.

Not only does the author's vast practical experience inform this textbook, but her work as an adjunct faculty member also provides additional perspectives. Whether she is teaching healthcare executives at Columbia University's Mailman School of Public Health; aspiring arbitrators, mediators, and human resources professionals at Cornell University's Scheinman Institute on Conflict Resolution; law students at Fordham University School of Law; college students at Berkeley College; or students and professionals pursuing a number of other certifications and degrees at other academic institutions, she is always gaining new perspectives on how both employees and employers view and work through employment law issues.

In addition to this textbook, the author has written two other career books, including the #1 Amazon best-seller *The Perpetual Paycheck: 5 Secrets to Getting a Job, Keeping a Job, and Earning Income for Life in the Loyalty-Free Workplace*, and *Over the Hill But Not the Cliff: 5 Strategies for 40+ Job Seekers to Push Past Ageism and Find a Job in the Loyalty-Free Workplace*.

The author welcomes both faculty and student feedback, as she is continually thinking about how to ensure that this textbook continues to be a relevant and user-friendly teaching tool.

At the end of a job interview, a potential employer asks an applicant, "And what starting salary are you looking for?"

The applicant responds, "In the neighborhood of \$150,000 a year, depending on the benefits package."

The interviewer sits back in her chair a moment, considers the statement, and responds, "What would you say to a package of six weeks' vacation, 14 paid holidays, fully paid medical benefits, a defined benefit retirement plan equal to 50% of your salary, a corner office, and a company car?"

The applicant stands up from his chair and responds, "Wow! Are you kidding?" And, to that, the potential employer replies, "Yes, but you started it."

People need to work to live, and yet it is never as simple as performing services in exchange for compensation. The employer-employee relationship is actually incredibly complex, and despite this, employers and employees often enter into working relationships absent a clear understanding of their mutual expectations. Quite often the parties also enter into working relationships without a basic understanding about the laws that govern the creating, maintaining, and ending of those employment relationships. This lack of awareness has the potential to place both parties at a significant disadvantage when discussing employment issues because they will not have an appreciation of their rights and obligations under the law.

Employment Law: A Guide to Hiring, Managing, and Firing for Employers and Employees is designed to address this situation by providing an overview of employment law and identifying the most significant rights and obligations that employers and employees have during the key phases of the employment relationship. The textbook begins with a discussion about the prohibition against workplace discrimination, and then tracks the employment process—from job creation, to recruitment, to compensation and benefits, to leave entitlements, and to performance management, all the way to the conclusion of the employment relationship.

I. TEXTBOOK STRUCTURE

This book is divided into four parts, covering workplace discrimination and the hiring, managing, and firing of employees. The information is further divided into 20 chapters, which explain basic legal principles in clear and concise language.

A. Part I, Workplace Discrimination

Part I, Workplace Discrimination, focuses on Title VII, which makes it illegal for employers to discriminate against individuals on the basis of their race, color, religion, sex, national origin, and genetics; the Age Discrimination in Employment Act (ADEA), which makes it illegal for employers to discriminate against individuals who are 40 years of age or older on the basis of their age; and the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), which makes it illegal for employers to discriminate against qualified individuals with disabilities and requires employers to provide a disabled job applicant or employee with a reasonable accommodation unless doing so would cause an undue burden. The purpose of this part of the textbook is not to educate litigators or to provide detailed guidance about the mechanics of presenting a case in a judicial forum. Instead, the goal is to alert employers to the types of workplace behavior that may subject them to liability for discriminatory conduct, and to alert applicants and employees to the types of workplace behavior that may infringe upon their rights.

The chapters covering workplace discrimination should be thought of as the umbrella that you remember to bring with you to school or work on the days when it never rains. Armed with this basic knowledge about the litigation process, the hope is that you will never be placed in a situation where you have to use it — either by having a need to file a claim alleging discriminatory conduct, or having a need to present a defense to an allegation that an employment decision was based upon improper motivations. If, however, you become a party to a legal claim, you will be a well-informed participant in the process.

B. Part II, Hiring

Part II, Hiring, lays out the components of a nondiscriminatory recruitment and hiring process and provides employers with guidance about soliciting candidates for an open position from a diverse applicant pool, and collecting information (through the use of employment applications and interviews) in a manner to minimize potential claims for workplace discrimination. Both employers and applicants will learn how to distinguish appropriate employer conduct from conduct that suggests an employer used improper motivations as the basis for an adverse employment decision, which could be the basis for the filing of a discrimination claim.

C. Part III, Managing

Part III, Managing, covers issues relating to terms and conditions of employment, focusing on compensation and benefits, leave entitlements, performance management, harassment, and privacy rights. This part includes an extensive discussion about the appropriate use of performance management tools, including probationary periods, progressive discipline policies, and performance evaluations, geared toward minimizing the potential for their use to constitute discriminatory

Preface XIvii

employer conduct. The balance that must be achieved between the rights of employers to manage their businesses and the rights of employees to be free from employer intrusions, both while at work and also when engaging in conduct outside their regularly scheduled work hours (often within the context of privacy rights), is also discussed in detail.

D. Part IV, Firing

Part IV, Firing, the final part in this textbook, focuses on the ending of employment relationships. It examines the concept of employment at will, which is the legal doctrine that governs most working relationships and provides the parties with the right to terminate their employment relationship for any reason at any time, but that is subject to a number of limitations. There is also a significant discussion about layoffs and the just-cause standard for terminations, as well as how employers can minimize the potential for liability once a relationship ends. The significance of separation packages (including the use of knowing and voluntary waivers of employees' rights) and restrictive covenants is also explored.

II. TEXTBOOK RESOURCES

As you move through this book, you will find that each of the 20 chapters includes illustrative examples, key terms and definitions, and a number of discussion questions to test students' knowledge of the most significant concepts presented. A comprehensive index and glossary of the key terms can also be found at the end of this book. In addition, the companion website for this textbook at www.aspenparalegaled.com/rassas_employment includes additional resources for students and instructors. Instructor resources that accompany this text include a comprehensive Instructor's Manual, Test Bank, and Microsoft PowerPoint slides.

Employment law is a challenging area of law, but it is also an exciting field that has widespread relevance to all individuals who receive compensation in exchange for the providing of a service. There are certainly times when employers and employees have similar interests and truly benefit from each other's success. However, it would be naïve to ignore the reality that there are times when their interests diverge. Both parties have a vested interest in possessing a basic understanding of their entitlements and obligations in order to anticipate the types of employment issues that might materialize, expend efforts to resolve them at the earliest stage possible, and be prepared to defend their interests in the absence of a mutually agreeable resolution. This book is designed to be a teaching tool for both parties to an employment relationship who want to obtain a solid foundation of knowledge to further each of these goals.

Acknowledgments

I am incredibly humbled to be publishing the third edition of this textbook, and just as with the two prior editions, there were a number of people who provided me with invaluable guidance and support throughout this process. First, I want to thank my family: my parents, Marge and Aaron Rassas; Stacey, Jeff, Logan, and Davis Klinge; Jessica, Eric, Danica, and Jamie Rosenbloom; and Melissa and Jariel Bortnick. Each of you has always been incredibly supportive of everything I set out to do and encouraged me to continue to pursue my goals even when others suggested I pursue a different path.

Danica, Jamie, Logan and Davis, thank you for your help with this new edition. When I first wrote this textbook, you were so excited to carry it around. Now, just a few short years later, you are not only carrying my books, but actually *reading* them and *editing* them to be sure that no pesky little typos fall through the cracks.

I am also very fortunate to count on so many mentors and friends for guidance and support. A very special thank you to Scott and Beth Atkins; Jen Biderman ("B"); Jayne Bower; Irene Dorzback; Rosemary Griffin; Greg Hessinger; Marci, Jason, Harper, and Sloane Kroft; Sharon and Fred Kroft; Ryan Kroft and Adam Zeller; Beth Wang Llewellyn; Linda Lupiani; Becky Nelson; Parisa Salehi; and Ana Venegas. Ken Husserl, I am grateful to you for providing me with my first opportunity to teach a class of my own and for your continued friendship. Marisol Abuin, thank you for your well-grounded advice. Thank you also to the entire team of people at Aspen Publishers, who put so much time and energy into this new edition, and to Paul Sobel and his team at The Froebe Group for all of the work they did to ensure that this final manuscript was in the best possible shape. Megan Washburn and Ed Robertson, thank you for your editing contributions as well.

I also wanted to remember cartoonist Randy Glasbergen, who lost his life suddenly and unexpectedly. Randy, it was an honor working with you to select the perfect cartoons for each of the books I authored. Many students look forward to first breezing through my writing to locate the cartoons sprinkled throughout the text, and I am sure that future readers will be no different.

And finally, I want to thank all of my students, many of whom have become my friends, and many of whom have provided me with valuable constructive feedback that has been incorporated into my book. I really do value the time and energy you have expended to critique my work. This new edition is definitely a better book because of it.

Employment Law

Summary of Contents

Contents About the Author Preface Acknowledgments		xi xliii xlv xlix
Chapter 1	Introduction to Employment Law and the Employment Relationship	1
PART I WORKPLACE D	ISCRIMINATION	15
Chapter 2	Title VII — The Foundation of Workplace Discrimination Law	17
Chapter 3	Race, Color, and National Origin Discrimination	53
Chapter 4	Religious Discrimination	71
Chapter 5	Sex, Pregnancy, and Genetic Discrimination	91
Chapter 6	Age Discrimination	107
Chapter 7	Disability Discrimination	123
PART II HIRING		147
Chapter 8	Employees Versus Independent Contractors	149
Chapter 9	Recruiting and Assembling a Diverse Applicant Pool	173
Chapter 10	Collection of Information: The Application and Interview	193
Chapter 11	Pre-Employment Testing	231
PART III MANAGING		269
Chapter 12	Compensation and Benefits	271
Chapter 13	Paid and Unpaid Leave	319

Chapter 14	Performance Management	353
Chapter 15	Workplace Harassment	379
Chapter 16	Workplace Privacy and Personal Expression	395
Chapter 17	Regulation of Off-Duty Conduct	433
PART IV FIRING		459
Chapter 18	Employment at Will	461
Chapter 19	Ending the Employment Relationship	483
Chapter 20	Severance and Post-Employment Obligations	521
Glossary Index		555 569

Contents

ABOUT THE AUTHOR	xlii
PREFACE	XiV
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	xlix

1

INTRODUCTION TO EMPLOYMENT LAW AND THE EMPLOYMENT RELATIONSHIP

I.	RELEVANCE OF EMPLOYMENT LAW AND RELATED ISSUES	2
П.	EMPLOYMENT LAW VERSUS LABOR LAW	2
	A. Substantive Differences B. Changing Landscape	3
	C. Significant Union Issues Are Identified	4
III.	TEXTBOOK IS NOT A SUBSTITUTE	
	FOR LEGAL ADVICE	4
	A. Number of Sources of Law	4
	1. Statutory Law	5
	a. Variations in Types of Issues Regulated	5
	b. Variations on Available Causes of Action and Defenses	5
	2. Common Law	6
	3. Administrative Regulations	6
	4. Federal and State Constitutions	7
	B. Laws Apply to Different Employers	7
	C. Laws Are Complex	8
	1. Determinations Are Fact Specific	8
	2. Determinations Are Subjective	8
	D. Laws Change	9
	E. Laws Play Various Roles	9
IV.	EMPLOYMENT RELATIONSHIP	10
	A. Consistent and Inconsistent Goals	10
	B. Unstable Relationship	10
	C. Symbolism of a Job	10

	V.	THIRD EDITION ENHANCEMENTS	11
	VI.	TEXTBOOK STRUCTURE	12
		Terms cussion Questions	12 13
PARTI	W	ORKPLACE DISCRIMINATION	15
2		TLE VII—THE FOUNDATION OF WORKPLACE SCRIMINATION LAW	
	l.	INTRODUCTION	18
	II.	APPLICABILITY OF TITLE VII OF THE CIVIL RIGHTS ACT OF 1964	22
		 A. Covered Entities B. Covered Individuals C. Discrimination Defined Adverse Action Membership in a Protected Class Nature of Protected Class Membership in a Protected Class Is Nonexclusive Limitations on Protections Expansion of Protections 	22 22 23 23 24 24 24 24 25
	Ш.	TYPES OF EVIDENCE	25
		A. Direct Evidence B. Circumstantial Evidence	25 26
	IV.	FILING A CLAIM UNDER TITLE VII	27
		 A. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC) B. Statute of Limitations 1. One Hundred and Eighty (180) Days 2. Triggering Event for Compensation Claims Under the Ledbetter Fair Pay Act of 2009 	27 27 28 28
		C. EEOC Response to the Filing of a Claim	29

V.	FILING A DISCRIMINATION CLAIM IN FEDERAL COURT	29
VI.	DISPARATE TREATMENT CLAIMS	29
	A. Prima Facie Case1. Membership in a Protected Class2. Qualified for the Position3. Adverse Action	30 30 30 31
	4. Candidates with Comparable Qualifications Continue to Be Considered	31
	B. Employer's Burden: Articulate a Legitimate,Nondiscriminatory Reason for Its Adverse Decision1. Appropriate Justifications for Making Adverse Decisions	32 32
	2. Extent of Burdena. Appropriateness of Objective and Subjective Considerationsb. Deference to Employer	32 32 33
	 C. Employee to Show Employer's Justification for Decision Is a Pretext 1. Pretext-Plus a. Prima Facie Case May Be Sufficient to Satisfy Pretext-Plus 	33 33
	Burden b. Plaintiff Continues to Have Ultimate Burden of Proof	34 34
	2. Mixed-Motive Claims	34
VII.	DISPARATE IMPACT CLAIMS	35
VII.	A. Significance of Unintentional Discrimination	35
VII.	A. Significance of Unintentional Discrimination B. Employer's Intent Is Irrelevant	35 35
VII.	A. Significance of Unintentional DiscriminationB. Employer's Intent Is IrrelevantC. Basis for Disparate Impact Claims	35 35 36
VII.	A. Significance of Unintentional DiscriminationB. Employer's Intent Is IrrelevantC. Basis for Disparate Impact ClaimsD. Presentation of Proof for a Disparate Impact Claim	35 35 36 36
VII.	 A. Significance of Unintentional Discrimination B. Employer's Intent Is Irrelevant C. Basis for Disparate Impact Claims D. Presentation of Proof for a Disparate Impact Claim 1. Prima Facie Case 	35 35 36 36 37
VII.	A. Significance of Unintentional DiscriminationB. Employer's Intent Is IrrelevantC. Basis for Disparate Impact ClaimsD. Presentation of Proof for a Disparate Impact Claim	35 35 36 36
	 A. Significance of Unintentional Discrimination B. Employer's Intent Is Irrelevant C. Basis for Disparate Impact Claims D. Presentation of Proof for a Disparate Impact Claim 1. Prima Facie Case 2. Showing of Business Necessity 	35 35 36 36 37 37
	 A. Significance of Unintentional Discrimination B. Employer's Intent Is Irrelevant C. Basis for Disparate Impact Claims D. Presentation of Proof for a Disparate Impact Claim 1. Prima Facie Case 2. Showing of Business Necessity 3. Less Discriminatory Alternatives 	35 35 36 36 37 37 38
	A. Significance of Unintentional Discrimination B. Employer's Intent Is Irrelevant C. Basis for Disparate Impact Claims D. Presentation of Proof for a Disparate Impact Claim 1. Prima Facie Case 2. Showing of Business Necessity 3. Less Discriminatory Alternatives ALLOWANCE FOR CONDUCT THAT WOULD OTHERWISE BE DISCRIMINATORY A. Work Production B. Bona Fide Seniority Systems and Professionally Developed Tests C. Bona Fide Occupational Qualification (BFOQ)	35 35 36 36 37 37 38
	 A. Significance of Unintentional Discrimination B. Employer's Intent Is Irrelevant C. Basis for Disparate Impact Claims D. Presentation of Proof for a Disparate Impact Claim 1. Prima Facie Case 2. Showing of Business Necessity 3. Less Discriminatory Alternatives ALLOWANCE FOR CONDUCT THAT WOULD OTHERWISE BE DISCRIMINATORY A. Work Production B. Bona Fide Seniority Systems and Professionally Developed Tests C. Bona Fide Occupational Qualification (BFOQ) as a Defense to Discriminatory Conduct Based on Religion, Sex,	35 36 36 37 37 38 38 38
	A. Significance of Unintentional Discrimination B. Employer's Intent Is Irrelevant C. Basis for Disparate Impact Claims D. Presentation of Proof for a Disparate Impact Claim 1. Prima Facie Case 2. Showing of Business Necessity 3. Less Discriminatory Alternatives ALLOWANCE FOR CONDUCT THAT WOULD OTHERWISE BE DISCRIMINATORY A. Work Production B. Bona Fide Seniority Systems and Professionally Developed Tests C. Bona Fide Occupational Qualification (BFOQ)	35 35 36 36 37 37 38 38
	 A. Significance of Unintentional Discrimination B. Employer's Intent Is Irrelevant C. Basis for Disparate Impact Claims D. Presentation of Proof for a Disparate Impact Claim 1. Prima Facie Case 2. Showing of Business Necessity 3. Less Discriminatory Alternatives ALLOWANCE FOR CONDUCT THAT WOULD OTHERWISE BE DISCRIMINATORY A. Work Production B. Bona Fide Seniority Systems and Professionally Developed Tests C. Bona Fide Occupational Qualification (BFOQ) as a Defense to Discriminatory Conduct Based on Religion, Sex, and National Origin 1. Safety 2. Privacy 	35 36 36 37 37 38 38 39
	 A. Significance of Unintentional Discrimination B. Employer's Intent Is Irrelevant C. Basis for Disparate Impact Claims D. Presentation of Proof for a Disparate Impact Claim 1. Prima Facie Case 2. Showing of Business Necessity 3. Less Discriminatory Alternatives ALLOWANCE FOR CONDUCT THAT WOULD OTHERWISE BE DISCRIMINATORY A. Work Production B. Bona Fide Seniority Systems and Professionally Developed Tests C. Bona Fide Occupational Qualification (BFOQ) as a Defense to Discriminatory Conduct Based on Religion, Sex, and National Origin 1. Safety 2. Privacy 3. Religion 	35 36 36 37 37 38 38 39 39 40 40
	 A. Significance of Unintentional Discrimination B. Employer's Intent Is Irrelevant C. Basis for Disparate Impact Claims D. Presentation of Proof for a Disparate Impact Claim 1. Prima Facie Case 2. Showing of Business Necessity 3. Less Discriminatory Alternatives ALLOWANCE FOR CONDUCT THAT WOULD OTHERWISE BE DISCRIMINATORY A. Work Production B. Bona Fide Seniority Systems and Professionally Developed Tests C. Bona Fide Occupational Qualification (BFOQ) as a Defense to Discriminatory Conduct Based on Religion, Sex, and National Origin 1. Safety 2. Privacy 	35 36 36 37 37 38 38 39 39 40

IX.	RETALIATION	41
	A. Scope of ProtectionB. Imposition of an Adverse Action in Response	41
	to Assertion of a Legal Right	42
	C. Types of Retaliation Claims	42 42
	 Protected Activity Opposition Claims 	42
	3. Participation Claims	43
	D. Employer Liability for Unsubstantiated Discrimination Claims	43
X.	REMEDIES UNDER TITLE VII	44
	A. Types of Damages	44
	B. Expanded Damages for Intentional Discrimination	44
	1. Compensatory Damages	44
	2. Punitive Damages	45
	3. Statutory Caps on Damages	45
	C. Mitigation of Damages	45
	D. Considerations That May Affect the Amount of Damages Awarded	
	1. Legitimate, Nondiscriminatory Reason for the Adverse Decision	46
	a. Mixed Motive	46
	b. After-Acquired Evidence Rule2. Employer Exerted Reasonable Efforts to Comply with the Law	46 46
	Terms cussion Questions	47
DI	ACE, COLOR, AND NATIONAL ORIGIN SCRIMINATION	
1.	RACE AND COLOR DISCRIMINATION	54
	A. Extent of Discriminatory Conduct	54
	B. Broad Application	55
	C. Disparate Treatment Discrimination	57
	D. Disparate Impact Discrimination	57
11.	NATIONAL ORIGIN	57
	A. Broad Application	58
	1. Birthplace	58
	2. National Origin or Ethnic Group	58
	3. Citizenship	58