
Negotiating a Labor Contract

A Management Handbook

Second Edition

Charles S. Loughran

Negotiating a Labor Contract

A Management Handbook

Second Edition

Charles S. Loughran



The Bureau of National Affairs, Inc., Washington, D.C.

Copyright © 1992
The Bureau of National Affairs, Inc.
Washington, D.C.

Second Printing, June 1993

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Loughran, Charles S.

Negotiating a labor contract : a management handbook / Charles S.

Loughran. — 2nd ed.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references (p.) and index.

ISBN 0-87179-745-3 : \$58.00

1. Collective bargaining—Handbooks, manuals, etc. 2. Collective
labor agreements—Handbooks, manuals, etc. I. Title.

HD6483.L69 1992

658.3 ' 154—dc20

92-280

CIP

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use, or the internal or personal use of specific clients, is granted by BNA Books for libraries and other users registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transactional Reporting Service, provided that \$1.00 per page is paid directly to CCC, 27 Congress St., Salem, MA 01970. 0-87179-745-3/92/\$0+\$1.00.

Published by BNA Books
1231 25th St., N.W., Washington, D.C. 20037

Printed in the United States of America
International Standard Book Number: 0-87179-745-3

Preface

This book is intended for a variety of persons who have some responsibility for, or interest in, the employer's side of labor contract negotiations. First, it is designed to guide management's spokesperson or chief negotiator, whose duty it is to represent management at the bargaining table. Second, it is intended to assist the labor relations professional, line management executive, sole entrepreneur, or public agency administrator who may not be a direct participant but is responsible nevertheless for seeing to it that there is a successful outcome from labor contract negotiations. Third, the book is meant to assist students and observers of the collective bargaining process to better understand the procedures, strategy, and tactics which management utilizes to successfully negotiate a labor agreement. While this volume was not originally intended for union negotiators, I have been told by a number of union spokespersons since the initial publication in 1984 that they have read it and have found it of value. In fact, certain passages from this book have been quoted to me by my union counterparts in negotiations. Readers are indeed welcome from either side of the bargaining table.

One of the great difficulties in writing a book such as this is that there is no such thing as a "typical" or "normal" labor contract negotiation. A negotiation for a bargaining unit of ten employees may be settled in a single three-hour meeting between one management negotiator and one union business agent, consummated with a shake of hands, and concluded with nothing more than a promise to send a confirming memorandum of agreement. This is in contrast to a negotiation covering thousands of employees in a single-employer-multi-plant or multi-employer bargaining unit which may require months of meetings, bargaining committees composed of dozens of persons,

regular press releases, and final contract documents numbering in the hundreds of pages.

Likewise, negotiations in manufacturing industries are somewhat different from those in transportation and service industries, and there is a considerable difference between public employer and private employer collective bargaining. Despite these variations, however, there is sufficient similarity among these various negotiating situations for one volume to be useful to practitioners or students regardless of the size and nature of the bargaining unit or the nature of the employer's enterprise.

Persons who have had experience in other types of negotiations involving such matters as sales contracts, real estate transactions, or litigation settlements may feel that such a background qualifies them to negotiate a labor contract. While such experience is certainly helpful, it would be a serious mistake to conclude that methods and techniques which are successful in other types of bargaining will have direct applicability to contract negotiations with labor unions. Significant differences exist between labor contract negotiations and other types of bargaining.

Unlike a typical sales contract negotiation which is often a one-time event, the relationship between a union and management normally continues over many years. Memories of union negotiators are long. More importantly, the ability of a sales contract negotiator to cease negotiations with a buyer or seller and do business with another buyer or seller is virtually nonexistent in the labor relations arena. Except for very limited situations (e.g., when a union is decertified), the law requires that an employer continue to deal with the union which represents its employees regardless of the degree of difficulty it experiences in reaching an agreement with that union. Other differences exist as well. Labor laws regulate many aspects of bargaining. Parties to a real estate negotiation, for example, are not told by an agency of the state or federal government how they may or may not conduct their negotiations (although it may control what they can agree upon).

Labor negotiations also require a thorough knowledge of work practices within the employer's workplace and within the industry in which the employer competes. The negotiator must also have an understanding of the meaning and effect of typical

labor contract clauses as they affect the day-to-day activities in the employer's workplace. The application of the clauses will have evolved through custom and tradition in that industry, past practices in the employer's workplace, as well as decisions of labor arbitrators, the NLRB, and the courts.

Another major difference between labor contract negotiations and other types of bargaining is the relative permanence of language in a labor contract. Unlike commercial contracts or other types of contracts where unduly burdensome provisions can frequently be renegotiated, labor contract clauses covering hours of work, seniority, union security, work jurisdiction, etc., normally remain unchanged from one contract to another. Major changes in these provisions sought by either party usually are attainable only at the risk of a work stoppage.

Because of the variety of contexts within which labor contract negotiations take place, I have made certain assumptions to limit the scope of matters covered to manageable proportions. The first of these assumptions is that employers and the union or unions with which they deal are subject to the National Labor Relations Act (NLRA), sometimes referred to as the "Taft-Hartley Act," as amended. This, of course, is not always the case. Although the NLRA covers the vast majority of employers in manufacturing and service industries, it does not cover airline and railroad employers (who are covered by the Railway Labor Act) or most employers in agriculture or the public sector. However, where federal or state statutes regulate collective bargaining in industries not covered by the NLRA, such statutes have generally been patterned after the NLRA, and therefore have many features in common with the basic labor law in the United States.

A further assumption throughout most of the book is that the negotiations in which management is involved deal with renegotiation of an existing labor contract, rather than with bargaining over terms of a first contract between union and management. Particular attention, however, is given in Chapter 13, "Special Bargaining Situations," to the peculiarities of negotiating a first contract.

Also, it is assumed that the common objective of the negotiating parties is to reach an agreement. This may not be the case, for example, when a resisting employer who has lost a representation election is simply negotiating with a newly cer-

tified union with the objective of reaching an impasse in order to fulfill a legal bargaining obligation. If the reader is representing such an employer, this is the wrong book to consult for assistance. The guidance provided in this volume is intended to assist management in reaching an agreement, not in avoiding it.

Much has been written and said about adversarial versus cooperative labor negotiations or, as the academicians would say, "distributive" and "zero-sum" bargaining versus "win-win" negotiations. Stated another way, "do we negotiate over how we will split the pie or how we together will make the pie larger?" This book focuses primarily on process rather than philosophy, and aside from portions of Chapter 18 under subsections on concessionary bargaining and joint union-management programs, little attention is given to a distinct management philosophy on labor contract negotiations. To foreclose the reader's speculation, however, the author believes there is ample room for a range of philosophies and styles of negotiating in most union-management relationships. Not only can the parties work together in a cooperative spirit to make the pie larger, they almost necessarily will have to agree on how the pie (smaller, larger or the same) is to be divided. Negotiating over how to split the pie may be termed "adversarial," but it certainly need not be "hostile." Both parties can be winners even though they may take contrary positions. A more in-depth discussion of union-management and labor negotiating philosophies must be reserved for other treatises, since the negotiation process itself requires all of the pages, and probably more, that are contained within the covers of this book.

It has always struck me that effective labor negotiators are essentially pragmatists with a "hands-on" orientation, and are not particularly given to reflecting upon the process in which they are engaged. A review of available literature about the techniques of labor contract negotiations confirms this impression. My search for books on the subject turned up few titles published within the last 30 years. It was this discovery plus my own fascination and love of the negotiating process which prompted me to write this book.

The process of free collective bargaining as practiced throughout the United States has proven to be a most effective and durable means for employers and unions to set the terms and conditions of employment. Although strikes do occur, the

amount of work time lost in the United States due to strikes is extremely small. Differences between unions and management which appear to be completely irreconcilable have a way of being resolved, in the vast majority of cases, in the give-and-take of collective bargaining. It is an amazing and wonderful process to witness and in which to participate.

I hope this volume not only helps the reader make the process work to the reader's advantage but also conveys that sense of amazement and wonder which I have always felt for this subject.

C. S. L.

Seattle, Washington
June, 1992

Acknowledgments

Those who contributed to making this book possible are many.

The laborious task of typing the manuscript with its multiple drafts was performed diligently and cheerfully by my secretaries, Ms. Linda Farris (First Edition) and Ms. Marilyn McGovern (Second Edition changes).

I am deeply indebted to Mr. Lew Scott, a labor attorney in Portland, Oregon with the firm of Lane, Powell, Spears and Lubersky. Lew reviewed and made useful suggestions for Chapters 4 and 11. Messrs. Tom Persely and Paul Gilbert, consulting actuaries with the Seattle Office of William Mercer reviewed and critiqued Chapters 8 and 9 respectively. Their thoughtful ideas were extremely valuable. Notwithstanding the input of Messrs. Scott, Persely, and Gilbert, the author takes full responsibility for any errors and omissions in those chapters.

Lastly, my wife Jo deserves a long and deep bow for her patience, cooperation, and moral support. The lost weekends, diverted vacations, and other inconveniences are part of the price she paid to make this book a reality.

Summary Table of Contents

Preface	xxiii
Acknowledgments	xxix

Part I Before Bargaining Begins

Chapter 1 General Assessment of Negotiations	3
Chapter 2 Preparing for Bargaining	50
Chapter 3 Developing a Bargaining Game Plan	93
Chapter 4 The Law Controlling Labor Negotiations	119

Part II The Bargaining Process

Chapter 5 Preliminary Stages of Negotiations	143
Chapter 6 Practical Tips for the Management Spokesperson	177
Chapter 7 Strategies for Bargaining Over Economics	202
Chapter 8 Negotiating Health and Welfare Benefits	243
Chapter 9 Negotiating Pensions	269
Chapter 10 Costing Contract Demands, Offers, and Settlements	291
Chapter 11 Drafting Labor Contract Language	322

Part III Reaching a Final Agreement

Chapter 12 Striving to Reach Agreement	345
Chapter 13 Strike Preparation, Decision Making, and Management	379

vi / *Negotiating a Labor Contract*

Chapter 14 Bringing the Negotiations to a Conclusion	423
Chapter 15 Special Bargaining Situations	458
Appendixes	
1. Summary of Labor Contract Provisions	493
2. Labor Cost Recap	498
3. Review of the Development of a Clause	500
4. Negotiations Preparation Checklist	501
5. Strike Contingency Checklist	513
6. Sample Memorandum of Agreement	523
7. Labor Contract Checklist	526
Notes	539
Index	549

Detailed Table of Contents

Preface	xxiii
Acknowledgments	xxix

Part I Before Bargaining Begins

Chapter 1 General Assessment of Negotiations	3
When to Begin	4
Responsibility for General Assessment	4
Analyzing Previous Negotiations	6
Established Objectives Compared to	
Negotiation Results	7
Pattern of Negotiations	7
Key Personalities in Previous Negotiations	9
Key Issues	10
Hits, Runs, and Errors	12
Units for Bargaining	13
The Single-Employer-Single-Facility Unit	14
Evaluating the Single-Facility Unit	15
The Proper Economic Fit	15
Work Practice Issues	17
The Single-Employer-Multifacility Unit	18
Evaluating Multifacility Units	18
Multiemployer Bargaining	19
Evaluating Multiemployer Bargaining	20
Multiple-Union Situations	24
Contract Dates	24
The Bell Cow	25
Joint Negotiations	26
Overall Strategy	27
Economic Climate for Bargaining	28
Recent Comparable Settlements	29
Bargaining Leverage	31
Employer Bargaining Power	33
Employer's Financial Condition	33
Anticipated Demand for Product(s) or Service(s)	33

Ability to Supply or Service Customers	34
Mutual Aid or Mutual Assistance Pacts	38
Union Bargaining Power	40
Recent Levels of Employment Hours and Earnings ...	40
Strike Fund	41
Availability of Government Subsidies	42
Alternative Employment Opportunities	42
The Bargaining Leverage Equation	43
Institutional and Attitudinal Climate for Bargaining	43
Union Organization—Policies, Politics, and Personalities	43
Employee Perspective	44
Management Perspective	46
Labor and Employee Relations	46
Importance of Perceptions	47
Comparison With Other Employers	47
Ability to Change?	47
Public and Governmental Perspective	48
Summary	49
Chapter 2 Preparing for Bargaining	50
Assembling Management's Bargaining Committee	50
Selecting the Management Spokesperson	51
Insider Versus Outsider	51
Lawyer Versus Nonlawyer	53
The Executive as Negotiator	54
Selecting Other Members of the Negotiating Committee	56
Operating Expertise	56
Cost Specialist	57
Note Taker	57
Language Draftsperson	58
Other Committee Members or Observers	59
Establishing the Negotiator's Authority and Management's Expectations	60
Gathering Bargaining Data and Information	61
How Much Is Necessary?	61
Bargaining Book	63
Economic Information	63
Internal Historical Information	63
Current Internal Information	66
External Economic Data	70
Internal Noneconomic Information	75
Work Hours	75
Seniority	78
Grievances and Arbitration Cases	78
Supervisors' Survey	79

Development of Contract Clauses	79
Supplemental Agreements	82
External Noneconomic Information	82
Reference to Law	82
Key Contacts	85
Briefing Personnel and Coordinating With Other Management Functions	85
Public and Investor Relations	86
Management Briefing	86
Selecting a Site for Negotiations	87
Formal Notification Preliminary to Bargaining	88
Failure to Reopen	89
Who Has to Reopen	89
Notice to FMCS	90
Checklist for Preparations	92
Chapter 3 Developing a Bargaining Game Plan	93
Establishing Objectives and Setting Economic Parameters	94
Economic Parameters	94
Noneconomic Objectives	95
Models of Bargaining Parameters and Objectives	96
The Role of the Negotiator in Setting Parameters	96
The Simple Model	97
More Direction	98
A Road Map	98
The Target Approach	100
Timing	102
Beginning Negotiations	102
Ending Negotiations	104
Timing of Offers	104
Bargaining Calendar	105
Identifying Key Issues	105
Spotting Hot Issues	107
In-Depth Analysis	107
Dealing With Key Issues	108
Management's Agenda	109
Determining Management's Needs	110
The Running List	110
Grievance and Arbitration Decisions	111
Beyond the Contract	111
Organizing and Prioritizing Management's Needs	112
Avoiding the Major Pitfall of Management Proposals ..	113
Scope and Strategy of Management Agenda	117
Chapter 4 The Law Controlling Labor Negotiations	119
National Labor Relations Act	119
Good Faith Bargaining	120

x / *Negotiating a Labor Contract*

Duty to Furnish Information	121
Relevancy	121
Feasibility	123
Confidentiality	123
Waiver	123
Subjects for Bargaining	124
Mandatory vs. Nonmandatory Bargaining Subjects ...	125
Bargaining Over Nonmandatory Subjects	128
Bargaining Over Borderline Mandatory Subjects	128
Avoiding Waiver On a Nonmandatory Subject	129
Bargaining to Impasse Over Nonmandatory Subjects	129
Good Faith in the Conduct of Negotiations	131
An Imprecise Standard	131
“Totality of Conduct”	132
Imposing Conditions	132
Inhibiting or Delaying Meeting	132
Insufficient Authority of Negotiator	133
Surface Bargaining	133
Withdrawal of Accepted Offers	134
Refusal to Put Agreements in Writing	134
Unilateral Changes	135
Bypassing the Union	135
The Effect of Unfair Labor Practices on Bargaining	136
Impact of Board Orders	136
The Significance of an Unfair Labor Practice Strike ..	136
The Right to Strike or Lock Out	138
Caveat—Tip of the Iceberg	139

Part II The Bargaining Process

Chapter 5 Preliminary Stages of Negotiations	143
Ground Rules for Conducting Negotiations	143
Meeting Schedules	144
Pay for Members of the Union Bargaining Committee ...	145
News Media Contacts	146
Order of Addressing Issues	147
Confirming Agreement on Resolved Issues	148
Treatment of Contract Expiration	149
Ascertaining Contract Finalization Requirements	150
Ground Rules for the Management Committee	151
Only the Spokesperson Speaks	151
Method of Calling Caucuses	152
Inadvertent Signals	152
Unauthorized Communications	153
Opening Statement by Management	153

Setting a Tone	153
Theme	154
Presentation	155
Opening Statement by the Union	156
Receiving the Union's Bargaining Agenda	157
Advance Receipt of the Union Agenda	157
Dealing With Pending Grievances	157
Understanding and Clarifying the Union's Proposals	158
Ascertaining Rationale for Proposals	159
The Spokesperson's Notes	159
Pitfalls in Clarifying Union Proposals	160
Avoiding Immediate Substantive Responses	163
Closing Off Further Proposals	163
Presenting Management's Agenda	164
Timing	164
Method of Presentation	165
Accentuate the Positive	165
Evaluating, and Determining Positions on, the Union's Agenda	166
Monetary Issues	166
Nonmonetary Issues	167
Reviewing Each Proposal	167
A Devil's Advocate	168
Developing Management's Positions	169
Initial Response to the Union's Nonmonetary Proposals	172
Kicking the Tires	172
Categorizing Proposals	172
Initial Signaling	173
Eliminating Issues	174
Reflecting Basic Positions	174
Getting Negotiations off the Ground	175

Chapter 6 Practical Tips for the Management

Spokesperson	177
Arranging and Conducting Meetings	177
Seating Arrangements	177
Meeting Times	178
Response Timing	179
Caucus Room and Equipment	179
Bargaining Table Talk	180
Setting the Proper Tone	180
Dealing With Abusive Table Talk	180
A Rational Approach	181
A Place for Humor	182
Word Selection	182

The Spokesperson as a Persuader	183
Types of Persuasion	184
Persuasion Based on Factual and Statistical Information	184
Rational Persuasion	186
Emotional Persuasion	187
Limits of Persuasion	188
The Spokesperson as a Listener	189
Listening as an Art	189
Listening for the Source of the Problem	190
Specific Listening Techniques	191
Listening to Everyone	191
Making Concessions	192
Effective Use of the Caucus	193
Tactical Significance	193
Calling for a Caucus	194
Length and Frequency of Caucuses	194
Managing the Caucus	195
Presenting Offers and Proposals	196
Traits and Characteristics of an Effective Management Spokesperson	197
The Other Negotiation	200
Chapter 7 Strategies for Bargaining Over Economics	202
General Forms of Negotiating Wages and Benefits	202
Auction or Traditional Bargaining	202
"Boulwarism"	203
"Ballpark Offer" With Minor Adjustments	203
Piecemeal Approach	203
Pattern-Following Approach	204
Traditional Economic Bargaining: Offer and Counteroffer	204
Management's First Economic Offer	205
Timing of the First Offer	205
Exceptions to the General Rule	206
Timing Factors to Consider	207
Constructing Management's First Economic Offer	208
Credibility of the First Offer	209
Objectives of the First Offer	210
Reviewing the First Offer Before Presentation	212
Presenting Management's First Offer	213
Characterizing the Offer	213
Form of Presentation	214
The Union's Response to Management's First Offer	214
Failure of the Union to Make a Counteroffer	215
Evaluating the Union's First Counteroffer	216